

# External Evaluation Report

## Programme Evaluation at AAB College

### Table of Contents

<b>1. Introduction</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>1.1. Context</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>1.2. Experts</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>1.3. Procedure and Evidence Collection</b> .....	<b>3</b>
1.3.1 Self-Evaluation Report (SER).....	3
1.3.2. On-site Visit .....	3
1.3.3. Additional Documents.....	4
<b>2. Programme Evaluation – Social Policies and Child Welfare (MA)</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>2.1 Academic Programme and Student Management</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>2.2 Staff</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>2.3. Research and International Co-operation</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>2.5. Quality Management</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>Final recommendation</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>3. Evaluation of Study programmes of BA Psychology and MA Organizational Psychology</b> .	<b>9</b>
<b>3.1. Curricula</b> .....	<b>9</b>
<b>3.2. Research</b> .....	<b>10</b>
<b>3.3. Staff</b> .....	<b>11</b>
<b>3.4. Space and equipment</b> .....	<b>13</b>
<b>Concluding remarks and recommendations</b> .....	<b>14</b>
<b>4. MA in Public Administration and Diplomacy</b> .....	<b>15</b>
<b>4.1. Academic Programmes and Student Management</b> .....	<b>15</b>
<b>1.2. Staff</b> .....	<b>17</b>
<b>1.3. Research and International Co-operation</b> .....	<b>17</b>
<b>1.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment</b> .....	<b>17</b>
<b>1.5. Quality Management</b> .....	<b>18</b>
<b>Overall Recommendation</b> .....	<b>18</b>
<b>2. LLB in Law</b> .....	<b>19</b>
<b>5.1. Academic Programmes and Student Management</b> .....	<b>19</b>
<b>2.2. Staff</b> .....	<b>21</b>
<b>2.3. Research and International Co-operation</b> .....	<b>21</b>
<b>2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment</b> .....	<b>22</b>

2.5. Quality Management .....	22
Overall Recommendation .....	22
<b>3. LLM in Civil Law.....</b>	<b>23</b>
6.1. Study Programme and Student Management.....	23
3.2. Staff .....	24
3.3. Research and International Co-operation .....	24
3.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment .....	24
3.5. Quality Management .....	25
Overall Recommendation .....	25
<b>4. Bachelor of Arts B.A. in „Physical Culture and Sports“ and Master of Arts M.A. in “Physical Culture and Sports” .....</b>	<b>26</b>
7.1. Academic programmes and student management.....	26
7.2. Staff.....	28
7.3. Research and International Co-operation.....	29
7.4. Finances and Infrastructure / Space and Equipment.....	29
7.5. Quality Management .....	30
General recommendations:.....	30
<b>8. Student Matters – Overall Comments.....</b>	<b>31</b>
8.1 Positive Aspects .....	31
8.2 Aspects for improvement .....	32

# 1. Introduction

## 1.1. Context

The present document contains the draft version of the evaluation report 2016 and it focuses on the programme evaluation level at the AAB College in Pristina, Kosovo. It is the result of the collegial work of an international team of experts appointed by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA). The report is based on the Self-Evaluation Report (SER 1) of the AAB College, the visit of the expert group in Pristina on 26<sup>th</sup> March 2016, and further information of the AAB College, as requested by the expert group.

## 1.2. Experts

The team consisted of following experts:

- Prof. Dr. Peter Parycek/Danube University Krems, Austria
- Prof. Dr. Robert Masten/University of Ljubljana, Slovenia
- Prof. Dr. Milan Pol/Masaryk University, Czech Republic
- Prof. Dr. Harald Tschan/University of Vienna, Austria
- MSc. Rebecca Maxwell Stuart/European Students Union

## 1.3. Procedure and Evidence Collection

### 1.3.1 Self-Evaluation Report (SER)

The AAB College submitted a detailed SER as the central document for the accreditation of the study programmes. The report thoroughly describes all the programmes in focus. Consequently, it enabled the expert team to get a clear picture of the current situation of the study programmes concerned and this way served as a solid information source to prepare for the on-site visit.

### 1.3.2. On-site Visit

On 25<sup>th</sup> March 2016 the experts gathered in the evening for a preliminary working dinner together with two members of the KAA:

- Ms Furtuna Mehmeti, Acting Director, Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Mr Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

The experts discussed their impressions of the SER. Also, they agreed on the allocation of responsibilities within the expert team in the following way: Prof. Peter Parycek was responsible for the evaluation of programmes of Law/LLB, Civil Law/LLM, and Public Administration and Diplomacy; Prof. Harald Tschan was responsible for evaluation of the programmes Physical Culture (BA, MA); Prof.

Robert Masten was responsible for evaluation of the programmes Psychology (BA, MA); Rebecca Maxwell Stuart was responsible for student matters for all programmes; and Prof. Milan Pol was responsible for evaluation of the programme Social Policies and Child Welfare (MA), and also for moderation of the meetings during the site-visit. All members of the expert team agreed to conduct their work during the on-site visit together and in close co-operation, the same concerned the way of developing the Final report.

On 26<sup>th</sup> March 2016 the expert team spent one day at the AAB College.

The expert team was accompanied by two members of KAA:

- Ms Furtuna Mehmeti, Acting Director, Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Mr Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

The on-site visit took place as planned. It started in the morning with a meeting with the management of the institution from 9.00-11.00; then the visit to facilities followed (11.00-12.00). After a working lunch of ET and Co. KAA (12.00-13.30) the visit continued with (1) the meeting with responsible persons for the study programmes (13.30-15.30), (2) the meeting with the teaching staff (15.30-16.30), and (3) the meeting with students (16.30-17.30). At the end, the closing meeting with the management of the institution took place (17.45-18.00).

The expert team would like to express their gratefulness to the management of the AAB College and to the representatives of the study programmes for very good organization of the visit. Also, the experts warmly thank the KAA and especially Ms Furtuna Mehmeti and Mr Shkelzen Gerxhaliu for their outstanding support and cooperation before, during and after the visit.

### 1.3.3. Additional Documents

After the on-site visit a few additional documents were requested. They were sent in time by the management of the institution.

## **2. Programme Evaluation – Social Policies and Child Welfare (MA)**

### **2.1 Academic Programme and Student Management**

The programme Social Policies and Child Welfare corresponds well to the institution's vision and mission statements and to principles of operation. The aims of the programme are appropriate to the master degree; quality and range of the programme are sufficient.

