UNIVERSITY OF PRISHTINA
"HASAN PRISHTINA"
FACULTY OF PHILOLOGY

TURKISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE (MA)

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

June 20, 2019, Zagreb

1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 27 - 28 May 2019

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Asst. Prof. dr. Barbara Kerovec, University of Zagreb

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Avni Gashi, Acting Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation

Sources of information for the Report:

● Self-Evaluation Report (hereinafter: SER) from 2019 submitted by the Faculty of Philology (University of Prishtina „Hasan Prishtina", hereinafter: UP), which includes evaluation of the MA program Turkish Language and Literature (pp. 92-134);

● 03-Annex-Study Programme_Turkish;

● 04-Annex-Plan for implementation of recommendation;

● 06-Annex-Scientific work and Field of expertise;

● Annex - 6 curricula vitae (Irfan Morina, Ergin Jable, Suzana Canhasi, Nebahat Sulçevsi, Nuran Muhaxheri, Salih Okumuş);

● Annex – Syllabi – Turkish Language and Literature (MA) - 15 syllabi;

● Information collected during the site visit on the 28th of May 2019. During the site visit meetings were held with:

a) representatives of the management of the Faculty, including Assoc. Prof. dr. Lindita Rugova (Dean), Asst. Prof. dr. Albulena Blakaj-Gashi (Vice dean for Sciences), Mr. sc. Besfort Krasniqi (Secretary), and Mr. sc. Shpëtim Elezi (Coordinator of Faculty for Academic Development);

3

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

b) representatives and members of academic staff of the Department of Turkish Language and Literature, including Full Prof. dr. Irfan Morina, Assoc. Prof. dr. Nuran Muhaxheri, and Asst. dr. Nebahat Sulçevsi;

c) representatives of external stakeholders, including Agnesa Raşiti (Vice-director of the Primary School 'Elena Gjika', Prishtina), and Keriman Sadıkay (Office of Good Governance, Human Rights, Equal Opportunities and Non-Discrimination, Office of the Prime Minister).

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- KAA Accreditation Manual

1.2. Site visit schedule (as provided by KAA)

27th of May

| 19.45 | Meeting at the Reception of the Hotel |
| 20.00 | Working dinner |

28th of May

08.40	Meeting at the reception of the hotel
09.00 – 09.30	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
09.35 – 10.35	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
10.40 – 11.10	Meeting with quality assurance representatives
11.10 – 12.15	Lunch break
12.20 – 13.00	Meeting with involved teaching and administrative staff
13.00 – 13.40	Meeting with students and graduates
13.40 – 14.20	Meeting with external stakeholders
14.20 – 14.50	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure *(used for the implementation of the programme)*
15.00 – 15.15	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

4

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

Working dinner with experts and representatives of KAA, which was planned for 20.00 o'clock on the 27th of May 2019, was cancelled due to unforeseen circumstances. The meeting was rearranged at 08.00 o'clock on the next day at the KAA office.

Meeting with students was not held due to the fact that there are no students of the MA program of Turkish Language and Literature.

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The Faculty of Philology (hereinafter: Faculty) started to function as an independent, separate institution in 1989 (based on the Law for the establishment of the Faculty of Philology in Prishtina no. 011-83/88, in Prishtina on the 22th of December 1988.), although it has much longer tradition which goes back to the year of 1960 when the Cathedra of Albanian Language and Literature and the Cathedra of Serbo-Croatian Language and Yugoslav Literature were established within what was then Faculty of Philosophy. Today the Faculty operates within the UP and has 8 departments: Department of Albanian Language, Department of Albanian Literature, Department of English Language and Literature, Department of French Language and Literature, Department of Orientalistics, Department of Turkish Language and Literature, Department of German Language and Literature, and Department of Journalism. Apart from basic studies, it also has two PhD programs: Linguistics and Literature. The Faculty thus provides study programs in the field of philological sciences, teaching and studying foreign languages, literatures and cultures, as well as journalism.

