

**Accreditation of Study Programmes  
UBT College**

**Evaluation Final Report**

by the team of experts,  
assessing five study programs of the UBT College

July 5, 2017

# Table of Contents

Table of Contents	2
1. Introduction	3
1.1. Preparation	3
1.2. Experts and assigned study programs	3
1.3. On-site visit	3
1.4. Meeting with institutional management	4
1.5. General remarks	4
2. Information Systems and Management (MSc, reaccreditation)	4
2.1. General remarks	4
2.2. Academic Programme and Student Management	5
2.3. Staff	7
2.4. Research and International Cooperation	7
2.5. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment	8
2.6. Quality Management	8
3. Integrated Studies in General Medicine (accreditation)	8
3.1. General remarks	8
3.2. Academic Programme and Student Management	9
3.3. Staff	9
3.4. Research and the International Cooperation	9
3.5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities	10
3.6. Quality Management	11
4. Integrated Studies in Pharmacy (accreditation)	11
4.1. General remarks	11
4.2. Academic Programme and Student Management	11
4.3. Staff	12
4.4. Research and the International Cooperation	12
4.5. Finances and Infrastructure	12
5. Integrated Studies in Stomatology (accreditation)	13
5.1. General remarks	13
5.2. Academic Programme and Student Management	13
5.3. Staff	14
5.4. Research and International Cooperation	16
5.5. Finances and Infrastructure	16
5.6. Quality management	17
6. LLM in Law, Computer Criminology and Forensics (accreditation)	17
6.1. Academic Programme and Student Management	17
6.2. Staff	20
6.3. Research and International Co-operation	21
6.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment	21
6.5. Quality Management	22
7. Proposals for the decision on (re-)accreditation	22

## 1. Introduction

The present document contains the evaluation report 2017 on UBT College (*the College*). It is the result of the collegial work of an international team of experts (ET) appointed by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) to evaluate five study programmes. The report bases on the self evaluation report (SER) of the College, the visit of the ET in the College on 5<sup>th</sup> of July 2017 and further information of the College, asked by the ET.

### 1.1. Preparation

The College submitted a detailed SER as the central document for the accreditation of the study programmes. The report has 765 pages and contains a brief description of the institution's history, study programmes under evaluation, staff, students, quality assurance, research and international cooperation, infrastructure, financing and an annex. CV-s of academic staff were submitted separately. The SER and other documents were made available to the ET by 28.06.2017.

### 1.2. Experts and assigned study programs

- Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak/Tallinn University (EE): Information Systems and Management (MSc, reaccreditation).
- Prof. Dr. Rain Ottis/Tallinn University of Technology (EE): Law, Computer Criminology and Forensics (LLM, accreditation).
- Prof. Dr. Markus Paulmilch/Austrian Institute of Technology (AT): Integrated Studies in Pharmacy (accreditation) and Integrated Studies in General Medicine (accreditation).
- Prof. Dr. Ulrike Webersberger/Medical University of Innsbruck (AT): Integrated Studies in Stomatology (accreditation).

### 1.3. On-site visit

On July 4<sup>th</sup>, the experts gathered in the evening for a preliminary working dinner together with Shkelzen Gerxhaliu from the KAA. They talked about their first impressions of the SER and the program for the on-site visit (OSV) at the following day.

The OSV took place as planned. The scheduled OSV started in the morning of 5<sup>th</sup> with a meeting with the management of the College from 9.00-9.30 (see below), followed with the meetings with the responsible persons for the study programmes (9.30-11.30), visit to facilities (11.30-12.30), lunch and discussions of ET and participating KAA members (12.30-14.30), meeting with academic staff (14.30-15.20) and with students (15.20-16.10).

The visit ended with short consultations of ET and KAA (16.10-16.25) and a final meeting with the management of the institution (16.25-16.40).

#### 1.4. Meeting with institutional management

From the management of the university, the rector Edmond Hajrizi together with about 20 colleagues took part in the discussions.

The ET was given a short – about 15 minutes – overview of the academic structure of the College, participation on different organizations and the latest achievements. Subsequent discussion was devoted mainly to the composition and hiring of academic staff.

#### 1.5. General remarks

The ET is indebted to the College for facilitating the site visit – the discussions and the opportunity to see facilities were particularly valuable. The ET would like to thank the College for its hospitality.

In addition, the experts warmly thank the KAA and its representatives for their outstanding support and cooperation before, during and after the visit. The work done by the members of the KAA in crosschecking the HR requirements for the different applied courses according to Kosovar law was tremendously helpful.

## 2. Information Systems and Management (MSc, reaccreditation)

#### 2.1. General remarks

The master programme in *Information Systems* was accredited in 2014 for three years. The ET has made only one recommendation of improvement: it was recommended to focus on fewer specialization areas in the beginning (the study programme had six concentrations) and start first with only one or two with 22 students. This recommendation was taken into account: 30 students were admitted in 2014 and two concentrations proposed (*Business Information Systems* and *Geo-Information Systems*).

