

Draft - Evaluation Report

by the team of experts

assessing the

ISPE College

Prishtina

according to the Process of Accreditation

by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA)

22th of June 2016

Table of Contents

- 1. Executive Summary 3
- 2. Review Process 3
- 3. Evidence 4
- 4. Study Programs 5
 - 4.1. Bachelor Program in Economics 5
 - 4.2. Master Program in Business and Management 12
 - 4.3. Bachelor Program in General Law 19
- 5. Recommendations 25

1. Executive Summary

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) is requested by the Minister of Education, Science and Technology of Kosovo to evaluate all private institutions of Higher Education which operate in the Kosovo. According to this request the ISPE College decided to undergo the accreditation process.

ISPE College is a private institution of higher education in Kosovo in accordance with the Law on the High Education in Kosovo. ISPE College started their higher education activities with a program on European Studies and in 2010 the Institute for Political and European Studies was accredited for the first time with the program Integrated European Studies on bachelor level. Beside this program ISPE College offers studies in the European Integrated Studies (BA), European Studies (MA) with specializations in EU Politics, European Economic Integrations and EU Law as well as Security Studies (MA).

The experts are grateful for ISPE College hosting the External Expert Team during their on-site-visit 13th to 14th June 2016. In addition the Experts want to express their thanks to the Kosovo Accreditation Agency and its representatives for their remarkable hospitality, support and cooperation during this accreditation procedure. Mr. Shkelzen Gerxhaliu accompanied the Expert team throughout the Site-Visit-Program (SVP).

2. Review Process

The process was designed in the light of the KAA policy on “KAA Standards for Accreditation”. Relevant documents for the review team were the “KAA Guidelines for Experts – Academic Programs”, but also “KAA Guidelines for Experts – Institutional Programs” and the “KAA Code of Good Practice for Site-Visits“. The evaluation procedure consisted of the following steps: Nomination and appointment of the review team members, self-evaluation by ISPE College, and an SVP by the external Expert team and finally the preparation and completion of the final evaluation report.

Before the site visit took place a comprehensive Self-Evaluation Report (SER) was provided by ISPE College, which includes a short description of institution's history, leading principles and the mission of ISPE College, organization, management and planning of the study programs, staff situation, students, quality assurance, facilities, research and international cooperation as well as funding.

3. Evidence

The key document considered by the review panel was the Self-Evaluation Report prepared by ISPE College. It was made available to all review panel members in advance of the SVP in a digital version and later in print form too.

We like to thank KAA, but also the staffs of the various departments who worked on that additional material after the on-site-visit. Finally, the comprehensive comments by ISPE College on the panel's draft report provided further information and insights which contributed to write the final report.

On-site-visit Peer Review Team:

Prof. Tiiu PAAS / University of Tartu (Estonia)

Ass. Prof. Dr. Ingeborg MOTTIL / University of Salzburg (Austria)

4. Study Programs

4.1 BA program in Economics

Expert: Prof. Tiiu Paas, School of Economics and Business Administration, University of Tartu, Estonia

Date of site visit: 13-14.06.2016

Introductory remarks

The ISPE College has been running the bachelor programme in Economics since 2012/2013. The program was submitted for the re/accreditation in spring 2016. The expert team's opinion and the recommendations for the development of the BA program under the re-accreditation relies on the Self Evaluation Report - 2016-2017 (hereafter SER), materials presented in the appendices of the SER, additional materials presented upon the request during the site visit and on the information experts collected in the meetings with the faculty members and students during the site visit. The site visit of the international experts was in June 14, 2016.

1. Academic Program and Student Management

Does the academic programme correspond to the institution's mission statement and principle of operation?

The mission of the ISPE College (hereafter the College) is in line with the overall mission of the higher education in Kosovo, which is defined in the Law No.2003/14 date 12 May 2003 "On Higher Education in the Republic of Kosovo". Following this comprehensive mission statement, concrete aims of the ISPE College as a higher education institution (HEI) activities are defined as follows: to be competitive following regional and European standards, to develop strong collaboration with European universities being a part of European Conference of Universities, and through the proven quality to help Kosovo become part of European Area of Higher Education. The College emphasises the necessity to be competitive in national, regional and

international educational markets providing education that creates necessary preconditions for graduates' labour market success.

Thus, the implementation and development of College's all study programs including the BA program in Economics has to strongly follow the principles of internalisation in order to fulfil main aims of this institution. Additionally, the program in Economics has to be implemented and develop following the expectations of all stakeholders and the principles of College's operation (e.g. principles priority, professionalism, continuity and confidentiality; see also SER p.14). It is possible to summarise, that majority of essential requirements have been considered by the elaboration and implementation of the BA program in Economics taking into account that this program has to continually be an integral part of College's all activities ensuring its sustainability.

Are the programme's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree? Does the academic degree correspond to standards? Has the program been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff.

