"PJETËR BUDI" COLLEGE

INSTITUTIONAL AND PROGRAM EVALUATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

12 – 13 JUNE 2016, PRISTINA

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Context

Date of site visit: 12 - 13 June 2016

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Dr. Anca Prisacariu, Quality Assurance expert (Chair)
- Ms. Simona Dimovska, European Students' Union
- Prof. Dr. Tanja Dmitrovic, University of Ljubljana
- Prof. Dr. Kriistina Tonnisson, University of Tartu

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Prof. Dr. Blerim Rexha, State Quality Council
- Ms. Furtuna Mehmeti, Acting Director, Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Mr. Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

- Self-Evaluation Report (SER) submitted by "Pjetër Budi" College;
- Information obtained during the site visit;
    Meetings with the management of the institution, teaching staff, students, representatives of the administration and student services;
- Additional documents and information requested by the ET (Appendix 1);

The Expert Team has accepted and integrated in its report only the information that reflected the institutional reality and state of affairs at the moment of the site visit, naturally not grounding its' decision on the promises of the college.

Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations

- Guidelines for experts for institutional evaluation (KAA)
- Guidelines for experts for academic programs evaluation (KAA)
- Code of Good Practice for Site-Visits

1.2 Site visit schedule

The expert team, KAA representatives and the institution under review conducted the review under the following schedule:

12th June 2016
19.45   Meeting in the Reception of the Hotel
20.00   Working dinner

13th June 2016
08:30   Meeting in the Reception of the Hotel

09:00 – 11:00   Meeting with the management of the Institution
                              - Mission Statement
                              - Organisation and management
                              - Staff
                              - Finance
                              - Development Plan
                              - Quality management
                              - Internationalisation
                              - Recommendations

11:00 – 12:00   Visit to facilities

12:00 – 13:30   Lunch and discussion of ET and Coo. KAA

13:30 – 15:30   Meeting with responsible persons for the study program
(Curriculum, teaching, researches, recommendations)

15.30 – 16.30   Meeting with the teaching staff

16.30 – 17.30   Meeting with students

17.30 – 17.45   ET and Coo., KAA consultation

17.45 – 18.00   Closing meeting with the management of the Institution

18.00   The end of the site visit

1.3 A Brief Overview of "Pjetër Budi" College

According to its statute, "Pjetër Budi" College (PBC) is a private provider of the higher education, of academic and scientific nature in Prishtina, Kosovo. The college presents itself as a higher education institution which organizes and conducts academic studies, Bachelor and Master, professional and scientific activities, as well as commercial consultancy. The institution was founded in 2005 based on the decision from the Board of Directors of the Institute for Studies. It is governed by the Kosovo Law on Higher Education. Its' Statute and administrative guidelines were approved by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST).

According to its' public website, institution is offering the following study programmes: Customs and Freight Forwarding (BA and MA), Tourism and Hospitality Management (BA), Business Administration (BA) including Marketing Management, Banks and Financial Control, Public Administration, Human Resources Management, as well as Insurance (BA) and Management (MA).

As reflected in its strategic plan, "since its' founding in 2005, the College has continuously strived to proceed through reforming, structuring and completion within itself or processes and initiatives that provide the highest possible graduating quality of their students. The College was very active in the social range, world of ideas, initiatives, publications and interrelation with labour market, being fully integrated in the area of higher education in Kosovo".

2. INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION

The institutional evaluation considers 9 sub headings through which the administration, organisation and management of the institution, as well as teaching and research are assessed.

2.1 Mission Statement

First of all, it was difficult for the ET to identify the formal mission of the institution in the SER. It is our impression that there might be a confusion between the terms "mission" and "vision" (maybe a linguistic problem). The format and wording of what the ET assumes is the mission of the College is not in line with what the general theory and practice offers as characteristics of a mission that properly guides upper administration in their decision making; an institutional mission should be brief, distinguishable, measurable and should include the three main pillars detailed below.

According to the SER, "Pjetër Budi" College aims to be "a specialized college in academic shaping of students, a centre of expertise in specific areas of studies influential in the country and the region, and a centre of excellence in the scientific research". The college underlines, therefore, its' commitment for both teaching and research. However, even though it was recommended during the institutional evaluation in 2013 (and the college considered that they have addressed the recommendation accordingly), the current mission does not include the third main pillar of a higher education institution - community service. Regardless of higher education institutions being public or private, they exist to serve the public; community service should therefore be incorporated into the institutional mission.

Secondly, as outlined in the 2013 external review report, as it stands now, the differentiation of the college from other institutions in the region and country is not outlined in the mission.

The institution should conduct a complex and formal consultation process with both internal and external stakeholders in order to agree on what exactly makes this college different from other similar providers, and incorporate the outcome of the consultation into the new mission.

Lastly, the mission statement is not targeted and measurable so the panel is uncertain whether the institution is able to state when its mission is achieved. The mission statement does not seem to guide and provide support for decision making at institutional level; the mission statement should also be more realistic and aware of the context within which the institution is operating.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Revise its' mission and vision statements through a complex consultation process involving external and internal stakeholders;
2. Adjust the format of the mission so that it is brief, distinguishable, measurable, realistic and aware of the context, and includes all three main pillars of a higher education institution: teaching, research and community service;
3. Ensure the proper consistency between mission, vision, objectives and strategic plan so that they all guide the institution in its' decision making and administration;
4. Properly disseminate the institutional mission and vision across the academic community.

2.2 Academic Freedom

The organisation charts were available for the ET in the SER provided by the institution. The main chart is also available on the public website (including on the English version) for all interested parties. All these versions seem to be according to the formal organisation chart in the statute of the institution.

The quality assurance structures are, however, in an unusual position on the organisation chart. The ET considers that quality assurance should be assigned as a clear portfolio (e.g. to one of the vice-deans) that would be directly mandated and accountable for the initiatives and results in this area. As it stands now, the QAC and the QAO do not respond and do not seem to be monitored by anyone.

During the site visit, the academic staff interviewed by the ET did not seem to have any restrictions in conducting their research and teaching.

As part of the supplementary documentation requested by the ET, the College has provided the Regulation on the code of ethics of the college staff, a document adopted in 2012 with the purpose of promoting academic honesty and integrity. The document seems to be slightly outdated since it includes a mission statement that is not in accordance to the other versions the ET has seen on the website, in the SER and Statues. Most importantly, the Regulation is mentioning a Council of Ethics that is no longer present in any of the organisation charts, in spite of the need for a structure to monitor the implementation of the guidelines for ethics, academic freedom, honesty and integrity.

As it stands now, "each academic and non-academic staff is obliged to recognize and respect this Code", while there is no corresponding document offering similar provisions for students. The institution should include students as a group required to adhere to the Code of Ethics, and the Code itself should address all types of working relationships inside the academic community that may lead to conflicts that need resolution through the Code.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Adjust the organisation chart so that the quality assurance structures move under the supervision of an individual;
2. Revise the organisation chart in a way that will incorporate again the Council of Ethics;
3. Expend the remit of the Code of Ethics so that it applies to students as well;

2.3 Academic Programs and Student Management

According to the SER, "the purpose of the programs provided by the College "Pjeter Budi" is to equip students with a. relevant studies that enable them to have a broader understanding of theory and practice in accordance with the *needs of the labour market and employment*" b. achievement of valid results in scientific research, through quality teaching, creativity, *use of best practices in the scientific and professional achievements, meeting the expectations of students, partners in the labour market and international partners, taking into account the South East Europe, always demanding to achieve the European Union standards.* There is evidence that the College has conducted several meetings and focus groups with the representatives of the community and employers. However, the college was unable to provide a list of recent examples of measures taken in order to improve the performance and operations of the institution based on external stakeholders' suggestions. Therefore, it is unclear how the quality cycle is closing in relation to stakeholders' involvement, how exactly does the institution use external feedback in order to improve.

Also, it is unclear how does the institution determine the "best practices in the scientific and professional achievements", as there is no evidence of using similar higher education institutions in order to benchmark the College operations against. This aspect has been further detailed under 2.7 section below.

All the students of the College are obliged to take part in an internship, which the institution does its best to facilitate through an increased dialogue and cooperation with relevant institutions: Association of Kosovo Freight Forwarding agents, Kosovo Customs, among others. The feedback regarding the contribution of the internship towards the personal and professional development of the students has been largely positive. In this regard, the ET would like to commend the activity of the Career Guidance Office for the coordination of the internship programs.

It is of crucial importance for the College to continue tracking its alumni and collect more feedback based on their experiences at the institution. Likewise, the views of the employers with regard to the expected graduate profile should also be constantly evaluated. Both these instruments should be part of the quality cycle given their importance in developing an effective and relevant curriculum that will ensure that the study programs continue to respond to the needs of the labour market.

Other aspects related to learning outcomes, ECTS, teaching and learning, and study programme management can be found under Section 3 of the present report.

Regulations related to student management are spread all over institutional provisions – Statute, Regulation on the organization of exams and evaluation of students and other documents. Currently, there is no proper induction session for new students at the College: staff offer students an informal tour of the facilities and they stop at every office that has a regulation that would be of interest for the recently admitted students. Students are expected

to collect the Statute and other corresponding Regulations in order to familiarize themselves about their rights and responsibilities at the institution.

The institution should therefore elaborate a student handbook that would compile all the necessary information a recently registered student would need in order to get familiar with the institution; this would normally include students' rights and responsibilities, institutional expectations in terms of rules for behaviour, ethics, discipline, academic misconduct, plagiarism and cheating, including sanctions.