\*\*\*

The following bases on the documents presented to the ET, on the site visit and on discussion with the following persons – Lulzim Beqiri, Hazer Dana, Festim Halili, Peter König, Hasan Metin, Gazmend Krasniqi, Bertan Karahoda, Naim Preniqi, Miranda Kajtazi, Mary Somerville, Besnik Skenderi, Afrim Sylja, Zhilbert Tafa, Muhamet Gërvalla. According to the SER, the first five are assigned one or more courses in the study programme; the remaining nine not. L.Beqiri, H.Dana and A.Sylja were given as responsible for the study programme.

## 2.2. Academic Programme and Student Management

The mission statement of the College relies on generic competences and does not specify academic areas of activity. Computer science and information systems are also not in the list of the focus and further developments that are described in the Strategic Plan of the College. Nevertheless, the study programme corresponds to the institution's principles of operation that are in most general level formulated in the Mission Statement: dynamic innovative 21<sup>st</sup> century academic environment; teamwork between students, faculty, staff and administrators; participatory and self-governance approach.

The study programme has 14 learning outcomes. The term "management" is mentioned only in one learning outcome, and this together with several other notions: "Demonstrate an ability to integrate methods from different areas of organization, management, information systems, and information and communication technology." On the other hand, the term "information systems" contains in eight learning outcomes. Therefore, the proposed new title "Information Systems and Management" of the study programme and the learning outcomes would not harmonize to each other. Moreover, it is not clear from the expected learning outcomes what competences in development and deployment of information systems the graduates are actually supposed to have. There is only one learning outcome that mentions design of information systems: "Demonstrate an ability to solve information systems design problems". Does it also include, for example, competences necessary for merging or integrating different information systems (the term "interoperability" is not mentioned in the syllabi)? The teachers responsible for the study programme were disappointingly not able to explain satisfactorily the questions about the coverage of the full development cycle of information systems in the study programme.

The SER claims that several European universities offer similar study programmes. *Information Systems* MSc programmes (NB! without "and Management" in the name of the programmes) of Vienna, Münster, Cologne and Stockholm universities and Waterford Institute of Technology were given as examples. Additionally, *Information Systems Management* MSc programme (NB! without "and" in the name) of University of Applied Sciences Wien was mentioned. Therefore, the name *Information Systems and Management* of the study programme is not justified.

The SER mentions that ACM curriculum recommendations from 2010 are taken into account in designing the study programme. However, the later document MSIS 2016 *Global Competency Model for Graduate Degree Programs in Information Systems* would be more appropriate to base on.

As to the overarching didactic concept, SER does not describe it. However, as both the teachers and students explained, project based learning and elements of flipped learning are often used.

The study programme has Erasmus subject area code 11.3 (Informatics, Computer Science). It is also claimed that the study programme is appropriate for graduates of "a variety of fields from business students with an IS concentration, computer science, general business degrees and social sciences and humanities". On the other hand, the list of elective courses does not contain any courses in programming and software engineering. Although it is claimed that applications of graduates of certain non-ICT bachelor programmes are considered on individual bases, no criteria or additional

entry requirements are provided. Therefore, it can happen that a graduate – of the MSc study programme that belongs to informatics/computer science subject area – has no competences in software engineering. Moreover, as some courses are taught in English language, the ability of students to be involved in discussions varies a lot because of their different English language skills.

The big majority of courses have the size of 6 ECTS and weekly 2+1 or 2+0, in total up to  $12 \times 3 = 36$  contact hours. Therefore, the number of hours for independent work of the students during a course is in the majority of cases supposed to be about 140; that gives the students' enough opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis. The students were satisfied with the supervision and support of their independent work. Note here that the ET got an impression that the students participating on the meeting did not represent the whole cohort of students – all students who attended the meeting were already professional developers of information systems.

The number of contact hours spent in classes is relatively small, about 20% of the total student workload. The share of lectures is about 65% and exercises/seminars about 35%. This is probably adequate for students already having work experience in the area. For students not having work experience in development or managing information systems, the share of exercises/seminars/practice should certainly be bigger.

The number of students has a declining trend, from 30 (2014) to 15 (2016). The relatively small number of students brings us to the following questions:

1. Is the relatively big number (5) of concentrations appropriate? The SER claims that the curriculum consists of five components: information systems prerequisites, business prerequisites, information systems technology, information systems management, concentration tracks and Master Thesis. Abolishing the concentration tracks would allow focusing more on the fundamental topics – on information systems technology and information systems management. This would also allow increasing the amount of optional courses each student can take.
2. Whether the marketing of the study programme has been conducted properly? Information systems are nowadays horizontally and vertically pervasive through all areas of human activity. Moreover, new emerging areas like *Industry 4.0* or *Internet of things* produce huge amount of data opening new perspectives for creating new information systems that allow development of new type of services. It seems that this understanding has not yet brought to the potential students.