As stated in the SER, the mission and objectives of the Faculty are in compliance with those determined by the UP and all the programs offered by the Faculty have been drafted according to the UP leadership principles, important strategic documents and current regulations (https://www.uni-pr.edu/inc/doc/PLANI-STRATEGJIK1.pdf).

The basic principles of the Faculty are mainly defined according to the aim of focusing on the development of young people in the field of humanities and communication sciences (journalism), as well as on the development of professionals such as lecturers of Albanian and foreign languages, translators / interpreters and philologists in various scientific disciplines for the needs of society and its institutions.

The Department of Turkish Language and Literature (hereinafter: Department) was established in 1989 (the same year as the Faculty). It offers BA program of Turkish language and literature designed in order to meet the needs of the Turkish-speaking national community in Kosovo and of the labour market which offers employment opportunities in the fields of education (teaching mainly in public and private schools and Turkish language courses), translation and public administration. All courses of the BA program are delivered

5

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

in Turkish and the great majority of students have Turkish as their first language although in few recent years there has been a positive increase of interest among students whose first language is Albanian and among foreign students (Poland, Czech Republic) coming within Erasmus program (according to the information given at the meetings during the site visit). Before its establishment, the Department was a part of the Department of Orientalistics, which today exists as a separate unit. The Department of Orientalistics also delivers courses of Turkish language, but from a zero-level, so programs of the two departments do not overlap nor do they share the same body of interested candidates.

The Department had an MA program in a short period between 2005 and 2008 but it was not reaccredited.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

One-year program in Turkish Language and Literature MA level (60 ECTS) is intended to be of scientific profile, thus research oriented. By aiming to focus on research in the field of Turkish language and literature, this program differs from the existing BA Program which ensures basic qualification in Turkish language and literature, supplemented with courses of methodology and didactics of Turkish. As such, the MA program is conceived to educate future researchers and scientists in the field of Turkish language and literature who would create an academic career, and to thus ensure the academic continuity of the Department and of the scientific tradition of Turkish studies in Kosovo. This is important because Kosovo, together with North Macedonia and Albania, is in this respect still lagging behind the countries in the Western Balkans in spite of the fact that Turkish studies are of great importance for this part of the Balkans regarding historical, cultural and socio-economic background as well as contemporary circumstances.

The objectives of the MA program in Turkish Language and Literature are focused on developing students' skills for scientific research, enhancing students' acquisition of advanced knowledge of modern Turkish language and literature, advancing students' knowledge of literary analysis, and ensuring their acquisition of methods for collection and documentation of study materials for folklore and linguistic research (e. g. comparing grammatical structures of standard Turkish and Turkish local dialects in Kosovo).

During the site visit, two representatives of external stakeholders, coming from educational and administrative sectors, stated that graduates with advanced knowledge and more developed research skills in the field of Turkish language and literature would respond labour market requirements better than graduates from the BA program. Similar information was

6

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

given by actual BA students at an informal meeting during the visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure of the Faculty. Students expressed their interest in enrolling the MA program of Turkish Language and Literature claiming that such a research oriented program would improve their employment possibilities by making them more competitive at the labour market.

The MA program of Turkish language and Literature would be administrated by the Department and under the supervision of relevant Faculty bodies.

Table 1. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Mission, objectives and administration**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: 85% - substantially compliant

7

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

ET comment concerning the Standard 1.2.:

In the SER it is stated that "the program belongs to level 7 which includes preparing students (…) in the field of **media and communication**." (p. 94, bold is mine). Also, in the continuation of the text, Erasmus Subject Area Codes for *communication and information sciences* are mentioned, not for *languages and philological sciences*. I can suppose that the wrong area is mentioned by a mistake of taking the program of journalism as an example in creating the self-evaluation, but such a mistake gives an impression that the relevant academic and professional advices were not consulted. This is not the only mistake of that kind in the SER, and I have indicated some of them to the responsible of the program during the meeting, where it was noticed that the version of the Department's self-evaluation in SER is different from the version that the responsible had at the meeting and for which she claimed to be the latest version. After the site visit, I asked the KAA by an e-mail to ask the Department to provide me with the latest version, but it has never been sent to me.

