# Accreditation and Re-Accreditation of Study Programmes at AAB College

# A: THE ACCREDITATION PROCESS

# 1. Study Programmes Evaluated

- 1.1 An Expert Team visited Kosovo on 16 and 17 April 2015 for the purpose of considering the accreditation and reaccreditation of the following study programmes:
  - LAW
  - LLM in Criminal Law (re-accreditation)
  - APPLIED ARTS
  - BA in Architecture (re-accreditation)
  - MA in Architecture (accreditation)
  - MA in Visual Design (accreditation)
  - MUSICAL ARTS
  - o BA (BMus) in Folk and Traditional Music (accreditation)
  - NURSING
  - BSc in Nursing (accreditation)

# 2. Expert Team

- 2.1 The Expert Team consisted of:
  - Professor Dr Stephen Shute (Chair), Professor of Criminal Law and Criminal Justice and Provice-Chancellor (Planning and Resources) at the University of Sussex, United Kingdom
  - Professor Dr Balint Bachman, University of Pecs, Hungary
  - Ms Doris Carstensen, Higher Education Consultant, Vienna, Austria
  - Professor Dr Jadwiga Mirecka, University of Krakow, Poland
- 2.2 The Team was supported by two members of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):
  - Ms Furtuna Mehmeti, Acting Director, Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation
  - Mr Shkelzen Gërxhaliu, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

## 3. Basis of the Evaluation

3.1 The Expert Team based its evaluation on the *Self Evaluation Report* initially submitted by AAB College on 30 September 2014; the site visit made by the Expert Team to the College in April 2014; and three pieces of further information requested by the Expert Team at the end of the site visit: (i) a full academic staff list for the programmes in Applied Arts indicating whether or not the staff member

held a PhD; (ii) a full academic staff list for the programme in Musical Arts; and (iii) an indication of how the learning outcomes for the courses that made up the programmes in Law and in Nursing are linked to the learning outcomes for the programme as a whole.

#### 4. Site Visit

- 4.1 The Expert Team visited AAB College on Friday 17 April. During this site visit, the Expert Team had meetings with:
  - Senior members of the College with responsibility for the management of the institution.
    These included the Vice Rektor, Academic; the Vice Rektor, Finance; the Vice Rektor, International; and the Head of Quality Assurance.
  - Members of the College with responsibility for the study programmes evaluated, including those with responsibility for the curriculum and for teaching.
  - Members of the academic staff, most of whom were teaching on the programmes evaluated.
  - Students studying on the evaluated programmes.
- 4.2 The meeting with the senior members of the College was held with all four members of the Expert Team. Meetings with academic staff and students were split. Three members of the Expert Team (Professors Shute, Bachmann, and Mirecka) met staff and students for the Law and Applied Arts programmes (10 students, six studying the BA in Architecture and four studying the LLM in Criminal Law; and 13 academic staff, 10 teaching in the field of Applied Arts and three teaching on the LLM in Criminal Law) while the meetings with the staff for the Visual Design and Folk Music programmes were conducted separately by Ms Carstensen. She met the Vice Rector and the Quality Assurance Manager separately to discuss the managerial support in both study units.
- 4.3 The site visit by the Expert Team concluded with a closing meeting with senior managers of the College.

# 5. The College and its Mission

- 5.1 The College was the first institution to be involved in the delivery of higher education in Kosovo outside of the public sector. It has recently restructured to give greater autonomy to its 10 faculties, empowering the Deans and bringing the delivery of student services closer to students. The new structure, which includes revised arrangements for the management of quality assurance and learning outcomes, took effect in January 2015.
- 5.2 The College's mission includes applying 'new approaches in teaching and scientific research' and providing 'perfect conditions (including new technologies) for work and study for students of all levels and for teachers'. Its vision is to be a 'lead education and research institution that exemplifies the best national and international quality, values and traditions in higher education' and to promote 'high standards of academic and research life at home and abroad in line with new technological developments, fully integrated in ... European higher education trends'.
- 5.3 The College states that it is committed to diversification of its portfolio of programmes. It also says it is committed to interdisciplinarity, multidisciplinarity, and applied research. It wants to embed new teaching techniques, including developing its online learning platform and introducing quizzes, blogs, and chats. It sees 2015 as a 'breakthrough point'.

# 6. Quality Assurance and Quality Management

6.1 Quality management is organized at the institutional level. AAB has a well-defined system of quality control and assurance consisting of structures, procedures and activities. The structures are: Quality Assurance Committee; Central Quality Assurance Office; and Quality Assurance Coordinators at the level of fields of studies. All these bodies have defined roles. They are supervised by the Senate's Quality Assurance Committee and report to the Deputy Rector for Teaching Affairs. The collective bodies include representatives of academic teachers, administrative staff, and students. The procedures include annual or periodic evaluation of study programmes; students' evaluation of teaching; surveys concerning students and staff satisfaction; opinions collected from employers and professional bodies. The rules for implementation of the new programmes or new modules are described. There are defined procedures for students' complaints. The results of students' evaluation questionnaires only recently became available to teachers, who up to now did not receive any feedback.

6.2 Activities coordinated by the QA Office include workshops aimed at the staff development. As reported at the meeting with AAB Management, the last workshop concerned the proper description of learning outcomes at the level of courses. When judging from the course description presented in the Nursing programme, those lessons have not yet been reflected in practice.

6.3 The questionnaire for students' evaluation of courses may require some improvement by including field specific questions (e.g. related to opportunities for training practical skills).

Recommendation 1: Questionnaires used for students' evaluation of teaching should include a field specific component.

Recommendation 2: The type of questions asked should be revised.

# **B: THE PROGRAMMES OF STUDY**

# 1. STUDY PROGRAMME IN LAW

# 1.1 LLM in Criminal Law (re-accreditation)

#### A: ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES AND STUDENT MANAGEMENT

- **1.1.1 Accreditation History:** The LLM in Criminal Law was first accredited in 2011 for one year and was then accredited in 2012 for a further three years. Following the 2012 accreditation visit, improvements were made to the library. The name of the LLM was also confirmed as LLM in Criminal Law (not Penal Law). The required course in Scientific Research Methods (4 ECTS) was also made more rigorous. However, the Faculty did not implemented the 2012 Expert's suggestion that there should be an obligatory course in Legal English in the second semester of the programme.
- 1.1.2 Structure of the Programme: The LLM in Criminal Law is designed to be a specialist, research led programme. It matches the College's mission statement and its curriculum is transparent and comprehensible. The teaching methods used on the LLM are sufficient to meet the programme's goals and outcomes. These include visits to prisons and other agencies involved in law enforcement such as the police. Teaching is delivered in lectures, seminars, exercises, internships, and consultations with Faculty. There is also an element of self-study which allows appropriate space for independent study. reflection, and analysis. The language of instruction is Albanian. In developing the programme, the Faculty aims to respond to developments in Kosovan society and keep pace with international developments in the field such as in organized crime, terrorism, cyber crime, and economic crime (including the abuse of power and corruption). The Faculty introduced a new required course in Organized Crime in October 2014. At the same time, it also introduced two new courses in Cyber Crime and Victimology. The latter two courses were introduced as electives in the first instance in order to see how students respond to them. All these new courses were recommended during the 2012 accreditation but were only able to be introduced when the staff required to deliver them were in place. The Faculty accepts that the current structure of the LLM includes two courses - Criminal Procedure and Criminology – which cover very similar ground to the material covered both in its own LLB degree and in other LLB degrees run in Kosovo. As students studying on the LLM in Criminal Law tend also to be in full-time work, the Expert Team was pleased to learn that the Faculty has responded to this reality by ensuring there is a flexible approach to delivery, with most teaching carried outside the standard working day: i.e. after 5.00 pm and at weekends. The aim of the programme is to prepare lawyers for work in the field of criminal law or for doctoral research by giving them a sound critical advanced masters-level understanding of the field. The level of study is appropriate to the National Qualification Framework and European Qualification Framework. The person with overall responsibility for the programme is Professor Dr Muhamet Kelmendi. All students who have received the Bachelor Degree (after four years) are eligible for admission to the programme so long as they have a minimum average grade (GPA) of 7.5. Where an applicant has an average grade (GPA) of less than 7.5, they are required to take a qualifying examination. These admissions procedures meet the necessary requirements as do the admissions criteria used by the Faculty. The workload for one year, delivered within two semesters, is, in total, 60 ECTS (30 ECTS for each semester). Within the second semester, the masters thesis is allocated 20 credits. The allocation of ECTS is appropriate and justified and the workload is manageable for students.

Recommendation 1: The Faculty should move to make the electives in both Cyber Crime and Victimology required courses for the LLM in Criminal Law. The Expert Team was told that law enforcement agencies in Kosovo currently lack expertise in both these areas. Making them required

courses would therefore further the Faculty's intention for the LLM to serve the current needs of Kosovan society.

Recommendation 2: In order to implement Recommendation 1, the Faculty will need to remove some of the required courses to make space for the new material. It is recommended that the Faculty should remove the courses in Criminology and Criminal Procedure from the required lists: the Expert Team was told that these two courses largely replicate material in the LLB degree and so do not fit with the Faculty's goal for the LLM to be a specialist advanced degree based on applied research in key fields.

Recommendation 3: The Faculty should also consider creating a further required module in Violent Offending (including sex offending).

Recommendation 4: If the courses in Cyber Crime and Victimology become compulsory courses, the Faculty will need to create two new optional courses for the LLM programme in Criminal Law. One possibility is to introduce reconfigured advanced courses in Criminology and in Criminal Procedure.

