DARDANIA COLLEGE

Business Administration and Economics Program - MA

TYPE OF EVALUATION: RE-ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

21st of May, 2019, PRISTINA

1

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

2

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

2

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 21st of May, 2019

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Istileulova Yelena, PhD*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Arianit Krasniqi, the Coordinator from KAA*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-evaluation Report (SER) as of 18.02.2019, Prishtinë, including self-evaluation of Business Administration and Economics (BA) program (4.6.), (MA) program*
- *National Qualifications Framework*
- *KAA´s Formal Policies, guidelines and regulations*
- Course Catalogue and Course Syllabuses Business Administration and Economics
- Academic Staff Development Plan
- Model of Student Workload
- Research Activities: Academic Staff Research Report 2012-2019
- Staff CVs (Full time, Part time, Visiting Professors)
- Annex (Statute College Dardania; etc.)
- *Requested documents:*
  - *(a) List of lecturers, Business Administration & Economics (BA, MA)*
  - *(a) List of full-time professors, who are involved in the ongoing research/business projects/ consulting activities/visits according to Collaboration Agreements*
  - *(b) List of Conferences visited (2016-2019) with correspondent publications*
  - *(c) Students´ enrolment for Business Administration & Economics for BA and MA; their completion rate; students/teacher ratios for BA and MA*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards & performance indicators for external quality assurance, Accreditation Manual, July, 2018; Triangulation criteria; Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impacts, Sustainability*

3

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

1.2 Site visit schedule

2.   Site Visit Program

20 May

| 19.45 | Meeting at the Reception of the Hotel |
| 20.00 | Working dinner |

21 May

08.40	Meeting at the reception of the hotel
09.00 – 10.30	Meeting with the management of the institution *(no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion)*
10.40 – 11.50	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative services
12.00 – 13.00	Meeting with the heads of study programs
13.00 – 13.50	Lunch break
13.50 – 14.50	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure
14.50 – 15.40	Meeting with teaching staff
15.50 – 16.40	Meeting with students
16.50 – 17.40	Meeting with graduates
17.50 – 18.40	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
18.45 – 19.00	Internal meeting – Expert Team and KAA
19.00 – 19.15	Closing meeting with the management of the institution

This site visit schedule is provided below:

Nr.	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs		
1	Institutional Re-accreditation	Melita Kovacevic Milan Pol Student Expert (TBA)			
2	Applied Psychology and Managerial Studies/BA	Melita Kovacevic	1. Dritan Ceka	2. Mariela Lazi	3. Mentor Agani, 4. Ferit Hysa
3	Business Administration and Economics/BA	Yelena Istileulova	1. Rilind Ademi	2. Naser Shabani	3. Edlir Orhani 4. Bilall Kasami
4	Busniness Administration and Economics/MA	Yelena Istileulova	1. Amir Imeri	2. Bekim Stafai	
5	Political Science and Public Administration/BA	Vlatko Crvtila	1. Njomza Krasniqi	2. Muazam Halili	3. Llokman Mirtezani
6	Public Administration/MA	Vlatko Crvtila	1. Dashmir Idrizi	2. Zamir Bregas	
7	Social Care and Walfare/BA	Milan Pol	1. Ervin Muco	2. Plarent Anamali	3. Rezak Jakupi
8	English Language and American Studies /BA	Andrew Goodspeed	1. Jusuf Mustafai	2. Mejreme Ymeri	3. Ismail Aliu, 4. Ismail Kamberi

5

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

1.3 A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The Private Institution of Higher Education started its activities as University, and now it functions under the name "DARDANIA" College. The name "Dardania" designates a territory of the Illyrian tribe named "Dardans," who, according to archaeological studies, were distinguished with a high level of economic, social and cultural development. The Dardania College is a Private Higher Education institution established in 2004 with a goal to provide quality education for younger generations to contribute to the development of Kosovo society. The College offers a range of programs aimed at equipping students with knowledge, skills to prepare the professionals. Among them is the Business Administration and Economics MA Program, which aims to provide students with theoretical, analytical and practical work experience. The programs are tailored to the institution's mission principles and oriented towards fulfilling Kosovo's market demand. Business Administration and Economics-MA program offers two-year studies with the possibility of specialization in Banking, Finance and Accounting program and from the most demanded areas in the market. The MA program is designed in 4 semesters. The purpose and the specialization of the program is to increase the level of administration and management of businesses and development of contemporary management, training and building of managers of the contemporary profile of the most important contemporary business areas. The program is administered by the Head of Department, who chairs the Teaching and Research Council, and reports to the Rector about the teaching and research process implementation. Since the foundation of the College program has been licensed by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, constantly improving its content. To provide an attractive program comparable to EHEA programs and beyond, the economic studies program was revised and transformed *Business Administration and Economics (MA)* program, which is *under current evaluation,* submitted for re-accreditation and represents the efforts of Dardania College and program staff to enhance and enrich the program based on the internal evaluation as well as the recommendations and suggestions of the External Experts Team.

6

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

1. In accordance with the Self-Evaluation Report (SER, p. 292) the program mission statement of Business Administration and Economics-MA is:

"To prepare students with skills and intellectual capacities for leadership career and practical management skills to meet the challenges of free market economics.
To this end, Dardania College will offer high quality study programs for first and second cycle studies that prepare students for successful professional and academic careers.
Continuously, it will contribute to the intellectual and creative improvement of students in order to prepare their qualifications to contribute to the economic development of the country and to the wider community of business through academic programs, research, and community activities".

This mission includes *the following* pillars in its statement:

- *students,* as the future professional leaders of market economy (1),
- partly - *teaching*, which is *presented* here *implicitly and indirectly* (through "high quality study programs"; "*with skills and intellectual capacities", and students´ qualifications, improvement, academic programs, research* (2), and
- *business* community (wider community of business) (3)

Thus, (1) students as future leaders and (3) business community − are the main *direct actors* in this program mission statement, with its implicit teaching (2). From this perspective, this mission seems to be in the compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution. The SER previously noted that there is no any description about the participation of stakeholders in formulation of its mission and objectives (especially employers, and students) − at both levels (institutional and program). The answer was received for this comment (for the first draft of this report), that stakeholders participated in its discussions. The details or elaboration and examples (which particular stakeholders, representatives of employers) were not provided, but the comment was accepted about participation of all stakeholders. The standard 1.1. was conditionally moved to be "*in compliance*", but under the following conditions below (to be considered to) that take part at the institutional level (2 conditions) and some comments related to some few changes of the mission in English at the program level:

(a) It should be noted that the consultation to the present institutional ET on Standard 1.2 (*The mission of the institution has been defined and, if the case, revised, based on a consultation process involving external and internal stakeholders*) provided "*no*

7

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

compliance", and therefore, the ethical issue is raising – because at the institutional level, the consultations with stakeholders are not taken place.

