

Evaluation Report External Expert Team Dardania College (DAC) 2016

Evaluation Report
by the team of experts,
assessing study programme of
College Dardania
in the process of re-accreditation

by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency

October 25th, 2016

Table of Content

1	Preamble	3
2	General Remarks	4
2.1	Aims and Objectives	4
2.2	Introduction, preliminary impressions.....	4
2.3	Mission Statement	5
2.4	Organization, management, and planning; facilities, infrastructure, equipment.....	5
2.5	Staff	5
2.6	Finance and Facilities, Infrastructure and Equipment.....	6
2.7	Quality Management and ECTS administration	6
2.8	Academic Programs and Student Management	7
2.9	Students.....	7
2.10	Research, External contacts and international cooperation.....	8
2.11	Particular problem items: Library.....	8
3	Business Administration and Economics, BA and MA.....	10
3.1	Academic Programs and Student Management	10
3.2	Staff	12
3.3	Research and International Cooperation	13
3.4	Final Recommendation.....	14
4	Bachelor of Arts in Political Sciences and Public Administration	15
4.1	Academic programmes and student management.....	15
4.2	Remarks on individual course modules:.....	20
4.3	Final Recommendation.....	23
5	General Law Bachelor Programme Re-Accreditation.....	24
5.1	Academic programmes and student management.....	24
5.2	Staff	26
5.3	Research and International Co-operation.....	30
5.4	Final Recommendation.....	31

1 Preamble

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) is requested by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology of Kosovo to evaluate all institutions of higher education which operate in Kosovo. The following experts were appointed to the team:

- Prof. Dr. Kristiina Tonnisson, University of Tartu (EE)
- Prof. Dr. Reinhard Meyers, University of Muenster (DE)
- Prof. Dr. Peter Parycek, Danube University Krems (AT)

Reinhard Meyers was asked to be chairman of the team.

This report on the re-accreditation of study programme of College Dardania, Republic of Kosovo was written by the Expert team appointed by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), on the basis of the self-evaluation of the institution and supporting documentation and a visit to the institution.

This report could not have been written without the support of the staff of the KAA in the first place, and also without a number of helpful face-to-face contacts at the College Dardania.

The following four study programs were processed for re-accreditation by Dardania :

- Business Administration and Economics, BA
- Business Administration and Economics, MA
- Political Science and Public Administration, BA
- Law, LLB

The evaluation report is based on the following materials and information:

- Self-Evaluation Report 2016, Dardania College, Pristina, [henceforth SER]
- KAA Lists of Academic Staff for the above programs
- External evaluation reports, Dardania College, Pristina, 2010, 2011, 2013
- Site Visit by the above-mentioned experts to Dardania College, Pristina, on October 17, 2016

2 General Remarks

2.1 Aims and Objectives

The purpose of this report is to enable the Kosovo Accreditation Agency and the Ministerial and/or Political Authorities concerned to come to a decision regarding the reaccreditation of the above-mentioned course programs to be offered by the Private Provider of Higher Education Dardania College, Pristina [henceforth addressed as Dardania College(DAC)]. The undersigned experts will assess the documentation mentioned above in the light of their experiences gained in the German, English, French, Austrian and Estonian university systems. References to benchmarks and good practices mainly refer to the German, Austrian, and Estonian university systems.

This report will conclude with a number of recommendations concerning each of the course programmes proposed: they are the personal opinion of the authors and are formulated with the background experiences mentioned above in mind. They reflect what the authors regards as good or standard practices in a number of mainly Western European education systems, without wanting to prejudice the different boundary conditions of tertiary education in the Kosovo in any way. Therefore, the final decision on the College's application for accreditation of the programs mentioned above will have to be made by the relevant authorities concerned.

This report could not have been written without the support of the staff of the KAA in the first place, and also of a number of helpful face-to-face contacts in Dardania College. While the authors are most grateful for the support thus received, they would like to stress that the arguments and conclusions of this report are their own responsibility exclusively.

2.2 Introduction, preliminary impressions

The Expert Team visited the established Pristina site of Dardania College on October 17, 2016, and, after being given a brief introduction into the history of Dardania, its evolutionary development, and its variety of programs, had general discussions first of all in the morning with the Rector and representatives of the Management, followed by a split up into various groups to discuss more specifically the teaching programs mentioned above with responsible members of the academic staff as follows:

Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs		
Law	Peter Parycek	Blerton Sinani	Muazam Halili	Hyreme Gurri
Business Administration and Economics/ BA	Kriistina Tonnison	Jeton Mazllami	Izet Zeqiri	Ajtene Avdullahi
Business Administration and Economics/ MA		Brikend Aziri	Gjilnaipe Bexheti	Luljeta Sadiku

Political Science and Public Administration/ BA	Reinhard Meyers	Mentor Agani	Jordan Daci	Safet Emruli
---	-----------------	--------------	-------------	--------------

The discussions were followed by a visit of the facilities, esp. the IT rooms and the library, lunch and internal discussions amongst the Experts, a meeting with a larger number of representatives of the teaching staff, a meeting with a larger number of students including the student union president, and another short round of discussions amongst the Experts.

2.3 Mission Statement

The experts noted that the SER did not contain a general chapter on the mission and future development prospects of Dardania. Partly, this is replaced by brief remarks on the rationale of individual programs under the respective program headings [and will thus be dealt with in situ there]. The experts also noted that Dardania had received institutional reaccreditation in the summer of 2013 until September 2018. This dispenses them from discussing a number of constitutional, institutional, financial, quality assessment, research, and staffing questions typically associated with an institutional reaccreditation demand.

However, a smaller number of points arose during the site visit which merited analysis and discussion; these will be mentioned below.

2.4 Organization, management, and planning; facilities, infrastructure, equipment

The experts had no problem with the way the College was administered nor with the resources and facilities available for that task and for academic instruction.

2.5 Staff

During the initial meeting with the Rector and Management, the experts remarked on a number of general staffing problems common to the majority of Kosovo HEIs and also characterizing the situation at Dardania:

- The increasing age level of senior teaching staff, particularly after the recent reduction of the retirement age for full-time staff from 70 to 65 by governmental decision – this will leave Dardania with serious problems in senior program management and teaching, academic administration, and guidance/peer review by experienced members of staff in the medium term
- The unreasonably short employment period in the employment contract – three years for full-time, and one year only for part-time members of staff
- The somewhat peripheral situation of female academic teachers: Dardania in that respect is far from a gender equal opportunity employment situation - though they have a female rector - let alone from a positive discrimination policy favouring female teaching staff [N.B. the male/female ratio in the afternoon meeting with the staff was roughly 80:20]

The experts noted with interest that Dardania was following a staff development policy [SER pp.876 et seq.] consisting inter alia of

- Carrying out a special analysis of the current situation in regard to the number, profile and other characteristics of the personnel working in the College,
- Designing a needs assessment and a plan for dynamics of recruitment of young staff in the College, including recruitment and development of internal resources and hiring of teaching staff externally,
- Setting up a scheme for sending our young teaching staff to study and advance in Universities abroad,
- Looking into possibilities to engage a significant number of visiting professors ...

Unfortunately, the otherwise rather voluminous SER contained only a few general paragraphs on these intentions, and the question of gender equality was not discussed at all in this context.

Recommendation:

- The experts would therefore recommend to finalize the needs assessment and the recruitment plans with a certain sense of urgency, make extra allowance therein for a policy of positive female discrimination, and add the resulting exposé as an annex to further Self Evaluation Reports.
- The experts acknowledge that the pool of female PhDs qualified for academic teaching in Kosovo at present is rather limited. This should, however, not discourage Dardania to follow a course of positive female discrimination; rather, they might want to increase that pool of female PhDs by offering a number of PhD grants to their own female Master students on condition that the grant holders after having completed their PhDs elsewhere come back to teach at Dardania for a period of time specified by the original grant contract.

