



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

***ESLG College***

***ACCREDITATION  
MANAGEMENT OF REAL ESTATE AND INFRASTRUCTURE  
(BA)***

**REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM**



*Prishtina, 25.05.2021*

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

### Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule.....	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	5
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION.....	6
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	6
2.2. Quality management.....	7
2.3. Academic staff.....	9
2.4. Educational process content.....	15
2.5. Students.....	18
2.6. Research.....	20
2.7. Infrastructure and resources.....	24
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	28



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1. Context

**Date of site visit:**

**Expert Team (ET) members:**

- *Prof. Dr Peter Parycek*
- *Mr Marko Komso*

**Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):**

- *Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA*
- *Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation*
- *Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Ilijane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*

**Sources of information for the Report:**

- *SER ESLG College*
- *CVs*

**Criteria used for program evaluation:**

- *KAA Accreditation Manual*



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

## 1.2. Site visit schedule

09.00 – 09.40 Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated

09.45 – 10:15 Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff

10:20 – 11:20 Meeting with the heads of the study programme

11:20 – 12:00 Lunch break

12.00 – 13:40 Meeting with teaching staff

12.45 – 13:30 Meeting with employers of graduates

13.35 – 13.45 Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts

13:50 – 14:00 Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program



### **1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation**

The ESLG College was established in 2009, by decision 01/2009 of the Managing Board of the European University in Kosovo. The ESLG College was accredited for the first time by decision No. 479/10 of 20 July 2010, as the ESLG Institute. (p. 2 SER) ESLG consist has one centre and offers currently one program, Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure (MA). Other programs are still provided on the website, which could be misleading for interested potential students, and it is highly inappropriate for a higher education institute.

ESLG has had some difficulties in recent years; only a few programmes are still accredited. The current status of the institution seems to be critical. Therefore, the ET urgently recommends drafting strategies for the next two years and also considering an exit scenario.

COVID 19 is a challenge for the higher education institutions and an excellent opportunity to learn about content and didactic for the future of teaching. (e.g. asynchronous information in the form of video; audio or text via learning platforms; what kind of content could/should be taught online interactively; what content will be conducted on campus or hybrid; etc.)

#### *Recommendation:*

- The ET urgently recommends drafting institutional development strategies for the next two years and also considering an exit scenario.
- ET highly recommends updating the information on the website and only publish accredited programs.
- ET recommends analyzing online teaching experiences in detail and also collecting the expectations of the students. Future students will likely expect a good mix of asynchronous online content, synchronous online instruction, and traditional on-campus instruction. Especially for employed students, this will play an increasingly important role in their choice.



## 2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

### 2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The overall mission was very general and has been comprehensively revised. Strategic goals are very well written. (p. 4) In talking to the management of the programme, we have seen that they have implemented the necessary changes, which were recommended the first time during the accreditation. They are more proactive with the private sector and will send students to do their internships there. The private company has expressed their willingness to help the management in organizing round tables and discussions. (Standard 1.1)

The learning outcomes have improved and are now at a decent level with a strong collaboration between academia and industry. The construction companies were included, the most respected experts in their field help them. The academic references and network seem to be healthy and elaborated. There is no industry board established or included, but the management has said to include experts when needed, which is sufficient. (Standard 1.2)

The SER provides a well-defined overarching didactic concept. The research concept does not need any further clarification and development. (Standard 1.3).

Typical basic processes are described in the SER; quality processes, academic processes, application processes for students or teaching applicants are described. Management mentioned several times the importance and value of transparency also this time and has implemented the processes which are needed for it. (Standard 1.4)

Code of Ethics is established for academic and administrative staff and students. (Standard 1.5)

Several review process and process owners are described, which are also responsible for evaluating their policies in different time frames. (Standard 1.6).

#### **Performance indicator**

Performance indicators are well described in the SER.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.</i>	X	

**Compliance level:** Fully compliant.

**ET recommendations:**

- No further recommendations

**2.2. Quality management**

The SER describes in detail quality management organization and processes. Numerous improvements have been highlighted Based during the SV and all recommendations have been implemented:

- Quality management is integrated into the life cycle of the program
- A process for ongoing strategy improvement has been developed
- Based on the evaluation action plan is/will be developed, and the implementation is monitored.