(b) The problematic part with 2 institutional missions to be compared still remain. In addition, there are more considerations presented below that bring more issues (to be considered for the next evaluation together with the institutional mission).

The SER highlights "the clear mission and vision" as the main strengths in its SWOT analysis of MA program (in SER, p. 293). The ET submitted the first draft of this repot and appreciate that some answers were provided by the MA program about its mission. The ET has no doubts that this MA´s mission is absolutely fine in Albanian language (in terms of the right phrases and wording), and perfectly well understand that the mission is translated, and this point is taken into account. At the same time, there are still some imperfections in its text together with more nuances and its lengthy text (which is lengthy in both languages):

First, the mission "*to meet the challenges of free market "economics"* ("economics" is a subject of teaching, but in the mission text it is "*economy"* that should be implied *("economies*") instead of "economics"). Therefore, it should be written:

 - *to meet the challenges of a free market economy*";

Second, this mission is quite lengthy, not corresponding to the criteria of brief, clear and concise statement;

Third, it is quite heavy for reading, also due to the phrases, - "to this end", "continuously", that brings an additional burden of "heavy" reading.

Fourth, in terms of compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution, it should be decided then which versions of the missions are to be compared, because there are two versions of the institutional mission statement of Dardania College (instead of one / the explanations are provided below). The present institutional Standard 1.4 from the institutional ET ("The institutional mission provides an effective guide for strategic planning, decision making and operations of the institution") shows "no compliance", and therefore the programs´ missions have to mitigate their risks re-considering their statements again.

8

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

The comparison of public mission statement on the web-site (when it was available, under its 1st draft preparation) versus public mission in the Self-evaluation report are different. The mission located at the web-site[1] is:

"DARDANIA College offers high quality study programs of the first, second and third cycle levels that prepare our students for responsible professional and academic careers." The other institutional mission is presented in SER (p. 15), being viewed as too long:

"Dardania" College provides qualitative education for professional advancement and practical training of the cadre in human and applied sciences and arts. "Dardania" College is responsible to develop through teaching and research the cadre capable to contribute to sustainable and creative development in the service of community. It will create competent cadre to realize the above mentioned requirements in the context of the development of economic, political, social and cultural life of Kosovo.
"Dardania" College encourages multi- and inter-disciplinary studies, which bring about the enrichment of knowledge of students, and their training for life-long learning and education.
"Dardania" College cooperates with organizations that exercise commercial activities and it provides services in public and private sector, to government, local communities and institutions of civil society, and in this manner it promotes the application of its research and educational accomplishments and it contributes to the overall development of Kosovar society.
"Dardania" College will act as a part integrated in the European area of higher education through application of common standards established by Bologna Declaration, for achieving intensive cooperation with institutions of higher education in the European Union and beyond.

Fifth, there is also a disproportion between the broadly written public mission statement (SER, p. 15) with 10 objectives and the program mission with only **one objective** for MA program (SER, p. 292) instead of several.

Sixth, despite it is written that "The strategy of the management of the institution includes the vision, the definition of the mission, and the objectives…" (SER; p. 36), vision is not provided in its SER. Thus, the mission and objectives are not very clear at this stage.

The question has to be raised at the level of institution whether the mission statement was discussed with participation of stakeholders, especially employers and students? The SER did not provide any answer regarding this point.

---

[1] http://www.kolegjidardania.com/arkiva/www.kolegjidardania.com/en/about-us/mission-and-vision.html)

9

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

2.   The comments were received to this 1ˢᵗ draft of this report: "As demonstrated during the meeting (on 21.05.2019), and as previously clarified, the website of Dardania College is still under construction".

The website had been available all the time prior to site visit and during the preparation of the first draft of this report (since May, 2019 up to the first decade of June, 2019); that is why it was possible to check the different versions of the mission statements. After this answer was received, the expert also requested the peers of ET to clarify the situation on the website status on the date of the site visit (21.05.2019), and got the answer (Jun 25, 2019, 11:49 PM) that the peers from ET do not remember "*any info re the website and possible reconstruction*" at the time of the site visit. However, since the 3ʳᵈ decade of June, 2019, when the answer from DC was received, this DC website was not available any more, showing the message "*This site has been temporarily disabled, please try again later*". Probably, there were more than one website of Dardania College? (but this version is not available now).

Again, as in the issue with the stakeholders (above), this issue is also an ethical issue. Formally, it is the SER that should be considered (according to KAA recommendations), but the ET thinks that it is fair to consider all points that are prepared (although some of them are however are very disturbing ones).

3.   Other related comments (to the above points).

The usual expectation is that the mission is a short general statement of how MA College´s vision is achieved, and objectives are several, presented as specific actions for achieving the goal. The ET´s goal is to assess the MA program, but due to its connection with its institution, program also should be considered as a part of institution. In its "Strategy for the realization of the Mission", SER (p.19): College *aims for the near future to become a leader in the higher education in Kosovo and in the region*, the "near future" is not defined in a more specific term.

10

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

4. Administration issues

The policies on Academic Staff Development, the Code of Ethic and other documents are formally present. As regards the Standard 1.3, didactic and research concepts are partially present in study program, but not in all subjects. Didactic concept is not perceived as the "well-defined overarching concept" as it is defined in SWOT. In terms of teaching and learning (including skills), the principles of didactics are partially present in Syllabuses. "Didactic" as a concept is not present in Syllabuses, as well as the references towards more didactic tools and concepts. The study programs can be enriched with more didactic tools, like video-lecturing, Socratic method, experiments, or in terms of didactic concepts like active learning by doing, or peer instructors, formative assessment, etc. The standard is also adjusted to 1.4 institutional criteria accordingly.

The institutional evaluation should also be taken into consideration. The institutional mission provides an effective guide for strategic planning, decision making and operations of the institution (1.4 standard: – not in compliance).

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
*Standard 1.1. T*he study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution	v	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		v
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		v
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students		v
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	v	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of	v	

11

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

changing circumstances.		