2.6 Finance and Facilities, Infrastructure and Equipment

The Experts found the present financial situation of the College satisfactory, the infrastructure ample and sufficient, and the equipment in full working order. No respective complaints were to be heard either from the staff or the students.

2.7 Quality Management and ECTS administration

The College's quality, ECTS management, peer review and mentoring system mechanisms were described in the SER pp 900 - 910, and more substantially discussed during the site visit in the meeting with the academic staff. In general, they met with the satisfaction of experts, teaching staff and students alike and were regarded as workable and fair. Some points of criticism, however, were raised during the site visit, e.g. concerning evaluation systems within the courses. Currently the college applies rather a rigid system of evaluation so that all courses would follow exactly the same logic: intermediate exam 20 points; continuous student engagement 30 points; regular attendance and homework 5 points and final exam 45 points. According to various management teams all professors and teachers are totally free to change this grading structure if they wish, but it was surprising to notice that no one in any of the courses has ever done it. It might mean that the flexibility of the system in theory and in practice is contradictory or there are certain push or pull

factors explaining why all courses continue to follow the described format. It is highly suggested both to offer and to promote more flexible grading systems in general while different courses might need different approaches to assessment and grading.

2.8 Academic Programs and Student Management

The following questions were addressed by the experts during the site visit, and in the preparation of the draft report on the basis of the various chapters and annexes to the SER received electronically from Dardania College via KAA prior to the visit:

- Do the academic programs correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of employability?
- Are the quality, range and academic aims of the curriculum appropriate to the academic degree awarded?
- Are the programs based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated to and adopted by the teaching staff?
- Do the academic degrees correspond to international standards?
- Does the structure of the programs give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? (e.g. what is the proportion of independent study time compared to online/distance teaching and classroom units?).
- Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and comprehensible?
- Is the workload required for the academic program manageable for students?
- Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the overall program's goals and outcomes (competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills)?
- Are the examination regulations appropriate?
- Is the overlap of academic content between the various curricula comprehensible and transparent?
- How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?
- Is the ratio of academic/artistic staff to students appropriate?

As these questions can best be answered on the basis of the individual programs, they will form a skeleton for the individual program assessments. Answers to these questions can therefore be found under the headings for the individual programs up for accreditation.

2.9 Students

The development of the student body is extensively discussed and documented in the SER pp 879 et seq. On that basis, and in the discussion with the staff and the students, the experts' attention was positively drawn to the excellent staff/student ratio, the advantages of small-group teaching, the positive effects of a larger web of internship arrangements, and the satisfactory results of the College's career advisory services. Students' opinion and comparison yardsticks were very much (and largely optimistically) down to earth – study behaviour was regulated more by future job expectancies and employability requirements than by pure artefactual considerations of the potential future academic. So the experts gained the impression that there was a considerable amount of satisfaction with what the College had to offer on the student side – and the only major

point of criticism raised (which again is a common Kosovarian one) was that students would have preferred to enjoy more active offers for a period of study abroad (EU visa policy and financial concerns being named as the main obstacles).

2.10 Research, External contacts and international cooperation

The SER pp 915 – 1062 provides a numerically impressive list of international contacts and consequent publications of individual staff members – with the impact of the senior staff members much more in prominence than that of the junior members of staff. The experts would therefore welcome some additional College support for international activities especially of the junior members of staff to close this gap in a 1:1 direction. However, as transpired during the meeting of the experts with members of the academic staff in the afternoon, there is a general level of satisfaction with College support in this field.

Further questions to be addressed were:

- Are the extent and the quality of international cooperation in research and teaching adequate?
- Are the strategies of internationalization and the involvement of staff and students in training co-operations and mobility programs adequate?

In both cases, Dardania College does more than a lot of the other average private providers of higher education in Kosovo. The question, however, is what KAA and its board define as adequate. Staffwise, one could envisage intensified cooperation in the Tempus framework; three projects so far have been won, and completed, but the SER was silent on whether any new ones were in the pipeline or under preparatory consideration. Regarding students, internationalization depends to a very large extent on alterations in the Schengen visa regime. This, unfortunately, neither the experts nor Dardania can change.

2.11 Particular problem items: Library

The experts visited the library and found it reasonably well patronised with about half the working booths taken up; the place was well and orderly kept, and the librarian very helpful. The Library has an electronic, password-protected catalogue, which unfortunately cannot easily be accessed from the outside; it stocks over 6000 titles (according to the SER p.913), the majority of them in Albanian. It also offers students access to some 30 data bases and electronic platforms – like the World Bank's e-library or ISTOR [the librarian supplies a printed list on demand]. Bafflingly enough, the students met by the experts in the afternoon declared that they preferred to touch their books in a physical, printed form [very much unlike the student population in other Kosovarian colleges the experts had visited in the past]. In order to live up to that demand, the College would have to make sure that at least all the mandatory reading named by the individual course syllabuses would be available for consultation in situ; the experts were left with some doubts to that effect, could, however, due to the lack of time, not undertake a thorough check of the library holdings to ascertain the proper state of affairs.

However, also Dardania College will be challenged by the continuing electronisation of academic teaching over the medium term. This somehow reduces the traditional problem of access to literature in print: judging on the experience from elsewhere, Dardania students too will more and

more prefer to have access to their course material in full or chapterwise as e-books or in a downloadable PDF format. [Bear in mind also the fact that largescale suppliers like Amazon do not supply books to the Kosovo by mail.] The traditional library services would thus have to be augmented (and in the long run possibly be replaced) by free access to electronic libraries, downloadable publications on the websites of the larger international research institutes [like Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Stiftung Wissenschaft und Politik, European Union Institute for Security Studies, etc., etc.] data bases, publishing firms offering electronic versions of their product, the material collections offered by international governmental and nongovernmental organisations, and so on. We mention as examples SSRN (Social Science Research network – www.ssrn.com), CIAO (Columbia International Affairs Online - <https://cup.columbia.edu/reference/ciao>), JURIS(<https://www.juris.de/jportal/index.jsp>) or openJur (<https://openjur.de/>). Similar offers exist in the fields of economics, or psychology. In order to make the research & reading possibilities offered thereby known to the students, the experts would advise the College (also on suggestion of some of the students met in the afternoon)

Recommendation:

- To introduce a preparatory seminar on “Computer Literacy and Internet Access” into the first semester of each study program acquainting the students with the reading and research possibilities offered by electronic resources

Initial Library Recommendations:

- to structure the Library as a textbook library more specifically geared to the needs of academic instruction in the College’s subject areas
- to invest continuously in the acquisition of textbooks in cooperation with and according to the needs of the individual subject areas
- to make available major works (particularly works of reference, dictionaries, legal texts, and official document publications) in a downloadable form for students to take electronically home

Further Library Recommendations:

- In the medium term, it might – metaphorically – pay if the College employs for some time two or three student research assistants whose job it would be to muster the Internet for reference websites (like the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy - <http://plato.stanford.edu/>), e-learning programmes, download pages of research institutes (like ARENA, Crisis Web, HSFK, Brookings Institute etc., etc.) and policy think tanks, and download web-pages of international governmental and nongovernmental organisations (from UNO via the EU to e.g. OXFAM) in order to construct a catalogue of links to specific documents, official and semi-official publications, and study material which would be available on a College server to all students and could also be copied on CD or stick in order to be taken home.
- In their answer to the draft report, the College might want to point out under what conditions staff and students can make use of of what is already provided electronically by the various suppliers and electronic depositors.