- **1.1.3 Teaching:** The students the Expert Team met indicated that they had chosen AAB College for their LLM in Criminal Law because it provided a modern curriculum and the teaching and facilities were good. The only significant change they proposed was that there should be even more applied work if that could be provided. The teachers the Expert Team met were committed to their students and keen to provide a strong student experience.
- **1.1.4 Assessment:** Every course on the LLM uses at least four different methods of assessment and some courses appear to use as many as five. This produces unnecessary complication in the programme. The Expert Team was pleased to learn that some of the more practical aspects of the programme are integrated into the assessment process and commends the Faculty for this. Nonetheless, the Faculty should have a constructive discussion on rationalization of assessment. An over complex system can easily depress achievement. The Expert Team was told that students on the LLM in Criminal Law were awarded an overall GPA and then were categorized as either 'pass' or 'distinction'. However, this 'pass' or 'distinction' was based entirely on the student's performance in the masters thesis. Yet only one-third of the programme's credits were attached to this thesis. The Expert Team therefore recommends that the Faculty and the College discuss whether the 'pass'/distinction' structure could be expanded to embrace the whole degree i.e., all 60 ECTS and not just the 20 ECTS allocated to the thesis.

Recommendation 5: The Faculty should seek to simplify the assessment processes for the courses that make up the programme of study. While mixed methods are desirable across the whole programme, there is no need for each course to use every assessment method.

Recommendation 6: The Faculty and the College should explore the possibility of expanding the 'pass'/'distinction' structure to embrace the whole of the LLM in Criminal Law - i.e., all 60 ECTS - and not just the 20 ECTS allocated to the masters thesis.

**1.1.5 Plagiarism:** The Faculty does not currently have an electronic means of detecting plagiarism but it was explained to the Expert team that it was difficult to find a system on the international market that was designed to cope with the Albanian language. The Faculty will need to continue to be vigilant in this area and ensure that it takes robust steps to detect and eliminate plagiarism by its students. The Faculty and/or College should consider establishing an 'Anti-Plagiarism Task Force' to provide strategic oversight for this area.

Recommendation 7: The Faculty and the College should continue to explore whether it is possible to obtain plagiarism software which is able to be used for work written in Albanian.

Recommendation 8: The Faculty and/or College should consider establishing an 'Anti-Plagiarism Task Force' which is able to take strategic oversight on this area.

#### **B. STAFF**

**1.1.7 Staff:** The Faculty of Law has sufficient numbers of appropriately qualified academic staff to deliver its LLM in Criminal Law at an appropriate standard. The balance between full-time and part-time staff is also acceptable. The Expert Team was told that all teaching staff on the LLM in Criminal Law have doctorates with the exception on one teacher who assists on the programme who has a master degree. The Expert Team was also told, however, that the supervision of a few of the masters theses was carried out by professors who were not directly employed by the College. The Expert Team considers this sub-optimal.

Recommendation 9: The Faculty should seek to ensure that the only masters theses that are approved for students are those that can be supervised by members of the Law Faculty in the College.

**1.1.8 Equality and Diversity: Gender Balance:** The accreditation in 2012 noted that there were fewer women than men amongst the Law Faculty's academic staff. From the information received for the 2015 accreditation, this remained the case. The Expert Team urges the Faculty and the College to continue to work to rectify these imbalances as a matter of priority.

Recommendation 10: The Faculty should, as a matter of priority, work with the College to seek to rectify the gender imbalance amongst its academic staff.

**1.1.9 Training in Modern Teaching Methods:** The Expert Team was encouraged to learn from both staff and students that the Faculty of Law reflects critically on how it delivers its teaching. This is an area in which development is always taking place internationally and the Faculty of Law should continue to enhance the skills of its staff, thereby ensuring they are abreast of innovations in higher education pedagogy and modern creative teaching methods. It should also explore opportunities to allow its academic staff to spend short periods of time in institutions overseas to refresh their skills.

Recommendation 11: The Faculty should explore opportunities to allow its academic staff to spend short periods of time in institutions overseas to refresh their skills.

#### C: RESEARCH AND INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION

**1.1.10 Research:** Most teaching staff in the Faculty are actively engaged in research activities which inform both the content of and the teaching delivered on the LLM in Criminal Law. Students on the LLM are also involved in research through their masters thesis and have some opportunities for international internship and exchange. There was, however, a strong appetite amongst the students the expert team met for those opportunities to continue. The importance of research to the LLM in Criminal Law cannot be overstated and the Faculty needs to continue to drive forward its research mission. In the 2012 Accreditation Report it was suggested that the Law Faculty should enhance the opportunities it provides for staff to be involved in research and improve the training it makes available in research methods and the time it makes available for research. The 2012 Accreditation Report also suggested that the Faculty should evaluate the research output of its staff more closely. In the view of the Expert Team, there is still more than could be done in this area. It is therefore

recommended that the Law Faculty introduces a procedure whereby it reviews that performance of all research staff annually. As part of this process, it should ensure that all research staff produce a five-year research plan in which they set out what they are looking to achieve during that period and what support they might need for that, including any additional training needs they might have. Finally, the Expert Team noted that there was a term in the contract for all academic staff that they are required 'to publish at least once a year an article in the scientific journal of the AAB'. Since each edition of that journal, *Thesis*, contains only 10 articles and since there are only two editions published each year, it is not possible for all academic staff to comply with this requirement. It therefore needs to be revised.

Recommendation 12: The Faculty should introduce an annually research planning and monitoring process for all research staff.

Recommendation 13: The clause in the contract for all academic staff that states they are required 'to publish at least once a year an article in the scientific journal of the AAB' needs to be re-thought. This is because the AAB journal, *Thesis*, contains only 10 articles and is only published twice a year. As a result, it is not possible for all academic staff to comply.

**1.1.11 Internationalisation:** The 2012 Accreditation report noted that the Law Faculty should try to establish more Cooperation Treaties with established partner-Institutions. The Expert Team considers that the Faculty should continue to press to internationalise its activities and recommends the establishment of an International Advisory board to assist in this area.

Recommendation 14: The Faculty and the College should establish an International Advisory Board in Law to ensure that the Faculty maintains an outward-looking approach to its pedagogy and its research.

## **D. SPACE AND EQUIPMENT**

**1.1.12** The Faculty of Law has good buildings and other facilities for the study of Law, including a dedicated modern room equipped as a 'moot court. The Faculty also has good specialist facilities for the study of 'criminalistics'.' These facilities meet the requirements of the LLM in Criminal Law.

# **E: QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

**1.1.13** Quality assurance, management, and enhancement is largely handled centrally by the College. The arrangements the College has put in place to handle this are discussed above.

# Accreditation Decision: The LLM in Criminal Law should be re-accredited for three years.

## LIST OF RECCOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LAW PROGRAMME

Recommendation 1: The Faculty should move to make the electives in both Cyber Crime and Victimology required courses for the LLM in Criminal Law. The Expert Team was told that law enforcement agencies in Kosovo currently lack expertise in both these areas. Making them required courses would therefore further the Faculty's intention for the LLM to serve the current needs of Kosovan society.

Recommendation 2: In order to implement Recommendation 1, the Faculty will need to remove some of the required courses to make space for the new material. It is recommended that the Faculty should remove the courses in Criminology and Criminal Procedure from the required lists: the Expert Team was told that these two courses largely replicate material in the LLB degree and so

do not fit with the Faculty's goal for the LLM to be a specialist advanced degree based on applied research in key fields.

Recommendation 3: The Faculty should also consider creating a further required module in Violent Offending (including sex offending).

Recommendation 4: If the courses in Cyber Crime and Victimology become compulsory courses, the Faculty will need to create two new optional courses for the LLM programme in Criminal Law. One possibility is to introduce reconfigured advanced courses in Criminology and in Criminal Procedure.

Recommendation 5: The Faculty should seek to simplify the assessment processes for the courses that make up the programme of study. While mixed methods are desirable across the whole programme, there is no need for each course to use every assessment method.

Recommendation 6: The Faculty and the College should explore the possibility of expanding the 'pass'/'distinction' structure to embrace the whole of the LLM in Criminal Law - i.e., all 60 ECTS - and not just the 20 ECTS allocated to the masters thesis.

Recommendation 7: The Faculty and the College should continue to explore whether it is possible to obtain plagiarism software which is able to be used for work written in Albanian.

Recommendation 8: The Faculty and/or College should consider establishing an 'Anti-Plagiarism Task Force' which is able to take strategic oversight on this area.

Recommendation 9: The Faculty should seek to ensure that the only masters theses that are approved for students are those that can be supervised by members of the Law Faculty in the College.

Recommendation 10: The Faculty should, as a matter of priority, work with the College to seek to rectify the gender imbalance amongst its academic staff.

Recommendation 11: The Faculty should explore opportunities to allow its academic staff to spend short periods of time in institutions overseas to refresh their skills.

Recommendation 12: The Faculty should introduce an annually research planning and monitoring process for all its research staff.

Recommendation 13: The clause in the contract for all academic staff that states they are required 'to publish at least once a year an article in the scientific journal of the AAB' needs to be re-thought. This is because the AAB journal, *Thesis*, contains only 10 articles and is only published twice a year. As a result, it is not possible for all academic staff to comply.

Rrecommendation 14: The Faculty and the College should establish an International Advisory Board in Law to ensure that the Faculty maintains an outward-looking approach to its pedagogy and its research.

