



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

DARDANIA COLLEGE

Business Administration and Economics Program - BA

TYPE OF EVALUATION: RE-ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE	OF CONTENTS	2
1. INT	TRODUCTION	3
1.1.	Context	3
1.2.	Site visit schedule	4
1.3.	A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	6
2. PR	OGRAM EVALUATION	7
2.1.	Mission, objectives and administration	7
2.2.	Quality management	17
2.3.	Academic staff	26
2.4.	Educational process content	29
2.5.	Students	33
2.6.	Research	39
2.7.	Infrastructure and resources	44
3. OV	ERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	49
4. AP	PENDICES (if available) Error! Bookmark	not defined.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 21st of May, 2019

Expert Team (ET) members:

• Istileulova Yelena, PhD, Fulbright Scholar

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

Arianit Krasniqi, the Coordinator from KAA

Sources of information for the Report:

- Self-evaluation Report (SER) as of 18.02.2019, Prishtinë, including self-evaluation of Business Administration and Economics (BA) program (4.6)
- National Qualifications Framework
- KAA's Formal Policies, guidelines and regulations
- Course Catalogue and Course Syllabuses Business Administration and Economics
- Academic Staff Development Plan
- Model of Student Workload
- Research Activities: Academic Staff Research Report 2012-2019
- Staff CVs (Full time, Part time, Visiting Professors)
- Annex (Statute College Dardania; etc.)
- Requested documents:

List of lecturers, Business Administration & Economics (BA)

List of full-time professors, who are involved in the ongoing research/business projects/consulting activities/visits according to Collaboration Agreements

List of Conferences visited (2016-2019) with correspondent publications

Students' enrolment for Business Administration & Economics for BA; their completion rate; students/teacher ratios for BA

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- Accreditation Manual, July, 2018; Standards & indicators for external quality assurance
- Triangulation criteria;
- Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impacts, Sustainability; Previous ET programs' evaluation; Institutional ET's evaluation 2019





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.2 Site visit schedule

2. Site Visit Program

20 May

19.45 20.00	Meeting at the Reception of the Hotel Working dinner
	<u>21 May</u>
08.40	Meeting at the reception of the hotel
09.00 – 10.30 allowed, the meeting is	Meeting with the management of the institution (no slide presentation is intended as a free discussion)
10.40 – 11.50	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative services
12.00 – 13.00	Meeting with the heads of study programs
13.00 – 13.50	Lunch break
13.50 – 14.50	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure
14.50 – 15.40	Meeting with teaching staff
15.50 – 16.40	Meeting with students
16.50 – 17.40	Meeting with graduates
17.50 – 18.40	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
18.45 – 19.00	Internal meeting – Expert Team and KAA
19.00 – 19.15	Closing meeting with the management of the institution

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

This site visit schedule is provided below:

Nr.	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs		
1	Institutional Re- accreditation	Melita Kovacevic Milan Pol Student Expert (TBA)			
2	Applied Psychology and Managerial Studies/BA	Melita Kovacevic	1. Dritan Ceka	2. Mariela Lazi	3. Mentor Agani, 4. Ferit Hysa
3	Business Administration and Economics/BA	Yelena Istileulova	1. Rilind Ademi	2. Naser Shabani	3. Edlir Orhani 4. Bilall Kasami
4	Busniness Administration and Economics/MA	Yelena Istileulova	1. Amir Imeri	2. Bekim Stafai	
5	Political Science and Public Administration/BA	Vlatko Crvtila	1. Njomza Krasniqi	2. Muazam Halili	3. Llokman Mirtezani
6	Public Administration/MA	Vlatko Crvtila	1. Dashmir Idrizi	2. Zamir Bregas	
7	Social Care and Walfare/BA	Milan Pol	1. Ervin Muco	2. Plarent Anamali	3. Rezak Jakupi
8	English Language and American Studies /BA	Andrew Goodspeed	1. Jusuf Mustafai	2. Mejreme Ymeri	3. Ismail Aliu, 4. Ismail Kamberi





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.3 A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The Private Institution of Higher Education started its activities as University, and now it functions under the name "DARDANIA" College (DC). The name "Dardania" designates a territory of the Illyrian tribe named "Dardans," who, according to archaeological studies, were distinguished with a high level of economic, social and cultural development. The DC is a Private Higher Education institution (HEI) established in 2004 with a goal to provide quality education for younger generations to contribute to the development of Kosovo society. The College offers a range of programs aimed at equipping students with knowledge, skills to prepare the professionals, among them is the Business Administration and Economics Program (Bachelor), BA. One of the goals of this program is to provide students with theoretical, analytical and practical work experience. It is designed in 6 semesters and offers three-year studies with the possibility of profiling into specializations that are demanded in the labour market. The purpose of specializations is to deepen knowledge in the most important areas of modern economy: finances, accounting, information technology, tourism and management. By studying this program, students will be able to be fully acquainted with business principles and economics. This program was licensed by MEST, and subsequently accredited by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency. DC constantly improve the program according to the development of the society, in compliance with labor market requirements, and considering the recommendations of the International Experts Team. To offer an attractive program comparable to EHEA and beyond, the economic studies program was revised and transformed into BA Business Administration and Economics According to Self-Evaluation Report (SER), on 07.11.2016, KAA has made the decision with protocol number 1249/16 to re-accredit the following study program of Business Administration and **Economics** (BA) for the three-year period. Business Administration and Economics (BA) program, which is under current evaluation, submitted for re-accreditation, representing the efforts of DC and program staff to enhance and enrich the program based on the internal evaluation, as well as the recommendations and suggestions of the External Experts Team.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

Comments: The present ET requested the previous evaluation, that was kindly provided by DC after the first draft of this Final report, in the 3rd decade of June, 2019. The previous evaluation was provided for the Business Administration and Economics, - BA and MA, Political Science and Public Administration, BA, Law, LLB. The previous experts' team noted that the SER (at that time) did not contain a general chapter on the mission and future development prospects of Dardania College. It is written that "Partly, this is replaced by brief remarks on the rationale of individual programs under the respective program headings [and will thus be dealt with in situ there]. The experts also noted that DC had received institutional reaccreditation in the summer of 2013 until September 2018. This "dispenses them" (experts) "from discussing a number of constitutional, institutional, financial, quality assessment, research, and staffing questions typically associated with an institutional reaccreditation demand". The present ET prepared the below comments without being briefed on this situation, but did notice the very problematic issues on mission (listed above), requesting the evaluation of the previous ET. The comments below are the same as in the previous 1st version/draft of the Final report with some additions (with the inclusion of answers from DC to this initial report) to reflect the evolution of this assessment. The analysis of the mission statements of program (there are four (!) different missions) is provided below in line with 10 objectives (3 - changed as well). The institutional mission statement (2 different versions of the missions) and ten (10) objectives (SER, p. 16) are not perceived quite well. The comments on the institutional mission statement is included due to the requested comparative analysis of program vs. institution), and 10 institutional objectives are formulated not in the present, but in the future tense (therefore, making DC free from the present responsibilities (in fact, from the year of 2013, up to the present), and the only question is then to be raised: "when they will be implemented?").

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The evaluation of mission (Standard 1.1) had been the most challenging one during this present assignment due to 4 (four) discovered missions (almost equally challenging for the issue of personnel for MA program linked to the procedures for the "<u>obedient personnel and staff</u>"). All missions are different from each other at the level of BA program: in its initial (1) SER (with 2 different missions for BA), (2) website (3rd mission), and (3) the comments to the first draft of this report (4th mission). The official recommendations of KAA is that ET cannot consider any new versions or additions submitted after the initial SER. As the matter of fact, the ET also appreciated a lot the efforts initiated by the BA program, and decided to





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

include some of the related comments here to reflect the fair evolution of this assessment, but bearing in mind the KAA recommendations. The final version of the mission statement (the 4th mission) is the following:

"to prepare students with intellectual capacities for leadership career, practical management skills, **research** and knowledge about systems and economic policies to cope with the challenges of a free market economy."