One can identify an overarching didactic concept within the programme and this seems to be typical by emerging effort to balance the theory and the practical inquiries, to offer historical, methodological, as well as up-to-date specific information from relevant disciplines of social policies, social work, psychology, and more. There seems to be communication with the staff about the programme and its concept and the staff are aware about the programme's concept.

The academic degree of the programme (master degree) is in principle comparable to international standards.

As for the independent study within the programme, the programme structure makes it possible. However, one is concerned about a real use of the study resources (the library still requires major improvements, and online resources seem to be used to a certain extent only). Also, some study literature ("Core literature") is only in English, which raises the question of language proficiency of all students.

The allocation of the ECTS seems to be appropriate and justified, the workload required for the academic programme is manageable by students. A slightly higher number of contact hours seems to be justified with the fact that facilities/resources for independents study need improvements, as already mentioned. There was a question regarding the content of the last term, which is totally devoted to the final thesis. But, the way the 'Manual for Diploma Thesis' is elaborated shows this part of study is prepared and justifiable.

Admission criteria and admission standards are acceptable, for students coming from the outside (mainly those who did not study a close-to-bachelor programme at the AAB College) there are three courses prepared to help them to adjust (Social Education, Pre-school Education, Social Policies) – I find this measure appropriate.

The ratio of students/staff seems acceptable.

Student involvement in the study has several levels. First, there is a student organisation that is involved in a number of ways in the ABB College life. While students are also involved in regular evaluation of teachers' work and of other aspects of studies at AAB College, communication of evaluation results to students

remains a challenge. The institute of student tutors seems to be a well-functioning instrument to facilitate well-being of students here.

Recommendations:

1. Continue in searching balance between the theory and practical parts of the program (mainly by interlinking these two elements of the programme)
2. Emphasise explicitly more diversified opportunities for practical internships for the students – with regard to a broad area where social policies and child welfare can be studied in practice.
3. Support supervised research activities of students, for instance in relation to their practicum (internships).
4. Make sure there is enough available Core literature in Albanian language to the students.
5. Strive towards such an arrangement of study/information resources (library, e-learning facilities) that would make it possible for the students to use time for independent study effectively.
6. Develop a strategy of communication of evaluation results of the teachers' work and of other aspects of AAB College operation to the students.

## **2.2 Staff**

The situation for staffing seems to be relatively good at AAB College, taking into account that overall staffing is often a problem in Kosovo HE institutions. The AAB College has progressed in getting more staff on permanent basis – nowadays, it is about 60% of the staff with such a contract.

Some staff members study their PhD abroad (incl. Western European countries), and they can be viewed as a promising future of the AAB College.

Considerable work has been done as for staff development, namely in two directions: (1) development in teaching-methodology skills; (2) development of research-related skills. The focus on research should still be strengthened, though, it seems, also in relation to students' involvement in research.

Recommendations:

1. Continue working on development of research-related profile of the staff.
2. Provide explicit and effective support to those staff members who study their PhD programme abroad.

## **2.3. Research and International Co-operation**

Research still seems to be in need of further development. It appears, staff members need more stimuli to get involved in research and publication activity in relevant forums

(journals, conferences). However, there are documented forms of student involvement in the research activities.

Also, internationalisation has a potential to improve studies at AAB College. The AAB College has some relations with institutions and individuals from Albania, Macedonia, Montenegro, and also with some institutions in Germany. This mainly relates to the teaching. Chances for students to benefit from international exchanges are not high, although, again, there were several attempts to provide students with short-term study abroad experiences (Germany in particular). Partly, the problems in internationalisation can be seen in relation to complicated visa procedures for people of Kosovo.

**Recommendations:**

- Stress the importance of professors as research leaders.
- Continue linking student research and staff research.
- Increase financial support of staff research and also student research.
- Support different ways of internationalisation of the study programme.

#### **2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment**

The AAB College enjoys new buildings which is a great support to all the HE processes.

Finances seem to be centralised and invested from the level of the AAB College management into different aspects of the programme. Maybe more financial independence down to the lower levels would be beneficial for the programme.

E-learning facilities support the programme realisation and it is important to continue in this direction. Library still seems to be a weaker point of the AAB College and the same relates, consequently, to the programme concerned.

**Recommendations:**

1. Improve library.
2. Keep developing and using effective e-learning system that could in a synergic way support “traditional” teaching.
3. Consider possibilities of financial decentralisation down to the level of the programmes as well as research, library etc.

#### **2.5. Quality Management**

As for the quality management, many processes have been set up in order to assure the desired quality, especially in the area of teaching. More attention to research, internationalisation, and facilities is recommended here, too.

**Recommendation:**

1. Focus on QA related to the development of research, internationalisation, and library/study resources.

### **Final recommendation**

**With regard to the above mentioned, I recommend to award the programme accreditation for the period of 3 years.**

Prof. Milan Pol



### 3. Evaluation of Study programmes of BA Psychology and MA Organizational Psychology

#### 3.1. Curricula

In 2013, with regards to BA Psychology there was suggested i.e., to change order of the subjects in the curriculum, from more basic to more advanced; to think about differentiation between particular subjects; to unify (or simply to correct) the titles of the subjects; and to make some improvements of contents of certain subjects.

However, the titles of subjects at **BA Psychology** as listed in SER, p. 141-142 for BA or in SER, p. 188 – 190 often differ from those described in syllabuses which I suggest to correct. Maybe there is just a typing error, but there could also be a question of naming particular subjects as grounded as possible. One possibility is i.e. “*Abnormal psychology*” which is correctly named according to different standards, but still maybe it brings some negative connotations.

I would say that if we compare different basic areas of psychology, pedagogical (educational) psychology is relatively poorly represented as it is only one subject in the curriculum. Otherwise different areas of psychology are well represented at BA level. In the curriculum there are some shortcomings, i.e. *Developmental psychology* includes populations like children and adults, but adolescence or transition to adulthood isn't mentioned (except in clinical, not developmental context). Also it is more visible that subjects are included in curriculum from more to less basic ones.

AAB College decided to do steps towards specialization towards **MA Social and Organisational Psychology** according to their analyses of local context. This decision was not towards pedagogical psychology as suggested (i.e. 50% of Kosovo population under 23 years) but the decision sounds reasonable (entrepreneurship oriented population, many companies in the country, which probably needs psychological services, possibilities to find jobs).