# 2. STUDY PROGRAMMES IN APPLIED ARTS

# 2.1. BA in Architecture (re-accreditation)

### A: ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES AND STUDENT MANAGEMENT

2.1.1 Accreditation History: The Bachelor of Art in Architecture was first accredited in 2011 for three years. The programme of BA in Architecture fits to the development of AAB College, it has an obvious strategic role with the other programmes of the Applied Arts Faculty. If AAB wishes to deliver an adequate programme of Architecture, the Expert Team recommends it to follow the EC directive as a guideline for developing a study plan with European recognition. Practically, five years BA+MA educational programs should be proposed for recognition. During the site visit it was established that a masters course of Architecture is designed and AAB is applying for first accreditation. It should be taken in account that a less-than-four-years continuous Architecture study programme or an early specialization (for example in Urbanism) can lead to rejection of the recognition as free lanced Architect of the holder of such a diploma within the EU. On the other hand, the study programme of a future MA with strong content in Urban development/Building management/Heritage protection can benefit the rapid development of the cities in Kosovo. The Republic of Kosovo orients its political, economic and cultural development on European standards, especially those of the European Union. The European Council's Directive 85/384/1985 gives the guidelines for mutual recognition of diplomas in the EU. Architecture is one of seven professions to be examined by a Sub Commission of the European Commission for the notification of qualifications of EU Member States under Article 21(7) of Directive 2005/36/EC. This European organisation is in charge to list the European diplomas in Architecture for full recognition within the EU. There are special criteria for studies in architecture on European level, eleven points mark the content of such studies:

"Education and training leading to diplomas ... shall be provided through courses of studies at university level concerned principally with architecture. Such studies shall be balanced between the theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training and shall ensure the acquisition of:

- 1. an ability to create architectural designs that satisfy both aesthetic and technical requirements;
- 2. an adequate knowledge of the history and theories of architecture and the related arts, technologies and human sciences;
- 3. a knowledge of the fine arts as an influence on the quality of architectural design;
- 4. an adequate knowledge of urban design, planning and the skills involved in the planning process;
- 5. an understanding of the relationship between people and buildings, and between buildings and their environment, and of the need to relate buildings and the spaces between them to human needs and scale;
- 6. an understanding of the profession of architecture and the role of the architect in society, in particular in preparing briefs that take account of social factors;
- 7. an understanding of the methods of investigation and preparation of the brief for a design project;
- 8. an understanding of the structural design, constructional and engineering problems associated with building design;
- 9. an adequate knowledge of the physical problems and technologies and of the function of buildings so as to provide them with internal conditions of comfort and protection against the climate;
- 10. the necessary design skills to meet building users' requirements within the constraints imposed by cost factors and building regulations;

11. an adequate knowledge of the industries, organisations, regulations and procedures involved in translating design concepts into buildings and integrating plans into overall planning."

2.1.2 Structure of the Programme: The BA in Architecture programme of AAB College responds to the 11 points of studies balancing between theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training. Doing so ensures the quality and European recognition of diplomas of Kosovo. The overall programme is a suitable architectural study plan, it fulfils European and international criteria of a 6-semester Bachelor of Art in Architecture level. Design studio work has now about 50% of all classroom hours, which is appropriate. The weekly hours of lectures and tutorials varies from semester to semester: 24 (1.), 26 (2.), 24 (3.), 22 (4.), 22 (5.) and 21 (6.), which is approx. 22 in average, for studies like Architecture affordable. (Students' efforts to complete their design studio work outside lecturing hours can justify a lower workload 20 to 26 hours of contact hours a week.) The ratio of L/E/ECTS of the subjects varies. Every subject has 3/6/9 ECTS, Design projects ("Architectural design") or courses like "Architectural constructions" and "Practice – design studio" have more workload than others, the number of ECTS responds this fact. The entrance criteria for applicants with completion of secondary school in Kosovo or abroad, passing the state exam (Matura) and going through the AAB College entrance exam in "Perception in Space and Free-hand Drawing". A detailed explanation of the evaluation is not included, but the results of earlier procedures shown during the site visit prove its efficiency. Forty students for BA in Architecture is ambitious, but permanent young staff can handle such a big number of students. External professional staff can help to keep up with international movements in architecture. The ratio of (full-time) staff (15) to the number of students (40) is appropriate. High working load of staff can cause problems especially in tutorial demanding subjects like Design or Final work. The curriculum design meets legal requirement for Bachelor study programs of six semesters. Following from the general requirements, the total of 180 ECTS (30 ECTS per semester) is distributed as follows: 130 credits are allocated to the mandatory course units of the study field (12 of them are dedicated to the BA thesis project); elective subjects units account 50 credits or more. The number of subjects studied accountable for one semester is from 4 to 7. The main axis of the studies is dedicated to discipline of design projects going horizontal across all 6 semesters. The axis is supplemented by general professional subjects (Architectural design, Architectural constructions, History of Arch.) and the training of creative skills (Graphic Design, Contemporary issues). In every semester the design task is becoming more complicated therefore theory and practical subjects must help students in every step of the new task. In semester VI are three subjects (Arch. Design, Eco-Arch., Design Studio) related to the final Diploma work (6+3+6+12 ECTS). The workload structure of the programme is focused on lectures and practical exercises within the subjects. Ratio of lecture/practice is ½ which is correct. Subjects for complex understanding of the profession of Architects (Theory, CAD, Project management, History of Arch., English) are provided well spread through the 6 semesters. This structure is logical and consistent to ensure study outcomes and programme aims. The curricula covers the necessary theoretic and practical fields of Architecture, the competence of the profession Architect as a general outcome is secured. An overarching didactic concept of teaching methods is widely acknowledged by the interviewed representatives of the teaching staff. The first cycle architecture studies are finalized with the final work project. The constituent part of the final work is enough to demonstrate skills as professional architect. The semester and final works of graduates demonstrate a professional and artistic result of the BA study program. Group work experience is sufficiently described in the subject syllabus. For professional work collaboration in architectural offices teamwork and collaborations with engineering science specialists are required (Practice Design Studio-Internships). Theoretical components linked to practical work tasks are sufficiently provided in the descriptions. The hours of student's independent work per course seem realistic. Experts of Architectural studies often have the impression, that students are obliged to work much more for the courses than indicated in the descriptions of study modules. Especially design work requires huge amount of workload from students. The descriptions of the design studios (project based learning) and other subjects' definitions are exact, their content is announced in the syllabus.

The study programme of BA in Architecture should continue to process the curricula balancing theoretical (40-50%) and practical (50-60%) knowledge based on design studio work of the students.

Recommendation 1: The new programme scheme has been developed to address Directive 13/55/EU requirements of both the 3 years of BA and the 2 years of MA. The programme should develop specific identity to become more recognisable at the local international market to attract more students from Pristina and the region. The study programme of BA in Architecture should continue to process the curricula balancing theoretical (40-50%) and practical (50-60%) knowledge based on design studio work of the students, Diploma work and other design studio/practical subjects should have in total 50% or more of the total ECTS.

- **2.1.3 Teaching:** The students of AAB College reported about efficient teaching methods, sufficient teachers' effort and good facilities. Students wish significantly more international contents, possibilities for foreign experience. The teachers of BA in Architecture are committed to their subjects and provide an intense communication with the students.
- **2.1.4 Assessment:** the syllabus of the subjects gives clear methodology of the assessment, it describes the task and its parameters (scale 1:1, 2500 words) and includes the criteria (points or %) of the evaluation of students.

#### **B. STAFF**

**2.1.5 Staff:** The BA in Architecture has a sufficient number of qualified staff from the professional (Architecture) point of view. The results of students' works of the last years prove the quality of the education of Architecture at AAB College. The BA in Architecture programme presently has 15 full-time staff members:

<u>Professors:</u> Shyqeri Nimani and Esat Valla, <u>Associated Professors:</u> Dr.Sc Jovan Stefanovski<u>a</u>nd Dr Fejaz Drancolli, <u>Doctoral Candidates</u>: Teuta Jashari-Kajtazi, Bujar Demjaha, <u>Mr. Art, Mr.sc:</u> Nora Krasniqi, Nusret Jusufi, Lulezim Nixha, Armend Fazliu, Flamur Grajcevci, Adelina Tahiri, Egzon Pllana.

Further part-time staff members:

<u>Professor:</u> Dr Sulejman Meta, <u>Associated Professor:</u> Dr Florim Grajcevci, <u>Assistant Professors:</u> Dr Arta Basha-Jakupi, Dr Enis Jakupi, Dr Florina Jerliu, <u>Doctoral Candidates:</u> Dukagjin Hasimja, Luljeta Belegu-Demjaha.

Proper information about the actual status of the teaching (full- and part-time) was handed over to the experts during the site visit. There is a permanent demand on Professors on the field of Art, including Architecture. Professor Shykei Nimani and Professor Esat Valla are highly recognised artists but not Architects. Their competence in Art can have an impact on the artistic quality of Architects' performance if they are deeply involved in the education of them. Architects professional experience and competence are internationally widely acknowledged as a criteria for academic titles. Dr. Sc. Jovan Stefanovski is such a person, finally AAB College announced him as the full stuff member of MA in Architecture. The responsible stuff members like Teuta Jashari-Kajtazi should go on for their PhD for further academic recognition.

Recommendation 2: According KAA Standards, it is necessary to get permanent staff, at least for each competence field one permanent full time Professor or other permanent academic staff member. From the perspective of the future higher education in Kosovo it is necessary to establish

the procedure of announcing professor in private institutes as well. AAB College should encourage and support its employees to finish their long-time PhD procedures abroad.

# **C: RESEARCH AND INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION**

**2.1.6 Research:** AAB College established Research Centres for its disciplines to support scientific and artistic cooperation among the faculties. Architecture and Art Research Centre published in 2013/2014 the Journal of Students of Architecture and Graphic Design (ARCHIDES) as a result of their work in the retrospective. It will be published once or twice within every academic year. Several mutual agreements were signed with Schools of Architecture from the region (Slovenia, Hungary).

Recommendation 3: It is to recommend for all staff members to be involved in international research projects and publish in prestigious journals for Architects.

**2.1.7 Internationalisation:** The 2014 accreditation report noted that Faculty of Applied Art has established cooperation with established foreign partner-Institutions. The expert considers that the Faculty should continue to press to internationalise its activities.