**Recommendations:**

1. As no other college or university in Kosovo currently offers a master programme in information systems, keep the current name (*Information Systems*) of the study programme.
2. Elaborate adequate and proper learning outcomes for the study programme.
3. Offer the students opportunity in the study programme to go through full development cycle of information systems (for example, including also a *Project* course in the study programme).

4. Make the study programme more flexible taking into account the wide target group of students by harmonising the entry requirements to the study programme and the list of elective courses.

### 2.3. Staff

The overwhelming majority of teachers have full-time employment in the College.

The qualification of the academic staff is not quite appropriate, especially of these responsible for the study programme. They claimed during the meeting that their responsibilities are restricted with administrative matters, and that there is a study programme council that recommends improvements of the study programme. Therefore, there is no person responsible for the content of the study programme.

#### **Recommendation:**

5. Assign responsibilities for study programme quality to a person who has appropriate qualification.

### 2.4. Research and International Cooperation

According to the Strategic Plan & Goals 2020, the College is a teaching institution – research is not mentioned in it. The academic staff claimed that there is formed a SAP research group. Although SAP is discussed at least in one course (*Enterprise Resource Planning Systems*), a concrete software solution (SAP) cannot be considered as a topic for a serious research. Therefore, there are formed no real research groups in the area of the study programme. Although every teacher has some publications – some of them in fact very few – the majority has not got any significant results: according to Google Scholar, there is not a single citation to the publications of about half of the academic staff teaching on the study programme. The students' involvement in research takes place mainly during the final semester in the course of the preparation of the thesis.

The College has taken part on some TEMPUS and Erasmus projects.

International cooperation in research is conducted on individual level – there is currently running no international research and development joint project in information systems. Many teachers have conducted some of their studies in foreign universities and still keep academic contacts with these universities. The participating academic staff claimed that the College is supportive, for example covers the costs for participation on international conferences.

#### **Recommendations:**

6. Determine the research priorities of the department, form research groups and focus the research activities in priority topics.
7. Find opportunities to be included into international consortia for applying funds by international programs, especially by Horizon 2020.

## 2.5. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

The College is financially sustainable – 10-15% of the income is assigned to investments and about 7% remained for profit (“overhead” in the SER). Operational costs and equipment costs are combined under one position *Fixed Office Expenses*. Relatively big part of the budget (up to 15%) is used for scholarships and discounts and 6-7% for research and development.

The college has good quality buildings, good library and labs equipped with necessary hard- and software.

## 2.6. Quality Management

The study programme was previously accredited in 2014 for three years. Concerning internal evaluation process, no additional procedures on top of the general procedures were demonstrated. The main quality instrument is supposed to be the Curriculum Committee. Only one (out of fourteen) committee member – Larry Stapleton – can be considered as an expert in information systems. This is quite unusual for a master level programme and is a tremendous quality risk. Moreover, none of the persons responsible for the study programme has appropriate qualification.

# 3. Integrated Studies in General Medicine (accreditation)

## 3.1. General remarks

Overall, the documentation for accreditation of the different programs was in place. However, there was information lacking regarding the topics of the thesis work that will be offered to the students. The responsible persons explained that the topics of the theses will be given in due time, however, the institution should have an idea what can be offered, which will of course depend on the research infrastructure in place (see below) and the financial and research support that can be provided. In addition, the overview also contained erroneous information, for example it was mentioned in the SER that the Pharmacy study programme already started in the academic year 2016/17.

**In the future, it would be advisable to prepare the SER more diligently in order to avoid disturbing generalities, erroneous information and omissions.**

Additional requested documents:

- Contracts with cooperation partners (i.e. hospitals, pharmaceutical industries etc.), including terms of termination and monetary compensations:
- Budget, including salaries, infrastructure, equipment, consumables etc.

The additional documents were submitted by the applicants on the 10th of July 2017.



The below mentioned personal is – according to the provided information – responsible for the study programme and at the same time appointed full time at the University Clinical Center of Prishtina.

- Zaim Gashi – MD/PhD in Internal Medicine
- Sali Krasniqi – MD/PhD in Surgery
- Gani Halilaj – MD/PhD in Neuro Psychiatry.

### 3.2. Academic Programme and Student Management

The management of the College envisions the admission of 100 students per year to the programme.

**After carefully examining the infrastructure, staff personnel and financial recourses, the ET cannot agree with that request – the number of admitted students should be limited to 20.**

The allocation of ECTS points to the different courses is reasonable. The ECTSs for anatomy and physiology seemed high, however, the team of the institution was able to give a solid explanation why they did it as summarizes in the SER.

A setback is the fact that some of the elective courses i.e. Transfusion Medicine, Clinical Genetics, Nuclear Medicine and Pain Medicine need to be taught as mandatory courses. The responsible person for the programme mentioned that the general content of those courses are taught in the respective mandatory courses (i.e. Anesthesiology for Pain Management), however, after checking the content in the syllabus description we found out that the content in the elective courses was actually very basic and therefore of mandatory nature. The organization should put utmost attention in avoiding redundancies in the teaching contents!