3 Business Administration and Economics, BA and MA

3.1 Academic Programs and Student Management

Both BA and MA programs in Business Administration and Economics have been developed and improved since the last accreditation and the college has seriously worked on the recommendations from the last evaluation report. Both programs have gone through some major structural changes; a lot of emphasis is put on staffing and language issues, the programs are now structured in more logical and efficient way. Since these business programs are the core programs of the whole college, they generate the biggest number of the students and also the biggest part of the revenue. That in turn means that both programs have high potential for continuous improvements if it is consciously planned and targeted.

As for the BA study program Business Administration and Economics, the program was first accredited with no specialization in year 2010. In 2013, the program was reaccredited with 3 specializations: 1) General 2) Marketing and Entrepreneurship 3) Tourism Management. This year the Institution has applied for accreditation with 5 specializations adding 2 other specializations that used to be separate BA programs. Thus the official specializations for this year are: 1) banking, finances and accounting 2) management and informatics 3) marketing and entrepreneurship 4) tourism management and 5) general business administration track. According to the written feedback received from the college there was a mistake in SER where *general track* was not mistakenly listed as specialization. Regarding the specializations Management and Informatics, Marketing and Entrepreneurship and Tourism – they all used to be separate BA programs according to the management of the program. The institution has merged them with the current BA program and is offering them now as specializations. All these mergers are highly welcomed and the whole program is now even better connected to the business school profile of the institution.

Based on the last accreditation report, the biggest concerns were connected to the aspects that no courses were taught in English, there were no guest lecturers from foreign countries, linguistic competences of the staff and students were very limited and available readings were not up to date and in foreign languages. The expert was positively surprised how much emphasis the program has put on these aspects during the last years. The final outcome has not led to a totally new quality, but the push for improvements is commendable, e.g teaching practice in English. Some from the current staff have started already to deliver their courses/part of the courses in English and there were more (even if still very limited) books available in English. There was also a visiting professor invited from the U.S. for 1-2 semesters. The improvement of linguistic competences of the staff and students would certainly take more time, but the positive starting was there.

In the context of available infrastructure and the library, the school continues to have very nice premises for teaching and the biggest concern isn't even the limited volume of the books in the library (though it is for sure a critical issue), but the real usage of the books/academic resources. There is a long way to go for fostering academic and analytical thinking among all involved parties within the college, especially among the students. Also the staff working in library should get a proper preparation in academic search competencies and strategies. Even if there is a certain budget for the library each year and there are various possibilities for students to search in academic databases and journals, it is heavily underused. Even the librarian did not have appropriate skills to

search in academic sources, not talking about the students. While meeting with the students, none of them recognised the abbreviation EBSCO nor managed they to name any titles of existing academic journals they are aware of. Shortly, the possibilities for searching up-to-date information are available in college, but people are not skilful/ aware how to do it and the actual usage of resources is very limited.

Also the only visiting professor pointed correctly out that despite many positive sides and development in college one thing he would improve is increasing analytical thinking within the college. While having a random look at 6 defended MA theses, this critique becomes even more evident. 1 MA thesis out of them had an appropriate number of resources and there was a certain system for referencing, but 5 other theses showed poor quality for being MA theses in the academic sense (missing references, valid sources, up to date literature etc.).

Currently the biggest concern with the program is general program management capacity. The ones responsible for the program did not share a common understanding and view, how the program has been developed, what it used to be, what previous specializations were and what were independent BA programs. During the meeting their standpoints and information delivered to the expert changed four times. That raised a serious concern about program management capacity and quality assurance system within the whole institutions. The expert committee witness in various meetings that people responsible for certain areas actually did not have an overview of the area. This concern is more connected even to the general management system on the institutional level than with specific programs. It is strongly advised to have program leadership clearly in place who would be also present during the next accreditations while having full overview of the programs.

From the positive side, the teaching methods and the content of the teaching units are sufficient for the achievement of the program's goals and outcomes. There is certain logic behind the delivered courses. Taken into account that business curricula might be built up in so many different ways, the one currently under accreditation could certainly be one possible version. The program's range and academic aims correspond to the academic degree and to international standards. The overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum is comprehensible and transparent (e.g. having the same elective courses in different specializations, etc.). The allocation of ECTS continues to be logical, appropriate and justified. The admission requirements and criteria are standard for such BA and MA programs.

According to the staff the institution's programs are assessed regularly within the context of internal evaluation processes. The students have to assess each course at the end of the semester. Concerning evaluation criteria within all courses, it is advisable to soften the very rigid system of evaluation (45 points for final exam, 20 points for mid-term exam etc)

Also the alumni and potential employers are approached from time to time in order to get their feedback. The institution has installed an internal strategy of continuous assessment, which is very positive. In many places the expert witnessed an implementation gap between the principles and reality, but in general the system is working. Most of the previous recommendations have been taken more or less into account for the further strategy of development. For the future there will be the questions – are all specializations still relevant and corresponding to the market needs? – but at the current moment it is commendable that the merger of so many different programs has

happened. In general, both programs are doing a good job at training students who will be able to contribute in meaningful ways to the development of the business administration field and the general society in Kosovo.

Concerning teaching practice the term “interactive methods” is used a lot in formal argumentation, but often it means just discussions. On the other hand, practicums and cooperation with companies are really used in the programs. Students are required to complete various home assignments / course work and to present results to others, to discuss and to defend their arguments. According to the interviews with the academic staff the teachers at Master’s level are using more actively real life projects and case studies. Especially on MA level this requirement should get even more attention. The requirements for the Master’s Thesis include both theoretical research and empirical data collection. According to interviews, student works are often conducted during internships with the local relevant companies. On the BA level there is only once course covering partly the research mind-set called Academic writing. Currently it is an elective course. It would be suggested to consider having this course as a required one.

Recommendations:

- More emphasis should be put on systematic program management and sharing the general understanding and framework of the program among all involved staff. Most interviewed people managed to give a very good overview of their own courses and of some certain aspects of the program, but no one had the general overview of the programs in terms and past, presents and future changes, statistics etc. Even if the expert witnessed commitment to increase quality of the programs and to correspond to the previous recommendations, the picture delivered through meetings was rather eclectic. There is a certain implementation gap between what the program is doing and accomplishing in reality vs what it would like to do and accomplish. At the same time there is certainly a strong will for improvements. The program should be ready for constant changes and improvement in due time if additional needs would be there – closing down some specializations, changing the list of required vs elective courses etc. It is also advised to have in the future relevant information/overview about the changes already happened within the programs vs the changes that would be implemented after the program would be accredited. This information should be available already in the self-evaluation report in a clear and structured way.
- Much more emphasis should be put in fostering an analytical and academic approach among the students towards learning and research. Hands-on trainings on how to use the databases and how to look for international references should be available. Also lectures about the differences between academic literature vs grey materials, between academic research vs just gathering/describing data would be highly suggested. The school should continue to look for possibilities for international internships and international applied research projects where students could take part and gain valuable practical experience.

3.2 Staff

The staff of Dardania College teaching in the field of business administration is competent and motivated. Altogether there are listed 29 (sometimes 34) academic people, of which 20 have PhDs out of whom 11 have both a PhD and are also full time employed by Dardania. Some names presented in SER as part of the team (e.g. Hafize Miftari) are not on the KAA list. During the last 3

years at least 8 new staff members have joined the academic staff while replacing the retired people and renewing the teaching establishment, 6 of them have PhDs. The institution has an adequate proportion of permanent staff, also the proportion of full time and part time staff is appropriate. Most of the courses are led/ supervised by doctors or professors. Their qualifications are appropriate to the positions they hold within the institution.