- 1). This version has been modified with the new extension for "research" direction. *Comments:* The expert understands that the new mission is formulated under the load of the standards provided, but this requirement suits well for the institution level, and not for the program one. This mission could be understood with the double meaning: to prepare students for research (so they can do and practice it at the later stage during MA program, in this case it is fine) or prepare students for research to do it during BA. The second version might be justified for MA, but not for BA students at the time being. The ET do not think that this second version of the mission is appropriately justified in terms of relevant resources (from the library and online resources up to the relevant provision of courses on research), and the weak preparation of BA students in their research development. However, if there is a permanent demand from BA student for the additional elective course introduced for the "Young Potential Researchers" with the qualitative and quantitative technique (under the availability of professors who teach basics in AMOS, SPSS, SEM and other programs), this initiative should be supported then.
- 2). Some explanations from the Dardania College's BA program were accepted for consideration (related to the great pressure to prepare the SER report as well as the comments to the first draft of this report, and the views that the version in Albanian language can be slightly different from the English translation (due to some technical omissions or errors in English language). The ET accepted the new versions of objectives that were provided (3 new clarified objectives), because of the DC's technical omissions in translation.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 3). In the comments to the first draft of ET report (p. 9), BA program of Dardania College put the following statement: "As demonstrated during the meeting (on 21.05.2019), and as previously clarified, the website of Dardania College is under construction. However, the first draft of the updated version of the website is already finished and the ET may check it". The experience of the ET, however, is different - the website had been available all the time since May, 2019 up to the first decade of June, 2019; - the time prior to the site visit and during the preparation of the first draft of this report (that is why it was possible to compare all different versions of the mission statements). The expert also requested all members of the ET group to clarify the situation on the website status on the date of the site visit (21.05.2019) to make sure that the ET for Business Economics and Administration program, BA and MA, probably, miss something important. However, the ET got the answer from the peers that there was no any message that the website was under construction at the time of the site visit. Indeed, all the time, the ET was working on the website on a daily basis (till the 1st decade of June). In contrary, now, at the time being (during the 3rd decade of June), this website is not available: all the attempts to find website of Dardania College shows: "This site has been temporarily disabled, please try again later". Therefore, it is not publicly available, therefore, adjusting the standard 1.4 accordingly (in the first criteria).
- 4). As the ET mentioned above, the ET has listed the criteria of KAA together with the criteria of triangulation (the ET also did the cross-check of website/previous evaluations, in line with her observation during the site visit, and etc.).
- 5). The complexities with additional version of the missions and the absence of website brought even more concerns about all inconsistencies together. However, as it has been recommended, the ET decided to follow the previous versions of the missions that were provided earlier in the officially prepared document the SER.

Thus, in addition to the above comments on the mission statement, the ET sticks to the analysis of the mission statement provided in the first draft of this report for the Standard 1.1:





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

According to the SER (p. 259), the (initial) mission of Business Administration and Economics Bachelor Degree Program at Dardania College considered here is the following one:

to prepare students *with skills* and intellectual capacities for leadership career and practical *management skills* to cope with the challenges of a free market economy by having knowledge about systems and economic policies.

The *comment* related to a *minor weakness* is that within one sentence there is a repetition of the word "skills ("with skills"/ "management skills"). In the case of removing this tautology, it would be the a slightly improved mission statement:

to prepare students with practical management skills, intellectual capacities for leadership career and knowledge about systems and economic policies to cope with the challenges of a free market economy.

The SER makes conclusion, that the mission of the Business Administration and Economics Program at the Bachelor level is compatible with the Dardania College mission, and the program offers a harmonized subject structure and discipline (*comment*: should be *disciplines*). However, in terms of compliance and compatibility of study program mission (in SER) with the overall mission statement of the institution (presented in SER, p. 15), the ET makes the following comments:

First, the program mission statement with its focus on management skills, intellectual capacities, leadership, knowledge about systems versus institutional mission statement have in common only the parts related to the professional advancement, practical trainings of the cadre and educational accomplishments. The other parts - on teaching and research, the service of community or application of its research and contribution to development of Kosovar society are left uncovered, or they might be assumed implicitly.

Second, Despite the mission includes 3 main pillars: (1) teaching, (2) research, and (3) community service, the perception of *institutional* mission statement itself is quite





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

problematic. This statement itself is viewed as a very broad one, it does not meet the key principle of the mission statement to be brief, concise and clear:

"Dardania" College provides qualitative education for professional advancement and practical training of the cadre in human and applied sciences and arts. "Dardania" College is responsible to develop through <u>teaching</u> and <u>research</u> the cadre capable to contribute to sustainable and creative development <u>in the service of community</u>. It will create competent cadre to realize the above mentioned requirements in the context of the development of economic, political, social and cultural life of Kosovo.

"Dardania" College encourages multi- and inter-disciplinary studies, which bring about the enrichment of <u>knowledge of students</u>, and their training for life-long learning and education.

"Dardania" College cooperates with organizations that exercise commercial activities and it provides services in public and private sector, to government, local communities and institutions of civil society, and in this manner it promotes the <u>application of its research and educational</u> accomplishments and it contributes to the overall development of Kosovar society.

"Dardania" College will act as a part integrated in the European area of higher education through application of common standards established by Bologna Declaration, for achieving intensive cooperation with institutions of higher education in the European Union and beyond.

Third, there was another mission statement located at the website (available during May, and the first decade of June, 2019 when the first version of this report had been in preparation):

"DARDANIA College offers high quality study programs of the first, second and third cycle levels that prepare our students for responsible professional and academic careers."

This mission statement in comparison with the program mission has a common part regarding student's "professional career". At the same time, availability of two different missions of the same institution (although at two different location) posed a big question: why there are two different missions? Another question also rises: which one is updated?

The mission presented in SER, is not visible to anyone, and SER doesn't provide any information about the mission, when it was discussed and when it was introduced, who participated under its discussion. The public mission statement on the web-site and public mission in the Self-evaluation report (SER) are not identical.

Fourth, as far as the *objectives* of the Business Administration and Economics program program are concerned, according to SER, they are the following:

1. Equipping students with knowledge and skills related to business analysis and their business environment.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 2. Providing students with theoretical and empirical bases with which they will be able to provide arguments in addressing various economic issues.
- 3. Providing students with managerial and leadership skills to be able to cooperate effectively and get the best out of the team-work.
- 4. Allow students to recognize the opportunities and threats that businesses face in a continuesly-changing environment.
- 5. Recognizing students with the importance of clients for a business and diversity in the workforce.
- 6. Recognizing students with economic policies and ways of articulating them with principles that positively impact on economic well-being.
- 7. Develop students' skills to be able to evaluate quantitative and qualitative data.
- 8. Develop students' skills to argue and find solutions to various operational, tactical and strategic problems.

In view of the ET, the following objectives -4, 5, 6 were not well written, and therefore they are not well understood. It seems that the difficulties of its understanding are connected with the wrong selection of words under the technical English translation. In addition to it, objectives as the specific action try to achieve something, but in the objectives 4 and 5 these actions are not clearly present.

The later comments (after submission of this 1st draft of the report) received from BA, Dardania College on these objectives 4, 5, 6 are accepted. The objectives 4, 5, 6 are now provided in the following statements:

- Providing students with strategies regarding opportunities and threats that businesses face in a continuosly-changing environment.
- Providing students with insights that highlight the importance of a diversity workforce and a diversity of clients.
- Develop students' capabilities to argue and evaluate economic policies, including the
 ways of articulating them with principles that positively impact the economic wellbeing.

Fifth, in regard to specialisations, - which particular specialisations, how exactly they are entitled and how many of them - *four or five*, it is not clear. The SER provides 2 different versions, and website - the 3rd version. It is not explained how they are connected between





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

each other in terms of fulfilling the overall mission of its institution (although, these specialisations do not present any obvious impediments, because in general, they reflect the various aspects of market demand). Later, the explanation is provided in the comments after the 1st draft of this report: KAA recommended to omit one of the listed specialisations. KAA also proved it in its letter, however, the ET is still wondering why these changes did not result in the relevant adjustments and changes in reports, website and the SER.

Thus, there are 4 specialisations that are at the current stage (where Marketing and Entrepreneurship specialisation is removed according to the recent answer of DC):

- General Specialization
- Banking, Finance, and Accounting
- Management and Informatics
- Tourism Management

Sixth, there is no any obvious involvement of stakeholders into the mission's discussion, neither from employers nor from students' sides. It is also not clear how academic staff was involved into its discussion. SER or website do not bring any evidence about it.

Seventh, despite it is written that "The strategy of the management of the institution includes the vision, the definition of the mission, and the objectives..." (SER; p. 36), vision is not provided in its SER. Moreover, in the website: http://www.kolegjidardania.com/arkiva/www.kolegjidardania.com/en/about-us/mission-and-vision.html despite there is a title "Mission and vision", it is no clear identification what exactly is related to vision.

Eighth, the SER do not include areas requested by KAA (p. 26) for Re-accreditation of bachelor programs related to the standards on mission, objectives and administration (didactic and research concept, some references related to the Qualifications of the EHEA, ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in academic and administrative activities, how program is reviewed in the light of changing circumstances.

Ninth, the recent evolution and developments recorded since the previous evaluation and the recommendation of the Expert Team in previous External Review Report, do not have any





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

comments related to the mission, objectives and vision. At the same time, SER has a very limited analysis, which is very often mixed parts, and it seems that it simply skips some parts that make a picture clearer. Therefore, it is the question whether the mission was reviewed under the requirements of KAA or it was based on the previous comments of the ET.

* (the initial 1st version of this Report requested the original full version of the previous evaluation report to understand what was the situation 3 years ago, what were the original mission statement and **objectives of the program** versus **institutional one** and whether there were any comments at that time to understand the evolution of all changes. The present SER has only short versions of the previous evaluation, but **nothing** has been mentioned there about the mission statement).

Other additional comments:

Also, in the format of SER, the way how the objectives of programs presented is not perceived as a logical one. After the word "Objectives", there is an expectation, that objectives will follow immediately. However, there are 2 statements: one is "the primary purpose", and the second sentence is just explanation what this program offers. The objectives follow only afterwards.