According to the information presented in the SER, the BA program in Economics has been elaborated and developed taking into account stakeholders' opinions, which were expressed during the several meetings with stakeholders (e.g. meetings with employers, faculty members, students, CEO's, managers). Following the opinion of stakeholders, the BA program provides possibilities for specialisation in marketing; banking, finance and accounting, management and informatics, and also more deeply in economics providing basis for better understanding essence of economic processes.

The program is developed relying on the information Kosovo's labour market requirements as well as following international standards and experience including in the study modules that are also parts of study programs of several European universities. Taking into account that faculty members have been actively involved in the program's development processes, it is possible to conclude that this program has been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff.

The scope of the program measured by the ECTS in general corresponds to the international standards (1 ECTS = 30 study hours). The BA program in Economics provides 60 ECTS annually with total amount of 180 ECTS during three study years

including also 5 ECTS for master thesis in the sixth semester. The program consists of necessary basic study modules applicable to all specialisations that are offered during the first and second semesters and of special courses following the basic requirements for specialisation. The allocation of ECTS is in general appropriate and justified. Certain flexibility is necessary in allocation of ECTS, particularly in the conditions of students' international mobility. The general design of the program has to have room for that.

The program has strong emphasis on integration theoretical knowledge with practical skills. The share of providing theoretical knowledge and developing practical skills is varying between 40-60 depending on specific nature of the study course and the expected study outcome. Also internship is playing a remarkable role in implementation of the BA program in Economics. Students have possibilities to attend internship in state institutions, private companies and different non-governmental organizations. Development of students' research skills is also an important task of the BA study program in Economics. Teachers try to integrate students into their own research activities. The universal rules for the preparing theses are elaborated and implemented on the College level.

In conclusion, general design of the BA study program in Economics creates necessary framework for offering BA degree; the scope of the program and the expected study outcome allow fulfilling the aims appropriate to this academic degree. In order to guarantee the sustainability of the program, the implementation of the program has to be continually dynamic, offering sufficient flexibility in providing study courses (including elective courses) and implementing new creative teaching methods.

Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified? Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

According to the information presented in the SER and collected during the site visit (including conversations with students), the allocation of ECTS seems to be appropriate and the workload required is manageable for the students. The program also includes possibilities for independent study.

Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes?

In general, teaching methods and content of teaching units are sufficient for the achievement of the program's aims and expected study outcome. But of course, there is still room for improvements in this field taking into account international experience and quick development of teaching methods and high school' pedagogics. During the site visit, students expressed their opinion that they expect that even more interactive teaching methods can be implemented in future.

Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?

The SER presents brief and rather laconic description of the study courses and expected study outcome of every subject. In general, the necessary principles of compressibility and transparency of the curriculum are followed. But without doubt, the syllabuses and curriculum design should be continually developed taking into account regular feedback from the students and other stakeholders.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards? Drop out of students?

The SER does not provide detailed information about the admission procedures of students to the program under evaluation. But according to the information collected from students, they did not recognise remarkable problems with the understanding and following admission criteria. According to the SER, the average passing rate of the BA Economics program students has been around 58% during the recent years. In comparison with the other programs of the College this rate is sufficiently high. According to the information presented in the SER, the drop out is small (only 2-3 students during the study year).

Is the ratio of academic staff to students appropriate?

According to the information presented in the SER, the overall number of students of the BA program in Economics at the ISPE College is around 600 (SER, p. 336). The

expected academic staff /student ratio at the ISPE College is 1:25, which means 1 teacher to 25 students (SER, p. 338). According to SER (p.75-76), full-time academic staff involved in the BA Economics program is 26 persons, 11 of them have PhD degree. Relying on the information of the same source (SER p. 332-333) the staff of the BA Economics program consists of 11 persons and four of them are holding PhD degree. Thus, the information presented in SER is somewhat contradictory, but in any case, it is possible to conclude that the expected academic staff /student ratio is probable not fully sufficient for the development of the study programs in the field of economics and business¹.

2. Staff

Does the institution have an adequate proportion of permanent staff and appropriate proportion of permanent and external staff?

The College expect to have every year at least 150 new students (SER, p. 75) in the BA program in Economics. Following the information presented in the SER and collected during the site visit (see also our remarks in the paragraph above) the College should consider whether to decline the admission of the new students or to recruit additional qualified staff including also external staff. Taking into account that the College strongly emphasises important role of internalisation, attention should also be devoted to the recruitment of qualified people from prominent HEIs outside of Kosovo. International exchange of teaching staff has to be improved.

Does the academic staff demonstrate proven ability at a high academic and didactic level and are their qualifications appropriate to the position they hold within the institution according to the basic criteria?