In the Comments of the Department sent on the 18th of June 2019, the Department confirmed that for some parts of its SER the SER of the Department of Journalism was taken as a template, and that the proper corrections have been made.

2.2. Quality management

As stated in the SER and at the meetings during the site-visit, in the process of quality assurance and management, the Department operates in coordination with the management of the Faculty and the UP. In the process of reviewing and creating programs it has a responsibility to try to harmonize with other similar study programs of European universities and to take into account the administrative guidelines of MEST of the Republic of Kosovo. According to the SER, on the level of the Faculty and the UP the reviews and approvals of curricula are done in accordance to standards of European higher educational domain, market requirements, graduates' comments and experts' recommendations from accreditation procedures. Survey data is being regularly collected from students, graduates and employers (stakeholders are being consulted twice a year for feedback). On the level of the Faculty and the UP, methodology courses and trainings on writing syllabi are being regularly held. On the level of the Department, topics and issues relevant for the improvement of the academic and administrative work are discussed on meetings which are held on regular basis. Consultations with students are also regularly held.

The weak point is that the Faculty is not financially independent in any way from the UP; it does not have its own bank account and cannot dispose with any financial means independently, which makes ensuring funds for research, scientific activities (e.g. conferences) and administrative activities more difficult (in spite of a good cooperation

8

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

between the Faculty and the UP in this respect). The Department is being regularly financially and logistically supported by different (academic and non-academic) Turkish institutions such as TİKA (Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency), Yunus Emre Institute, Turkish Embassy in Prishtina, and Turkish Language Institute.

Table 2. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Quality management**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		X
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	

9

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: 89 % **-** substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Although survey data is being regularly collected from students, graduates and employers, the results of electronic questionnaires for students organized at the level of the UP are not made publicly available. According to the information from the SER and the meetings held during the site-visit, the results are not even sent to each academic unit; they are available only to the Faculty management and eventually to the heads of the departments. This issue is beyond the competence of the Department, so the UP and the Faculty should reconsider this system because making the results of the surveys publicly available, students' complaints, suggestions and requests could contribute to the improvement of programs and staff quality, making them aware of their weak and strong points.

2. The Faculty has its website, but the departments do not have their web-pages where they could regularly update information on their own. For such type of communication with students the Department uses social media (besides e-mail and notice boards). Since this issue is beyond the competence of the Department, the Faculty should consider introducing official web-pages for departments which would be controllable and updatable by the departments themselves.

2.3. Academic staff

In the MA program of Turkish Language and Literature six members of the Department are planned to be engaged as full time teaching staff. Three of them are full professors, two are associate professors, and one is PhD Assistant. Almost all of them (except one) have their MA or PhD degrees from different, well known Turkish universities, some of them with long tradition (University of Istanbul, Gazi University, Trakya University, Sakarya University). The members of the Department regularly attend different teaching trainings organized by the UP (Center of Teaching Excellence in UP) and by Turkish institutions (Ankara University – TÖMER, Yunus Emre Institute), and the majority of the staff participated in Turkish mobility program Mevlana. As claimed in the SER, members of the academic staff possess good mentoring skills due to their experience gained in various institutions. They are also very

10

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

active in organizing international conferences (at least once a year, as reported at the meetings during the site-visit).

Table 3. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Academic staff**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	

11

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	Not ablicable.	

Compliance level: 100 % **-** Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Comment for the Standard 3.8: Although academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly, the results are not made publicly available (as already mentioned earlier in this report, in the chapter 2.2. Quality management, pp. 11-12), which should be changed on the level of the Faculty, i.e. the University.
2. In addition to Turkish as their mother tongue, all members of the teaching staff possess knowledge of Albanian, and either Bosnian / Serbian or Macedonian, but almost all of them lack knowledge of English (or other Western language) on a level which would be satisfactory for research needs (reading and interpreting Western literature and sources) or for inclusion into broader academic community (by, for example, using Erasmus exchange possibilities or attending conferences held in countries other than those in the region). Since English has the status of *lingua franca* of science and academic world, it is strongly recommended that the staff makes some effort in this respect by considering attending courses or trainings of English.
3. The majority of the staff members regularly attend international conferences, but these conferences are limited to Kosovo, Turkey and few countries of the (near) region. This is natural concerning the field of their studies, and is understandable because of the restricted freedom of movement due to economic (lack of real funds for conferences) and political circumstances, but it is suggested that they make effort in trying to attend conferences in other (Western) countries, too.