Very disturbing was the fact that no OSCE exam is in place! Furthermore, the curriculum does not foresee a course of toxicology!

### 3.3. Staff

The ET appreciates the effort to assemble a professional team of teachers. The staff – as communicated by the responsible person - is comprised of 50 full time teachers holding an MD/PhD. All the personal is engaged in different hospitals, mainly in the University Clinic Center in Pristina.

### 3.4. Research and the International Cooperation

A major concern is the development of the research activity. The College is advised to constantly improve the laboratory facilities in terms of infrastructure, equipment as well as the access to consumables.

The College should seek to constantly increase the institutionalized international and national collaborations at the level of staff and student education. This would increase the sustainability of building a competitive education at the College. Regarding the national collaborations there are

multiple contracts in place, however, all the contracts (English contracts) can be terminated unilaterally immediately or within 1-12 month or need further approval before active. These contracts will NOT guarantee a sustained education for a six-year programme! Also, there is no information on how much the College needs to pay the institutions/hospitals for the effort they are willing to put into different programmes of the College. In fact, all the contracts explicitly mention that NO financial commitments will be given!

### 3.5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The clinical education of the students will be done mainly in the University Clinical Center of Pristina and three additional hospitals. The College has therefore NO exclusive access to a serving hospital with enough beds and therefore patients allowing the education of medical students at a European level (see also below). This, however, is an absolute prerequisite in order to guarantee quality of the education and availability of the staff for teaching.

The site visit was – in addition – overshadowed by serious worries that INSUFFICIENT funds will be available for laboratory and clinical-based 'research' work. If substantiated, this would seriously hamper the quality of the education, as well as the continuous education of the staff!

As infrastructure the management team showed the Lipjan site (innovation campus), which, according to the management team should act as a community hospital in the future. Even with the most optimistic outlook it is impossible to envision that the offered site can ever be used as a hospital. The total amount of beds is <10, the surgical theater HIGHLY inadequate for surgery and the different 'departments' i.e. internal medicine, nephrology, endocrinology etc. are simple equipped offices between 10 and 20 m<sup>2</sup> in size with close to no specific medical equipment, holding space for one physician!

The administration provided a financial plan for the course of general medicine. In order to guarantee a successful development, substantially more funds need to be allocated to the program.

A Medical School should at least have three fully equipped and staffed research departments (i.e. Anatomy/Genetics, Physiology and Pharmacology) in order to guarantee minimum research activities for staff development and respective theses work for the students.

The shortage of space, adequately equipped and staffed departments and the absence of patients in the Lipjan facility, would, at the moment, NOT allow quality education of 100 students or any smaller number of students. The ET appreciates the existence of the available space at the Lipjan site, however these alone will be insufficient for the training of medical students of any number, as well as the continuous research by the staff as required for a competitive Institution at the current European level.

### 3.6. Quality Management

Information available from the SER document allows conclusion that the quality instruments do not necessarily ensure quality of the study programme.

On the other hand, a strategy is in place to allow constant improvement of the teaching. The curriculum and the respective syllabi should be regularly (yearly) visited and the management should keep track of the implemented changes. This would also allow the ET – in the future – to track the development of the curriculum.

## 4. Integrated Studies in Pharmacy (accreditation)

### 4.1. General remarks

The below mentioned personnel is – according to the provided information – responsible for the study programme appointed full time at the Institution.

- Shpend Abdushi – PharmD
- Valon Ejupi – PharmD
- Fitim Alidema – PharmD

### 4.2. Academic Programme and Student Management

The management of the College envisions the admission of 50 students per year to the program. The allocation of ECTS points to the different courses is reasonable, however, in order to fulfil European standards some of the elective courses need to be taught mandatory, i.e. Pharmacotherapy, Drug stability and Radiopharmacy.

Very positive is the fact that the curriculum includes courses in drug development as well as pharmacogenetics! Furthermore, very positive is that the curriculum foresees a practical education for the students in pharmacies serving the community.

A setback is the fact that only 20 ECTS are foreseen for the Thesis work.

**The diploma thesis workload should have a minimum of 30 ECTS!**

A strategy will be put in place (new quality control system) in order to allow constant improvement of the teaching and monitoring outcome beyond checking the memorized facts. The curriculum and the respective syllabi should be regularly (yearly) visited and the management should keep track of the implemented changes. This would also allow the ET to track the development of the curriculum.

### 4.3. Staff

The ET appreciates the effort to assemble a professional team of teachers. The total staff is comprised of 5 full-time teachers holding a PhD. Four have a PhD degree in pharmacy! Two of the PhDs have a solid education obtained in Japan and have a proven track record in research as evidenced by a publication in Nature Methods where they share authorship! A healthy development of the study programme is however only possible if more staff personnel will be acquired in the future. The institution should also put emphasis on the continuous professional development of the staff members, as well as guarantee adequate research possibilities in order to guarantee a competitive research activity within the organization.

