



Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

ILIRIA COLLEGE

INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

T	ABLE (OF CONTENTS	2
1.	INTI	RODUCTION	4
	1.1.	Context	4
	1.2.	Site visit schedule	5
	1.3.	A brief overview of the institution under evaluation	6
2.	INST	FITUTIONAL EVALUATION	6
	2.1.	Public mission and institutional objectives	6
	2.2.	Strategic planning, governance and administration	7
	2.3.	Financial planning and management	14
	2.4.	Academic integrity, responsibility and public accountability	15
	2.5.	Quality management	18
	2.6.	Learning and teaching	22
	2.7.	Research	24
	2.8.	Staff, employment processes and professional development	26
	2.9.	Student administration and support services	29
	2.10.	Learning resources and facilities	30
	2.11.	Institutional cooperation	32
3.	PRO	GRAM EVALUATIONS	33
	<i>3.1.</i>	Bachelor of Law	33
	3.1.1	. Mission, objectives and administration	33
	3.1.2	. Quality management	35
	3.1.3	. Academic staff	35
	3.1.4	. Educational process content	36
	3.1.5	Students	37
	3.1.6	Research	37
	3 1 7	Infrastructure and resources	38





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

3	2.2. N	Masters of Management, Business and Economy	39
	3.2.1.	Mission, objectives and administration	39
	3.2.2.	Quality management	41
	3.2.3.	Academic staff	42
	3.2.4.	Educational process content	43
	3.2.5.	Students	46
	3.2.6.	Research	47
	3.2.7.	Infrastructure and resources	48
4.	OVERALL EVALUATION AND JUDGEMENTSOF THE ET		49
5.	APPENDICES5		





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 16th - 17th May 2019

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Dr. Anca Prisacariu
- Ms. Keti Tsotniashvili
- Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum
- Prof. Dr. Mirjana Pejic Bach

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Avni Gashi, Acting Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation

Sources of information for the Report:

- Self-Evaluation Report (SER) submitted by Iliria College;
- Information obtained during the site visit;
- Meetings conducted with the management of the institution, teaching and administrative staff, students, graduates, external stakeholders and employers of graduates;
- Supplementary documents requested by the ET (Appendixes 1, 2 and 3).

Criteria used for the institutional evaluation:

• KAA Accreditation Manual





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.2. Site visit schedule

16 th May 2019	
19.45	Meeting at the reception of the hotel
20.00	Working dinner
<u>17th May 2019</u>	
08.40	Meeting at the reception of the hotel
09.00 - 10.30	Meeting with the management of the institution
10.40 – 11.50	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative services
12.00 – 13.00	Parallel meetings with the heads of study programs
13.00 – 13.50	Lunch break
13.50 – 14.50	Visiting tour of the facilities
14.50 – 15.40	Parallel meetings with teaching staff
15.50 – 16.40	Meeting with students
16.50 – 17.40	Meeting with graduates
17.50 – 18.40	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
18.45 – 19.00	Internal meeting – Expert Team and KAA
19.00 – 19.15	Closing meeting with the management of the institution





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

Iliria College was established pursuant to the Article 22 of the Law on Higher Education, registered as a legal person with competent bodies, and licensed by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST).

The college began its activity in 2001 as a private institution which combines the Albanian educational tradition with contemporary concepts; the institution is member of the Balkan Universities Network.

The college offers bachelor studies in the fields of Bank, Finance and Accountancy, Management and IT, International Business, Computer Sciences – Applied IT, Law and International Relations and Diplomacy, as well as Master degree studies in Bank Finance and Accountancy, Management and IT, Civil Law and Health Management. Studies are organized in Official Languages, English as well as languages of the communities pursuant to Article 5 of the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo, and the Law for the use of languages in the Republic of Kosovo.

2. INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION

The institutional evaluation consists of 11 sub headings through which the administration, organisation and management of the institution, as well as teaching and research are assessed.

2.1. Public mission and institutional objectives

According to the SER, the mission statement of the institution is as follows:

Create capable, courageous and independent graduates, generators of employment and competitors at national and international markets. These graduates shall achieve a high level of academic competence through its activity and institutional commitment to active involvement in research and scholarship processes.

The mission statement is defined in a way that it includes teaching and research; however, the third main pillar of a higher education institution - community service - is not included in the mission. Also, the current mission statement could easily be transferred to any higher education institution in the world; therefore, the ET believes that the mission statement should present to the internal and external community what distinguishes Iliria College from other institutions. The ET considers that the mission wording is not sufficiently clear, specific and distinguishable, so that to provide an effective guide for strategic planning, decision





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

making and operations of the institution. Also, it was confirmed during the site visit that there is little use of the mission statement in guiding strategic and operations management.

The mission statement has been adopted in 2001; while the management of the institution mentioned that the mission has been revised since, during the meetings conducted by the panel it was unclear what elements were revised and when, nor was there any evidence of the consultation processes associated to the mission revision.

As observed in the meetings conducted by the panel, the mission statement seems to be recognized by the members of the academic community of the institution. However, the formal mission statement of the college could not be located on the institutional website; the college should therefore increase its effort to disseminate the mission amongst internal and external stakeholders.

Medium and long term institutional objectives, as reflected in the Strategic Plan, are consistent with and support the mission.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Adjust the format of the mission statement so that it is clear, specific and distinguishable;
- 2. Revisit the mission statement so that it reflects the uniqueness of the institution and what it distinguishes it from other providers;
- 3. Ensure that the mission statement revisions are based on consultation processes involving external and internal stakeholders;
- 4. Increase the dissemination of the mission statement across the academic community, including by publishing it on the institutional website;
- 5. Ensure that the mission statement is sufficiently specific to provide an effective guide for strategic planning, decision making and operations of the institution.

2.2. Strategic planning, governance and administration

The Strategic Plan of the institution has been developed for the period 2018-2022 and it identifies the following core strategic aims:

- 1. Research;
- 2. Learning, teaching and assessment;
- 3. Innovation and engagement;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

4. Environment, staff and IT strategy.

For each of these, the strategic plan determines principles, key objectives and key priority areas. In some of the strategic aims, the strategic plan includes Characteristics of Critical Success.

The strategic plan has been developed by a Committee that had in its composition representatives of all internal and external stakeholders: the leadership of the college, professors, representatives of the labour market (2), students (1) and alumni (1). However, there is no evidence of consultations being conducted outside the format of the Strategic Plan Committee. In this regard ET has requested the minutes of the Board Meeting where the strategic development plan was discussed. The minutes, dating 05/05/2017 mention that there was a "short presentation done on the draft Strategic Plan, which highlighted the involvement of various stakeholders, through meetings and workshops that are held at the College". However, there is no evidence on the results of the consultations with stakeholders, such as labour market representatives, students or alumni, other than the ones represented in the strategic planning committee.

The strategic plan does not take full and realistic account of aspects of the internal and external environment affecting the development of the institution, such as the specific needs for education and training in the region, visa liberalisation in Kosovo as a challenge of internationalisation, etc and there is no evidence of SWOT and PEST analysis that have led to the current version of the strategic plan.

The strategic plan does not allocate resources (material, human, financial) and assigned responsibles for each of the objectives. Under these circumstances, it is unclear how does the institution plan to use the strategic plan as a support for decision making in resource allocation and whom to hold accountable for each objective. During the site visit the ET has learnt that the leadership of the institution finds it impossible to do a specific budgeting for the strategic plan; moreover, the institution was unable to describe what the process of aligning the strategic plan with annual and longer term budgets was.

The annual budget for 2018-2019 academic year includes the broad budget lines related to the core strategic aims; however, due to the fact that the strategic development plan does not include any specific actions and measurable outcomes, it is not clear based on what data is the budget allocated. The ET strongly suggests that the college refers to strategic planning theory and best practices in other higher education institutions to observe that budgeting is a condition of the efficiency and effectiveness of the strategic planning process.

Furthermore, the strategic plan does not include any timelines, and measures, targets or KPIs (numbers and percentages for each of the objectives); the ET is therefore unsure how does the





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

college evaluate the progress of its actions, if they are heading in the right direction, with the right speed and, most importantly, identify when it has achieved the set objectives.

The ET notes that the key objectives are very general: for example, the college plans to "support staff to develop and enhance their skills and capabilities and to maximise their contributions", but it does not clarify how this will happen, it does not provide progress targets/KPIs, associated budget, how many staff, how many trainings, etc; similarly, the college plans to "maintain and further develop a research infrastructure and organizational culture of the College, to encourage and support research and teaching of the highest quality", but it does not clarify what is the associated investment, what is the specific infrastructure to be developed, what is the understanding of research and teaching quality, progress targets/KPIs, among others.

The college should consider developing an annual action/operational plan either to narrow down the institutional strategic objectives on a more short-term scale and assign specific actions supporting the achievement of strategic objectives, as well as to include the allocate resources, timelines, responsibles and measurable indicators; the ET believes that such operational document would help the institution better follow and monitor the its priorities.

According to the strategic plan document and to the meetings conducted by the ET, the college did not develop and formalise relevant procedures to ensure that the strategic plan is monitored on short and medium term targets, and outcomes are evaluated.

According to the Statute, the main bodies of the College are the following: the Board, Rector, College Senate, Education/Scientific Councils of the Faculties (Departments), Deans and the Council of Deans.

