Assessment Report on the Application of UBT College for KAA Programme Reaccreditation 2016

Final Report 27th June 2016

Programme Reaccreditation Procedure at UBT College
Date: 16th – 17th May 2016. Pristina and Prizren, Kosovo

Experts' Team (ET)

- Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak / Tallinn University (EE)
- Prof. Dr. Balint Bachmann / University of Pecs (HU)
- Prof. Dr. Walter Cadek / University of Applied Sciences FH Johanneum (AT)
- Prof. Dr. Gabor Dombay / Szent István University (HU)
- Prof. Stephen Adam / (Formerly) University of Westminster (UK)
- Mr. Tapio Heiskari / European Sudents Union (EU)

Coordinators of KAA

- Prof. Dr. Blerim Rexha / State Quality Council - KAA
- Ms. Furtuna Mehmeti / Acting Director Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation - KAA
- Mr. Shkelzen Gerxhaliu / Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring – KAA

Nr.	Study programmes	Experts
II.1	Architecture and Spatial Planning/ BSc	Balint Bachmann
II.2	Integrated Design/ BA	
III.1	Civil Engineering and Infrastructure/ BSc	Gabor Dombay
III.2	Civil Engineering and Infrastructure/ MSc	
IV.1	Computer Science and Engineering/ BSc	Peeter Normak
IV.2	Computer Science and Engineering/ MSc	
V.1	Mechatronics Management/ BSc	Walter Cadek
V.2	Mechatronics Management/ MSc	
VI.1	Political Sciences/ BA	Stephen Adam
VI.2	International Relations / MA	

On the basis of UBT Self Evaluation Report 2016, KAA UBT Assessment Reports 2013, 2015, Site Visit by the Experts' Team at UBT College, May 16-17th, 2016 in Pristina and Prizren. Additional documents presented to the Experts during the Site Visit. Additional documents requested by the Experts and sent via KAA on May 15th, 2016. Response by UBT to Draft Assessment Report, sent via KAA 23rd June 2016.

Table of Content

I. General Remarks

I.1. Mission Statement, Organization, Management and Planning

The Experts' Team (ET) was received by the President of UBT College and a larger number of academic and administrative staff; a brief slide show was produced on the mission, vision, strategic plans, and achievements of UBT, printouts of which were part of the additional documents presented to the ET during the site visit. The mission and vision of UBT were briefly and convincingly demonstrated with background information about the National Educational Context of the Institution's Positioning (SER p.6-14.):

UBT offers a dynamic and innovative 21st century academic environment, a supportive and challenging opportunity for the students, faculty and staff in participatory and self-governance setting building on a tradition of teamwork between students, faculty, staff and administrators. UBT is committed to enhance its participation as an active member of community by providing learning opportunities driven by teaching and research excellence, intellectual interaction and creativity. In short UBT is a preeminent centre of intellectual and cultural activity in Kosovo, improving the region's quality of life through

the skills, knowledge, experience and engagement of its faculty, staff, students and alumni.

The ET recommends to include more reflection on the dynamic review of any programme for re-accreditation at future Self Evolution Reports (SER). Detailed analysis of the evidence and experience gained in running the programmes(s) together with a clear indication of any subsequent changes made to the programme should be available as part of the internal quality assurance process of UBT.

UBT in its respond *„accepted the recommendation for further information on and internal quality, progression, dynamics and efficiency related to programmes , although this is not currently a KAA requirement"*.

I.2. Academic Freedom and Quality Management

UBT officials highlighted the style of community engagement, not only with a view on Kosovo society, but also with the Balkan region in mind; the ET recognized the valuable inputs and influences exercised by UBT, its staff, students, and alumni, on local and regional socioeconomic and educational contexts. Organizational aims goals, and procedures matched mission objectives: UBT travels a well-charted route and should proceed further in that direction. This also applies to the idea of basing teaching on specific projects, which at times permeate subject boundaries, as well as to the elaborate ISO 9001-based quality management procedures. UBT received Business Excellence 2014 as first higher education institution in the West-Balkans.

I.3. Academic Programmes and Student Management

With regard to organization and management the ET took note of the structures laid out in the SER and additional explanations by the staff present; the structures in place did not raise any negative comments regarding institutional reaccreditation. The same applies to facilities and equipment, in particular the new building in Lipjan for the science and engineering programs visited during the site visit: spacious, well-fitted – giving the extra breathing space the partial move of departments to Pristina's available faculty building. UBT no question is in a solid financial state, generating a moderate financial profit; the forecasts for 2016-2018 however, seem to be a bit optimistic based on a progressively rising curve of student fee income. Operating costs, capital expenses, wages, and depreciation, nevertheless, are fully covered in any case; whether the net profit meets the expectations.

The students seem very content with the delivery of their studies. Pedagogical skills of the staff are seen as advanced, with even favorable international comparison offered by students who have studies elsewhere in Europe. Both problem-based learning and practice-oriented learning were readily brought up during the student meeting as familiar approaches. The principles of student-oriented learning are well implemented according to the students, with staff giving students the tools they need to learn instead of delivering static lectures.

Student services and support in UBT are well taken care of. According to the SER, student orientation and tutoring are planned right from the beginning of studies. Staff are apparently very easy to approach for the students. Support is easily available straight from the professors and administrative staff, if needed. Students reported UBT having a very clear administrative support structure: if a member of staff is unable to assist, it's always clear where to make the next inquiry.

I.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

SER 2016 contains a meaningful statement of finance; that was a good basis for discussion during the site visit.

The UBT Research Themes and Priorities (SER p.157) in Research Strategy and Plan allows a look into which direction UBT intends to turn in the medium term. Never less a more detailed description of the main strategic (max 3 or 4) scientific topics would be useful for the next institute accreditation.

Moving the learning functions to a new campus outside the city center brings with it the question of accommodation and transport. Bus rides from the "old campus" to the new one are adequate as a temporary solution. However, a dormitory solution would be preferable. Student housing as part of the university campus would undoubtedly save students valuable transport time, ease access to university facilities such as the library and bring with it further collegiality and sense of belonging to a university.

Finally, the students' employability and employment seems to be outstanding. Even during their studies students partake in internships, and after graduation they are quickly employed to jobs corresponding to their abilities. According to the SER, even their progress after that is very satisfactory. This is somewhat expectable, considering Kosovo as an emerging knowledge society, but it is clear that UBT provides its students with both knowledge and abilities that are very much in demand in working life.

I.5. Staff

UBT states (SER p.167), that *"in the upcoming three years the expenditure plan will prefer program operation, staff retention and recruitment, initiation of applied research and improving student services. This principled approach for the initial financial expenditures, the institution intends to allocate the lions share of incomes for program operation and staff, research and development, capital investments, international cooperation activities and capacity development."* Further assessment outcomes for UBT could depend on the success of such ambitions.

The present staff situation is adequate in the science subjects, but improvement in the field

of Humanities is required. Further remarks on the staff situation can be found in the context of the respective programs up for reaccreditation.General notes to human resource policy at UBT, entrepreneurship spirit, good research policy, support for PhD/DLA candidates, remarkable staff development policy, organizing conferences and exchanges, excellent cooperation with colleagues – a forum for independent minds, characterized by an open academic culture.

I.6. Students' Affairs

The number of students in UBT is rather small, which is well justified in the SER by issues of quality. Experience during the site visit supports the justification: the students seemed very happy with the quality of their education. Projections and plans to introduce new study programmes and further increase the number of students poses various challenges for the institution, of which the administration seems well aware.
Meeting with students during the site visit was an open and constructive meeting but overwhelmingly attended packed with Business, Management and Economy students - hence their experience dominated - which did not relate to the programmes for re-accreditation/accreditation. Only one BA Political Science student attended + none from the Warsaw MA International Relations, initially there were no Civil Engineering students but two were called in.

The meeting was very informative and students were well aware of all aspects of their learning process and support in UBT. However, the evaluation group would have preferred to converse with students from all the programmes evaluated, instead of specifically invited individuals.
UBT responded on student representation during the site visit: „*The institution has been previously instructed that the students be appointed by the Students' Representative Body (S'RB)....The representation of the students is determined by the voting numbers and in this case the weight of student numbers within the programme determines the level of representation*". It is an acceptable explanation for the small programmes' (Political Science/Civil Engineering) under-representatition in the S'RB, but the presence of those students' group is essential for future accreditation cycles.

I.7. Finances and Fees

UBT's accessibility situation is not quite ideal due to its tuition fees, which seem rather high relative to local wage levels and public institutions' fees. However, this is very well heeded by the institution. There are numerous instruments in place to support applicants and students who come from a disadvantaged background, have performed with distinction, take part in research and so on. These, together with various other services substantially level the playing field in terms of access to higher education.

The drop-out rate of UBT students is not alarming, if not ideal either. There is considerable variation between study programmes. The students report reasons for dropping out to be mostly economic, which is quite understandable. Another issue is reportedly passing courses, as the studies can be rather demanding. Strict assessment is understandable for an institution aspiring to high quality, but as the passing rates seem to have had a dip already some years ago according to SER, the issue of passing is something to look into.

UBT respond on Students' drop-out rate underlines its *„assessment system addressed since last year taking a list of measures: student support, teacher support and resource support.... Tutoring System to provide additional assistance to students that have demonstrated lower achievement rates... UBT implements a thorough ex-ante procedure for staff selection, it has also focused on creating a system in place for (a) Mentoring System and (b) Professional Development for Lecturers,... a freshmen training program and CPD training programme on teaching methods, research methods and E-education". UBT develops „the level of educational resources,... reading materials and textbooks that are suitable for students' level of development... it operates STEM preparation courses to address the rather low student achievement in secondary school examination".*

Recommendations:

- Look into reasons for students not passing their courses and act on emerging issues, support all courses with a Lecturer, Assistant Lecturer and a Tutor,
- Consider providing housing for the students studying at the new campus.