- QA regulations were fragmented; ESLG developed new integrated regulation.
- QA handbook is extensively revised
- Quality management staff members received training and will receive further training.
- The fragmented quality management reports are now integrated.
- Staff training has been developed and offered; one of the topics was learning outcomes for students.

QA revised comprehensively learning outcomes together with the faculty. The assessments were adapted and further developed through COVID19 in the master program and will be continued after COVID19, and the experiences will also be used in the BA program. The problem-based teaching and learning approach is strengthened. In general, was the switch to online teaching implemented efficiently and accurately.

ESLG has implemented all recommendations with great seriousness and, in some cases, has gone beyond them. The standards and processes described have improved considerably.

A specific COVID19 impact evaluation was not conducted; questionnaires were adapted in the master program.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 2.1.</i> All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
<i>Standard 2.2.</i> Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
<i>Standard 2.3.</i> Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 2.4.</i> Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
<i>Standard 2.5.</i> Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
<i>Standard 2.6.</i> Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	X	





<i>Standard 2.7.</i> Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
<i>Standard 2.8.</i> The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
<i>Standard 2.9.</i> The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

**Compliance level:** Fully compliant

All KAA standards are fully compliant, but to what extent the processes are lived and implemented is hard to review. The overall situation of ESLG is highly critical regarding the decline of accredited programs. Therefore, it is doubtful how the organization could provide enough resources for sustainable implementation. The second critical issue is collecting data and providing strategies for the future of teaching.

**ET recommendations:**

- 1. ET recommends ensuring that the very well described processes are also implemented and applied.*
- 2. ET recommends continuing the staff development, especially the quality management staff training*
- 3. ET recommends rigorous evaluation of student's expectations for future teaching through surveys, focus groups and interviews and detailed evaluation of online education.*
- 4. ET recommends further online teaching training and ensuring that all faculty members have attended a least one-day training.*
- 5. ET recommends testing further possibilities for interactive online teaching by combining break-out rooms and online whiteboards or similar tools.*
- 6. ET recommends designing hybrid scenarios for the winter semester 2021.*

**2.3. Academic staff**



The faculty consists of 18 academic staff, 9 with full-time and 9 with part-time employment. Six full-time faculty members hold a Dr/PhD degree. Part-time staff bring in extensive practice experience. High diversity and interdisciplinarity are strengths of the faculty; research focus fits with the allocated courses, but research activities regarding publications need to be higher. (Standard 3.1, 3.2) The following table is based on SER (p. 98 f), CVs of the faculty and desk research:

Name and Surname	Qu.	M.	Publication	Courses
Visar Hoxha	PhD	FT	Eight papers in the field of sustainable energy efficient	Sustainable architecture // Real estate valuation // Cost Accounting // Insurance of Objects
Islam Hasani	PhD	FT	No paper within the last 5 years; older paper and research focus are fitting to the courses	Economics of real estate // Public Private Partnerships // Real Estate Financing including leasing
Veli Lecaj	PhD	FT	One paper within the last 5 years; older paper and research focus is fractionally fitting to the courses	Introduction to law // Property Law // Tax Law
Hazer Dana	PhD	FT	Five papers within the last 5 years; within regulated period 3 papers, but not all of them are eligible; research focus is fractionally fitting to the	Introduction to spatial planning // Urban Sprawl // Demographics and urban settlements // Social infrastructure // Urban transformation and sustainable cities



			courses; practical experience fits;	
Mersiha Kacamakovic	PhD	FT	Two papers 2021, 2020, one of them is eligible; older paper and research focus are fitting to the courses	Introduction to management
Fuat Pallaska*	PhD	FT	Two papers 2018; none is eligible based on KAA accreditation; one paper 2017; research fit with courses.	Infrastructure project management // Energy buildings
Jehona Hoxha	M.S c	FT	No paper within the last 5 years;	Academic writing and research methods
Edin Murati**	M.S c.	FT	No paper within the last 5 years;	Energy Infrastructure // Transport Infrastructure
Elita Çeku	PhD Can didat e	FT	No paper within the last 5 years;	Methods of Real Estate Marketing

(\* CV refers to UBT, LinkedIn UBT)

\*\* CV: 2019 – Present University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina" – Faculty of Law)  
(SER; p. 44)

CVs of Fuat Pallaska and Edin Murati are inconstant regarding their employer. According to Fuat Pallaska's CV, he is employed by UBT, and Edin Murati's CV University of Prishtina is referred to as employer. The ET asks KAA to check the final employment for Standard 3.3.