Dardania College has succeeded to attract good academics as part of its teaching staff (including staff who is mostly active in the business world). The college's only foreign visiting professor is also in the business field. The college could take additional advantage of him in fostering an "academic mind-set" among academics even more. While the credentials of many academic staff as researchers in the fields of business administration could still be developed, their knowledge of other fields of study and their commitment to the program, as well as their ability to deliver on the stated aims, are beyond doubt.

The academic staff meets regularly in order to share experience and they have had general institutional wide trainings (e.g. in the field of interactive teaching methods). They regularly visit each others' classes as well. At the same time more structure is needed in order to build up from *single individuals* a *working team* who is understanding the logic of the curricula and who would feel personal responsibility not just for their own courses, but for all the curricula.

Certain respect should be given to the local teachers who are active and open enough to deliver their certain classes or the whole courses in English (if there is a need and request from the students). Even if general foreign language skills could be much improved both among teachers and students, certain improvements are already visible while comparing the situation now and 3 years ago.

Recommendations:

- On the institutional level more focus should be put on fostering the common mind-set and framework for program management. More time and effort should be spent on building up a common teaching unit from separate individuals who would have the overview of the whole curricula and who would share common understanding. It is suggested to continue with the process of renewing academic staff. It is also suggested to continue with visiting lecturers/professors on regular basis and to continue to invite guest lecturers to the courses.

3.3 Research and International Cooperation

Many of the professors (both full-time and part-time) are engaged in smaller and medium sized projects. Funds for research are usually coming from the college's own research centre and not from *the market*. At least it shows clearly the college's general attempt to increase the importance of research. In the future there should be more information and experience sharing around what academic research is about, what are the standards for quality research and publications, etc. There are certain international projects connected to the college as well, but they are mostly targeted towards international cooperation and teaching.

There have been improvements in publishing outcomes. The number of published pieces is for many cases respectfully high, now more attention should be put on increasing the quality of publications/ranking of the journals where the staff is publishing. In addition to motivating each

person to write, it would be very wise to have a common research agenda and policy. Again, steps towards a better system have been made through establishing research centres at Dardania College. Currently, there is one common research centre both for business and law. In the future it might be reasonable to separate these fields or on the contrary, to inter-combine these fields even more.

For the staff development research profile development should be encouraged by resources allocation and monitoring the professional development of the people. Especially at Master level the school's own research profile and research capabilities are important for sustainable institutional education and development. The school could offer more incentives for staff to become actively involved in other academic activities than teaching (publications, applied research, training abroad, etc.)

There is enough evidence that students' graduation theses/final papers are connected to processes dealing with research problems generated by the companies/institutions based on their work life needs, but higher academic and analytical levels of analyses could be expected as described above. Hence, on the BA level this research part shouldn't be over-emphasised, though on the other hand it is better to over emphasise than under emphasise this value. According to the interviews, student academic field research is usually conducted during the internships with the local relevant companies. The requirements for the diploma paper include empirical data collection and for this there could be a wider link to reliable and valid research methods.

Recommendations:

- In addition to motivating each person to write and publish, it would be very wise to have a common research agenda and policy within existing research centres. Also time should be allocated for preparing various applications and building international connections among the academicians. The school's/ program's intention to have more foreign lecturers is for sure commendable and it should be put continuously into the focus. All initiatives to strengthen the usability of the academic databases should be supported by the management. On the MA level more research focus should be visible within the study process as well.

3.4 Final Recommendation

Both MA and BA programs in Business Administration and Economics are running at an appropriate level. Further developments are needed to build up an even deeper academic mind-set, better understanding of curricula and research among all involved parties and to create a *working team* from *single individuals*. Based on currently available data, statistics and developments, both programs are committed to improvements and therefore **it is recommended to re-accredit both programs for 3 years.**

4 Bachelor of Arts in Political Sciences and Public Administration

4.1 Academic programmes and student management

The College applies for re-accreditation of a standard three-year, six semester full-time 180 ECTS total, 60 ECTS/year Bachelor program in Political Sciences and Public Administration (BA), which is characterized by a common block of core and elective courses in the first four semesters branching out into four two-semester specializations in the fifth and sixth semester, namely

- Public Administration,
- European Studies,
- Diplomacy
- Public Opinion.

Formally, this program fulfils the conditions of the Bologna agreement (in the 3+2+3 structure) and is therefore in principle comparable to similar course schemes in the Bologna area. The application answers, in varying degrees, the following questions.

Do the academic programs correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of employability?

Yes in principle – the rationale and intention of the program, as well as the labour market orientation are explained in the SER pp.241 et seq.. The expert would have liked to see, however, some more precise information on the number of and demand structure for political scientists' jobs in the Kosovo labour market based on some empirical evidence gained by market research. As formulated in the SER, the program conveys the impression to be rather supply driven than demand driven.

Are the quality, range and academic aims of the curriculum appropriate to the academic degree awarded?

Yes – after some structural reordering [cf. below] the program composition suggested would be acceptable to any Western European University as well.

Are the programs based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated to and adopted by the teaching staff?

Course descriptions, course objectives, and learning outcomes are prima facie rationally related to each other and extensively described in all the modules. The sequence of modules, however, shows a certain disorderliness, which can be explained only by the incremental growth of the program over time; some of the elective subjects should be struck from the pool of elective subjects altogether. Throughout the SER, there is no explicit discussion of a subject-wide pedagogical concept or common didactic approaches. However, the College has set up various schemes and approaches for better material, moral and other support and motivation for its staff (SER p.878). It has also

... motivated the teaching staff in their efforts for enhancement of teaching skills and professional development by offering them courses in didactics of higher education and by supporting their participation to conferences, symposia and to other scientific events at home and abroad (ibid., p.877)...

Given that, as well as given the existence of a rudimentary mentoring system, the experts can only conclude that Dardania's didactic policy is based on a watch & learn/trial&error/learning by doing system supported by assessment of a teacher's performance by students via quality assurance. In this context, the experts did not get an answer to the question what would happen if an academic does not fulfil students' expectations: there does not seem to be a transparent, clearly defined, publicly accountable procedure to deal with such cases. In particular, neither staff nor students wanted to discuss the possibility that quality assessment procedures could also be instrumentalised for the mobbing of teaching staff.

With regard to program structure, we address criticism first to the common entity of the first two years, and subsequently to the individual specializations of the third year:

- a. common ground work semesters I – IV
- b. specialization Public Administration
- c. specialization European Studies
- d. specialization Diplomacy
- e. specialization Public Opinion

ad a) common ground work semesters I – IV

The discussion between the expert and the colleagues responsible for the program established consensus on the necessity to arrange the sequence of modules in a more orderly way: the first semester should gain in propedeutic content, while the majority of introductions to a particular subject area should be arranged together in the second semester in order to allow looks over the respective fences of the subject areas and support comparisons more easily; semesters three & four could then be reserved for dealing with particular items more in depth or broaden the approach into neighbouring areas of political science (like e.g. Sociology). Thus, a possible order of modules might be:

- I. Academic writing; Computer and Internet literacy (including introduction to Informatics); Basics of statistics; Communication skills; Critical thinking; Stereotypes & gender roles; Fundamentals/Methodology of scientific research; English language I
- II. Introduction to Political Sciences; Introduction to Public Administration; Introduction to International Relations; Introduction to Comparative Politics; Introduction to Economics; Introduction to Sociology; History of Political Thought; English language II
- III. History of International Relations; History of European Integration; International Political Economy; International Public Law; Geopolitics and Geostrategy; Balkan history and politics; Political Philosophy; History & Identity
- IV. Administrative Law & procedures; Business Law; Basic Methods of policy planning and analysis; Local governance and Urban Sociology; Social and Labour Market policies; Macroeconomics; Political Sociology

ad b) Specialization Public Administration

In a similar vein as above, some rationalization of the course structure seems to be necessary; the elective course on "judicial psychology" should be replaced by a subject more akin to Public Administration, while the course on "Administration of education" should be replaced by the wider-angled "Administration of public services". What is dearly missed is a full course on "Public Finance"