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Revisit the program´s mission vs. the institutional mission;
2. Consider that program mission should be translated into more objectives, not just one objective (comments to SER p. 292);
3. Ensure that the new version of the updated mission statements provided in the written documents and web-site and these versions are equivalent to each other;
4. Adjust the version of program´s mission, vision and objectives to the comments and make them corresponding in Albanian and English languages;
5. It is believed that if institutional mission is not discussed by all stakeholders, it may hinder the programme level. Therefore, participation and involvement of both internal staff and external stakeholders should bring the clear position in the formulation of mission (still quite problematic due to its length, and inconsistencies in English);
6. Current version of the mission is recommended to be considered in a brief, clear and simple way based on the comments above;
7. More attention should be dedicated to the didactics concept (some more recommendations on didactics are included in other sub-chapters), developing and introducing more tools (like video-lecturing, Socratic method, experiments) and related concepts (learning by doing, peer instructors, formative assessment, etc.);
8. Website - http://www.kolegjidardania.com (that was available till June, 2019, and during this time – it is not available) is recommended to be updated, hoping that its new re-construction should be presented with the regularly updated information.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

2.2. Quality management

The SER provides description that quality management in the "Dardania" College is based on the officially approved policy of quality assurance linked to continuous monitoring and management of quality: "The policy and procedures for quality assurance" with the strategic orientation on the Standards and Instructions for internal quality assurance. This section is very broad because quality management touch practically all aspects of the learning and teaching process. The additional questions were raised, and provided to this initial draft of the report, and the final version of this report also considered these answers. As an example for this section, the opinion of MA DC was taken into account about the standard 2.5 on the program DMS to conduct better evaluations (changed it to be compliant).

This section also included observations that are not implicitly included into standards but reflect the general holistic impression about it.

1.The ET observes that the most typical QA challenges are those related to the inconsistencies that begin from the titles of specialisation (with examples of this MA program demonstrated). In fact, these issues are not directly present in any standards, but implied in the 2.2. on normal planning processes. As an example, the SER document (p. 13) refers to the Master of Arts in Business Administration and Economics, with its specializations:

- General;
- **Banks**, Finances and Accounting.

The answers/comments to this 1st draft of this report, for "Business Administration Program and Economics" - MA refers to two specialisations, which are:

- Business Administration and Economics and
- **Banking**, Finance and Accounting.

Thus, these slight differences apply in two provided documents: in the SER, and the present comments to this report. In addition, the previous check of web-site[1] shows that the

---

[1] http://www.kolegjidardania.com/arkiva/www.kolegjidardania.com/en/faculties-depts/master.html

13

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

"**Department of Economics**"(which is again, different to its initial title) offers Master degree´s programs (Master of Arts):

- **Business administration /management**
- Banking, finance and accounting

Thus, these inconsistencies between **the SER and the answers** to this report (in titles of specialisations), then - the titles of programme in **web-site and SER**, lead to confusion – whether the program has a title Business administration/Management (web-site version) or Business Administration and Economics (SER version). Although it is not formally included into the standards, but quality management should start from the correct titles of Departments/Programs/Specialisations and the regular check and correspondence between the web-site – provided for the external users and internal self-evaluation purposes. The check with this standard at the institutional level, is found to be not in compliance as well.

2.In terms of structure between Master studies in Business Administration and Master studies in banks, finance and accounting, the check of web-site (according to the triangulation check) suggests two different structures.

For Business administration/management it includes:

- priority goals/knowledge/evaluation

For Banking, finance and accounting:

- learning program´s goals/results of learning/structure of the study program

Although it brings the partial evidence for learning outcomes for students (Standard 2.4) for banking, finance and accounting studies, the logic of structure itself is not clear. There is no correspondence between them: in the first case it is priority goal, and in the second case – learning program´s goal. Moreover, the difference is emphasised by the use of different styles of writing, titles, content and components (from lectures consultation, seminar and exams, field work, project implementation).

The positive message is that a Quality Assurance Committee is in place with Quality Assessment Team (3 members). Therefore, there are services and resources available at the

14

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

institution to deal with the issues of inconsistencies. The Quality Management staff may consider recommendation about the short Dictionary with the various titles and their abbreviations in Albanian and English language that can be prepared for the right interpretation to facilitate the purposes of further external and internal evaluation/accreditation exercises.

3.**The site visit** included some discussions and observation on various issues. For instance, the question what is the perception on "the high quality" during the site visit has been asked to the academic staff and students. The answer was about the perception of the right skills that should be provided to students according to the market´s needs. The representatives of Employers provided the positive impression and referred to the quality of Dardania students as "the quality that correspond to the labour market needs".

Academic teachers express their view that it should be teaching, research and community services that guide their activities. The other question referred to the Research Center (Development Plan uses one name and the CER – another one). It seems that the academic staff is not very much aware of the activities of this Center (with 3 units).

The impressions about the research linked to practices and projects was not not at the level of higher expectations, because the very first list with the research publications provided to the ET showed the minimum publications, but later on, the second list of publications have been submitted with their sharp boost.

The current staff of professors came to work during the last 2 years, and the question that referred what happened to the old staff, the answer was that previous staff got retired. The opinion of faculty members about quality of teaching, led to the answers from they put the intended learning outcomes reflecting them in Syllabuses. Major professors came to Dardania college for the last 2-3 years. When they were questioned about their conditions, they answered that they have provided with internal research fund with 300 euro for publications (there was an evidence of support for monograph´s publications as well). The question related

15

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

to competition showed that academic staff had some difficulties to name who is the main competitor to their program from other colleges or universities.

3.The ET expressed positive opinion about the rich curriculum, when students can have a great choice of subjects from the first year of studies. Lectures are delivered in combination of methods ("ex cathedra" / "case"), seminar paper processed through the whole theoretical content of the course, and there is a seminar activities that apply specific guidance for preparing it. As far as the **teachers´ load** are concerned, there are **10** hours of lectures is the average load per teacher.

At the same time, the check of Course catalogue and Course Syllabuses indicated that Course Syllabuses do not include learning outcomes, and the Course Catalogue provide some learning outcomes for some subjects; otherwise, the learning outcomes are missing for many subjects (more elaborated in p. 2.4–pp. 18).

4.When the question was raised about the Curriculum Assessment Plan (because the SER does not provide any information about it), the answer was provided to this 1st draft of Report: there is a new Curriculum Assessment Plan which is currently in discussion to be implemented for future assessments.