Recommendation 4: The academic qualification of staff is appropriate to their positions at the moment, regarding to the lack of young professors, educators' academic qualification (completing PhD/DLA programs) is a main topic of the development of Architects' education.

Facilities and equipment for scientific work are still missing, a special attention must be paid for the literature. International cooperation with ambitious higher education institutes of the wider region (South, East and Middle-East Europe) can accelerate the development of academic stuff and scientific activity.

# D. SPACE AND EQUIPMENT

**2.1.8** The spaces of the modern building of AAB College dispose of drawing rooms for independent work or storage of students' models/drawings. The existing facilities can host the needs of the Architecture BA course. The campus-like buildings produce a creative mood, which is needed for Architecture. Spaces of common activities like cafés have a great impact on homelike atmosphere.

Recommendation 5: The Library is very poor and needs improvement extensively, in terms of Architecture it does not correspond to European standards at the moment. AAB College should provide appropriate teaching equipment including literature and professional journals of international architecture, design and urbanism. Modelling laboratories should be established and equipped devoted for architectural design studio work in the refurbished building. Co-working with other disciplines of Art is preferred.

Accreditation Decision: The BA in Architecture should be re-accredited for three years.

# LIST OF RECCOMMENDATIONS FOR THE BA IN ARCHITECTURE PROGRAMME:

Appreciated internationally acting Architects should be involved, that ensures the development of practice-oriented attitude of the graduates.

The programme leader is keen to engage more teaching staff with international background, which will bring additional value to internationalization efforts.

Students wish to have more international cooperation and experience. Considering the visa-complusion for Kosovo, in land workshops and common projects with international partners could help.

Library and internet-access are in a good condition, but Architecture, Applied Art and Building Technology oriented literature is missing.

# 2.2. MA in Architecture (Accreditation)

#### A: ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES AND STUDENT MANAGEMENT

**2.2.1** Accreditation History: The Master of Art in Architecture was supposed to be accredited in 2014. Following the 2014 negative accreditation decision, AAB applied again 2015. Following the recommendations of the experts the management drew up a memorandum of understanding with the Chamber of Architects in Kosovo about the acceptance of the degrees BA+MA of Architecture for free-lanced Architectural design occupation of the holders. The expert of the 2014 evaluation denied the need of "artistic" Architecture studies, meanwhile the general requirement about Architectural studies of major professional bodies (EP, UIA, RIBA, NAAC) state that the curricula of all Architectural studies must balance between scientific/engineering and artistic/architectural contents and outcomes. The Architect as general - concept making - author of complex spatial, urban or design tasks should have a strong theoretical knowledge and practical skills of Arts! Indeed it is a global challenge for Architects of nowadays to compete with other professions to develop, coordinate and conduct projects and procedures in building industry. Modernisation of harmonised minimum training requirements enters into force in 2016: the revised Directive (Modernisation of the Professional Qualifications Directive, Brussels, 9 Oct. 2013) introduces changes in the definition of the minimum training requirements for the professions benefiting from automatic recognition (doctors, nurses, midwives, dentists, pharmacists, veterinary surgeons and *architects*):

"For architects, the revised Directive sets the training requirement to either five years of university training or to not less than 4 years of full-time study at a university, supplemented by supervised professional traineeship of a minimum of two years. This solution offers the necessary flexibility to accommodate different approaches in the Member States (the duration of both the academic and practical components varies between Member States)."

It is important to mention these criteria, to underline the need of exact description of the content of courses in Architectural study programs. It is not just the European regulation, which is not mandatory for Kosovan higher education, but it is a general aim of the profession and the art of Architecture to be recognized in that manner, that should be taken in consideration.

**2.2.2 Structure of the Programme:** The programme Architecture MA of AAB College responds to the 11 points of studies balancing between theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training. Doing so ensures the quality and European recognition of diplomas of Kosovo. The overall programme is a suitable architectural study plan, it fulfils European and international criteria of a 4-semester Master of Art in Architecture level. Design studio work has now about 50% of all classroom hours, which is appropriate. The number of theoretical subjects in total (450) is rather low comparing with practical subjects (1095). But it is still acceptable, since practical units have lectures too. The weekly hours of lectures and tutorials (with 1 or 2 electives) varies from semester to semester: 27 (1.), 24 (2.), 26(3.), 22(4.), which is approx. 25 in average, for studies in Architecture affordable. The ratio of L/E/ECTS of the subjects varies. Every subject has 3/6/9 ECTS, Design projects ("Notion, programme and design") or courses like "Urban content-the City" and "Professional practice" have more workload

than others, the number of ECTS responds this fact. The entrance criteria for applicants with a degree BA in Architecture upon the presentation of their portfolio of former projects can secure the quality of students' performance. Additional criteria for applicants is completing a motivation letter describing the ability of the candidates as future free-lanced Architects. The planned 40 students for the first year in Architecture MA is ambitious, permanent young staff can handle such a big number of students. Taking in consideration the average number of graduates AAB can count with lower entrance rate in the first semester of MA. For MA programme a higher proportion of permanent staff is necessary, than for BA. External professional staff can help to keep up with international movements in architecture. The ratio of (full-time) staff (15) to planned number of students (40) is getting worth if upcoming semesters having more and more entries. High working load of stuff can cause problems especially in tutorial demanding subjects like Design or Final work. The curriculum design meets legal requirement for Master study programs of four semesters Following from the general requirements, the total of 120 ECTS (30 ECTS per semester) is distributed as follows: 99 credits are allocated to the mandatory course units of the study field (15 of them are dedicated to the final thesis); elective subjects units account 21 credits or more. The number of subjects studied accountable for one semester is from 5 to 6. The main axis of the studies is dedicated to discipline of design projects going horizontal across all 4 semesters. The axis is supplemented by general professional subjects (Architectural practice, Management, Law) and the training of creative skills (Urban context, Contemporary issues). In every semester the design task is becoming more complicated therefore theory and practical subjects must help students in every step of the new task. In semester IV are two subjects (Master Thesis, Final Project Report) related to the final design (15+6 ECTS). The workload structure of the programme is focused on lectures and practical exercises within the subjects. Ratio of lecture/practice is 1/2, which is correct. Subjects for complex understanding of the profession of Architects (Theory, CAD, Methodology, Research methodology, Construction Law, Society, Sustainable systems) are provided well spread through the 4 semesters. This structure is logical and consistent to ensure study outcomes and programme aims. The curricula covers the necessary theoretic and practical fields of Architecture, the competence of the profession Architect as a general outcome is secured. An overarching didactic concept of teaching methods is widely acknowledged by the interviewed representatives of the teaching staff. There are clear guidelines in the EU Directives that underline the requirements for the education of Architecture. The programme Master of Art in Architecture of AAB College responds on these recommendations. The development of Master studies is obvious to establish free lanced Architects' education. The second cycle of architecture studies is finalized with the final work project. The constituent part of the final work demonstrates skills as a professional architect. In general, it could be argued that the scope of the programme is sufficient to ensure learning outcomes and the content of the programme reflects the latest achievements in science, art and technologies, the subjects are problem and learning outcome oriented. Group work experience is sufficiently described in the subject syllabus. For professional work collaboration in architectural offices teamwork and collaborations with engineering science specialists are required (Professional Architectural practice A, B). Theoretical components linked to practical work tasks are sufficiently provided in the descriptions. The hours of student's independent work per course seems realistic. Experts of Architectural studies often have the impression, that students are obliged to work much more for the courses than indicated in the descriptions of study modules. Especially design work requires huge amount of workload from students.

Recommendation 1: The Expert Team recommends that the descriptions of the design studios (project based learning) should be defined in the documentation. Responding to last year's recommendation: the exact content should be announced in the syllabus. The study programme of MA in Architecture should continue to process the curricula balancing theoretical (40-50%) and practical (50-60%) knowledge based on design studio work of the students. Study program's subjects must be more clearly described; semester works, competences and evaluation should be developed in detail.

- **2.2.3 Teaching:** The students of AAB College reported about efficient teaching methods, sufficient teachers' effort and good facilities. Students wish significantly more international content and possibilities for foreign experience. The teachers of MA in Architecture are committed to their subjects and provide an intense communication with the students.
- **2.2.4 Assessment:** The syllabus of the subjects doesn't make clear the methodology of the assessment, it describes the task and its parameters (scale 1:1, 2500 words) but it doesn't include the criteria (points or %).

### **B. STAFF**

- **2.2.5 Staff:** The programmes BA and MA in Architecture have a sufficient number of qualified staff from the professional (Architecture) point of view. According to KAA Standards:
- "(4.) Teaching Staff. The qualifications of teaching staff in Higher Education Institutions must meet international scientific, artistic and professional standards. Legally binding contracts with these staff must be submitted with the application. These contracts should demonstrate the staff's suitability for the institution's planned studies."

The planned MA in Architecture programme presently has 15 full-time staff members:

<u>Professors:</u> Shyqeri Nimani and Esat Valla, <u>Associated Professors:</u> Dr Jovan Stefanovski <u>and Dr Fejaz Drancolli, Doctoral Candidates</u>: Teuta Jashari-Kajtazi, Bujar Demjaha, <u>Mr. Art, Mr.sc:</u> Nora Krasniqi, Nusret Jusufi, Lulezim Nixha, Armend Fazliu, Flamur Grajcevci, Adelina Tahiri, Egzon Pllana.

# Further part-time staff members:

<u>Professor:</u> Dr Sulejman Meta, <u>Associated Professor:</u> Dr Florim Grajcevci, <u>Assistant Professors:</u> Dr Arta Basha-Jakupi, Dr Enis Jakupi, Dr Florina Jerliu, <u>Doctoral Candidates:</u> Dukagjin Hasimja, Luljeta Belegu-Demjaha.