(taxation, budget making, controlling, auditing), as parts of this subject crop up in a number of different fields without proving the close relationship existing between them. Also, the somewhat general “Management of innovations” should give way to “E-Government”, as this field has gained much prominence over the last one or two decennia. The question then still to be decided is whether the two semesters should be structured either on a national/international divide, or systematically again on basic subjects (sem.5) versus deepening aspects (sem.6). If the latter is preferred, the structure could look as follows:

- V. Theory and Practice of National Central Administration; Theory and Practice of International Administration; Constitutional Law; Management of Public Institutions [agenda setting, project formulation, decision making, political & public stakeholder relations, personnel recruitment and staff development, development of service, contract, and staff welfare conditions, implementation control, organizational change management – in short: an internal process framework and process continuation perspective); Administration of public services (needs analysis, customer relationship definition, stakeholder interest definition, project formulation, legal framework analysis, budgeting, market observation, product making and product quality control, product success analysis, public information & public opinion influencing – in short: an output orientation and organisation – environment relation perspective); Public Finance; E-Government
- VI. Foreign Policy & Diplomacy; Global [Economic] Governance; International Conflict Management and Conflict Resolution; International Protection of Human Rights; EU policies and institutions; European Union Law (special aspect: Europeanization of national administrative behaviour); Public Relations; Diploma paper & practicum

ad c) Specialization European Studies

In view of the traditional European Studies perspectives dominating Western European tertiary education, a thorough reformulation of the specialization structure seems to be necessary. The elective courses on “Judicial Psychology”, “Work and Life Balance”; “Cultural and Religious Diversity” should be given up in this context altogether; new elective courses should be offered in the analysis of a number of concrete EU Policy Areas like

- Competition and Consumer Protection Policy
- Common Agricultural Policy
- Cohesion Policy and Structural Funds
- Social and Employment Policy
- Research and Technology Development Policy (incl. IT)
- Environmental Protection Policy
- Transport Policy and Common European Networks
- Trade and Overseas Development Policy
- Justice and Home Affairs (including Migration)

Students should choose at least three, if not four of these policy areas according to their personal preferences [and of course also according to the offers realized by Dardania]. A reformulated specialization structure could look like the following:

- V. EU policies and institutions; European Economic Integration and the Single Market: Integration and (De-/Re-)Regulation; EU Economic and Monetary Union: Crisis and Stability in the Eurozone; European Union Law (special aspect: *acquis communautaire*); Policy Making [alternatively: Decision Making] in the European Union; Contemporary European Political Systems [comparative focus on a number of paradigmatic member states]; Theories of European Integration; elective courses from the EU policy areas mentioned above
- VI. Global [Economic] Governance; International organizations: the EU in perspective; International Conflict Resolution and Conflict Management: the EU's contribution to world peace; The Common Foreign and Security Policy of the EU; Humanitarian Assistance and Overseas Development: the EU and the Third/Fourth Worlds; further elective courses from the EU policy areas mentioned above; practicum & diploma paper

ad d) Specialization Diplomacy

Again, a more structured reformulation of the original suggestion seems necessary, starting with the elimination of the elective courses on "Judicial Psychology" and "Delinquency Psychology" as atypical for the overall subject area. Propedeutical courses like "Methodology of Political Research" should be shifted to the first or second semester (and then be made available to all Political Science students). In this light, a reformulated program structure could look as follows:

- V. V: Foreign Policy and Public Diplomacy: a general overview [Actors and Interests]; Economic Diplomacy: Carrots and Sticks; Soft Power Diplomacy: Alternative Diplomacy from the grassroots; Art, Strategy, and Tactics of Diplomatic Negotiation; Contemporary Diplomacy; Recent Diplomacy [the expert suggests a clarification of the titles of the latter two courses, whose syllabus description is otherwise clear and distinct]
- VI. VI: Theories of International Politics and Foreign Policy: Contending perspectives and world views; Global Governance, International Actors, and International Law: the structuration of international Relations; Conflict Management and Conflict Resolution; Multilateral Diplomacy and Security Alliance Systems; War, peace, and security: deterrence, balance of power, and compromise of interests as traditional stances of security politics; practicum & diploma paper

ad e) Specialization Public Relations

Finally, the systematization effort has also to be applied to the Public Relations specialization. Again, we start with some suggestions for basics in semester 5 and proceed to more specialized areas of application in semester 6.

- V. Introduction to Public Relations; Principles of Public Relations; Basics of Journalism: Print, Broadcast, TV; Electronic Communication and the Internet; Communications and Law; Communication and Ethics; Communication Theories; Public Relations Writing
- VI. Strategic Public Relations Management; The Psychology of Communication, Advertising, and Market Making; Conflict Management and Conflict Resolution; International protection of human rights; Crisis Communication; Public Opinion and Political Culture; Stereotypes & Gender Roles II; diploma paper and practicum

Elective courses should be offered from the areas of Political Sociology; EU policies and institutions; International Organizations; Global Governance, etc. For the more philosophically minded student courses on the theory of knowledge, Constructivism, and Postmodernism might be recommended.

Do the academic degrees correspond to international standards?

Yes in principle – conceivably this structure could – after the reformulations suggested above - also be adopted by the expert’s own department. A closer look at the international yardsticks, however, reveals a heavy dependence on examples from the SEE region, in particular on examples from the area of former Yugoslavia. In contrast, the ENA as a purported program father would probably ask at least for a genetic parenthood test, and would contest any action for maintenance.

Does the structure of the programs give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? (e.g. what is the proportion of independent study time compared to online/distance teaching and classroom units?).

Unfortunately, neither the SER nor the Syllabi contained in annex 1 say anything about the study times requirements of an individual module. In terms of the division and structuration of the subject matter, the expected outcomes, the requirements and bases for assessment, and the listing of set literature and further reading they are a muster of extensive and meaningful information. The only thing they are silent about is the actual workload – a state of affairs the College certainly want to change in their next Self Evaluation Report !!

Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and comprehensible?

The ECTS calculation is transparent and comprehensible. However, ECTS and allocated workload for the Bachelor thesis might be better explained.

Is the workload required for the academic program manageable for students?

The only answer to this can be formulated on the Radio Eriwan model – in principle yes, but... If students can devote their attention to the program full-time, they should be able to manage its completion in the six semesters foreseen; if students have to work part-time for their living (as in the experts’ experience most Kosovo students have to), and if they want to follow an interesting and demanding internship, and if they want to immerse themselves thoroughly in one of the research projects, then some of them will experience the program as a rather demanding one.

With this particular set of customers in mind, the experts would therefore recommend to Dardania to investigate the possibilities of offering part-time BA studies over a four-year or even a four-and-a-half--year period [i.e. 2/3rds of the teaching load per semester].

Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the overall program’s goals and outcomes (competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills)?

We quote Radio Eriwan again – in principle yes, but... If you have to work to keep yourself afloat during your studies, it makes all the difference.

Are the examination regulations appropriate?

Yes indeed – they show clarity and completeness.

Is the overlap of academic content between the various curricula comprehensible and transparent?