### 4.4. Research and the International Cooperation

A concern is the development of the research. The Institution is advised to constantly improve the laboratory facilities in terms of infrastructure, equipment as well as the access to consumables. The College should seek to constantly increase the institutionalized international and national collaborations at the level of staff and student education. This would increase the sustainability of building a competitive education at the local Institution. Regarding the national collaborations there are multiple contracts in act, however, all the contracts can be terminated unilaterally within 1-12 month. If the time for termination is shorter than a year this will NOT guarantee a sustained education of a 5-year programme! Very positive is the fact that two Pharmaceutical Companies are willing to closely collaborate with the Pharmacy programme, allowing students to do internships! However, there is no information on how much the College needs to pay the collaborating institutions for the effort they are willing to put in to the different programmes.

### 4.5. Finances and Infrastructure

The site visit was overshadowed by serious worries that INSUFFICIENT funds will be available for laboratory and pharmaceutical-based 'research' work. If substantiated, this would seriously hamper the quality of the education, as well as the continuous education of the staff!

However, it was described and evidenced in the additional documents that for the programme a total of 100K€, 200K€, 280K€, 350K€, 430K€ are allocated for the first 5 years, respectively, as funds for research and lab costs – not including staff salaries.

Most important, safety equipment i.e. acid/base cabinets, emergency shower, eye-showers, etc, are missing. These safety equipment needs to be installed BEFORE the coursework can start.

The research laboratories for technical pharmacy, pharmaceutical chemistry, pharmacognosy and pharmacology are equipped with some well used equipment. Very positive is the availability of a HPLC and quantitative PCR machinery able to do pharmacogenetic assessments at the genetic and functional level (therapeutic drug monitoring) of patients receiving 5-FU. For this, however, safety cabinets are necessary in order to avoid contaminations of the primer as well as templates.

At the moment, the laboratory space will only allow a pharmacy education for max. 20 students as well as the continuous research by the small group of staff, in order to guarantee an education at a European level.

## 5. Integrated Studies in Stomatology (accreditation)

### 5.1. General remarks

The documentation for accreditation of the Integrated Studies in Stomatology programme was, at the time of the site-visit, in place, however, not correct and sufficient.

The dental clinical infrastructure wasn't mentioned in the SER at all. It is important to mention size and major purchases in detail (for example number of dental chairs, x-ray devices, laboratory places). In addition a detailed budget for every study programme should be presented separately, including the last major expenses and the planned investments.

**Obviously the SER wasn't prepared properly.**

In the future it would be advisable that one responsible person of each study programme should check the information presented in the SER.

The following additional documents were requested during the site visit:

- Excel Sheet with all teachers of the Department of Stomatology, full-time and part-time with specialty and academic degree.
- Student Requirements (3 tables):
  1. Requirements of dental laboratory work
  2. Requirements of dental pre-work in phantom heads
  3. Clinical requirements
- International and local co-operations.
- Annex 7 like mentioned in the SER.
- Financial Budget plan for Stomatology.

### 5.2. Academic Programme and Student Management

The Integrated Studies in Stomatology Programme is planned as a 5-year study programme leading to The Doctor of Stomatology (Dr. Dent.).

The dental students will start with practical lab courses in the Dental Laboratory at UBT College (SER page 254) in the second study year, this allows the students to check the manual dexterity they get self-awareness of their skills for dental work and in case of infeasibility it is not too late to quit the

programme (especially from a financial point of view). These technical courses are followed by preclinical dental courses where students do dental treatment in phantom heads. In the 3<sup>rd</sup> year of study the students start with the clinical treatment of patients in the "Dental Clinic" on the second floor at the UBT building at Innovation Campus Lipjan.

For the practical courses all students will be separated in smaller groups up to 10 students per teacher.

Three detailed tables with the minimum requirements for all preclinical and clinical courses were presented in the additional documents. The clinical workload numbers in prosthodontics have to be raised (e.g. at the moment only 1 total or 1 partial denture are necessary to become a dentist, as well as the number of dental crowns, impression taking patients). Additionally, the numbers of observations and time to spend in the Maxillofacial Surgery (Clinic) and Orthodontic Department have to be mentioned.

The preclinical courses look reasonable and manageable.

In terms of treatment costs for the patients, the College will cover the treatment costs for the patients to attract more patients.

Bearing in mind that the College is no official dental clinic yet the fulfilment of the requirements for all planned 100 students can't be guaranteed. Patients are not a renewable resource – therefore the admission at this point should be limited to 20 students per year.

The elective courses mentioned in the curriculum should be switched to mandatory, additionally the following subjects should be added:

- Dermatology
- Hygiene and Infection Control
- Dental Hygiene
- Oncology plus Radiotherapy
- General Psychology and
- Dental Photography

A diploma thesis is mentioned in the Study programme plan in the last semester with 20 ECTS. The students should have the chance to start at an earlier stage with their research project for the diploma thesis.