The previous assessment of the ET was requested to provide the continuity of results: the present and the past experience about the evaluation systems within the courses is in general, met with the satisfaction of experts. It was interesting detail (also noticed by the previous ET) that despite there is a freedom to change evaluation, no one made any attempts to do it, so some criticism on rigidity of this system was applied in the past.

5. The other observations include that the website has not updated information that exists from 2014 (or longer). As an example, the website (available during this check, and preparation of this first draft of report) still provide the information about Tacis program. This program has been changed into Erasmus+ since 2014. It is not the point of criticism, but one of the details that rises question about updates and when the last updates of the web-site was made, as well as who is responsible for this content.

16

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

In the evaluation of standards, the additional Institutional compliance´s of the evaluation peers of the ET were considered with "no compliance" given to the points): 5.4 (QA throughout the institution are fully integrated into normal planning), 5.5 (Regular evaluations are carried out), 5.7 (all units participate in QA), 5.11, 5.12 (on forms and surveys and statistical data are made publicly available), 5.14 (QA regularly evaluated, reported and improved).

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	V	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes		V (p. 5.4 of institutional ET)
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.		V (5.4,5.5,5.7 institutional)
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		V (comment is for learning outcomes)
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	V	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		V (5.11; 9.5, 9.10. 9.12)
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.		V (5.11, 5.12)
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	V	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.		V (standard of the institution 5.14)

Compliance level: Partially compliant

17

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

ET recommendations:

1. The issues of inconsistencies should be removed;
2. Incorporate the check procedures for the titles of program, specialisations, the correspondence between them into Quality Management processes;
3. Ensure that the correct names of Departments/Programs/Specialisations/Degrees are used in Quality Management process in conformity for different sources of reporting/web-site/languages (Albanian-English);
4. Make sure that the members of QA team provide some checks of the program´s Syllabus to make sure that it is correct in terms of quality and numbers;
5. Master studies in Business Administration and in Banks, Finance and Accounting should be harmonised in terms of their structure (both in web-site, external and internal reporting and other documentation);
6. Ensure a regular communication between academic staff and Head of Department about recent developments;
7. Curriculum Assessment Plan should be made available as a document to the teaching staff with the planning time in terms of assessment and the recommendations provided;
8. During the site visit, it is recommended to follow the KAA overall instructions (to provide their staff with the nametags (name and the company for the Employers and the names and title of program for Students);
9. Quality Management staff has to make sure that the short Dictionary of its names and abbreviations in Albanian and English language are prepared for the right interpretation with the same titles of administrative structures for the purposes of further external and internal evaluation/accreditation exercises.

2.3 Academic staff

Pursuant to SER, the selected representatives of academic staff, including the members of the Department of business administration, have drafted the strategy with other normative acts, defining the employment policies with the issues of academic promotion. The Terms of references for Employment Procedures for academic and non-academic staff as of 26.11.12 is a basic document that regulates the general responsibilities. There is an evidence provided for 37 members of Academic staff at the Department of business administration and economics who signed contracts with 3 and 1 year´s terms. Out of 18 members of academic staff, 14

18

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

faculty members with their PhD degree – are those who have signed the three academic year's contract with a teaching load – 10 academic hours per week, and the rest - one year´s contract with 6 academic hours per week. Models of both academic contracts are developed.

There are funds available – the Joint Services Fund to provide quality services to academic staff and students, as well as the fund for the development of academic activities (Publications, Trainings, Seminars and Workshops, Development Projects, Conferences).

As far as the SER is concerned, there are some striking differences in regard to academic staff. On the one hand, there is a good motivation based on the Academic staff Development Plan as of 18. 02.19, with awarding the best researchers on the annual basis as the "Research of the Year". On the other hand, one of the strengths according to SWOT analysis, is an available procedure for the selection of "obedient" personnel. The word "obedient" sounds inappropriate in applying to the professors, whose professional characteristics, teaching experience and research reputation should be assessed and respected at the first place rather than the characteristic of obedience. It is believed that it is the result of an incorrect translation.

Moreover the abilities to have an excellence in teaching and research in producing an interesting, relevant and interdisciplinary research based on the academic choice and freedom should be the main strenght under the selection of personnel, and according to the mission of Dardania. Although the terms of references of employment procedures of academic and non-academic staff (04/L-037 approved by the Steering Board of the College on 26.11.2012) includes that the freedom of expression instead of the obedience. So the code of professional academic values should be promoted.

Involvement into consulting activities is one of the activities (included into standards), but there is no clear evidence for consulting performed by the members of academic staff. Academic staff can be interested in involvement into consulting activities based on their

19

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

specialisation, research and publications. This can serve as an threefold purpose (research-project-consultig) that bring additional profit-oriented activities of the College, serve as an additional source of income for both College and academic staff, and meet the standards for accreditation in terms of the adequacy of processes the standards. These activities can be proposed to be developed under the the Centre for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration Research´s umbrella. As far as the evaluation of academic staff is concerned, in addition to the students´ survey, (confirmed during the site visit´s discussion with students), SER does not mention any peer and superiors' evaluations as well as self-assessment linked to Standards 3.7 and 3.6. Despite the institutional assessment of standards of the peers was assessed as «no compliance» (in 6.2- monitoring of performance, 6.3 - quality indicators, 6.8 - performance standards, 6.9- teaching quality and the effectiveness of programs)), the ET thinks that strategy at program level try to incorporates quality enhancements.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	v	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	v	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	v	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	v	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the	v	

case of artistic/applied science institutions.		
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.		v
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.		v
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.		v
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	v	
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	v	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. Ensure in the policies (HR/Quality Department) that the priorities under the hiring of PhD personnel and professors should be the professional characteristics linked to the *excellence in teaching and research* according to the mission of Dardania.
2. Consider the development and promotion of academic values that may later lead to the values-based education, with the promotion of teaching, learning and research with academic freedom.
3. Actively involve academic staff not only into the project, research but also consulting activities at the Centre for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration Research
4. Ensure various motivation (based not only on the financial, but also non-financial methods – with non-monetary rewards) from all levels – from the Head of Department, who chairs the Teaching and Research Council up to each academic professional to develop and promote the research, teaching and learning projects with local and international universities based on the system of academic and research values
5. Consider, develop and write done some activities related to the self-evaluation of academic staff, in line with the peer and superiors' evaluations.