I.8. Recommendations to the KAA and Ministry:

- The ET compliments the KAA staff for the excellent and professional organisation of the re-accreditation/accreditation event and whole process.
- The KAA and Ministry are recommended to revisit the requirements for Self Evaluation Reports (SER). In particular, SER should include a focus on their internal review process of the qualification(s) covered and evidence gained and investigated. The SER should also include detailed analysis of responses to any recommendations from the most recent past accreditation. KAA guidelines for SER need to focus more on evidence-based review of old programmes and resultant changes to the revised and updated proposal. The SER should also indicate where further information, policies, rules and detailed regulation of the Higher Education Institution (HEI) could be electronically accessed.

II. Bachelor of Science in Architecture Reaccreditation and BFA Integrated Design Accreditation

II.1 Bachelor of Science in Architecture Reaccreditation

This Report refers to the SER 2016, the Final Report on Programme Accreditation 2013 and the the Final Report on Programme Accreditation And Re-Accreditation 2014 and 2015.

During the Site Visit the confusing application description about the Branch was clarified, that differently of the "*programme applies to Branch Ferizaj*" (SER 2016 p.1126. and printed version of SER 2016 p.23.), this accreditation is devoted to the same BSc in Architecture programmes maintained in Pristina, Ferizaj and Prizren.

BSc in Architecture programme at UBT went through several evaluations from 2012. General changes has been made since, recommendations of the experts were followed in terms of students' enrollment and development of staff and infrastructure. Officials of KAA confirmed, that UBT finished a new site and made general changes in its' constitutional organization.

During the site visit on 16-17th May 2016 the experts had the chance to inspect the facts declared at SER 2016.

UBT launched Architecture BSc programme – paralelly to the Pristina branch - at the Ferizaj branch 3 years ago. As many of 35% of the students of the current programme are coming from this region, there is a demand to have a presence at Ferizaj. According to staff interviews, there is no plan to increase the intake of students there, but to establish BSc in Architecture in Prizren too. A city with great history, culture and architecture, where the local labor market demand for the building sector is merging. The study programme is the same as in Pristina, according to regulation of higher education law, no difference is allowed at any of the branches. Student enrollment is planned up to 50 students per semester.

II.1.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

The curricula has been changed significantly since 2012, following the recommendations of the experts. The programme responds to the 11 points of studies balancing between theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training. Doing so ensure the quality and European recognition of diplomas of Kosovo. The overall programme is a suitable architectural study plan, it fulfils European and international criteria of a BSc level. Design studio work has now about 50% of all classroom hours, which is appropriate. The weekly hours of lectures and tutorials is between 20 and 26, which is ideal for studies like Architecture. Students efforts to complete their design studio work outside lecturing hours can justify a lower workload (24 to 26 hours) of contact hours a week.

Additional courses were introduced lately with up-to-date topics such as advanced CAD, On Site Management, Building Information Modelling. UBT Career Centre organizes 3-months internship on request of the students. Annual students' exhibition is held during the Architecture Week. Cross border summer school takes place at summer. At the third year of the programme a study tour is organized abroad. UBT Architechture Department organizes an Architechture Summer Academy on annual basis involving and open to both local, regional and international staff and students.

UBT provided further information about the Bachelor Thesis work/Capstone, that shows significant results in technical, architectural, graphical and other skill of the final designs of students.

In semester 5 students of BSc in Architecture can choose from 4 Concentrations: Sustainable Architecture, Urban Management, Architectural Restauration and Interior Design.

Under elective subjects of Sustainable Architecture we can still find topics like Fire Protection or Earthquake Engineering, which are important but not related to sustainability. Meanwhile there are teachers at UBT with international and even local experience in terms of sustainable city development. It is necessary to replace the incoherent subjects by those.

UBT stated in its respond *„to replace Fire Protection or Earthquake Engineering with more suitable courses in Sustainable Installation, Energy Reduction Installation or Water Reduction".*

The idea and the topics of the Concentrations are actual and highly needed in Kosovo, 20 ECTS for specialization of 180 ECTS of the 3-years study programme must be consolidated during the MSc programme, not to step over the European Commission's (EC) recommendation of 10% of non-general architectural skills of the 300 ECTS study plan. A too early specialization, like during BSc is not wishful, specializations should be mentioned only in the final year of the 3+2 years programmes of Architecture seeking for EC equivalence for full licencing in the EU.
UBT's respond on Concentrations/Specialisation: *„the correct focus is on concentrations and not on specializations. The concentrations are... meant to channel the students towards areas of their particular interest in architechture rather than Specialisation"* doesn't overwrite the demand of the ET about the *particular* content of the programme, which is not recommended by the guidelines mentioned before. The requirement of an all-in-all 5-years generalist education of Architects is essential, meanwhile an early study-phase specialization/concentration is not welcome. According to the EC Directive – if taken in consideration – allows concentration/specialization during the study programme of Architecture - in the final, fifth year.

The study program of BSc in Architecture is constructed upon the curricula of some recognized European schools of Architecture (TU Vienna, TU Delft Univeritate Mariboru). UBT is following the earlier recommendations of the experts by fulfilling guidelines for Architecture education of the European Commission (EC). The programme responds to the 11 points of studies balancing between theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training.

- The content of the curriculum takes into consideration the Council Directive 85/384/EEC of 10 June 1985 on the mutual recognition of diplomas, certificates and other evidence of formal qualifications in architecture, including measures to facilitate the effective exercise of the right of establishment and freedom to provide services. The program shall be balanced between the theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training and shall ensure the (1) acquisition of the ability to create architectural designs and satisfy both aesthetical and technical requirements, (2) an adequate knowledge of the history and theories of architecture and the related arts, technologies and human sciences, (3) the knowledge of fine arts as an influence on the quality of architectural design, (4) an adequate knowledge of urban design, planning and skills involved in the planning process, (5) an understanding

between the relationship between people and buildings and between buildings and the environment, (6) an understanding of the profession of architecture and the role of architect in the society [social factors]. (7) methods of research and investigation for design project, (8) an understanding of the structural design and engineering problems associated with building design, (9) knowledge of physical problems and technologies, (10) necessary design skills to meet users' requirements within the constraints imposed by cost factors and building regulations and (11) knowledge of the industries, organizations, regulations and procedures involved in translating design concepts into buildings and integrating plans into overall planning.

Doing so, UBT ensures the later European recognition of diplomas in Architecture of Kosovo. The overall programme is a suitable architectural study plan, it fulfils European and international criteria of the BSc level. According to the recognition of Professional Qualifications in the European Union (Directive EC/2005/36 Article 21/7) and its Modernisation of the Professional Qualifications Directive (Brussels, 9 October 2013)

"***for architects**, the revised Directive sets the training requirement to either five years of university training or to not less than 4 years of full-time study at a university, supplemented by supervised professional traineeship of a minimum of two years. This solution offers the necessary flexibility to accommodate different approaches in the Member States (the duration of both the academic and practical components varies between Member States)".*

Following the EC guidelines, it is important to observe the 3 year-BSc and the 2 year-MSc curricula together, though the directive requires five years of university training.

Recommendations

- The planned number of enrolled students of 500 in all is rather high, but the demand of the labor market can justify it. To ensure the quality of the programme from, it is recommended to examine the students' applications critically during the entrance procedure.

II.1.2. Staff

During the discussions, it was told that the study programme in Architecture BSc would be conducted fully in the separate braches, the students wouldn't need to go to the main campus in Pristina for the studies. All of the courses will need to be taught at the two locations and this impacts the resource utilization. The impressing staff development of the last years at UBT allows, that the full-time staff members with the participation of local professionals can manage to teach at both locations. UBT improved its' staff significantly, young educators introduced themselves as highly motivated competent members of a community led by former Dean Dr. Binak Beqaj. 10 PhD degree-holders and 12 candidates of PhD/DLA, which is impressive, since scientific degrees are rare among Architects.
Student/staff ratio is satisfactory, although the high number of students per semester can be difficult to manage in the weekly timetable. Upon the request of the experts UBT provided

support methods of the staff. Foreign experience and finishing of doctoral education is crucial for the development of young educators, UBT recently invests in the future generation of leading professors.
Dr. Lulzim Beqiri is named as responsible person for the BSc in Architecture, his capability and ambition secure the further development of the programme on a long term. Ajhan Bajmaku PhD-candidate designer, Kujtim Elezi architect with PhD and Bujar Demjaha architect and spatial planner are mentioned as responsible persons too.
If UBT is intending to enrol 500 students in all, they must count with the high working load of staff especially in tutorial demanding subjects like Architectural Design or Construction.

Recommendations

- UBT shall keep on developing human resources, even the regulations of nomination for full professorship in Kosovo doesn't allow to earn this title for educators employed in non-university level colleges for now. Participation in research and international mobility ensure the increasing academic quality of the staff and programme development.
- Considering that the volume of BSc students will be increasing during the coming years by teaching both in Prishtina and Prizren up to 500 (confusing total number of students for 2016/17: 1190! at SER 2016 p.63.) with potential starting of MSc programme too, the plans for faculty members' teaching load should be monitored and used in staff planning.

II.1.3. Research and International Cooperation

UBT as an institution and its' leaders are active in national and international professional organizations, the scientific content of their efforts are well documented, it is important to continue to become a certified university. UBT has proven this year's international and scientific programmes as additional document. The cooperation with other universities (in Kosovo and outside) can allow students and their educators to measure their performance objectively.

