

EXTERNAL EVALUATION REPORT

ESLG College

COMMITTEE OF
EXTERNAL EVALUATION
EXPERT TEAM

Prof. Dr. Arvi Hamburg

Prof. Dr. Patricia Kotnik

Prof. Dr. Aurora Pedro Bueno

Commissioned by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA)

June 2015

1. Introduction

This report summarises the results of a peer-reviewing process of ESLG College in May 2015. ESLG College was awarded institutional accreditation in 2010 as well as programme accreditation for a LLB Law and a BA in Law and Real Estate and Infrastructure Management. The institution has since then been reaccredited and another programme was introduced (MA in Law and Real Estate and Infrastructure Management). It is now applying for the following programmes:

BA in Energy Management,
Master of Law in European Commercial Law
and
BA in Finance and Investment.

The purpose of this report is to enable the Kosovo Accreditation Agency and the Ministerial and/or Political Authorities concerned to come to a decision regarding the accreditation of these programmes. This Evaluation Report is produced in accordance with the requirements and guidelines of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) for accreditation of Academic Programmes.

This report will conclude with a number of recommendations: they are the personal opinion of the authors and are formulated with their background experience in European higher educational systems and international accreditations in mind. In the current text, paragraphs with recommendations start with a subtitle “*Recommendation*”.

The recommendations expressed in this Report are addressed to the Dean and other members of the academic and support staff at ESLG College and they endeavour to suggest challenges and opportunities for the future development of the programmes. They reflect what the authors regard as good or standard practices in higher education systems, without wanting to prejudice the different conditions prevailing in Kosovo in any way. Therefore, the final decision on the ESLG College’s application for accreditation will have to be made by the relevant authorities concerned. The undersigned are aware of a difficult period of the tertiary education and economic conditions in Kosovo, but for its future quality the acceptance of standards generally prevalent in the European Union needs to be pursued.

2. Report Information Basis

The findings, suggestions and recommendations of the expert team are based on:

- the application of ESLG College for an accreditation of the three programmes in the form of Self-Evaluation Report, in the following denoted by SER, provided before the site visit,

- a list of the academic staff provided to the experts by the KAA before the site visit,
- a site visit, accompanied by Mr. Shkelzen Gërxhaliu and Mr. Elmi Kelmendi, on March 5, 2015,
- other complementary documents sent to the Expert Team after the site visit, on 1st June 2015, compiled based on the reviewers' request of additional documents to be provided,
- the comments of ESLG College on the draft report of the Expert team, provided to the experts on June 16, 2015.

The Expert Team greatly appreciates the support offered by the Dean of College and other members of the staff at the ESLG College during the Expert Team visit. We would like to acknowledge the work involved in the writing of Self-Evaluation Report and collecting all of the necessary information. It was very useful for the Expert Team.

3. Academic programmes accreditation

i. BA in Finance and Investment

Does the academic programme correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation?

According to the SER, the purpose of the ESLG College is to focus on the disciplines that no other higher education institution in Kosovo or the region offers and to create a strong learning culture for students of these disciplines (SER, pp. 9). Concerning the discipline of finance and investment, it would first seem that similar programmes are already available. However, as pointed out by the representatives of the college, most schools in the region offer programmes in banking and finance but none of them offers a strong focus on the investment part, i.e. project evaluation, including the evaluation of agricultural projects, and on the foreign direct investment. The finance industry in Kosovo is not well developed when it comes to investment funds, equity and pension funds and the stock market, so we can expect the need for specialists in this field in the future. It was also pointed out that Kosovo lacks the teaching staff with a background in investment and this is what the ESLG College can offer.

The institution's mission also puts strong emphasis on developing the learning culture and creating small groups of excellent students. Given that the expected enrolment in the programme is only 20 students, this aim is achievable. Based on this, we can conclude that the academic programme corresponds to the vision of the college.

Are the programme's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?