12

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

2.4. Educational process content

The MA program of Turkish Language and Literature (hereinafter: Program) is a 60[1] ECTS credit, one year (two semesters) program. The first semester consists of 3 mandatory and 3 elective courses (the student chooses 3 out of 5 elective courses offered), while the second semester includes 2 mandatory courses, 2 elective courses (the student chooses 2 out of 5 elective courses offered), and a diploma thesis. All courses are planned to be delivered in Turkish. The Program is modelled in a way to enhance students' disciplinary, methodological and generic skills by offering a range of different courses related to the field of turkology as well as to research methodologies. The courses are intended to be delivered using different methods of teaching which would help students to achieve both, theoretical knowledge and practical skills. In spite of these positive, strong sides of the Program, there are some inconsistences which have to be removed and some aspects which have to be reconsidered on the general level of the Program, as well as on the level of specific courses:

1) Although the courses focus on different subject matters and different aspects of knowledge and skills to be achieved by students, from the tables where their weekly workload is systematized (p. 102-103 of the SER) the courses seem to have identical methodology, with no courses having exercises, practice or seminars, only lectures (in addition, all courses have the same quantity of lecture hours). The same can be concluded from the tables for each specific course (entitled *Student workload*, pp. 104-126 of the SER) in which seminars are included, but exercises and practice are not (some courses do not even include homework). All these tables of student workload look almost identical, in spite of different content, objectives and methodologies of the courses. Furthermore, the descriptions given below the tables are not consistent with the information given in the tables because in these descriptions a lot of exercise, homework, practical work, etc. is mentioned. Furthermore, some details related to the study program and given in the SER are not consistent with those given in the syllabi (e.g. the number of ECTS credits for some courses);

2) Several courses have the same descriptions and outcomes as some BA courses (e.g. *Contemporary Turkish Language* (MA) vs. *Turkish Phonetics* (BA), *Techniques of Collection and Folklore Research* (MA) vs. *Folkloristics* (BA)). This could be a mistake, but it suggests that the objectives and outcomes of these MA courses are not definitely set, carefully considered upon, and that they were written in a rush;

3) Some courses are inconsistent in themselves in the way that their title do not corresponds to their description, (or) objectives and learning outcomes, nor to the literature offered as basic (a flagrant example is the course *Contemporary Turkish Language* which is inconsistent in all the mentioned aspects).

---

[1] There is a mistake in the SER, p. 99: it is written that the program has 120 ECTS credits, but 60 ECTS credits were confirmed by the program responsible at the meeting during the site visit.

13

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

4) Lists of basic literature for some courses lack recent literature and should include relevant Western authors as well, not only Turkish ones.

Table 4. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Educational process content**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X	
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	X	

14

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		X
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: 75 % **-** Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

15

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

1. The types of the courses (lectures, exercise, seminars) in the program should be reconsidered to better correspond to the courses' objectives and methodologies and to better account for, otherwise, considerably high number of ECTS credits (4-6 for only 2 hours of lectures).

2. There should not be overlapping between MA courses and BA courses in respect to their objectives, learning outcomes and specific subject matters.

3. Some of the learning outcomes on both, program level (p. 100) and course level, should be reformulated in the way that they clearly show what graduates will be able to do (attention should be paid to the use of the right verbs: the use of the verbs such as *learn*, *understand, own, adopt*, *be aware of* etc. and structures such as *the student is informed / introduced / acquainted* (teacher's perspective) is not recommendable when formulating learning outcomes; instead, active verbs and formulations such as *the student will be able to explain / describe / translate /analyse / demonstrate,* etc. should be used.). Precise formulation of learning outcomes is necessary to make qualifications comparable across sectors and countries and to make students' knowledge and skills more transparent to the employers in the sense of what they could expect from their potential employees.