During the site visit and meetings with the faculty members, academic staff demonstrated good qualification as well as readiness and motivation to work with the BA students in Economics. Unfortunately, the SER and meetings with the faculty members of the College did not present sufficient information about the College's

¹ The College provided (27.06) explanations to the current staff situation and to the information presented in the SER. Experts try to understand the situation. But in order to keep good international standards in educating young people in the field of economics and to implement the ongoing study program developments are always necessary ensuring the sustainability of the program. Staff issues are particularly crucial for the development and implementation of this study program and developments are necessary.

concrete plans how to increase the motivation of young faculty members to successfully finish their PhD studies and to continue academic career. The improvement of some faculty members' abilities and readiness to communicate in English is necessary.

3. Research and International cooperation

Is the teaching staff involved in research activities inside or outside the institution, and do these research activities feed back into teaching/course contents? Is the extent and the quality of international cooperation in research and teaching adequate?

International cooperation activities, mainly with the colleagues from German universities, are developed or are in the development stage. Thus, the College has created preconditions for international cooperation and development of joint research with the colleagues outside of Kosovo. Some of this cooperation results have been also reflected in the development of study plans and contents on study subjects, also in selecting appropriate text books and other study materials. Faculty members strongly emphasise the necessity to be involved in research activities in Kosovo and outside and to actively publish their research outcome; some of them are also successfully participating in local and international research projects. So far, the publications of the College academic staff in the field of economics and business seemed to be geared more to the specific situation and issues in Kosovo or/and the Western Balkans. But people are aware that successful participation in the much broader international networks is necessary in order to have better possibilities for the preparing and publishing joint research papers in economics and business with much larger international impact.

Are students involved in research and cooperation projects?

Taking into account that BA program in Economics includes internship and bachelor theses and the program has strong orientation on integrating theoretical knowledge and practical skills, the College emphasises the necessity that students have to be involved in research projects together with faculty members as well as internship's

supervisors outside of the College. Some necessary rules and guidance for development of these processes are already elaborated and implemented by the College. But there is still the necessity as well as expectations of students to be more actively involved in the international exchange schemes and projects. Students also expect to get more information and guidance for improving their international mobility.

4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

Does the institution have an adequate budget plan? Does the institution have adequate buildings and specialized infrastructure for the requirements of the programme?

ISPE College has made some progress in development of its infrastructure during recent years (renovation of lecture rooms, computer labs, equipment, library, etc). The College has also developed the system of its budget planning in order to make necessary adjustments according to Kosovo's economic development and well as developments in national and international labour and educational markets. But of course, continual development of College's infrastructure is necessary in order to every year admit planned 150 students in the BA program in Economics guarantying proper conditions for educating them.

5. Quality Management

Are the institution's programmes assessed regularly within the context of internal evaluation processes?

According to the SER, Quality Assurance in the ISPE College is in compliance with the higher requirements of the higher education in Kosovo, of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and the requirements of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency and is governed by the regulations of the College. The system of quality assurance in general ensures for meeting standards and guidelines arising from the Association (Network) European Quality Assurance (ENQA). The College administration in cooperation with program committees put efforts to development of quality management; some necessary preconditions for well-functioning Quality Assurance system are created or/and are in development stage. Procedures for permanent reviewing of study programs and necessary institutional framework

(including several committees, Quality Assurance Office) are established. In order to collect feedback from stakeholders, special questionnaires are elaborated and the system for regular surveys and analysis of feedback results are introduced. All these activities also support the implementation of the BA study program in Economics.

6. Recommendations

The BA study in Economics program is elaborated and implemented following necessary requirements for bachelor studies. But every study program should be continually dynamic and developments are always necessary ensuring the sustainability of the program. Therefore, below are summarized some recommendations that can support the development of the BA program in Economics during its ongoing implementation processes.

- The program should be continually revised and updated putting emphasises on the internalisation, which is one of the most important aims of the College corresponding to its mission statement. In order to fulfil these tasks, it is recommendable to elaborate and implement concrete plan of internalisation activities and regularly monitor its implementation.
- International exchange of students and faculty members has to be improved. Remarkable emphasis should be given to the guiding and supporting students' international mobility.
- Study plan and syllabuses should be continually revised and developed avoiding possible overlaps of some course contents implementing for instance matrix approach or some other approaches for that.
- Implementation of new teaching methods allowing improvement of students' creativity and abilities to effectively integrate theoretical knowledge with practical skills is necessary. Therefore, it is recommendable to implement concrete measures that motivate and support academic staff in development of their modern pedagogical skills and teaching methods.
- Taking into account that the improvement of research activities and research quality is among the priorities of the College's development, it is recommendable to elaborate concrete measures and plans for the

development of research and international networking and to regularly monitor the successfulness of the implementation processes.

- Remarkable attention should be continually devoted to the recruitment and development of teaching staff, particularly of young faculty members who still are PhD candidates.
- Program committee as well as other relevant institutions have to strongly monitor and evaluate the implementation of concrete plans elaborated for the development of the BA study program in Economics (e.g. internalisation; academic staff development, research and networking development). Main decisions of the program committee's meetings should be correctly documented making this information available to all stakeholders.