The website provides very little of this information. The institution should substantially increase the level of publicly available information in terms of infrastructure, opportunities for accommodation, for scholarships, full and transparent information about the administration and decision making, as well as the academic and administrative fees. The details regarding the cost of education should be available in a transparent manner so that students and their families are fully informed and anticipate the cost of education when making the decision to register. Also, it is recommended for the list of fees to be complete and reliable; when the ET asked for this list as part of the supplementary documentation, some of the items that the experts have found out about during the site visit were missing (e.g. fee for masters' thesis defence).

According to the SER, for the past three academic years the College offered 20 full scholarships and constantly stimulates excellent students with discounts. The ET was provided the Regulation on criteria for partial and full scholarships (adopted in 2011). However, the Regulation seems to be outdated and not in line with current practices; for example, the document enlists that "free education (scholarship) is to be awarded to the students of basic (bachelor) studies", while the ET has evidence that the College has offered scholarships to Master students as well. The SER mentions that "Discounts or partial scholarships are provided to certain categories of the students as well", and that was confirmed during the site visit interviews, but it is not reflected in the Regulation. These two aspects have to be updated in the Regulation for scholarships.

The ET has found out that the institution is offering fee waivers and discounts based on the following grounds: to encourage performance on one hand and to support students coming from socio-economically disadvantaged groups, on the other hand. However, according to the interviews, the criteria of these two types of scholarships have been mixed. We would like to remind the College that these two categories of scholarships have different purposes: first type – the academic scholarships – have the objective to support and encourage excellence and performance, and should therefore be offered only taking into account academic results. The second type – social scholarships – should not take into account academic performance since their purpose is to facilitate the access, progress and completion of higher education studies for students coming from fragile groups and should therefore be offered to students that need them from the socio-economical background point of view. It is very important for their criteria to be kept separately, and it should be reflected and formalised in the Regulation for scholarships. The Regulation should also describe all the administrative steps in getting a scholarship for the students to benefit a transparent and objective process (the exact criteria for each of the categories mentioned above, the documents to be provided as evidence, the selections process, among others).

Regulations on students' appeals are included in the Statute and Regulation on the organization of exams and evaluation of students. During the site visit, the ET has observed that students' knowledge about the appeals system is incomplete and the general impression is that the only instrument in case of disagreement on the grading is to consult

with the professor and discuss on the calculation of the grade. The students interviewed by the ET were not aware of all the further instruments that may follow.

Information about students' participation in the decision making process can be found under section 2.7. Further details about students' feedback in relation to different institutional processes can be found under section 2.9.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Ensure that the suggestions collected form the community and representatives of the labour market feed back into the quality assurance system and serve for future improvement of institutional operations;
2. Draft and formally adopt a student handbook;
3. Organise a formal induction day for all newly registered students to get introduced to the institutional facilities and the student handbook;
4. Increase the level of publicly available information on the institutional website: academic and administrative fees, scholarships, infrastructure, accommodation and decision making process;
5. Revise the Regulation on criteria for partial and full scholarships, as detailed above;
6. Promote and encourage the possibility of students to submit a written appeal/complaint in case of a grading disagreement.

2.4 Research

The research activity at the College is regulated through the Statute and the Regulation on scientific research (adopted in 2008). Additionally, the college has put together the "Internationalization and Research Plan 2016 – 2020", distributed to the ET as supplementary document after the site visit. However, it is not yet clear how and when exactly was this document produced: if it implied an in depth consultation of the academic community, if it was adopted by a management body, if it is based on the current and future actions, funding and plans of the management bodies, if it was internally communicated to all the interested parties, if it involved a SWOT analysis of the internal and external environment and a PEST analysis, if it is based on former version of a strategic plan, etc. Neither from these documents, nor from the interviews, the ET was unable to identify a consistent direction the college is aiming at in terms of research: the Regulation for research is defining as the main objective to "perform the basic scientific research activities in *various scientific fields*"; also, it is unclear whether the staff is expected to contribute to the literature by publishing in top journals or to do research just to be current in what they teach during classes. As already noted in the first two external evaluations, the college does not yet have a clear orientation of areas their research should focus on. The ET can observe that the recommendations provided by the previous teams have not been integrated. These aspects need to be clarified by setting a specific direction for research, in terms of both areas and level.

During the interviews the ET has found out that there are no incentives for the academic staff to carry out research. Those who carry out research and have a proven track record of publications do not have reduced teaching workload, the compensation for attending conferences abroad is not guaranteed and there is no other motivation mechanism. While there were academic staff that had their conference attendance funded by the institution, there were also cases where the staff had to cover the attendance from their private budget.

As part of the TEMPUS project "Encouraging the process of curriculum development based on learning outcomes and research guided teaching", the institution participated in the development of the guidelines with key indicators to monitor and benchmark future research and development activities. However, the indicators are not yet in place; the aim of the College is to have them officially launched by the next academic year. Since the institution is stating that the "majority of these descriptors were already in the place", the ET strongly recommends for the indicators to be more clear, transparent and most importantly, more measurable (adding key targets), which is not the case at the moment. For promotion purposes, the aims in terms of research performance are equally confusing; the college is using words such as "a significant number of" or "a selected number of" referring to the targets individuals have to reach in order to get promoted.

The Regulation for research should therefore provide measurable targets for research activity, including those for promotion purposes, as well as clear incentives for reaching them.

The college is currently publishing the "Logos" magazine, comprised of research papers from foreign and domestic authors. According to the SER, five numbers of the scientific magazine have been published so far and the College states that it will continue to keep a separate budget line for at least one scientific magazine on annual basis during the next five years. However, it came to the attention of the ET that publishing in Logos magazine is quite accessible as there is no sound peer review process.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Set a clear orientation of areas the college wishes their research to focus on, specific direction for research, with clear objectives in terms of both areas and level of results;
2. Establish and formalise clear incentives for the academic staff to carry out research;
3. Determine measurable research performance targets for promotion purposes;
4. Formally adopt and integrate in the institutional practices the key indicators to monitor and benchmark future research and development activities;
5. Reorganize the publishing process of the Logos magazine so that all manuscripts are properly peer-reviewed.

2.5 International Cooperation

According to its Statute, the College has established a Professional Council for Internationalization and Foreign Affairs, which aims to implement the projects that will enhance the research activity through study programs, domestic, regional, international scientific conferences, identify areas of cooperation, joint development and research projects with similar institutions at domestic level and abroad.

For the past years, the college has signed cooperation agreements with "Sv. Klement Ohrid" University in FYROM, Mediterranean University in Montenegro, International Institute for Private, Commercial and Competition Law in Tirana, "Politechnica" University in Bucharest, University of Podgorica in Montenegro, and the Institute for Development and Research in Montenegro and is currently engaged in talks with other institutions.

Currently, the institution hosts 4 international incoming academic staff and 4 international incoming students (from FYROM, Serbia and Montenegro). As for outgoing international mobility, the ET only has information about one PhD candidate currently based in FYROM.

The college has also been involved in 3 international projects in the field of quality assurance and curriculum development.

The initial self-evaluation documentation the ET was provided did not include an Internationalisation strategy. Our impression is that the internationalization segment of the 2016 – 2020 Plan is reiterating what the SER has already introduced to the ET, which is a presentation of the past achievements and vague ideas for the future which are not targeted, measurable, supported by funding intentions or Key Performance Indicators. Should there be a serious commitment and intention in establishing a proper internationalisation strategy/policy, the ET is confident that the College with find enough similar higher education institutions to benchmark with.

Also, the ET has not identified an assigned individual with clear responsibilities in the area of internationalisation. When referring to the scientific publications and cooperation with researchers abroad, individual academic staff have isolated results in international journals and magazines, but mostly limited to initiatives in the region.

Although it is stated that the College is "in contact with various partners across the region and Europe to work together and explore possible funding for increase of the mobility of both lecturers and students", this is highly unsupported by evidence and results. During the site visit, the ET has observed that the internationalisation segment is very much in need of improvement, as the interviewees have repeatedly manifested their willingness to study abroad. While the ET is aware of the distinguishing context of Kosovo, we underline the urging need of the institution to strongly intensify its efforts on this emerging issue, especially taking into account the general European trend towards the internationalization of higher education. There is a large series of projects that can be accessed by the institution in order to increase student and staff mobility, as long as there is a serious commitment and continuous effort for improvement in this regard. The institution should constantly have in mind the fact that the academic community would like the institution to be focused on a more European direction, as expressed by the interviewees during the site visit.

Also, given the expressed dissatisfaction in relation to the teaching staff' level of English, the institution should identify solutions in this regard.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Adopt a proper internationalization strategy/policy that would guide the institutional decisions and resource allocation in this area;
2. Assign a clear portfolio for internationalisation (e.g. to one of the vice-deans) that would be directly mandated and accountable for the initiatives and results in internationalization;
3. Prioritise all the instruments that would increase the number of staff and students (especially outgoing) that take part in international mobility;
4. Increase international cooperation of all types not only in the region, but on a larger geographical scale;
5. Raise the level of mandatory English courses and encourage intensive English courses for the teaching staff.

2.6 Staff

According to the SER, for the 2015-2016 academic year, the College has 19 full time and 9 part-time academic staff, and 842 students. While the general ratio of the full time academic

staff per student is within normal limits compared to Kosovar and European higher education institutions, the ration in the BA Customs and Freight Forwarding is actually double (1:52). According to the SER, full time professors are obliged to work 40 hours per week, while part time staff is engaged 20 hours of work per week. Still, during the site visit, the workload did not seem to represent a concern or dissatisfaction for the academic staff the ET has interviewed. According to the "Internationalization and Research Plan 2016 – 2020" (already approached above), the workload distribution between teaching and research will change in the near future - "contracts of the academic staff will be revised and an article that obliges lecturers to spent at least 30 per cent of their time in research activities will be added".