1. The College Board, as the main governing body of the College, is, according to the SER, "pursuing study curricula, the academic staff structure, level of success at work, the organizational level of management, and all other matters of interest for a further enhancement of the activity advancement"; the specific responsibilities of the Board are regulated in the *Regulation on organization and activities of the College Board*. According to the Statute, the "members to the Board shall be appointed by the Board of Shareholders", but the specific criteria for nomination, as well as the process associated to the appointment are not transparently defined and published in the regulation or in the Statute of the college. At the time of the site visit, the Board was made of national and international professors, as well as one representative of the business sector. According to the Statute, "one member of the Board shall be a student appointed by the Student Parliament"; yet, according to the Board composition





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

submitted by the College as part of the supplementary documents request (see Annex 1) no student was listed as a member of the Board at the time of the site visit;

2. According to the Statute, the Rector is the "main manager of the College, is responsible for effective and regular operations of the College, and shall enjoy the necessary authority to exercise such duties". Even if not listed in the Statute as a main governing body/decision maker, it was the impression of the ET that the College President is the "de facto" manager of the college. In spite of its formal role and responsibilities, the rector did not respond to any of the questions of the ET (all relating to the management of the college that would normally be within the remit of the Rector - mission, strategic planning, governance, ethics, quality assurance, etc). According to the Statute, the College President responsibilities are restricted to signing financial statements, signing purchase and sale contracts with amounts higher than 50.000€ a year, long-term liability contracts and other duties as assigned by the Shareholders Board. In spite of the Statute provisions and considering the state of affairs at the time of the site visit, the ET strongly believes that the roles and responsibilities of the rector and college president are not differentiated and followed in practice. We therefore believe that the institution should revisit its governing bodies structure and conduct an effectiveness and efficiency analysis of the current task division: for example, the roles of the rector or the president are not explicitly required by the National Law of Higher Education, should the college consider one of them as futile and decorative role, it could be made redundant.

The roles and responsibilities of the Rector and College President are defined in the Statute; however, the criteria and process for the appointment of the two positions are not transparently defined and published (the statute mentions that "the Rector shall be appointed by the absolute majority of the Board, in compliance with the present Statute", but the process and criteria are not clarified further).

3. The College Senate is the highest academic body of the College, which, according to the SER, "reviews study curricula, structure of academic personnel, and level of success at work, management activities and weaknesses, and all other matters of general interest". The specific roles and responsibilities of the Senate and provided in the *Regulation on organization and activities of the College Senate*.

According to its Regulations and to the Statute, the Senate is made of:

- Rector;
- Pro-Rectors;
- Deans of all academic units pursuant to the Statute;

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Three members elected by the academic staff (PhD) from each academic unit;
- One assistant teacher elected from each academic unit:
- Two member students elected from each academic unit;
- Three members elected by the non-academic personnel of the College;
- The Secretary General of the College is a permanent member of the Senate, without the right to vote.

The process and criteria for election of the three members elected by the academic staff (PhD) from each academic unit, one assistant teacher elected from each academic unit, two member students elected from each academic unit and the three member elected by the non-academic personnel of the College are not transparently defined and published in any formal regulation of the institution.

According to the *Regulation on the organisation and activity of the Senate* "the senate has the duty to elect members of the College Board appointed by the college"; however, according to the Statute, all the members of the Board are appointed by the Shareholders. The ET finds this aspect as well unclear and confusing.

- 4. According to the Statute, "the Council of Deans is a body of the College". The Statute does not define the roles and responsibilities of the Council of Deans. According to the SER, the Council is a consultative body providing proposals, conclusions and recommendations in regards to the teaching process, the dynamics of assignments, regularity of lectures, quality of lectures by professors, engagement in research and scientific activities, initiatives for developing cooperation with other institutions within the country and abroad and inform on all problems faced in the teaching and learning processes, and alternatives for their solution. The ET finds these responsibilities partly overlapping with the role of the Senate.
- 5. According to the Statute, the faculties are managed by the Deans, whose duties are clearly regulated in the same documents. The Statute also regulates that "the Deans and pro-deans shall be proposed by the Rector, and appointed by the College Board. Candidates for dean and pro-dean shall be individuals with relevant academic qualifications and be skilled and experienced in management". The criteria and process associated to the proposition and appointment are not transparently defined and published in any formal regulation of the institution.

Based on the arguments given above, the ET can state that the election criteria and processes of the decision makers and other elected positions are not clear, transparent and published in institutional regulations, and they are in part overlapping and unclear, which do not provide for an effective and efficient management of operations of the institution. The ET is also





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

concerned that the lack of transparency in the proposals/appointment/elections of these structures and individuals leaves room for subjective judgements and double standards, as opposed to ensuring the professionalism and competence of candidates.

Also, the responsibilities of the decision making bodies are not defined in such a way that the respective roles and responsibilities for overall policy and accountability, the senior administration for management, and the academic decision making structures are clearly differentiated and followed in practice.

According to the Statute of the college, students shall be represented in the College Board and the Senate; however, as mentioned before, the ET has learnt that it was only the Senate that had the student representatives among its members.

The mechanism for electing student representatives is not clear. For example, the procedure on electing the members of the Senate indicates "The Student Parliament exercises its influence in the College Senate through 2 (two) student members (20%-25% of the total number) with the right of vote". However, the composition of the Senate currently shows 8 student representatives. Thus, the regulation and the actual practice contradict to one another. Through its comments in the accreditation draft report, the institution mentioned that there are indeed 8 students, each if the 4 academic units delegating 2. However, the ET is still unclear as to why this is not reflected correctly in the formal procedure.

The students the ET has met during the site visit were not aware of the procedures for student representatives to be elected as members of the governing bodies. The student election procedure is not defined in any internal regulation of the college.

The institutional administration is not effective in terms of organization: the ET learnt during the site visit that the management and administration representatives are confused and inconsistent about the task division in the areas of finance, quality assurance, and human resources management, such as: who collects the budgetary proposals from departments, to whom is the monitoring of expenditure reported, who compiles them for the overall submission to the Board, who drafts and conducts surveys, who collects and analyses the data, who collects information on staff research output, etc.; therefore the ET can state that the administration does not function rigorously.

According to the interviewees the panel has met, the staffing levels and resources available to the administration are sufficient for its functioning. Generally, the background and qualifications of the individuals are in line with the position they occupy. The responsibilities of administrative staff are clearly defined in position descriptions; however, job descriptions are only made available to the individual after signing of the contract (the area of human resource management is further detailed under Standard 8 below).





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Compliance level: Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure that the strategic planning processes include broader consultations with all internal and external stakeholders, outside the formal composition of the Strategic Plan Committee;
- 2. Revisit the strategic plan so as to provide resource allocation (material, human, financial), assigned responsibles and timelines for each strategic objective;
- 3. Associate measurable targets and Key Performance Indicators to each strategic objective in the strategic plan;
- 4. Draft and adopt action plans that narrow down the institutional strategic objectives on a more short-term scale and assign specific actions supporting the achievement of strategic objectives;
- 5. Ensure that the strategic plan takes full and realistic account of aspects of the internal and external environment affecting the development of the institution;
- 6. Revise the financial planning process so as to ensure that the strategic planning is integrated with annual and longer term budgets;
- 7. Ensure the effective and transparent monitoring and reporting on the implementation of the strategic plan on short and medium term;
- 8. Clarify, regulate and make publicly available in institutional regulations the criteria and processes of election/appointment of all governance and management positions (Board, Rector, President, Senate, Deans, etc);
- 9. Ensure that the mechanisms for electing student representatives in the governing bodies is clearly explained in internal regulations and ensures a democratic, transparent and non-discriminatory election procedure;
- 10. Ensure that the regulations established by the institution are respected in practice:
- 11. Revisit the organization chart so that the responsibilities of the decision making bodies are defined, clearly differentiated and followed in practice to ensure the effective governance and management of the institution, such as avoiding the overlaps between the President and Rector, the Senate and the Council of Deans, etc.
- 12. Revisit institutional regulations so as to avoid the existing contradictions, such as appointment of the Board members;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 13. Ensure the actual implementation of the formally adopted policies and procedures of the college, such as respecting the position of the rector, as long as the Statute defines the role as the main manager of the college;
- 14. Review the administrative structure in order to provide a more clear, predictable and intuitive task division between all institutional services.

2.3. Financial planning and management

The institution can demonstrate that it has sufficient financial resources in the short (one year) and medium term (a minimum of three successive years) to adequately reach its mission; however, the ET is concerned about the college financial sustainability considering that the funding comes mainly from student enrolment fees, donor revenues, research activities of institutes, training courses and professional activities. The ET is also alarmed by the contradictory financial information provided in the SER and in the 2018/2019 budget. For example, according to the SER, the revenue generated from student payments is 1,850,000 EUR and the revenue generated from research activities is 100,000 EUR, while the data indicated in the budget for 2018/2019 academic year is 3,802,000 EUR and 25,000 EUR respectively.

Moreover, based on the income statements 2016-2019, as well as on the forecasts for the upcoming 3 years, the ET believes that the college is very dependent on student fees and does not have sufficiently diversified income sources, especially if we consider that the student drop-out rate is, on average, 26% at Iliria College and the student enrolment in Kosovo is decreasing.

The ET considers that the core strategic aims of the strategic development plan are reflected in the annual budget; however, since the strategic development plan does not include the activities, timeline and the expected outcomes, ET cannot assess whether the activities and the allocated budget lines are aligned or realistic.