The developing city of Pristina and the virulent historic Prizren offer several urban, building technological and architectural topics of research and innovation. UBT is active in international cooperation in many disciplines, the connections to other schools of Architecture especially in the region are established and to be developed. The competent and enthusiastic staff members can create a challenging atmosphere at UBT, that is needed to have a recognized school of Architecture.
UBT's respond on Research in Architecture: *„developed and consultated with stakeholders, industry has been engaged in curriculum development and implementation whether in formulating priorities, implementing the course practice or through the UBT Alumni"*.

Recommendations:

- Involve local professionals and decision makers at the beginning of the course to establish scientific work in Architecture.
- Connect research activities with actual topics of urban development, building investment and technology through staff members who are already involved.
- Raise the attractiveness of the programme by hiring foreign visiting staff.
- Involve local professionals and decision makers at the maintance of the course.
- Connect research activities with actual topics of the cities of branches.
- Ensure the same attractiveness of the different branches by hiring foreign visiting staff.

II.1.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

Creating a new campus outside the centre of Pristina in Lipjan solved the concerns about need of space for architectural studies. Though the empty spaces of the new building should be filled by students' activities such as drawing room for in dependent work or storage of students' models/drawings. It produces a creative mood, which is needed for Architecture. Spaces of common activities like café or club could have a great impact on homelike atmosphere of the new site. UBT delivered numbers about finances that proves the possibility of investing in equipment and furniture.

The main building and the new campus outside the city center have specialized facilities and IT classroom needed for the basic courses of all disciplines.
For the studies in Architecture, special software (CAD) and hardware (plotter, scanner, 3D equipment) is required. High-speed internet access is necessary for using internet databases. As most of the materials are available in the Moodle system, this installation enables access to course information. According to an interview during the site visit, Moodle is widely used by staff members and students.
For courses like Architectural Design, Construction or Modeling, special laboratory access is needed. These facilities are available on both campuses. In some cases UBT duplicates the investments for it.
There is a library on both campuses available for the students. It seems that the currently available books are not connected to the ones mentioned in the course descriptions, there are generally few books related to Architecture. The library is expecting to get a large quantity of books from the US and the process is in transition. The list of book and journal catalog shows, that further development of literature in Architecture is needed.

Recommendations:

- Complete the library with books and journals in Architecture.
- Connect library books to the courses taught at the branches.

Branch in Prizren for BSc in Architecture Programme

In the current accreditation, a visit to Prizren was taken place on 17th of May.

The ET of the Accreditation of the Branch in Prizren in 2015 recommended allowing implementation the branch without condition. The ET observed some aspects to fulfil about the current building and potential resources to accommodate the planned number of students. The identified potential conflict for studio/laboratory space with the architecture

programme led the expert team to recommend developing either the basement or the refectory building prior to a student intake of 200 across all four programmes. Development of the basement and/or refectory space should also be carried out with proper staff office space in mind. Appropriate facilities, equipment and materials as seen in the new campus on the outskirts of Pristina should be replicated at Prizren. There should be some consideration of student (and staff) social facilities.

Following findings from ET's Chair *Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak* reflect on the fulfilment of the requirements for Architectural studies as well.
"A newly renovated two-storied building with computer lab and library is ready for receive students. Two neighboring plots with a two-storied building on one and a small restaurant on the second plot have been bought. There are two big rooms that can be used for extra-curricular activities in the renovated building. Additional rooms for these purposes can be assigned in the second building and in the restaurant."

II.1.5. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

- We recommend to establish working space for students of Architecture at the new site and concentrate more on Design Studio work methods.
- Cooperation with national and international universities in form of workshops, common projects can enhance students' activity and can raise quality of education.
- Research in Architecture should be developed in terms of Sustainability, Urbanism and Experimental Issues.

Final Recommendation:

- Reaccreditation of the Bachelor of Science in Architecture programme at the Pristina and Ferizaj Branch of UBT is recommended for 3 years.
- Based on the analysis points Accreditation of the Bachelor of Science in Architecture programme at the Prizren Branch of UBT is recommended for 3 years.

II.2. BFA Integrated Design Accreditation

The Experts' Team (ET) based its evaluation on the SER 2016 of UBT, the Site Visit made by the ET to the College on 16-17th May 2016 and the further information earned by the ET during the discussion with the colleagues of UBT.

II.2.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

The programme has been designed to respond to the context and demand in the labour market. The Curriculum Committee has taken into account the content similar programmes from several institutions worldwide: BA Integrated Design –Koln International, Dassau, Bremen, Politecnico Milano, Aalto University, Glasgow, Stockholm School of Arts and Parsons New York.

The aim of the study is well defined: *"Students are expected to have the necessary skills to assist in the research and concept development phase with the ability to understand user requirements, social and consumer dynamics, formal language and corporate philosophy. The graduates are expected to work in various areas: industrial product design, etc."* UBT uses an indicator framework to assess demand for professionals and economic sectors. The indicator framework is composed of skill sectors employing most of professionals (to differentiate among all workers in the sector), share of professionals' distribution in all economic sectors (ISCO) and job creation tendency in the past decade for the respective economic sector (NACE).

Goals of the study programme: *"The graduate of this study programme will acquire all the knowledge and competence in arts and design, structures, materials, information technology and social science."* To acquire all competence is not required on Bachelor level, but a multidisciplinary approach can be achieved during the 3-years study time. "*The curriculum integrates multiple disciplines. The curriculum includes education in the basic principles of visual organisation and communication design alongside more advanced work in design-led research and development."* The curriculum design meets legal requirement for Bachelor study programmes of six semesters. Following from the general requirements, the total of 180 ECTS (30 ECTS per semester) is distributed as follows: 150 credits are allocated to the mandatory course units of the study field (12 of them are dedicated to the BA Thesis/Capstone project and 3 for Internship); elective subject units account 5 credits. The number of subjects studied accountable for one semester is 6 to 8.

Learning Outcomes expected: *"Participate in planning, design and implementation of projects, to actively participate, contribute and adapt to interdisciplinary teams in industry, to engage in design research using quantitative and qualitative research methodology, adapt to technology and work methods in integrated design, design ethics and regulations underpinning the profession."* The programme BFA in Integrated Design supposed to balancing between theoretical and practical aspects of students' training. Doing so ensuring the quality and equivalence of diploma. The overall program is a suitable design study plan, it fulfils European and international criteria of a 6-semester Bachelor of Fine Art level.

Most Design Studio work supposed to have equal (50-50%) of all classroom hours, which is appropriate. It is calculated with the independent work load of the students. The weekly hours of lectures and tutorials varies from semester to semester: 19 (1.), 21 (2.), 19(3.), 21(4.), 18(5.) and 16(6.), which is 19 in average, for Fine Art studies affordable. Students' efforts to complete their design studio work outside lecturing hours can justify a lower workload of about 20 hours of contact hours a week.

Still Practical time is allocated to low comparing to Lectures in the study plan:
P9/L10 (1.), P9/L12(2.), P7/L12(3.), P7/L14(4.), P6/L12(5.) and P6/L10(6.).

The ratio of L/P/ECTS of the subjects varies. Every subject has 3/4/5 ECTS, "Design Studio" or courses like „Fundamentals of Product Design" and „Fundamentals of Graphic

Design“ with 5 ECTS each have more workload than others, the number of ECTS should respond this fact with more credits.
The Admission Criteria declares: “*Students completed undergraduate degree in Construction and Infrastructure, Civil Engineering and Architecture. Or students that have graduated from Business and Administration fields who demonstrate prior work experience in Construction Engineering are able to complete the Preparation Packages involving several undergraduate courses delivered at UBT Curriculum Structure.”* The entrance criteria for applicants with completion of some far-related professions like Construction or Civil Engineering or Architecture doesn't allow direct conclusion of the capability of the applicants upon their creativity and artistic skills. Same criteria for non-related professionals such as Business and Administration undergraduate should prove their capability by passing a UBT organized entrance exam in „Perception in Space and Freehand Drawing“ or “Portfolio of Professional CV”.

“Students with upper secondary degrees in arts, construction, architecture and manufacturing”. A detailed description of the evaluation is not included, it is not clear, if secondary school degree-holder could and if, how can enter the BFA in Integrated Design.

UBT's respond on BFA Design Admission Criteria: *„the correct Admission criteria are as follows: Students of Upper Secondary School Diploma in Arts and Design, in Hummanities, in ICT in Engineering/Architecture, and in Business and Administration.*
All students must have achieved at least 40% in Matura Examination”.

More important criteria is declared for evaluating the artiscic skills: *„Students from other areas need to demonstrate prior work experience in design or be able to engage in a Preparatory Package during the summer term”.*

50 students for BFA in Integrated Design is ambitious, but the enormous list of full-time staff can handle such a big number of students. External professional staff can help to keep up with international movements in art. The number of full-time staff to the number of students (50) planned to enrol is appropriate. High working load of staff could accure especially in tutorial demanding subjects like Design Studio work.
The main axis of the studies is dedicated to basics of the discipline of design going horizontal across all 6 semesters. The axis is supplemented by general professional subjects (Design Methods, Design Structures Fundamentals of Product Design, Design Communication) and the training of creative skills (Drawing, , Ideation, Modelling, Graphic Design, Contemporary Issues). In every semester the design task is becoming more complicated therefore theory and practical subjects must help students in every step of the new task.

In semester 5 four Concentrations take place:

- Graphics and Communication Design,
- Product Design,
- Fashion and Textile Design,
- Interior Design

The topics are appropriate with the strategy of UBT related to labour market conscious studies.
Content of the concentration subjects respond well to the aims of the specialized skills targeted by the study plan. A possible collision of Interior Design with Architecture – conducted at UBT successfully – is to be examined. More reliable topic in BFA of Integrated Design could be Building Decoration and Furnishing.