Recommendation for (Re-) Accreditation Decision:

Study Program BA in Economics

The experts recommend an accreditation for 3 years.

4.2 Master Program in Business and Management

Expert: Prof. Tiiu Paas, School of Economics and Business Administration, University of Tartu, Estonia

Date of site visit: 13. - 14.06.2016

Introduction

In order to provide possibilities to potential students for the continuation of their education in economic field on the master level, the ISPE College elaborated the master program in Economics that has been provided to the evaluation by the international experts in 2014 and 2015. Both versions of the program were not accredited. The remarks and suggestions made during the evaluations of these programs were taken into account by the elaboration of the new master program in Business and Management which was presented for the accreditation in 2016.

The description of the elaborated MA program in Business and Management is presented in the ISPE College Self Evaluation Report - 2016-2017 (hereafter SER). The expert team's opinion about the master program in Business and Management and the recommendations for its implementation and development are elaborated based on the SER, materials presented in the appendices of the SER, additional materials presented upon the request and the information experts collected in the meetings with the faculty members and other stakeholders during the site visit. The site visit of the international expert team was in June 14, 2016.

1. Academic Program and Student Management

The master program in Business and Management has been elaborated taking into account stakeholders' opinions about Kosovo's labour market demand, which were expressed during the stakeholders' roundtable meetings. Stakeholders found that this program would enable students to develop knowledge and skills that are multidimensional in business and management fields allowing graduates to be attractive and competitive in labour market.

Does the academic programme correspond to the institution's mission statement and principle of operation?

The mission of the ISPE College (hereafter the College) is in line with the overall mission of the higher education in Kosovo, which is defined in the Law No.2003/14 date 12 May 2003 "On Higher Education in the Republic of Kosovo". Following this comprehensive mission statement, concrete aims of the ISPE College as a higher education institution (HEI) activities are defined as follows: to be competitive following regional and European educational standards, to develop strong collaboration with European universities being a part of European Conference of Universities, and through the proven quality to help Kosovo become a part of the European Area of Higher Education. The College emphasises the necessity to be competitive in national, regional and international educational markets providing education that creates necessary preconditions for graduates' labour market success.

According to the defined aims, the College strongly emphasises the importance of internalisation. Thus, the implementation and development of College's study programs including the master program in Business and Management have to strongly follow the principles of internalisation in order to fulfil College's aims and principles of operation (e.g. principles of priority, professionalism, continuity and confidentiality; see also SER p.14). Additionally, the master program in Business and Management has to fulfil the expectations of all stakeholders, including employers, students and graduates. Important target of the new master program under evaluation is to attract students that are able and interested in getting deep knowledge and skills in business and management having special focus on marketing and financial management and on development of analytical and research skills.

It is possible to summarise, that majority of essential requirements (mission statement, aim, principles of operation of the College) have been considered by the elaboration of the master program in Business and Management. The necessary framework for the implementation and development of this new master program has in general been created taking into account that the program has to be an integral part of activities ensuring College's sustainability.

Are the programme's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree? Does the academic degree correspond to standards? Has the program been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff.

The program is designed for two years including four study semesters. The program has clear focus on the following issues: first, the EU focus that provides students with knowledge and skills interrelated to the EU best practices; second, academic excellence including good research and analytical skills and third, regional and international labour markets' demand for graduates' knowledge and skills in business and management.

The scope of the program measured by the ECTS in general corresponds to the international standards. The program under evaluation provides 60 ECTS annually with total amount of 120 ECTS during two study years including also 5 ECTS for internship and 25 ECTS for master thesis. The courses are divided to the core courses in business, economics, management and EU studies as well as to some elective courses. The study plan tries to provide balanced semester workload during the whole study process. The allocation of ECTS is in general appropriate and justified. The program has strong emphasis on integration of theoretical knowledge with practical skills. Taking into account that majority of faculty members have been involved in the program's development processes, it is possible to expect that the program has been adequately communicated and adopted by the teaching staff.

The general design of the elaborated master program in Business and Management creates necessary framework for offering master degree that corresponds to international standards; the scope of the program and the expected study outcome allow fulfilling the aims appropriate to the academic degree. Of course, in order to fulfil all aims and expected learning outcome and to guarantee the sustainability and internalisation of the program, the implementation of the program has to be continually dynamic in offering sufficient flexibility in providing study courses (including elective courses) and in implementing interactive and creative teaching methods.

Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

According to the information presented in the SER, the allocation of ECTS is in general appropriate and the workload required seems to be manageable for the students. Students have sufficient opportunity for independent study. But of course, these issues will be possible to profoundly evaluate and to provide additional recommendations for development only after getting feedback from the first students and graduates.

Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes?

In general, proposed teaching methods and content of teaching units are sufficient for the achievement of the program's aims and expected study outcome. But relying on the discussions with students and teaching staff, there is still room for the implementation of additional interactive teaching methods taking also into account best international experience and quick development of university level pedagogics.

Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?

In general, the necessary principles of compressibility and transparency of the curriculum are followed. But without doubt, the syllabuses and curriculum design should be continually developed taking into account regular feedback from the students and other stakeholders, including first graduates. Correctly updated syllabuses have to be comfortably accessible through the well-functioning electronic study information system of the College. The implementation of a matrix approach and/or other possibilities for the collecting information and conducting module's essence analysis will help avoiding possible threats that parts of the courses' contents are remarkable overlapping; this will also provide additional possibilities for improving curriculum transparency. Profound analysis of students' and graduates' feedback is essential for these activities.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?

The admission criteria are clearly settled following first of all Kosovo's labour market demand. Advantage will be given to the students with higher GPA as well as students that have working experience and seeking for additional knowledge and possibilities for specialization in business and management. The program is dedicated to students that have HEI undergraduate at least of three years studies (180 ECTS and above). Applicants who do not have necessary background in economics and business have also possibilities to apply for this master program. In these cases the applicants are required to attend additional basic courses in marketing, microeconomics, and finance if these subjects were not passed during the previous studies.

Is the ratio of academic staff to students appropriate?

According to the information presented in the SER, academic staff /student ratio at the ISPE College is 1:25 (SER, p. 338). The information on academic staff presented in the SER is somewhat contradictory (see also remarks in the paragraph below). But in order to fulfil College's plan to admit every study year 100 new master students in Business and Management, there will be the necessity to have additional well qualified teaching staff that have relevant publications in business and management as well as business experience and good English language proficiency in order to teach additional 200 master students per year in near future. Thus, following the elaborated study program and its curriculum, the recruitment of additional academic staff as well as training and re-training of faculty members seems to be an essential task of the College in order to start with the implementation of the master program in Business and Management. Development of internalisation processes can also help to solve problems related to achieving and keeping necessary ratio of academic staff.

2. Staff

The SER presents somewhat contradictory information regarding the staff issues. According to the SER (p. 229-230), full-time academic staff involved in the master program in Business and Management is around 30; 15 of them have PhD degree.

Relying on the information of the same source (SER, p 335-336) the staff of the proposed new master program consists of 9 persons and five of them are holding PhD degree. The information, who is the program supervisor and who are the responsible people for the program development, is also somewhat unclear. According to the SER (p. 335), the program supervisor is Dr. Izet Ibrahim, who is also the program supervisor of on the BA Economics program and who's educational background as well as academic publications do not fully fit the fields of economics, business and management (see CV of Dr. Izet Ibrahim). Relying on the information the expert commission got during the site visit, the responsible persons of the master program in Business and Management are Dr-s. Iva Zajmi, Florim Idrizi and Sadri Alija, who's academic CV-s (including publications) do not fully correspond to the business and management fields. According to the SER, Dr. Iva Zajmi is also responsible for the program in Law². Thus, the College has to quickly and clearly set the responsibilities and competencies of academic staff that are responsible and have necessary competences (including also publications) for the development of the new master program in Business and Management. That is the most crucial issue for the implementation and development of the new master program intending admitting 100 students every year (according to the SER, students are already admitted since the study year 2015/2016?). Thus, without solving the problems related to the responsibilities and qualifications (including also good proficiency in English as the most important language for business communication and knowledge development in the fields of business and management) of academic staff, it will be impossible to successfully implement the master program in Business and Management.

3. Research and international cooperation

The College emphasises the necessity to improve academic staff's research activity and quality including also staff involved in the implementation and development of the master program in Business and Management. People are aware that successful participation in much broader international networks is unavoidable in order to have

² The College provided (27.06) explanations to the current staff situation and somewhat contradictory information presented in the SER. Experts try to understand the situation. But in order to keep good international standards in educating young people in the field of business and management and to provide master degree following international requirements, the elaboration and implementation of the new master program in Business and Management requires involvement of additional qualified and experienced people in business and management who also have relevant academic publications in this field.

better possibilities for the preparing and publishing joint research papers with much larger international impact in economic and business fields. Taking into account that new master program in Business and Management includes internship and master theses; there is clear necessity and also hope that future master students will step by step be involved in the research process in business and management fields getting professional supervision for their research work. During the meetings with College management and faculty members, they expressed their willingness and ability for strengthen research activities and international research cooperation in business and management in near future.

4. Finances and infrastructure/space and equipment

ISPE College has made some progress in development of its infrastructure (renovation of lecture rooms, computer labs, equipment, library, etc) during the recent years. The College has also developed the system of its budget planning in order to make necessary adjustments according to Kosovo's economic development and well as developments in national and international labour and educational markets. College's infrastructure supports implementation and development of the master program in Business and Management, but continual improvements are necessary in order to admit additional new 100 master students every year.