Therefore, the ET (expert) does not fully agree with the SWOT analysis on "Clear vision and mission" related to BA program (due to the reasons provided). In terms of other Strengths, also not all characteristics indicated in SER (p. 261) for the program's mission are relevant ("Location of the facility is in close-range with the center of the capital city", "Infrastructure of the facility and technical equipment are suitable for lectures and tutorials", "Use of information technology for teaching and communication" – related to other areas, like infrastructure). Not all characteristics in SWOT analysis under this area are related to the mission, objectives and administration and relevant (for instance, visa difficulties, use of e-mails in communication, etc). There are some unclear references towards BED funds (opportunities, SWOT) with no explanation for its abbreviation, and without any clarification about their nature (no answers have been provided after the first draft with highlighting these questions). The most important features related to the involvement of stakeholders in the





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

mission are left uncovered (although answered in the provided comments) – but they are more relevant to the institutional accreditation standards.

As far as the Standard 1.2 is concerned, on defining the intended learning outcomes, it is recognised that they are not stated explicitly, but they are implied in "Goals and Expected Results" in course syllabuses, and DC accepts that it will be continuing working on the courses 'learning outcomes and expected results.

As far as the didactic and research concepts are concerned (the Standard 1.3), they are partially present in study program, but not in all subjects. Didactic concept is not perceived as the "well-defined overarching concept" as it is defined in SWOT.

With regard to administration (Standard 1.6), BA program is administered by Dean of academic unit, who also chairs the Teaching and Research Council, and reports to the Rector about the implementation of the teaching and research process. With reference to administration issues, the policies on Academic Staff Development, the Code of Ethic and other documents are formally present (Policies of academic staff development-at the website: http://www.kolegjidardania.com/arkiva/www.kolegjidardania.com/en/about-us/academic-staff.html). At the same time, some parts at the website are seems to be not updated. For instance, Tacis program that has been changed into Erasmus+ since 2014, and therefore the question arises: when last the web-site was under the consideration and updates, and who is responsible for this content. In terms of teaching and learning (including skills), the principles of didactics are partially present in Syllabuses. "Didactic" as a concept is not present in Syllabuses, as well as the references towards more didactic tools and concepts. The study programs can be enriched with more didactic tools, like video-lecturing, Socratic method, experiments, or in terms of didactic concepts like active learning by doing, or peer instructors, formative assessment, etc.

Standard		Compliance	
	Yes	No	
Standard 1.1. the study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission		V	





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

statement of the institution		
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when		V
defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National		
Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European		
Higher Education Area.		
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and		V
research concept.		
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with		V
recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all		
staff and students		
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to	V	
ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative		
activities.		
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of	V	
responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed		
at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing		
circumstances.		

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- the mission statement should be the same uniform version in the website, in the SER being provided to the staff, students and stakeholders openly and transparently;
- make sure that the mission selected is the one, which is clear, concise and brief (avoiding tautology in the mission statement);
- revisiting the program's mission vs. the institutional mission with involvement of stakeholders into discussion of the mission statement for the common understanding;
- identify which vision is to be followed (at the institutional level), adjust objectives;
- pay more attention to the didactics concept in terms of tools and related concepts (some more recommendations on didactics are included in other sub-chapters) and identify which research level is intended for BA students;
- re-consider the content and context of web-site and put the one person being responsible for its updates;
- make sure that the context on the web-site and SER should be identical in both versions and languages (Albanian, English, etc.).





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2.2. Quality management

It should be recognised that certain efforts of DC were made to improve the program in different sphere of activities. First, it should be noted, that after the first draft of this report and the answers and clarifications provided, the standards 2.1, and 2.2 moved to the positive positions in criteria of "Quality Management". Standard 2.5 and 2.8 were assessed in a positive way, with a provided explanation and the positive institutional position. The issues of clarifications about the new curriculum and allocation of ECTS credits are positively accepted and the ET thanks the explanation provided, because it was assessed as the weak point under the SER for "The disproportionate and unbalanced allocation of ECTS credits within the subjects of study". The explanation is still not quite clear "with every course for 6 credits" (because not every course is allocated with 6 credits only – there are 5, 7 credits models as well).

The explanation for standard 2.3 ("Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects ...) provided by other parts of the institution" is not accepted due to 2 arguments: first, the permanent inconsistencies in the issues of specialisations, missions, and many others (partly explained in 2.1) and second, the position of the institutional assessment of the ET group (5.4 standard - the compliance position "No"): "Quality assurance functions throughout the institution are fully integrated into normal planning and development strategies in a defined cycle of planning, implementation, assessment and review. The quality assurance system covers the whole range of institutional activities".

According to the previous assessment, there is only summary information on the "Recent evolutions and developments recorded since the previous evaluation" with the efforts on Students who "are constantly encouraged to do their assignments and research in English" up to the issues on "expansion of research activities in local and international level" (p. 285, SER). These issues required additional clarifications, and that is why the ET requested the





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

report of the previous assessment. Finally, the "recent evolutions" missed also some important issues (provided at the beginning of Program evaluation).

The SER explains that Quality Management (QM) is mainly dedicated to the quality of work with students (through surveys) linking to the quality of teaching, research and other activities with student's participation in research and other activities. The SER also provides description that QM is based on the officially approved policy of quality assurance (QA) linked to continuous monitoring and management of quality: "The policy and procedures for quality assurance" with the orientation on the Standards and Instructions for internal QA. The ET's check started from the confirmity of various documents, website and other sources. According to the official "Quality Assurance Regulation" approved on 26.11.2012 in accordance with Article 1 and Article 4, the document should pay attention to »appropriate measures to improve the results«. Therefore, by the opinion of the ET, the attention should be paid to the issues of confirmity and consistencies in the documents in English, Albanian and other languages.

The proof of standards 2.7, 2.9 – not in place: in this case, the ET institutional assessment is taken into account, and the fact that there are inconsistencies of information (explained below, in the SER) with the absence of information on the Career center in the SER (only once briefly mentioned in the SER, p. 58). Later, the answer was received that there are 4 (four) specialisations, not 5 specialisations (due to KAA recommendations), however, the SER and website included the information that is considered below, because the SER is remaining to be the main document.

First of all, there are inconsistencies found for the specialisations of Business Administration and Economics (BA) program. In the SER (p. 257), it is written that program re-accreditation is also applied on its 5 specializations:

- Banking, Finance and Accounting
- Management and Informatics
- Marketing and Entrepreneurship
- Tourism Management

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- General

In the same SER, (but in p. 260), the reference made only to 4 listed specialisations:

- General Specialization
- Banking, Finance, and Accounting
- Management and Informatics
- Tourism Management

Simultaneously, the website¹ includes the following 5 listed specialisations, but under the different name, which is the 3^{rd} version:

- Business Administration/Management
- Banking, Finance and Accounting
- Management and Informatics
- Tourism Management
- Marketing and Entrepreneurship

Where Business Administration/Management is included (missing in the previous versions of SER, but probably meant as a general specialisation). Again, there are <u>4 listed</u> specialisations: submitted by Dardania College for the request for assessing the BA program (as of 27th of May, 2019), which contained the information for

- Business Administration and Economics
- Banking, Finance and Accounting
- Management and Informatics
- Tourism Management

Thus, there are doubts whether Dardania College's program for Business Administration and Economics, BA has 4/5 specialisations (at the time of evaluation) and how they are entitled. *Second*, there is no correspondence/conformity between the titles of programme in web-site and SER/Development Plan/Strategic Plan. This leads to some confusion – whether the program has a title "*Business administration/Management*" (website version) or "*Business Administration and Economics*" (SER version). Therefore, the quality management first should refer to the correct names/titles of Departments/Programs/Specialisations with the regular check and correspondence between the web-site – provided for the external users and

 $^{^1\,\}text{http://www.kolegjidardania.com/arkiva/www.kolegjidardania.com/en/faculties-depts/bachelor/departamenti-ekonomik.html}$





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

internal self-evaluation purposes. The web-site http://www.kolegjidardania.com/en/faculties-depts/bachelor/departamenti-ekonomik.html also demonstrates some mistakes in the written titles (example: Business adminsitration/management).

Third, within 5 different specialisations' structure for BA, there are some differences within their internal contents' structures. Business administration/management has a content of:

- Courses/learning outcomes

Marketing and Entrepreneurship and Tourism management -

- Courses (only)

Management and informatics -

- Structure, learning outcome, degree for management and informatics

Although it brings the partial evidence for learning outcomes for students (Standard 2.4), its content is not harmonised.

The positive changes are that a Quality Assurance Committee has been established with Quality Assessment Team and a Curriculum Assessment Plan, its provided new analysis. However, the Curriculum Assessment Plan is not accessible at the website during the working period of preparation for this report and now - due to not accessible website (its reconstruction).

Fourth, regarding improvement in research management. The question addressed to academic staff during the site visit: "what does "the high quality" mean for them?" was answered that the skills should be provided according to the market's needs. Academic teachers express their view that it should be all three components - teaching, research and community services that guide their activities. When it was asked about the activities of the Research Centre, the teaching staff was not quite aware about it, and couldn't answer this question. It makes think this "Centre" exists only on paper. Development Plan uses the title for it - the Centre for Research, and the SER and Strategic Plan – Centre for Scientific





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Research (according to the Regulation of the College). Strategic plan (in its SWOT) also refers to the point that this centre has "insufficient activities".