There is no formal induction process for the new staff and there is no formal employment handbook. When the ET has asked for the employment handbook as part of the supplementary documentation, it was provided a document visibly made of selections from other regulations. During the interviews conducted by the ET, it resulted that when new staff is recruited, they are expected to read the Statute and other corresponding Regulations in order to familiarize themselves about their duties, responsibilities and rights at the institution. Sometimes this process is carried out informally by colleagues or administrative staff which give the newcomer a tour of the facilities and would stop at every office that has a regulation that would be of interest for the recent employee. The institution should therefore elaborate an employment handbook that would compile all the necessary information an incoming staff member (academic or non-academic) would need in order to get familiar with the institution; this would normally include rights, responsibilities, institutional expectations, information on all types of performance appraisal, promotion requirements, workload etc.

The employment process is described and formally adopted through the Regulation on employment rules and procedures for the college staff. However, in some parts the procedure seems to be quite foggy and leaving room for interpretation and subjective decision - "Following the approval of the candidates, upon proposal of the Dean, the Scientific and Teaching Council takes the decision on the appointment of staff to the respective subjects". It also contradicts with the SER "The Commission for the staff employment makes selection of the applications of candidates who applied for the position". Given the existence, according to the Regulation on employment rules and procedures for the college staff, of a Recruitment Board, it is unclear whether the decision in the hands of the Dean or is it based on a merit selection (qualifications in the CV, interview, reference check) of the committee. Also, the Regulation is unclear on who is responsible and what the exact selection process of the administrative staff is.

The staff interviewed by the ET considered that all promotions and opportunities for personal development have been implemented fairly. While there is evidence of several trainings offered by the institution and MEST to the academic staff, the pedagogical skills are not constantly developed so that the teachers keep up and advance their teaching methods. The ET was provided a strategy on enhancement and renewal of the academic staff adopted in 2011. The strategy has no clear targets and Key Performance Indicators. Moreover, even though there is a mention that in order "to implement this strategy there should be allocated a budget", there is no evidence that any of the institutional funds have been specifically allocated to staff development in the past or during the present academic year.

Both academic and non-academic staff are evaluated through different mechanisms that have been approached in detail under section 2.9. Recommendations have also been offered under that section.

Should the institution wish to embrace the community service as the third main pillar of the institutional mission, the ET suggests including, as part of the overall staff performance

appraisal, indicators related to this area; such as participation in committee work at different college levels, serving as a mentor to an employee who has recently joined the college, providing services to national, regional, and international agencies, task forces, boards, and commissions, participating in local, regional, national, and civic activities that promote a positive relationship between the College and the community, serving on national, regional, or international professional associations.

During the interviews, the ET has learned that the teaching staff is not aware of the students' evaluation survey results. When asked to offer several examples of improvements the academic staff have made in their teaching activity based on student feedback, there was no actual evidence that any of the suggestions for improvement have been integrated. Moreover, the results of the surveys are not discussed between the teacher and the line manager unless there is a serious and alarming concern, which has only been the case in three isolated situations for the past years. Therefore, the institution should develop and implement a mechanism to evaluate the extent to which individual teachers have integrated the feedback provided by the student surveys into their teaching activity.

Lastly, the institution should increase the level of public information in relation to its staff; publishing their CVs, consultation hours and contacts on the website so that they can be better reached by students and all interested parties. .

Further details related to staff can be found under section 3 of the present report, under each of the study programs.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Draft and formally adopt an employment handbook/manual/catalogue for academic and non-academic staff, as detailed above;
2. Organise a formal induction session for each staff member to get introduced to the institutional facilities and the employment handbook;
3. Organise/facilitate the access of the academic staff to classes, workshops and seminars that would increase their teaching effectiveness;
4. Revise the Regulation on employment rules and procedures for the college staff so that to avoid interpretations and recruitment is done through a clear, transparent, objective and consistent process;
5. Revise the strategy of the College "Pjetër Budi" on enhancement and renewal of the academic staff so that it provides more clear and measurable objectives for staff development;
6. Allocate, according to the Strategy for Staff Development, the necessary funds for staff development;
7. Include in the overall staff performance appraisal indicators related to community service;
8. Implement a procedure so that the feedback provided by the students' survey in relation to teaching activity is always discussed between the teacher and line manager, and improvements are always sought;
9. Make publicly available on the website information about the staff members, as detailed above.

2.7 Organization, Management and Planning

The decision-making structures for governance, management and administration matters do not seem to work very transparently: the public website does not offer the names and contacts of the individual members of each of these institutional bodies or key positions across the institution, nor dates and minutes of the meetings, the statute does not offer complete information on how individuals have reached their key positions, among others. When the ET asked for detailed "Regulation/provisions for the election and appointment of the decision making bodies and decision makers", the College has extracted and returned the corresponding (but still insufficient) parts of the Statute referring to this segment. Moreover, confusing information comes from the whole list of regulations of the institution and the quality assurance related structures. The general impression and conclusion of the ET is that the College seems to leave too much place for informal and subjective decisions in the processes of organization, management and planning. Also, a big part of the regulations of the institutions has been adopted during 2008-2011 and have not been revised since, even though different types of institutional dynamics have changed.

The level of public information on the website is very limited, as previously detailed in other sections.

The current Strategic Plan (2015-2020) has been made available to the ET. However, while the institution presents itself as "a college that serves growth, labour market and being fully integrated into the regional and European space of higher education", it is the impression of the ET that the College seems to have difficulties in designing appropriate tools and mechanisms that would help the institution reach its aims and finally develop the areas in need for improvement as defined in the Strategic Plan, as well as identifying new areas in need of improvement.

In all the documents available for the ET, as well as during the interviews, the College is repeatedly mentioning "international standards/objectives" for its management and planning. However, there is no evidence that the college is actually benchmarking against similar international higher education institutions in order to determine these "international standards/objectives" they are referring to.

The college does not evaluate the effectiveness and functionality of any of its' institutional structures.

As it stands now, students' engagement and representation has serious shortcomings as the general impression of the interviewees was that students cannot actually influence or have a say on any institutional matters. According to the SER, "students have a representative in the Teaching and Scientific Council that is the highest body for academic issues of 'Pjeter Budi' College". The ET did not find evidence that students are represented at all institutional levels and would, therefore, like to remind the College that the European Ministers responsible for Higher Education described (in their Prague Communique) students as "competent, active and constructive partners" in the establishment and shaping of EHEA; therefore, students should be involved in all strategic, decisional, consultative and executive bodies, as well as in all quality assurance processes. Student representation should be organised in line with European general practice:
- independently - by the students themselves, without the involvement of the institution;
- openly - with all current students having the right to vote and be elected, regardless of their academic performance or any other criteria;
- democratically - the representatives would be elected by all the students at the corresponding level – e.g. Students in the Teaching and Scientific Council would be elected by all the students at institutional level and the same rule is applied for lower levels;

-   with precise regulations that ensures the formality and transparency of the process – adopt a formal document (drafted by the students themselves) that provides the exact rights, responsibilities and obligations for students' representatives, the length of the mandate for each position, mentioning the exact percentage students have in all decision making bodies, etc;

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Substantially increase the volume of publicly available information by providing more transparent information on organization, management and planning;
2. Adopt a formal regulation for the election of the decision making bodies and decision makers that would include every single aspect of the election process, including the administrative steps;
3. Regularly revise all institutional regulations so that they constantly reflect the institutional realities and challenges;
4. Identify (based on clear criteria) similar higher education institutions abroad to benchmark their processes against, including processes on management and planning;
5. Establish a clear and systematic procedure to evaluate the effectiveness and functionality of the institutional structures;
6. Increase, improve and formalise student representation at all institutional levels, as detailed above.

2.8 Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

At the time of the site visit, the College was not using the entire building as it did not consider necessary; one of the floors continues to be closed. The teaching rooms, computer rooms and facilities (equipped with computers and projectors), appear to be adequate. However, in some of the classes it seemed that the number of seats was smaller than the number of students in one group. Technically, the institution is counting on the fact that not all students attend their classes for the teaching activity to run smoothly.

During the site visit, it seemed that some of the interviewees considered the premises quite small, so the institution should constantly monitor the academic community satisfaction in relation to the premises.

The library rooms are quite small and the number of hard copy books are limited, especially the publications in English. The library has generous working hours and seems to offer spaces for both individual reading, as well as group work, without these two interfering with each other.

The library offers electronic access to several databases such as EBSCO and JSTORE, which can be accessed remotely as well. The institution has signed two cooperation agreements with two other libraries in the city which grants more access to reading materials for PBC students. The library is also comparing the level of provisions with other libraries; however, there is no systematic process of collecting the needs that the academic staff may have from the library for the next academic year.

The main room of the library has several computers connected to internet available for students to access electronic databases. These computers could be easily connected to the library inventory system so that the students can check themselves if a certain book is available in hard copy. The institution could therefore provide a platform for self-service in

the library. The library has no security system to prevent the loss of hard-copy material, and the staff has previously observed that books went missing.

The ET has observed that the building is mostly unsuitable for handicapped students and personnel. Also, even though there have been previous graduates with visual impairments, there are no library instruments adapted to students with different reading and hearing needs.