The oversight and management of the institution's budgeting and accounting functions are carried out by the finance office responsible to the Secretary General. However, as mentioned under Standard 2, the task division in the area of finance is very ambiguous: the interviewees the ET has met in the area of finance and administration were unable to indicate who does what in terms of: collecting the budget proposals from individual units, merging them in preparation for senior management approval, who is responsible for budgetary forecasting and forecast analysis, etc.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Also, none of the college staff the ET has met in the area of finance and administration were engaged in the strategic planning process in order to assess the feasibility of the plan and its associated actions.

Accounting systems comply with accepted professional accounting standards. There is an accurate monitoring of expenditure and reports are being prepared by the finance department and reported by the Head of Administration to the Secretary General on quarterly and annual basis.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure appropriate budgetary allocations for all areas to adequately reach the institutional mission:
- 2. Ensure the financial sustainability of the institution by reducing the dependency on student fees and ensuring more diversified financing sources;
- 3. Integrate the financial and strategic planning processes so as to ensure the feasibility of the strategic plan and its associated actions;
- 4. Clarify the roles and responsibilities in the area of finance.

2.4. Academic integrity, responsibility and public accountability

The college has developed a Code of Ethics that is, according to the SER, "dedicated to the academic staff, management staff, administrative staff and support staff". The code includes the areas of possible ethical misconduct, such as inappropriate behaviour, criminal act, discrimination and hatred, political activities, misuse or forgery, student maltreatment, breach of contract, misuse of the college funds and property, confidentiality, beneficial inappropriate conduct, alcohol and illegal substances, violent behaviour, and the failure to do requested reporting. However, the code of ethics does not emphasize values such as academic freedom, institutional autonomy, academic integrity and avoidance of plagiarism.

Moreover, it is unclear to the panel why the Code of Ethics does not apply to students as well. In this regard, the college has developed a separate Code of Conduct which, among others, gives emphasis to academic freedom, institutional autonomy and plagiarism.

The college has also elaborated a "Guideline on prevention of Plagiarism" which includes the definition of plagiarism in research and it also indicates that "research institute provide software that automatically checks for plagiarism research works and publications (papers,





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

references, scientific articles, dissertations, monographs, textbooks, manuals, course assignments or theses submitted for obtaining "Bachelor", "Master", "Doctor of Sciences" degrees." However, during the interviews the ET has learnt that the software does not work for Albanian language papers, and the supervisors review the literature of individual academic papers. Thus, it is unclear how does the college follow the guideline indicated in its regulation.

The college has elaborated the "Regulation on the Procedure and Disciplinary Measures", which defines the disciplinary procedures for staff and students and it also distinguishes minor disciplinary violations from the serious ones. The list of disciplinary violations does not include issues such as violation of the code of ethics by students or staff. The regulation also gives the list of possible measures that will be taken in case of a disciplinary violation. For example, the disciplinary measures for students can be the following:

- Written remark;
- Expulsion from the faculty for 6 months;
- Expulsion from the faculty for a year;
- Expulsion from the faculty for two years;
- Permanent expulsion from the faculty;
- Permanent expulsion from college.

However, the regulation does not define the principle for imposing the above mentioned measures to students' disciplinary violations, thus it is unclear which disciplinary measure shall be applied to which violation.

The institution has established the *Disciplinary Commission* responsible for the analysis and resolution of eventual violations in the code of ethics from staff and students. However, according to the SER, "due to a great and continuous workload of the College in managing teaching and learning, and covering on student demands and requirements, this Commission in practice does not have much to do". The activity of the Disciplinary Commission is monitored by the Quality Promotion Office.

Based on the meetings taking place during the site visit, the ET concludes that the staff and the students are not aware of the regulations referring to safeguarding ethics and the related disciplinary measures. Moreover, there is no evidence that the institution is applying these regulations and procedures on activities related to management, administration, teaching and research.

The official website of the college includes information about the programmes and the research activities conducted at the college. The institution does not publish its internal regulations, procedures, self-evaluation reports and decisions of governing bodies on its





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

website. Also, the ET could not locate on the website information regarding to college academic staff, the number of students enrolled, the teaching, learning and assessment procedures used, the pass rates and the learning opportunities available to its students, graduate employment information, scholarship opportunities, as well as tuition and administrative fees.

Compliance level: Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure that the Code of Ethics for staff includes values such as academic freedom, institutional autonomy, academic integrity and avoidance of plagiarism;
- 2. Revise the guidelines for plagiarism so that they include principles not only in research, but also in teaching, management and administration;
- 3. Define clear rules and procedures for detecting cases of plagiarism and revise the *Regulation on procedure and disciplinary measures* so that it emphasizes the sanctions related to plagiarism;
- 4. Increase the application of the *Regulation of Procedure and Disciplinary Measures* so that to ensure that the respective measures are implemented in a transparent and objective manner;
- 5. Improve the *Regulation of Procedure and Disciplinary Measures* so that to ensure that it is in line with all internal regulations and guidelines related to ethical and academic integrity issues;
- 6. Increase the institutional dissemination of all internal provisions relating to ethics and discipline amongst students and staff so as to increase their awareness;
- 7. Ensure that all internal regulations, procedures, self-evaluation reports and decisions of governing bodies, information on academic staff, the number of students enrolled, the teaching, learning and assessment procedures used, the pass rates and the learning opportunities available to its students, graduate employment information, scholarship opportunities, as well as tuition and administrative fees are made publicly available on the web page of the institution in easily available locations.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2.5. Quality management

Iliria College has described its quality assurance policy and system in the following documents: Statute of the college, College Policies to Enhance the Academic Work and Quality Assurance and Quality Enhancement Standards and Guidelines.

According to the Statute, "the evaluation shall cover the efficiency and effectiveness of the College in all its areas of functions. It shall provide the units and governing bodies with indicators of assuring and improving quality, and decisions related to personnel and organization".

As it is described in the Statute, the quality assurance mechanisms include the evaluation of teaching by students at least twice a year through anonymous questionnaires. The questionnaires are compiled by the study commission of each academic unit and the 10% of the best assessment scores in teaching are published. The ET would like to remind the college that all survey results should be made publicly available, not only a positive selection (*KAA Accreditation manual*, Standard 5.11) so that to increase the transparency and trust in the instrument and, on the long term, contribute to higher response rates.

The Statute is also mentioning that, in the case of academic staff evaluation by students, the chair of the study commission discusses the results of evaluation with teachers that are in the lowest 10% of ranking in the evaluations and agree on the measures that should be taken to improve the teaching quality. In order to promote the continuous development of quality in teaching, as well as institutional and individual commitment to quality culture, it is essential that the evaluation results are discussed not only with the staff with lowest evaluation results, but with all teaching staff in order to plan further improvement of courses and teaching practices or to share the good practices.

Although the Statute mentions that the quality assurance system covers all areas of activities of the college, it only describes the student surveys on teaching quality as a quality assurance mechanism. The Statute does not specify the unit responsible for the implementation and development of the overall quality assurance system and it does not define the quality functions across the institution. The *College Policies to Enhance the Academic Work and Quality Assurance* repeats the content given in the Statute and it additionally defines the procedure for the establishment and operation of the Quality Assurance Commission, and specifies the methods of quality assessment.

According to this regulation, the chair of the Quality Assurance Commission should be an external expert appointed by the College Board. However, the document does not mention who are the other members of the commission, thus it is not ensured that the quality





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

committee members are drawn from all types of members of academic community, including students.

According to the SER, the central unit that coordinates the quality assurance activities at the college is the Quality Promotion Office; however, neither the Statute, nor the college policy on quality enhancement or the quality promotion standards and guidelines define the functions, responsibilities and the reporting of this Office. The ET learnt during the site visit that all units are involved in the quality assurance processes, but the ET found that their clear roles and responsibilities are not described in the regulations.

In spite of college representatives claiming to promote a quality culture, the ET considers that at the moment, the level of development of the quality culture across the institution does not support the development of the institutional operations. The very idea of quality culture is not well defined, spread or promoted across the institution. The institution should increase its efforts to promote the development of quality culture as a common understanding of quality values, for which every individual of the organisation is responsible, a set of shared ideas, beliefs and values about quality united when everyone inside the academic community is sincerely engaged and motivated.

In terms of methods of quality assessment, the policy document focuses on the quality assessment of teaching. The *Quality Enhancement Standards and Guidelines* describe that the college takes the following quality assurance and improvement measures:

- Course evaluation questionnaires for students to address the competence of the teaching personnel, quality of teaching, available resources and infrastructure, and the learning success (achievement of learning outcomes) relative to the published course contents, learning outcomes and assessment regulations, methodology of teaching and time spent;
- Lecture Observation; Classroom visits by colleagues as a measure of internal peer review;
- Support service evaluation questionnaires for students (all support services);
- Support service evaluation questionnaires for teaching staff (primarily libraries, IT services and international office);
- Feedback questionnaires for alumni and members of the labour market as well as visits at potential workplaces to address the requirements of the market;
- External peer review evaluations as a tool for strategic planning: it addresses the position within the European Higher Education Area and gives recommendations for future development.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

During the site visit the ET has learnt that the surveys are conducted in hard copy "because the electronic system does not allow anonymous survey"; the ET finds this approach untrue and once again directs the college to consult the general practice in other higher education institutions, taking into consideration that most colleges globally have shifted to soft copy versions of surveys while safeguarding the confidentiality of the responses.