We found out again that titles of subjects as listed in SER p. 179 often differ from those named in particular syllabuses (p. 191, 196, 199 ...). For elective subject E - “*Group and Individual Counselling in Organisations*” - no syllabus was found. In the second year of MA study, maybe it would be better to name a subject as “*Psychological Assessment in*

*Organisational Settings*", not just "Psychological Assessment", which is more general or basic subject since in SER p. 204 it is stated that "*the purpose of the course is to introduce students on assessment in the context of selecting and assessment in organisations.*" In the case of a subject "*Intercultural Communication in Organisational Context: Theory, Issues and Practice*", a shorter title would be enough. In the cases of some subjects on MA (i.e. *Group Dynamics, Research Methods with Statistics ...*) in relation to BA subjects (i.e. *Group Psychology...*), it is not clear if subject upgrade each other or if they overlap to a certain degree. In some syllabuses we found that literature is out of date (i.e. SER p. 142, 143, 148...)

### **Conclusion**

Altogether, with some reservations or/and comments I evaluate that on both, BA and MA levels, curriculum and particular subjects itself are in general appropriate, where there is some room for improvements or/and corrections left, as mentioned above.

### **3.2. Research**

Comparing with evaluation in 2013 there was improvement done regarding the psychological laboratory. There could be substantial differences of course in equipment's and activities of different laboratories, but basic steps were done. As mentioned before, young psychologists in the Lab introduces current projects (some adaptations of psychological diagnostic instruments for Kosovo). As mentioned also in 2013, *psychodiagnostical materials base is very welcome since there is a lot of such material for which it would be welcome to be adopted for Albanian language and population. Therefore that could be an ongoing project.*

The facility (as mentioned later below in subchapter "*Space and equipment*") included one-way mirror, which is more oriented towards skills training, but could be also used in research context (i.e. observations etc). It was not clear if statistic packages (i.e. IBM SPSS or similar) are standard in the context of the study, my suggestion is to include it as much as possible. Members of AAB Psychology department were engaged in last accreditation period on the field of professional and scientific activities (i.e. especially conferences, less in publication).

### **Conclusion**

Improvement was done during last accreditation period. Academic staff members were professionally active, they were less active scientifically. Some specialisation toward subareas of psychological science and practice would maybe bring some also to the area

of research. I suggest to keep psychological laboratory, psychological instruments adaptation and other research oriented activities as ongoing project.

### 3.3. Staff

There are three “key” professors listed in SER, p. 407 for BA Program Psychology, all with contact for 100%:

Prof. Mimoza Shanini, Prof. Aferdita Ahmeti and Prof. Tahir Latifi (or Latifaj as also appears in KAA documents).

Prof. Shanini is teaching 4 subjects on BA level, and 4 subjects on MA level, a total of 8 subjects. Prof. Mimoza Shanini is one of the “key – professors” on both BA and MA level, but she is not psychologist by education (BA, PhD Medicine, MA Mental Health, Training in Psychiatry and Child and Adolescent Psychiatrist, Certified Trainer of Body-Mind Medicine and she is educated in Family Therapy and her PhD is related to Mental Health and Behavioural Science). Beside teaching **eight** subjects, she is engaged as Head of Child Psychiatry in University - Clinical Center of Pristina, Lecture of Human Behaviour - Medical University of Pristina, Psychological Counselling for children faced with domestic violence, youth trafficking - Security Centre “Hope and Homes”, NGO, Pristina, Lecture of Communication Skills in Psychology, Interpersonal Relationships, Family Counselling and Family Therapy - Department of Psychology and Management, College Dardania, Pristina and as Supervisor of Doctoral Students, European University of Tirana, Albania. That’s impressive or even impossible to work on so many areas.

Prof. Tahir Latifi is not psychologist, but probably doctor of Philosophy by education (CV is in Albanian only). He is teaching **two** subjects Anthropology and Cultural psychology.

Prof. Aferdita Ahmeti is teaching at BA and MA level **four** subjects.

Further, there are other professors, employed full time (100%) and teaching at BA level: Prof. Hana Saliu. She works also at State University of Tetovo; Prof. Merita Shala; and Prof. Myqereme Rusi. Together on BA level there are four psychologists with PhD in psychology, employed for 100%.

Interestingly, there are another two full time professors listed as fully employed at AAB (SER p. 402-403): Prof. Emrush Taqi and p]Prof. Neki Juniku, who are **not engaged in any of subjects in curriculum**. I don’t understand that.

There are unreasonable big differences in pedagogical work load between different professors who are all employed for same amount (100%), i.e. Prof. Mimoza Shanini - eight subjects, Prof. Hana Saliu - only one subject, although both employed for 100%.

At MA Social and Organizational Psychology program ( the names of program as appearing in SER are not consistent, e.g. SER p. 179 – Social and Organisational Psychology and SER p. 407 – Organisational and Social Psychology) there are following three full time professors (SER p. 407):

Prof. Merita Shala, Prof. Myqereme Rusi and Prof. Sunaj Raimi. The last one, Professor Sunaj Raimi, who is not psychologist by education is not included in a list of employees p. 402-403, but he is included in summary of subjects in MA program on p. 188 – 189, teaching three subjects like *Advanced Social Psychology, Leadership and group performance* and *Negotiation and social decision*. Again, this case is another example where non-psychologists teach psychological subjects.

On MA program Social and Organisational psychology there are four full time employed professors – psychologist by education (Aferdita Ahmeti, Agron Hoxha, Merita Shala, Myqereme Rusi). Although, it is not clear how could particular professors work at AAB for 100%, if they are fully engaged at other institutions in other countries.

### **Conclusion**

There are four fully employed professors with PhD in psychology at each of two programs. Some professors are teaching subjects which are not related to their basic education. General guideline should be that psychological subjects should be hold by psychologists by education. Some areas of science border to psychology and are important area to cooperate with but shouldn't be substituted one with other.

There is a big differences between work load of professors, who are employed for same proportion (i.e. 100%) is found, i.e. teaching one to eight subjects with same type of contract. Unreasonably, big workload is found in the case of some professors, many of these cases are not documented since we are not informed about engagement at other institutions in the state and in region.

Another issue of professors or of personnel in general is possibility for **potential “specialization” towards subareas** of psychology (research, lectures, even “departments” for subareas of psychology with “key-person responsible for the area?). This is not necessary, but it is common and practical. Particular professors can more precisely “cover and take care” for less sub areas in comparison when they cover many areas. That can be only partly based on subjective perceptions of “feeling comfortable” with specific areas (i.e. clinical psychology, organizational psychology ...), but should be

based more on experience and academic career. On the basis of SER we found out that particular professors cover very different areas of psychology.