There is not much overlap between the various five & six semester specializations in the area of compulsory courses. However, the notation of modules in the elective field is somewhat misleading, as the same course titles appear again and again in the different specializations. It would make life much easier, if the specializations would only be described by the respective sum total of their compulsory courses, and all the elective courses would be relegated to a common elective course pool from which students would have to choose a predetermined number of modules either according to their individual interests or according to the needs of a particular specialization. The expert feels that in the last two semesters the number of elective courses should be reduced in favour of compulsory courses which might describe the academic sub-field to be taught in a more comprehensive way.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?

Admission criteria and procedures are up to international standards; no criticism was voiced in that direction during the site visit.

Is the ratio of academic/artistic staff to students appropriate?

According to the SER staff list p. 874 there are 8 members of fulltime political science/public administration staff, and 5 part-timers; all these are also on the KAA staff list. It may be that the KAA list lists even more staff members teaching in politics; however, this cannot be decided as the KAA list contains no information on the subject a particular person teaches. In any case, this gives an overall pool of teaching hours of up to 110 hrs. per semester. As the utmost minimum requirement per semester would be 30, this is more than adequate ! Also, the table relating student figures SER pp 879 et seq. gives 172 students altogether for the Bachelor program, and another 37 for the Master program. If we count the part-timers only half, this gives a staff/student ratio of a little less than 1:20. This is certainly not to be criticized at all!

4.2 Remarks on individual course modules:

In terms of content description, course objectives, and learning outcomes individual module descriptions were generally clear, comprehensible, and in order; in some cases, however, the set literature would need some refreshing. This applies in particular to the courses dealing with current conflicts and questions of globalization. As the prior accreditation of this program took place in 2013, there would be a need to change the then available editions of textbooks for the more recent 2015/2016 ones.

In the considered opinion of the expert, the following titles represent the minimum every good political science library should make available:

a) for Political Science as a field of Study

- Andrew Heywood: Politics. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 4th ed. 2013

- Andrew Heywood: Political Ideologies. An Introduction. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 5th ed. 2012
- Robert F. Goodin (ed.): The Oxford Handbook of Political Science. Oxford: Oxford UP 2011
- David Marsh/Gerry Stoker (eds.): Theory and Methods in Political Science. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 3rd ed. 2010
- Keith F. Punch: Social Research. Quantitative & Qualitative Approaches. 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage 2014
- Alan Bryman: Social research methods. 4th ed. Oxford: OUP 2012

b) for Comparative Politics

- Jeffrey Kopstein/Mark Lichbach/Stephen E. Hanson (eds.): Comparative Politics. Interests, Identities, and Institutions in a changing global order. 4th ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP 2014
- Robert Hislop/Anthony Mughan: Introduction to Comparative Politics. The State and its Challenges. Cambridge: Cambridge UP 2012
- Rod Hague/Martin Harrop: Comparative Government and Politics. An Introduction. 9th ed. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2013
- Daniele Caramani (ed.): Comparative Politics. 3rd ed. Oxford: OUP 2013
- William Roberts Clark/Matt Golder, et al.: Principles of Comparative Politics. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: CQ Press 2012

c) for European Studies

- Neill Nugent: The Government and Politics of the European Union. 7th ed. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2010
- Desmond Dinan: Ever Closer Union. An Introduction to European Integration. 4th ed. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2010
- Desmond Dinan: Origins and Evolution of the European Union. 2nd ed. Oxford: OUP 2014
- Simon Hix/Björn Hoyland: The Political System of the European Union. 3rd ed. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2011
- Daniel Kenealy et al.: The European Union. How does it work ?, 4th ed. Oxford: OUP 2015
- Ian Bache/Simon Bulmer et al.: Politics in the European Union. 4th. ed. Oxford: Oxford UP 2014
- Michelle Cini et al. (eds.): European Union Politics. 4th ed. Oxford: Oxford UP 2013
- Helen Wallace/Mark A. Pollack/Alasdair R. Young (eds.): Policy-Making in the European Union. 7th ed. Oxford: Oxford UP 2014
- Miroslav N. Jovanovic: The Economics of European Integration. 2nd ed. Cheltenham: E.Elgar 2014

d) for International Relations

- Andrew Heywood: Global Politics. 2nd ed. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2014
- John Baylis/Steve Smith/Patricia Owens (eds.): The Globalization of World Politics. An Introduction to international relations. 6th ed. Oxford: Oxford UP 2013
- Charles W. Kegley/Shannon L. Blanton: World Politics. Trend and Transformation. 15th ed. Belmont, CA: Cengage Learning 2015

- Joseph Grieco/G. John Ikenberry/Michael Mastanduno: Introduction to International Relations. Enduring Questions and Contemporary Perspectives. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2015
- Peter Dicken: Global Shift. Mapping the Changing Contours of the World Economy. 6th ed. London: Guilford Press 2011
- Matthew Sparke: Introducing Globalization. Ties, Tensions, and Uneven Integration. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell 2013
- Tim Dunne/Milja Kurki/Steve Smith (eds.): International Relations Theory. Discipline and Diversity. 4th ed. Oxford: OUP 2016
- Robert Jackson/Georg Sorensen: Introduction to International Relations. Theories and Approaches. 6th ed. Oxford: OUP 2016
- Jennifer Stirling-Folker (ed.): Making Sense of International Relations Theory. 2nd ed. Boulder/Colorado: Lynne Rienner 2013
- Cynthia Weber: International Relations Theory. A Critical Introduction. 4th ed. Abingdon: Routledge 2014
- J. Ann Tickner: A Feminist Voyage Through International Relations. Oxford: Oxford UP 2014 (with extensive bibliography on the subject)
- Malcolm N. Shaw: International Law. 7th ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP 2014
- Malcolm D. Evans (ed.): International Law. 4th ed. Oxford: OUP 2014

e) for Multi-Level Governance

- Henrik Enderlein et al. (eds.): Handbook on Multi-Level Governance. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar 2012
- Beate Kohler-Koch/Fabrice Larat (eds.): European Multi-Level Governance. Contrasting Images in National Research. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar 2009
- Andrew Geddes et al. (eds.): The European Union and South East Europe. The Dynamics of Europeanization and Multi-Level Governance. Basingstoke: Routledge 2012

f) for Political Theory

- Andrew Heywood: Political Theory. An Introduction. 4th ed. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2015
- Bruce Haddock: A History of Political Thought from Antiquity to the Present. Chichester: John Wiley 2008
- John Hoffman/Paul Graham: Introduction to Political Theory. 2nd ed. London: Longman 2009
- Fred Dallmayr (ed.): Comparative Political Theory. An Introduction. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan 2010
- John S. Dryzek (ed.): The Oxford Handbook of Political Theory. Oxford: Oxford UP 2008

g) for World History

- Jerry H. Bentley (ed.): The Oxford Handbook of World History. Oxford: Oxford UP 2011
- Richard H. Immerman/Petra Goedde (eds.): The Oxford Handbook of the Cold War. Oxford: Oxford UP 2013
- Dan Stone (ed.): The Oxford Handbook of Postwar European History. Oxford: Oxford UP 2012

- Various eds.: A History of the World. 6 Vols. Harvard UP 2012 ff – of which at least: A World Connecting: 1870–1945. Ed. Rosenberg, Emily S., and Global Interdependence: The World after 1945. Ed. Iriye, Akira

4.3 Final Recommendation

1) (Re-)Accredit the program on Political Sciences and Public Administration with the Specialization Public Administration for another three years in view of the only slight changes suggested in the assessment report.

2) Do NOT reaccredit the Program on Political Sciences and Public Administration with the three specializations European Studies, Diplomacy, and Public Opinion in their present form, but encourage Dardania to submit a new accreditation request after having executed the changes in the specializations' structures as suggested above.