Some inconsistencies can also be seen from the document - the Strategic Plan (2019-2024, p. 34) which has a copy-paste information: *Center for Scientific Research* (2012-2015) will be managed (?) – written in the future tense. Another document - Development Plan refers to the Center for Research: "academic and scientific activities are implemented through the Center for Research; which consists of:

- 1. Center for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration
- 2. Center for Psychology and Social Welfare
- 3. Centre for English Language of the American Studies

The document entitled "Brief explanation regarding covering research types of costs" refers to the Research Centre not as a centre producing research outcome, but the centre that deals only from the administrative costs. The question whether the Research Center is the unit that covers expenses for research only, whether it includes research activities (?) has been clarified. The DC explains that the Research Centre is a centre that focuses on producing research outcome as well, and not only with administrative costs. This is proved within the document "Research Strategic Plan of Academic Staff."

Many professors came to work at Dardania college for the last 2-3 years. When they were questioned about their research conditions, they answered that they can use the research funds in the amount of 300 euro for their publications, so there was an evidence of research support (for monograph's publication, for instance). The other positive sign is a Research award of the year, a good motivational sign. On the one hand, there are signs of improvement in terms of efforts and financial support, but on the other hand, research is assessed by staff in SER as "insufficient activities", and it is therefore the concern here that require some more additional organisational efforts. The Recent evolution and development recorded since the previous evaluation (SER; p. 285) showed there are 9 comments related to the different aspects of improvement. One of them is linked to the common Research Agenda to be provided. Research agenda, is the bottom up approach, coming from the teacher/academic, and if there





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

are efforts that can be united – with clear Research agenda and some support (which is available), it should work.

Fifth, in terms of various titles, for the same departments/centers – it is another area that should be a biggest concern for quality management. Therefore, it should be the awareness campaign that link all departments and their staff together. The Quality Management staff has to be sure that the short Dictionary of its names and abbreviations in Albanian and English language is prepared for the right interpretation and the same titles of administrative structures for the purposes of further external and internal evaluation/accreditation exercises. Sixth, about the teaching academic staff (also refers to 2.3 chapter – with the cross-reference). There are the various issues of concerns. The quality of teaching depends on the teaching staff. Under the 1st draft of this report it was unclear (in terms of which legislation/or any regulations, or it is related to the academic ranks), why under the present conditions, the retired professors cannot be hired if they are willing and able to bring a "great performance"? (identified as "Threats"). The current academic staff came to work during the last 2 years, and the ET's question about "what happened to the old staff?", got the answer "that previous staff got retired". The ET thinks that the issue of continuity is paramount, and this question was again raised under this ET report, and there was other answer provided:

Dardania College might be the only private institution that still has contracts with the old academic staff. As shown in SER of the program (refer to the Academic Staff table), Dardania College intents to keep those professors as their experience benefits students, new academic staff, and the society. The issue was raised related to the legal framework in Kosovo. In the absence of academic staff and experts in certain fields of studies, and as professors who are in their retirement age (65 years old) cannot be holders of the program, the following issues were raised:

The ET very much appreciates this explanation, although some concerns are still remaining due to inconsistencies and a disturbance in the formulation of answers: that previous staff "got retired" and then – DC "still has contracts with the old academic staff".

⁻The legal framework which is not suited to Kosovo's needs and reality, especially relating to the engagement of professors that are considered as retired but who are very much willing and able to achieve great performance

⁻One of the key challenges are difficulties in hiring of new staff due to the lack or slow process of developing academic ranks in Kosovo Also, the legal factors that can be considered as legal obstacles to the engagement of qualitative professors who are retired.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Seventh, the question related to competition showed that academic staff had some difficulties to name who is the main competitor to their program from other colleges or universities, that show a low awareness about market itself.

Eight, about publications that also reflect research in its final outcome - product. There were 2 list of publications provided – one is with only 3 publications for the last 3 years (for the whole program, although 2012-2016, but included the publications prior this term, and during 2017-2019), and the other one – with the significant growth in publications for the last 3 years (submitted at the time of evaluation, with incorporated 2016-2019 list of publications). The ET recognises that the second list indeed demonstrates the good signs in the improved performance in publications, as well in publications in English (demonstrating the progress in publications, but some ethical questions were raised - the new staff was hired/the old staff was fired and whether the continuity of generation is in place). It is also equally important to publish the results of research in both languages - Albanian and English.

Ninth, in terms of QA procedures, and the KAA instructions, it should be noted, even after clarifications, that some efficiency and effectiveness for visits could always be improved in their efficiency, and the nametags for various stakeholders are to be prepared in advance. It took time for asking the representatives of Employers which sectors they are from, their names and to write their names down or asking them to write to be sure that it was spelled correctly (especially under the fact, that it was a delay with arrival of the ET due to the unpredictable longer border's control between Macedonia and Kosovo, visa issues, and the other experts' absence, because of "broken leg" just prior the site visit).

The question to academic staff (during the site visit) about assessment of teaching quality, led to their answer that basically their quality is reflected in the intended learning outcomes in Syllabuses (Notes: not all subjects are provided with the learning outcomes). QA procedures should incorporate the check in accordance with the National Qualification Framework.

Tenth, standard 2.6 has been modified with the institutional assessment of standards - 9.5, 9.10. 9.12; an the standard 2.7 regarding employment is provided in the Students' section.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The strategic plan 2019-2024 put the additional administrative load for the responsible professors for study programs for Cooperation Memorandums with International Higher Education Institutions, but the opinion of the ET, it should be the main job of someone who is responsible for the international cooperation programs in International department, and the supplementary help from the professors who may bring the useful contacts from other institutions.

Other comments.

The SWOT analysis has a very positive message that "Experienced staff provides peer support for the new staff by conducting peer observers' hours" together with "ongoing guidance, support, and feedback to the youngest staff" on implementation of courses (p. 265, SER). The ET expectation is that the SER explains each standard with all facts and examples, because it is not always clear how the things are judged from inside, and when SWOT analysis is not always logical to the outside experts.

The check of Course catalogue and Course Syllabuses indicated that Course Syllabuses do not always include learning outcomes, and the Course Catalogue provide some learning outcomes for some subjects; otherwise, the learning outcomes are missing for many subjects (more elaborated in p. 2.4 - pp. 18). As far as the **teachers' load** are concerned, there are **10** hours of lectures is the average load per teacher.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate	V	
with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of		
activity.		
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement	V	
are integrated into normal planning processes		
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of		V (p. 5.4 of
program planning and delivery, including services and resources		institutional
provided by other parts of the institution.		ET)
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality		V
issues for the overall program as well as of different components		(comment





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

	T	
within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs,		is provided
with particular attention given to <i>learning outcomes for students</i> .		for learning
1 0		outcomes)
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required	V (5.6	
standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in	institutional)	
performance.		
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students,		V (9.5,
graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made		9.10.
publicly available.		9.12)
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are		V
taken into account for <u>further development of the study program</u> .		
This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student		
workload, <u>academic success</u> <u>and employment of graduates</u> .		
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall	V	
quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three		
years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths		
and weaknesses.		
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program		V
are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.		(standard
		of the
		institution
		5.14)

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Include and use the right titles of programme in web-site and SER and other documents (Business administration/Management (web-site version) or Business Administration and Economics (SER version);
- 2. Provide and apply the correct number of specialisations (4 instead of 5 for BA program), how they are entitled correctly (English, Albanian, etc) checking their correspondence in all documents (SER, Strategic Plan, Development Plan, etc.);
- 3. Establish the conformity & correspondence check for the titles of programmes, specialisations in the documents/websites/SER into the Quality Assurance;
- 4. Include the analysis of the activities into SER for the Center for Scientific Research, (at the level of its related activities in the Center for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration);
- 5. Improve research management organisational issues linked to the procedures, paying attention to bottom up approach (in terms of research initiative and area of specialisation);





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 6. Check the subjects in the Course Catalogue and Course Syllabuses in accordance with the requirements from the National Qualification Framework provided by KAA.
- 7. Develop the short Dictionary of for the right titles and abbreviations in Albanian and English language for the purposes of further external and internal evaluation/accreditation exercises.
- 8. Put the progress made from 2016-2019, from the time of the last evaluation what were the exact steps of improvement; what exactly had been managed to implement (and what had not been managed);
- 9. Impose the responsibilities for the Cooperation agreements to the separate person/body to be institutionally responsible for the coordinated international and local cooperation activities. Professors can be responsible for bringing the contacts and helping set up the agreements, but their main responsibilities are to teach and to be involved into research activities, motivating students.

2.3 Academic staff

The ET very much appreciates the explanation about DC academic staff (explained in the previous 2.2 chapter), and assess the academic staff and its standards as substantially compliant.

However, there are some concerns that are still remaining due to the formulation of answers provided and considered here just after the first draft of this report, DC "contracts with the old academic staff" (not relevantly formulated, with the points listed earlier in this report).

Pursuant to SER, the selected representatives of academic staff, including the members of the Department of business administration, have drafted the strategy with other normative acts, defining the employment policies with the issues of academic promotion. The Terms of references for Employment Procedures for academic and non-academic staff as of 26.11.12 is a basic document that regulates the general responsibilities. There is an evidence provided for 37 members of Academic staff at the Department of business administration and economics who signed contracts with 3 and 1 year's terms. 16 members of academic staff have 3 years contract. 14 faculty members (out of 18 members of academic staff) with their PhD degree – are those who have signed the three academic year's contracts with a teaching load – 10





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

academic hours per week, and the rest - one year's contract with 6 academic hours per week. Models of both academic contracts are developed. It should be noted that 37 professors present the major part out of 57 professors, the academic staff of DC (Development plan, p. 7).