Proper information about the actual status of the teaching (full-time and part-time) was handed to the experts during the site visit. Last year's negative accreditation was decided mainly upon the unsatisfactory academic status of the teaching stuff. Objectively, AAB does not have enough full time Professor and other types of full time academic staff with academic degrees. Professor Shykei Nimani and Professor Esat Valla are highly recognised artists but not architects. Architects professional experience and competence are internationally widely acknowledged as a criteria for academic titles. Dr. Sc. Jovan Stefanovski is such a person, finally AAB College announced him as the full stuff member of MA in Architecture. The responsible stuff members like Teuta Jashari-Kajtazi should go on for their PhD for further academic recognition.

Recommendation 2: According KAA Standards, it is necessary to get permanent staff, at least for each competence field one permanent full time Professor or other permanent academic staff member. It is a basic criteria for a new accreditation of MA level. From the perspective of the future higher education in Kosovo it is necessary to establish the procedure of announcing professor in private institutes as well. AAB College should encourage and support its employees to finish their long-time PhD procedures abroad.

# C: RESEARCH AND INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION

**2.2.6 Research:** Architects present themselves as usual by competitions and publications of realized buildings and objects. Scientific activity and publishing must be promoted. Despite of Architecture, other disciplines of science are active in national and international professional organizations, the scientific content of their efforts are well documented, it is important to establish the same attitude in Architecture too. The cooperation with other universities in Kosovo and abroad can allow students and their educators to measure their performance objectively. Dr Jovan Stefanovski has a remarkable international professional activity, Teuta Jashari-Kajtazi is participating international architectural events and is and acting architect. For Architects it is rather difficult to take part in research, but there are good practices in Europe to develop doctoral programs especially in Urbanism, spacial design or sustainable Architecture. Most of the staff members are practicing Architects, Urbanists or Artists, some of them with remarkable foreign experience and English language skills.

Recommendation 3: It is to recommend that all staff members be involved in international research projects and publish in prestigious journals for Architects.

**2.2.7 Internationalisation:** The 2014 accreditation report noted that Faculty of Applied Art has established cooperation with established foreign partner-Institutions. The expert considers that the Faculty should continue to press to internationalise its activities.

Recommendation 4: The Faculty and the College should establish an International Advisory Board to ensure that the Faculty maintains an outward-looking approach to its didactics and its research.

The academic qualification of staff is appropriate to their positions at the moment, regarding to the lack of young professors, educators' academic qualification (completing PhD/DLA programs) is a main topic of the development of Architects' education of AAB College on MA level. Facilities and equipment for scientific work are still missing, a special attention must be paid for the literature. International cooperation with ambitious higher education institutes of the wider region (South, East and Middle-East Europe) can accelerate the development of academic stuff and scientific activity.

## **D. SPACE AND EQUIPMENT**

**2.2.8** The spaces of the modern building of AAB College dispose of drawing rooms for independent work or storage of students' models/drawings. The existing facilities can host the needs of the Architecture MA course. The campus-like buildings produce a creative mood, which is needed for Architecture. Spaces of common activities like cafés have a great impact on homelike atmosphere.

# According to KAA Standards:

"(5.) Facilities: The applicant institution should have at its disposal sufficient staff, space and equipment (e.g. computers, library, etc.) for effective studies. These should be provided in accord with the type of educational institution. Evidence about teaching and support staff, space and equipment should accompany the application."

The buildings and facilities meet those criteria, the coexistence with applied arts students can result in complex and interdisciplinary projects of Architects. All kind of interaction between related fields of art and science are beneficial for the scheduled MA course. The library regarding books, magazines and journals shows the urgent need of development of literature in Architecture. The lab with Macintosh computers is adequate for the study programs in Architecture.

Recommendation 5: The management of financing on university level must consider that Architecture is one of the most expensive study programs despite Medicine and some high-tech disciplines. The library is very poor and needs improvement extensively, in terms of Architecture it does not correspond to European standards at the moment.

Classrooms are available and in a good condition, the infrastructure is of European standard. Computers should be available for Architects all day for the preparation of semester-work plans and for practice. AAB College should provide appropriate teaching equipment including literature and professional journals of international architecture, design and urbanism. Modelling laboratories should be established and equipped devoted for architectural design studio work in the refurbished building. Co-working with other disciplines of Art is preferred.

Accreditation Decision: The MA in Architecture should be accredited for three years.

#### LIST OF RECCOMMENDATIONS FOR THE MA IN ARCHITECTURE PROGRAM:

Following the "Directive 2013/55/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 November 2013, amending Directive 2005/36/EC on the recognition of professional qualifications and Regulation (EU) No 1024/2012 on administrative cooperation through the Internal Market Information System ('the IMI Regulation')", a total of at least five years of full-time study at a university or a comparable teaching institution, leading to successful completion of a university-level examination is claimed. AAB College makes a step toward European recognition of its diplomas with the establishment of MA in Architecture.

The expert recommends cooperation with other universities in south/central Europe. The new ERASMUS+ programme will help for such cooperation.

A strong development of the teaching staff towards owning a PhD degree is mandatory.

Cooperation with a recognized school of Architecture on a double degree basis is highly recommendable, such as to identify a mentoring institution which could possibly help the new Master programme developing its own character.

The programme leader is keen to engage more teaching staff with international background, which will bring additional value to internationalization efforts.

A modern equipment of a model building workshops is missing. Printing facilities and machines for efficient mock-up production should be established to the benefit of Architecture and other applied art courses. CAD equipment and drawing facilities should be fully devoted to Architecture study programme and will have to be kept up-to-date following the technical development of the devices.

Library and internet-access are in a good condition, but Architecture, Applied Art and Building Technology oriented literature is missing.

# 2.3 MA in Visual Design (Accreditation)

# A: ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES AND STUDENT MANAGEMENT

**2.3.1 Accreditation History:** In 2014 AAB applied for the accreditation of the postgraduate degree course Communication Design. The expert team (Stroud Cornock and Doris Carstensen) did not recommend the accreditation of Communication Design. They acknowledged the educational potential of the programme, and the pioneering development of a postgraduate programme in the Applied Arts Faculty. For this reason the experts gave a list of recommendations how to strengthen the degree course, and how to reduce its weaknesses.

This year AAB applied with much the same document for the accreditation of the postgraduate degree course named Visual Design. The Vice Rector and the Quality Manager seemed not to know anything about the misleading "reuse" of the documents by the faculty. If the review exclusively bases upon

the documents provide before the visit it will stand to reason that an accreditation of the study programme Visual Design cannot be recommended.

During the site visit to AAB on 17<sup>th</sup> April the Visual Design team was able to explain how they planned adequate teaching and learning forms, how to change the learning outcomes according to future job profiles and labour market demands, and how professional practice and internships would be widened and integrated. Overcoming the discrepancy between the level of detail and knowledge provided in discussions by the staff and management members, AAB documented specific descriptions of the characteristics, objectives and the evidence of this in the course descriptions in AAB College's response to the draft expert report (5<sup>th</sup> June 2015).

The purpose of an evaluation is to propose accreditation decisions and to highlight perspectives for further advancement in curriculum development and teaching and learning practice. Therefore this report will give recommendations and conditions addressing necessary and potential development perspectives.

**2.3.2 Programme Design:** Generally there is a need to tidy up the document in terms of nomenclature, consistency with terminology and accuracy (e.g. 180 ECTS instead of 120 ECTS, SER page 275 and Response page 15).

The documentation of the programme requires revision so that prospective students as well as staff members, visiting professors and other persons external to the staff team are able to see at a glance what the characteristics of the programme are and what makes the programme distinctive. A clear and precise documentation also enables appropriate and rigorous quality assurance and review procedures to be undertaken.

The proposed study programme Visual Design is over four semesters over two years in the full-time mode. The course provides 120 ECTS.

The core curriculum covers computer graphics, web design, the ethics of communication, strategy, advertising, photography and video in single and two-part modules, culminating in a thesis and a project.

These core modules are supplemented by the specification of six elective modules that cover such potential areas of specialisation as advanced use of CAD (?), business administration and marketing, project management and contemporary digital practice.

The appropriateness of this curriculum content and structure can be judge from the discussion and the documented response by the staff. For the intended learning outcomes (see next passage) the elective courses seem to be indispensable – except CAD. Potential students might better benefit, if business and market related topics are embedded in the core curriculum.

Recommendation 0: The designated faculty and AAB management team will provide a study programme documentation with more detail and precision in the form of a 'clean copy'. Therefore the documentation will be tidied up and revised according to the latest provision in AAB College's response.

The documentation of the programme helps prospective students as well as staff members, visiting professors and other persons external to the staff team to see at a glance what the characteristics of the programme are and what makes the programme distinctive.

Recommendation 1: The faculty should consider business-market and management related courses to be part of the core curriculum.

- **2.3.3 Learning outcomes:** During the site visit the designated study programme team clarified and redefined the general learning outcomes as follows:
  - 1. The ability of the student to analyse and to design effective visual design for communication
  - 2. The ability of the student to formulate, create, demonstrate and evaluate practical propositions and design innovation through critical thinking
  - 3. The ability of the student to handle multifaceted visual communication issues across multimedia formats, for various purposes (profit, public-profit and non-profit) in the contemporary market place
  - 4. The ability to use advanced technical and software tools to carry visual design into an online, cross platform world
  - 5. The ability to deploy visual design in marketing and business strategies.

The learning outcomes stated in the discussion by the staff are the purpose of the study programme. The work produced on this in the AAB College's response can be welcomed.