5 General Law Bachelor Programme Re-Accreditation

5.1 Academic programmes and student management

Do the academic programmes correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation?

The mission statement is quite general and offers no links to the well-developed Mission Statement of the CD. The programme representatives did not provide strong links to the strategy. The expert team (ET) had the impression that the representatives have not been involved into the strategy process respectively the strategy has not been communicated to the new staff members. The gap between management and programme representatives seems to be quite big. The strategic approach in staff development or research needs to be strengthened.

Are the curriculum's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?

The description of the study programme includes learning outcomes (p. 433ff) and course syllabi, which are well written and appropriate. Nevertheless the programme offers limited differentiation compared to other private or public programmes.

The recommendation of 2013 *“Develop program's own identity; rethink the order of the courses, the allocation of obligatory and eligible courses and the specialisations”* has been incorporated by reducing the specialities from 4 to two, which could be seen as a positive development, but in addition no further changes or developments happened – during the SV multiple times the ET asked for examples. Crucial aspects like European or digital aspects, which could be linked to the two specialisations, have not been developed. The expert team (ET) completely understands a conservative and general curriculum approach for a law bachelor programme, but a bit of differentiation and institutional signature is not a contradiction to a general law curriculum. Developing a special focus would be quite easy achievable based on cooperation with the remaining programmes in the field of economics and public administration. Jordan Daci, who was the official speaker at the meeting, is expert in the field of constitutional and administrative law, the expertise and knowledge could be used for administrative law specialisation, which cooperates with the programme of public administration. In general stronger cooperation between the different programmes could improve research and teaching. The debate club organized by student union and the CD or shared lectures like academic writing are a positive a positive example for knowledge exchange and network building.

The academic title Bachelor of Law is common in Europe and is in line with the content and learning outcomes.

First and second semester 40 credits are used for general non-law topics and just 18 credits for introduction to general law principles. This structure is not student oriented, who should have the possibility to find out quickly if studying law was the right decision. Very similar design can be found in other programmes all over Kosovo, like in the University of Pristina. This could be designed in a different way, like guiding the students to the core elements of law.

Nevertheless the non-law courses seem to be randomly selected and do not shape a specific profile, which was mentioned during the SV: *“Modern lawyer needs to combine theory, practice, English skills and information technology.”*

Some of the procedure law courses are too late positioned and should be closer to the respective law topics, e.g.: Civil procedure law in the 7th semester and the respective course “Civil Law” is taught in the 4th semester.

Is the programme based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated to and adopted by the teaching staff?

The SER offers no information about a didactic concept. No further evidence has been delivered during the SV. Teaching staff refereed that they present the content, discuss with students and offer possibilities of group discussion. Students were very satisfied with the teaching quality, nevertheless but an overarching didactic concept is completely missing. It was not possible to establish a common understanding during the SV about the necessity of an overarching didactic concept and institutionalized learning feedback loops do not exist.

Do the academic degrees correspond to international standards?

The SER offers one paragraph and mention Graz, Orebro, Sarajevo and the Faculty of Law of the University of Pristina. No further details about the compared programmes.

Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?

The ECTS-Credit allocation is appropriate and follows the European standards; there is no course with more than 6 credits. Workload seems to be correct, but is not evaluated.

Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

Workload calculation is mentioned in chapter 2.9 (p. 427) and is calculated with 25 hours for 1 Credit, which is common in Europe. The students didn't bother about the working load and seem to be satisfied with the workload of the programme.

Are the teaching methods and the content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of each programme's goals and outcomes (competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills)?

Teaching methods are a mixture of lectures, exercises, case analysis, discussions, debates, brief and papers. The group size is approximately about 30 students, which offers quite easy the possibility of interactive teaching. Based on the feedback by the students, the teaching methods should be sufficient. During SV discussion with the representatives of the teaching staff the modern lawyer profile was defined: Theory, Practice, English and Information Technology, especially information technology needs to be strengthened and to foster English skills some of the courses need to be taught in English.

Is the overlap of the academic content between the various curricula comprehensible and transparent?

The curriculum and syllabi are well prepared and offer comprehensible and transparent overview. Based on the curriculum there is almost no overlapping of courses.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?

Admission criteria are described in chapter 2.12 (p. 428) and are in line with international and exceed national standard through the combined assessment of admission exam test and secondary education.

Is the ratio of the academic/artistic staff to students appropriate?

Based on the delivered figures of 15 teaching staff members (p. 874-875) and 188 enrolled students (p. 1076), the staff/student ratio is very good.

Recommendations:

- ET recommends developing an overarching didactic concept with the faculty members; developing a train the trainer concept for disseminating the concept to all faculty members; establishing formal feedback loops and fostering the communication and experience exchange between the faculty members; developing a working culture and a strong core team.
- The law team should reflect the current curriculum in relation to sequence of the courses, new courses which are necessary for creating the described new lawyer profile, new courses in the in the context of Europe and Technology, to the potential of stronger cooperation with other programmes
- ET recommends incorporating workload evaluation into the evaluation questionnaires.
- ET recommends improving the comparability of the study programme in the SER.

CD Comments: CD provided a comprehensive document with comments. ET highly recommends using the recommendations and the feedback for reflection and further development of the curriculum.

5.2 Staff

Does the institution have an adequate proportion of permanent staff and appropriate proportions of permanent and external staff?

The bachelor law programme is – as discussed – a traditional general law programme with 8 semesters, therefore a strong group of law lecturers is needed. The current programme faculty consists of 9 full staff members and 6 part time members, which is close to the minimum number for a bachelor programme. The proportion of full-time to part-time is appropriate. But the ET had the impression that most of the full time programme members are just coming for their lectures to the premises. A strong core team, which does permanently research and work on the development of the programme, seems not to be existing.

DC comment: “We kindly disagree with you statement or impression that most of the full time programme members are just coming for their lectures to the premises. Full time programme members are required to spend time at our institution in full accordance with our applicable laws and regulations. Their employment relationship is well defined and regulated in their respective employment contract and by labor law into force in Kosovo. The

core team which you have not been able to notice is indeed the entire full time employed staff. Thus, we would kindly ask you to review this part of your report.”

ET comment: We didn’t dispute the legal correctness, but based on the discussion during our SV the impression raised that a strong core team for the law programme is missing. As example: Not a single joined law project was mentioned. Nevertheless it’s an impression, which could be used for further internal discussion. It is not an issue which leads to the the non-accreditation recommendation.

The listed lecturers in the course tables (p. 428-433) do not correspond with the lecturer list of the law programme (p. 874-875). On the first sight the lecturer lists seems to be appropriate, but after drilling down into details, the staff lists reflects too few law experts for an general law programme:

Name and surname	Academic grade	FT /PT	Academic Backgroud	Comment
Ejup Sahiti,	Prof.Dr.	FT	Law, Penal Law	Not eligible for full time because older than 65
Riza Smaka	Prof.Dr.	FT	Law, Civil Law	Teaches two courses: International private law and Contract law; further two courses in the Political sciences and public administration programme. Low teaching load for full time position.
Jordan Daci	Dr.Sc.	FT	Law, Admin. Law	Teaches 5 obligatory courses in the field of constitutional and administrative law.
Blerton Sinani	Dr.Sc.	FT	Law, Civil Law	Teaches 4 courses in the field of International public law . Additionally he is listed in almost all programmes with the course Intellectual property law, which would lead to a too high teaching load.
Fatlum Mjeku,	MA (PhD c)	FT	Law, Civil Law	Teaches approx. 7 to 8 courses and 5 in the law programme; leads to a critical teaching load.
Gjyldane Mulla,	Prof.Dr.	FT	Social Science	Course Sociology
Islam Krasniqi,	Prof.Dr.	FT	Social Science	Covers Academic writing in all programmes.