The self-evaluation report offers an appropriate description of the academic aims of this programme. Expected learning outcomes include the understanding of the scope of finance and investment, of the fundamental aspects of project finance, public-private partnerships and FDI,

and of how projects, companies and sectors are evaluated. They also include a focus on the investment projects in agricultural sector and on how value can be created by sound managerial decisions. These learning outcomes are appropriate and relevant for such a bachelor programme. The structure of the curriculum closely follows these learning outcomes.

Is the programme based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff?

A strong emphasis is put on what in the SER is called the “practical” part of the programme. This will mean an extensive use of the case studies and simulations, reaching up to 40% of the course contents. Most of the courses in the syllabus include such approaches in their description of teaching and learning methods. According to the ESLG College representatives, the cases that will be used will be adapted to the knowledge level of the students. The background of the main teaching staff seems to promise that a commitment to practice based learning would indeed be implemented throughout the programme.

Does the academic degree correspond to international standards?

The programme will be developed in collaboration with Graceland University from the US. A number of the teaching staff from Slovenian universities is also planned to be used. Above all, the curriculum contains the courses that can be found in similar programmes in developed countries. Therefore we can conclude that the academic degree corresponds to international standards.

Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?

Each course plans to have 3 hours of lectures and 1 hour of tutorials. Given the small number of students and the overarching concept of using problem based learning throughout the programme, we can expect that this will strongly support the analysis, reflection as well as independent study.

The structure of the programme includes 5 compulsive courses per semester, with the exception of the last one when 30 ECTS are set aside for writing a final thesis document. In the fifth semester, 12 ECTS are set aside for practical training. There is nothing unusual in the allocation of ECTS.

Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

It seems appropriate and manageable for students. But it would be advisable to analyse the feedback from the students once the programme has started.

Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes?

In the experts' opinion, the teaching methods that are planned to be used are very appropriate for achieving the learning objectives of the programme.

Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?

The overlap is comprehensible and transparent.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedure measure up to international standards

Admission criteria measure up to international standards and aim to attract relatively successful students.

Is the ratio of academic staff to students appropriate?

In view of a small number of students expected to be enrolled (20 students), the ratio is appropriate.

ii. BA in Energy Management

Does the academic programme correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation?

The Bachelor Program in Energy Management is a three-year undergraduate study program leading to university education in the field of Energy. The objective of the Energy Management program is to provide students with an overview of the energy sector, energy systems, energy savings in buildings, and to educate experts in the field of energy management, with a special focus on renewable energy management. It is organized as a full-time and a part-time program. The interdisciplinary program includes energy marketing and management but also classical

technical energy competencies. The offered academic degree is a Bachelor in Energy Management (for details see ESLG College Self-Evaluation Report, p. 25).

The curriculum is based on labour market needs and on the need for improving the efficiency of the energy sector (SER, p. 27).

The Strategic Plan of College ESLG 2014-2018 (SP, p. 9-10) is focused on developing unique programs in the sectors that contribute mostly to GDP growth or where the employment has been mostly generated or has the biggest potential to generate employment in the future.

The planned number of students is optimistic: year 2015/2016 – 50; 2016/2017 – 100; 2017/2018 - 150 and year 2020/2021 – 200 (SER, p. 96).

Recommendation: Analyse Energy Management Program sustainability if the number of students starting their studies are about 30 (not 50) and the number of the students will be 100, studying in the curriculum in the third year.

Conclusions:

The

Bachelor Study program Energy Management corresponds to the SP.

Are the programme's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?

The Bachelor three year Program, 180 ECTS points (60 ECTS points per year) (p. 25, SER). The profile of the program is oriented towards applied sciences. Theory (60%), practice/experimental (40%) ratios of the study. The study program includes 20 basic substance (V semesters), VI semester Elective Course (5 subjects) and Diploma Thesis. One ECTS calculation is based on 25 hours.

Most of the subjects have Theory and Practice ratio 50:50.

The expected learning outcomes are:

- A general overview of energy engineering systems;
- Knowledge on building energy systems, and comprehend the weather impacts on buildings;
- Knowledge on basic aspects of thermodynamics;
- Knowledge on heating, cooling and ventilation systems;
- Understand the impact of various building energy solutions on the environment;
- Resolve energy and environmental problems in buildings;
- Develop innovation, team work and creativity.