5. Quality Management

According to the SER, Quality Assurance in the ISPE College is in compliance with the higher requirements of the higher education in Kosovo, of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and the requirements of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency and is governed by the regulations of the College. The system of quality assurance in general ensures for meeting standards and guidelines arising from the Association (Network) European Quality Assurance (ENQA). The College administration in cooperation with program committees put regularly efforts on development of quality management and preconditions for the well-functioning Quality Assurance system are in the implementation and development process. Procedures for permanent reviewing of study programs and necessary institutional framework (including several committees, Quality Assurance Office) are established. In order to collect feedback from stakeholders, special questionnaires are elaborated

and the system for regular surveys and analysis of feedback results are introduced. All these activities support also elaboration and implementation of the master program in Business and Management.

6. Recommendations

Below are summarized some recommendations that can support the elaboration and implementation of the master program in Business and Management.

- The College have to clearly set the responsibilities and competencies of people who are responsible for the elaboration and implementation of the new master program in Business and Management taking also into account that academic staff should have relevant publications in business and management fields. That is the most crucial issue for the elaboration and implementation of the new master program in business and management intending to admit 100 students every year.
- The elaboration and quick implementation of concrete plans for staff development which includes also measures for increasing the motivation of young faculty members to successfully finish their PhD studies is unavoidable. International experience of teaching staff, their good proficiency in English as well as research experience and outcome in the business and management fields (including also relevant publications) should be the most important criteria for the recruitment and promoting of new faculty members involved in the education of master students in business and management.
- Remarkable attention has to be devoted to the internalisation of the program focusing on the specific needs of international collaboration in the fields of business and management studies.
- In order to support students' international mobility and creativity, the elaborated study plan should include more possibilities for flexibility in taking courses and in compiling individual study plans. The improvement of study plan's flexibility will give more possibilities to business and management students for compiling their own curriculum following their study and research interests and taking also courses from other programs of the College (e.g. European Studies, Law, Security) or even from other HEI-s in Kosovo and outside.

- Development of new interactive teaching methods allowing improving students' creativity and abilities to effectively integrate theoretical knowledge and practical skills is necessary. It is recommendable to elaborate and implement plan of measures that support and motivate teaching staff in development of their modern pedagogical skills and teaching methods taking into account also peculiarities of business and management studies.
- The College should implement concrete measures for the increasing the motivation of faculty members for applying new research projects in business and management fields and for successful participation in the professional and research networks (including also international networks and projects).
- It is recommendable to put remarkable attention to the development of the activities and composition of the program committee including all stakeholders (faculty members, employers, students, graduates, etc.). The discussions and decisions of program committee meetings should be correctly documented and available for stakeholders.
- The program committee as well as College administration have to correctly monitor and evaluate the elaboration of all concrete plans and measures elaborated for the development and implementation of the master program in Business and Management (e.g. internalization; recruitment and retraining of academic staff; development of research and networking activities, etc.) taking into account specific needs and challenges of business and management fields.

7. Final conclusion

The experts do not yet recommend the accreditation of the elaborated master program in Business and Management. Additional developments are necessary.

4.3 Bachelor Program in General Law

Expert: Ass. Prof. Ingeborg Mottl, University of Salzburg, Law School, Austria

Date of site visit: 13. - 14.06.2016

I. Introduction

The following findings and recommendations are results of the on-site-visit of the external expert (= EET) evaluating the description of the Bachelor Program in Law according to the Self-Evaluation-Report (SER see p. 144 - 227) and the meeting with representatives of the faculty on 14th of May 2016 to discuss their application for the re-accreditation of the Bachelor Program in Law.

Application for accreditation of a bachelor program in General Law (LLB) in 2011 and 2012 with an application for a program in General Law with a European focus.

In addition the expert has asked the members of the faculty to deliver the following documents after the meeting. These documents were handed over to the expert by KA-Agency.

The expert has the following comments on the additional documents:

1. List of all law students with internship in the academic year 2015/2016 with detailed information about the institution/company where students are/were employed

The list was created by the Career Development Office which has started its activities in 2015. Data of students that have currently an internship or have finished internship/work at affiliated institutions/companies (Post & Telecommunication of Kosovo/Legal Department, Central Bank/Legal Department, Court of Appeals of Prishtina, Shita Law LLC or ISPE College) were listed up (63 students in total).

39 students have already finished their internship. 2 of the students worked for Shita Law LLC and their internship was converted to work. 7 students worked at ISPE College and were also converted to work. In the other cases the internship wasn't converted to work. Beside this the expert misses data according to the duration of the single internship.

In the opinion of the expert ISPE College should increase the number of institutions where students can be engaged for an internship.