4. It is recommended that the title of the course *Contemporary Turkish literature* changes into *Modern Turkish literature* due to the fact that besides contemporary Turkish literature, it also deals with older Turkish literature starting from tanzimat, i.e. the literature from the second half of the 19th and the first half of the 20th century (according to the description in the SER) – periods that cannot be considered as *contemporary*.

5. It is recommended that the title of the course *Morpho-phonetics of Balkan Turkish* changes into *Phonetics and morphonology of Balkan Turkish*; otherwise the title gives impression that phonology is missing. Additionally, the list of basic literature for this course should be reconsidered since currently it does not include any title/study on Balkan Turkish.

6. The title of the course *Lexicography* should be changed into *Lexicography and Lexicology* since these are two different disciplines which the course deals with. Additionally, the list of basic literature for this course should include theoretical literature on lexicology and lexicography as well.

7. The course entitled *Contemporary Turkish Language* should be reconsidered in the way that its title, description, objectives, learning outcomes, and literature correspond to each other. Additionally, more recent literature should be added to the list of basic literature because it currently does not include any title/study more recent than 1977.

8. It is recommended that relevant authors other than Turkish are as well included in the list of basic literature for the course *Selected authors of Modern Turkish Literature*.

16

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

In the Comments of the Department sent on the 18th of June 2019, the Department stated that the remarks on formulation of learning outcomes, as well as on titles and literature of some courses will be notified to the respective teachers in order to make the necessary corrections.

2.5. Students

It is planned that 15 students enrol every year in the Master Program of Turkish Language and Literature. Considering the needs of the labour market, this number is well defined.

According to the information given in the SER, students who can enrol in the Master of Turkish language and literature must complete BA studies (240 ECTS) in Turkish language and literature or orientalistics, while potential candidates outside the field of turkology and orientalistics (coming from other disciplines of linguistics, humanities and social sciences), must provide at least 20 ECTS credits at the BA level in the field of Turkish language and literature in order to create a minimum base for following this program. This condition of 20 ECTS credits is disputable because the number of credits cannot guarantee the kind of knowledge a student must have, so this criterion should be reconsidered.

As stated in the SER, upon completing the MA of Turkish language and literature students will be able to trace the sources of information for study purposes of Turkish language, literature and folklore, to compile textbooks on relevant topics of turkology, to draw conclusions from traces and studies, to demonstrate methodological skills in the field of turkology, and to demonstrate skills and tendencies for independent scientific studies. As already mentioned earlier in this report, at an informal meeting during the visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure of the Faculty, students expressed their interest in enrolling in an MA program which would have these learning outcomes and thus which would, as they said, improve their employment possibilities and make them more competitive at the labour market.

Since some standards in the table below cannot be fully applicable for the program to be accredited (there are still no students enrolled in the Program), it must be pointed out that some opinions on compliance are given according to the information given by the Department on its common practice established on the BA level.

Table 5. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Students**

Standard	Compliance

17

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program posses a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

18

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

Compliance level: 100 % **-** Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

The condition of 20 ECTS credits that should be gained at the BA Turkish Language and Literature for students coming from disciplines other than turkology and orientalistics in order to enrol the program should be reconsidered in the way to define not the number of credits, but the courses that should be completed in order to be able to follow the program (especially given the fact that courses of the program are delivered completely in Turkish). In the Comments of the Department sent on the 18th of June 2019, the Department stated that, based on this recommendation, course titles were assigned through which 20 ECTS credits could be obtained, thus students who completed their BA studies outside the mentioned departments will be able to build necessary theoretical knowledge foundation.

2.6. Research

Members of the academic staff of the Department conduct their research in various disciplines of Turkish studies, mainly in linguistics (Turkish dialects in Kosovo, teaching Turkish as foreign language), literature, and folklore. They disseminate the results of their research by presenting them on scientific conferences in the country and abroad, or by publishing them in local or international scientific journals. They are also very active in organizing scientific conferences for which they are regularly supported (financially or logistically) by different Turkish institutions such as partner universities, Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency, Yunus Emre Institute and Turkish Embassy in Prishtina. As stated in the SER, the Department is engaged in publishing two journals indexed in international platforms (CEEOL and EBSCO) and with international reviews, and two students' scientific journals.