The results of the surveys are centralised and analysed in the internal MIS. During the site visit, the ET has learnt that the college considers the results of quality assurance in the decision making process, such as changing a professor, improvement of IT system, among others.

However, the ET notes several inconsistencies that should be pointed out:

- The document states that the course evaluations are carried out at least once in every three years. Thus, there is contradiction between the regularity of the surveys indicated in the Statute and the Quality Enhancement Standards and Guidelines. The ET has learnt that, in practice, some of the surveys, e.g. student surveys on courses and teaching staff, are conducted at the end of each semester;
- The results of the quality assessment are not made publicly available (with the exception of the 10%, as detailed above), but are discussed in meetings with the teaching staff;
- No action plan for improving the teaching performance is agreed with the individual academic staff member;
- It is the view of the ET that the quality assurance functions are not integrated into normal planning and development strategies as the quality promotion office is not involved in monitoring of the achievement of the strategic plan;
- The ET notes that the college has established the policy and procedures for quality assurance, but the procedures described in different documents do not coincide with one another (for example, according to the Statute the evaluation of teaching and learning quality should take place twice a year, but according to the guidelines they take place once every three years), and there is no clear description of the functions, responsibilities and reporting related to the implementation of the quality assurance system;
- The regularity of the other surveys is unclear during the site visit the ET learnt that the last survey for graduates has been conducted two years ago, there is no evidence of the survey for employers being conducted (as concluded from the meetings conducted during the site visit, as well as through the *Quality Commission Activity Report*, submitted as supplementary document);





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- The survey questions should be phrased more specifically so that the collected data is detailed enough to serve as a basis for improvement. For example, it may not be enough to learn "How satisfied are you with the library?", if one cannot know if a potential low satisfaction refers to the opening hours, loans system, training of library staff, individual and group spaces, etc;
- The self-evaluation report samples submitted as supplementary documents to the ET follow the structure provided in the KAA templates; therefore, the ET is concerned that the quality assurance system is driven by the external processes the college is undergoing (program and institutional accreditations) and not by the internal commitment for the constant quality improvement;
- There is no coordinated process for the surveys to be themselves regularly evaluated and improved.

Generally, the ET has not found any evidence that the college develops its own quality assurance system in order to maintain the quality of its operations. The internal quality assurance system is not integrated into the day-to-day activities of the college, but rather it seems to function in order to meet KAA's standards. From the perspective of the ET, therefore, there is more work to be done by college authorities and staff in achieving a better balance between external and internal quality assurance. The ET believes that the current system does not provide enough space for self-analysis and self-criticism, the opportunity for a department, or whatever entity, to present its unique features and to internalise the process. Overall, there is no evidence of a functional internal quality assurance system with periodic analysis at all levels of the college and annual self-evaluation reports, analysis and action plans to improve the weaknesses. The internal evaluation processes are almost entirely linked to external evaluation processes. There is no systemic quality management of any institutional area - strategic planning, human resources management, study programs, etc, as demonstrated in other areas of the report.

Compliance level: Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Improve the regulations related to quality assurance so as to ensure that they are consistent, they do not overlap/contradict each other, and clearly describe the quality management mechanisms, instruments, timeframes and responsibilities of all the involved parties;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 2. Formally define a clear description of the functions and responsibilities and reporting of the Quality Promotion Office;
- 3. Ensure that the results of all surveys conducted at the institution are made publicly available;
- 4. Explore alternative solutions of conducting all surveys electronically, while safeguarding the anonymity of the respondents;
- 5. Ensure that survey results are discussed with all individual staff so that to contribute to action planning processes and serve as a base for continuous development in the quality of their teaching;
- 6. Ensure that the quality assurance committee is selected through transparent and objective procedure and that its members are drawn from all types of academic community, including students;
- 7. Increase the internal commitment for the constant quality improvement and develop the quality culture across the institution so that it supports the college in the development of its operations;
- 8. Ensure that quality assurance functions throughout the institution are integrated in a defined cycle of planning, implementation, assessment and review and that the data is used to guide enhancement;
- 9. Improve the role of the QA system in the processes for planning and development and its use in the daily strategic and operations management;
- 10. Conduct regular evaluations to produce self-evaluations reports that provide an overview of performance for the institution as a whole and for organizational units and major functions within it;
- 11. Regularly review the effectiveness of the quality assurance mechanisms and ensure that they generate valid data that facilitates decision making process at the college;
- 12. Ensure data collection instruments (such as satisfaction surveys) are conducted amongst all internal and external stakeholders;
- 13. Clarify and ensure the regular implementation of satisfaction surveys amongst all relevant parties;
- 14. Ensure surveys are constructed in a way that they provide sufficient detail so as to effectively serve as a base for improvement.

2.6. Learning and teaching





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The organization of study programmes is regulated in the Statute of the college, according to which the contents of the curricula for all study programs are defined according to a proposal of the Expert Groups for each program and approved by the Education/Scientific Council of the Faculty, and approved by the College Senate. Each study program shall contain:

- 1. Study title;
- 2. Study type;
- 3. Academic degree (title);
- 4. Enrolment conditions;
- 5. Objectives and outcomes;
- 6. Details on curriculum;
- 7. Value of ECTS (courses, diploma thesis);
- 8. Conditions for individual studies;
- 9. Student evaluation form.

According to the Statute, the content of the curricula for teaching are determined by the regulations prepared by the Academic Council of the respective faculty, thereupon approved by the Senate for each level of study. However, such regulations have not been referred to during the site visit.

The Statute does not provide any information regarding the process of curriculum development or stakeholders involved in the process. The college does not have a procedure for monitoring the effectiveness of the policies and procedures of academic program development and implementation.

To ensure the quality of implementation of academic programmes, the college conducts student surveys as well as lesson observations, where the colleagues observing the lecture give feedback to the lecturer. The extent to which a particular problem has been remedied is observed through the following student survey.

The institution has not defined any indicators to monitor the quality of study programmes and to ensure that they meet the required standards. The ET has learnt about some examples that the curriculum has been changed based on the feedback received from students, but there is no evidence of a formal procedure for making the amendments in the programmes.

As confirmed during the meetings conducted by the ET, there is no formal process of engaging representatives of graduates or employers in the establishment of new schools, programs and programme amendments.

The expected learning outcomes for each program are in line with the National Qualifications Framework and the European Qualifications Framework for Higher Education. Teaching staff are appropriately qualified and experienced for their particular teaching responsibilities.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Some of the stakeholders have pointed out that the college should pay more attention to student assessment and ensure that grades actually reflect the achieved learning outcomes and the academic rigour is ensured.

During the site visit all other stakeholders pointed out that the practical component of the study programmes should be improved. It was also underlined that students lack the soft skills that are needed in the labour market and the institutions should pay attention to this area as well.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET Recommendations:

- Develop an effective system and regulation that clearly describes the procedure for the development, approval and revision of the academic programmes which, among others, also includes the roles and responsibilities of relevant units and stakeholders in this process;
- 2. Develop the procedure to review the effectiveness of the process related to development and implementation of the study programmes;
- 3. Revisit the system for monitoring of performance at the level of study programs: define and monitor KPIs, analyse, identify and investigate differences in quality between programs, and take action required to ensure that all programs meet required performance standards;
- 4. Ensure the engagement of alumni and employers in program development;
- 5. Ensure that the student assessment is based on transparent and objective criteria and reflect the actual learning outcomes achieved by students and graduates;
- 6. Increase the practical component of the teaching and learning process, work-based training and improve the connection with practitioners.

2.7. Research

The institution has defined research as one of the core strategic aims in the strategic development plan for 2018-2022. According to the strategy, the college shall develop and maintain a whole series of intensive research projects in Kosovo and the region. The research objectives indicated in the strategic development plan are the following:

• To achieve and maintain an important role for the increase of quality in education in the region by 2022;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- To develop and further improve an ambitious and dynamic research culture supporting both creativity and achievement at both an individual and collective level;
- To maintain and further develop a research infrastructure and organizational culture of the College, to encourage and support research and teaching of the highest quality;
- To support young researches and provide possibility for research in international level.

The strategic objectives for research activities are general and the ET could not identify the specific areas on which the institution will focus and to what level does it aspire to develop its research activities. For example, the first item is to increase the quality in education - this is a general statement that can be applicable as one of the purposes of research generally, but this does not reflect the specific research objectives of Iliria College.

The college has also developed a work plan for scientific research, the Science Research and Development Plan 2018–2022, which consists of the following items:

- Creation of an institutional prospect of science research priority setting, expansion and strengthening;
- Creation of a sound financial foundation;
- Creation of an appropriate environment for scientific research, with a view of staff enhancement;
- Increased cooperation with the business community and public sector;
- Increased scientific debate at College and nation levels;
- Fostering and increasing publication volumes;
- Regular review and revision of Science Research and Development Plan to guarantee its efficiency;
- Improvement of research management structures.

The ET observes that the institution has two different documents that aim to provide information related to research activities; however, they include different lists of strategic objectives. The work plan offers information related to research performance indicators and benchmarks as well as the related budget allocated by the institution.