We know that in general there are problems with career developments and consequently providing adequate academic staff and that is a matter of short-, mid- and long- term career planning. So we met some very perspective persons in academic sense of a word (i.e. some PhD candidates) who are not present at AAB anymore, which is a pity. In general, it seems that most of academic staff changed in last 3 years accreditation period, what would be interesting to explore.

### **3.4. Space and equipment**

There are excellent conditions for academic life at AAB. We found out that some improvement was done with “Psychology Lab”, to add on this place also high competency level of young psychologist who presented a Lab to expert team. There is a “one sided mirror”, very welcome for training of practical skills. There are still big differences seen in language proficiency in students, some being excellent, others not, which has some implications for organizing study literature draft.

There is (as also 3yrs ago) solid access to e-lit bases, but some crucial, mostly related to APA collections are missing (PsycLit, PsycAbstracts, PsycBooks, PsyTests etc.). I would ( despite big differences of English proficiency), strongly suggest to complete the sources of up-to-date scientific literature (what was a suggestion also 3 yrs ago). Although students are saying they are very satisfied with literature provided, there is room for improvement on this matter.

### **Conclusion**

According to evaluation and also fruitful meeting we had with academic staff, responsible for study of psychology, we agreed on following suggestions:

- To write their own scripts in Albanian
- To “cover” specific psychology topics, which are local, Kosovo Albanian and probably there are no other professionals more competent to do that as people with academic pedigree living here
- To translate some important topics; those students, who are excellent in English could play crucial role here
- In relation to these solutions short-, mid- long term planes could be done
- To add APA e-base of literature

- Last but not least, I recommend to develop further students psychosocial support services (i. e. Students psychological counselling services), which can be if possible included in curriculum of students of psychology and also changing attitudes or/and prejudices towards psychological counselling.

### **Concluding remarks and recommendations**

**On the basis of on-site visit, analyses of SER and other I can absolutely recommend BA Psychology and MA Social and Organisational Psychology for accreditation for another accreditation period.**

Significant progress was made from last accreditation. Benevolently, I still have some constructive remarks: I suggest systematic development of academics staff (i.e. to consider specializations for specific areas, mid- and long-term career development plans, work on commitment and retention of personnel with good academic development potential, to consider the principle to teach and research on subjects, concordant with basic education and to work, cooperation with other similar institutions in region etc.). Further I recommend to continue and to intensify research activities (including Psychological Laboratory, psychodiagnostic instruments adoptions and developments), publishing. I recommend also work on student's counselling service, maybe to include it appropriately to study process (curriculum). To upgrade excellent conditions with investment to additional relevant e-literature basis (APA). And, to make careful and systematic improvements of the curriculum.

Prof. Robert Masten

## 4. MA in Public Administration and Diplomacy

### 4.1. Academic Programmes and Student Management

The study programme “Master in Public Administration **corresponds to the mission statement** and it is a comprehensible and integrated part of the other bachelor and master studies of the institution, which is described in chapter 3.2.5 (p. 35 SER). The knowledge capacity building for public administration is still important for the region, because there is still a need for experts in administration, who are capable building up new administrative structures in Kosovo and the region. During the site visit the faculty members told us that all students get a job after their graduation; the **employability** is described in chapter 3.2.2 (p.33f SER).

The **curriculum’s quality** is comparable with European and international standards; similar programmes are taught at European universities and finish with similar titles, AAB also provided some evidence in chapter 3.2.3 (p. 34 SER). The combination of administration and diplomacy is not common, but possible. The combined lectures in the first semester make sense with regard to student networking and financial profitability. During the SV we discussed about a separation of the programmes into a master programme for public administration and a programme for diplomacy – the reviewer’s position is that both solutions are possible, the current curriculum is balanced and fulfils both needs. The networking possibility for the students in the first semester is a strong argument to continue with the design of a joined curriculum for these two different qualifications. Nevertheless it is a decision which has to be made by the faculty. If the faculty decides to separate the programmes, the joined semester or joined courses should be continued.

The topic of electronic administration and electronic government should be enhanced. The course “E-Administration” is taught by Ali Musliu in the second semester with 6 credits, based on his publications and his CV he is a leading scholar in democracy and human rights, but has no technical background; because of the importance of the on-going digitalisation I recommend to invest into faculty or search for collaboration with computer science faculty. The second aspect is to incorporate aspects of electronic government and administration into courses like, Comparative Administration, Local Government Administration or Management and Leadership. One of the weaknesses of the programme is the missing overarching concept. Under the bottom line the “Public Administration” stream follows a traditional approach, which should be modernized and should focus more on the current challenges of public administration.

Another course problem in the “Public Administration” stream is the course “Advanced Administrative Law”, which for students without legal knowledge hard to manage. It should be discussed to change the course or to offer the possibility of a bridging law semester or extra law courses for students without a degree in law.

The “Diplomacy” stream is adequate some aspects of digital diplomacy could be incorporated.

#### **Recommendations:**

- Faculty should discuss about the modernization of the “Public Administration” stream and should discuss which courses could or should also include digital aspects

- Extra-legal courses for non-legal graduates.

Aspects of the **didactic concept** are described in the chapters

- 3.2.7 Expected learning outcomes
- 3.2.8 Relation between the theoretical and practical/experimental parts of the study
- 3.2.10 Practical work-internship
- 3.2.11 Research plan for program (s) under evaluation

The chapter offers well described elements of teaching; the overarching concept should be described in a better way – how are these elements linked together to ensure the expected learning outcomes, which are described in chapter 3.2.7.

**Recommendation:**

- Faculty should bring together the current elements and describe the overall concept and ensure that all staff members get informed or trained if necessary; this helps the staff members and the students.

The master thesis and the internship offer adequate opportunities for independent study. The ECTS credits calculation in the table on p. 28 is misleading, because the ratio is the same like in the bachelor law programme, which should not be the case. Master programme should offer more time for independent study.

**Recommendation:**

- The faculty should clarify this issue for the next accreditation.

The **ECTS allocation** is appropriate and follows the European standards; there is no course with more than 7 credits; workload seems to be correct, but is not evaluated by AAB.

**Recommendation:**

- AAB should consider integrating work load evaluation into the standard evaluation process for all programmes.