2.4. Educational process content

It should be positively assessed that the course catalogue provides the richness and variety of different Economics and Management subjects for teaching and elective courses, in total – 60 subjects. According to the National Qualification Framework (p. 20), learning outcomes are to be specified in three categories – as knowledge, skills and competence. These categories are to be translated and listed in at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation (Standard 4.3 of KAA). SER doesn´t reflect these issues of educational process content related to the most important issues like learning outcomes, qualification objectives, competences and skills.

1.The Course Catalogue reflects some learning outcomes and skills in subjects (and in Annexes), and the related Course Syllabuses check show that the "**learning outcomes**" are directly written and indicated only for one subject, other words are in use like "outcomes" or "expected results". Although the teaching academic staff are great professionals in their own areas, it is becoming important to ensure the "learning outcomes" are written down for each subject in Syllabuses both for the deep understanding of students and professors. These learning outcomes (checked by KAA in educational process content) that achieved in a year of full time will earn 60 ECTS points, and the requirements as well.

2.Qualifications concerned with skills and competences are also not in place. This is a new area of the NQF. Qualifications may be comprised of modules which can be assessed and certified, and modules are expressed as learning outcomes. Kosovo's draft curriculum framework specifies six key competences for compulsory education (from Learning up to work competence). However, list of competences and qualifications are absent in both Course Catalogue and Course Syllabuses, and learning outcomes are present only in 6 subjects and Annexes in Catalogue. Quality of teaching and learning is not mentioned.

3.The check of content´s Course Catalogues found some *weaknesses* linked to:
- use of technologies (because it is not clear which particular)
- different new forms of learning (also provided without specifics)

and in Syllabuses – some *mistakes* linked to the activities (in yellow):
- Student's engagement in study in the part related to "Contacts with the teacher/consultants" (the copy below highlighted with a yellow colour) that is "copy-paste" for all activities:

22

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

Activity	Hours	Days / week	Total
Lectures	3	8	24
Theoretical / laboratory exercises	3	8	24
Practical work	4	3	12
Contacts with the teacher / consultants	30	8	4

4.Interesting enough, that SER provide SWOT for this particular sub-chapter, in another form: it includes "Possibilities and Challenges" – instead of "Opportunities and Threats". Moreover, this section looks like "copy-paste" – some part (weakness, for instance) is not translated, the others – look being copied (with double bullet library, p. 302). The one weakness from the SWOT analysis of SER (translated through Google Translate), understood as "Little opportunities for the practical and real-world knowledge from the contemporary economy" that can be interpreted that either the knowledge gained cannot be applied to the local market, or the knowledge gained is not adequate to the local labor market. One of examples of inadequate "Threat" is: "Dardania" College is determined to advance the structure of studying programs, and to improve its quality in order to keep the position of a leading institution of higher education in Kosovo". Another example is: "Continuous enrichment of the Center with experts on specific fields for professional development of academic staff". Other examples (for "opportunities" feature) require some clarifying questions: "Dardania college works in quite a complex environment, which is dominated by unprincipled competition among the colleges and institutions…

5.The weakness in SER that is related to the "poor quality of candidates during secondary education" refers then what are the entrance criteria college/program set up?
According to processes within the Department, special attention should be paid for improving students´ quality work. The College Quality Assurance Committee (KSC) organises surveys, conversations and in cooperation with staff and explores the possibilities of improving the quality of teaching, research and other activities that have an impact on the quality of the department's work.

6.The meeting with students during the site visit program (SVP) shows that from their opinions, the process of learning is adequate, and they are quite enthusiastic about it. Students that have been present at the meeting reflected a diversity (in terms of gender, out of 3 students, 1 – female from MA, and 2 – BA students, where 1 of them is the owner of the

23

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

23

company/employer and student at the same time). In terms of Quality assurance, Students confirm that they participate in assessment of teaching not only through the survey, but also based on their written feedback or comments about the lectures: they have a change to put their comments about the lecture into specially organised box. Programs for Business Administration and Economics MA for 2019/2020 are provided for 4 semesters of study with the list of lecturers per subject, including specialisation (Banking, Finance and Accounting). Finally, the possibilities for some interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary aspects in Curriculum might be considered as well – depending on the subject of teaching.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	v	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		v
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		v
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	partial	v
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program	*Not related*	*Not related*
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which		v

24

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

24

each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.		
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students		v
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	v	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.		v
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	v	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		v
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units	v	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Include and reflect the issues of SER educational process content according to NQF, and standards of KAA;
2. Provide additional trainings for the teaching staff on the various teaching methods and didactics and teaching strategies;
3. Remove the mistakes from the Syllabus as well as include all necessary elements (from general requirements up to didactics), with the use of technologies, etc.
4. Student's engagement in study in the part related to "Contacts with the teacher/consultants;

25

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

25

5. Back to the form of SWOT (with opportunities and threats). Possibilities and Challenges can still be present;

6. Ensure the "learning outcomes" are written down for each subject in Syllabuses, Course Catalogue, because learning outcomes achieved in a year of full time earn 60 ECTS points;

7. Qualifications, competences and learning outcomes are to be added into each subject according to the NQF;

8. Consideration of the entrance criteria for this program that should be raised through more thoroughly examination;

9. Consider the possibility to include some interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary aspects in Curriculum that refers to the overall content, taught in a course

2.5 Students

This section of SER is the shortest one, and much information is recommended to be included, since the students are the main source of income. Positive feature confirmed during the visit, as well as SER, that there are all learning conditions in the College created for students with different schedules: from flexible ones (till late evening) with supplementary classes and services for alumni. The Joint Services Fund set up to provide quality services for student staff, and their academic activities (in terms of Publications, Trainings, Seminars and Workshops, Development Projects, Conferences).

The total number of students is 238 for both BA and MA with current ratio 13 students per professor which is acceptable. The progression of enrolment – is growing from 13 up to the current 15 students for MA. All other figures are provided – total number of students and their passing rates.

1.The answers of the ET related to the completion rate of students, and DC provided the ET with statistics on completion rate (at the end of May) with the answer "that there is no standard that requires to provide the completion rate". ET agrees, that there are no any specific requirements on it by KAA; but it is one of the characteristics of the students´ teaching and learning process. As it was explained, the dropout number and the graduates'

26

number is a result emigration, economic and social conditions in Kosovo, and the temporary employment outside of the country. The reason why there was no information regarding the enrolment for 2018-2019 in its statistics, is due to the suspension of the program for the year.