The budget of the institution indicates a budget line for research and scientific activities which is 289,716 EUR for 2018/2019. However, during the site visit the ET has found out that the teaching staff are not aware of the procedure on how to request research funding from the institution, and most of them have not benefited from the institutional funding to support their research activities or participation in conferences. The regulation on procedures of "Award of scientific titles, teaching titles, professional teaching titles and associate title" defines the research performance as one of the criteria for staff advancement.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Teaching staff could not refer to their cooperation or the functions of the research institute or research office operating at this institution; according to the regulation on scientific research, the Research Office is responsible for the coordination of research activities at the college and according to the SER the research activities are coordinated by the Scientific Research Institute.

The work contract template with academic staff includes the obligation of conducting research activities, participation and presentation of their research in conferences, engagement of students in research activities and indicating their research findings in their courses. According to the contract, professors are obliged to produce at least one scientific publication per year, published in ILIRIA College or in a foreign scientific journal.

As it was mentioned under Standard 4, the college has a code of conduct for staff, but it does not include the articles related to ethical principles in research.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure that the documents that define the development of research activities are consistent, and that research objectives and priorities are clearly defined considering the resources and profile of Iliria College;
- 2. Develop a transparent procedure for applying for funding of research activities by students and staff, and ensure its transparent dissemination and fair implementation;
- 3. Define the unit that is responsible for the coordination and support of the research activities (Research Office or the Scientific Research Institute) and ensure that the unit is consistently mentioned in all regulations;
- 4. Enhance the capacity of the unit responsible for research activities to ensure that it efficiently supports staff and students' participation in research and improvement of research performance;
- 5. Revise the code of ethics and ensure that ethical principles related to research activities are also emphasized in it.

2.8. Staff, employment processes and professional development

The college did not develop an employment handbook that collects the rights, responsibilities, recruitment processes, performance evaluation, promotion, support





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

processes, professional development, promotion, etc for either academic or administrative staff.

The Statute of the college includes the description of the recruitment process, qualification requirements and duties and responsibilities of the academic staff. According to the Statute, all academic personnel shall be appointed by the Rector, based on a transparent and public procedure. The applications for academic positions are reviewed and then interviewed by an evaluation committee and reported to the rector for appointment.

The college has also developed a separate procedure on "Award of scientific titles, teaching titles, professional teaching titles and associate title", which repeats the qualification requirements for each type of academic staff; however, the procedure, which is described in more detail, contradicts the text of the Statute. For example, according to the Statute, the committee submits the selected candidates to the rector for appointment, while according to the other regulation, the committee submits the selected candidates to the dean, and they are are then appointed by the majority of votes of the Senate.

During the site visit the ET has learnt that the announced positions include the qualification requirement, but did not include the full position descriptions and conditions of employment; staff are informed about these only after recruitment.

In terms of requirements for administrative staff, the statute gives a very general description for the recruitment of senior management, e.g. it mentions that "the Secretary of the college shall be appointed by the Board, as per proposal of the Rector, based on a public recruitment process". As for the other non-senior administrative staff, the recruitment process is not described at all. The responsibilities and qualification requirements of administrative staff are defined in two documents - the Statute of the college (for senior administrative staff only) and in the regulation on "Organization and Systematization of Working Positions of the Administrative staff". The ET has noted that the two documents also contradict each other in some areas. For example, the qualification requirements for the Secretary, described in the latter document, indicate a few additional requirements, such as knowledge of English Language and define the years of experience required, while those requirements are not mentioned in the Statute. As it was described under Standard 2, the division of tasks in some areas, e.g finances, quality assurance, human resource management are not clearly defined and separated.

Generally, the background and qualifications of the individuals are in line with the administrative and academic positions they occupy. The level of provision of teaching staff is adequate to the programmes offered at the college.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

As it was mentioned under Standard 5, the college evaluates the performance of its teaching staff through student surveys and lecture observation; in case of unsatisfactory evaluation, the results are discussed between the individual staff and the department head.

Although research outputs are considered while awarding academic titles, the research performance of academic staff is not included in the overall staff-assessment system. The institution also does not include the self-assessment as a tool for staff performance evaluation.

The institution has not developed a system for the performance evaluation of its administrative staff.

The professional development opportunities that are supported by the college include participation in conferences, producing publications and training. However, there is no formalized procedure established by the college to collect the needs for professional development or to apply for the related funding. It is notable that the college has allocated sufficient budget for "Professional Advancement and Staff Training" for each faculty separately.

Compliance level: Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Develop an employment handbook that collects the rights, responsibilities, recruitment processes, performance evaluation, promotion, support processes, professional development, promotion, etc for both academic and administrative staff;
- 2. Ensure that the regulations that provide information regarding the recruitment process, qualification requirements, and responsibilities are consistent to each other;
- 3. Develop a transparent and objective procedure for recruitment of all administrative staff;
- 4. Ensure that the duties and responsibilities for all administrative staff are clearly defined and include all of their key responsibilities and reporting channels;
- 5. Ensure that the academic staff evaluation system with the students' and peer evaluation also includes the self-assessment mechanism, which is to be carried out at least once a year;
- 6. Review the overall staff performance evaluation system for all staff and ensure that the evaluation mechanisms include all of their activities and the results are used for monitoring and improvement of their performance;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

7. Elaborate a professional development system which includes the needs assessment, strategies for provision of relevant support, procedure for applying for institutional funding for professional development purposes.

2.9. Student administration and support services

The admission requirements and procedure at Iliria College are defined in the Statute according to which the conditions for enrolment to undergraduate studies in the College are the following:

- Successful completion of secondary education in Kosovo, certified by a diploma;
- Successful completion of primary and secondary education outside of Kosovo, with at least 12 years of education, proven by a relevant diploma;
- Special authorization issued by the Ministry.

The information regarding the admission procedure is published on the official website of the institution and the application can be submitted online on the college website. The website also includes information on the programs and services provided by the institution.

According to the SER, the college allows students to pay the tuition fee in several instalments, which reduces the students' financial burden. The college also considers the student's social-economic background and academic success and has fee-waiver possibilities. However, the procedure and criteria for receiving the financial support are not made publicly available.

The institution collects and stores the data on students' profile, progression and career paths through a Management Information System (MIS). There is no evidence on how the institution is using this data to support decision making processes and improvement of academic process quality.

The ET has been concerned with the student drop-out rates, which average at 26% annually thus, it means that approximately half of the enrolled students cannot graduate. The reasons behind this data have not been analyzed in the SER; during the meetings conducted by the ET, low level of high school quality was named as one of the main reasons. The ET considers that the institution should prioritise more the investigation of the reasons for high drop-out rates and take relevant actions to address them, among others to reconsider the admission requirements, teaching, learning and assessment methods and student support services.

The college has not developed a student handbook and the main source of information for students is the college website or the administration office.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The College has career development, graduate support and student support offices that help the student with academic and career guidance. The social and extracurricular activities are organized by the student activity centre. The performance of their activities is assessed through student surveys.

The has learnt during the site visit that the teaching staff and the students are not aware of the official procedure for student appeals, as such issues are usually solved informally. This issue was not included in any of the documents provided by the college.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure that the procedure and criteria for receiving the student financial support is transparent, objective and publicly available;
- 2. Develop a student handbook covering all information relating to admission, progression, recognition and certification, regulations, the rights and responsibilities of students, actions to be taken for breaches of discipline, responsibilities of relevant officers and committees, and penalties that may be imposed;
- 3. Develop a student appeals procedure and ensure that it provides clear grounds on which academic appeals may be based, the criteria for decisions, and the remedies available; ensure that students and staff are informed about the procedure;
- 4. Ensure that data on student profile, academic progression and career paths is regularly analyzed and the results are used for further decision making and improvement; special emphasis should be made on the student drop-out rates;
- 5. Provide psychological counselling for students.

2.10. Learning resources and facilities

During its tour of the facilities, the ET has found that the college has adequate and clean classrooms and offices. However, one of the buildings hosting offices for administrative staff is not properly maintained. Also, the ET was concerned whether the capacity of the classrooms is adequate to the number of students (2000 students). The ET is aware that the college is building a new facility in the city centre and the related budget for this work is already allocated.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The college has a library that also includes a reading hall. Through the collaboration with the National Library, ILIRIA College has made direct subscriptions to several International Electronic Libraries.

- Cambridge University Press;
- Oxford University Press;
- OpenEdition;
- eDuke Journals;
- IOP Publishing;
- IMF e-Library;
- The New England Journal of Medicine;
- Edward Elgar Publishing;
- ASTM Compass;
- DOAJ Directory of Open Access Journals;
- DOAB Directory of Open Access Books.

The library is managed by a librarian which records the loans and returns of the library material through excel sheets. In order to ensure the provision of relevant literature, the academic staff submit to the library the bibliography indicated in their syllabi, so that the learning resources are updated accordingly. The library is not equipped with spaces for group work or isolated spaces for individual work. The college does not provide the facility or other learning resources adapted to students with special needs. However, although the building does not have an elevator, the college can accommodate students with physical disabilities on the ground floor of the building and the college staff assist students to navigate.

The college has two well-equipped computer labs and a photo-copying facility is available to students free of charge. There is a cafeteria space located on the ground floor and outside of the building, but food or snacks are not provided.

In terms of safety measures, the fire exits are in place, the college has first aid boxes, but the medicine inside are expired. The college has a cooperation agreement with the hospital located about 5 minutes away from the college, which is ready to assist in case it is needed.