Recommendations:

1. Consider the possibility to increase the share of energy consumption topic in curriculum (especially efficient energy consumption). Analyse in some of the subjects (Energy Economics, HR Management and Contracting Strategies) the possibility of treatment of efficient energy consumption.

2. Analyse the arguments for proportions of ECTS (such as Energy Economics 6 ECTS and Fluid dynamics 8 ECTS) (SER, p. 30).

Conclusions:

1. The academic degree (Bachelor in Energy Management) corresponds with international standards, compared to similar programs in Europe.
2. The programs' quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the Academic degree.

Is the programme based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff?

The structure of Study program is logical (SER, p. 31-52).

Practical work shall be implemented together with building and energy sector companies. This practical work shall be organized as a project in the third year of studies, before the compilation of the Diploma Thesis (SER, p. 29).

Head of the Study program is Dr Visar Hoxha, there are 11 academic persons and 2 doctoral students in this team.

Recommendation:

1. Study modules: describe specifically the implementation modes of theoretical learning and practical knowledge in the educational process (complete physics (SER, p33); Chemistry (SER, p 33), Thermodynamics (SER, p. 36).
2. Concretization of some module outcomes: for example Objectives and Expected Outcomes, the module Human resource Management (SER, p. 42) (add the methodology of workforce forecasting, preparing the workforce (training) strategy, management and motivation system, management processes, quality handbook) and Contracting Strategy (SER, p. 43) - add the ideology of contracts, liability of the parties, public procurement principles).

Conclusions:

1. The Program is compact and is based on general didactic concept.
2. To realize the program the necessary forces (professors, lectures) are available.

Does the academic degree correspond to international standards?

The similar program, at a Bachelor level, exists in several universities: Faculty Engineering and Energy, University College for Applied Sciences of Oslo and Akerhus, the Limeric University in the Great Britain, the Dublin Technology Institute, the Otago University in New Zealand.

Recommendation:

In addition to cooperating with Norwegian University of Science and Technology, to conclude cooperation agreements with the above mentioned universities to develop Energy Management programs and also allow the exchange of students (mobility).

Conclusions:

The academic degree Bachelor of Arts in Energy Management corresponds to international standards.

Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis?

Very many students are employed full-time and at the same time studying full-time.

Independent learning is the one way to save the time. This chance must certainly be used.

There is the possibility of an independent study program but one part of it in the first year it is difficult, because the general subjects (mathematics, physics) demands to solve exercises.

Direct contact with academic staff is needed.

Recommendations:

1. Based on the need/demand of the independent study it is necessary to analyse each module of Evaluation methods and passing criteria and work out (impose) specific evaluation conditions that are in accordance with the expected output module.
2. In the list of Literature scientific articles that provide an independent analysis opportunity of active students could be added.

Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?

ECTS distribution ratio is generally balanced and takes into account the content of different modules.

Recommendation:

The volume of the Diploma Thesis needs analysis (conformity with 18 ECTS).

Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

In view of: 1 ECTS = 25 working hours, it is suitable for students.

There are two versions in the Study program - Full-time and Part-time.

The teaching methods and content of teaching units are sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme.

Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes?

Program goals and outcomes are described in the Table Module Objectives and learning Outcomes 1.16 (SER, p. 31).

College strategic goal nr 2: Developing full-time academic staff of the highest quality Teaching and Research (SP, p.10).

Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?

Different parts of Study programme together with theory and practice are comprehensive and understandable for students and teachers.

Recommendation: In case there are the professional standards of engineers, then compare Energy Management Study program with the professional standard.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedure measure up to international standards

Future students are divided into two groups: with work experience and without working experience (SER, p. 30). Due to this a somewhat different admission requirements are planned. There are no differences between the studies. Students with work experience have easier opportunity to perform the practical part of the curriculum.