The workload structure of the programme is focused on lectures and practical exercises within the subjects.
This structure is logical and consistent to ensure study outcomes and program aims. The overarching didactic concept of teaching methods is widely acknowledged by the interviewed representatives of the teaching staff.
Group work experience is sufficiently described in the subject syllabus. For professional work collaboration in design studios teamwork and collaborations with engineering science specialists are required (Practice Design Studio-Internships).
Theoretical components linked to practical work tasks are sufficiently provided in the descriptions.
The hours of student`s independent work per course seem realistic. Experts of Art studies often have the impression, that students of Art are obliged to work much more for the courses than indicated in the descriptions of study modules. Especially design work requires huge amount of workload from students. The descriptions of the design studios (project based learning) and other subjects' definitions are exact, their content is announced in the syllabus.

Some Engineering oriented subject descriptions are not fitted to BFA, like *"Design Structures and Engineering"* aiming to analyse and calculate stresses and deflections by the students. Introduction and understanding of Structural and Mechanical Engineering should be focused on, not earning semi-competences of the Engineering professionals.

Recommendation:

- The new programme scheme has been developed to address international requirements of the 3 years of BFA in Integrated Design. The programme should develop specific identity to become more recognisable at the local international market to attract more students from Pristina and the region.
- The study program BFA in Integrated Design should continue to process the curricula balancing theoretical and practical (50-50%) knowledge based on design studio work of the students,
- Admission criteria including detailed method of evaluating the artiscic skills of Students from other areas need to demonstrate prior work experience in design,
- Thesis/Capstone and other design studio/practical subjects should have 50% or more of the total ECTS.

II.2.2. Staff

The impressing staff development of the last years at UBT allows, that the full-time staff members with the participation of local professionals can manage to teach at both locations. UBT improved its' staff significantly, young educators introduced themselves as highly motivated competent members of a community led by Dean Dr. Binak Beqaj.
Student/staff ratio is satisfactory, although the high number of students per semester can be difficult to manage in the weekly timetable. Upon the request of the experts UBT provided support methods of the staff. Foreign experience and finishing of doctoral education is crucial for the development of young educators, UBT recently invests in the future generation of leading professors.
If UBT is intending to enrol 350 students of BFA in all, they must count with the high working load of staff especially in tutorial demanding subjects like Architectural Design or Construction.
The BFA in Integrated Design have a sufficient number of qualified full-time staff from the professional point of view. Proper information about the actual status oft he teaching (full- and part-time) was handed over to the experts during the site visit. There is a permanent demand on Professors on the field of Art.
Responsible persons of the programme are Binak Beqaj, Dean with PhD in Architecture, Ponesta Dika with PhD in Art History and Shpresa Suli with PhD in Economics.

They are highly recognised professionals urgently needed in such an advanced study field, but non of them is an Artist. Their competence in Bachelor of Fine Art can have an impact on the artistic quality of the students' performance, if they are deeply involved in the education of them.

A determinative, recognized designer of the specific field of Integrated Design should be named as artistic head of the programme of BFA in Integrated Design. Art and Design professional experience and competence are internationally widely acknowledged as criteria for academic titles. There are numerous personal with proper occupation and wide practice in Design and Fine Art. Ajhan Bajmaku, Alban Muja, Fatmir Krypa, Bujar Demjaha, Valmir Hoxha, Hivzi Muharremi, Artan Behluli, Fatim Krypa are such persons, if finally announced as full-time staff members at UBT. It is to mention, that after 5 years of acting as an expert in Kosovo, still an uneasy task to find of the status, competence and purpose of the staff from the "CV-xls-syllabus" triangle.

UBT's respond on staff development: *„Starting from the first curriculum implementation cycle, the School of Design will have a separate Dean to lead its development in the nascent phase".*

Recommendations

- UBT shall keep on developing human resources, even the regulations of nomination for full professorship in Kosovo doesn't allow to earn this title for educators employed in non-university level colleges for now. Participation in workshops, competitions and international mobility ensure the increasing academic quality of the staff and programme development.

- Considering that the volume of BFA students will be increasing during the coming years by teaching in Pristina up to 350 students till 2019/20, the plans for faculty members' teaching load should be monitored and used in staff planning.

II.2.3. Research and International Cooperation

The Strategic Research Plan guides the UBT in responding effectively to the changing environment in research opportunities, and provides a platform for participation in international research-related initiatives in Integrated Design too. UBT earned experience of research in computer graphics as part of Computer Science and Engineering, product design as part of Mechatronics Engineering and interior design as part of Architecture. The key research areas for the BFA in Integrated Design are textiles and fashion design research, computer graphics and communications design, industrial product design and interior design. The first step to take is establishing a Bachelor in Art-related, interdisciplinary advanced studies.

UBT as an institution and its' leaders are active in national and international professional organizations, the scientific content of their efforts are well documented, it is important to continue to become a certified university. UBT has proven this year's international and scientific programmes as additional document. The cooperation with other universities (in Kosovo, West Balkan, Visegrad 4 Countries and outside Europe) can allow students and their educators to measure their performance objectively.

Recommendations:

- Involve local professionals and decision makers at the beginning of the course to establish advanced, design oriented artistic atmosphere.
- Connect research activities with actual topics of urban development, building investment and ITC technology through staff members who are already involved in the Industry.
- Raise the attractiveness of the programme by hiring foreign visiting staff.
- Involve local professionals and decision makers at the maintenance of the course.

II.2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

Creating a new campus outside the centre of Pristina in Lipjan solved the concerns about need of space for Artistic and Engineering studies. Though the empty spaces of the new building should be filled by students' activities such as drawing room for independent work or storage of students' models/drawings. It produces a creative mood, which is needed for Fine Arts. Spaces of common activities like café or club could have a great impact on homelike atmosphere of the new site. UBT delivered numbers about finances that proves the possibility of investing in equipment and furniture.

The main building and the new campus outside the city centre have specialized facilities and IT classroom needed for the basic courses of all disciplines.

For the studies in Art and Design, special software (CAD) and hardware (plotter, scanner, 3D equipment) is required. High-speed internet access is necessary for using internet databases.
For courses like Design Studio or Modelling, special laboratory access is needed. These facilities are available on the Lipjan campus.
There is a library on both campuses available for the students. It seems that the currently available books are not connected to the ones mentioned in the course descriptions, there are generally few books related to Art, Design and Graphics.

UBT's respond on facilities devoted to Design studies: *„space at UBT Innovation will be alleviated by the beginning of the next academic year when a new Humanities and Social Science Building will be erected. That will leave sufficient space and breathing room for the BFA Integrated Design".*

Recommendations:

- Complete the library with books and journals in Art, Design Graphics, etc..
- Connect library books to the courses taught at the branches.

II.2.5. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

- We recommend to establish space for students' independent work of Integrated Design at Lipjan campus and concentrate more on Design Studio work methods.
- Cooperation with national and international universities in form of workshops, common projects can enhance students' activity and can raise quality of education.

Final Recommendation:

- Accreditation of the Bachelor Fine Art in Integrated Design programme of UBT is recommended for 3 years.

III. Bachelor and Master of Science in Construction Engineering and Infrastructure Reaccreditation

Preliminary Remarks

This Report refers to the *Self Evaluation Report* (SER) of UBT from April 2016 the *Assessment Report for Institutional and program (re-)accreditation* 2013.
In addition to the documents, the meeting during the accreditation audit with the management and staff of UBT's Civil Engineering Department was most useful and very effective. All of the accreditation expert's questions and remarks were answered a confident, professional and at the same time collegial manner. This co-operation from UBT's side was a significant help and assistance in the accreditation process that was organized flawlessly by KAA staff.

III.1. Bachelor of Science in Construction Engineering and Infrastructure Reaccreditation

In 2013 the expert team approved the accreditation UBT's BSc programme of civil engineering, that time called BSc in Building and Infrastructure Engineering. The name of the programme was changed to BSc in Construction Engineering and Infrastructure, and this is the current name of the program which present report refers to.
In 2013 the expert team highlighted a number of points where correction is to be made, and also indicated certain recommendations for the sake of improvement. During the re-accreditation audit these points were focused upon. Focusing on the aforementioned shortcomings and examining the experience of the last 3 years of the program, our conclusions are as follows:

III.1.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

As already indicated, UBT changed the name of their civil engineering programme to Construction and Infrastructure Engineering. With this name alteration the content and focus of the programme has not been changed, which has been a fortunate decision, as the core characteristics of the programme was approved in 2013.
The curricula was accepted last time. It comprises every necessary element of a contemporary civil engineering BSc course, and at the same time it does not forget the necessities of Kosovo in terms of civil engineering. As it was remarked during the accreditation process last time, the programme (as usually engineering programmes do) imposes a fairly high workload on students, in terms of contact hours and design assignments also. During the meeting which the expert team had with the students, this workload was not complained about, students seem to accept it, morever, they welcome the practical knowledge resulting from it. It can be seen as indicator of the usefulness of the programme: a BSc program must provide the practical elements of the profession, of which mastery requires effort and dedication of a certain extent.
In 2013 the expert team suggested that more social science subjects are to be included in the programme, which are necessary for prospective engineers. This has been corrected in the curricula.
Other recommendation was the inclusion of an integrative "complex project" subject that would synthesise the different engineering disciplines that have been taught in several subjects. This recommendation was realised, in the final semester there is the complex project subject, which is welcome.
We also see an improvement in the application of contemporary civil engineering software, in addition to CAD structural software applications are used in the programme.
The regular site visits to construction sites, the co-operation with engineering companies are a vital part of the program, which strengthens the practical aspects.