The provision and quality of the college premises and facilities are included in the students' and staff surveys.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Allocate spaces for students' individual and group work;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 2. Define the priorities for development of the facilities and the learning resources for students with special needs and allocate the relevant budget;
- 3. Ensure that the first aid boxes have the validated items that could be safely used if needed.

2.11. Institutional cooperation

Iliria College has developed a strategy and policies for international cooperation for 2018-2022, which identifies the following priorities for its institutional cooperation:

- 1. Participation in International Project through the Project Department of ILIRIA College and maintain the already developed international projects;
- 2. International cooperation in research and innovation;
- 3. Organization of International Exchange programs;
- 4. Organization of International mobility activities, such as Voluntary work and job shadowing for ILIRIA College students;
- 5. Organization and participation of International Conferences;
- 6. Membership in International Higher Education Networks.

The activities for institutional cooperation are coordinated by the International Relations and Career Development Offices. The college has established memorandums of cooperation with relevant local and international organizations, and is presented as partner institution in various Erasmus+ mobility projects. As a consequence, the college has quite a large number of both incoming and outgoing staff and students, which the ET acknowledges as a good practice.

However, as it was underlined during the site visit, one of the weaknesses for development of institutional cooperation is the lack of skills or interest from staff members to initiate and participate in projects. The International Relations Office offers consultation for students to guide them in participating in international mobilities.

The college has also implemented various developmental projects with the support of the international organizations, such as USAID, UNDP, British Embassy in Kosovo, etc. Iliria College organizes various events, such as conferences and summer schools in cooperation with its partners. In order to maintain the links with its alumni, the graduate support office has been established. The college also has established memorandums of understanding with employers that offer various internship or employment opportunities to students and graduates.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Enhance the capacity of the staff in areas such as language skills, project writing, etc. to promote their participation in international projects;
- 2. Indicate the participation in the international projects as one of the performance evaluation criteria for staff;
- 3. Increase the institutional cooperation with regards to research activities.

3. PROGRAM EVALUATIONS

3.1. Bachelor of Law

Iliria College has asked for the re-accreditation of the study program Bachelor of Law (LLB). This four-year (eight semesters) program is focused on Administrative/Constitutional Law, Criminal Law, Civil Law, International Law and Financial Law and is established in the Faculty of Law of Iliria College since many years.

3.1.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The mission of Iliria College as to be a contemporary place of study, research and transfer of knowledge, which serves as a connecting bridge (integral) in the region, and offers programs which prepare students with professionalism, impartiality, serving with critical and analytical skills in the field of jurisprudence, community equipped leaders, discipline and professional the ethic.

The object of the study program is the legal system in the offered branches (civil, criminal, administrative, financial, and international, etc.) The study program of the Law Faculty enables the students with consolidated knowledge on the national and European legal culture, in the historical level, as well as in the doctrinal and practical levels. The program includes the study of public and private law, developing analytical and interpretive skills necessary for solving the problems by implementing the law. The curriculum is built on the market requirements for students to be able to participate in legal reforms, exchange of knowledge, methods and best professional practice, giving contribution as informed students of the developments in the field of local, regional, European and American jurisprudence. A primary objective is the necessity of preparing students who are participating in the Legal





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Clinic for free legal aid to be able to be part of various projects, from the drafting of legislation, issues of economic development, social until the formalization of the economy business, poverty reduction, property rights, impartial system of justice, effective and professional.

In order to fulfil these goals, the faculty has worked out and established some special programs as an offer for the enrolled students and cooperation with different stakeholders in the region and abroad. In this context, it must be underlined that the college has recognized the relevance of legal clinics.

Therefore, with full support of the USA Embassy, the College has started in 2015 to implement the project: 'Developing Human Capacities and Institutionalization of Legal Clinic Studies in Arbitration'. The objective of the program is to develop sustainable curricula in the area of commercial law and international sales law. During the implementation the project a workshop was organized with a professor from Nebraska University to develop a sustainable curricula in the area of commercial law and international sales law, which will be incorporated as part of the study program, which will be based on hypothetical problems and developing human capacities in that field.

The unemployment of lawyers is a big challenge in the Republic of Kosovo. Therefore, there is a big need to collaborate with enterprises and administration to enable the students for juridical work in practice. Respecting the engagement of the Faculty of Law in legal clinic it would be good to elaborate as well as more cooperation with all fields of work for layers.

In this context, it is as well necessary to check the number of reasonable study places regularly. In the additional documents requested by the ET, Iliria College presented the development of enrolled students in the last ten years. The number of enrolled students varies between 111 and 263 per academic year. The college should give in a reasonable manner accountability about the adequate number of students to enrol, respecting the needs of the labour market and the offer of other universities and colleges in the Republic of Kosovo.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Work out further cooperation with enterprises and administration in all fields of work for lawyers;
- 2. Explain the number of provided study places for the next years.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

3.1.2. Quality management

The implementation of the study program by the teachers is coordinated through the quality promotion office, monitored and evaluated through the internal structures of the study program and the respective department. Subsequently, appropriate recommendations, in coordination with the quality promotion office, are approved by the Quality Council, which are then returned to the academic unit for implementation in the specific program. These recommendations include all necessary measures to improve the quality of program implementation, including advancement of the staff, upgrading the infrastructure, organization and student support.

The Self-Evaluation Report of Iliria College gives a long list of activities realized as a usual quality assurance process (pages 242-247). This list of activities is imposing. However, during the site visit conducted by the ET, the staff and the students were not able to describe concrete actions induced by the quality assurance process of the Faculty of Law. The faculty of Law has in a reasonable way to prove that the criteria written in the Self-Evaluation Report are continually realized and to enumerate in an action plan which ameliorations are aspired next.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Prove in a reasonable way that the criteria written in the Self-Evaluation Report are indeed continually realized in the academic routine;
- 2. Enumerate in an action plan which ameliorations are aspired next.

3.1.3. Academic staff

The academic staff of the study program includes thirteen full-time professors and six part-time professors. In relation to the 141 new enrolled students in the academic year 2018/2019 (in the academic year 2017/2018 all four years together added up to 604 students), it is an acceptable number.

According to the meetings conducted by the ET during the site visit, there were different opinions about the necessity to establish special time to discuss several problems of the students directly with the teaching staff in an open manner. According to the interviews, there is already an intensive and individual electronic contact between professors and students,





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

such as three or four contacts after every lesson concerning the content of the courses. On the other hand, electronic contact cannot substitute a face-to-face discussion. There was consensus about the goal to encourage students as far as possible for independent academic work. That way there is no need for a uniform approach much more it seems to be useful to realize the contact to the students in a varied manner.

About the realization of the law clinic, the representatives of the academic staff clarified that there is no separate performance for the practical implementation of law, but it is implemented in the courses described in the syllabus. The professors are aware of the need to realize even more law clinic in the study program.

There was an open discussion about employment of more part-time professors realizing a more various teaching staff with practical experiences, where the possibilities of special contracts have to be checked.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Verify if it is useful to identify law clinic more clearly in the curriculum;
- 2. Extend the number of qualified part-time or full-time professors.

3.1.4. Educational process content

The Law LLB program was already re-accredited several times, where the standard of Western European Law was each time attested. There is no substantial modification in the program since the last re-accreditation and, based on the SER and the meetings conducted by the ET, there is no reason to question this standard.

According to the meetings taking place on the site visit, one of the benefits of classes having less students is that it allows for a closer relationship with the professors. The many practical components of the Program as Law clinic and internship are also highly appreciated, together with the usefulness of the library and that the professors give scripts usually. Observing so much praise doubts are reasonable if the representations of the students gave their free independent meaning.

On the other hand, an increase in the English language provision and the increase of the economic context of Law are considered needs of improvement by both the students and the graduates. The employers of graduates and other external stakeholders reminded the





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

importance of enabling students to act independently and underlined the importance of Commercial and Contract Law.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendation:

Further develop the syllabus of the study program in areas such as English language provision and the economic context of Law.

3.1.5. Students

Based on an additional documents request submitted by the ET, the college has submitted a list of the student dropout numbers in the Law LLB program. This document shows that, in the last three years, less than 50% of the enrolled students passed the master graduate. The college has to further investigate the reasons and to introduce more activities to reduce this rate. The college already acknowledges in the Self-Evaluation Report that the knowledge and the abilities of the graduates of schools are not very good in Kosovo. However, the ET finds that it is not enough to explain the situation; the college should work out activities to reduce the dropout rates, such as considering changing the entrance examination.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure that a free and unprejudiced discussion with the students is possible during the next re-accreditation process;
- 2. Extend the exchange between teaching staff and students about the content and procedures of the program;
- 3. Investigate the reasons of the high student dropout rates and to develop activities to address the issue.

3.1.6. Research

The research activities of the study program are reflected very briefly in the Self-Evaluation Report.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The teaching process of the study program in Law is based on the syllabuses prepared by the lectures for each of the subjects. Preparation for the research plan is within the competence of the Rector for Research and Science and also the Coordinator of the Institute for Scientific Research and the Representatives of the Council of the Faculty of Law. This plan which is set each academic year carries out relevant topics that are consistent with the requirements of the market for the relevant program.

The Self-Evaluation Report provides no description of concrete research activities and no details about involving students in research projects.