Fjolla Shala is mentioned in the publication list and the list of practical and consulting activities, but is not listed in the program or faculty list. The ET asks ESLG to clarify the listing of Fjolla Shala.

The program consists of 180 credits; the legal requirement is that for the number of 60 credits, at least one full-time staff member must be employed with a PhD degree; therefore, a minimum of three full-time staff members holding a PhD must be employed; ESLG has employed six full-time professors and provides four core faculty members. The domain expertise is given if ESLG is the employer of Fuat Pallaska. It is unclear why Visar Hoxha is not listed as one of the core members; he would strengthen the core team with his high academic expertise and practical experience. If Fuat Pallaska and Visar Hoxha are not eligible for Standard 3.5, the domain expertise in the field of Real Estate/Architecture is critical.

No	ECTS	Staff Member: Name and Surname	Qualification
1	60	Hazer Dana	(PhD Geography, land consolidation )
2	60	Veli Lecaj	(PhD Legal )
3	60	Mersiha Kacamakovic	(PhD Management)
4		Fuat Pallaska (reserve staff member)	(PhD in Law and Management of Real Estate)
Tot	180	4	

(SER, p.45)

The strong cooperation with Nova Univerza in Slovenia still offers sufficient possibilities for staff development. Elements and processes for an academic career are sufficiently described in the SER (p.47ff). (Standard 3.6).

ESLG describes the typical academic activities sufficiently in the SER (p. 49 f). These activities are not reflected in the CV of the staff-faculty members. Practical experiences are one of the strengths of the faculty; as mentioned earlier, based on these activities, they are generating a high impact in society. The ET appreciates that fact; but the limited academic impact is highly



critical regarding scientific publications and active conference participation, based on the review of the CVs of the faculty members.

The ET recommended in the report 2020

- *ET recommends describing academic community and community services, eventually examples and rough estimate of the share in relation to teaching and research obligations.*

Based on the CVs, this fact has not improved; on the contrary, the situation has worsened. The decline of publication is a critical trend, which needs to be changed. (Standard 3.7).

The department heads are receiving an "Academic Year Staff Appraisal Review" by the quality management office, which includes teaching, research, service and administration aspects. ESLG provided two samples; they are brief and provide sufficient overview and feedback. (Standard 3.8)

The quality assurance committee is focussing on three aspects, "Procedures for on-going monitoring of programmes", "Procedures for programme evaluation" and "Procedures for selection, appointment, appraisal and development of staff". Based on these three procedures, individual and organizational development plans are generated. (p. 51) (Standard 3.9)

Based on the information, retired teachers lose their status of full-time teachers with the age limit of 65 and are used in advisory roles. (p. 51) (Standard 3.10)

Standards	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.</i>	X	



<i>Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.</i>		?
<i>Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.</i>		part.
<i>Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.</i>		X
<i>Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self- evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.</i>	X	

**Compliance level:** Substantially compliant.

Based on the KAA Accreditation manual research, "Academic Staff Standards" are still substantially compliant. For the high-quality execution of a higher education program, the faculty is the most critical factor. The lack of clarity regarding the employment of two full-time staff members and the fact that scientific publications are outdated could lead to a high-risk situation.

The ET has understanding for the current difficult situation of the institution and the additional pandemic crisis, but the faculty is in a critical condition, which worsened and deteriorated during the last year; the academic output and participation urgently need to be increased, and the highly relevant positions for architecture or real estate need to be clarified and improved.