And we remind the designate study programme team to review yearly the teaching and learning practice to ensure that there is consistency across the modules in terms of:

- 1. Great emphasis on guided project work throughout the programme
- 2. Great emphasis on student's independent ideas and creative solutions in devising campaigns
- 3. Great emphasis on multi-media formats (print and online) together with associated methods of providing information, identities and handling transactions across a variety of platforms (!) and media
- 4. Priority of advanced technical and software solutions with a focus on their use in creative and artistic contexts
- 5. Great emphasis on business-market and management aspects in student's projects and experimentation.

Recommendation 2: The Visual Design faculty should clarify the key learning outcomes, and produce a mapping of connected qualifications (knowledge, skills, and competencies), related employment destinations, employment positions.

Recommendation 3: The faculty should monitor how the key learning outcomes are unpacked in specific learning outcomes in the modules. The distinction of specific knowledge, skills and abilities to be achieved in the modules helps prospective students and staff members to learn, to teach and to recognize the study progress.

**2.3.4 Teaching and Learning Methods:** During the site visit and in the response the staff team emphasised distinct teaching and learning activities tailored to the structure and function of the subjects (such as the use of lectures and follow-up seminars; studio demonstration to a group, followed by guided individual practice, guided group works, initiating and organising independent learning activities in workshops, projects commissioned by external partner organisations). The work produced on this in the AAB College's response can be welcomed.

Recommendation 4: The Visual Design faculty further develop distinct teaching and learning activities appropriate to the intended learning outcomes and student's competencies.

**2.3.5 Assessment:** The work produced on this in the AAB College's response can be welcomed. More specified methods of assessment (for example oral or written examination, presentation, test,

paper/essay, portfolio, report about an internship/on fieldwork/on project work etc.), criteria and levels of progression are noticeable.

Recommendation 5: Methods and types of assessment need further development and differentiation to be more coherent with the intended learning outcomes of the modules, and to mark different levels of student's progress.

**2.3.6 Internships and Placements:** The SER states 'the practical part of the programme is very important'. The naming and range of potential industry and media contacts has been widened. Letters of intent or memoranda of agreement would have underlined the reliability.

Recommendation 6: The range of potential cooperation for internships and placements should be widened and be more international. Even virtual-internships should be taken into account, since most of the services, orders and business-models are digital.

#### **B. STAFF**

**2.3.7 Academic Staff:** Professor Shyqri Nimani is the course leader designate. He also is the course leader in other programmes in the Faculty of Applied Arts. One should think about whether Professor Nimani can be supported in his various positions and obligations.

The number of professors and lecturers seems to be appropriate.

The formal and general declaration of staff development done in the AAB College's response can be welcomed. Further development and specification is needed, since the emphasis in the learning outcomes on marketing and business-skills, high end desktop publishing, platforms, and creative and artistic work should give rise to academic, artistic and practical requirement profiles.

Recommendation 7: Staff team and AAB College's management should map the qualifications and fields of expertise in the existing staff, offer trainings to transfer innovative teaching and learning methods, and involve professors from business and economics in the future semesters.

**2.3.8 Gender Equality and Diversity: Gender Balance:** There are no women amongst the Visual Design's academic staff. The expert urges the Faculty and AAB College to rectify this imbalance as a matter of priority.

Recommendation 8: The visual design staff team should, as a matter of priority, work with the Applied Arts Faculty and AAB College to rectify the gender imbalance amongst its academic staff.

#### C: RESEARCH AND INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION

**2.3.9** Apart from passing mention of a research centre at the College the research strategy has to be developed.

Three institutions from Slovenia, Italy and Turkey were named as international cooperation partners. Purposes, duration, objects and activities (staff/student exchange, virtual classrooms etc.) are not clarified.

Recommendation 9: The purpose of international cooperation should be specified. The person in charge for international contacts and cooperation should draw a cooperation profile of each partner institution and make it completely transparent to the graphic design department.

#### D. SPACE AND EQUIPMENT

**2.3.10** As proposed during the site visit an extended analysis would necessitate a better understanding of the demand on those facilities by the growing range of courses across the Applied Arts Faculty. Also by the need to support intensive project work by postgraduate students outside scheduled class hours.

Recommendation 10: The Visual Design faculty should analyse and plan the demand for study spaces, facilities and equipment reflecting the fast growing number of students per year to support postgraduate students' progress and provide sustainable study conditions.

#### **E: QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

**2.3.11** Quality assurance, management, and enhancement are largely handled centrally by the College. The arrangements the College has put in place to handle this are discussed above. The Faculty of Applied Arts needs to be more acquainted with the central QM approach.

Recommendation 11: Transparent processes for curriculum development and control of formal requirements of proposals should be installed and managed in the Faculty of Applied Arts. The Faculty of Applied Arts and AAB College should support its units.

The expert recommendation is that the postgraduate degree course Visual Design can be validated once attention is paid to the following areas already documented in the report but summarized here:

- Study programme documentation with more detail and precision in the form of a 'clean copy' on the basis of AAB College's response
- Matrix on key learning outcomes and linked courses
- Planning of study requirements and learning facilities (space, workshops, software, hardware, real and virtual networking) in the light of the demands of sustained creative study environment and the accelerate rate of growth in the number of students.
- Overview (1 page: time/measure/milestone/responsibility) of the implementation planning for the degree course (e.g. provision of the modules, student recruitment, staff training and deployment, expansion of facilities and equipment)

## LIST OF RECCOMMENDATIONS FOR THE VISUAL DESIGN PROGRAMME

Recommendation 0: The designated faculty and AAB management team will provide a study programme documentation with more detail and precision in the form of a 'clean copy'. Therefore the documentation will be tidied up and revised according to the latest provision in AAB College's response.

The documentation of the programme helps prospective students as well as staff members, visiting professors and other persons external to the staff team to see at a glance what the characteristics of the programme are and what makes the programme distinctive.

Recommendation 1: The faculty should consider business-market and management related courses to be part of the core curriculum.

Recommendation 2: The Visual Design faculty will clarify the key learning outcomes, and produce a mapping of connected qualifications (knowledge, skills, and competencies), related employment destinations, employment positions.

Recommendation 3: The faculty should monitor how the key learning outcomes are unpacked in specific learning outcomes in the modules. The distinction of specific knowledge, skills and abilities to be achieved in the modules helps prospective students and staff members to learn, to teach and to recognize the study progress.

Recommendation 4: The Visual Design faculty further develop distinct teaching and learning activities appropriate to the intended learning outcomes and student's competencies.

Recommendation 5: Methods and types of assessment need further development and differentiation to be more coherent with the intended learning outcomes of the modules, and to mark different levels of student's progress.

Recommendation 6: The range of potential cooperation for internships and placements should be widened and be more international. Even virtual-internships should be taken into account, since most of the services, orders and business-models are digital.

Recommendation 7: Staff team and AAB College's management should map the qualifications and fields of expertise in the existing staff, offer trainings to transfer innovative teaching and learning methods, and involve professors from business and economics in the future semesters.

Recommendation 8: The visual design staff team should, as a matter of priority, work with the Applied Arts Faculty and AAB College to rectify the gender imbalance amongst its academic staff.

Recommendation 9: The purpose of international cooperation should be specified. The person in charge for international contacts and cooperation should draw a cooperation profile of each partner institution and make it completely transparent to the graphic design department.

Recommendation 10: The Visual Design faculty should analyse and plan the demand for study spaces, facilities and equipment reflecting the fast growing number of students per year to support postgraduate students' progress and provide sustainable study conditions.

Recommendation 11: Transparent processes for curriculum development and control of formal requirements of proposals should be installed and managed in the Faculty of Applied Arts. The Faculty of Applied Arts and AAB College should support its units.

# 3. STUDY PROGRAMME IN MUSICAL ARTS

# 3.1 BA (BMus) in Folk and Traditional Music (Accreditation)

### A: ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES AND STUDENT MANAGEMENT

**3.1.1 Accreditation History:** In 2014 AAB applied for the accreditation of the Bachelor degree programme Folk and Traditional Music. In 2014 the experts find out that almost all relevant parts of the curriculum were copied from the websites of Newcastle University. The expert team (Stroud Cornock and Doris Carstensen) did not recommend the accreditation. They shared the impression that the course team designate had not mastered to develop a convincing case of delivering modules, advice and guidance, and assessment in the proposed course Folk and Traditional Music. This year AAB applied with much the same document for the accreditation of the Bachelor study programme Folk and Traditional Music. The Vice Rector and the Quality Manager seemed not to know anything about the misleading "reuse" of the documents by the faculty. If the review exclusively bases upon the documents provide before the visit it will stand to reason that an accreditation of this study programme cannot be recommended.

During the site visit to AAB on 17<sup>th</sup> April the course team designate handed over another version of a revised curriculum. This version illustrated how a focus on a deep knowledge in Traditional Albanian folk music with regard to contemporary and historically informed performance, research and comparison, instrumental and vocal music can be realized. Overcoming this discrepancy between the level of detail and knowledge provided during the site visit by the staff and the documents provided ahead of the site visit, the staff team documented specific descriptions of the characteristics, objectives and course descriptions in AAB College's response to the draft expert report (5<sup>th</sup> June 2015).

Owing to the discussions and the documentation in AAB College's response an accreditation decisions for the study programme Folk and Traditional Music can be proposed. Additionally the purpose of an evaluation is to highlight perspectives for further advancement in curriculum development and teaching and learning practice.

**3.1.2 Programme Design:** This is proposal for a degree course in Folk and Traditional Music, presented over eight semesters over four years in the full-time mode.

The curriculum covers a wide range of 19 subjects. Some are multi-part modules, culminating in a degree dissertation and a performance project. The subjects include performance studies in various constellations, music skills, early and contemporary music, music and culture theory, ethnomusicology, pedagogy, musical instruments, vocal practice.

One of the inspiring sources of the course programme is the unique BA-programme Folk and Traditional Music BMus Honours, Newcastle University. Additionally neighbouring study offers have been consulted with regard to folk education. As a consequence the programme structure is an adaption and the modules function is to specify information, knowledge and skills in Folk and Traditional - respective Albanian – Music.