The curriculum changes (raising the requirements, adding subjects and more research time for the thesis) could be easily realized by changing the curriculum into a 6-year study programme.

### 5.3. Staff

The academic staff list provided in the additional documents shows in total 35 teachers for the Stomatology programme (31 full-time and 4 part-time) of which at the moment 7 dentists (5 full time and 2 part-time) are engaged for the Dentistry programme according to the official KAA UBT

Academic Staff list 2017. Two additional dentists were mentioned in the additional documents (Aida Rexhepi, part-time Pediatric Dentistry and Vilson Cukaj, full-time Dental Materials) but aren't mentioned in the official Academic Staff list. These discrepancies have to be avoided in the future.

The core disciplines in dentistry are as follows:

- Restorative Dentistry (including Endodontics, Preventive Dentistry, Periodontics, Pediatric Dentistry, Oral Health)
- Prosthodontics
- Orthodontics and
- Oral Surgery/Maxillofacial Surgery

At the moment, all disciplines are covered by a full-time specialist at UBT College (see Table 1).

Teachers		Discipline		full-time	part-time
Name	Surname				
Agim	Prokshaj	Orthodontics		x	
Burim	Kiseri	Prosthodontics		x	
Mergime	Prekazi	Maxillofacial Surgery, Implantology			x
Merita	Barani Svecla	Restorative Dentistry		x	
Merita	Vitia	Restorative (Dental Care Elderly Patients)		x	
Vjosa	Hamiti Krasniqi	Oral Surgery		x	
Zana	Agani	Oral Surgery			x

**Table 1: Academic staff for the Dentistry program (only dental subjects)**

The teachers have to be present the whole time during dental clinic treatment for supervisory responsibilities. During discussions with the teachers it was mentioned, that they have a lot of dentists/teachers on a waiting list who haven't signed a working contract yet, because the study programme is at this time not accredited. This might change after the program is accredited.

***Recommendation:***

The ET suggests having a maximum number of 20 student admissions per year in the dental department due to the small number of dental teachers and supervision expenditures in clinic and research in the dentistry program.

#### 5.4. Research and International Cooperation

International collaborations in teaching and research exist (SER 772) and are provided in Annex 8.

A Detailed list of international publications (peer reviewed journals, textbooks, conference proceedings, abstracts) should have been provided in the Annex 7 (mentioned in the SER) but wasn't in place at time of the site visit. The additional documents provided demonstrate a variety of publications and national and international activity in congress lectures and presentations.

#### 5.5. Finances and Infrastructure

The dental infrastructure and the dental budget plan were not mentioned in the SER at all. The information concerning the infrastructure was gathered during the visit of the UBT facilities.

Lecture and seminar rooms are present, as well as the study programme management infrastructure with student office and student library.

The dental practical preclinical and clinical part will be performed on the second floor at the UBT building at Innovation Campus Lipjan. The floor is separated in a preclinical and clinical part.

The preclinical part consists of three rooms:

- A room for preclinical treatment training with 16 phantom heads with dental simulation models
- A dental lab room with 10-12 technical places and
- An additional lab room for gypsum and casting work procedures.

Dental Laboratory equipment was visible, but at the moment the Laboratory is not run.

In the ground floor of the building a panoramic x-ray machine is in place and periapical x-rays and bite-wing-x-rays can be run.

In the clinical part already 25 new dental chairs were visible:

- 3 in the division of Prosthodontics
- 12 in the division of Restorative Dentistry (Preventive Dentistry, Endodontics, etc.)
- 3 in the division of Periodontology
- 3 in the division of Orthodontics and
- 3 in the division Oral Surgery

It is planned that the students will treat patients for free, all costs will be covered by the College to attract patients.

A granted fund should be established to finance future investments (e.g. running costs like material for patient treatment).



During the site visit it was mentioned, that in the future (3 years) a new building will be constructed for the Dentistry Department.

The planned number of chairs and phantom heads is now suitable for 20 students, if the students number should be raised much more investments concerning infrastructure (space, chairs) must be performed.

### 5.6. Quality management

The College has an office designated for Quality Assurance (QA) and participates in the current EU Tempus program for enhancing QA in private HEIs in Kosovo. The QA is certified by quality assurance standards criteria of ISO 9001. A quality management plan is in place and the already existing study programmes are so far evaluated accordingly (SER pages 757-761).

## 6. LLM in Law, Computer Criminology and Forensics (accreditation)

### 6.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

The LLM in Law, Computer Criminology and Forensics is proposed as a one-year 60 ECTS programme, where each ECTS corresponds to 30 hours of student work. Approximately 75% of it is assigned to independent studies. As the name suggests, it is an interdisciplinary programme. The College expects to admit 20 students during the first year and increase admission to 50 per year from the second year.