2. Although learning outcome are missing through Syllabuses and Course Catalogue, they are provided in so called "Model of the students workload activities" with ECTS credits and quite acceptable structure from lectures up to research activities. It is difficult to fully assess the general extent of interactive process between students and professors due to the fact that students are reluctant to express their opinion about quality evaluation of academic staff. Formally, an additional good tool is found that all students have the right to provide their written opinion (if they cannot express it openly) in available boxes. This was explained by students during the site visit´s discussion with ET), and it is perceived as a good tool found linked to some cultural norms and barriers in expressing opinions.

According to SER, the evaluation results are published at the DMS system.

3.SWOT analysis in SER deliver the information that there is a continuous support for students with employment information and opportunities for scholarship and practice. However, it is recognised that internship remains to be problematic, despite of existing career services with the threat and challenges in the employment of graduates in labour market. The challenges are linked to the employment opportunities. Therefore, it is becoming crucial to have a developed career center that are dealing with these issues. The SER includes a limited information about the work and activities of the career centre connected with these activities. Despite there is no direct standard or requirement on these services (except QM section related to employment), and the SER mentions it only once in its report.

4. The earlier request about the plagiarism check-up provided the answer that there is no plagiarism software/checker available in Albanian language. DC currently works on this direction jointly with the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and analyse the various options to develop anti-plagiarism software. Also, a statement of responsibility is signed by the student regarding their academic writing.

27

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

27

5. At the level of MA, students should be actively involved into the research process, but there is no any proof that this process is taking place, and there are no any formal requirements in Students´ standards that it can be somehow be evaluated.

In terms of the admission requirements for all students, the SER does not particularly make any statement about the admission requirements for MA students, and this information is not provided. In addition, there is an indicated lack of financial resources for involvement of students into the research projects. At this stage, it is a more active involvement into research process for MA Diploma is needed. Therefore, the flexible mechanism can be applied: 1. students should be concentrated in their selected subjects of research by selecting their potential employer or present employer (who might also invest into some research activities of the relevant program); 2. Other students should be involved into the activities of the Research center (one of those three listed units).

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students	V (?)	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	v	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.		v
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.		v
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	v	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.		v
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	v	

28

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

28

Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		v
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.		v
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	v	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	v	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Include more developed analysis for MA Students, in order to address their needs;
2. Assess the needs of students in research, as well as the opportunities with their possible publications organised at the MA level.
3. Ensure active involvement of students into the joint research activities and publications with professors;
4. Ensure active involvement of students into the activities of the Research Center (with professors) or their present or potential employers;
5. Use the Center for Economic and Political Science and Public Administration research as a forum for young leaders

2.6 Research

Some comments are provided at this stage related to the repetition of KAA standards in Research section on p. 6.8 below, and therefore, the ET leaves it as it is in both reports for BA and MA programs:

Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.

Since the MA program is stricter in terms of research (compared to BA program), with much higher requirements to both students and professors, the additional questions have been addressed to the MA program by the ET. The answer was received that DC "needed to

29

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

29

incorporate new staff who have completed their studies in different universities, in order to bring new experiences that benefit the college" and to cover "teaching, research, and practical needs" with the goal of increasing research activities and publications.

According to Development plan (that was assessed during the same time with "no compliance" in "Research" section by the peers from this ET (no compliance to 7.1, 7.2, 7.3, 7.4), SER 2019 and other sources, the academic staff of the Business Administration and Economics is included in the research activities of the Centre for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration Research. But the ET request to clarify what types of activities are carried by the Research Centre (that includes activities of 3 units or centres) did not clarify some doubts and the situation with its 3 units. Also, from the observation during the site visit, it seems to be that the teaching staff was not quite aware about its activities during the meeting (21.06.2019).

Nevertheless, the positive motivational features that have been observed during the meeting with Academic members were the opinions that (1) there is a better working atmosphere in Dardania College compared to other HEIs; (2) many members of staff are motivated to apply for international conferences and to publish their papers in the international journals (despite the language of instructions is Albanian). Access to electronic library has been raised, and according to academic staff, it is possible to access to electronic library only during the time of their physical location in Dardania College.

List of lecturers has been provided for those members of the Faculty who received financial support for publishing with the aim of academic advancing and the PhD research studies.

Prof. Dr. Enver Hasani; Prof.Dr. Deme Hoti; Prof. Dr. Ajet Ahmeti; Dr.Sc. Ferid Hysa; Dr. Sc. Dritan Cekaj; Dr. Sc. Samire Bllaca; PhD. Kujtim Zylfiu; PhD Arta Grubi; Dr.Sc. Amir Imeri; Dr.Sc. Edlir Orhani, Dr.Sc. Ervin Muqo; Dr.Sc. Rilind Ademi; Dr.Sc. Mariela Lazi; Dr. Sc. Muazam Halili; Dr.Sc. Mejreme Ymeri; PhD cand. Florentina Dushi; PhD cand. Njomza Mehani ; PhD cand. Bajram Gecaj; PhD cand. Fatlum Mjeku; MA cand. Egzon Gashi

With the reference to SER, (a) *the lack of government funding* for scientific research and (b) the *deficit of financial resources* for research projects remain the key problems at the levels of Faculty and College. The academic Staff development plan for 2019-2024 year confirms that Dardania College ensures and continuously invests in the quality of academic staff in terms of teaching and scientific research as two main pillars. The development plan includes the budget with projections for money allocation in publications, training, workshops, seminars, development projects, cooperation and conferences as well as the coverage for research expenditures. It is however, not clear, which expenditures are supposed to be

30

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

30

covered for "the DARDANIA magazine" and what is the status of this journal. Best researchers are motivated to get the award "Research of the year".

Under the request of *additional information*, *dilemma* has been raised with the provision of 2 lists of publications at the Faculty level – first, Report for 2012-2016 (but included some fresh publications till 2018/2019), and the second – for 2016-2019.