Generally there is a need to tidy up the document in terms of nomenclature, consistency with terminology and accuracy of expression. The expert found a number of inaccuracies and repetition, even of material from other programmes (AAB College's response, page 70), within the documentation and therefore recommend to provide a study programme documentation on the basis of the last text (AAB College's response) in the form of a 'clean copy'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The course leader designate tried to contact the British faculty for a memorandum of understanding or letter of intent for cooperation with Newcastle University without effort.

A good documentation of the programme helps prospective students as well as staff members, visiting professors and other persons external to the staff team to see at a glance what the characteristics of the programme are and what makes the programme distinctive.

Recommendation 1: The designated staff and AAB management team will provide a study programme documentation for the bachelor course Folk and Traditional Music in the form of a 'clean copy'. Therefore the documentation will be tidied up and revised according to the latest provision in AAB College's response.

**3.1.3 Learning Outcomes:** General learning outcomes such as musical and personal skills, practical and theoretical knowledge, analytical, critical and creative thinking are written out. More comprehensible learning outcomes are clearly stated in the module descriptions. The expert recommends that the staff team undertakes the process of mapping key skills developed and assessed across all the modules. So they can evaluate and record how the modules add up to producing graduates with a specific practical and theoretical skill set, fit for employment and continuing in higher level studies.

Recommendation 2: The staff team should map the key learning outcomes and evaluate how the modules follow with qualifications (knowledge, skills, and competencies) that will add up in prospective professional employments and/or further academic development in higher level studies.

**3.1.4 Teaching and Learning Methods, Assessment:** It would be advisable to put emphasis on the implementation of the distinct teaching and learning activities tailored to the course descriptions. With regard to assessment modes and methods are smart and distinct.

Recommendation 3: The staff team will transform and implement the distinct teaching and learning and assessment modes and methods which are appropriate to the structure and function of the subjects into their actual practice.

**3.1.5 Professional Practice, Placement and Labour Market:** During the site visit the course leader designate mentioned that practical performance of Albanian folk music is very popular, but all too often not professionally performed and not in the line with principles of originality. On the other hand the transcription and conservation of historic Albanian folk music is a demanding task in the region. There seems to be a challenging professional field for academic qualified musicians related with folk and traditional music in the Albanian region. In this constellation AAB College will not only act as an educational provider but also as a developer for professional fields. There is a substantial need for placements, professional contacts and integrated performance practice in studios or in front of an audience for students and academic staff.

Therefore relations to institutional partners in the field of Folk and Traditional Music need continuous development. Besides this academic practice in archives, libraries and ethnographical museum should be fostered as far as possible.

Recommendation 4: The staff team and AAB College should continue the systematic enhancement of professional cooperation and contacts with partners in media, in music performing and recording, profit and non-profit institutions (museums, foundations, university, concert agencies and events). It is necessary to establish some minimum level of oversight and supervision between the College and the institutions.

Recommendation 5: The staff team has to decide how to reflect the learning experience and how to assess the artistic performance of the student in internships and supervised practical work.

#### **B: STAFF**

**3.1.6 Academic and Artistic Staff:** Among the designated staff members are established and well-known artists and scientists. Young artists and scientists complete the team. After the second year the staff might experiment with additional visiting staff members to enhance academic and practical exchange.

Because of the professional background there is a high probability that the course team designate will be able to implement a sound study programme of actual theoretical knowledge and practical skills in Albanian Folk Music and Practice.

Academic staff development planning is specific and personalised. It might be worth considering key trainings for all staff members in student motivation, self-directed learning processes, teaching methods and assessment modes.

**3.1.7 Gender Balance:** The officially presented staff group is in good gender balance.

## C: RESEARCH AND INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION

**3.1.8** Albanian folk and traditional music is an oral and intangible heritage of humanity. There is a high demand for academic expertise, research and conservatory work in the region. The work considering prospective research activities in the AAB College's response can be welcomed.

The staff team should continue to arrange their academic capacity in research and practice. More transparency and a strategic research oversight will help identifying fields of further development and engagement.

Recommendation 6: The staff team and AAB College should continue to develop the research strategy for Folk and Traditional Music in the region. This could integrate research oriented learning (research activities of the students) and academic capacity building in the staff (academic career path).

### D: SPACE AND EQUIPMENT

**3.1.9** The course leader designate explained that AAB College assures to provide the necessary infrastructure for the study programme.

Since this study programme is multifaceted it requires various ressources: computer aided technical audio-visual ressources, real and virtual libraries, publications, licences, instruments, performance and practice rooms etc.

Recommendation 7: The staff team and AAB College will need to specify the planning for a modern teaching and learning environment with real and virtual space (rooms, studios etc.), typical regional instruments, music sheets and transcriptions, real and virtual libraries and archives.

The implementation of this planning verifies that appropriate arrangements are made and underline the serious approach of AAB.

#### **E: QUALITY MANAGEMENT**

**3.1.10** Quality assurance, management, and enhancement are largely handled centrally by the College. The arrangements the College has put in place to handle this are discussed above. The Faculty of Applied Arts needs to be more acquainted with the central QM approach.

Recommendation 8: The Faculty of Applied Arts and the College should support its units with transparent information and processes in an application procedure.

The expert recommendation is that the four year bachelor degree course Folk and Traditional Music can be validated once attention is paid to the following areas already documented in the report but summarized here:

- Study programme documentation with more precision in the form of a 'clean copy' on the basis of AAB College's response
- Matrix on key learning outcomes and linked modules
- Planning of the study requirements and learning facilities (real and virtual space, licences for software, hardware, real and virtual libraries and archives eg.), instruments, performing and practice rooms.
- Overview (1 page: time/measure/milestone/responsibility) of the implementation planning for the degree course (e.g. provision of the modules, student recruitment, staff training and deployment, expansion of learning facilities and equipment)

# LIST OF RECCOMMENDATIONS FOR THE FOLK AND TRADTIONAL MUSIC PRO-GRAMME

Recommendation 1: The designated staff and AAB management team will provide a study programme documentation for the bachelor course Folk and Traditional Music in the form of a 'clean copy'. Therefore the documentation will be tidied up and revised according to the latest provision in AAB College's response.

Recommendation 2: The staff team should map the key learning outcomes and evaluate how the modules follow with qualifications (knowledge, skills, and competencies) that will add up in prospective professional employments and/or further academic development in higher level studies.

Recommendation 3: The staff team will transform and implement the distinct teaching and learning and assessment modes and methods which are appropriate to the structure and function of the subjects into their actual practice.

Recommendation 4: The staff team and AAB College should continue the systematic enhancement of professional cooperation and contacts with partners in media, in music performing and recording, profit and non-profit institutions (museums, foundations, university, concert agencies and events). It is necessary to establish some minimum level of oversight and supervision between the College and the institutions.

Recommendation 5: The staff team has to decide how to reflect the learning experience and how to assess the artistic performance of the student in internships and supervised practical work.

Recommendation 6: The staff team and AAB College should continue to develop the research strategy for Folk and Traditional Music in the region. This could integrate research oriented learning (research activities of the students) and academic capacity building in the staff (academic career path).

Recommendation 7: The staff team and AAB College will need to specify the planning for a modern teaching and learning environment with real and virtual space (rooms, studios etc.), typical regional instruments, music sheets and transcriptions, real and virtual libraries and archives.

The implementation of this planning verifies that appropriate arrangements are made and underline the serious approach of AAB.

Recommendation 8: The Faculty of Applied Arts and the College should support its units with transparent information and processes in an application procedure.

# 4. STUDY PROGRAMME IN NURSING

# 4.1 BSc in Nursing (Accreditation)

### A: ACADEMIC PROGRAMMES AND STUDENT MANAGEMENT

**4.1.1 Relation to the Institutional Mission and Strategy** .The proposed programme belongs to health sciences and extends beyond the areas covered till now by the AAB College. Experience gained in programmes such as Public Health or Physical Exercise and Sport may not be sufficient to deal with this type of study which is subjected to very strict European regulations. An external expertise and consultation with professional bodies may be required. Yet one cannot say that the programme does not correspond to the institutional mission because the latter is formulated very broadly with declared focus on quality of educational methods but not on field specificity. The local insufficiency of the nursing staff as well as the need for upgrading their formal competencies may justify the attempt to create the programme aimed at the degree in Nursing (Bachelor of Science or Bachelor of Nursing). However it does not seem probable that the same programme will be equally suitable for graduates from secondary schools and for currently working nurses.