### **ET recommendations:**

1. *ET highly recommends clarifying the core team and the contract situation.*
2. *ET recommends improvement and standardization of the CVs, which obviously have not been reviewed by the institution and are not standardized.*
3. *ET highly recommends increasing the academic output and participation in academic communities and increasing the research activities.*

### **2.4. Educational process content**

The uncertainties in the accreditation process 2020 regarding the responsibility of the programmes between Nova Univerza, UBT and ESLG have been clarified in the present SER. The study program complies with comparable international and national programs. It is still similar and comparable with Nova Univerza, which offers an accredited program in Slovenia and is an academic cooperation partner. The ET encourages further cooperation with Nova Univerza or similar academic partners for enabling student exchange, e.g., through recognition of individual courses.

The program's focus is clear, and the interdisciplinary approach is appropriate for the field of real estate management. The central aspect of the program is management of real estate. ESLG has taken up the ET's soft recommendation for the programs name from the report 2020. and introduced the new submission on accreditation with the proposed title: "Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure" Overall, the programme has clear qualification objectives for the field of real estate management. (Standard 4.1)

The study methods are described in the syllabuses for each course; in general, the program focuses on problem-solving skills, case studies, project work, problem-based learning and simulated learning. The whole program is an interdisciplinary program, with an obvious set of elements for creating specific and generic competencies. (Standard 4.2)

The curriculum has been slightly adapted, compared with the accreditation process 2020; law subjects (obligation law, labour law and administrative law) have been removed and replaced by Urban planning subjects. The changes improved the program's focus; it provides a logical flow and leads to the development of general and specific learning outcomes. The program



offers a bundle of elective courses for individual student focus, especially the fifth and sixth semester with five elective courses. (Standard 4.3)

Syllabuses of the curriculum are state of the are well documented and published on the website, <http://www.eukos.org/?page=2,35>. The structure of the syllabi is standardized and sufficiently described by the faculty staff members. (Standard 4.4)

English skills are regulated, and students must pass the TOEFL test with at least 500 points in the paper-based TOEFL. (Standard 4.5)

Teaching strategies consist of different teaching methods described and customized for the courses and documented in the syllabuses; the main common aspects are problem-based approaches. (Standard 4.7)

The SER illustrates the assessments, and the descriptions are appropriate. During the SV, assessment improvements have been discussed; through the COVID19 pandemic situation, assessments have been further developed and even more focused on problem-solving capabilities. The faculty is planning to use the learnings from the master program also for the bachelor program. Students are required to use also empirical research without advanced statistical analysis, which is adequate for a bachelor thesis (p. 15). (Standard 4.8)

An overall assessment monitoring is established, which generates for every assessment a report; policies and processes are defined for conflicts. (p. 63) (Standard 4.9)

The program includes a mandatory internship in the third year with 12 ECTS credits or 180 hours. ESLG has internship agreements with companies. Students are obliged to writing a report of their learning (120 hours) (p. 65). (Standard 4.11)

Overview about industrial partnerships is provided, and compared to 2019, the number has been increased from 10 to 17 partners. (p. 66) (Standard 4.12)

**Performance indicator**

Performance indicators are sufficient. (p. 66 f)

Standards	Compliance
-----------	------------





	Yes	No
<i>Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.</i>	X	



<i>Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or students inconsistently assessed.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organizations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organizations/practical training units.</i>	X	

**Compliance level:** Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- ET encourages developing the idea of building case studies; a bachelor thesis in cooperation with the industry could be a possibility.*

**2.5. Students**

The evaluation process has confirmed the presence of information, outside the documents supplied in advance of the visit, that demonstrate institution-wide arrangements for student admissions, rights of representation, student feedback via 'satisfaction surveys', what students can expect during the studies, what is expected of them and what support can be provided if something goes wrong.



According to MEST requirements, all students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent documents of study. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record and analysis considering the student completion rates are produced for all courses and the programme as a whole and included among quality indicators.