The **first** source of information, - the Research Report (in fact, 2012-2019), provided the following information:

- Publications in local journals – 6
- Publication of books – 28 (but 13 publications are deducted due to the earlier year of publications – prior 2012) = 15
- Local conferences – 8 (minus 1 conference, held in 2011) = 7
- Participation in seminars – 52 (minus 13, published earlier 2012 year) = 39
- Participation in local/international projects –13 (from 2012) could be considered out of 25
- Managerial and administrative jobs – 18 (from 2012) activities were considered out of 25

Thus, the final list presented **21** publications/related activities with the following structure:
- Publications in local journals – 6
- Publications of books (university, monographs, chapters) – 15
- Participation in the local conferences – 39
- Participation in local/international projects – 13
- managerial and administrative jobs – 18 activities

The **second** source with the updated List of lecturers with research activities for 2016-2019 indicated that during the last 3 years the number of publications reached - **60** (including those, in process) with related activities and the following structure:

- International papers – 14 and 3 (in process)
- Publications in local journals – 15 and 3 (in process)
- Publications of books (university, monographs, chapters) – 9
- International Conferences´ Proceedings – 11 and 2 (in process)
- Participation in local conferences - 3
- Participation in projects – 10 (where 1 – international)
- managerial and administrative jobs – 10

The provision of two different list – one with no active research basis – 21 publications in local journals and books during 2012-2019 (by fact, and the earlier publications to 2012 have been deducted), and the other, new submitted list – with a boost in activities – 60 within 2.5 years. A certain dilemma is raised about the sharp boost of publications during the last 3

31

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

31

years - from the updated list compared versus the previous list of publications. These two lists of publications raised the questions how they were compiled (because the first list included also the period of 2017-19), but the clarification answers were not provided. The ET makes an assumption that the first list was not updated for the publications made within last 3 years, but there are still some doubts remain.

The discussion with academic Faculty members during the site visit revealed that the key staff basically came to work here 2-3 years ago, from 2016-2017, and the previous staff left college due to the pension´s age. The academic members have emphasised that they came to work at Dardania College because of their motivation, with "more favourable conditions", including research activities. On the other hand, the contrary answer was received to this first draft of the report (and it is included in its final version), that the Dardania college is one of those few that keeps the professors of older generations. The ET therefore, assume that there it is done on ad hoc basis, because there is quite a contradictory explanation.

The sufficient financial, resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives (standard 6.1)– the question is how institution will be allocating them, - solely out of students´ income or from the other sources? It is less clear regarding the logistic and research objectives.

SER very often mentions Tempus program as one of the possible source of funding, but it doesn´t exist since 2014 being replaced by Erasmus+ program from 2014.

Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results (the second version of the Publication list is accepted) on the same topics as their teaching activity – ET expert refer to the latest documents of the EU, where the issues of interdisciplinarity are important, and therefore, compliance should not be such a strict issue here

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the		v

32

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

32

institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.		v
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.		v
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	v	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.		v
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.		v
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	v	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	v	
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	v	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	v	(?)
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities		v

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. Activate the work of the units of the Research center with the defined roles and responsibilities for staff and students;
2. Awareness campaign organised about the Research Center (with its 3 activities, also Centrers), and the conditions under which the academic staff will be involved;

33

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

33

3. Promote and involve MA students into research through the specialisation of mentors linked to the motivation of each student.
4. Provide better infrastructure for research to students with more active involvement of students into this research process;
5. Subscription to Online library and access to this library from both home and institution should be provided for both the members of teaching staff, and students
6. Expansion of multidisciplinary research with the involvement of the members from other departments
7. Stimulate students to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.

2.7 Infrastructure and resources

The ET shared a positive opinion of teaching staff and students about the Dardania College´s modern infrastructure, equipment and all facilities designed for teaching and learning located in two buildings. During the site visit´s meetings with students´ representatives, students confirmed that in addition to all listed facility, they enjoy the great and convenient location of college facilities in the downtown area. The location of DC is excellent, being located in the center of the city. Another positive aspect is about the study conditions: "for the students and the personnel with physical disabilities, or with special needs, "Dardania" College provides appropriate conditions (p. 83, SER). However, it does not elaborate further on this topic.

Third, the ET positively assess the efforts of management about the renting conditions for students (it is believed that these conditions include both BA and MA students who travel to Pristina to study from different locations).

The access to electronic Library is a required source of information by all users – the academic staff, students, and other categories of personnel. At the same time, the local students need to have the access to the sources in Albanian language, while the teaching staff – to English language sources, linked to research and publications.

The provided agreements with libraries showed that there are only 50% of them that are valid at this moment (other agreements are expired).

34

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

34

The ET recommends Freely available sources for research with an access to the free sources like Google Scholar, www.academia.edu, as well as https://www.researchgate.net/; and a great source of information –- General A Selective Guide to Free Online Library Resources, for Alumni and Members of the Public https://guides.lib.berkeley.edu/FreeResources and other freely available resources for research. After the provision of the requested data on the previous evaluation (with the first draft of this report), some more information is included below:

The biggest concern is now expressed about the fact that (1) the previous opinions of the ET were not taken into consideration by DC; (2) the important information about the recommendation on the augmented resources that should be used with a free access was not included in the SER, and (3) the provided SWOT in the SER about the threat: "a challenge remains in accessing the latest research databases in various online databases". Is it really a threat if the provided resources are the recommended ones, that are provided for free with a free access to publications that are tested and used by other universities?

The Background: The ET in 2016 recommended that the traditional library services have to be augmented (and in the long run possibly be replaced) by free access to electronic libraries, downloadable publications on the websites of the larger international research institutes, - the same recommendation that was provided by the present ET in the previous version of this report and at the present one. The request related to the previous evaluation discovered that the additional free resources were recommended - from Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Stiftung Wissenschaft und Politik, European Union Institute for Security Studies, data bases, publishing firms offering electronic versions of their product, the material collections from SSRN (Social Science Research network – www.ssrn.com), CIAO (Columbia International Affairs Online (https://cup.columbia.edu/reference/ciao), JURIS (https://www.juris.de/jportal/index.jsp) or openJur (https://openjur.de). The question is therefore arisen whether 2016 recommendations were distributed to the past and present staff, (who also distribute this information to students) of the DC? It is not clear why the opinions

35

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

35

of the 2016 ET were not taken into consideration, and the present ET who provided the same comments in the 1-st draft of this report makes a double attention to this issue (especially after revealing the ET reports with the same recommendations) with great concerns. The other recommendation (recommended by previous ET and the present ET) is the provision of library facilities with textbook library geared to the needs of students with the academic staff instruction on major textbooks, major documents.