The college is providing accommodation for the students outside of Pristina, but it seems to be highly used due to its remote location. The present building used to be equipped with a doctor for urgent assistance, but the medical centre was hardly ever used. Given the proximity of a hospital with an emergency room, the college is no longer providing medical services inside the building.

There is a cafeteria available for the entire academic community, but it does not provide any food or snacks. The institution is offering free copying services at the ground floor reception for all those interested. There is free functioning Wi-Fi access in the entire building, accessible for all those interested (that own a password).

All in all, there was no significant dissatisfaction of the interviewees towards the premises and equipment. However, the institution should regularly conduct the evaluation of services and facilities by the entire academic community; this should include questions related to all services (cafeteria, library, teaching rooms, electronic equipment, internet, copying facilities), but also approach them in a detailed manner so that the feedback is truly useful e.g. the library section should equally evaluate the perception in relation to number of volumes, loan system, technology functionality, opening hours, electronic library satisfaction, etc.

Also, the survey related to services and facilities should provide enough open ended questions for the academic community to be able to voice their needs and suggestions.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Adjust the number of students in a group to the number of seats in teaching rooms;
2. Increase the number of hard-copy materials available in the library, especially the ones available in English language;
3. Implement a self-service system in the library;
4. Purchase and install a security system to prevent the loss of hard-copy material;
5. Periodically conduct the evaluation of services and facilities by the entire academic community, as detailed above;
6. Adapt the building (and library instruments) for the integration of individuals with different disabilities: wheel chair, different reading and hearing needs, visual and hearing impairment.

2.9 Quality Management

For the past ten years, "Pjetër Budi" College has built its' internal management system around the Quality Assurance Commission (QAC) and the Quality Assurance Office (QAO). According to the SER, the first one is the policy making body, while the second one is executive. The ET observes a serious overlap between the responsibilities of both these structures as described in the SER. It was also not clear to the ET how do they communicate to each other and with the rest of the organisation chart. Moreover, here was no evidence of the activity and effectiveness of the QAC. The college should clearly revise the roles of these two structures so that the QAO is the one that designs all related procedures and

instruments, collects and analyses data, and recommends quality improvement plans and activities, while the QAC would support and provide advice to the QAO on the development of the internal QA system/framework and in its implementation and monitoring, providing hence expertise, advice and support.

Moreover, when asked about the activities of the QAO, the College extracted from relevant documents (again) the list of formal tasks and responsibilities of the Office, instead of providing evidence of the activities which justify the existence of this office (such as an activity report for the past years).

Even though the 2013 external review report suggested that the members of QAC should be trained in the field of quality assurance, the follow up is considered unsatisfactory: three of the members attended the activities of the TEMPUS Project "Encouraging the process of curriculum development based on learning outcomes and research guided teaching in the private higher education institution of Kosovo", which is hardly considered "internal quality assurance standards and implementation". The institution should, therefore, direct some resources into providing proper training related to internal quality management systems to the members of QAC and QAO.

The College has offered the ET the Regulation on procedures for the quality assurance, adopted in 2010. The document does not seem to have been revised ever since, despite of major international evolutions in the quality assurance sector. Also, it is the impression of the ET that the Regulation is not reflecting the institutional practices and it is rather a formal document adopted probably because "the institution has to have one". For example, the Regulation is mentioning regular quality assessment of, among others, "textbooks, literature, library and IT room, financing, organization and functioning of the quality assurance system". There is no evidence that these aspects are currently assessed through any of the questionnaires available for the ET. Given the big gap between the formal provisions and the actual practices, the Regulation (and the whole internal quality assurance system, as a matter of fact) does not seem to support the institution in monitoring its progress and quality of operations in order to achieve the objectives outlined in the strategic plan, and offer adjustments when needed.

The general impression of the ET is that there is no sound link between the internal quality assurance system and the strategic and operations' management. The ET is not sure whether the internal QA system is being perceived as a burden for the institution, but it is definitely not used to support the strategic and operations' management. The idea of quality culture is not well defined, spread or promoted across the institution. The SER is making references to "quality control" rather than enhancement or assurance. There doesn't seem to be any commitment and genuine ownership from the academic community on the internal quality assurance system; actions and participation do not seem to raise any individual interest and motivation at any institutional level. The college should increase its efforts to promote the development of quality culture as a common understanding of quality values, for which every individual of the organisation is responsible, a set of shared ideas, beliefs and values about quality united when everyone inside the academic community is sincerely engaged and motivated.

As in every small community, people are communicating rather informally; however, if the processes are based on individual, informal and inconsistent discussions, they risk to disappear when people in certain institutional position are changing. Even if "Pjetër Budi" College is a small institution, the internal quality management system has to be developed and formalised (for example by adding agenda, minutes, list of participants to meetings with external stakeholders, adding an evaluation form to the collegial evaluation of the teaching

activity, putting in practice the processes outlined in the Regulation on procedures for quality assurance, among others).

The institution is currently conducting a system of surveys, as follows: student survey regarding instructors' performance, students' survey regarding administrative staff performance, lecturers' self-appraisal and alumni survey. However, even if the SER is repeatedly mentioning "appropriate measures taken in order to improve the performance" of the institution based on survey results, no such evidence was available for the ET when asked as supplementary documentation. The evaluation of staff by the management is rather a reactive process, based on the isolated cases of complaints.

Since the internal quality assurance does not cover the whole range of institutional activities, the College is suggested to establish formal survey processes and adequate forms for the collegial evaluation of teaching activity, evaluation of services and facilities by students, academic and non-academic staff, individual evaluation of the lecturers by line manager, collecting of training needs, library and equipment requirements, among others. Also, the institution should consider making available a summary of results in each of the surveys and better monitor the integration of the suggestions for future developments; this way, the response rates will increase and the academic community will gain more trust in the instrument.

The institution has started to move some of the surveys on electronic platforms and this process should be completed. It is also very important for all the surveys to be centralised on the same platform. A coherent internal quality assurance system will have an integrated information management system where all the data is in one place and which allows for analysis and interpretation upon request. A single existing database will also keep the information readily accessible for any type of numbers and correlations that were not prepared in advance.

Lastly, the feedback loop is most of the times not closed and continuous; it is not evident how the collected data is being used for quality enhancement. The quality assurance system has little capacity to detect signals from different institutional challenges which makes it difficult for some issues to be brought to the attention of decision makers and for solutions to be sought.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Revise the roles of the Quality Assurance Commission and the Quality Assurance Office so that they better coordinate with each other and avoid overlaps;
2. Provide/facilitate access to proper training in the field of internal quality management systems for the members of QAC and QAO;
3. Revise the Regulation on procedures for quality assurance (include clear task division, reporting, data collection, timeframes, quality cycle, evaluation of the internal quality assurance system itself etc.);
4. Bring the Regulation on procedures for the quality assurance in line with the revised edition of the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education;
5. Expand the internal quality assurance system so that it covers the whole range of institutional activities, as detailed above;
6. Ensure that the surveys themselves, as data collection instruments, are being constantly revised;
7. Increase the involvement of staff and students in the internal quality assurance system;

8. Formalise all initiatives, meetings and processes related to internal quality assurance;
9. Establish an integrated information management system that would centralise all collected data on the same platform;
10. Increase the efforts to ensure that the feedback loop is closed and that all the collected data is used for continuous improvements of quality.

3.   PROGRAM EVALUATIONS

3.1 BA Customs and Freight Forwarding (re-accreditation)

The BA Program in Customs and Freight Forwarding is considered as the "core curriculum" of the entire College. It has the highest number of the students: 334 registered students according to SER, although the number of actually enrolled students is smaller. It is probably also the best-known program of the college. The aim of the program is to equip the graduates with applicable knowledge and skills for being able to work mostly in customs and logistics sector.

3.1.1. Curriculum and Teaching
The program fulfils all legal requirements. It is market oriented in nowadays Kosovo and it for sure serves a particular and important sector - logistics and customs. There is also quite a long list of partners/stakeholders being involved in the program. The employability of the graduates of the program has got positive feedback in self-evaluation documentation, as well as in various meetings.

The program itself consists of 180 ECTS credits and the study subjects are spread appropriately. Each semester students should obtain 30 ECTS. All courses give 6 ECTS. In all semesters (except the last one when the students need to prepare the Bachelor Thesis) they have 4 required courses and 2-4 elective courses to choose from. At the same time, during the 4th and 5th semester they have exactly the same two elective courses. Therefore, in reality, they do not have any elective courses during these semesters. Students need to choose one course in one semester and the second one in the second semester. The Bachelor Thesis itself gives 12 ECTS.

During the last 3 years some changes within the curriculum have happened, but unfortunately the school hasn't implemented most of the suggestions concerning the courses. The current panel also continues to make similar suggestions. As it was suggested by the previous Expert Team, the course *Academic Writing* is obligatory in the third year, but similar topics/skills could be offered already during the first year of studies. The course *Protection of Cultural Heritage* still has a too confusing place in this curriculum or has a too confusing title. It is also suggested to have the *Public Administration* course as a required (not elective) course.

The ET also suggests the College to look over the sequence of the courses – what courses are taught and when. Currently, general management/skills courses are mixed with special ones, some general social science courses "jump in", the courses do not have a logical flow. The ET suggests considering the creation of a general management module as the starting platform for all programs. Last, but not least, the expert team suggests reconsidering the title of the program to "Customs/logistics management".