The **workload** for full students is manageable. However, for part time students 120 credits it could lead to problems.

**Recommendations:**

- AAB should consider increasing the number of semesters for master programs to five semesters for part time students.
- KAA should discuss if part-time studies should be generally regulated and limited to 90 credits for four semesters or 120 for five semesters.

The **learning outcomes** are very well described in chapter 3.2.7 Expected learning outcomes, structured into *Cognitive fields, Acquisition results (competence), Evaluation or measurement of acquisition results for the Program will be done by way of*. The examination is regulated, the way of examination is well described in the table and they offer high variate and appropriate forms of evaluations.

There is almost no **overlapping of the academic content** with other curricula.

The **admission criteria** and admission processes are adequate to international standards; described in chapter 3.2.12 Student registration and admission criteria.



The **ratio between academic staff and students** is excellent.

## 1.2. Staff

The ratio between permanent and external staff of about 80% permanent is appropriate. Ratio of staff to students is good. The faculty has a good mixture of senior and junior lecturers. The discussion during the site visit was open and very constructive. Most of the full time contracts are permanent (~60%).

One of the most important aspects is the staff development, which we discussed during the site visit. The faculty is on a good track, but the investment could and should be increased in the next years. Even if the current legal framework hinders the promotion to a professor, AAB could start to negotiate qualification contracts with their younger staff members, with clear measurable goals.

The disadvantage of not having the opportunity to offer PhD studies is also an advantage because staff members have to study at other institutions, which fosters network building to other organisations.

### **Recommendation:**

- AAB or the faculty should develop a staff career model, as role model I would recommend the US academic career model.

## 1.3. Research and International Co-operation

Staff members have to provide teaching and research; they need to publish one paper per year at least. Most of them are involved into projects and almost all students are involved into research projects. The internship is sometimes combined with a project and students are also included into conferences, chapter 3.2.11 Research plan for program (s) under evaluation. Compared to the accreditation from 2013 this is an improvement of the individual staff and student research activities.

Beside the individual increased activities also structural changes improved the research: six research centres have been founded within AAB and a clear research governance model has been developed and is in place (chapter 8 Research and International Co-operation, p.468). These activities led to an increase from 10 projects 2013 to 27 projects 2015. The research centres should start to

### **Recommendation:**

- Continue the research activities and foster staff development activities and design a clear career model for young researchers.
- Foster interdisciplinary research teams and fosters the cooperation between the research centres, especially in the field of public administrations inter- or transdisciplinary research group between law, public administration and computer science could lead to projects with impact in the Kosovo and the region.

## 1.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

The new premises and facilities are impressive; the student figures are increasing; staff expenses increased a bit. The library still offers room for improvement. All in all seems the budget to be stable. Nevertheless the income increase should lead to higher staff

expenses, if the institution wants to become a leading teaching and research institution in the region.

Recommendations:

- Invest in the Library and Online Resources.
- Invest in staff development.

### **1.5. Quality Management**

The quality framework is well developed; even the service processes are evaluated.

### **Overall Recommendation**

The Program “MA in Public Administration and Diplomacy” can be recommended for accreditation.

## 2. LLB in Law

### 5.1. Academic Programmes and Student Management

The LLB Law programme corresponds with **the mission statement**, it's still very general, but AAB has improved the orientation and aims of the programme, compared to the last accreditation 2013 – the elements are located in chapter 3.3.5 *Orientation of the study program according to the leading principles of the institution* (p. 78) and chapter 3.3.6 *The aim and profile of the study program* (p.78). Employability for law graduates is always a problem, but this is regional and not an institutional problem.

**Comparable programmes** are mentioned by AAB in chapter 3.3.3 *International Comparability of the Program*. Based on the reviewers experience and on a quick desk research the current curriculum is appropriate and meets the European standards. Most of the 2013 recommendations are incorporated like the sequence of courses.

Nevertheless current curriculum could be **more progressive** and focus more on the digitalization of our societies; important legal aspects for the digital society are completely missing, like data protection law, e-commerce regulation. If AAB wants to become one of the leading institutions in Kosovo and the region, investment into these kinds of future oriented fields need to be made. The combination of legal, technology, business and public administration know-how would offer great potential for an interfaculty research and teaching group within AAB.

The courses “Law of Obligations”, “Civil procedure” and “Criminal Procedure” are complimentary in semester V and VI; this seems to be a **major translation mistake**, which should not be the case in a re-accreditation process.

The students have to choose between general law and criminalistics in the last year, which is very common in Kosovo; the profile “European Integrations” has been canceled (p. 552) by the faculty. So the overall **programme structure** is adequate.

The **academic degree** “LLB” is common and used by European and international universities. “*LLB in Law*” is a minor translation mistake in the SER, which should be revised into: “*Bachelor of Laws (LL.B.)*” in the internal documents and the SER for future accreditation processes.

#### **Recommendations:**

- Discuss in the faculty about modernizing the curriculum and how these technology challenges could be incorporated into the existing curriculum. This is a recurring recommendation from 2010 and 2013.
- Start a strategic discussion within AAB about capacity building for law and technology and how the existing potentials of other faculties could be connected for research and teaching.
- Revise the SER with regard to the double courses in semester V and VI and improve the quality process for the SER through including more law staff members for proof reading.
- Revise the writing of the degree from “LLB in Law” to “*Bachelor of Laws (LL.B.)*”.

Aspects of the **didactic concept** are described in the chapters

- 3.3.7 Expected learning outcomes

- 3.3.8 Relation between the theoretical and practical/experimental parts of the study
- 3.3.10 Practical work-internship
- 3.3.11 Research plan for program (s) under evaluation

The chapter offer well described elements of teaching; the overarching concept could be described in a better way – how are these elements linked together to ensure the expected learning outcomes, which are described in chapter 3.3.7.

**Recommendation:**

- Faculty needs to bring together the current elements and describe the overall concept and ensure that all staff members get informed or trained if necessary; this helps the staff members and the students.

The structure of the programme offers sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis with regard to a bachelor programme.

The ECTS allocation is appropriate and follows the European standards; there is no course with more than 6 credits; workload seems to be correct, but is not evaluated by AAB.

**Recommendation:**

- AAB should consider integrating work load evaluation into the standard evaluation process for all programmes.

The workload for full students is manageable, for part time students it could lead to problems.

**Recommendations:**

- AAB should consider increasing the number of semesters for part time students.
- KAA could discuss if part-time studies should be generally regulated.