III.1.2. Staff

In the SER the number of the civil engineering staff is 29, of which 12 person has PhD (41%). The strength of the staff is its diversity of specializations that covers the major areas of the civil engineering profession. Although the 41% can bee considered adequate

for BSc programme, the ratio of doctorate staff should be increased for the sake of higher qualifications programmes, such as MSc. Since 2013 not much improvement has happened in the ratio of doctoral staff, that time out of 34 14 had Phd, which was 41% that time also. The present international concept in engineering high education is that at least 50% of the permanent staff should be PhD's. In accreditation processes this ratio is mostly emphasised over e.g. engineering experience. We recommend that UBT should focus on increasing the number of PhD's in its staff, for which effort we recommend that a specific HR strategy is to be set up.

The BSc programme attracts 60 student annually. Considering a 3 year rotation the student:staff ratio is (3 x60 / 29 =) 6,2 :1 student:staff ratio, which is very good, giving adequate opportunities for the student for personal consultations during their assignments. This number, together with the number of class hours also indicates that the workload on staff can be increased for an optimal utilization, so there is available staff capacity for extention.

III.1.3. Research and International Cooperation

In the 2013 accreditation report the expert team remarked, that "In the UBT RESEARCH STRATEGIC PLAN 2012-2015 document we cannot see the specific areas where civil engineering research will be focused. A detailed and explicit research strategy has to be created for this new engineering discipline of UBT."

"… UBT should focus on an institutional research activity instead of diffuse individual researches. We also recommend that the research strategy is to be industry-driven, practice and technology-transfer oriented in the field of infrastructure engineering, which is the focus of the BSc programme. international CE relations should be incorporated in the research strategy. "

Unfortunately we still cannot see the research strategy for civil engineering: including every aspect of the civil engineering profession in fairly general research proposal cannot be considered a strategy.

The expert team understands that the civil engineering programme has only a 3 year history in UBT, and the first priorities are to strengthen the educational capabilities of the institution, and create acceptance for the programme in the professional field. But, in addition to this, university programmes need supporting research activities to be accepted nationally and also internationally. For this, the creation of an institutional research strategy is inevitable.

The international civil engineering conference organized by UBT is a very good idea, the conference proceedings contains many valuable publications. We suggest to continue with this effort.

III.1.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

In the 2013 accreditation report the expert team highlighted the lack of civil engineering laboratories. At the initiation of the BSc programme the co-operation with external laboratories was accepted, and the establishment of the civil engineering laboratories within two academic years the latest was recommended. The recommendation was to

establish basic civil engineering laboratories first: geotechnics, building materials and hydraulics.
Since 2013 only a construction material laboratory has been set up. The laboratory is set up with the most important contemporary equipment, focusing on concrete testing. We were informed during our visit that equipment for the geotechnical laboratory has been ordered and it is on its way.
In 2013 we wrote: "Having seen the forecasted financial numbers of UBT for the period of 2013-2016 we do think that laboratory development can be carried out without significant financial constraints." We see the effort in establishing laboratories, but It could have been done better: these laboratories should be working by now. And also, the equipment of the material laboratory is to be developed, enabling the examination of other crucial building materials such as steel or reinforced concrete.
Our opinion is that the laboratory development is the weakest point of the civil engineering training at the moment.
In 2013 we indicated the lack of civil engineering textbooks. Since than a number of crucial books have been acquired by UBT, which is positive. Not so positive, that the volumes in the library we visited were only partially catalogued, so we are not completely certain, how students can find the required textbooks.
During the site visits the experts found the amenities of UBT (classrooms etc.) very good quality, spacious and sufficient for their educational purposes.

III.1.5. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

In summary: The Bachelor of Science in Construction and Infrastructure Engineering has been implemented since its 2013 accreditation an acceptable way. Many of the recommendations have been realised and a number of shortcomings have been corrected, but in certain areas, such as the lack of laboratories and institutional research strategy, there is still improvement to be made.

Final Recommendation:

- The Bachelor of Science in Construction and Infrastructure Engineering programme is to be re-accredited for three years.

Two major recommendations for the improvement of the program:

- As a priority, we recommend that UBT should allocate a significant budget to develop its civil engineering laboratory basis rapidly. This is the weakest area of the civil engineering programme of UBT, upon which the prospective re-accreditation process should focus.
- Detailed strategic research plan has to be created for civil engineering: UBT's institutional research strategy should incorporate civil engineering, in specific core research areas. We recommend focusing on the possibility of multi- and trans-disciplinary research areas, utilizing the full scope of UBT's expertise.

III.2. Master of Science in Construction Engineering and Infrastructure Accreditation

UBT's proposed MSc programme was created with the intention to be the continuation of the BSc Construction Engineering and Infrastructure Engineering programme. As the proposed MSc programme is built upon the same civil engineering staff and UBT's infrastructure as the BSc programme, its accreditation report includes cross references to the 2016 BSc re-accreditation report.

III.2.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

Base on the SAR and the meeting and discussion with UBT's civil engineering staff, the major considerations and characteristics of the MSc programme are as follows:
Internal demand. The first graduates of the BSc programme are to be released this year. UBT's focus of their MSc programme is primarily their graduate BSc students. During our meeting with the students we were confirmed by this need, all of the students at the meeting would continue their studies on the MSc level.
External demand. In Kosovo there is a demand of specialist civil engineers, which the MSc programme would provide.
In terms of demands the MSc programme seems to fits adequately.
The two year programme would provide a high spectrum for specialization for the students. In the curricula six specializations are offered, which is a very high number of specializations. We had concerns about this number, and the feasibility of this diversification. Considering the available capacity of staff (see BSc report 1.2.), and the available expertise this diversification can physically be realized. There will be very small groups of students in some specializations though – it is a decision from UBT's management if they wish too finance this form of education.
The selected names of certain specializations are not apparent. Based on the contemporary international terminology we would suggest a few modifications:

- Construction Engineering -> Structural Engineering
- Infrastructure and Traffics -> Traffic Infrastructure
- Hydrotechnical Engineering -> Water Engineering
- Geomechanical Enginweering -> Geotechnical Engineering

The curricula is set up thoroughly, we consider it a fairly reasonable MSc programme. The programme provides the basis for the MSc degree in the first year, and deep, specialist subjects in the second year.
We would like to highlight, that the proposed MSc programme is a state of the art extension of UBT's BSc of Construction Engineering and Infrastructure Engineering programme, providing a full-scale training possibility for prospective engineers, from general and broad civil engineering knowledge to specialist areas.
During our discussion it became apparent, that one area Kosovo needs development is water engineering, more specifically wastewater treatment. In this regard we suggest that in this particular specialization the wastewater treatment subject should be not elective but

compulsory, and that a water and wastewater chemistry and biology course should also be included.
We would like to emphasize here the importance of foreign language knowledge for engineers, which is a necessity for BSc graduates but which should be a must for MSc graduates. The reason of the inclusion of this remark is our not so positive experience at the student meeting during our accreditation audit: all the students present but the civil engineering students spoke English. We suggest that foreign language training should be incorporated in the MSc programme an effective way.

III.2.2. Staff

The staff of the MSc programme is identical of the BSc's, so the statements 1.2. applies here as well.
We consider the expertise of the current staff adequate to teach the proposed specializations of the MSc programme. But at the same time we would like to underline the necessary proportion of PhD's, 41% is really a bottom line for an MSc programme. Considering the possible future of the MSc programme, and its role as a vestibule of PhD, UBT's management should consider the improvement of this ratio a strategic element in its institutional development.
With the launch of the MSc programme, the overall the student:staff ratio would converge 10 :1, and the present workload of the staff would also be increased considerably. Taking into account the presently fairly low class load on the staff, this increase can make the otherwise effective small student group training a viable option for UBT. Namely, there is staff capacity for the six specializations.

III.2.3. Research and International Cooperation

The analysis of the BSc report 1.3. applies here as well, with more accentuation: institutional research must be realised to strengthen and give cutting edge to MSc training. UBT has to establish its activity in the institutional research incorporating specific areas of the civil engineering discipline.

III.2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

In 1.4. of the accreditation report of the BSc programme we emphasised, that the laboratory development is the weakest point of the BSc course at the moment. It is even more stressed in the MSc programme.
For educating specialists in civil engineering, thorough and grounded knowledge is vital not only in the theoretical domain, but in practice as well. For this the adequate laboratory background is indispensable.
We consider the lack of laboratories a critical factor here. At the same time, understanding the demand for the MSc course, the good curricula, the expertise of the staff, and also that the first BSc graduates would enter the system know, and taking into account that

specialization starts in the second year, this shortcoming can be temporarily accepted, but in the very short run only:
UBT should set up the necessary laboratories within one year. It is possible, practically a question of intent – and budget.
The MSc program requires the laboratories detailed in the BSc report (further development of material laboratory, geotechnical laboratory, hydraulic laboratory with a water and wastewater quality laboratory section).
Apart from the laboratory deficiency, UBT's infrastructure is suitable for the MSc programme.

III.2.5. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

In summary: The MSc in Construction and Infrastructure Engineering programme is well designed, its foundation is properly given by the BSc programme, it corresponds to the internal and external demands. The proposed specialisations are reasonable, provided UBT can afford the training of small student specialist groups. The lack of necessary laboratories is a critical deficiency, which is to be solved within one year, before the specializations take place.

Final Recommendation:

- The Master of Science in Construction and Infrastructure Engineering programme is to be accredited for three years.

In order to launch a widely accepted MSc programme, we suggest that UBT should make improvement in the following areas:

- As a priority, we recommend that UBT should allocate a significant budget to develop its civil engineering laboratory basis within one year. This is the weakest area of the civil engineering programme of UBT (both BSc and MSc), upon which the prospective re-accreditation process should focus.
- The proportion of doctorates should be increased in the staff, it is a viable indicator of MSc programme quality, in addition to expertise and acknowledgement. For this purpose we recommend UBT that a specific HR strategy is to be set up
- Detailed strategic research plan has to be created for civil engineering, MSc programmes cannot exist without ongoing research activities for long. UBT's institutional research strategy should incorporate civil engineering, in specific core research areas. We recommend focusing on the possibility of multi- and trans-disciplinary research areas, utilizing the full scope of UBT's expertise.
- Responding to the comments of UBT concerning the laboratories, the ET urges that these developments will occur according to UBT's statement. It will be the role of the next re-accreditation process to evaluate.