The market analysis for this specific program is lacking detail. While it is clear that the law enforcement sector requires forensic specialists, the full need in Kosovo is not known. During the discussion the College representatives claimed that the Kosovo law enforcement sector would need "more than a hundred" trained persons. Considering the noticeably low drop-out rate in UBT, this would account for about three admission cycles, which is not promising for the long term sustainability of the programme. It is recommended to conduct a more detailed market analysis to identify the real training need.

Some courses have too many books listed as required reading. It is recommended that one textbook is designated as the main reading, whereas the others are voluntary. This would help the students to prioritise their time, while still pointing to valuable resources for those who want to study the subject matter in more depth.

The programme is designed around a Law bachelor who has passed 240 ECTS in their previous studies. As such, a 60 ECTS Master's program makes sense and would allow for continuing studies at

the doctoral level. However, this may become problematic for the IT students, who typically have 180 ECTS of previous studies. It is recommended to analyse the prospects of follow-on PhD studies for various disciplines and to include such information in the student brochures.

The current study programme has NO electives. All courses are mandatory. While there are supplementary courses that students can take to mitigate any shortcomings in previous studies, these would be added to the 60 ECTS. Considering the interdisciplinary nature of the programme, this is problematic for law bachelors who do not know enough about IT, as well as for the IT bachelors who do not have enough background in law. It is recommended to introduce an elective module that provides the 'missing' background to the various incoming students as part of the 60 ECTS, because very few incoming students will be proficient both in law and IT.

The Advanced IT Infrastructure and Security course, as currently proposed, does not fit into the curriculum. Non-IT students will likely lack the technical background to understand the 'advanced' concepts. Furthermore, the syllabus does not explain what, if any, security concepts are taught and how. It is recommended to re-design the course or replace it with something that introduces key cyber/information security concepts and technologies.

The Research Methods course is currently offered on the second semester. In order to get full benefit from it, it should be moved to the first semester, so that students are better prepared to start writing the thesis in the beginning of the second semester.

The programme is intended to be taught in Albanian. However, some of the relevant materials are available in English only and would require translation. Alternatively, UBT could require a baseline proficiency in English as a prerequisite for this program. Outside of school, almost all relevant materials and professional networks will be in English. Therefore, familiarizing the students with the use of English in their chosen field will provide additional value.

In general, the programme addresses relevant aspects of the fields covered by the programme title. However, the current proposal should be amended to address international forensics investigations (how to get evidence from a foreign country) and mobile device forensics as part of the existing courses.

While in general the courses listed are useful and support the programme goals, there are a number of items that need clarification in the syllabus:

- The Advanced Criminal Law and Criminal Procedure course aims and objectives start with "The second part of the course ...". It is unclear what is covered in the first part of the course and whether the split is a straight 50%/50% or something else.
- In the learning outcomes of the Advanced IT Infrastructure and Security course the students are expected to "make intelligent choices about computer architectures and platforms". It is not clear why and in what role they would make these choices. Furthermore, it is unclear what "adequate software" is meant in the equipment section.
- The Advanced Criminology and Penology course learning outcomes refer to both undergraduate and graduate students. In the assessment methods section there are two

tests, each worth 50% of the grade, as well as “research based work” and “active participation during classes”. It is unclear how the latter two are related to the final grade.

- The course description of Legal Aspects of Information Security starts with the statement “This module can almost be summed up in a two word phrase ‘phone hacking’.” This is a very narrow interpretation of information security, which ignores many of the relevant problems, such as ransomware and Distributed Denial of Service attacks (DDoS). The course description and content needs to be broadened beyond ‘phone hacking’ and personal data protection.
- The IT and Telecommunications Law course description includes “We will continuously monitor the implementation procedure and the draft law on telecommunications and its policy.” It is unclear which draft law is meant in this sentence. While it is not clear, one would assume that this course covers topics like how long and what type of logs do ISPs have to keep and when will such logs be made available to investigators.
- The E-commerce Law course description (and content) should also cover online fraud, if it is not covered elsewhere in the programme.
- The Digital Forensic Analysis course description seems to be plagiarized from <https://www.contextis.com/services/response/digital-forensic-analysis/>. Furthermore, the assessment is based on four short reflective reports and one essay. There seem to be no hands-on components in the course or the assessment.
- The Research Methods course seems to be focused on qualitative research methods, which is in stark contrast with the quantitative and proof-based approaches often expected from forensic investigators. It is recommended that quantitative methods are also covered in this course. Furthermore, the course should include a discussion on what methods and under what circumstances may be admissible in court proceedings.
- In the SER, the course syllabi (including descriptions, learning outcomes, etc.) of (1) Cyber Crimes and Cyber Security, (2) IT and Telecommunications Law and (3) Network and Telecommunications Forensics seem to be identical. It is therefore impossible to provide adequate feedback on those courses.