The learning outcomes are described in chapter 3.3.7 Expected learning outcomes and are not appropriate, they need to be described in more detail and link competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills.

**Recommendation:**

- The ET recommends to revise the academic aims in the SER and the faculty should consult the faculty of public administration, because they worked out a well prepared table, which links Cognitive fields, Acquisition results (competence), Evaluation or measurement.

There is almost no overlapping of the academic content with other curricula.

The admission criteria and admission processes are adequate to international standards; described in chapter 3.3.12 Student registration and admission criteria.

The ratio between academic staff and students does not seem appropriate from a pedagogical point of view, AAB has enrolled 2500 bachelor law students and 57 staff members are responsible for teaching, consulting and researching, this leads to ratio student teacher ratio of 43, which is critical even for bachelor of laws programme.

**Recommendation:**

- The ET recommends to increase permanent staff and to limit enrolling of new students until the ratio is under 40 at least.

- The ET recommends to develop E-Learning lectures for extending capacity, especially the bachelor of laws programme suits for E-Learning lectures, because it's primarily focussing on learning and understanding facts<sup>1</sup>. The communication faculty could be a perfect partner for developing high quality content.

## 2.2. Staff

The ratio between permanent and external staff of about 80% permanent is appropriate.

Ratio of staff to students is one of the main problems as already mentioned in the previous chapter.

One of the most important aspects is the staff development, which the experts discussed intensely during the site visit. The faculty is on a good track, but the investment could and needs to be increased in the next years, especially because of the high number of students. The current legal framework offers not the promotion to a professor, but AAB could start to develop clear staff development career paths with clear measureable goals. Even if the career path doesn't lead to professorship, the faculty improves the quality and the value of their staff members.

The disadvantage of not having the opportunity to offer PhD studies is also an advantage because staff members have to study at other institutions, which fosters network building to other organisations.

Nevertheless the faculty needs to increase the numbers of PhD students in their faculty for managing and teaching the huge number of 2500 bachelor students. During the site visit the dean mentioned that in the next year 11 staff members will start with PhD studies, this is under the current circumstances the minimum number.

### **Recommendation:**

- The ET recommends a minimum of 10 to 15 new PhD positions; therefore a recruiting process needs to be designed, to ensure objective decision process and foster competition.
- AAB or the faculty should develop a career model.

## 2.3. Research and International Co-operation

Staff members have to provide teaching and research; they need to publish one paper per year at least. Most of them are involved into projects and many students are involved into research projects. Compared to the accreditation from 2013 this is an improvement of the individual staff and student research activities.

Beside the individual increased activities also structural changes improved the research: six research centres have been founded within AAB and a clear research governance model has been developed and is in place (chapter 8 Research and International Co-operation, p.468).

The creation of an interfaculty research group could have great potential, as mentioned before.

### **Recommendations:**

---

<sup>1</sup> Compare: <http://www.linzer.rechtsstudien.at/de/index.html>

- The ET recommends to continue the research activities, to foster staff development activities and to design a clear career model for young researchers.
- The ET recommends to start a discussion about the potential of cross faculty research areas, like the combination of law, public administration, computer science or communication science.

#### **2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment**

The new premises and facilities are impressive; the student figures are increasing; staff expenses increased a bit. The library still offers room for improvement. All in all seems the budget to be stable. Nevertheless the income increase should lead to higher staff expenses, if the institution wants to become a leading teaching and research institution in the region.

##### **Recommendations:**

- The ET recommends AAB to invest in staff development.
- The ET recommends AAB to invest in the Library and Online Resources.

#### **2.5. Quality Management**

The quality framework is well developed; even the service processes are evaluated.

#### **Overall Recommendation**

The Program “LLB in Law” can be recommended for accreditation under the circumstances of increasing full time staff.

### 3. LLM in Civil Law

#### 6.1. Study Programme and Student Management

The Master program in civil and property law is a logical extension for bachelor students, which is also evident considering the large number of students, whose interests of specialization are intended to be met. The employability was discussed during the site visit; the dean ensured that all graduates found a job after their graduation or respectively had already a job during their study. The information in the SER (chapter 3.4.2, p. 122) is very general and provides no evidence for the high employability.

The academic degree “Master of Laws in Civil Law” corresponds to international standards on condition that only law graduates are enrolled in the programme. The admission criteria are defined in chapter 3.4.4 (p. 122) and AAB limits the enrolment to bachelor of laws graduates with a volume of 240 credits and/or 4 years duration. This is very clear and fulfils European standards.

The maximum number of students is set to 20, which is excellent, but the selection criteria and processes are not described. Because of the high volume of bachelor students the process has to be described in detail in the SER and should be completely transparent for all students and personnel.

#### **Recommendation:**

- The ET recommends describing the selection criteria and processes for the enrolment in detail on the website and in the next SER. The process has to be completely transparent: who applies, who is selected and justification of the decision.

The international comparability of the program is not obvious, because of the different study scheme of 4 years (bachelor) + 1 year (master), which is not common, but adequate under the current circumstances. Nevertheless it could be discussed if a three semester programme could offer the possibility for research oriented master programmes.

The academic aims in chapter 3.4.6 and the expected learning outcomes in chapter 3.4.7 are too general and need to be revised. The overarching didactic concept is not described.

#### **Recommendations:**

- The ET recommends to revise the academic aims and learning outcomes in the SER.<sup>2</sup>
- The ET recommends to describe in detail the overarching didactic concept and to ensure that all staff members get informed or trained if necessary; this helps the staff members and the students.

The main problem is the programme design and course selection, which leads to a massive overlapping of content with regard to the bachelor programme. The bachelor programme offers the following courses in the civil law domain:

Civil Law, year II, semester III and IV: 10 Credits

---

<sup>2</sup> The faculty should consult the faculty of public administration, because they worked out a well prepared table, which links Cognitive fields, Acquisition results (competence), Evaluation or measurement.