There are funds available – the Joint Services Fund to provide quality services to academic staff and students, as well as the fund for the development of academic activities (Publications, Trainings, Seminars and Workshops, Development Projects, Conferences).

As far as the SER is concerned, there are some striking differences in regard to academic staff in terms of requirements between BA and MA programs. BA provides the professional procedures for selection of teaching staff that include selection for the doctoral degree's criteria, and for assistants - Masters degree. Academic staff is selected based on the criteria by fulfilling the requirements demanded by the Committee, which is formed by the Senate. The difference is that at the level of MA - the selection of "obedient" personnel – takes place. Therefore, the code of professional academic values should be promoted equally at both programs to be sure that selection process is fair.

Involvement into consulting activities is one of the activities (included into standards), but there is no clear evidence for consulting performed by the members of academic staff. Academic staff can be interested in involvement into consulting activities based on their specialisation, research and publications. This can serve as an threefold purpose (research-project-consultig) that bring additional profit-oriented activities of the College, serve as an additional source of income for both College and academic staff, and meet the standards for accreditation in terms of the adequacy of processes the standards. These activities can be proposed to be developed under the the Centre for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration Research's umbrella. As far as the evaluation of academic staff is concerned, in addition to the students' survey, (confirmed during the site visit's discussion with





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

students), SER does not mention any peer and superiors' evaluations as well as clear examples linked to Standards 3.7 and 3.6 especially *»students in needs*« facing difficulties

Standard	Comp	liance
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position	V	
descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form		
data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as:		
name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract,		
workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research,		
etc. for the study program under evaluation.		
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements	V	
concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the		
Administrative instruction on Accreditation.		
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more	V	
than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the		
educational institution where they carry out their activity		
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full	V	
time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study		
program.		
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution)	V	
and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has		
employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the		
case of artistic/applied science institutions.		
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional		V
development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are		
facing difficulties.		
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time,	V	
include the engagement in the academic community, availability for		
consultations with students and community service.		
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least		
through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur		
on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are		V
made publicly available.		
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the	V	
teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status	V	
of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.		

Compliance level: Substantially compliant





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure the right policies under the hiring of PhD personnel and professors linked to the *excellence in teaching and research* according to the mission of DC in both BA and MA programs;
- 2. Actively involve academic staff not only into the projects, research but also consulting activities at the Centre for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration Research:
- 3. Ensure various motivation (based not only on the financial, but also non-financial methods with non-monetary rewards) from all levels from the Head of Department, who chairs the Teaching and Research Council up to each academic professional to develop and promote the research, teaching and learning projects with local and international universities based on the system of academic and research values:
- 4. Consider, develop and write some activities related to the self-evaluation of academic staff, in line with the peer and superiors' evaluations;
- 5. Academic staff recruitment should be considered carefully with the ethical aspects (and not only as a matter of standards) and the contribution brought by each individual professor on the ad hoc basis.

2.4. Educational process content

The issues on the educational process content with the focus on learning outcomes have been positively considered by DC with the 1st draft of report. The recent information is that Curriculum Assessment Plan is now provided with the new analysis, and there is a communication between academic staff and QA about recent developments in its Curriculum Assessment Plan is also positively perceived. The meeting with students during the site visit program (SVP) shows that from their opinions, the process of learning is adequate, and they are quite enthusiastic about it. Students that have been present at the meeting reflected a diversity (in terms of gender, out of 3 students, 1 – female from MA, and 2 – BA students, where 1 of them is the owner of the company/employer and student at the same time).

In terms of Quality assurance, Students confirm that they participate in assessment of teaching not only through the survey, but also based on their written feedback or comments





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

about the lectures: they have a chance to provide their comments about the lecture in the written form and put them into specially organised box.

First, the Bachelor Programme Business Administration and Economics meets the requirements in terms of its three-year program with six semesters, the areas of study related to management and economics. There are four - 4 (and not five-5 – that are clarified under the 1st draft of this report) specialisations presented in SER with a well-designed program that offers the interesting and compulsory courses covering the needs of Kosovo economy. All 4 listed specialisations with the courses (Business Administration and Economics; Banking, Finance, and Accounting; Management and Informatics, Tourism Management) meet the minimum requirements of *180 ECTS credits* awarding a Bachelor's degree according to the NQF 1st cycle with the range of 180-240 ECTS credits.

Second, it should be positively assessed that the course catalogue provides the richness and variety of different Economics and Management subjects for teaching and elective courses, in total – 60 subjects.

Third, SER doesn't reflect the issues of educational process content related to the issues like learning outcomes that should be specified in categories of knowledge, skills and competence leading to the qualification with its specifications. The Course Catalogue reflects some learning outcomes and skills in subjects (and in Annexes). The related Course Syllabuses check show that the "learning outcomes" are directly written and indicated not for all, but for 7 subjects.

Fourth, list of competences and qualifications are missing in the Course Catalogue and Course Syllabuses, and learning outcomes are not present in all subjects and Annexes in Catalogue. Quality of teaching and learning is not mentioned.

The check of content's Course Catalogues found some weaknesses linked to:

- use of new, advanced/information technologies (without elaboration, which of them)
- different new forms of learning (also provided without specifics)

SER provides a relatively fair self-evaluation to the educational process content. The weakness in SER that is related to the teaching process refers to the poor preparation of students during their secondary education, in rural areas. It is believed, that the entrance criteria can be improved if some additional test like brief essay are introduced. The question is referred to the values and to the "portrait" of the student that Dardania College wants to see.

According to processes within the Department, special attention should be paid for improving students' quality work. The College Quality Assurance Committee (KSC) organises surveys, conversations and in cooperation with staff and explores the possibilities of improving the





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

quality of teaching, research and other activities that have an impact on the quality of the department's work.

Fifth, the area of cooperation agreements (despite evaluated positively – because it is also include the institutional level) is remaining to be the issue of concerns. It seems that it is only 2 valid agreements that exist by this date (according to SER). Therefore, the international department unit or the person should be involved into the issues of cooperation.

Finally, the possibilities for some interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary aspects in Curriculum might be considered as well – depending on the subject of teaching.

The present institutional standards of accreditation of ET peers have also been taken into consideration under the evaluation with the cross-checking on institutional issues, such as standard 11.3 – positively assessed (cooperation agreements). Other institutional general considerations are taken into account (these examples are not positively assessed at the compliance level of institution: standard 6.2 (effective system for ensuring high standards of learning and teaching), 6.3 (institution monitors quality indicators), 6.5 (student-centred and stimulate students' motivation, and engagement in the learning process), 6.6. effectiveness of programs, 6.8 (learning methods), 6.9 (employer surveys)) and Standard 4.7 (no compliance):

"The institution is publishing clear, accurate, objective, relevant, accessible and detailed information regarding its academic staff, its research and academic activities, the programmes it offers, the <u>number of students</u> enrolled, the intended learning outcomes of its programmes, the qualifications they award, the teaching, learning and assessment procedures used, the pass rates and the learning opportunities available to its students, graduate employment information, scholarship opportunities, as well as tuition and administrative fees".

Company	ance
Yes	No
V	
V	
	V





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the		V
general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the		
study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least		
7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical	In	V
syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's	general	(learning
objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution	V	outcome)
of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment		·
system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/		
syllabuses of each subject/module should be attached only in electronic		
form to the self-assessment report for the study program under		
evaluation.		
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian,	Not	
actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and	related	
academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when		
students begin their studies. This may be done through language training		
prior to the commencement of the program		
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which		V
each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes.		
Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the		
perspective of their relevance to the students' development.		
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of		V
learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of		
teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are		
followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students		
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and	V	
objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.		
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for		***
verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work		V
required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in		
courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study		
programs at highly regarded institutions.		
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to	V	
dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are	•	
inadequate or inconsistently assessed.		
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the		V
T South Francisco	1	,





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective		
processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the		
strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The		
practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at		
the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports;		
students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic		
staff in the study program.		
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher	V	
education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other		
documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units		

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Include the needs of the teaching staff in its additional training on different teaching methods with the organised qualification upgrading;
- 2. Include and reflect the issues of the educational process with the periodical surveys with employers in order to gain valuable feedback and to improve education of students:
- 3. Student's engagement in study in the part related to "Contacts with the teacher/consultants;
- 4. Ensure the "learning outcomes" are written down for each subject in Syllabuses, Course Catalogue;
- 5. Qualifications, competences and learning outcomes are to be added into each subject according to the NQF;
- 6. Consideration of the entrance criteria for this program that should be raised through more thoroughly examination;
- 7. Consider the possibility to include some interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary aspects in Curriculum that refers to the overall content, taught in a course;
- 8. Develop more actively the relations with other institutions, through cooperation agreements on the various areas from research up to exchange of students and professors;
- 9. Enclose the Curriculum Assessment Plan (CAP) in the website with the planning activities and the planning period and ensure a communication between academic staff and QA about its recent analysis and developments in CAP.