Recommendations:

1. Basically, prospective students should have the same admission requirements at the same curriculum.
2. To justify the exemption there should be clear criteria what kind of professional experience is taken into account.
3. After entering the school there must be monitoring to identify studying results and progress between two different group of students.

Is the ratio of academic staff to students appropriate?

For a study program where 50 students are planned, 12 members of academic staff are planned (SER, p. 26). The Academics load are planned for every lecturers (SER, p86- 89).

Academic staff who participates in Study program (SER, p 26):

Full time scientific/artistic personnel (no by personnel categories)	Prof. Dr. Tore Haugen – Professor time	visiting, part-
	Prof.Dr. Alenka Temeljotov Salaj-Associate Professor	part- time
	Doc.Dr. Visar Hoxha – Assistant Professor	full- time
	Prof.Dr. Sabri Sadiku – Associate Professor	full- time
	Doc. Dr. Ali Sadiku – Assistant Professor	part- time
	Doc. Dr. Kujtim Elezi – Assistant Professor	part- time
	Doc.Dr. Ilir Morina – Assistant Professor	?
	Dr. Bedri Dragusha – Doctor of Science	full-time
	Dr. Lutfi Bina – Assistant Professor	visiting
	Dr. Elvida Pallaska – Doctor of Science	full-time
	Luan Morina – PhD Candidate	full-time
	Elmi Konjusha – PhD Candidate	full-time

There are 12 lecturers, from them six lecturers work full-time.

Academic staff to students ratio is completely acceptable but in teaching the study program there participates only one full-time professor. Academic staff CV's are considerable with high level of professional experience.

Very positive is the existence of Academic Personnel Development Plan and control system.

Recommendation: Implementation of the Development Program of Human Resources is the key to success of the Energy Management Study Program. It is very necessary to make efforts that the number of full-time professors would be higher in College.

Research and internationalization

Research activities are partly based on personal motivation, what is also college strategy. It is very positive to take part in the Program “Sustainable and Efficient Energy Buildings” (HERD Program), funded by the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Positive aspects are the support of PhD activities and the organization of conferences.

iii. Master of Law in European Commercial Law

Does the academic programme correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation?

As it is remarked in the SER (p. 53), this Master programme tries to prepare specialists in European Law, especially in European Commercial Law. This is an interesting aim if we consider that Kosovo and the region aspire to integration with the European Union.

That is fully in line with the Mission of the Institution (SER p. 54): to develop an intellectual elite in Kosovo, prepared to push the country towards European integration offering unique programs in the region.

Experts in this area will be increasingly needed as the integration process advance, covering needs of public and private sector in Kosovo.

Are the programme's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?

The expected outcomes cover the main pillars when considering the Economic, Commercial legislation and Governance administration of the European Union. There is an adequate mix of legal, economic and administrative governance issues to be learned by the students.

The distribution of the courses is set so that half of the ECTSs are offered in the first semester and half in the second semester. During the first semester all the courses have 25 ECTS and in the second semester the two courses are 5 ECTS and the Thesis 20 ECTS.

There could be some overlap with the content of European Law, Economic Integration and EU Governance and the course EU Internal Market Law. These possible coincidences justify the different weight in ECTS. But we recommend the review of the contents to avoid repeating some of them.

We will also recommend considering the introduction of a specific course on Economics. Most of the legislation in the EU is related to the Economic area (Commercial, economic integration, external relations, monetary union, etc.) and it could be interesting to introduce some fundamentals of this discipline to understand European integration process and legislation.

No elective courses are offered. That means it is a rigid programme with no possibilities of some specialization. We recommend considering this possibility in the future.

Although the Master programme will be offered on full-time and part-time basis no information is given to explain any differences between them.

Taking into account additional information sent by the institution, optional courses on Economy had been introduced in the programme. These will help to meliorate the

understanding of the processes and the consequences of EU integration process and European Law. The optional courses add flexibility for the students in the Master and open the possibility of future specialization.

Is the programme based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff?

The ratio between the theoretical and practical parts of the program is established at 60% to 40%. That is an adequate ratio, although the quality of practical parts of the program should be the main criteria to evaluate it.. If we consider the information given for each course the ratio theory/practice is 50:50.