1. Contract Law, year II, semester IV: 5 Credits
2. Civil Procedure, year III, semester V: 5 Credits
3. Law of Obligations, year III, semester V and VI: 10 Credits
4. Private International Law, year IV, semester VII: 7 Credits
5. Family Law, year II, semester IV: 6 Credits
6. Scientific Research Methodology, year IV, semester VIII: 7 credits

These courses overlap massively with the following courses in the master programme:

- Civil Law and institutions: 6 Credits => overlaps with 1
- Civil relations in the Private International Law: 5 Credits => overlaps with 5
- Contested Procedure: 4 Credits => overlaps with 3
- Contractual Law and Civil Law Delicts: 5 Credits => overlaps with 1, 2 and 4
- Methodology of scientific research: 6 Credits overlaps with 7

The course description, methodology and literature are very similar. There is no comparable European or international programme, which offers 16 credits for civil law, 9 credits for civil procedure, 12 credits for international civil law or 10 credits for contractual law. The already in depth lectures in these fields in the bachelor programme causes these problems; therefore a complete redesign is needed for the whole bachelor master structure or a new design for civil law.

On the other side important topics are missing like EU-Directives for E-Commerce, Data protection, Distance Selling, Consumer Law and Inheritance law.

**Recommendation:**

- The ET strongly recommends a complete re-design of the master programme or a complete redesign of the bachelor master structure in the field of law studies.

The master thesis is calculated with 25 credits, which is very high and should be changed to 20.

The workload which is required for the academic programme would be manageable for students. There is no workload evaluation established, which is necessary to counter check if the credit estimations are appropriate.

Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? (E.g. what is the proportion of independent study time compared to online/distance teaching and classroom units?)

The ratio of academic staff to students is excellent.

**3.2. Staff**

Please compare the staff chapter for the “LLB in Law”.

**3.3. Research and International Co-operation**

Please compare the staff chapter for the “LLB in Law”.

**3.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment**

Please compare the staff chapter for the “LLB in Law”.



### **3.5. Quality Management**

Please compare the staff chapter for the “LLB in Law”.

### **Overall Recommendation**

The Program “LLM in Civil Law” cannot be recommended for accreditation because of the massive overlapping with the bachelor of laws programme. The faculty has to redesign the whole programme.

Prof. Peter Parycek

## **4. Bachelor of Arts B.A. in „Physical Culture and Sports“ and Master of Arts M.A. in “Physical Culture and Sports”**

(Note: a 4 years full-time BA programme is corresponding to 240 ECTS but in the self-evaluation report 3.8 page 240 the number of ECTS is erroneously mentioned to be 180 ECTS ).

### **7.1. Academic programmes and student management**

#### **Does the academic programme correspond to the institution’s mission statement and principles of operation?**

Based on its mission statement AAB College aims to provide an academically friendly environment for both teachers and students contributing to the social and economic development of Kosovo by implementing quality programmes of international standard and by promoting high quality research (see also 3.8.5. p 243).

Actually, higher education plays an essential role in society by creating new knowledge, transmitting it to students and fostering innovation. In this respect AAB University College has achieved notable progress in improving their study programmes and teaching facilities during the last years. AAB College offers sufficient sport facilities and equipment, motivated staff, and a good general structure for its students. In this respect it seems that the Institution would be able to fulfil the mission to successfully prepare the students for the local job market.

#### ***Recommendations:***

However, additional efforts will be required to ensure that the education they offer meets the expectations of students and the requirements of employers, both today and for the future nationally, but also internationally. Quality higher education in Sport Science today requires research-based teaching, transferring state-of-the-art knowledge, competences and skills by within an attractive, research-based study programme, preparing students to practice a new role of producing knowledge. In this respect and to enjoy international visibility the focus for the next years to come research clearly has to shift toward quality research (research laboratories, staff training, international research cooperation’s, and research-based teaching, respectively).

#### **Are the programme’s quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?**

The study programmes for reaccreditation in Physical Culture and Sports (bachelor and master) have improved significantly in terms of quality and international comparability compared to the last accreditation and recommendations have been successfully implemented. Programmes correspond to regional and European standards and titles are

appropriate, objective and learning outcomes are presented for each teaching subject, ECTS are appropriate but research infrastructure and research-based teaching has to be improved to be competitive internationally.

**Recommendations:** To strengthening its position as a leading provider of private higher education AAB should work toward the provision of an attractive range of research-based subjects. This includes to entertain the idea to change from a 4 + 1 academic cycle to a 3 + 2 academic cycle clearly better facilitating research within master thesis projects.

**Is the programme based on an overreaching didactical concept that has been adequately communicated to and adopted by the teaching staff?**

The programmes (bachelor and master) are following a clear didactical concept and the discussions within the side visit lead to the impression that this concept had been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff.

**Recommendations:** The overall didactical concept should include English language courses for staff members as having the goal to perform high quality research and research based teaching it has to be assured that teaching staff is able to read, understand scientific literature, discuss scientific questions, and to write research papers in English.

**Does the academic degree correspond to international standards?**

In general, the academic degree corresponds to international standards (Bologna) but the distribution of 4 academic years for the bachelor and only 1 year for the master programme excludes graduates from the Master to continue in most international PhD programmes as usually this requires a 2 years master programme.

**Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analyses?**

Based on ECTS students workload permits to study independently and allows to reflect and analyse study content. Based on the meeting with students it is clear that many of them additionally are working part time.

**Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?**

The number of ECTS internationally seems somewhat high but is also very diverse in many EU member states following Bologna guidelines.

**Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?**

As mentioned above and informed by the students the academic programme is manageable.

**Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes (competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills)?**

The teaching methods in general are sufficient to reach competences, qualifications and skills to reach programme goals and outcomes. However, in the future the focus should change to research-based teaching.

**Recommendation:** in the Bachelor Programme English is a mandatory subject – the prescription of the content however give rise to doubt about meaningfulness of competences students should achieve. Students should be able read, understand and discuss scientific literature (this is an imperative necessity to be able to write a bachelor or master thesis).

**Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?**

The overlap of the academic content in the different parts of the curriculum is comprehensible and transparent.

**How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?**

This is hard to assess objectively. However, it became clear that many students (and also scientific staff members) are lacking basic knowledge of English (others are fluent) – which indicates a very inhomogeneous school education something which cannot be found to that extend internationally. Admission to bachelor also requires a physical test (as in most countries in sport science or physical education) and good average grade 7.5 are automatically admitted, those with lower grades have to perform qualification tests.

**Is the ratio of academic / artistic staff to students appropriate?**

The teaching staff to student ratio is appropriate. However, it is obvious that female students are clearly underrepresented in both the bachelor and master programme. Male students clearly outnumber female students.

## **7. 2. Staff**

**Does the institution have an adequate proportion of permanent staff and appropriate portion of permanent and external staff?**

In this respect improvements can be observed compared to previous years. The proportion of permanent staff to external staff is appropriate.