2.5 Students





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

This section on "Students" is the shortest one in the SER, and much information is recommended to be included, since the students are the main source of income. The requested information by the present ET on the high dropout number and the low number of graduates have been received with the explanation that these "figures are the result of the emigration" flows, and the temporary employment outside of Kosovo. However, the standards do not incorporate the situation about employment for students, the only criteria that deals with this issue partially is a quality management (2.7 standard in Quality management). The information about "disabled students" or with special needs and their conditions is not elaborated in the SER.

The answer was also provided on the reason why there was no information regarding the enrolment for 2018-2019, and it has been explained that "the KAA did not accept the old academic staff as regular staff", and the efforts therefore was refocusing on recruiting a new staff. Therefore, it is understood, that if it is not regular staff, it means (according to standard 3.10) that the contracts are prepared on the part-time basis. The ET in this case consulted to the opinion of the previous ET (with the provided document after its request), and the evaluation report, 2016 (p. 8) cites it: "...publications of individual staff members – with the impact of the senior staff members much more in prominence than that of the junior members of staff. The experts would therefore welcome some additional College support for international activities especially of the junior members of staff to close this gap in a 1:1 direction."

The ET understands the concerns, and indeed, this information provides the evidence that the senior staff showed much better results. The ET believes that the college has its freedom and its right how to keep their best professors in its own interests (whatever the forms of the contracts are), because there are no "one advice for all", and ad hoc arrangements are different from person to person.

First, from the challenges listed in SER, the first one is linked to the employment opportunities. There is a limited information about the work and activities of the career centre connected with these activities. Despite there is no direct standard or requirement on these





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

services (except QM section related to employment), and the SER mentions it only once in its report. The ET was wondering how DC deals with the main challenge of the youth employment/unemployment, and what are the activities of this center? The SER does not make reference about it, but the requested positive answer was received after this first draft of Report:

"Even though there are challenges for students to be employed, career centre is focused to deliver the information to students regarding open job positions in the market, especially the job positions of those institutions with whom Dardania College has Cooperation Memorandums. There are many cases where students' have finished their internship in a specific job position, and then they are hired to continue working with a regular contract".

Employers also confirmed that the facts about the internships available.

Second, the explanation on the low completion rate is missing in the SER's SWOT analysis. The number of graduated BA students were 13, 14, 14 (respectively in 2015-16, 2016-17, and 2017-18). At the same time, there is no explanation how projections are planned for 2019-2020 with the number of 160 students per academic year (especially if there were no enrolment in 2018-2019).

Third, some analysis of future projection on students with the competitors analysis will be helpful for Dardania College to answer the most important questions "why and how" to understand better the dynamics and the sources of its sustainability. The total number of students (2015-2018 generations) is 212 for BA with current ratio acceptable and normal ratio - 13 students per professor. Despite the provision of passing rate that fluctuates between 67% and 71%, it is the number of graduates of BA program during the last years that is quite low (13, 13, 14) with the high number of drop outs (8, 7, 9) for 2015-16, 2016-17, 2017-18, and therefore, the more deeper and thorough analysis is required to SWOT. The provided explanation in the SER is a weak students, and therefore, the question about the criteria for admission and how these criteria are defined is to be raised.

Fourth, positive feature confirmed during the visit, as well as SER, that there are all learning conditions in the College created for students with different schedules: from flexible ones (till





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

late evening) with supplementary classes and services for alumni. The Joint Services Fund set up to provide quality services for student staff, and their academic activities (in terms of Publications, Trainings, Seminars and Workshops, Development Projects, Conferences).

Fifth, although learning outcomes are not always present, and missing through many subjects of Syllabuses and Course Catalogue, they are partly provided in the general form only in the Student workload spreadsheet (corresponding to student's learning outcome). The separate document "Model of the students workload activities" with ECTS credits with structure from lectures up to research activities – is the attempt to cover this missing evidence in the teachers' syllabuses.

Sixth, it is difficult to assess the general extent of interactive process between students and professors due to the fact that students are reluctant expressing their opinion about quality evaluation of academic staff, the recognition of the fact that the current students are not familiar with quality management procedures (SER), and despite the "interactive" process is assumed and written (in Syllabus), it is difficult to make judgement about efficiency of the interactive process, and the listed and detailed interactive didactic methods from the side of teachers are not specifically provided in the Curriculum for subjects. Formally, taking into consideration the variety of classes and the survey evaluation with the possibilities to write their opinion for available boxes (as students shared during discussion with ET), with DMS are acceptable. According to SER, the evaluation results are published at the DMS system (online software of Dardania College, accessible through http://dms.kolegjidardania.com/with "Përdoruesi/Fjalëkalimi", for the internal users only). Pattern of the evaluation results from the DMS system into SER, with the main elements of evaluation for analysis could be useful for analysis (Standard 5.3). There are no data, how promptly the process is organised due to the individual level of each professors.

Seventh, SWOT analysis in SER delivers the information that there is a continuous support for students with employment information and opportunities for scholarship and practice.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

However, it is recognised that internship remains to be problematic, despite of existing career services with the threat and challenges in the employment of graduates in local labor market; Eighth, in terms of admission, the online application form with the enrollment criteria are: http://www.kolegjidardania.com/arkiva/www.kolegjidardania.com/en/apply/criteria-forenrollment.html, where Matura test and Diploma/certificates are the main entrance criteria. Ninth, there is no plagiarism check-up and therefore, there are no formal procedures in the standard 5.8, and therefore it can be appeal only to the Ethic Code. At the same time, these tools are available for free. The system should be only selected and introduced (one of the https://smallseotools.com/plagiarism-checker/). The examples: answer this recommendation was provided that currently, there is no plagiarism software/checker available in Albanian language, and DC jointly with the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology will analyse options to develop anti-plagiarism software. This is a positive moment, and the timeframe should be defined for this action.

Standard		Compliance	
	Yes	No	
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students	V		
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	V		
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.		V	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.		V	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	V		
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.		V	





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and		
for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.		
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work		V
submitted by students is original.		
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available,		v
promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the		
right to academic appeals.		
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions,	V	
faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal		
documents.		
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for	V	
consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided		
to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.		

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Include more elaborated analysis with the description of "portrait" of the "average statistical student" of Darania college, why and how students are coming to Dardania College, with their needs' analysis, including information about "disabled students" or with special needs and their conditions;
- 2. The analysis of these reasons in SER will be helpful for Dardania College to understand the dynamics of its development and the sources of its sustainability, including the analysis on dropouts;
- 3. Insert the pattern of the evaluation results from the DMS system into SER, with the main elements of evaluation for analysis;
- 4. Elaborate more benefits provided by the Career center, in terms of its assistance in organising employment for the BA levels;
- 5. Ensure active involvement of students into the joint research activities and publications with professors;
- 6. Use the Center for Economic and Political Science and Public Administration research as a forum for young leaders in the fields of economics;
- 7. (Despite the previous evaluation is given as extracts in "Recent evolution and development recorded since the previous evaluation", the whole report would be useful to understand the recommendations and the steps made towards the progress up to 2019).





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2.6 Research

The ET considered that more evidence and positive results are brought towards research activities with the updated list of publications and more explanation, supporting KPIs 6.1-6.5. There are also some more evidence brought that "DC continuously provides support, including financial means, to the academic staff so they have the freedom and motivation to pursue their goals in research and publications. Moreover, Dardania College will continue to be committed in providing favourable conditions in all work-related aspects".

At the same time, the biggest concerns are now expressed about the previous recommendations of the ET in 2016, that have not been taken into consideration at all. The ET in fact brought the same recommendations under the 1st draft of this report. When the ET requested the previous evaluation of 2016, it was discovered that there were the same recommendations about library resources made that the traditional library services have to be augmented by free access to electronic libraries. Other concerns are connected with the (1) more evidence about the involvement of BA students into research activities (positively assessed based on the limited discussion with professors and students), but with no concrete examples (and therefore some left doubts); (2) some inconsistencies about the updated research publications (two different list of publications), and (3) the clear activities of Research Center.

According to Development plan, SER 2019 and other sources, the academic staff of the Business Administration and Economics is included in the research activities of the Centre for Economic, Political Science and Public Administration Research (Mentor Agani and Sabahudin Komoni), governed by Research Council, the main body. The work of this Research Centre (that includes activities of 3 units or centres) is supported by the administration of College with the regulation and provision of its cost. However, during the site visit the teaching staff was not quite aware about its activities (21.06.2019). The positive motivational features that have been observed during the meeting with Academic members were the opinions that (1) there is a better working atmosphere in Dardania College compared to other HEIs; (2) many members of staff are motivated to apply for international conferences and to publish their papers in the international and some local journals.

List of lecturers has been provided for those members of the Faculty who received financial support.

With the reference to SER, (a) the lack of government funding for scientific research and (b) the deficit of financial resources for research projects remain the key problems at the levels





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

of Faculty and College. The academic Staff development plan for 2019-2024 year confirms that Dardania College ensures and continuously invests in the quality of academic staff in terms of teaching and scientific research as two main pillars. The development and strategic plans include the budget with projections for money allocation in publications, training, workshops, seminars, development projects, cooperation and conferences as well as the coverage for research expenditures. It is however, not clear, which expenditures are supposed to be covered for "the DARDANIA magazine" and what is the status of this journal. Best researchers are motivated to get the award "Research of the year".