The overlap of the academic content between the various parts of the curriculum is rather comprehensible and transparent. For full-time studies the various courses seem to grant

enough time for independent study, reflection and analysis. More effort is needed while working out the intended learning outcomes for both the program as well as for the courses. Though it is worth mentioning that the division among three layers (knowledge, skills, competencies) is a good approach to start with.

Looking at the current course syllabi, course descriptions and the reading materials there is no clear link between the amount of reading materials/home assignments/work hours and the credits given (even if the documents clearly state how much work each credit would require, the course syllabi do not reflect it well enough). Information about assessment methods, home assignments, percentages are quite often missing. These aspects (how to write an informative curriculum and study plan, explain assessment methods etc.) should be brought out into a curriculum design as well as in further staff training in a more active and clear way. Currently, the course syllabi are rather standardized and do not reflect the special aspects of the courses. During the meetings conducted by the ET, it became clear that, in reality, the syllabi vary much more and the teachers are applying different assessment methods and approaches, offering nice variety to students.

Generally, classes have been well received and students appreciate the experience teachers bring into the classroom. Even if the program is not based on an overarching didactic concept (there is not concrete concept that the program should follow, the keywords "practice oriented", "student centred", "based on the needs of the market" etc. were predominantly mentioned), the teachers are aware of different possible approaches and teaching methods. Different teachers are communicating to each other, adopting and testing different concepts offering additional value to the program – students will get to know various competing approaches to teaching and learning. According to the interviews, the teachers are actively using real life projects and case studies. Students are required to complete various home assignments, coursework and to present results to others, to discuss and to defend their arguments. Quite often the teachers are also visiting each other classes in order to share the teaching experience.

The admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards. Rather huge grey area is existing due to the system that allows students to have their students' status for too long (twice than their nominal time of studies, altogether 6 years) and they can basically take exams for an unlimited number of times. It is strongly advised to consider changing the system both concerning maximum study length as well as putting limits to the maximum times a person can take exams. Another grey area exists in statistics of the students' numbers – the number of applications vs. how many students really started to study. In different tables different methods are applied and it creates quite a lot of confusions.

Summarizing the analysis about the curriculum and teaching, it is possible to conclude that the scope and content of the program's main part is generally sufficient and appropriate to ensure the aims of the program.

3.1.2. Research and Internationalization

Research and internationalization are two areas that need to be substantially developed. The previous ET report identified several problems in these areas which have not been remedied yet. During the interview with the institutional management it was pointed out that the vision of the "Pjetër Budi" College is to become a centre of excellence in research. There is no evidence that any concrete efforts in this direction have been made, apart from formulating a Research plan for the period 2016-2020. The plan is approached in section 2.4

of the present report, which also highlights some other issues regarding the lack of research incentives for the academic staff. According to the SER, some measures are envisioned for the period 2016-2020, which, if implemented as planned, may improve the situation. It is commendable that students are included in applied research projects. According to the Research plan, students in Customs and Freight Forwarding BA program will participate in research projects over the next three years. As these projects will be apparently conducted as part of the courses it can be assumed that they will not reach the level of scientific rigour which is needed for publishing in peer-reviewed international journals. High impact research that would endorse key objectives of Strategic plan ("…excellence in education, research and innovation", SER) seem to be left to the initiative and resourcefulness of the individual faculty members.

The academic staff that teach in the BA program Customs and Freight Forwarding have produced several publications; however, only a few researchers have published in peer-reviewed international journals. Most of the articles have been published in Kosovo journals and conference proceedings which often lack rigor in the review process.

"Pjetër Budi" College supports conference participation, mostly at those conferences in the region where the college is one of the organisers. Research plan outlines a financial plan which includes funds for continuous support of research activities, including training in research activities by foreign experts. Academic staff reported that their requests for financial support of conference attendance has been supported most of the times, but also that their requests have been modest as they take into account financial situation of the College.

The internationalisation strategy of "Pjetër Budi" College is evaluated under the section 2.5 of the present report. Internationalisation is barely visible in Customs and Freight Forwarding program, even though it should be at the core of the program. There is no student exchange (an issue considered as the most critical by the students) that would allow them to acquire hands-on international experience. Judging from the interviews, students are under the impression that internationalisation is not possible due to visa requirements. This is certainly not true, as demonstrated by several other higher education institutions in Kosovo which have established international student mobility. Students did mention that some one-day international trips (to Montenegro) were organised by the College.

The research plan does not include any projects in the field of internationalisation beyond the issue of EU association agreement (research project planned for 2019) and internationalisation opportunities for teachers is below the desirable level. On a positive side, some teachers (mostly in general-content courses) are foreign nationals, which may bring some "international flavour" to the classroom. Internationalisation could be reinforced by inviting more international guest lecturers. This practice is already in place for some courses and it should be continued and further strengthened.

3.1.3. Staff

Customs and Freight Forwarding program is College's flagship program and it has a relatively stable faculty body. All teachers that attended the interviews conducted by the ET teach in a program for several years already.

Based on the faculty list provided by the KAA, the programs in this field (BA and MA) are well staffed: there are 10 full-time teachers (8 hold a Ph.D. degree), and 7 part-time teachers (3 with Ph.D. degree). SER (pp. 307, 309-310) quotes 6 full-time (4 with Ph.D. degree) and 5 part-time instructors (1 with Ph.D. degree). Gender-wise, the faculty is very imbalanced, as

there are only three female teachers (1 full-time and 2 part-time) according to KAA (1 full-time and 1 part-time according to SER).

Given the large number of students, a self-reported faculty-student ratio for this program is 1:52 (SER, p. 322). This is well beyond the ratios of other programs, and also high by international standards. Several faculty members teach more than one course in the program. As they also teach in other programs this raises a concern regarding their teaching load. However, the academic staff present at the interviews reported they teach no more than 6 hours per week which is comparable to international standards. Nevertheless, if the number of registered students reported in the SER is close to the actual number, the College should consider employing additional teachers in this program, which would contribute to higher quality of the learning experience by improving teacher-student ratio and, at the same time, free some time for research by lowering the teaching load of instructors. The latter is essential as the College plans to include in the employment contracts an obligation to devote 30% of the work hours to research (SER, p. 340).

Faculty participates in the management and governance of the program. The head of the programme is selected through an open competition and employed on a basis of an evaluation by the selection committee. Each program has a Program council which was established per recommendation of the ET report in 2013. The heads of the program meet with the Dean on a weekly basis and report to the Academic council once per quarter. Performance of program heads is measured based on the complaints voiced by students, vice-deans and faculty members. Professors are evaluated according to a uniform survey system, implemented by the Quality Assurance Office. Further details of the performance assessment are approached under 2.9 Section.

The students the ET has met during the site visit reported that the relationship with their professors is overall very good. They also commented that professors are "flexible" as regards examinations and that at some of the courses the students that are not satisfied with their grade can "improve it". These practices should be carefully monitored by the college management and also evaluated through the "in-house" pedagogical training.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Continue to deliver common trainings for the whole staff about curriculum development, writing learning outcomes, new approaches to assessment and teaching methods;
2. Change title of the curriculum into a more usual title; e.g. International Trade and Logistics;
3. Rearrange the sequence of the courses/ mandatory vs. elective courses;
4. Reconsider the logical flow of the semesters and courses;
5. Introduce more content in English language;
6. Incentivise and support high impact research
7. Establish international co-operations that would enable international staff and student mobility.
8. Employ additional faculty so that to improve a teacher-student ratio and lower the teaching load.

Summary Recommendation: Based on the argumentation above the BA program in Customs and Freight Forwarding is well enough prepared and delivered. Some aspects of the program need to get more attention and focus in the future, and research and

internationalisation should be strengthened, but in general, the curriculum is delivering what it is promising. Therefore, it is recommended to accredit the program for 5 years.

3.2 MA Management (re-accreditation)

The Master Program in Management corresponds to the institution's mission and both to formal and informal principles of operation. The aim of the program is to equip the graduates with applicable knowledge and skills for being effective managers in various organizations in the market economy heavily needed in nowadays Kosovo. The program is hoped to provide solutions to different challenges in Kosovo covering the general knowledge of management and training the professionals who will be working as managers in various fields.

3.2.1. Curriculum and Teaching

The program in Management is considered in current curricula development as one the main programs in the College "Pjetër Budi" and it is one of the two Master Programs offered by the school. It is aiming to provide theoretical and practical knowledge in the field of Management that is needed both in the private and public sector, both in big and small organizations. Although officially this program is training the professionals for all sectors, currently the program has the strongest foundation in general business management. According to the teachers the focus of the program is on SMEs.

The program tries to cover both the classical management part as well as specific knowledge within three/five profiles: 1) General Management, 2) Insurance Management, 3) Management of Tourism and Hospitality – these three profiles are already existing and they are under re-accreditation - and 4) Human Resource Management and 5) Management in Banking, Finance and Accounting – these profiles the college would like to open and they are under the first accreditation process. Among the students who started their studies in 2013/2014 there were 14 students who chose management of tourism and hospitality profile, 13 students chose general management profile and 9 chose insurance management.

The program consists of 120 ECTS credits and its' structure meets the legal requirements. Still, the SER is delivering confusing information when stating in some places that the program is giving a MSc degree (p.200), while in other places is referring to MA Degree (p.10, 13). The study subjects are spread appropriately. Each semester students should obtain 30 ECTS. In the first two semesters, they have 4 required courses and 2 elective courses to choose from, in the third semester they have 4 required courses and 3-5 courses to choose from depending on the chosen profile. All courses give 6 ECTS. The Master Thesis itself gives 30 ECTS. Thus, the first year of studies is common for all students and they will choose a certain track during the second year.