The ESLG College established different regulations to deal with academic misconduct, including plagiarism and other forms of cheating: Code of Ethics for Academic Staff, Code of Ethics for Students, Code of Ethics for Non-Academic Staff, Academic Integrity Policy or Educative and Preventative Plagiarism Policy. Also, ESLG operates the plagiarism detection software academia, which includes the Albanian language.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	<i>Yes</i>	<i>No</i>
<i>Standard 5.1.</i> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organizing students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
<i>Standard 5.2.</i> All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
<i>Standard 5.3.</i> The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
<i>Standard 5.4.</i> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
<i>Standard 5.5.</i> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
<i>Standard 5.6.</i> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	



<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

**Compliance level:** Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- No further recommendations.

## 2.6. Research

The program research plan is part of the overall in institutional research strategy. Students write conceptual research assignments during the first two years and continue with empirical research in the third year. This approach is quite unique for bachelor study programs; and should be highlighted. Strong cooperation with European Universities strengthens their research policies, like Norwegian University for Science and Technology (NTNU) or Nova Univerza in Slovenia. (Standard 6.1).

The research strategy goals for individual academic staff members and the departments are communicated; ESLG offers clear definitions of research output, evaluated through the staff appraisal process and Report. (Standard 6.2, 6.3)

The following evaluation is based on table from chapter academic staff and an additional table for part-time faculty members. The results are based on SER, CVs and desk research by ET:

Sabri Sadiku	PhD	PT	0 papers within the last 5 years;
Christian Seidel	PhD	PT	Last paper 2015
Arzu Tuncer	PhD	PT	Last paper 2011
Sirri Duger	PhD	PT	2 papers 2019
Mendim Blakaj	M.Sc.	PT	1 paper 2018



Sara Sadiku	M.Sc.	PT	1 paper 2019
Emblema Zeqiraj	M.Sc.	PT	1 paper 2019 (SER); no information about further scientific publication in the CV
Driton Haziri	M.Sc.	PT	Quality of provided CV is insufficient
Besnik Vrella	M.Sc.	PT	last paper 2017

The individual research field corresponds with their respective teaching topics as reviewed in chapter academic staff. Unfortunately, the research results are no longer up-to-date, most of the research papers are older than 3, 5 or even more years.

- Visar Hoxha scientific output is impressive; he published eight papers within the regulated three years' time-period and all of them are eligible.
- Hazar Dana published three papers, but it is uncertain if alle of them are eligible. One paper is an historic analysis; and one paper seems to be a conference paper which is not listed on the regarding platforms, defined by KAA.
- Fuat Pallaska published two papers 2018, but it is uncertain, if these papers are eligible; and the issue of employer needs to be clarified.
- Sara Sadiku, Emblema Zeqiraj, Mendim Blakaj published one paper, as co-authors with Visar Hoxha, which is a positive, but the number of papers is still not sufficient.
- Islam Hasani's CV is impressive, but his last papers are from 2015; 2019 he published a book about "Islamic Finance".
- Veli Lecaj's CV is impressive, but unfortunately, he did not publish since 2015.
  - **ESLG Comment:** Professor Veli Lecaj published one publication in 2018 Boz Mustafa and Veli Lecaj "ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND ECONOMIC GROWTH: GOVERNMENT SUPPORTS FOR SMES IN TURKEY AND KOSOVA", Sosyal Bilimler Elektronik Dergisi Electronic Journal of Social Sciences ISSN: 2602,- 4306, Vol. 2 No. 3, 2018, pp. 9 - 39. The link of the publication is:
    - [https://sbedergi.com/?mod=makale\\_tr\\_ozet&makale\\_id=698](https://sbedergi.com/?mod=makale_tr_ozet&makale_id=698)
  - **ET Comment:** The ET thanks you for the information and correction, but unfortunately the requirements are not met even with this.



- Mersiha Kacamakovic, published 2021 and 2020; the conference paper would need further clarification it is eligible; nevertheless, the number of three paper is not succeeded.

Currently, only Visar Hoxha fulfils Standard 6.7 within the full-time faculty. A similar result for the part-time faculty, not a single part-time faculty member is meeting the requirements of three papers within the three-year time period. The number of publications is critical for the whole faculty. The promising development from 2010 to 2015 has sharply turned around.

ESLG developed a solid framework for research, but it does not create the required outcomes, measured in number of publications or active conference participation. Due to the predominant lack of publications by the faculty, standards 6.4 to 6.8 are not fulfilled.

**ET commentaries on ESLG comments:** ESLG provided several comments and further information in regard to publications. ESLG sThe ET did not include all of them in the final report. Even if the information leads to an improvement in the publication situation, the standards for the entire faculty are currently not met and the situation is critical.