IV. Computer Science Engineering BA Reaccreditation, Prizren Branch Accreditation and Computer Science and Engineering MA Reaccreditation

IV.1. Computer Science Engineering BA Reaccreditation

This programme has been accredited in May 2013. The expert team made in 2013 the following two recommendations:

1. Reconsider the learning outcomes of the programme.
   Comment of the ET: the learning outcomes are revised and are concrete, adequate and harmonises with the content of the learning programme.
2. The amount of independent work is always bigger than hours spent in classes (for example, by 2+4 model 30 hours are spent in classes and 70 hours independently). Therefore, organization, supervision and assessment of independent work should explicitly be described.

***Comment of the ET**: the SER does still not describe the supervision and assessment of independent work, but discussions with the teaching staff revealed that students submit their home-works in written and sometimes electronically. For supporting purposes, tutors from older study years are nominated.*

The following bases on the documents presented to the expert team, on the information acquired during site visit and on discussion with some teaching staff members.

IV.1.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

The mission statement relays on generic competences and does not specify academic areas of activity. The academic programme corresponds to the institution's principles of operation that are in most general level formulated in the Mission Statement: dynamic innovative 21st century academic environment; teamwork between students, faculty, staff and administrators; participatory and self-governance approach.

The programme's quality, range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree – there is by concentrations (majors) a nice coverage of a number of important subfields of ICT. On the other hand, the objectives and expected learning outcomes of these concentrations are not described (Note that this problem was also mentioned in the Accreditation Report of 2013). Formulation the objectives and learning outcomes also for each concentration would help better focusing of the concentrations. For example, emphasizing development of information systems in the *Database and Information Management* concentration and leaving topics related to management more to the computer science master's programme (and removing the word "management" from the title of the concentration).

The college could also consider moving the *Human Computer Interaction* course from optional to compulsory (and *vice versa*, moving one currently compulsory course to optional).

Recommendation: formulate the objectives and expected learning outcomes for the concentrations and revise the courses accordingly if necessary.

The self-evaluation report does not describe any overarching didactic concept. On the other hand, discussions with the members of university administration and academic staff were surprisingly productive and encouraging – the principles of flipped classroom and blended learning are used and critical thinking supported. Study information system and using tutors supports continuous supervision and support of the students. All this allows concluding that academic activities are based on sound didactic principles.

Although the academic staff was not able to describe how the *European e-Competence Framework* was used in the development of the study programme, the degree certainly corresponds to international standards.

Each student has to select one concentration (major) out of eight concentrations on fifth semester. Every student has to select additional two elective/optional courses (out of seven). There are also 10 ECTS for free electives in the fife's semester. Additionally, the two *Lab Courses* and *Thesis* can be treated as optional courses as well. The college started using a learning management system *Moodle* in 2012, which certainly supports independent study. On the other hand, students expressed their wish to have more international teachers (from abroad), but also to have more opportunities to study or visit other academic centres outside of Kosovo.

The allocation of ECTS are in general appropriate. Most of the courses followed the 2+2 (two hours lectures and two hours exercises in a week) or 2+1 structure. This raises a question whether the students will acquire enough skills during the studies. The academic staff explained that some lectures are conducted in fact in computer labs where students can also solve exercises given during the lectures.

The teaching methods and content of teaching units seem to be sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes. The programme corresponds to the competences of teaching staff; half of all teachers have a PhD degree.

The first four semesters are the same for the whole study group, after that every student selects a major (*Software System Engineering, Database and Information Management, Networks and Telecommunication, Computer Graphics and Multimedia, Web Programming, Intelligent Systems and Robotics, Bioinformatics, Information Assurance and Security*). Here some issues can be raised, for example:

1) Mechanisms for preventing overlapping of the content between different courses are not explained. For example, different teachers teach *Software Design* and *Software Architecture* courses. As several authors consider software architecture as part of software general design, it can happen that these courses have considerable overlapping.
2) The description of some courses is not adequate. For example, the descriptions of *Introduction to Computer Graphics* and *Introduction to Computer Animation* are identical (sic!), but learning outcomes are completely different.

3) To what extent “Mathematics 1” and “Mathematics 2” serve subsequent courses in computer science, especially the concentrations (this question was also raised in the 2013 report)?
4) The role of electives and principles of their selection are not clear. The electives should also help students selecting a concentration. For example, there is no course during the first study years about robotics. There is no opportunity for students to test whether they like or dislike robotics before they have to select a concentration.

Recommendation: Strengthen the mechanisms for preventing overlapping and gaps between the different courses.

The admission criteria are relatively restrictive – EQF Level 3 graduates in social sciences and humanities should “be able to undergo” the *Preparation Package* consisting of the following courses: *Calculus* 1, *Calculus* 2 and *Science (Industrial Physics and Chemistry*). The objective of the Preparation Package and how this package is linked to the studies on the *Computer Science* study programme is not explained.

The academics/student ratio for Computer Science is not given in the SER. The numbers for calculating it are confusing: once the numbers of students in Computer Science are up to 3000 (SER, page 655), and then about 700 (SER, page 1356). The number of permanent academic staff is 66 (SER, page 563-564). The ratio 700/66 would be very good, but 3000/66 not.

IV.1.2. Staff

The proportion of permanent staff is very good and the proportion of teachers that have doctoral degrees is satisfactory. However, the fact that the majority of the permanent staff has also other affiliations raises the question of competitiveness and sustainability – full devotion of the staff is a prerequisite for an educational institution to become internationally competitive. Although the students presented to the expert team were very satisfied with the teaching quality, the teachers themselves were interested in having more information about positive and negative experience of other departments of UBT.

IV.1.3. Research and International Cooperation

Research is extremely disperse – the list of research topics contains 27 items. The academic staff named four focus areas: 1) E-learning, 2) AI in learning management systems, 3) networking and telecommunication, 4) modeling and simulation. At the same time the list of international joint projects and agreements (SER, pages 1371-1374; SER2, pages 321-324) does not contain a single project in IT. Although the number of teachers and publications has significantly been increased during last three years, the problems remained – only few staff members have indicated UBC as their employer in social media like *LinkedIn* and very few staff members have indicated UBT on their publications. Therefore, UBT is scientifically (at least in ICT) not enough visible. The academic staff expressed a wish to have more joint projects with the industry and with other departments of UBT, and also to have research groups for conducting joint research.

Recommendation: determine priority research and development (R&D) areas and build up internationally competitive R&D groups in these areas.

The cooperation in teaching is expanding and has already reached a good level (summer schools, joint and double degrees, joint doctoral studies and supervision, TEMPUS projects etc). However, no evidence about international cooperation in research was presented. On the other hand, students have won prices in international competitions.

IV.1.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

The college submitted an income statement and planned expenses for years 2013-2018. According to these documents, the share of study fees will decrease and of the projects increase. Investments are planned throughout the whole period.

A new building was recently constructed, and a new one is planned. However, the students complained about a missing dormitory. They also expressed a wish to have more space for extracurricular activities, but also for communication and learning.

IV.1.5. Quality Management

The programme was previously internationally accredited in 2013. Concerning internal evaluation process, no additional procedures on top of the general university procedures were demonstrated.

IV.1.6. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

Based on the above analysis and evaluation, expert team does recommend BA program in Computer Science and Engineering of UBT to be reaccredited for the period of 5 years.

IV.1.7. Computer Science Engineering Branch Accreditation in Prizren

Thorough analysis on the conditions in UBT Prizren branch was conducted in 2015 accreditation. The ET of 2015 recommended allowing implementation the branch without condition. The ET also recommended considering four additional aspects (see below).

In the current accreditation, a visit to Prizren was taken place on 17th of May. We will focus below on the following two aspects: 1) comparison on the Computer Science and Engineering study programme with the ICT study programmes of the Prizren University and 2) satisfaction of the four recommendations of the 2015 ET.

IV.1.8. Comparison with the Software Design *study programme of the University of Prizren*

The following comparison bases on the self-evaluation reports of 2015 (UniPrizren) and 2016 (UBT). This comparison is to certain extent conditional because the descriptions of the courses were partly quite vague (especially in the SER of UniPrizren). The courses that to certain extent correspond each other are written in the same row.

The analysis bases on the comparison of compulsory courses only because there were no

statistical data about selection of elective courses by the students.

UBT	**Univ Prizren**
Computer Science I	Introduction to Programming
Mathematics I	Mathematics I
Fundamentals of Electronics/Electric Engin.	
Intro to IT	Introduction to Informatics
IT, Law and Society	
English for Engineers	
Computer Science II (Programming)	Object Oriented Programming
Computer Architecture and Organization	
Mathematics II	
Intro to Algorithms	
Operating Systems	Operating Systems and Managements
Database systems	Database Systems
Algorithms and Data Structures	Algorithms and Data Structures
Software Engineering	
Signals and Systems	
Discrete Mathematics	Discrete Math
Discrete Structures 2	
Computer Systems Engineering	
Computer Networks and Communication	
Embedded Systems	
Web Engineering	Introduction to Web Languages and Technologies, Web design
Lab Course 1	
Project Management	Software Engineering and Project Management
Entrepreneurship and Innovation	
Seminar (Professional Communication)	
Technical and Scientific Writing	
Laboratory Course 2	Project
	New Media and Multimedia
	Computer Graphics and Image Processing
	Advanced Databases
	Advanced Web Development
	Research Methods
	Artificial Intelligence
	Game Development
	Cloud Computing
	Mobile Computing
	IT- Security
	Distributed Systems

The main differences of the study programmes:

1. UBT has more focused on analytics and management issues.
2. UniPrizren has more focused on software engineering.
3. Electives are grouped in UBT mainly into 8 concentrations; UniPrizren has a common set of electives.