During the last 3 years some changes have happened within the curriculum (e.g. the course on *Decision making* was replaced by S*trategic management* course, *HRM* was replaced by *Leadership and organizational behaviour*, etc.). In principle, the subjects currently covered within the curriculum are nicely balanced and correspond to similar programs around the world. Currently there is only one special methodology course. The ET suggests considering putting more emphasis on the methodological issues of additional courses and within the existing ones as this (not enough skills to write a quality thesis) is usually the biggest problem in most of the programs. Also, the statistics show that during 2014/2015 only 10 students graduated from the program.

The overlap of the academic content between the various parts of the curriculum is rather comprehensible and transparent. The ET suggests to pay more attention to possible options to include more international expertise and lecturers into the curriculum. Also, more effort is needed while working out the intended learning outcomes both for the program as well as for the courses. However, it is worth mentioning that the division among the three layers (knowledge, skills, competencies) is a good approach to start with.

Since the management of the program is considering the current program more as "a soft management program", the future changes within the curriculum could be based on this approach. Also, the students have pointed out the desire to have more communication, negotiation, psychology, marketing etc. courses. Another suggestion of the ET is to include a required internship into the program (currently it is an elective course). Even if the program already puts quite a lot of emphasis on connecting the program with social partners (also the list of existing cooperation agreements is rather long) and some great internships have happened (even remunerated examples), a required internship system could represent an added value.

Looking at the current course syllabi, course descriptions and the reading materials there is no clear link between the amount of reading materials, home assignments, work hours and the credits given (even if in the documents it is clearly stated how much work each credit should cover, the course syllabi do not reflect it well enough). Information about assessment methods, home assignments, percentages are quite often missing. These aspects (how to write an informative curriculum and study plan, explain assessment methods etc.) should be brought out in a curriculum design as well as in further staff training in a more active and clear way. Currently, the course syllabi are rather standardized and do not reflect the special aspects of the courses. During the meeting with the academic staff it became clear that in reality the syllabi vary much more and the teachers are applying different assessment methods and approaches offering a nice variety to the students.

Generally, classes have been well received and students appreciate the experience teachers bring into the classroom. Even if the program is not based on an overarching didactic concept (there was no concrete concept that the program should follow, mostly the keywords "practice oriented", "student centred", "based on the needs of the market" etc. were mentioned), the teachers are aware of different possible approaches and teaching methods. Different teachers are communicating to each other, adopting and testing different concepts offering added value to the program – students will get to know various competing approaches to teaching and learning. According to the interviews with the academic staff, the teachers are actively using real life projects and case studies. Students are required to complete various home assignments and coursework, to present results to others, to discuss and to defend their arguments. The teachers are quite often visiting each other classes in order to share the teaching experience.

As far as the sources of literature for students are concerned, the lists of compulsory reading could be revised in most of the course descriptions. Currently the syllabi lists mostly textbooks as reading materials. The ET recommends the College to also consider scientific articles from journals as required (or at least suggested) reading materials since the new, relevant and up to date knowledge is often delivered faster throughout the articles than books. In addition, even if the college is trying to promote scientific activities among the students, none of the interviewed students were aware of the acronym EBSCO. It shows a clear gap between plans and reality.

The admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards. Rather huge grey area is existing due to the system that allows students to have their

students' status for too long time (twice more than their nominal time of studies, altogether 4 years) and they can basically take unlimited times exams. It is strongly advised to consider changing the system both concerning the maximum study length as well as putting limits to maximum times a person can take exams. Another grey area exists in statistics of the student numbers – the number of applications vs. how many students really started to study. Different methods are applied in different tables and that creates quite a lot of confusion.

Summarizing the analysis about the curriculum and teaching, the ET concludes that the scope and content of the program's main part is generally sufficient and appropriate to ensure the aims of the program. Still, taking into account the argumentation under the present section, it is not recommended to open additional profiles, but to focus on improving the existing ones.

3.2.2 Research and Internationalization

Even if according to the mission statement one of the college's aims is to be the centre of excellence in scientific research, the college is mostly focusing on teaching. On the other hand, the teaching staff has still managed to publish quite a few articles and papers. The number of publications is rather low for Western standards, but could be considered rather positive for such a young institution in Kosovo. Even if the number of publications and presentations as such might be considered as acceptable in Kosovo, the research coming out of the teaching staff could result in more high level peer-reviewed international academic publications (e.g. most of the publications are conference proceedings, publications in schools' journals, papers presented at the seminars, etc.). According to the management, approximately 30% of the teachers' time should be spent on research and approximately 10% of the college's budget should go into the research. Based on the interviews the ET has conducted, this doesn't seem to be the case in reality. Teachers are overburdened with teaching and there was no clear evidence of financial allocation for research. On the other hand, the college has plans to activate scientific research and the research plan for the next five years (2016-2020) looks rather impressive for such a small college. This has been further approached under the Institutional section of the present report.

The college is making its first steps towards internationalization by looking for possible educational partners abroad, possible common projects and exchange programs. The series of "international guest speakers" could be considered as a way towards this direction. Still, internationalization does not currently happen almost at all (there are only some foreign students from Montenegro and FYROM) and the students are heavily looking and waiting for options in international summer courses and foreign exchanges. More time and resources should be allocated to preparing such exchanges, applications and building international connections. International recruitment could also be considered in the future. The ET recommends the College to use more guest speakers and international expertise in the program. We also suggest for some of the optional courses to be delivered in English. Verbal English is currently not used almost at all, while written texts in English are mostly listed under "additional suggested reading". Based on the meetings the ET has attended, students would be ready to take more foreign language challenges on board.

3.2.3 Staff

Despite the fact that the college currently has a rather fragile personnel situation (quite a few impactful persons left during the last year, it is hard to keep valuable teachers on long term basis etc.), the available teaching staff in the management field is motivated and competent.

Based on the SER there are 4 full time teachers responsible for the program. Additionally, there are also other full time and part time teachers from other programs delivering the courses. The qualifications of the teachers are appropriate to the positions they hold within the program. Most of the courses are led and supervised by PhDs. The college is also planning to finance PhD studies of some of the employees (cca. 5 people) and sing long term contracts with them.

Considering the number of students in the program (altogether 143 students based on SER, p. 317 or altogether 107 students based on the data received during the meetings: 36 students who started their studies in 2013, 43 students who started their studies in 2014 and 28 students who started their studies in 2015) and all teachers involved, the ratio between academic staff and students could be considered very good (according to SER it is officially 1:29, p.323). Communication among the management and academic staff is taking place constantly: they have weekly staff meetings and monthly bigger meetings within the college. Constant in-house trainings are also happening.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Continue to deliver common trainings for the whole staff about curriculum development, writing learning outcomes, new approaches to assessment and teaching methods;
2. Introduce more content in English language;
3. Reconsidered the system of maximum length of the students' status and maximum number of possibilities to take exams;
4. Increase the level of soft management subjects throughout the curriculum by focusing more on communication, psychology, social transferable skills;
5. Include guest speakers and social partners in regular courses;
6. Promote the internship options and the added value of the internships among students;
7. Increase the exchange possibilities for both staff and students.

Summary Recommendation: Based on the argumentation above, the MA program in Management is prepared and delivered well enough. Some aspects need to get more attention and focus in the future, the curriculum is generally delivering what it is promising. Therefore, it is recommended to accredit the program for 5 years. However, the ET firstly underlines that, given the existing personnel and admission situation, the accreditation is only valid for the current profiles and the college cannot open new ones. The ET recommends keeping all three profiles running on long-term basis or even decreasing this number in order to focus and improve the existing curriculum even more. Secondly the ET underlines that the accreditation is granted to the Management program as MA, not MSc.

3.3 BA Tourism and Hospitality Management (re-accreditation)

BA program Tourism and Hospitality Management is of the lowest quality out of the three programs under evaluation. It is also the smallest in terms of student numbers, with barely viable numbers over the last three years. Small number of students, as attested by the number of graduates over the last three years is a serious problem: it drains College's resources as the financial viability is surely questionable but, more importantly, the reduced

size of the students' group reduces the richness of the interactions among students, it limits the variety of views, opinions and opportunities for intra-group learning.

On the other hand, the program is one of the few in this field in Kosovo. As tourism sector is likely to grow, the employment opportunities will be abundant, especially if the sector is supported and promoted by the national policy.

3.3.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The program was developed on the basis of the opportunities for tourism development and market needs. A Ministry analysis in 2014 showed a lack of qualified labour for jobs in tourism sector at the managerial and professional level. There are also indications that the development of the tourism industry will be actively promoted by the state. In this respect, the program corresponds to the institution's mission and principles of employability.

BA program in Tourism and Hospitality Management is a three-year Bologna-type program with 180 ECTS. According to SER (pp. 123-124) it was modelled after the comparable programs at the University of Vienna (Austria) and University of Ohrid (FYROM). Overall, the program's quality, range and academic aims seem appropriate for a BA degree.

As explained in the interview with the staff responsible for the program, the proposed program was drafted by a special committee consisting of five faculty members based on input from stakeholders and recommendations by the ET in 2013. In the next step, individual course holders designed the syllabi and send them to the committee which commented and proposed the changes. When asked about the differences between the master and bachelor programs in terms of competencies, no answer was provided.