ESLG states that KAA has no standards. Irrespective of this legal issue, the ET can state that the performance in international comparison is to be judged as critical,

### Performance indicator

Performance indicators are well described in the SER.

Standards	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.</i>	X*	
<i>Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.</i>	X*	
<i>Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.</i>	X*	



<i>Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.</i>		X
<i>Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.</i>		X
<i>Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.</i>		X
<i>Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.</i>		X
<i>Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full time staff.</i>		X
<i>Standard 6.9. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.</i>	X*	
<i>Standard 6.10. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 6.11. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.</i>	X	

\*Based on the Accreditation manual, research is still partially compliant; with about 50% of the Standards are fulfilled; The ET questions the quantitative approach in cases in which an organization well describes standards, processes or policies, but which have not the intended effect or impact.

**Compliance level:** Partially compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- 1. ET highly recommends executing the research development plan, which is theoretically given but does not produce the required effectiveness or impact.*
- 2. ET highly recommends establishing combined teaching and research processes which lead to scientific publications.*



3. *ET highly recommends developing individual publication strategies.*

## 2.7. Infrastructure and resources

It should mention the fact that regarding the learning resources and facilities, the evaluation was made on the basis of the information received from the institution via photos and videos and those declared by the participants in the meetings during the online accreditation.

Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure (BA) will be implemented and situated in the College ESLG seat in Annex of Innovation Campus, Street Ibrahim Rugova p.n, Lipjan, Kosovo.

College ESLG operates in a single building in Annex of Innovation Campus in Lipjan, with the total surface of the premises used for College ESLG equalling 1000 m<sup>2</sup>. The premises have six classrooms and one computer lab. The building has a Student Affairs Office on the First Floor, an Administration Office on the second floor, and seven offices dedicated to administrative, research, and consultation work with faculty staff members and professors. (Standard 7.1)

According to the Memorandum of Cooperation with College UBT, ESLG has access also to a big lab of 132 computers of UBT and videoconferencing auditorium with technical aids, conference equipment, a television set, a video projector and a smartboard. The Department also has printing and photocopy equipment for students. It will be possible for students to print, scan and copy materials. There is also a videoconferencing equipment for streaming video lectures live, in which lectures are recorded and filed on the Department's server and can be accessed through the electronic library. Also, four types of software are provided to students: ECOTECT (Sustainable Architecture), SPSS (Quantitative Analysis for Diploma Thesis), Athena Impact Estimator, and VBA Excel.

The financial plan at the programmes level is based on student's fees and investors' capital. Investor capital investments were essential in infrastructure development; the operation of programmes, research, and staff development will have to rely significantly on student tuition fees.

- Expenditure for 2021 is stated at 229,000 euros, but this is counterbalanced by student tuition fees income of 84,000 euros; further 145000 Euro income are





generated by consulting and contract research; in this optimistic case running of the programme is just about cost-covering. Tuition fees would be needed to divided between 2021 and 2022, if exactly calculated.

- For the following years, the result deteriorates due to rising costs, which increase to 402,600 euros in 2022 and to 573,800 in 2023. The income from tuition fees increases to a maximum of 298,800 Euros 2023, which is not realistic because it is calculated with 120 new students; therefore, a new accreditation process would be needed. In the current constitution of the faculty regarding size and research quality, a maximum of 80 students is possible. Consulting and research income increases to 231000 Euro 2022 and increases further more to 27500 2023.

The income planning is a best-case plan and it is calculating with a not realistic number of students. Calculated with the realistic number of 80 first-year-students, a risk of financial loss of 50.000 to 100.000 Euros occurs. (Standard 7.2)