Hyreme Gurra,	Dr.Sc.	FT	Social Science	Listed as law member, but not listed in any law course . Covers Anglo-American Cultural Studies in the English Language and American studies master programme (p.833)
Safet Emruli,	Dr.Sc.	FT	Social Science Changed to Law	Listed as member (p. 875), but not listed in the law course programme; listed in public management programme.
<p>CD comment: <i>“Dr. Safet EMRULLI has a PHD degree from the University of Tirana, Albania in Constitutional and Administrative Law, very well experience law professional and academic teaching staff.”</i></p> <p>ET comment: ET appreciates additional information, but as mentioned, Emruli is not responsible for a law course, regarding the SER.</p>				
Haki Demolli	Prof.Dr.	PT	Social Science Changed to Law	Teaches seven courses as part time lecturer.
<p>CT comment: <i>“Prof. Asoc. Dr. Haki DEMOLLI, who is among the most well known specialist of criminal law areas including but not limited to Forensics, criminology, investigation techniques and Criminal Law and Rule of Law in general. He is a former Minister of Justice and one of the most honored members of the lawyers’ community in Kosovo.”</i></p> <p>ET comment: ET appreciates additional information, has been changed to law and changed to teaching seven courses in the law programme.</p>				
Rafet Haxhaj,	Mr.Sc. (PhD) c)	PT	Law	Teaches two courses History of state and law I+II
<p>CT comment: <i>“Dr. Rafet Haxhaj (recently completed PhD studies, while in the report is referred as PhD.Candidate) is among the most highly evaluated first instance and appellate court judges in Kosovo who has an excellent experience in different areas of law relevant to law practitioners.”</i></p> <p>ET comment: Haxhaj is listed as law expert in the draft report, based on the additional information the title is changed from PhD candidate to PhD.</p>				
Refki Morina,	Mr.Sc. (PhD) c)	PT	Social Science Changed to Law	One course, Organized crime
<p>CT comment: <i>“Mrs. Refki MORINA is a very well known professional in area of law in general and especially administrative sciences, but with a significant experience in teaching different criminal law subjects.”</i></p>				

ET comment: ET appreciates additional information and changed social science to law.				
Fatime Goga,	Mr.Sc. (PhD c)	PT	Social Science	Course Cultural and religious diversity
Behar Selimi,	Mr.Sc.	PT	Law	One course Theory and basics of law
Shefqet Beqaj,	MA	PT	Social Science Changed to Law	Two obligatory Course, Criminology and Criminalistics
CD Comment: <i>“Shefqet Beqaj, PhD. Candidate at University of Sarajevo has a distinguished professional experience on criminological discipline as well as in the area of security etc”</i>				
ET comment: ET appreciates additional information and changed from social science to law.				

Only two law professors and both of them, Prof. Dr. Ejup Sahiti and Prof. Dr. Riza Smaka, are not eligible for a full time position, because of the age limitation in the Kosovo Law regulation. Two PhD graduates cover constitutional and administrative law (Dr. Jordan Daci) and private law (Dr. Blerton Sinani), both of them have a critical teaching load, which offers almost no possibilities for research and additional activities. The last full time lecturer with law background is Fatlum Mjeku, who has not finished his PhD studies and teaches up to 8 courses, which is much too high.

CD comment: *“You have expressed your concerns about two PhD graduates cover constitutional and administrative law (Dr. Jordan Daci) and private law (Dr. Blerton Sinani), both of them have a critical teaching load, which offers almost no possibilities for research and additional activities. The last full time lecturer with law background is Fatlum Mjeku, who has not finished his PhD studies and teaches up to 8 courses, which is much too high. In order to have a clear evaluation of these three staff members, we would like to share with you the fact that based on the courses distribution throughout the semesters, a relatively small number of students and the frequency of courses, we believe that the load for Prof. Asoc. Jordan DACI and Dr. Blerton SINANI is not excessive and does comply with our national standards. Since by law our institution is obliged to cover 50 % of courses with full time staff, and if we make the math, than the average number of courses to be covered by full time staff are around 5. Nevertheless, as you can see in the evaluation report, section research and publication Prof. Asoc. Dr. Jordan DACI and Dr. Blerton SINANI have an extensive list of international and domestic publications and have participated in many domestic and international scientific events. Thus, your statement about the lack of possibilities for research and additional activities is not well grounded.”*

ET comment: Sinani, Mjeku and Daci are great law experts and the ET didn't want to dispute the quality of these colleagues. The teaching load critic is more related as staff development problem and is not the core problem. A law faculty for a 4 year general law bachelor programme needs more and broader law teaching team.

The social science staff members have great experience in their respective fields and deliver important input, but could not be counted with the same weight in a general law programme. Altogether the minimum staff requirements of KAA are not covered. The ET recommends at least two full time law lecturers for each specialisation, with the respective personal specialisation – one experienced PhD graduate with a minimum of 4 years' experience after finishing PhD studies, second PhD graduated with less experience and/or PhD candidate.

An appropriate faculty is one of the major elements for a positive evaluation; the inconsistency between course table (p. 428-433) and lecturer list (p. 874-875) needs to be solved before starting the accreditation process. Nevertheless, even a consistent programme list would not solve the main problem of not appropriate profiles for a general law programme. The programme lecturer group needs to be strengthened, needs an accurate management and development plan. Currently these main pillars need to be essentially improved.

CD comment: *“Therefore, we would kindly ask you to review this part of the report since we do believe that we duly cover all the legal criteria regarding the composition of academic staff.”*

ET comment: The provided additional information and comments about the faculty is incorporated in the table. The additional information was mainly about part time lecturers and leads to no changes about the overall law team evaluation. The existing law team may fulfil legal criteria but it does not fulfil quality criteria for a four year general law bachelor programme!

The current academic staff situation is not appropriate for teaching a four year general bachelor law programme.

Recommendations:

- The ET strongly recommends building up personal capacity; therefore a strong campus based core team is needed; at least one law professor or very well experienced PhD graduate for two specialisations: Civil Law and Penal Law.
- The ET strongly recommends to develop a staff development plan and to communicate clear goals and development stages for the staff members.
- Develop a sustainable staff development strategy. Therefore try to build up cooperation with international universities to enable PhD studies for staff development.
- Create a strong team, which works permanently on the premises. This team of young researchers could coordinate the regular and part-time staff members and build up research focus areas.

5.3 Research and International Co-operation

Is the teaching staff involved in research activities inside or outside the institution, and do these research activities feed back into teaching/course contents?

The SER offers almost no information about research activities. During the SV no further evidence for group research activities was found. A research strategy does not exist. The representatives referred to their individual track record, which is important, but without a clear strategy and group research not appropriate.

Is the extent and the quality of international cooperation in research and teaching adequate?

International cooperation is weak, research partners are listed in the SER, but not a single activity has been mentioned during the SV.

Are students involved in research and cooperation projects?

Students are involved, which is mentioned in the SER and in was also mentioned during the SV from faculty members.

Recommendations:

- The ET strongly recommends restarting research and international cooperation activities. Qualification agreements with clear goals for every full-time faculty member need to be established. The current situation is not appropriate.
- The ET recommends organizing a workshop with the goal to establish a research strategy and focus for the law faculty.

5.4 Final Recommendation

The Bachelor programme “General Law” does not meet the requirements at a minimum level. It is not recommended for re-accreditation. In particular the law faculty is not appropriate and furthermore key academic concepts and measures like an overarching didactic concept, a staff development plan or a research plan are missing, incomplete or erroneous.