There was some contradiction about **7.6** standard, because the SER makes a reference that "*For the students and the personnel with physical disabilities, or with special needs, "Dardania" College provides appropriate conditions*", but it does not elaborate further on it. At the same time, the members of the ET who directly visited the site, assessed it in the final version of their report with "no compliance" on the standard 10.9 "*Appropriate provision for both facilities and learning resources is made for students and staff with physical disabilities or other special needs (such as visual or hearing impairments)*", and the standard that was assessed positively before, had to be shifted.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	v	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	v	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum,	v	

36

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

36

with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.		
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	v	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	v	
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs		v

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Re-consider again the recommendations of the previous ET and the present ET on the augmented library of free resources with the free access to the indicated journals and resources. It is not clear why the opinions of the 2016 ET were not taken into consideration, and the present ET who provided the same comments in the 1st draft of this report makes a double attention to this issue (especially after revealing the ET reports with the same recommendations) with a great concern;

2. Provide facilities of library with textbooks specifically geared to the needs of academic instruction in College's subject areas making major textbooks, instructions and documents available in the free remote library electronic access to students;

3. Provide the list of free library resources to all categories of users (from students – up to professors). Prepare the additional source of information – like the Guide to Free Online Library Resources (with the recommended sources listed above) – there are

37

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

37

plenty of free resources available that can be a great source of information for all types of researchers (students, professors, etc.);

4. Find the resources through the available alternative channels - project preparation (for instance, targeted for the group of students with special needs – if this category of students available) or initiate or join to the projects that are jointly prepared with the access provision to electronic libraries. The project can be prepared by the professors or researchers of DC who are the grantee of some programs (Fulbright scholar, British Council scholar, etc.) who are always provided with the grant opportunities to bring the resources to the organisation, where he/she works.

5. Consider the possibility to online access starting with the list of free available online library´s resources and then adding the other online libraries

6. **Include the possibilities to sign the agreement with more real estate agencies who will help MA students (or group of students) to find the apartments/rooms in a low-cost housing/apartment for students.**

3   OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Thus, the overall evaluation of 7 standards for MA program looks like:

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
2. Quality management	Partially compliant
3. Academic staff	Substantially compliant
4. Educational process content	Partially compliant
5. Students	Partially compliant
6. Research	Partially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
Overall compliance	**Partially compliant**

Therefore, the overall compliance is assessed at the level of partially compliant.

Comments: The site visit left a positive impression about the friendly academic and non-academic staff, and Employers with students who provided a positive view about the prospective of the Dardania College, for many aspects of its functioning. Some minor impediments have been tracked due to the absence of name tags for Employers and students.

38

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

38

Although it has been a required element in the written procedures of KAA for the site visit, it didn´t disturb the flow of process. The tasks related to the internal documents have been more challenging in nature, because of different standards in web-site, SER and documents. The overall accreditation process in Dardania College very often appeals to the issue of correspondence and conformity at many points during this report. The present SER is not very factual and explicit, and does not indicate its data sources, and brings some contradicting information in its SWOT analysis. The mission and objectives are not very clear at this stage due to availability of two versions of mission and one objective only. The question is also remained whether the mission statement had been discussed with the involvement of different stakeholders, especially employers and students?

First, given the importance of business community and the future leaders (in the SER mission) as the main two pillars, second, taking into accounts the values of Dardania College (according to its Strategic plan, the value is the "self-assessment of mission"), and third, considering the requirement towards the study program mission with the overall mission´s compliance, the special attention should be given to this task. The problematic issues are seen in both versions of the mission statement (in the website and SER), and in the proportion between the mission and objectives (there is only one single written objective presented in SER).

Second, there is no correspondence between the titles of program, specialisations in web-site and SER, and the indicated issues of inconsistencies. Despite this task is not included into the standards, but it is one of the first recommendation to be addressed.

Third, the main question arises under the policy on recruitment of academic staff personnel. The priorities for the professional characteristics and the principle of excellence in teaching and research are different from the current practices of hiring the personnel at the program level. This is illustrated by SER: the characteristics of "obedience" is becoming important

39

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

39

strength under hiring the academic staff. At the same time, the ET accept the answer from DC MA program, that it is the matter of the wrong translation.

Fourth, the Course Catalogues reveals some minor weaknesses linked to: use of technologies (because it is not clear which particular) and different new forms of learning (also provided without specifics) and related to didactics. It is believed that there are mistakes linked to the activities (provided in Table as an example, highlighted in yellow).

Fifth, the educational process content with "learning outcomes" for students, the main sources of income, is completely overlooked. It should be recognised that the syllabuses with the listed subjects for the main and elective subjects are demonstrate their rich content and interesting in their related fields. However, the weakest part is linked to "learning outcomes" missing in the Syllabuses and Catalogue of the courses. According to the NQF, learning outcomes are to be added into each subject.

Sixth, in terms of productivity and involvement into research activities, the list of publications has been provided twice, - in the list of regular documents (for the period of 2012-2019 - Academic Staff Research Report 2012-2019) and among the documents requested by ET for the last 3 years (2016-2019). There was a striking difference between the first and second versions, and dilemma has raised. The first document indicated that within the last 3 years there were 21 publications, where 3 publications (2 published and 1 – in process) produced for the last 3 years (2016-2019). The updated list of publications (for the same term 2016-2019) suddenly reflected 60 publications. A great boost of publications that has been increased from 3 to 60 compared to the initial version of document raised this dilemma.

Seventh, the general SWOT analysis left the impression that many areas are not analysed properly, and standards are not often considered. In addition, the key features of SWOT analysis are mixed with each other. For instance, threats are not identified in the expected

40

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

40

way. One of examples of inadequate "Threat" is: "Dardania" College is determined to advance the structure of studying programs, and to improve its quality in order to keep the position of a leading institution of higher education in Kosovo". Another example is: "Continuous enrichment of the Center with experts on specific fields for professional development of academic staff". Other examples (for "opportunities" feature) require some clarifying questions: "Dardania college works in quite a complex environment, which is dominated by unprincipled competition among the colleges and institutions…What is meant under "unprincipled competition" needs some further clarification.

Eighth, there is a good infrastructure for teaching and learning, an excellent location as well as the efforts to support the process of research. At the same time some criticism is implied, why the opinions of the previous ET not taken into account. In addition, among the sources provided for the electronic library currently only 3 out of 7 are valid – ASIM Compass Abstract, Edward Elgar Products and e-library (in Albanian language).

Ninth, some information is still kept not updated. This can be referred to the information about Tempus projects, - both in the website and SER that have been replaced with Erasmus+ activities from 2014. There is an urgent need to adjust the information flow that is provided under the contents and context of two sources – English and Albanian languages as well as reflecting the current status.

It is recommended to look at each criteria with their recommendations, because this general list of recommendations do not include all specific details.

4   APPENDICES *(if available)*

Expert Team

Chair

_____

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)

Member

_____

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)

Member

_____

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)

Member

_____

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)

Member

_____

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)

Member

42

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

42

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)