Common part of compulsory courses form about 40%.

The most suitable affiliations of the graduates:

- UBT: ICT service providers.
- UniPrizren: software developers.

IV.1.9. Comparison with the Information Technology *study programme of the University of Prizren*

The following comparison bases on the self-evaluation reports of 2015 (UniPrizren) and 2016 (UBT). This comparison is to certain extent conditional because the descriptions of the courses were partly quite vague (especially in the SER of UniPrizren). The courses that to certain extent correspond each other are written in the same row.

The analysis bases on the comparison of compulsory courses only because there were no statistical data about selection of elective courses by the students.

UBT	**Univ Prizren**
Computer Science I	Programming
Mathematics I	Mathematics I
Fundamentals of Electronics/Electric Engin.	Electronic Devices
Intro to IT	
IT, Law and Society	
English for Engineers	
Computer Science II (Programming)	Object Oriented Analysis and Design
Computer Architecture and Organization	Computer Architecture and OS
Mathematics II	
Intro to Algorithms	
Operating Systems	
Database systems	Databases Systems
Algorithms and Data Structures	Algorithms and Data Structures
Software Engineering	Software Engineering
Signals and Systems	
Discrete Mathematics	Digital Technology, Discrete math
Discrete Structures 2	
Computer Systems Engineering	
Computer Networks and Communication	Fundamentals of Data Communication,

	TCP/IP Technology
Embedded Systems	
Web Engineering	Dynamic Contents of Web-Engineering
Lab Course 1	
Project Management	
Entrepreneurship and Innovation	
Seminar (Professional Communication)	
Technical and Scientific Writing	
Laboratory Course 2	
	Microcontrollers
	Sensors and Interfaces
	Transmission Methods
	Authentication and Cryptography
	Research Methods
	Advanced IP-Technologies and Networks
	Tools for Internet Security
	Concepts of Mobile Telecommunication
	Cloud Computing

The main differences of the study programmes:

1. UBT has more focused on analytics and management.
2. UniPrizren has more focused on electronics and telecommunication.
3. Electives are grouped in UBT mainly into 8 concentrations; UniPrizren has a common set of electives.

Common part of compulsory courses about 40%.

The most suitable affiliations of the graduates:

- UBT graduates: ICT service providers.
- UniPrizren graduates: telecommunications engineers.

Recommendation. As the study programmes in computer science have different focuses in UBT and UniPrizren, it is recommended to build up partnership between these institutions and mutually open up the courses to the students from partner institution.

IV.1.10. Satisfaction of recommendation of the previous (2015) Evalation Report

Expert team of 2015 accreditation recommended allowing implementation of the Prizren branch. The following four recommendations were proposed to be seriously considered:

1. The current building and potential resources are adequate to accommodate a 50 student intake for computing students; however, the identified potential conflict for studio/laboratory space with the architecture programme leads the expert team to recommend developing either the basement or the refectory building prior to a student intake of 200 across all four programmes.

Comment: two neighboring plots with a two-storied building (of a previous college) on one and a small restaurant on the second plot have been bought.

2. Development of the basement and/or refectory space should also be carried out with proper staff office space in mind.
   Comment: the recommendation is completely satisfied (see the previous comment).
3. Appropriate facilities, equipment and materials as seen in the new campus on the outskirts of Pristina should be replicated at Prizren.
   Comment: A newly renovated two-storied building with computer lab and library is ready for receive students.
4. There should be some consideration of student (and staff) social facilities.
   Comment: There are two big rooms that can be used for extra-curricular activities in the renovated building. Additional rooms for these purposes can be assigned in the second building and in the restaurant.

One can conclude that all recommendations of 2015 expert team are satisfied.

IV.1.11. Expert's Recommendations to KAA on Prizren Branch Accreditation

There are created necessary conditions for starting Computer Science and Engineering study programme at the UBT Prizren branch.

IV.2. Computer Science and Engineering MA Reaccreditation

This programme was accredited in May 2013. The expert team of 2013 made only one recommendation:

- The amount of independent work is always bigger than hours spent in classes (for example, using 4+5 model 60 hours are spent in the classes and 65 hours work independently). Therefore, organization, supervision and assessment of independent work should explicitly be described.

Comment of the ET*: the SER does still not describe the supervision and assessment of independent work, but discussions with the teaching staff revealed that students submit their home-works in written and sometimes electronically. For supporting purposes, tutors from older study years are nominated.*

The following bases on the documents presented to the expert team, on the site visit and on discussion with some teaching staff members. As the initial SER was obviously incorrect (some parts of the text and several course descriptions of the master's programme were copied from the description of the bachelor programme), correct course descriptions were requested and provided by UBT on 27th of May (referred as SER2).

IV.2.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

The academic programme corresponds to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation – the arguments are the same as in the case of bachelor programme.

The programme's quality, range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree – there is by concentrations (majors) a nice coverage of a number of important subfields of ICT, and the relatively long list of electives offer students enough opportunities for finding suitable courses. However, the problems are similar to these of the bachelor programme: the objectives and expected learning outcomes of these concentrations are not described.

Recommendation: formulate the objectives and expected learning outcomes on the concentrations and revise the courses accordingly if necessary.

The self-evaluation report does not describe any overarching didactic concept. On the other hand, discussions with the members of university administration and academic staff were surprisingly productive and encouraging – the principles of flipped classroom and blended learning are used and critical thinking supported. Study information system and using tutors supports continuous supervision and support of the students. All this allows concluding that academic activities are based on sound didactic principles.

The number of concentrations is bigger than it is usual on master-level study programmes. Compared to bachelor programmes, master programmes are more focused. This is also the case of *Computer Science and Engineering* master programme – it is more focused on software engineering. This leads to the question about the title of the programme. The word "engineering" in it is understood as "computer engineering". Computer engineering consists of hardware engineering and software engineering. On the other hand, the share of courses in software engineering is much bigger than in hardware engineering. Therefore, the study programme could also have the name "Computer Science", as it is in the list of UBT study programmes (SER2, page 13).

Most of the courses have 5 or 6 credits, few also 4 credits. Allocation of ECTS are appropriate and justified. A 6-credit course has normally 5 hours a week in the classes, and a 5-credit course 3 hours a week in the classes. This gives sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis.

Most of the courses followed the 3+5 (three hours classes in a week with 5 ECTS course) and 5+6 model. All 35 courses in the concentrations have the same structure - 2 hours lectures and 1 hour exercises in a week, although the type of the courses (theoretical-practical) and the availability of the literature varies.

The teaching methods and content of teaching units seem to be sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes. The programme corresponds to the competences of teaching staff; all teachers of compulsory courses have a PhD degree.

It is not clear whether there are some guidelines, recommendations or restrictions for selecting elective courses. For example, if a student already has had a course *Human Computer Interaction* during his/her bachelor studies, can (s)he take this course during the master studies as well (although the content and the learning outcomes are different for the bachelor and master courses, the list of the literature for the master course is a strong subset of this of the bachelor course!). The course descriptions are also partly very different in details. For example, while the assessment methods for the *Human Computer Interaction* master course are very thoroughly described, the course descriptions of the

majority of other courses indicate their components only (including of the *Human Computer Interaction* bachelor course).

Another problem is related with the coverage of the topics – although the study programme as the whole covers most important topics, some of them are present in electives only. Therefore, it can happen that a master graduate has missed some important topics like *cloud computing* or *virtualization*.

The admission criteria are formal and the procedures of it are not described. For example, "students that have graduated from business and administration fields who demonstrate prior work experience in computer science and engineering or are able to complete the Computer Science Preparation Packages (Mathematics, Computer Science 1, Fundamentals of IT (Programming), Algorithms, Fundamentals of Electrical and Electronic Engineering)" (SER2, page 156). However, the meaning of "work experience in computer science and engineering" is not explained.

For calculation of the student-teacher ratio both bachelor and master programmes and the whole ICT teaching staff should be considered because the majority of teachers is teaching on both programmes. There are about 750 students and about 65 full-time teachers. The ratio 750/65 is very good.

IV.2.2. Staff

The proportion of permanent staff is relatively high and the vast majority of teachers have doctoral degrees. However, the fact that the majority of the permanent staff has also other affiliations raises the question of competitiveness and sustainability – full devotion of the staff is a prerequisite for an educational institution to become internationally competitive. The students presented to the expert team were very satisfied with the teaching quality.

IV.2.3. Research and International Cooperation

Research is extremely disperse – the list of research topics contains 27 items. The academic staff named four focus areas: 1) E-learning, 2) AI in learning management systems, 3) networking and telecommunication, 4) modeling and simulation. At the same time the list of international joint projects and agreements (SER, pages 1371-1374; SER2, pages 321-324) does not contain a single project in IT. Although the number of teachers and publications has significantly been increased during last three years, the problems remained – only few staff members have indicated UBC as their employer and very few staff members have indicated UBT on their publications. Therefore, is UBT is scientifically not enough visible (at least in ICT). The academic staff expressed a wish to have more joint projects with the industry and with other departments of UBT, and also to have research groups for conducting joint research.

Recommendation: determine priority research and development (R&D) areas and build up internationally competitive R&D groups in these areas.

International cooperation in teaching is expanding and has already reached a good level (summer schools, joint and double degrees, joint doctoral studies and supervision, TEMPUS projects etc). However, no evidence about international cooperation of research

in IT was presented. On the other hand, students are to certain extent involved in research as they have won prices in international competitions.