***Recommendations:***

1. Conduct a more detailed market analysis to identify the real training need in the (digital) criminology and forensics sector in Kosovo and relevant potential markets.
2. Designate one textbook per course as the main reading material, where applicable.
3. Analyse the prospects of follow-on PhD studies for various disciplines and include such information in the student brochures.
4. Introduce an elective module where a student can learn the basic concepts of law or IT, depending on their previous studies.
5. Replace or re-design the Advanced IT Infrastructure and Security course.

6. Move the Research Methods course to the first semester.
7. Consider requiring baseline English language proficiency from all students.
8. Cover mobile forensics in the technical part of the programme.
9. Cover international forensic investigation aspects in the law/procedural part of the programme.
10. Clarify the points raised in individual course descriptions in future versions of the programme.

## 6.2. Staff

The submitted programme includes 12 courses and the thesis. There are 6 courses (23 ECTS total) in the law category and 5 courses (18 ECTS total) in information technology/forensics category. The Research Methods course (4 ECTS) and the Thesis (15 ECTS) can be considered universal, as they are relevant to both categories.

Five of the twelve courses are taught by staff with no apparent relevant background, in terms of their education, work experience, publications, etc. A further three courses are taught by staff with partially relevant or up to date background. This is the most significant shortcoming of the current proposal. It is recommended that the instructors have extensive background on the subject that they teach. This background comprises of previous education (both academic degree programmes and professional training courses), work experience and publications on the subject.

Based on CVs, public profiles accessible on the Internet and affiliations listed in recent publications, the majority of the relevant staff holds additional posts (often multiple) outside of UBT. This puts to question their commitment to UBT and their ability to provide instruction and supervision throughout the Master's programme. It is recommended, where possible, to have at least one full time staff member (with appropriate background for the course) responsible for each of the offered courses. 'Full time' means, in this case, that a person has a contract with UBT, has declared UBT as their primary employer in online sources (LinkedIn, Google Scholar, etc.) and spends a *significant* majority of their time teaching, supervising and researching in UBT.

The person responsible for the programme has some background in the legal aspects of data protection, but no apparent connection to computer criminology, forensics or the relevant legal disciplines beyond data protection (law covering computer crimes, handling of evidence, etc.). While she does have a doctorate in law and some publications on personal data protection, her publications have no citations according to Google Scholar (h-index of 0). It is recommended that the person in charge of the programme is an internationally recognized expert on the subject.

UBT has established a CERT, which is claimed to be part of FIRST (could not confirm) and the Trusted Introducer (confirmed as a listed member) community. This group has great potential to add value to forensic studies, as they may be able to provide practical experience to the students, as well as real world examples. According to the UBT representatives, however, there is no teaching

collaboration between the proposed program and UBT-CERT. It is recommended to seek opportunities for further collaboration with UBT-CERT.

**Recommendations:**

11. The instructors must have extensive background on the subject that they teach.
12. Have at least one full time staff member responsible for each of the offered courses.
13. The person in charge of the program should be an internationally recognized expert on the subject.
14. Seek opportunities for further collaboration with UBT-CERT.

### 6.3. Research and International Co-operation

The personnel have varying success with research and publications. While the persons involved in the proposed programme have publications, the papers are typically few and not widely cited. According to Google Scholar, the h-index of the relevant staff tends to be in the range of 0 to 2. Even the stronger performers (for example, a researcher with  $h=5$ ) can be considered weak at the international level. In addition, the publications are generally not linked to the topic that is taught. While citations and the h-index are not goals in their own right, it is recommended to consider this factor when hiring new staff.

Several staff members have direct professional ties to neighbouring countries. While this is useful for providing context and international networking opportunities, it is also a problem, since the staff members often work elsewhere.

Several staff members have acquired their degree in foreign countries. This is useful, as they can bring their experience to UBT.

**Recommendation:**

15. Consider the number and quality of publications when hiring new academic staff.

### 6.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

The technical forensics courses require a forensics laboratory. There seems to be enough space available in the existing facilities to provide hands-on training to groups of 10-16 students at a time. There are also some larger computer classrooms, which might be usable for certain types of lab exercises. While some specialized forensics equipment and software exist at UBT, more investments are needed to teach 50 students, which is the stated aim of the program. In general, the infrastructure is adequate for the proposed program, but additional lab equipment will need to be procured as the program grows.

## 6.5. Quality Management

As the programme is new, no specific measures were reported.

However, it is troublesome that the SER seems to have been prepared in a hurry and with little attention to detail. There are numerous language problems present. For example, the sentence "The assessment will be done based on two **teststs**, interactivity, and research **based work based**."

## 7. Proposals for the decision on (re-)accreditation

The team of experts proposes the following decisions on (re-)accreditation of the study programmes submitted by UBT College:

1. Information Systems (MSc) – reaccredit for two years.
2. Integrated Studies in Pharmacy (MSc) – accredit for one year.
3. Integrated Studies in General Medicine (MSc) – not to accredit.
4. Integrated Studies in Stomatology (MSc) – accredit for one year.
5. LLM in Law, Computer Criminology and Forensic – not to accredit.