Under the request of *additional information*, *dilemma* has been raised with the provision of 2 lists of publications at the Faculty level – first, Report for 2012-2016 (but included some fresh publications till 2018/2019), and the second – for 2016-2019.

The **first** source of information, - the Research Report (in fact, despite 2012-2016, reflected the publications for the last 3 years as well - 2012-2019), provided the following information:

- Publications in local journals 6
- Publication of books -28 (but 13 publications are deducted due to the earlier year of publications prior 2012) = 15
- Local conferences -8 (minus 1 conference, held in 2011) = 7
- Participation in seminars -52 (minus 13, published earlier 2012 year) = 39
- Participation in local/international projects –13 (from 2012) could be considered out of 25
- Managerial and administrative jobs 18 (from 2012) activities were considered out of 25

Thus, the final list presented 21 publications/related activities with the following structure:

- Publications in local journals 6
- Publications of books (university, monographs, chapters) 15
- Participation in the local conferences 39
- Participation in local/international projects 13
- managerial and administrative jobs 18 activities

The **second** source with the updated List of lecturers with research activities for 2016-2019 indicated that during the last 3 years the number of publications reached - **60** (including those, in process) with related activities and the following structure:

- International papers 14 and 3 (in process)
- Publications in local journals 15 and 3 (in process)
- Publications of books (university, monographs, chapters) 9
- International Conferences' Proceedings 11 and 2 (in process)
- Participation in local conferences 3

Other activities are included like: Participation in projects -10 (where 1 – international) with the managerial and administrative jobs -10





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

According to Strategic Plan 2019-2024, organisation of scientific-research work is organised by a leader, the head of the Research and Promotion Program (who is responsible for Organization of work and activities within scientific research units). It is not clear whether this work has already been organised, or it is planned to be organised, because there is a clear evidence that the budget of "Dardania" College is managed by the Center for Scientific Research according to the College's regulation, but the problem is that it is written for the period 2012-2015, and then the data are provided for 2019-2024. The ET also considered positively the updated information provided for the 1st draft of this report.

Access to electronic library has been raised, and according to academic staff, it is possible to access to electronic library during the time of their physical location in Dardania College, but there is no access to the online resources remotely.

A certain dilemma is raised about the sharp boost of publications during the last 3 years from the updated list compared versus the previous list of publications. On the one hand, the discussion with academic Faculty members during the site visit revealed that the key staff basically came to work here 2-3 years ago, from 2016-2017, and the previous staff left college due to the pension's age. On the other hand, the question might touch the issue connected to the continuity of generations, as well as the provision of two sources with numbers that reveal a strike difference. The academic members have emphasised that they came to work at Dardania College because of their motivation, with "more favourable conditions", including research activities.

The previous Evaluation report (SER, p. 285) refers to the common Research Agenda, applied research projects and analytic academic approach with the management capacities how it has been developed. With the reference to the second list of publications (2016/2019), - at the levels of academic staff, it is present, but it is less clear about the management capacities that bring the efforts to join the efforts at all levels.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

At the same time, the sufficient financial, resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives (standard 6.1)— the question is how institution will be allocating them, - solely out of students' income or from the other sources? It is less clear regarding the logistic and research objectives.

SER very often mentions Tempus program as one of the possible sources of funding, but it doesn't exist since 2014 being replaced by Erasmus+ program from 2014.

Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity – ET expert refer to the latest documents of the EU, where the issues of interdisciplinarity are important, and therefore, compliance should not be such a strict issue here.

Last comment is related to the SWOT analysis from SER. SWOT provides the comments that the department's academic staff has participated actively in the realization of 10 projects. Table-4 "Realization and participation in local and international projects" provides some evidence about it in 10 projects (where it is natural, that the majority of projects are done with the neighboring countries, - Macedonia, for instance), and it would be more beneficial if there were some research publications indicated to be developed based on these projects. The consultancies can be developed based on the expertise of professors and also to be incorporated into the work of the Research Center. The institutional Standards (7.1 - 7.4) also influence some elements of this assessment (6.1, 6.3 and 6.9). Despite DC gives proper respect to the Intellectual Property Policy which has been established at country level on November 30, 2011, law 04/L-065, the institutional characteristics for 7.10 are not in its correspondence.

Standard		Compliance	
	Yes	No	
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research		v	
objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary			
program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the			
institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for			
achieving the proposed research objectives.			
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and	V		
scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these			
expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.			
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as		v	
research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the			





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

		l
field of study of the program.		
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results	V	
on the same topics as their teaching activity.		
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality	v	
magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are		
presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts,		
expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the		v
country and/or abroad.		
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research	V	
publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy		
centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.		
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at	v	
least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic		
outcome/product per year for the past three years.		
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the	V	
institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.		
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching	v	
information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to		
courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in		
the field.		
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property		v
and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff		,
and students.		
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	V	
similara 0.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	· ·	
	(?)	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Awareness campaign organised about the Research Center (with its 3 activities, also Centers), and the conditions under which the academic staff can 1 be involved into this activity;
- 2. Include the Action plan for the related units of the Center for Scientific Research (as it is called in the Strategic Plan) for 2019-2024, with the roles and responsibilities of its activities (one of its 3 related units);
- 3. Research infrastructure should be improved. Invite professors with successful research publications and projects to share their view how he/she achieved a positive results and outcome;





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 4. Involve more professors into the various personal development programs (ex.: Fulbright scholarship);
- 5. Promote and involve BA students into pre-research phase at the stage of data collection through the specialisation of mentors linked to the motivation of each student, as well as MA researchers and Doctoral researchers. BA can see the integrity of this research process;
- 6. Subscription to Online library and access to this library from both home and institution should be provided for both the members of teaching staff, and students, if not possible the list of excellent free publications available from various sources;
- 7. Involve the library staff into preparation of available sources and free sources of information (from academia.edu; up to "A Selective Guide Free Online Library Resources" (elaborated in p. 2.7) with the inclusion of all sources recommended by the previous ET's staff;
- 8. Expansion of multidisciplinary research with the involvement of the members from other departments;
- 9. Stimulate professors to apply for the independent grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects; Involve successful professors in sharing their idea on their successful projects and research publications;
- 10. Include the possibilities for consultancies' services that can be developed based on the expertise of professors and also to be incorporated into the work of the Research Center that can successfully sell these activities inside and outside the market;
- 11. Include into the Development/Strategic plans the possibilities for consultancies provided by professors based on their research, projects and publications

2.7 Infrastructure and resources

The ET shared a positive opinion of teaching staff and students about the Dardania College's modern infrastructure, equipment and all facilities designed for teaching and learning located in two buildings. During the site visit's meetings with students' representatives, students confirmed that in addition to all listed facility, they enjoy the great and convenient location of college facilities in the downtown area. The location of DC is excellent, being located in the center of the city. Another positive aspect is about the study conditions: "for the students and





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

the personnel with physical disabilities, or with special needs, "Dardania" College provides appropriate conditions (p. 83, SER). However, it does not elaborate further on this topic.

Third, the ET positively assess the efforts of management about the renting conditions for BA students who travel to Pristina to study from different locations. The top management may want to include the opportunity for cooperation with existing real estate agencies that provide services related to renting of housing for students (in addition to the personnel with physical disabilities). In fact, there was a proof provided that these actions are in fact implemented – with the answers that arrived to this report. Although this issue is not directly included into standards, but it is included into SWOT analysis. The previous recommendation in the first draft of this report was related to the cooperation agreements (presumably, an International Department) with the possibilities to rent apartments for students or group of students who travel to Pristina on a regular basis in order to facilitate their study conditions. The cooperation agreement with the Real Estate Agencies that might provide the low-cost apartment for two or more students to live together is recommended (but seems to be already in existence – with the answer that one agreement is signed). It is also can promote the image of Dardania College of being socially responsible in its business

The access to electronic Library is a required source of information by all users – the academic staff, students, and other categories of personnel. At the same time, the local students need to have the access to the sources in Albanian language, while the teaching staff – to English language sources, linked to research and publications.

The provided agreements with libraries showed that there are only 50% of them that are valid at this moment (other agreements are expired).

The ET recommends Freely available sources for research with an access to the free sources like Google Scholar, www.academia.edu, as well as https://www.researchgate.net/; and a great source of information — General A Selective Guide to Free Online Library Resources, for Alumni and Members of the Public https://guides.lib.berkeley.edu/FreeResources and other freely available resources for research. After the provision of the requested data on the





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

previous evaluation (with the first draft of this report), some more information is included below:

The biggest concern is now expressed about the fact that (1) the previous opinions of the ET were not taken into consideration by DC; (2) the important information about the recommendation on the augmented resources that should be used with a free access was not included in the SER, and (3) the provided SWOT in the SER about the threat: "a challenge remains in accessing the latest research databases in various online databases". Is it really a threat if the provided resources are the recommended ones, that are provided for free with a free access to publications that are tested and used by other universities?