**4.1.2 Structure of the Programme:** The overall structure of the programme for Bachelor in Nursing does not comply with the European Directive on the Recognition of Professional Qualifications (20005/36/EC, with amendment 2013/55/EU), .The total amount of clinical training envisaged in the programme comprises only around 30 % of the programme length, whereas the Directive requires at least 50%. Most of the programme content is not adequate for the needs of future nurses, being more medically oriented. It is particularly visible in clinical subjects which should deal with the nursing care specific for a given discipline and not with diagnostics and treatment of diseases. Except one subject (Emergency Medicine) one cannot find training in practical skills expected from nurses. Teaching of clinical subjects is not accompanied by practice with patients. All exposure of students to real patients is limited to periods of internships (one after each semester), which are planned to take place in various health care units within and outside of Pristine. The organization of these internships is not yet fully elaborated. The programme organizers have not provided the list of future instructors nor the contracts specifying their duties. There are no arrangements made to assure a proper supervision of training in external locations with 8 students assigned to one instructor-nurse. Taking into account the fact that the later will probably be involved in current duties in the place, one can fear of potential harm being done to patients by unobserved students. There is no indication how it will be assured that each student will have an opportunity to spend some time in contact with patients representing all 9 medical specialties mentioned in the Directive (it is difficult to imagine successful rotations within 6 periods of internships). There are no learning outcomes defined for internships, nor the methods of assessment to confirm that students have reached the goals. It should be also noticed that the design of the programme does not guarantee preparation of students for internships. For the sake of patients, students should practice all necessary skills in laboratory conditions before going to the ward or ambulatory unit. From this point of view the first internship, following teaching in basic sciences only, will find students completely unprepared for any activity related to patients' care. On the list of courses an Introduction to nursing (or Propedeutics of nursing), Palliative Care and Ethics are missing. Absence of ethics as a subject, as well as lack of programme learning outcomes related to values and ethical behaviours is striking in view of the argument presented in Rationale for the programme (poor understanding of professional values by actually working nurses). It also disagrees with the Institutional stress on values (see SER p.3.) The offer of electives is not proper, because according to the European requirements all nursing students must be trained in the First aid, Social Health, Hygiene and Nutrition. Course descriptions are not satisfactory. In some courses there is a mismatch between the course outcomes and their content (e.g. Biology and Genetics, Anatomy, Biophysics, Geriatrics). In many others such a mismatch concerns the recommended textbooks (e.g. "Cytopathology" as a

textbook for Chemistry and Biochemistry, or 'Psychophysics' proposed for Biophysics. In clinical subjects the topics are often irrelevant for nurses and textbooks are more suitable for specialists in medicine. The principles underlying an allocation of ECTS points are not quite clear, because it seems that it was not the students' workload which determined the number of points, but rather that the sum of 60 points devoted to one year was divided between the courses (SER p.324). The total student workload is very high, but this is the consequence of the European requirement of 4,600 hours of instruction to be accommodated in the three years of studies which hardly leaves any space for self-learning.

- **4.1.3 Teaching:** The teaching methods in general are not adjusted to specificity of nurses training. Besides universal didactic forms like lectures, other means of teaching listed in course descriptions like: text analysis, work sheets, flip-charts have no application in this practically-oriented programme and should be replaced by practice in the ward, role playing or problem-based learning (PBL). There is also deficiency in training of practical skills in simulated conditions (simulated patients, virtual patients, manikins,)
- **4.1.4 Assessment.** The methods of assessment in relation to basic sciences are dominated by written examinations. The proportional value of text analysis seminar papers, and written test is the same for all subjects, regardless their content and specificity. In clinical subjects the methods of assessment include: participation in lectures, engagement in seminars, two colloquia and final exam (in unspecified format). Although half of the each course, according to their description, consists of practice, the assessment of the practical component does not exist.
- **4.1.5** The Link between the Learning Outcomes and Courses: The additional document providing link between the learning outcomes and courses shows all 9 learning outcomes of the programme distributed among the courses. But more thorough study reveals that in many cases there is a discrepancy between the programme outcome assigned to the course and the actual course content or learning outcomes defined for the course. One cannot see for instance any trace of self-assessment and self-improvement in Biology and Genetics. The courses in Anatomy, Physiology, Chemistry are very loosely (if at all) related to advising patients about their health. The course on Communication skills does not prepare students for planning and implementing technical procedures.

Recommendation 1: The concept of the programme should be consulted with experts in nursing (not only with experts in medicine)

Recommendation 2: The number of hours devoted to clinical training should be adjusted to the European requirements.

Recommendation 3: The content of courses should be re-oriented towards the needs of future nurses.

Recommendation 4: The list of practical skills required from nurses should be prepared and their training assured.

Recommendation 5: Training of the required skills in laboratory conditions should precede contacts with real patients during internships.

Recommendation 6: The organization of internship must assure the defined content (learning outcomes), adequate supervision (devoted time of nursing-instructors), students' rotation across all required specialties as well as suitable assessment of the results of such training.

Recommendation 7: The list of courses should be supplemented by Introduction to nursing, Palliative Care and Ethics.

Recommendation 8: First aid, Social Health, Hygiene and Nutrition should be moved from the elective to mandatory component of studies.

Recommendation 9: The course description should be corrected taking into account the relationship between the outcomes, content, and recommended textbooks.

Recommendation 10: Different teaching method should be chosen to fit the expected learning outcomes. Practical training should make use of simulations (simulated patients, virtual patients, manikins)

Recommendation 11: The assessment of students' progress should include evaluation of practical skills, with a focus on practical competences of future nurse.

Recommendation 12: There should be more alignment between the main learning outcomes, outcomes from courses and their content.

#### **B. STAFF**

**4.1.6** Although the list of pre-contracted staff includes several highly qualified persons, they represent areas different from nursing (medical doctors, experts in public health). There are only two qualified nurses on the list of 21 staff members. It stays in opposition to the requirements of the European Directive which explicitly defines that education of nurses should take place chiefly under supervision of nurses (even in relation to theoretical training). Assignment of some teachers to subjects does not seem justified by their experience (for instance Mr Beka Vokshi is supposed to take responsibility for Introduction to research, whereas he cannot prove his experience in this field by any scientific publication, Dr Pravera Zejnullahu with a background in physiology is assigned to the course on Infectious diseases. Shortage of specialists in the field leads to the situation when the same person is proposed for a variety of courses (Dr Ylzim Dyla being a specialist in family medicine is listed as responsible for Community nursing, First aid, Statistics and informatics as well as for Impact of environment).

Recommendation 13: The institution should employ qualified nurses in the role of teachers. In view of the shortage of graduate nurses in Kosovo it may be necessary to look for them in neighbouring countries.

Recommendation 14: More attention should be also paid to professional experience of other teachers.

# C. RESEARCH AND INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION

**4.1.7** Because the members of pre-recruited staff have no experience in nursing, one can hardly expect their research achievements in this field (although some of them have published papers in the area of health related sciences) The research plan outlined for the Nursing programme does not provide any information about the future areas/topics of research. Among the six Research Centres which are supposed to coordinate the research in AAB there is not one embracing the health sciences. There is no clue regarding the procedure for choosing the research projects for students' diploma. Till now one cannot see any international cooperation evidently linked to the Nursing programme.

# **D. SPACE AND EQUIPMENT**

**4.1.8** The Laboratory for Practical Training is located in one room. Almost half of the models exposed there represent teaching aids for anatomy, but not for nursing care. Single copies of manikins for resuscitation and general care are present. The number of small items mentioned on the list of equipment is unknown. In general the conditions may be suitable for demonstration of some technical

procedures by teachers, but not for their practising by students. In the Library several new copies of specialist medical textbooks (e.g. Family Medicine, Gynaecology, Ophthalmology) look nice on the shelves, but are of no use for the Nursing programme. There are only single copies of the two textbooks related to nursing.

Recommendation 15: The Laboratory for Practical Training should be rearranged with more space and more equipment available. In particular phantoms for: Baby Care, Breast examination, wound dressing and bed sore care are needed. It would be also desirable to get more advanced simulators allowing for training in variable conditions. Other items should be provided in numbers allowing students to practice in pairs.

Recommendation 16: Textbooks related to nursing, if possible in native language, should be purchased (after consultation with teachers of respective subjects).

Accreditation Decision: In view of the existing shortages concerning the structure and content of the programme, methods of teaching and assessment, inadequate equipment as well as staff without adequate experience in nursing the programme for BSc in Nursing CANNOT be recommended for accreditation.

#### LIST OF RECCOMMENDATIONS FOR THE NURSING PROGRAMME

Recommendation 1: The concept of the programme should be consulted with experts in nursing (not with experts in medicine).

Recommendation 2: The number of hours devoted to clinical training should be adjusted to the European requirements.

Recommendation 3: The content of courses should be re-oriented towards the needs of future nurses.

Recommendation 4: The list of practical skills required from nurses should be prepared and their training assured.

Recommendation 5: Training of the required skills in laboratory conditions should precede contacts with real patients during internships.

Recommendation 6: The organization of internship must assure the defined content (learning outcomes), adequate supervision (devoted time of nursing-instructors), students' rotation across all required specialties as well as suitable assessment of the results of such training.

Recommendation 7: The list of courses should be supplemented by Introduction to nursing, Palliative Care and Ethics.

Recommendation 8: First aid, Social Health, Hygiene and Nutrition should be moved from the elective to mandatory component of studies.

Recommendation 9: The course description should be corrected taking into account the relationship between the outcomes, content, and recommended textbooks.

Recommendation 10: Different teaching method should be chosen to fit the expected learning outcomes. Practical training should make use of simulations (simulated patients, virtual patients, manikins).

Recommendation 11: The assessment of students' progress should include evaluation of practical skills, with a focus on practical competences of future nurse.

Recommendation 12: There should be more alignment between the main learning outcomes, outcomes from courses and their content.

Recommendation 13: The institution should employ qualified nurses in the role of teachers. In view of the shortage of graduate nurses in Kosovo it may be necessary to look for them in neighbouring countries.

Recommendation 14: More attention should be also paid to professional experience of other teachers.

Recommendation 15: The Laboratory for Practical Training should be rearranged with more space and more equipment available. In particular phantoms for: Baby Care, Breast examination, wound dressing and bed sore care are needed. It would be also desirable to get more advanced simulators allowing for training in variable conditions. Other items should be provided in numbers allowing students to practice in pairs.

Recommendation 16: Textbooks related to nursing, if possible in native language, should be purchased (after consultation with teachers of respective subjects).

**Professor Dr Stephen Shute (Chair),** Professor of Criminal Law and Criminal Justice and Pro-vice-Chancellor (Planning and Resources) at the University of Sussex, United Kingdom

**Professor Dr Balint Bachman,** University of Pecs, Hungary

Ms Doris Carstensen, Higher Education Consultant, Vienna, Austria

Professor Dr Jadwiga Mirecka, University of Krakow, Poland

16 June 2015