The program includes 28 courses (21 obligatory and 7 electives). In addition, students have to complete an internship (120 hours at a company, 6 ECTS) and a BA Thesis (12 ECTS). Each semester students have to take 4 mandatory courses (2 are in the 6th semester) and one elective course (a choice out of the 2-3 courses provided for each semester). The program structure corresponds to the legal requirements and is comparable to the international standards for a 3-year first cycle Bologna program. All courses have 6 ECTS, which may be problematic, as different subjects most likely require different workload. There are some variations in the split between lectures and exercises, although most courses employ a 50:50 split.

The mandatory courses are a somewhat eclectic set consisting of courses pertaining to basic business functions (marketing, management, HRM, finance), skills (academic writing, English), tourism-related subjects, courses in economics, entrepreneurship, international trade and public finance, but also courses in the fields that support the tourism industry: food science, ecology, and cultural heritage protection. 6 out of the 21 mandatory courses and 6 out of the 16 elective courses are directly related to tourism and hospitality industry.

Firstly, it is surprising that only one foreign language course is offered (English) with only English I and English II being mandatory (English III can be taken as an elective). Secondly, the ET is surprised that mathematics, informatics and statistics are all offered only as elective courses. More emphasis should be given to language training (more than one foreign language should be offered) but also to the core infrastructure courses (e.g., courses developing quantitative skills and IT). English language proficiency, crucial for working in the tourism and hospitality sector, could be reinforced also by using course literature in English language to a larger extent. This would also contribute to international comparability of the course content.

The relatively low share of content related specifically to tourism and hospitality industry indicates that the program has characteristics of a general management program with a specialised track. This was already the finding of the previous program evaluation in 2013. Inclusion of courses such as Recognition of Goods and Food Science (mandatory) and Nutrition (elective) are somewhat unusual. They seem to reflect the expertise of the Head of the program, but could also serve as a point of differentiation towards the other programs in Tourism and Hospitality offered in the Kosovo sector. At the same time, courses of this type require the use of the laboratory to develop students' competencies (e.g. "to inspect condition of goods" (food) in the Nutrition course or "to conduct research in the field of food recognition and food science overall" in the Recognition of Goods and Food Science course). As the College does not have any science labs, the course instructor plans to adapt a (rather innovative) solution to this problem by conducting lab tutorials in food-processing companies in the region.

The course syllabi are designed according to the template. They specify learning goals, learning outcomes, and teaching and evaluation methods. The syllabi seem to be fully standardised and do not sufficiently highlight the specific content of the courses. For example, SER (p. 30) implies that all courses employ an identical assessment format. During the interviews the ET has conducted, faculty and students explained that this was not the case and that only the ranges are set for each component of the grade. Several course syllabi reflect a lack of understanding of the purpose and meaning of the learning objectives and learning outcomes. The College should provide additional training to faculty on course design, especially to teachers that were employed recently and have not received such training in the past.

The internship is mandatory and can be carried out at one of the companies that signed a cooperation agreement with the College. Securing a post is a responsibility of the student. Students have reported that this is not a problem, as many of them already work (part time or full time). This raises the question on how can the students who are employed attend the courses full time and complete the program in the foreseen time?

The SER (p. 131) states that an "admission test is being applied but it doesn't have elimination character". The students the ET has met reported that there was no admission test for any of the programs. Prospective students have to complete a high school degree and the pass national examination, as required by the law.

The planned student intake for the next three years is 50-55 students per year. Judging from the current numbers, this is an ambitious plan that will require a significant marketing effort.

3.3.2 Research and Internationalization

Given the College's ambition to become an important research centre in Kosovo, research and internationalization are two areas that need to be substantially developed in the field of tourism and hospitality management as well. Most of the issues that were raised in other parts of this report apply to Tourism and Hospitality Management program as well and will be re-iterated here.

There is no evidence that any substantial steps to foster research have been made, apart from formulating a Research plan for the period 2016-2020. The plan is evaluated in section 2.4 of this report, which also highlights some other issues regarding the lack of research incentives for academic staff. Some measures are envisioned for the period 2016-2020 (SER, Chapter 10.1) which, if implemented as planned, may improve the situation. It is commendable that students are included in applied research projects. According to the

Research plan, one research project will be carried out each year. In the tourism and hospitality field, all projects will be conducted as part of the courses. Therefore, it is clearly not expected that the research design and implementation will include scientific rigour required to publish in peer-review international journals. High impact research that would endorse key objectives of Strategic plan ("excellence in education, research and innovation", SER, p. 340) seems to be left to the initiative and resourcefulness of the individual faculty members.

Although academic staff that teaches in BA program Tourism and Hospitality Management has published in international journals, only a few articles published in regional journals pertain to tourism and hospitality.

"Pjetër Budi" College supports conference participation, mostly at those conferences in the region where the college is one of the organisers. The research plan outlines financial proposals which include funds for continuous support of research activities and training by foreign experts on research activities. During the interviews the ET has conducted, staff have reported that their requests for financial support on conference attendance has been supported most of the times, but also that their requests have been modest as they take into account financial situation of the College.

The internationalisation strategy of the "Pjetër Budi" College is evaluated in section 2.5. There is no student exchange (issue considered as the most critical by students). As for the other programs, students are under impression that internationalisation is not possible due to visa requirements. This is certainly not true, as demonstrated by several other higher education institutions in Kosovo which have established international student mobility.

No international dimension is apparent in the planned research projects. Staff have mentioned (and provided some examples) that international guest lecturers are occasionally invited. This practice is commendable and should be continued.

3.3.3 Staff

Based on the SER (pp. 308 and 310) the program includes 5 full-time staff (3 with Ph.D. and 2 with Master degree) and 3 part-time staff (2 with Ph.D. and 1 with Master degree). The academic staff list provided by KAA shows that 11 teachers work in the tourism and hospitality management programs, but it is possible that the list also includes the academic staff that teach in the MA program. Only 2 faculty members are women (4 on KAA list).

At the beginning of 2016, when KAA enforced the accreditation standard that a program can be accredited only on the condition that at least three faculty members hold a Ph.D. degree, the College had to employ additional qualified academic staff (and had to let some previous faculty members go). During the site visit, the ET learned that none of the persons that are now officially responsible for the programme was actually involved in the program design; they signed their employment contracts only very recently. Furthermore, one of the three faculty members responsible for the program, does not even teach at the BA level. This certainly brings into question the credibility of the program.

A self-reported faculty-student ratio for this program is 1:16 (SER, p. 323), which is quite favourable. As the number of enrolled students is clearly overstated (table on p. 308 of SER reports the number of registered students, however, not all students who register actually enrol), the true ratio must be much lower (information on the number of graduates – SER, p. 320 – shows that over the last three years only 11, 16, and 8 students per year have completed the program).

The academic staff participates in the management and governance of the program. The head of the programme is selected through an open competition and employed on the basis of an evaluation made by the selection committee. Each program has a Program council which was established after the recommendation of the ET in 2013. The heads of the program meet with the Dean on a weekly basis and report to the Academic council once per quarter. Performance of program heads is measured based on complaints voiced by the students, vice-deans and faculty members. Professors are evaluated according to an uniform survey system, implemented by the Quality Assurance Office and detailed under the 2.9. section of the present report.

Students the ET has met reported that the relationship with the professors is overall very good. They also commented that the professors are "flexible" as regards examinations and that, in some of the courses, students that are not satisfied with their grade, can "improve it". These practices should be carefully monitored by the college management and also evaluated through an "in-house" pedagogical training.

ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Offer further training for the faculty on curriculum and syllabi development, on new approaches to assessment and teaching methods;
2. Increase the foreign language proficiency by offering additional foreign language courses and prescribing course readings in English language;
3. Recruit academic staff with degrees in appropriate field (tourism and hospitality);
4. Incentivise and support high impact research activities;
5. Establish international co-operation in order to enable international staff and student mobility;
6. Provide a permanent access to laboratories for the food technology related courses as some of the intended teaching methods for the courses in the field of food science require it.

Summary Recommendation: Despite several areas of concern, the ET recommends that the BA program Tourism and Hospitality Management to be accredited for 3 years due to its relevance for Kosovo economy and good employment prospects of the graduates. The fluctuations in the academic staff should be stabilised and specific competencies in the field of tourism and hospitality of the faculty should be developed and strengthened.

4. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION TO KAA

As an overall observation, the ET would like to comment on the evaluation process itself: there was little self-reflection and self-criticism and this has made the ET wonder if the College is actually taking the external evaluation process seriously. The institution is therefore suggested to be more open and honest also when referring to its weaknesses, shortcomings and areas in need of development since it is the only way the experts can have a realistic picture over the institution and provide relevant recommendations. The college should perceive the external evaluation as an opportunity to enhance and continuously develop their internal processes and operations, and take advantage of the evaluation accordingly.

Moreover, looking at all the previous institutional reports and at how the College has addressed the suggestions offered by the expert teams, the ET is sad to conclude that the

institution doesn't demonstrate much commitment and effort into improving its operations. Instead, the external visits are rather perceived as checklist procedures; the institution is urged to be more preoccupied and responsible towards integrating an external and objective feedback aimed solely at providing support for development.

After evaluating the information obtained through the SER, site visit interviews and additional information and documents provided, the ET stresses the importance for the College to be more dedicated to implementing the recommendations related to both institutional and program level. The ET considers the implementation of the recommendations within the framework of a carefully designed action plan as a critical success factor for the College. KAA follow-up and close monitoring of the implementation of such an action plan is also a very crucial factor in the success.

In conclusion, the expert team recommends KAA to:

1. Grant institutional accreditation for a period of three years.

2. Re-accredit the following programs:
   - BA Customs and Freight Forwarding for 5 years.
   - MA Management (with current profiles) for 5 years.
   - BA Tourism and Hospitality Management for 3 years.