No practical work or internship program has been included in the Master programme. It is argued that the Master “targets employed lawyers with professional experience in domestic legislation, and therefore, practical work has not been planned for this program” (SER p. 55). The opinion of the experts is that this could be a weakness in the programme for those students that are not employed. It could be that the idea to accept only employed lawyers. If that, target students have to be revised. Or an effort has to be made to include an internship programme for those students that do not have any experience in the labour market.

Recommendation: To consider the development of an internship programme in the future. This could be of great interest for the students that have no professional experience.

Does the academic degree correspond to international standards?

ESLG College already has agreements with other European Universities as it is remarked in the SER. That is an interesting element of support of this Master programme. Anyway, efforts have to be done to get other agreements with other European Universities. This will give more international support to the programme and will allow developing other actions in the context of the European Union.

Recommendation: To sign agreements with other European Universities, especially those with European Law programmes.

Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis?

To the opinion of the experts, the hours of classes allows sufficient time-space for independent study, reflection and analysis. However, due to the content and objectives of the programme, most of the students are employed and then they have to do an extra effort to follow the courses, to do practices and projects.

As it is usual the student workload is established at 25 study hours per each ECTS. This is adequate for a full-time student and it follows the European higher educational standards. But it could be a difficult to achieve for those students that are working and studying.

The theory/practice ratio is estimated at 50:50 for all the courses. In the opinion of the experts this is optimal ration but we recommend adapting this ratio to the content of each course.

All the courses follow the same weight and type of components for the evaluation: 40% research paper, 50% final examination and 10% attendance. This has the advantage of facilitating unification of all the courses.

Recommendation: To establish an academic commission (academic coordination) to evaluate the different needs for theory and practice for each subject. We suggest the participation of students in the future to reduce overlaps.

Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?

The Master programme has a total amount of 60 ECTS. It is a one year programme. It follows the 4+1+3 structure for higher educational programmes in Kosovo. Per semester, 30 ECTS may be achieved. All the courses in the first semester are 6 ECTS courses. For the second semester, two courses of 5 ECTS and the work for the Diploma Thesis (estimated in 20 ECTS) are offered.

Recommendation: The introduction of internship programme and optional courses in the future could change these weights.

Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

The workload will be manageable under the condition that the calculation of ECTS has been realistic

Anyway, both collectives (students with only four-years of education in Law and students employed and with professional experience) could need different attention to prepare some subjects. The response to these two different situations depends on the teaching staff disposition to adapt the classes to different groups.

Additional information was given with the differences between full-time and part-time programmes.

Recommendation: The possibility to have full-time and par-time programmes means that the same programme is offered in two different “speeds”. This situation still could have different implications for students and teaching staff.

Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes?

According to the information we have, there seems to be an adequate teaching methodology. We are considering the equilibrium between knowledge and practice, skills and reflection. The evaluation methods also reflect the importance of the “research paper” (40% of total).

The teaching staff is also a condition for the successful achievement of the programme's goals.

Is the overlap of academic content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes?

Attending the revision of the contents of the courses offered in the Master Programme there could be a risk of overlap in some of the contents, especially those related to the history of EU that has to review legislation. This is the case, for example, with Legal Basis of European Integration and European Commercial Law. Similar contents can be developed in different ways (more or less developed, more or less importance) and that is common. In this case, teaching staff has to consider such a possibility and to establish tools to work on this risk.

Recommendation: Review the course descriptions to avoid unnecessary overlaps.

Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?

As we already said, there is a risk of overlapping academic content. This is a one year programme and thus it is important to detect and avoid it, when possible.

Recommendation: To establish an academic coordination commission to follow the syllabus and the contents, especially during the first year.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedure measure up to international standards

With 50 places offered, the size is adequate and similar to other similar Masters.