CVs of the majority of the Department's members show a remarkable number of publications and conference attendances. Nevertheless, the weak side is that the majority of these journals and conferences are of a regional character in the sense that, although international, they are published or organized mostly in Kosovo, Turkey and countries from the neighbouring region (as already described in the section 2.3 of this report). Additionally, very small number of the publications is written in English or in some other world/Western language which makes the results of their research less visible on the wider international scientific scene.

19

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

Table 6. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Research**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full time staff.	X	

20

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	X	

Compliance level: 80 % **-** Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

As it has already been mentioned in the ET recommendations of the section 2.3. of this report, the members of the Department should make effort to make their research visible for a wider international community by publishing more in English, and by presenting their research more in journals and conferences other than regional or Turkish. They should also profit better from some opportunities offered, in a few recent years, by the UP, such as a special office that the UP has made available which encourages staff participation in research and conferences (the Research Office and Sponsored Projects) or from consulting more the authors coming from scientific communities other than those of Kosovo and Turkey (they can use access to various scientific platforms such as ScienceDirect, Web of Science, etc. which has also been made available in the recent years by the UP).

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Within the University of Prishtina, supervision of infrastructure is the competence of the Faculty leaders and its modifications are made on annual bases, depending on the needs addressed by the staff and students. Nevertheless, the Faculty, as mentioned earlier in this report, is not financially independent from the UP so activities related to infrastructure depend also on the amount of the financial investment of the Rectorate. The building of the Faculty is partially renovated, but very old and there are still many infrastructural aspects to be improved (painting of the facility, adjustment of the sanitary and toilet nodes, lack of offices for academic staff, lack of an online software system and internal internet for free

21

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

21

communication between staff and students). There is also a lack of budget to follow new technological trends in teaching and science. In spite of these weak points, the Department has satisfactory conditions for work, partly due to many investments made in equipment from external stakeholders (mainly Turkish institutions already mentioned in this report). It has two available classrooms with an average of 40 seats for students, rooms are equipped with internet access and projectors, and the Department's library is well equipped with literature covering the field of turkology. The Faculty's library, which has reading corners, is also used by students of the Department.

Table 7. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Infrastructure and resources**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years	X	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	

22

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:
 	
    a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;
 	
    b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;
 	
    c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;
 	
    d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;
 	
e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission
	X	

Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.		X

Compliance level: 83 % - **s**ubstantially compliant

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Regarding historical, civilizational, cultural and socio-economic background as well as contemporary circumstances, Kosovo and the neighboring region can be regarded as a rich and challenging source of different study material and as a fertile ground for different kinds of Turkish studies (historical, (socio)linguistic, cultural, folkloristic, etc.). Requirements of the labour market searching for employees with wider knowledge and more developed research skills in the field of turkology cannot be neglected, neither can be neglected the students' need to respond better to these requirements and to invest into the self-development as well as into the development of the society. In spite of some weak points, which could and should be removed (by taking into consideration the recommendations made in this report), the Department and the MA program of Turkish Language and Literature could well respond to these needs – the needs of the challenging research area, of the labor market, and of the interested body of students. With its solid balance of theoretical and practical courses dealing

23

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

23

with different subjects and topics, and with advanced level of studying of Turkish language and literature, this research oriented MA program could be interesting not only to students from Kosovo, but from other countries as well.

In conclusion, the Expert considers that the study program TURKISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE (MA) offered by the Department of Turkish Language and Literature, Faculty of Philology (University of Prishtina „Hasan Prishtina"), is **substantially compliant** with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, **recommends to accredit** the study program for a duration of **3 years** with a number of **15 students** to be enrolled in the program.

Expert Team

Chair / Member

	Barbara Kerovec	June 20, 2019
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)