APPENDICES

1. **List of supplementary documents required by the Expert Team from "Pjetër Budi" College on 19.06.2016 and received on 22.06.2016**

    1. The detailed financial report on full and partial scholarships as well as any regulation/policy providing all the formal details (criteria and provisions for all types of scholarships);
    2. Regulation for Quality Assurance;
    3. Internationalization strategy/policy, as well as the numbers of incoming and outgoing (both staff and students);
    4. Regulation/provisions for the election and appointment of the decision making bodies and decision makers (for all institutional levels);
    5. A sample of the "periodic reports on assessment of the institution, programs, academic staff, administrative staff and students" (SER) the Quality Assurance Office has produced;
    6. Activity report/details/evidence on the Quality Assurance Office' "activities in order to increase and advance the quality in the institution" (SER);
    7. Code of Ethics/Code of Conduct or any similar document that would provide the formal requirements, guidelines and sanctions related to ethics, discipline, intellectual property, conflict of interests, etc;
    8. Regulation/provisions for appeals;
    9. Employment handbook for academic and non-academic staff (rights, responsibilities, institutional expectations, information on performance appraisal, on promotions, etc);
    10. The lists of students that benefited from scholarships for the past three academic years;
    11. Alumni survey - the response rates and the questionnaire form itself, the centralised results from the previous three years, as well as a list of recent examples of "appropriate measures taken in order to improve the performance" of the institution based on alumni suggestions.
    12. Other details on the employment rates (time it takes to get employed, having a job in the studied area or not, salary, usefulness of the study program, suggestions for improvement);
    13. The questionnaires used for teachers' own self-appraisal;
    14. The centralised results of the student survey regarding the quality of teaching, for the past three academic years and a list of recent examples of "appropriate measures taken in order to improve the performance" of the institution based on students' suggestions.
    15. The questionnaire forms the institution uses to consult the "business community, partner institutions of higher education, etc", the centralised results of these surveys for the past three academic years, as well as a list of recent examples of "appropriate measures taken in order to improve the performance" of the institution based on external stakeholders' suggestions.

16. The list of all tuition and administrative fees (all the fees a student pays from admission to graduation);
17. The list of trainings, programs and other specialised qualifications that the members of the Quality Assurance Committee have attained/attended for the past three academic years.

2. List of Recommendations (Institutional)

2.1 Mission Statement
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Revise its' mission and vision statements through a complex consultation process involving external and internal stakeholders;
2. Adjust the format of the mission so that it is brief, distinguishable, measurable, realistic and aware of the context, and includes all three main pillars of a higher education institution: teaching, research and community service;
3. Ensure the proper consistency between mission, vision, objectives and strategic plan so that they all guide the institution in its' decision making and administration;
4. Properly disseminate the institutional mission and vision across the academic community.

2.2 Academic Freedom
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Adjust the organisation chart so that the quality assurance structures move under the supervision of an individual;
2. Revise the organisation chart in a way that will incorporate again the Council of Ethics;
3. Expend the remit of the Code of Ethics so that it applies to students as well.

2.3 Academic Programs and Student Management
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Ensure that the suggestions collected form the community and representatives of the labour market feed back into the quality assurance system and serve for future improvement of institutional operations;
2. Draft and formally adopt a student handbook;
3. Organise a formal induction day for all newly registered students to get introduced to the institutional facilities and the student handbook;
4. Increase the level of publicly available information on the institutional website: academic and administrative fees, scholarships, infrastructure, accommodation and decision making process;
5. Revise the Regulation on criteria for partial and full scholarships;
6. Promote and encourage the possibility of students to submit a written appeal/complaint in case of a grading disagreement.

2.4 Research
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Set a clear orientation of areas the college wishes their research to focus on, specific direction for research, with clear objectives in terms of both areas and level of results;
2. Establish and formalise clear incentives for the academic staff to carry out research;

3. Determine measurable research performance targets for promotion purposes;
4. Formally adopt and integrate in the institutional practices the key indicators to monitor and benchmark future research and development activities;
5. Reorganize the publishing process of the Logos magazine so that all manuscripts are properly peer-reviewed.

2.5 International Cooperation
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Adopt a proper internationalization strategy/policy that would guide the institutional decisions and resource allocation in this area;
2. Assign a clear portfolio for internationalisation (e.g. to one of the vice-deans) that would be directly mandated and accountable for the initiatives and results in internationalization;
3. Prioritise all the instruments that would increase the number of staff and students (especially outgoing) that take part in international mobility;
4. Increase international cooperation of all types not only in the region, but on a larger geographical scale;
5. Raise the level of mandatory English courses and encourage intensive English courses for the teaching staff.

2.6 Staff
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Draft and formally adopt an employment handbook/manual/catalogue for academic and non-academic staff;
2. Organise a formal induction session for each staff member to get introduced to the institutional facilities and the employment handbook;
3. Organise/facilitate the access of the academic staff to classes, workshops and seminars that would increase their teaching effectiveness;
4. Revise the Regulation on employment rules and procedures for the college staff so that to avoid interpretations and recruitment is done through a clear, transparent, objective and consistent process;
5. Revise the strategy of the College "Pjetër Budi" on enhancement and renewal of the academic staff so that it provides more clear and measurable objectives for staff development;
6. Allocate, according to the Strategy for Staff Development, the necessary funds for staff development;
7. Include in the overall staff performance appraisal indicators related to community service;
8. Implement a procedure so that the feedback provided by the students' survey in relation to teaching activity is always discussed between the teacher and line manager, and improvements are always sought;
9. Make publicly available on the website information about the staff members.

2.7 Organization, Management and Planning
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Substantially increase the volume of publicly available information by providing more transparent information on organization, management and planning;

2. Adopt a formal regulation for the election of the decision making bodies and decision makers that would include every single aspect of the election process, including the administrative steps;
3. Regularly revise all institutional regulations so that they constantly reflect the institutional realities and challenges;
4. Identify (based on clear criteria) similar higher education institutions abroad to benchmark their processes against, including processes on management and planning;
5. Establish a clear and systematic procedure to evaluate the effectiveness and functionality of the institutional structures;
6. Increase, improve and formalise student representation at all institutional levels.

2.8 Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Adjust the number of students in a group to the number of seats in teaching rooms;
2. Increase the number of hard-copy materials available in the library, especially the ones available in English language;
3. Implement a self-service system in the library;
4. Purchase and install a security system to prevent the loss of hard-copy material;
5. Periodically conduct the evaluation of services and facilities by the entire academic community;
6. Adapt the building (and library instruments) for the integration of individuals with different disabilities: wheel chair, different reading and hearing needs, visual and hearing impairment.

2.9 Quality Management
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Revise the roles of the Quality Assurance Commission and the Quality Assurance Office so that they better coordinate with each other and avoid overlaps;
2. Provide/facilitate access to proper training in the field of internal quality management systems for the members of QAC and QAO;
3. Revise the Regulation on procedures for quality assurance (include clear task division, reporting, data collection, timeframes, quality cycle, evaluation of the internal quality assurance system itself etc.);
4. Bring the Regulation on procedures for quality assurance in line with the revised edition of the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education;
5. Expand the internal quality assurance system so that it covers the whole range of institutional activities;
6. Ensure that the surveys themselves, as data collection instruments, are being constantly revised;
7. Increase the involvement of staff and students in the internal quality assurance system;
8. Formalise all initiatives, meetings and processes related to the internal quality assurance;
9. Establish an integrated information management system that would centralise on the same platform all the collected data;

10. Increase the efforts to ensure that the feedback loop is closed and that all the collected data is used for continuous improvements of quality.

3. List of Recommendations (Programs)

3.1 BA Customs and Freight Forwarding (re-accreditation)
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Continue to deliver common trainings for the whole staff about curriculum development, writing learning outcomes, new approaches to assessment and teaching methods;
2. Change title of the curriculum into a more usual title; e.g. International Trade and Logistics;
3. Rearrange the sequence of the courses/ mandatory vs. elective courses;
4. Reconsider the logical flow of the semesters and courses;
5. Introduce more content in English language;
6. Incentivise and support high impact research
7. Establish international co-operations that would enable international staff and student mobility.
8. Employ additional faculty so that to improve a teacher-student ratio and lower the teaching load.

3.2 MA Management (re-accreditation)
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Continue to deliver common trainings for the whole staff about curriculum development, writing learning outcomes, new approaches to assessment and teaching methods;
2. Introduce more content in English language;
3. Reconsidered the system of maximum length of the students' status and maximum number of possibilities to take exams;
4. Increase the level of soft management subjects throughout the curriculum by focusing more on communication, psychology, social transferable skills;
5. Include guest speakers/ social partners in regular courses;
6. Promote the internship options and value of the internships among students;
7. Increase exchange possibilities for both staff and students.

3.3 BA Tourism and Hospitality Management (re-accreditation)
ET recommends "Pjetër Budi" College to:
1. Offer further training for the faculty on curriculum and syllabi development, and on new approaches to assessment and teaching methods;
2. Increase the foreign language proficiency by offering additional foreign language courses and prescribing course readings in English language;
3. Recruit academic staff with degrees in appropriate field (tourism and hospitality);
4. Incentivise and support high impact research activities;
5. Establish international co-operation in order to enable international staff and student mobility;

6. Provide a permanent access to laboratories for the food technology related courses as some of the intended teaching methods for the courses in the field of food science require it.