2. Detailed information about the joint study-program in general law with the University of Bremen: including information about the number of students in this program and the single subjects students attend together with students of the University of Bremen: in Pristina and in Bremen; information about the staff members of ISPE who are involved in this program

The detailed information received includes the following documents:

- **Agreement of Cooperation of the Department of Law (Uni Bremen) and ISPE College 2011 and 2015**
- **Students Exchange Agreement (Appendix to the Agreement of Cooperation of the Department of Law (Uni Bremen) and ISPE College) 2015**

According to the Students Exchange Agreement each institution may send up to 3 students each year for a full year or up to 2 students for a semester.

- **Agreement regarding common Course Sessions with University of Heidelberg**

According to this agreement regarding common course sessions graduate students from Heidelberg (20 persons) and Pristina (20 persons) were enabled to take part in a bi-national workshop (1 week of policy-oriented academic seminar) in June 2015 dealing with the post-conflict of peacebuilding in Balkan countries ("International Post-Conflict Peacebuilding: Lessons from Kosovo") in Pristina.

There was also organised a joint-course with students from Heidelberg and Pristina at ISPE College in Pristina in the summer semester 2016 („International Post-Conflict Management on the Balkans“).

- **Agreement Implementation Participants**

These data point out that since the academic year 2011/2012 ISPE College has sent 11 students in their exchange semester at Bremen University.

ISPE College has organized four common sessions with the Heidelberg University since academic year 2012/13 (per the agreement and planned syllabi). 88 students had the possibility to study in Heidelberg (outgoing) and 49 students from Heidelberg visited ISPE College (incoming).

These data verify the actual implementation of the proposed programs for the expert.

3. Full CV-List of Staff (EURO-Pass) in ENGLISH with detailed information: male/female, full-time/part-time, program³

The following persons are not listed as staff members of the law program in the SER (see detailed information SER – study plan): But the expert received their CVs:

- Beutler Bengt – doesn't hold lecturers
 - Gorani Arbër – doesn't hold lecturers
 - Mazrreku Avni - doesn't hold lecturers
 - Veseli Besa
 - Selimi Selim – doesn't hold lecturers
- **Falke Josef** is listed as a staff member in the SER, but he doesn't hold lecturers.
 - **Besa Veseli** teaches the subject „EU Environmental Law“, but she has no academic law degree (neither on bachelor nor on master level or a PhD-degree).

The expert therefore recommends to change this situation and to select a staff member with a PhD-degree for this subject.

- **Faton Maloku** holds a doctor-degree of the Faculty of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences and a master-degree of the Faculty of Mining and Metallurgy in the direction of Technology - "Environment protection engineering" (Mitrovica). His publications are also in these fields of his academic experience.

The expert therefore recommends a change according to the subject “Administrative Law” or “European Criminal Law” because this subject cannot be held by a professor without a law degree.

³ College ISPE provided more information to explain the remarks of the experts within the comments on the Draft Report (27-06-2016) according to the contradictory information about the staff situation present by the SER. Experts try to understand the situation. But in order to keep good international standards in preparation and education the experts recommend an urgent change in the preparation of the next evaluation process.

Beside this specific information the expert is confronted with very different information/data:

- Some of the staff-members are not listed in the overview.
- The list in the overview (see SER p 332) is again different to the list according to the law program (see SET p. 162).
- At the end the requested information (neither all the requested CVs nor the requested overview with detailed information) was not delivered in a sufficient way to the expert.

4. List of publications 2010-2015 of staff

The expert received a list of publications of some staff-members, but within the list there were also persons listed up (Prof. Falke) who are no more engaged in lectures within the law program.

5. List of literature according to EU-law which proposed as necessary literature for single subjects of the law program

The list of literature according to EU-Law is sufficient but should be increased in the future.

6. List of Database – law program

The list of database for the law program is sufficient but should be increased in the future.

7. List of internship possibilities for students

The current list of internship possibilities for students include institutions/companies with which ISPE College has signed cooperation agreements was received by the expert:

- Post and telecommunication of Kosovo/Legal Department; Sales & Marketing Department
- Central Bank of Kosovo/Legal Department; Economic Planning Department
- Shita Law LLC
- Court of Appeals of Prishtina

In the opinion of the expert ISPE College should increase the number of institutions where students can be engaged for an internship.

8. Manual of the process of application for a Bachelor-Thesis

The Manual of the process of application for a Bachelor-Thesis describes the process of application and corresponds to academic requirements. Nevertheless the manual has been used since 2013 and should be revised in 2017.

9. Database and Overview for all (re-)accreditation of the law program including the recommendations of the EET and their implementation

10. Database according to the incoming and outgoing students within the period 2010-2016

ISPE College has made specific effort in the last years regarding the recommendations of the experts and therefore e.g. changed the curriculum as well as the offered amount of ECTS in some cases. Beside this the library was enriched and more books are now available in English language for staff and students. Changes were made at the Council Regulations as regarding the plagiarisms and the measures to be taken against it as a preventive measure.