**Does the academic staff demonstrate proven ability at a high academic and didactic level and are their qualifications appropriate to the position the hold within the institution according to basic criteria?**

The academic staff have an adequate academics degree. It seems however that their expertise mainly disposes on sport practical experience – high-calibre professorial scientists with research background and publications in peer reviewed journals with

impact factor are missing. The academic staff fulfils local requirements in this respect, it is unlikely that staff members would be selected in job advertisements in developed countries.

**Recommendations:**

Foster academic staff ' mobility (research conferences, research semesters,...); foster quality assurance including English language skills, research background as requirement for employment.

### **7.3. Research and International Co-operation**

Based on the side visit and self-evaluation report research cooperation's focus on neighboring countries in the Western Balkans and project with Ljubljana University (Slovenia).

**Recommendation:** Strong investment in research in the next years is essential. This requires basic research laboratories as well as basic research equipment currently completely missing. Working in international networks should not be limited to the Western Balkan.

**Is the teaching staff involved in research activities inside or outside the institution, and to these research activities feed back into teaching / course content?**

Teaching staff is involved in research only to a very small extend with small feedback into research-based teaching

**Is the extent and quality of international cooperation in research and teaching adequate?**

As mentioned above international cooperation in research and teaching clearly has to be improved. This however is not limited to AAB College but to all providers of higher education in Kosovo and the Western Balkans.

**Are students involved in research and cooperation projects?**

Students are enrolled to a small extend currently but to enroll them to a higher extend research facilities and equipment has to be provided.

### **7.4. Finances and Infrastructure / Space and Equipment**

**Does the institute have an adequate budget plan?**

The institute has an adequate budget plan however budget for research, for further staff development measures like staff mobility, and international cooperation clearly have to be improved.

**Does the institution have adequate buildings and specialized infrastructure for the requirements of the programme?**

In terms of infrastructure AAB College in general is most probably the highest advanced institute in Kosovo and the region and has impressively improved and has improved within the last years. However specific research facilities (in sport science) as well as research equipment and devices are clearly missing.

## **7.5. Quality Management**

**Are the institution's programmes assessed regularly within the content of internal evaluation processes?**

The quality management programme is well developed and includes internal and external procedures.

### **General recommendations:**

- **The reviewer recommends to re-accreditate the Bachelor and the Master programme in the current version.**
- Laboratories and basic equipment for performing research in the area of sport science have to be developed.
- Academic staff has to be trained internationally
- English language skills of most staff members and many students have to be improved.
- Change from 4 years bachelor to a 3 years bachelor (180 ECTS) and and 2 years master (120 ECTS)

Prof. Harald Tschan

## **8. Student Matters – Overall Comments**

During the meeting with students a number of topics were covered. It is worth noting that the students that attended were from all fields of study within AAB College. Students were asked to comment on aspects that they most liked about their studies, and aspects that they desired to be improved. This section will be split into positive aspects and aspects for improvement that were noted in the self-evaluation report, the site visit and specifically the meeting with students. The aspects for improvement are recommendations developed to enhance the overall student experience.

### **8.1 Positive Aspects**

Student representatives known as ‘tutors’ and are seen as the ‘bridge’ between students and professors. Tutors are in regular communication with the Dean, working on quality matters together. During the site visit it was apparent that there is an excellent working relationship between students and staff, at meetings as well as informal discussions during the College tour.

The experts also welcome the flexible payment scheme, with generous scholarships available to disadvantaged students, as well as high-performers. This indicates that despite being a private for-profit institution, the education of students comes before fees.

Facilities are of a high caliber within the College. This includes classrooms, library and informal learning spaces. It was clear during the site visit that there is a collegiality amongst students and staff. During the meeting with students this was emphasised as several students made note that there was an open door policy with regards to teaching staff. Students were quoted as saying ‘everything is handled with a smile’ and ‘it feels like home’. There was also mention that students are able to see everything that their Professors publish, and there are opportunities to collaborate on research projects.

There is a great deal of flexibility for students in terms of their learning experience. For example, the timetable is well-structured and ‘does not change last minute’. In addition, students mentioned that they have the option to choose out of three timetables, depending on the students’ needs. This means they can attend class in the morning, afternoon or on Saturdays.

One student has been elected as Vice President of the newly created National Union of Students. This is excellent news and indicates that AAB College students will have their voice heard at national level.

**It is recommended that the College continues to nurture aspects that students like.**

## **8.2 Aspects for improvement**

It was noted that students appreciate the current evaluation format for providing feedback on their courses and staff. However, it is suggested that these evaluation forms should focus more on the syllabus and less on individual teaching staff, as this could be deemed as too personal. During the meetings with teaching staff, there was mention that individual staff do not see the results of the evaluation forms unless it is something serious. It is suggested that the results of evaluation forms should be disseminated to teaching staff so that they can find out what aspects of the course students like, and which aspects students believe could be improved upon. Any amendments should be communicated to students in order to close the feedback loop.

**It is recommended that results of evaluations forms should be made available to the responsible teaching staff as part of their professional development.**

The recently developed E-Service is noted to be promising. It was developed in-house, which indicates that it was designed specifically for AAB College users. During the site visit, several students commented on the e-service as a useful learning resource. Also, the e-service has the capacity to trace useful learning analytics, such as how many students download certain papers, or how often they access certain module. AAB College has the opportunity to use the e-service in line with their retention strategies in order to identify students that need extra support. However, it was noted that some staff use the service more than others and it is recommended that all staff receive some form of training on it's use to ensure its effectiveness across board.

**It is recommended that e-service training is available to all teaching staff and that data is used to support retention strategies.**



During discussions with students it was found that there is a lack of study abroad opportunities, despite demand from students. While the experts note that this is a concern at national level, the College should focus on other internationalisation opportunities for students. For example, setting up partnerships with foreign higher education institutions in which students could work on a project virtually. The College should also continue with hosting international conferences, and ensure that students are able to attend.

**It is recommended that the College review and enhance internationalisation strategies to include opportunities for AAB College students to collaborate with international students virtually.**

It was noted by students and the experts that there is a need for gender balance amongst teaching staff. This is particularly pertinent with the rising number of female students attending courses. At European level, achieving gender balance among staff and students is an important subject. AAB College should work to reflect gender balance to a European level.

**It is recommended that the College develops a strategy to increase the number of female teaching staff.**

Rebecca Maxwell Stuart