For a good development of the law system in the Republic of Kosovo it is not enough to teach law and introduce a law clinic, but it is indispensable to enable students to develop research skills in a wider manner. This is particularly applicable for a college that aspires to establish a PhD program in the Law Faculty.

The Faculty of Law has to better prioritise finding research projects and appropriate cooperation with enterprises and administration in the Republic of Kosovo, as well as abroad.

The ET noted the activities Illiria College has already realized in this field, but finds them still not satisfactory. It would be very helpful to report these activities regularly and in a more detailed manner, and to create actions plan for realising this step by step.

The experts has asked the college, in its supplementary documents request, to submit a list of research activities of the academic staff. Unfortunately, most of the links included in this list were not functional. Particularly, these individual performances of professors can of course neither substitute the inclusion of students nor a checkable research plan for the Faculty of Law.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Work out a detailed plan and proof of research projects engaging students;
- 2. Ground a research strategy in the curriculum.

3.1.7. Infrastructure and resources

The infrastructure and resources represent, in general, a big weakness of academic programs in the Republic of Kosovo.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The facility conditions of the college are generally acceptable, and are planned to be more developed in the next years, if a new building is established in the city of Pristina. Nevertheless, there is a cafeteria for students, smaller talk rooms and rooms for individual studies giving, all giving an adequate atmosphere.

The conditions of the library are insufficient. There are not enough books, particularly concerning Kosovar Law. There is to observe a progress providing electronic media.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations

Expand the library infrastructure and resources.

Conclusions of the evaluation of the study program:

The Expert Team considers that the study program Bachelor of Law (LLB) offered by the Faculty of Law of the Iliria College in Pristina is substantially compliant with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 130 students to be enrolled in the program.

3.2. Masters of Management, Business and Economy

3.2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The SER does not provide the elaboration of the mission of the programme in the relation to the institutional mission. However, the heads of study program *Management, Business and Economy* described the mission verbally during the site visit, and it is consistent with the mission of the institution.

According to the SER, the study programme is developed in line with the National Qualification Framework. Some of the learning outcomes of MBE programme are expressed in general terms, e.g. Recognize problems, Work effectively with a team of colleagues on diverse projects. Other outcomes at the level of the programme are either very specific and narrow (e.g. Integrate theory and practice for the purpose of strategic analysis), or are highly broad (e.g. Explain the role of and apply economics, accounting, strategic financial management, human resource management and marketing knowledge and skills in decision





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

making and management of organisations.). This also refers to the learning outcomes of the specialisation in *Banking*, *Finance and Accounting* and *Healthcare Management*.

Most of the learning outcomes of the specialisation *Management and Informatics* are focused on management, and those that are focused on informatics are expressed in high-level terms, and could not be considered as adequate for the specialisation (e.g. Demonstrate a competency for creative problem solving and innovative thinking of technologies as a means to enhance business processing, organizational culture, and other core operations.)

Learning outcomes for the specialisation *International Business* are adequate. Only one of the outcomes is too general, and should be more specific: Describe a range of research methods useful in the conduct of industry and organisation based projects, and discuss their benefits and limitations.

The following learning outcomes for the specialisation *Healthcare Management* is too ambitious and beyond the scope of the programme: Design a program of disease prevention.

The didactic concept can be considered as partially defined. Didactic concept at the level of MBE programme is partially adequate.

The research concept is partially in line with the legal framework and internal documentation, as reflected in the *Regulation on procedures of award of scientific titles, teaching titles, professional teaching titles and associate titles*, as well as *Regulation on scientific research*. Most of the journal publications are not indexed in Scopus and WoS, although some professors are moderately active in that area.

The SER indicates that there are formal policies, guidelines, and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. However, the clear list of documents that would support them is not provided in SER. In addition, they are not available on the institution website (English version). It is not clear if they are available over institution intranet, e.g. Student information systems (SIS). However, SIS is mainly devoted to schedules and exams: "all the students of ILIRIA College have the possibility to follow the schedule of lectures, exercises, tests, tests' results, the attendance results, to declare for elective courses, to communicate with the administration, with professors and other students of the University as well as to directly link with the Electronic Library of the College".

Iliria College has defined the *Regulation on code of ethics for students*, also described in the Self-Evaluation Report. In addition, two regulations regarding teachers and research work are provided: *Guidelines on prevention of conflict of interest in exercising public function*, and *Guidelines on code of ethics*. One document regulates both the activities of students and academics: *College guideline for prevention of plagiarism*.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The SER does not provide information if there were some cases that were treated according to the Code of ethics. However, there is a statement in SER that Disciplinary Commission: "Due to a great and continuous workload of the College in managing teaching and learning, and covering on student demands and requirements, this Commission in practice does not have much to do. The Quality Promotion Office monitors the activity of the Disciplinary Commission." — It is not clear if there were some process or not, since the statement is ambiguous: "does not have much to do". This provides the impression, that although there are numerous regulations, they are not actively used.

The SER indicates that all the relevant aspects (e.g. delivery of the programme) are regularly reviewed. The minor shortcoming is that there are no clear key performance indicators that would allow the monitoring of the progress.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. The learning outcomes of the MBE programme and the specialisations should be better expressed and tailored more in line with the National Qualification Framework;
- 2. The research concept should be better directed towards the publications of higher quality;
- 3. Formal policies should be published online (on the website or student information system);
- 4. The work of the Disciplinary commission is not reported in fully transparent manner in SER. It should be better elaborated.

3.2.2. Quality management

In relation to the quality management of MBE programme at the Iliria College, most of the statements in the SER are provided mainly in a general manner, and there are no specific examples in relation to the Standards 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 2.4, and 2.5.

There is an overall framework for quality management, but it is not fully implemented. For example, although the SER claims that there is "a hierarchic chain of approval of programs", during the conversation with academics and heads of the programme, the impression was that there is no systematic approach towards the programme improvement, and learning outcomes. This resulted in problems related to syllabi, which will be further elaborated in the educational process content.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

There is a regular student survey, and a report for master studies has been provided in order to present the grades of selected professors. The overall evaluation of all subjects and lecturers that were part of this survey were assessed with 9.04. This is rather high grade. However, the report does not provide almost any comments by students on how to improve the teaching, which raises the question of student motivation for filling the survey in relation to the transfer of its results into the teaching practice. This could be considered as minor shortcoming.

The data about the employment has been collected through the employability questionnaire. However, the data about employment is provided only at the Bachelor level, and not on Master level.

The quality assurance arrangements for the program are not clearly mentioned in SER, although they are implicitly present through some statements.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. A more comprehensive approach to quality management needs to be implemented, with a clear time schedule during one academic year;
- 2. Resources devoted to quality management are not sufficient. Most of the tasks are conducted by one research assistant, which is not sufficient.

3.2.3. Academic staff

There are 18 full employed staff, and 11 part-time staff, which is in line with the required standards. The contract for full time employment relationship has been provided and is considered adequate.

The academic staff are motivated, with the enthusiasm expressed in terms of teaching and research, for both research and teaching. However, the impression is that research excellence is not fully promoted among the teaching staff, which is in turn reflected in their publication results, which are modest. More progress should be done in terms of research activities, e.g. in terms of awards for best research papers and/or books (biannually). Quite a number of academics did not express the high proficiency of English language, which could affect their ability to participate in international research, and allow them to use international literature sources in their teaching preparation.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

There is no systematic support for the participation of academic staff at scientific conferences. During the meetings conducted by the ET it was indicated that academics can ask for the support in terms of funding case-by-case, and that all the requests were fulfilled. This however, is not reflected with sufficient participation of the professors at international conferences.

The List of publications by Iliria College staff, participation in conferences, as well as other publications supported by Iliria College has been provided, but it was prepared in sloppy manner. References are not standardized, year of publication is missing in many cases, and indexation information is missing.

Although the SER and additional documents indicate that there is continuous improvement of teaching and syllabi, the impression of the ET is that this was superficially reported, which is reflected in low quality of learning outcomes of syllabi, as reflected in the following section of the report.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. The list of publications of academics should be better prepared and communicated better with academics, in order to entice the research culture;
- 2. Education should be provided in order to improve the academic skills of professors, e.g., organize the workshops on writing, and publishing research papers;
- 3. Academic integrity should also be promoted in the direction of organizing workshops and educational materials for the students and academics on how to avoid plagiarism;
- 4. Improve the English language of academics;
- 5. Organize a systematic support for participation at international conferences (e.g. fixed yearly sum for travelling, registration fees, translation).

3.2.4. Educational process content

The description of the syllabi is overall adequate. The programme is interdisciplinary. Learning outcomes at the level of the programme and specialisation need to be improved, as elaborated under standard 3.2.1.

The programmes of all specialisations are adequate, with the exception of the specialisation in *Management and Informatics*:





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- The description of the programme in SER is as following: "This unique cross-discipline programme combines the expertise in Management and Informatics and offers exciting career prospects that range from project management to entrepreneurship. The programme has been designed to provide graduates from a wide variety of backgrounds with the necessary tools and skills for understanding complex information technology (IT) problems while, at the same time, knowing about the needs and requirements of a modern organization."
- However, this is not in line with the courses offered at the programme, which are mainly oriented towards the management. Students the ET has met indicated that this programme is oriented to learn managers to use information technology (Excel was mentioned), but this is not in line with rapid changes in environment, firstly related to digital transformation, triggered by big data, artificial intelligence and data science;
- The current academics do not have the research results that would indicate their capacity to teach relevant IT-based courses;
- Only two courses that are IT-based are taught at this programme: *Information Systems Management*, and *Database Management*;
- Suggestion is to change the title of this programme or to innovate the programme with more IT courses, and employ the academics with stronger background in Management information systems, that could support the teaching of relevant and modern IT trends.