The profile of the students has to guarantee they have the basic and core knowledge to follow the courses adequately: graduated students of four-year programs of General Law or European Law, lawyers employed in the Kosovo institutions working in commerce and economy, etc. That means two different kinds of students to be accepted in the programme with different criteria (different weight for the experience, the marks, etc.): one group of students with no experience and the other with experience – established professionals with the objective of career advancement. These different criteria are recognised in SER (p. 55): “For candidates

with at least three years of experience as lawyers in public institutions of Kosovo, the average grade criterion shall be revoked". But no additional information on this is given.

Recommendation: To consider and work on the different needs of two main students groups (with professional experience and with no professional experience).

Is the ratio of academic staff to students appropriate?

Following the information given in the SER (p. 53) there are four full time academic staff members to cover the teaching needs of the Master programme. That means 12,5 students for each of them. Although the number of teaching staff seems low for the number of students, the main criteria should be the quality of teaching staff and the availability of the teaching staff to the students. That information will be given with the quality evaluation questionnaires.

One of the quality criteria in a Master programme is the opportunity to know and share experiences with a variety of teaching staff.

Recommendation: To consider the integration of experts through seminars and other no-full time academic staff.

Recommendation: To diversify the academic staff in order to guarantee a wide variety of opinions and approaches.

4. Staff

According to a list of academic staff provided to the experts by the KAA before the site visit, ESLG College employs 37 faculty members of which 8 are employed on a full-time basis whereas the remaining 29 have part-time contracts. This raises concerns regarding one of the basic KAA standards that refers to the teaching staff and that requires that at least 50% of entire teaching load of a programme needs to be covered by permanent staff who is qualified (with a PhD).

This issue is most strongly problematic for the BA in Finance and Investment. The FT/PT faculty ratio for this programme is listed in the SER as 38% vs. 62% (SER, pp. 95). In the response to the draft version of this report it is stated that ESLG College now plans to strengthen the teaching staff covering this programme by allocating two other full-time members of the staff to teach here (Gazmend Ahmeti and Ilir Rama; both of them were included in the list of faculty provided by the KAA). Looking at the curriculum, there would now be 5 full-time faculty members involved in teaching whereas the rest of the courses will be covered by part-time faculty. Part-time faculty members include staff with strong CVs, quite a few of them also coming from Slovenian universities. However, the time available to devote their attention to the students of ESLG College will be strongly determined by their actual presence in Kosovo which will be only modest (modular courses are planned, taking 7-10 days, or

possibly dividing this into 2 parts). Even if we take into account the possibility of electronic modes of communication this is not an optimal arrangement since these faculty members have full-time commitments back home.

Coming back to full-time faculty members, here one of the problems lies in the lack of diversification of teaching load. Prof. Visar Hoxha is originally planned to teach 7 courses in this programme, not to mention courses he teaches in other programmes ESLG College offers (this might change with the inclusion of Mr. Ahmeti and Mr. Rama into this programme but no information is available on which courses they would be teaching). Prof. Hoxha has strong credentials for heading this programme as well as teaching courses within it, but it is not possible to cover so many courses on a satisfactory level. We should also be taking into account his role as a mentor for dissertations which brings additional responsibilities. An ambitious programme, like this BA in Finance and Investment definitely is, needs a stronger faculty team. In the SER, the section on academic personnel development does not even mention plans to remedy this situation. The latest information provided by the college (about 2 full-time faculty members that were planned for other programmes would now be teaching here also) does not solve this problem since both of these 2 faculty members are PhD candidates. The KAA standards require that the permanent staff which should cover at least 50% of teaching load is qualified, i. e. has a PhD.

A similar situation has been pointed out in the case of the Master programme (Master in Law, European Commercial Law). As it was said before, there are only four members of the academic staff for the whole year of the Master. One of them will be the responsible of three of the courses (with a total of 7 courses).

Very positive is the existence of Academic Personnel Development Plan and control system as well as the teacher mobility in the programs Energy Management BSc and LLM in European Commercial Law.

Recommendations:

1. Build a team of faculty members teaching in the BA in Finance and Investment that will have an adequate proportion of permanent staff with qualifications.
2. Strengthen the Energy Management Study with full-time academic staff.