The Background: The ET in 2016 recommended that the traditional library services have to be augmented (and in the long run possibly be replaced) by free access to electronic libraries, downloadable publications on the websites of the larger international research institutes, - the same recommendation that was provided by the present ET in the previous version of this report and at the present one. The request related to the previous evaluation discovered that the additional free resources were recommended from Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, Stiftung Wissenschaft und Politik, European Union Institute for Security Studies, data bases, publishing firms offering electronic versions of their product, the material collections from SSRN (Social Science Research network - www.ssrn.com), CIAO (Columbia International Affairs Online (https://cup.columbia.edu/reference/ciao), JURIS (https://www.juris.de/jportal/index.jsp) or openJur (https://openjur.de). The question is therefore arisen whether 2016 recommendations were distributed to the past and present staff, (who also distribute this information to students) of the DC? It is not clear why the opinions of the 2016 ET were not taken into consideration, and the present ET who provided the same comments in the 1-st draft of this report makes a double attention to this issue (especially after revealing the ET reports with the same recommendations) with great concerns. The other recommendation (recommended by previous ET and the present ET) is the provision of





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

library facilities with textbook library geared to the needs of students with the academic staff instruction on major textbooks, major documents.

There was some contradiction about **7.6** standard, because the SER makes a reference that "For the students and the personnel with physical disabilities, or with special needs, "Dardania" College provides appropriate conditions", but it does not elaborate further on it. At the same time, the members of the ET who directly visited the site, assessed it in the final version of their report with "no compliance" on the standard 10.9 "Appropriate provision for both facilities and learning resources is made for students and staff with physical disabilities or other special needs (such as visual or hearing impairments)", and the standard that was assessed positively before, had to be shifted. However, it did not change the whole picture, and this criteria on infrastructure and resources is still positively assessed as "Substantially compliant".

Standard	Complia	ance
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is	V	
ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and		
equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken		
into account.		
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would	V	
demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three		
years.		
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate		
documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the	V (in	
study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at	general)	
least three years:		
a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;		
b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the		
compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus		
includes such activities;		
c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with		
utilisation licence;		V
d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock		
according to the disciplines included in the curricula.		
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and	V	
laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups);		
the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are		





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.		
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the	V	
study programs:		
a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total	V	
number of students in the study program;		
b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the		
total number of students in the study program;		
c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to	V	
cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should		
represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last		
10 years;		
d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to		V
cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective		
discipline is provided for;		
e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and		V
periodicals, according to the stated mission.		
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of		V
the program is adapted to students with special needs		

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Re-consider again the recommendations of the previous ET and the present ET on the augmented library of free resources with the free access to the indicated journals and resources. It is not clear why the opinions of the 2016 ET were not taken into consideration, and the present ET who provided the same comments in the 1st draft of this report makes a double attention to this issue (especially after revealing the ET reports with the same recommendations) with a great concern;
- 2. Provide facilities of library with textbooks specifically geared to the needs of academic instruction in College's subject areas making major textbooks, instructions and documents available in the free remote library electronic access to students;
- 3. Provide the list of free library resources to all categories of users (from students up to professors). Prepare the additional source of information like the Guide to Free Online Library Resources (with the recommended sources listed above) there are plenty of free resources available that can be a great source of information for all types of researchers (students, professors, etc.);
- 4. Find the resources through the available alternative channels project preparation (for instance, targeted for the group of students with special needs if this category of students available) or initiate or join to the projects that are jointly prepared with the access provision to electronic libraries. The project can be prepared by the professors or researchers of DC who are the grantee of some programs (Fulbright scholar, British





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Council scholar, etc.) who are always provided with the grant opportunities to bring the resources to the organisation, where he/she works.

- 5. Consider the possibility to online access starting with the list of free available online library's resources and then adding the other online libraries
- 6. Include the possibilities to sign the agreement with more real estate agencies who will help students (or group of students) to find the apartments/rooms in a low-cost housing/apartment for students. This also can be done on the initiative of being socially responsible for the future generations.

3 OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Thus, the overall evaluation of 7 standards for this BA program looks like:

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
2. Quality management	Partially compliant
3. Academic staff	Substantially compliant
4. Educational process content	Partially compliant
5. Students	Partially compliant
6. Research	Substantially compliant
7. Infrastructure	Substantially compliant
Overall compliance	Partially compliant

Comments: The site visit left a positive impression about the friendly academic and non-academic staff, and Employers with students who provided a positive view about the prospective of the Dardania College, for many aspects of its functioning. The tasks related to the internal documents have been more challenging in nature, because of different interpretations and standards provided in website, SER and other documents. The overall accreditation process in Dardania College very often appeals to the issue of correspondence and conformity for many points of this report. The present SER is not explicit, full of inconsistencies, omissions, the absence of facts and the missing description of each standard, and data sources, with some contradictions inside the SER and in its SWOT analysis.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

In addition to recommendations provided after each chapter of this report (and not repeated here), some problematic aspects are emphasised. *First of all*, the issues of conformity and correspondence are coming at the first place as a matter of urgency. In terms of the mission and objectives – they remain to be unclear due to availability of four (4) versions of the DC's mission. Some objectives have to be re-written, because they are vague (some clarifications about the requested 3 objectives have also been received after the first draft of this report). The DC is to be ensured about the involvement of different participants of the stakeholders into the mission's discussion (especially, Employers and Students) for the common understanding. The problematic issues are seen in the various versions of the mission statement (in the website, the SER and other documents) with some tautology inside of the program's mission.

Second, in regard to quality management, there are many problematic aspects as well. The issues of specialisations of program, - four or five, have been described to reflect the inconsistencies even within the same report, SER and just became clarified – there are four of them (as a result of the KAA advice). However, this issue of conformity is not specifically reflected in the BA and MA programs. There are 4 specialisations (confirmed). The SER provides 2 different versions, and website - the 3rd version, and the answers to the questions of the 1st draft of this report include the 4th (fourth) version. At the website, despite there is a title "Mission and vision", it is no clear identification what exactly is related to vision, it is also not clearly provided by the SER. It is expected that conformity starts from the right titles. Quality management and quality assurance procedures of Department should be addressed these issues of conformity between the written policy and current practices.

Third, the main question arises under the policy on recruitment of academic staff personnel. It was unusual to see two different policies for BA and MA programs within the same department on hiring the academic staff. The program BA keep places with the professional characteristics so far, but the concerns still remain about the characteristics of "obedience"





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

under hiring the academic staff at MA program. The excellence in teaching, research and practices, as well as the Code of Ethics should be the important policies here.

Fourth, the issues of educational process should put more attention to the learning outcomes. The use of technologies, and different new forms of learning with didactics should be specified. The educational process content with "learning outcomes" for students and didactics from teachers should be present. The Curriculum Assessment Plan as a document should reflect the current issues of development. Some other documents for QA and QM like the action plan — would be the priority document to deal with. The issues of educational process content should put more attention to the learning outcomes specified in three categories — as knowledge, skills and competence. The use of technologies, and different new forms of learning with didactics should be specified in line with "learning outcomes" for students. The Curriculum Assessment Plan as a document should reflect the current issues of development. It is recommended to have the action plan with the set-up thresholds' dates. The attention should be paid to the area of cooperation agreements, and the person under the institutional international department unit should be involved into the issues of cooperation to support both the institutional and program levels.

Fifth, the most challenging issues for students is the ones linked to the employment opportunities and the students' completion rates. Despite there is no direct standard on employment (except QM section related to employment), with an absence of the information on career center in the SER, these issues are becoming priorities due to the high drop-out rate.

Sixth, in terms of productivity and involvement into research, a great boost of publications that has been increased, but with 2 different versions of document it raises some dilemma (there were no comments provided which version is updated and why there is a big difference in the number of publications). To support students' activities in research, it is also useful to use some tools in terms of the plagiarism (in Albanian – suggested in the answers to this report, and in English – that available for free online). There were some concerns on the





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

involvement of BA students into research activities, inconsistencies about the updated research publications and the clear activities of Research Center (with 3 sub-units), and therefore, the Action plan should be provided to improve these further directions. Actions' Plan is recommended to incorporate all these activities.

Seventh, in general there is a good infrastructure for teaching and learning, with an excellent location of DC as well as the visible efforts to support the process of research. Among the sources provided for the electronic library only 3 out of 7 are valid – ASIM Compass Abstract, Edward Elgar Products and e-library (in Albanian language). However, the biggest concern is expressed about the fact that the previous opinions of the ET (2016) were not taken into consideration by DC; The Background: The ET in 2016 recommended that the traditional library services have to be augmented (and in the long run possibly be replaced) by free access to electronic libraries, downloadable publications on the websites of the larger international research institutes, - the same recommendation that was provided by the present ET. Eighth, the general SWOT analysis left the impression that many areas are missing, do not provide standard by standard, hide or do not cover the issues in the elaborated way or according to the KAA standards. It is believed that the SER should bring more facts and evidence about each standard with more collective efforts to make it clear that the external standards are substantially met.

Ninth, some information is still not updated. It can be related to many issues listed in this report – from the mission up to vision, objectives, specialisations etc. This also can be referred to the outdated information about Tempus projects, - both in the website and SER that have been replaced with Erasmus+ activities from 2014. There is an urgent need to adjust the information flow that is provided under the contents and context of two sources – English and Albanian languages.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Expert Team

Chair		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)