Overall, the language of the course syllabi should be strongly improved, from both the language and grammar, as well as the content perspective.

The head of the programme claimed that each academic year the teaching and learning indicators are reviewed and evaluated by each department. In this case, the professors, management of the institution, student representatives, quality promotion office, as well as external experts and member of business community, representatives of relevant government institutions (eg. Judges etc.), are consulted in discussing and improving the curriculum in a specific program and the teaching process. However, this procedure seems to be superficial, since the syllabi are overall of rather low quality.

Comments to syllabi (only some examples will be mentioned, but they are present in almost every course syllabus):

- Some statements in the syllabi are not adequate for courses syllabus of the higher educational institution, e.g. "statistics are beautiful";
- General statements are present in some syllabi: e.g. "This course will help students develop their skills, critical thinking, problem-solving, and decision-making";





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Some of the syllabi and their learning outcomes are not related: e.g. "Explicate or project price changes and amounts of goods and services" and course "Advanced strategic management";
- Some of the learning outcomes are vague, e.g. "Analyse sources: strong and weak points";
- Some of the courses use general statements, which are just slightly refined for some specific topic, e.g. "the students shall be able to understand and practically apply the most important processes of human resource management, namely apply the knowledge gained, without any problem, in enterprises";
- Learning outcomes are not expressed for all of the courses, e.g. they are missing for the course Managerial Economics;
- The syllabi for some courses are too short with too little information, e.g. Accounting Management.

Description of master thesis is the same for all specialisations.

The website of the college does not provide a clear picture of the programmes. There is no information about *Healthcare Management*.

In addition, it is not clear from the website that there is one master MBE, with different specialisations. Instead, the specialisations are labelled as masters at the website. This must be changed in order to reflect the real situation. Moreover, the wrong name of the specialisation *Banking*, *Finance and Accounting* is put on the web!

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- Syllabi should be overall improved for most of the courses in terms of language, Suggestion is to change the title specialisation Management and Informatics or to innovate the programme with more IT courses, and employ the academics with stronger background in Management information systems, that could support the teaching of relevant and modern IT trends;
- 2. Master thesis requirements should be specified for each specialisation separately. It can be briefly elaborated, but specific;
- 3. The website should be improved in order to provide more information about the specialisations.





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

3.2.5. Students

The interviews conducted by the ET during the site visit resulted in the following conclusions:

- Overall, students are satisfied with the teaching process, evaluations, and communication with the teachers;
- The perception of the course and teacher assessment, as the tool for improving the quality of the teaching process, was not fully expressed;
- Numerous activities are organized at the College, but the impression is that most of them were not initiated by students;
- Overall, the knowledge of English language of undergraduate students was moderate, indicating the need for better education in that direction;
- The dropout rate is moderate (about 30%), but further elaboration on the reasons for that are not provided in the SER;
- Students are able to participate in various projects, which they appreciate. Some students transferred from public universities to private because of higher flexibility. Studies offered higher structure;
- Technology could be improved, but no specific instructions were given in which direction;
- Accessing the library is considered as positive, but electronic access should be improved;
- Employment of students should be better specified during the education regarding the required skills at the workplace;
- Better engagement in English language education is recommended;
- More additional courses in Excel and QuickBooks, overall IT should be added
- Additional education for Alumni is needed, and should be offered on a regular basis.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. The reasons for students dropout should be investigated, and adequate actions should be conducted in order to decrease the rather high rate;
- 2. The culture for the student-driven initiatives should be promoted;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 3. Usage of student surveys as a teaching improvement tool should be better communicated to students. Students should be enticed to provide more comments on how to improve the teaching process;
- 4. Employment of students should be better specified during the education regarding the required skills at the workplace;
- 5. The need for better education in English and IT would be appreciated.

3.2.6. Research

Although the research activity of the academic staff is in line with the regulations on the governmental and college level, the overall quality and quantity of academic publications is modest and should be substantially improved.

The practice of the publications in the area of *Management, Business and Economics* is not fully in line the Regulation on scientific research, as follows: Article 11 claims that the following publications are supported: "publication of scientific papers in international scientific journals (listed on Thomson Reuters Web of Knowledge, Scopus, or in journals under Administrative Instruction 01/2018 - MEST, Principles of Recognition of Platforms and International Journals with recension)". However, most of the journal publications are not indexed in Scopus and WoS, although some professors are moderately active in that area. Although the college publishes a journal of good quality, it should not be considered as the main venue for publication of local academics. In addition, the journal itself should be better promoted to other institutions. It is recommended to improve the journal according to Scopus criteria for journal inclusions.

The information about number of publications with students is not provided. Students collect the data for research, but usually do not participate in the publication of research.

Publications in fraud journals should be strictly forbidden, as well as engagement of professors in editorial boards of such journals. List of such journals should be obtained from the globally relevant sources.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. In order to improve the quality and quantity of academic publications, workshops on writing and publishing research papers should be organized. Also, workshops about the indexation should be organized;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 2. A list of publications of all academics should be produced once a year and be transparently available;
- 3. More categories should be awarded each year e.g., book, journal, junior, and senior scientists. However, due to the rather small number of scientists at the institution, it would be acceptable if such an approach is implemented every 2 years;
- 4. Publications in fraud journals should be strictly forbidden, as well as the engagement of professors in editorial boards of such journals.

3.2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Overall, the infrastructure and resources are adequate, and in line with the private funding of the college. Future improvement will be needed in terms of technology (computer lab), which will require significant resources. Support from sponsors could be considered for this purpose.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

Future improvement will be needed in terms of technology (computer lab), which will require significant resources, and support from sponsors could be considered for this purpose.

Conclusions of the evaluation of the study program:

The programme has been improved in accordance with the recommendation of the previous accreditation, and the overall impression of the university management and overall academic staff is positive, and have adequate knowledge to provide the relevant educational services to students. In the same time, students were positive about the institution, which is also a relevant resource for the programme.

Several problems should be stressed here:

- The website of the institution does not reflect the realistic information about the master programmes. This should be changed;
- Specialisation in *Management and Informatics* should be changed, since with the current courses it does not have the capacity to reflect the presence of Informatics in its title;
- Educational process content (syllabi) should be strongly improved;





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

• The SER should be prepared in a better manner. A number of general things is written, and that too much text is also provided, with too little examples on how a specific standard has being made.

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program *Masters of Management, Business and Economy* offered by Iliria College is fully compliant with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 75 students to be enrolled in the program.

4. OVERALL EVALUATION AND JUDGEMENTS OF THE ET

The overall accreditation process has been quite challenging in nature: the SER was of very poor quality considering that the institution did not follow the instruction of the KAA SER template to approach each standard individually. Not only that the institution lacked the self-critical and self-analytical capacity (with the exception of SWOT analysis), but it even failed to provide sufficient explanatory/descriptive information for each individual standard in order to allow the experts to assess its compliance; in addition to this, the ET has found the Statute of the college quite challenging, as it indicates articles that are not relevant to the college or contradict to the information given in other regulations. This has been the reason why the ET had to hunt down information in all over 50 institutional regulations, ask specific questions during the site visit and request a considerable amount of supplementary documents; the latter has been successfully provided by the institution.

The college has not always accommodated the needs of the ET in terms of organising the site visit agenda: in spite of explicit requests of the ET to add or remove specific individuals from sessions so that to ensure a fluent and productive conversation, the college did not adjust accordingly.

It was very difficult for the ET to do their work considering the nature of the discussions: while the ET was focus on assessing the standards compliance and asked specific questions in this regards, the institution did (most of the times) not provide the required clarification, in spite of repeated insistence; instead, the interviewees were providing information that was either already covered in the documentation submitted to the team or not judged as a priority by the ET at a particular point of time. The ET underlines that we understand the comprehensiveness of a higher education institution; but since it is not humanly possible to cover all activities during the site visit, we would have appreciated being given the respect and autonomy in establishing the information that needed to be collected and the opportunity





Agjencia e KosovëspërAkreditim AgencijaKosovazaAkreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

to meet our objective. In return, the ET has been explicitly and verbally indicated when to take notes and verbally instructed to ensure that good practices are written in the final report. The team is aware that the institution has good practices, which have been identified and commended, where applicable, in the text of this report and which we encourage, but we underline that the ET has guided its visit by the KAA accreditation manual which instructs that "when judging the accreditation at study program and/or institutional level, it is only the achievement of standards, considered as the minimum mandatory level to be achieved by all education providers, that is taken into consideration". This is why the team was focused on seeking clarifications relating to standard compliance.

Taking into consideration the information detailed in the present report, the Expert Team concludes that:

- 1. Iliria College is partially compliant with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends not to accredit the institution;
- 2. The study program Bachelor of Law (LLB) offered by the Faculty of Law of the Iliria College in Pristina is substantially compliant with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 130 students to be enrolled in the program;
- 3. The study program *Masters of Management, Business and Economy* offered by Iliria College is fully compliant with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 75 students to be enrolled in the program.

5. APPENDICES

Additional documentation requested by the ET (Appendixes 1, 2 and 3).