5. Research and International Co-operation

Based on the revision of the documentation sent to the experts and the conversation during the visit to the ESLG College, the expert team conclude that:

- ESLG College has initiated in the last years an interesting path to develop research in different areas.

- These research projects in which the ESLG College is participating are related to areas like energy, real state and infrastructure. No research projects seem to focus on law and European law issues. The expert tem consider that to initiate a project in this area is of great importance, especially when considering the Master programme that is launched.
- In general, the CV of the academic staff shows an important involvement in research and publication.
- The ESLG College will have to develop a special plan for Research. There are conditions to get good results in the future, especially in Law and European Issues.

6. Finances and infrastructure / Space and equipment

Does the institution have an adequate budget plan?

The College budget total Revenues show increase (2015 – 600 000; 2016 -800 000 and 2017 - 900 000 Euros).

The main part of the income comes the tuition fees (2015 - 400 000; 2016- 600 000 and 2016- 800 000).

Wages, compensations, air tickets all together forming 280 000 euros, it is 47% from total budget.

Library expense show increase, 25 000 to 40 000 Euros.

Recommendation: The Planned increase in tuition fees is associated with risk. It is necessary to find additional sources of funding and financing to the improvement of the learning process.

Does the institution have adequate buildings and specialized infrastructure for the requirements of the programme?

College ESLG leases the infrastructure necessary for the study. The lecture and laboratory facilities are adequate. Practical work will take place in partner organizations.

Recommendation: Experts recommend that the auditoriums be equipped with audio-visual equipment to conduct video lectures.

7. Quality management

Are the institution's programmes assessed regularly within the context of internal evaluation processes?

The ESLG College has an internal evaluation processes in place that should be able to identify the issues that need to be addressed. The academic units have a range of responsibilities related to the assurance of quality (SER, pp. 11). A number of indicators are also set, intended to measure whether the standards concerning quality assurance were achieved, with quantitative goals (and quite ambitious ones, too) assigned to each of them. The type of information that is gathered for the purposes of assessment includes quantitative as well as qualitative data. The most emphasis is put on the questionnaires that follow each course and on the focus groups that include student representatives with whom they meet regularly. They also involve students in periodical reviews of departments and of the faculty. When asked whether they can supply any examples of identifying problematic issues due to the quality assessment process and the reaction to it, the representatives of ESLG College have pointed out an example of students' complaints over one of the professors that have resulted in an intervention that has ended with the professor's contract not being extended.

The college also involves industry experts. They do this in the phase of the analysis of labour market needs when the programmes are being designed and when they are developing the courses. This is certainly a good practice. It would also be advisable to involve the stakeholders in the phase of the evaluation of the programmes after they are already being run. Expected learning outcomes are defined for each programme but analysing each course at a time (through a student questionnaire) does not give an opportunity for an overall assessment of whether the learning goals of the programme as a whole have been achieved (i.e. whether the desired educational accomplishments of the graduates have been realized). At the moment, the programme director is responsible for evaluation of each study programme but this process could greatly benefit from a wider involvement of stakeholders. Feedback from the employers or other industry experts as well as from the alumni students can be very useful in this respect. The ESLG College is now thinking about introducing monthly meetings of professors in which they would be able to discuss the issues that are relevant to their teaching and where the best practices could be learned. If this useful practice will be introduced, this opportunity could also be used for a yearly discussion on each programme's objectives and whether they are achieved.

Recommendation: Start introducing the elements of assurance of learning on the programme level.

8. Summary / Conclusion

The expert team comes to the conclusion, that at the given status **it proposes the accreditation of:**

- BA in Energy Management, and
- Master of Law in European Commercial Law.

The expert team **does not propose the accreditation of** the BA in Finance and Investment.

However, the expert team strongly encourages the ESLG College to consider the recommendations made by the expert team and, after additional development of the teaching staff, to re-apply for the accreditation of the BA in Finance and Investment.

Prof. Dr. Arvi Hamburg

Prof. Dr. Patricia Kotnik

Prof. Dr. Aurora Pedro Bueno