**ESLG Comment:** ESLG must acknowledge that if 80 students are realistic first year students in 2023-2024 and the program will have less 48,000 euros (1,200 x 40 students), the costs will be offset because in the third year the staff expenditures of 300,000 are calculated based on the fact that 120 new students enrolled in 2023-2024 will need to be divided into two groups of 60 students and professors will need to cover courses twice. If in 2023-2024 a realistic number of 80 students is planned, then the staff costs of the third year of the program will be only 240,000 euros. Thus the loss of revenues of 48,000 euros because of unrealistic plan in 2023-2024 shall be offset by total of 99,000 less expenditures due to following reasons: 1) there would only one group of 80 students instead of plan of two groups of 60 students in 2023-2024 (120 students) hence, which needs more courses to be taught and more costs of staff and also more research expenditures. Since there are only 6 courses in the third year, mandatory internship, and diploma thesis (seen in curriculum overview) and only one group of 80 students enrolling in 2023-2024 as first year students, the calculation is that staff expenditures with the realistic 80 students decrease from 300,000 to 240,000; 2) Recurring maintenance in 2023-2024 decreases from 25,000 to 15,000 euros since in 2023-2024 ESLG planned that there will be two groups of first year students; 3) Capital investments will decrease from 50,000 to 35,000 euros due to only one group of first year students (80) in 2023-2024 and only 6 courses, internship, and diploma taught in



the third year 4) scholarships decrease from 40,000 to 30,000 euros because they were planned for more enrolments in 2023-2024; and 5) Other expenditure will decrease from 15,000 to 11,000. Thus, the fear of financial loss because of less revenues of 48,000 euros is offset by the explanation that the year 2023-2024 calculations were based on the assumption that 120 new first year students will need to be divided into two groups of 60 students each.

**ET Comment:** The ET is grateful for the clarification, but as is generally evident, the financial framework can be considered critical.

During the meetings, the ET found out that the institution provides an adequate, clean, attractive and well-maintained physical environment for its building. The College has laboratories with adequate equipment and adequate software for the disciplines of the study included in the curriculum. As long as the agreement between ESLG and UBT does not specify the period of time in which it applies, ET cannot assess that the conditions will be met in the next three years. Adequate computer equipment is available and accessible for teaching, staff and students throughout the institution, and technical support is available for staff and students using information and communications technology.

Using also the libraries resources of UBT College and Nova Univerza, ESLG demonstrates a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission. The libraries provide access to SCOPUS database, BASE, EBSCO, SpringerLink and SAGE Journals.

On the ESLG's website are presented some information considering students with special needs, but the buildings are not suitably adapted for students with physical disabilities, and also, learning resources for special needs (as blindness, deafness etc.) are not available

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	



<p><i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.</p>		X
<p><i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;</li> <li>b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;</li> <li>c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilization licence;</li> <li>d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.</li> </ul>	X	
<p><i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.</p>	X	
<p><i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</li> <li>b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</li> <li>c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognized publishers, from the last 10 years;</li> <li>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;</li> <li>e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.</li> </ul>	X	
<p><i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.</p>		X

**Compliance level: Partially compliant**



Based on the Accreditation manual, infrastructure is still partially compliant, about 50% of the Standards are fulfilled; The ET questions the quantitative approach; also, in this case, without a sustainable finance plan, the other standards have minor importance.

**ET recommendations:**

1. *The ET highly recommends completely revising the finance plan.*
2. *Ensure suitable arrangements are made for the infrastructure and facilities to accommodate students with special physical difficulties.*

**3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET**

The ET wants to thank ESLG for the significant improvements in the self-evaluation report and the open discussion during the SV.

The high quality of the report cannot cover up the structural, institutional weaknesses. In recent years, several programmes have been discontinued or not been successfully re-accredited. The last few years have led to a dramatic decline in academic work. This means that the strategic goal number three, "Develop research capacity", is currently not being supported. Even with the best assumptions, the current financial plan does not cover costs and thus endangers the institution; therefore, the strategic goal number one to develop program that contribute to GDP growth is not supported. These fundamental weaknesses may also explain the lack of clarity in the appointment of two faculty members.

The ET finally recommends accreditation, because formally the standards are covered. A successful re-accreditation of the institution in 2022 could be considered as at least critical.

**In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program "*Management Of Real Estate And Infrastructure (Ba)*" offered by ESLG-College is *substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 year with a number of 80 students to be enrolled in the program.***



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

### Expert Team

#### Chair

**Peter Parycek**

**30.05.2021**

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)

#### Member

**Marko Komšo**

**30.05.2021**

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)