II. General Findings

The aim and the profile of the study program in Law is to offer a contemporary curriculum in the newest country in the region which is based on international standards of higher education and which will train students by quality cadre in order to serve labour market (see SER p. 162-164). The program should be relied on other programs of European Universities.

The program focuses on graduates from high school with interest in future work at legal institutions, private companies and legal consultants as well as notary or executors offices (see SER p. 163). Beside this the program focuses on a profound knowledge of European Union market in the field of European Union law (competition and labour law).

The SER contains information about the expected study outcomes, the theoretical and practical/experimental study correlation, internship, conditions of registration and admission of students and a research plan for the program (see p. 163-166).

The SER states that all recommendations of the last expert panel of accreditation and assessment report were implemented. It is obvious to the Expert that there have been significant changes within the law program since the last evaluation process (see p. 164).

The Bachelor Program is now structured as a classical law program which should provide students with basic knowledge of European Union Law. The program last 4 years and offers a total amount of 240 ECTS (during 8 semesters). **But the offered amount of ECTS each semester doesn't correspondent to the description in the overview (see SER p. 165) because the amount of ECTS in the 2nd, 3rd and 7th semester is not 30, but only 29!**⁴

In the academic year 2012-2013 only 52 and in the academic year 2013-2014 only 39 students instead of the planned 100 students were enrolled. In the following years the number of enrolled students was also only about 60-70 students a year (2014-2015: 68 students and 2015-2016: 65 students; see SER p. 332). **The expert**

⁴ College ISPE provided more information to explain the remarks of the experts within the comments on the Draft Report (27-06-2016) according to the ECTS-information present by the SER. In order to keep good international standards in Higher Education Programs the experts recommend an urgent change in the preparation of the next evaluation process and the data offered in the SER.

recommends the limitation of the number of new students for the following academic years with 70 students a year for the following three years.

The SER (see p. 337) informs the expert that the passing rate of students in the last three years in the law program was 59%, but on the other hand only 2 students dropped out within the last three years. **The expert cannot classify this.**

Based on the available documents and on the discussion with management of the expert is convinced that the proposed Law Program is a classic study program. The facilities and opportunities as outlined in the SER are sufficient for the moment. The program must be strengthened in the future to make sure that the program covers the needs and opportunities of the mission and vision of ISPE.

During the SVP the expert was unfortunately not able to discuss curriculum, teaching and research during the meeting with the responsible person for the law program with Dr. Iva Zajmi (see SER p. 162). Instead of her the founder of ISPE College was present during the meeting to discuss the single issues with the expert.

Beside this the schedule for the (re-)accreditation which was handed over to the expert didn't list Dr. Iva Zajmi as responsible person for the law program. Instead of her Bashkim Musliu and Sheherzada Murati were named as responsible persons of the study program. In the opinion of the expert Bashkim Musliu who holds a PhD-degree in Philological Sciences is not able to be responsible for a law program.

III. Recommendations

The expert suggests the following recommendations:

- The staff-situation seems to be unstructured and confusing. It was not obvious to the expert which person is a staff-member/teaches and which person is only on the list but doesn't hold lecturers.
- The expert recommends again that ISPE College should ensure the development of staff. Therefore a specific training-program (on academic level) with modern teaching methods should be implemented and training-courses in research methods, the improvement of language capacities and more time for research should be offered.

- For the achievement of the European academic standard it is also necessary to increase the number of female staff as soon as possible (as recommended already before by the expert).
- The expert again suggests the enlargement of the library possibilities and the offer of more books and international data basis both to the students and the staff.
- In the opinion of the expert ISPE College should increase the number of institutions where students can be engaged for an internship.
- **The expert recommends that a law subject can only be lectured by a legal professional/person with an academic law degree.**
- **The offered amount of ECTS in the 2nd, 3rd and 7th semester is not 30, but only 29 and therefore doesn't correspondent to the European Transfer System. The offered amount of ECTS must be changed to 30 ECTS!**

Recommendation for (Re-) Accreditation Decision:

Study Program "*Law*" with the academic degree "Bachelor of Laws" (LLB)

5. Recommendations

The Expert-Team recommends the (re-) accreditation of the following programs:

- Accreditation of the BA program in Economics for 3 years is recommended.
- Accreditation of the MA program in Business and Management is not recommended.
- Accreditation of the Bachelor Program in General Law is recommended.

This recommendation is based on the Draft Report and the Comments of ISPE College (27th of June 2016) according to the experts remarks. The conditions for this recommendation are:

- The discussion about the contradictory information according to the staff situation (see FR p. 26, remark 3)
- The necessary change of offered ECTS-points for several subjects as recommend as an urgent change (see FR p. 29, remark 4).