IV.2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

The college submitted an income statement and planned expenses for years 2013-2018. According to these documents the share of study fees will slightly decrease and of the projects increase. Investments are planned throughout the whole period. The relatively low income from the projects shows that the potentials for getting resources from international (including European) programmes are not fully exploited.

A new building was recently constructed, and a new one is planned. However, the students complained about a missing dormitory. They also expressed a wish to have more space for extracurricular activities, but also for communication and learning.

The share of expenditures for research and development is supposed to stay on the level of 7%. It is slightly higher than in other private colleges in Kosovo, but still not enough for building up an internationally competitive university. International level joint research is currently in fact non-existent – the list of international joint projects on pages 321-324 of SER2 does not contain a single **research** project!

IV.2.5. Quality Management

The programme was previously internationally accredited in 2013. Concerning internal evaluation process, no additional procedures on top of the general university procedures were demonstrated.

IV.2.6. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

The expert team would recommend to KAA an accreditation of the MSc. in Computer Science and Engineering programme for 5 years.

V. Bachelor and Master in Mechatronics Management Accreditation

V.1. Bachelor in Mechatronics Management Accreditation

V.1.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

The Bachelor program in Mechatronics Management is a graduate program which provides professional education in an important field of study for future development of the country.

Mechatronics is the study of mechanical systems and often precision mechanical systems connected in a way to monitor using appropriate sensor components and control using actuators supported by computer systems.

Mechatronics systems are all around us with far-reaching applications to every sector of society ranging from factories, automobiles, microwaves, airplanes, etc. Therefore studying mechatronics is very exciting and interesting. Moreover training the future generations of engineers and giving them a comprehensive set of skills is extremely important for the engineering industry as a whole and for the society.

Recognizing that today's engineers must be able to solve complex, highly focused practical problems, as well as those specialist fields of mechatronics, UBT has decided to offer this program of study. Our mission is to contribute to the study of Mechatronics Management based on European and American programs and experience.

Remark of the experts:

The existence of the program and an appropriate amount of students attest a stable demand and confirms the decision of UBT to start the mechatronics programs.

The Bachelor program in Mechatronics Management contains

- 32 obligatory modules in total including: Mathematics, Mechatronic Systems and Components, Physics, Mechanics, Information Technology, Simulation, Control Engineering, Project Management and
- 10 concentration modules for 12 ECTS, one of them electable by the students.

Remark of the experts:

It is not probably that each of the concentration modules are booked by enough students. Economic reasons will likely limit the amount of really held modules. Anyway, the offer of 10 different concentration modules gives the students additional opportunities.

Students must also complete Bachelor Thesis in an area that might suit them. The topics of thesis are selected by students, but defined in detail by the department.

V.1.2. Learning outcomes for the Bachelor programme

By successful completion of the Bachelor degree in Computer Science and Engineering students will be able to:

- Apply abilities of critical and integrative thinking in mechatronics applications.
- Resolve complex engineering problems, with a special focus on the fields of mechatronics and its components, robotics, management of such systems.
- Be competitive in the industrial and technological environment.
- Practice innovative and research learning, encouraging scientific and technological development, and make Kosovo a competitor in the international scene in the field of Mechatronics Management and related engineering disciplines.
- Possess, recognize and strengthen individual skills and improve capacities simultaneously in theoretical and practical mechatronics fields.
- Develop a working culture in team modes, making them able to be part of modern processes and trends in the world.

- Learn and understand the concepts of design in Mechatronics while taking into consideration the available technology and its application capabilities.
- Learn in detail the components of mechatronic applicable in different fields such as: medicine, automotive, aerospace, robotics and manufacturing.
- Respond to the specific needs to the related industries.
- Understand the fundamentals of engineering science applicable in mechatronics, such as mechanical engineering, electrical and electronic engineering and software engineering.
- Learn about the representation and professional report writing while taking into consideration the formats used in engineering.
- Possess excellence-based education and the highest academic and ethical standards nationally and internationally.

V.1.3. Structure of the programme

The Bachelor program in Mechatronics Management takes 3 years (6 semesters), including the completion of the Bachelor thesis.

Bachelor degree consists of 180 ECTS and of two catalogues (Mandatory core courses and free concentration courses).

Semester 1

No	**Subject**	**ECTS**
1	Introduction to Physics	5
2	Introduction to Chemistry and Environment	5
3	Mathematics 1	5
4	Introduction to Mechanics	6
5	Computer Science 1	6
6	English	3

Semester 2

No	**Subject**	**ECTS**
7	Fundamentals of Electronic and Electrical Engineering	6
8	Fundamentals of Mechanical Engineering	5
9	Mathematics 2	5
10	Material Science and Engeneering	6
11	Computer Science 2	4
12	Economics and Engineering Management	4

Semester 3

No	**Subject**	**ECTS**
13	Introduction to Mechatronics	6

14	Digital Circuits and Signals	5
15	Fluid and Thermodynamics	4
16	Software Systems Engenering	6
17	Information Technology	5
18	Law, Ethics and Engeneering	4

Semester 4

No	**Subject**	**ECTS**
19	Manufacturing and Automation	5
20	Mechatronic Systems 1 (Analysis and Design)	6
21	Modelling and Simulation	4
22	Control Engeering	6
23	Embedded Systems	5
24	CAD Computer Aided-Design/CAM	4

Semester 5

No	**Subject**	**ECTS**
25	Industrial and Organisational Psychology	5
26	Industrial Engineering	6
27	Instrumentation and Measurement	4
28	Mechatronic Systems 2 (Implementation)	6
29	Robotics and Automation	5
30	Entrepreneurship and Innovation	4

Semester 6

No	**Subject**	**ECTS**
31	**Project Management**	**2**
32	**Scientific and Technical Research**	**2**
33	Concetrations - Mechatronics Management - Industrial Automation and process Control - Industrial Product Design - Intellegent Systems and robotics - Biomedical Engeneering - Electrical Engenering - Telecommunications Engeneering - Mechanical Engeering - Aeronautical Engeneering	12
34	Thesis and Applied Mechatronic Project	12

Remark of the experts:
The laboratory is apropriate equipped with mechanical tooling machines and electronic development tools. Additional practical training objects were built by students and staff from used parts, which deepens understanding and trains to make compromises between perfect solutions and practical prospect.

V.1.4. Staff

Remark of the experts:

For the experts it is impossible to evaluate the educational and practical qualification of the teaching staff in this short time. Discussions while oral evaluation shows a highly motivated stuff almost enthusiastic, involved in using and further developing the surprisingly well equipped laboratory.

V.1.5. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

For a detail analysis of syllabus a more detailed structure of the program has to be offered by UBT. All Questions while oral evaluation regarding didactic sequence of lectures was answered successfully.
The staffs is highly motivated most likely as a result of their laboratory work.
The special Albanian language situation in Kosovo requires skills in foreign languages. This fact is poorly incorporated by the English courses. In respect to this technical lectures could be held in English. This not just offers the students a further training in English, but also builds an additional opportunity to the staff to train their English experience.

Final Recommendation:

There is an ongoing process of continuing improvement visible, therefore the E.T. recomments the reaccreditation of the Bachelor Programme in Mechatronics Management.

V.2. Master in Mechatronics Management Accreditation

V.2.1. Academic Programme and Student Management

This Master's degree provides professional education in mechatronics management. The program incorporates:

- Training the future generations of engineers and giving them a comprehensive set of skills is extremely important for engineering industry and for society.
- Balanced mix of specialized Engineering and Management units, enabling them to develop specific knowledge and skills required to establish them in their future careers in mechatronics management.
- Develops a methodical approach to analysis, problem solving and decision making, facilitated through the application of modern tools and technologies to achieve efficiency.

V.2.2. Learning outcomes for the Master programme

By successful completion of the Master degree in Mechatronics Management, students will be able to:

- Apply abilities of critical and integrative thinking.
- Use new methods and tools developed while studying in the industry.
- Effectively communicate.
- Analyse domestic and global forces affecting organization success.
- Identify and evaluate ethical dilemmas related to business decision-making and engineering.
- Manage project in mechatronics fields.
- Develop strategic understanding of mechatronics systems, design, application, maintanance, project management, information system management, operations, etc.

V.2.3. Staff and Facilities

Teaching staff at UBT are very dedicated and highly qualified with many years of international experience in their field and many of them have extensive experience in the industry.

The mechatronics laboratory at UBT is well equipped. The laboratory comprises of few robotic manipulators with varying degrees of freedom, CNC turning machine with automatic turret tool changer, measuring and instrumentation equipment, experimental mechatronics station comprising of mechanical systems with transducers and sensors, other auxiliary devices such as transducers and sensors, measuring an experimentation tool, many computers with engineering software, etc.
Remark of the experts:
For the experts it is impossible to evaluate the educational and practical qualification of the teaching sauff in this short time. Discussions while oral evaluation shows a highly motivated and qualified stuff.

V.2.4. Structure of the programme

The mechatronics engineering program at UBT is the only one of its kind in the country and the region. The program provides a well-structured education in principles of mechanical, electrical and computer engineering and management.

The Master program in Mechatronics Management contains

- 18 obligatory modules including: Mathematics, Mechatronic Systems and Components, Physics, Mechanics, Information Technology, Simulation, Control Engineering, Project Management and
- 3 concentration modules electable by the students.

Semester 1

No	Subject	ECTS
1	Advanced Electrical and Electronic Engeneering	6
2	Complex Software Modelling and Design	5
3	Automation and Industrial Communication	5
4	Advanced Materials Science and Engineering	5
5	Management and Organisational Culture	4
6	Modelling and Simulation for Advanced Mechatronics	5

Semester 2

No	Subject	ECTS
7	Advanced Mechatronic Systems	5
8	Advanced Design and Control Engineering	5
9	Robotics and Automation Systems	4
10	Complex Systems Engineering	4
11	Micro-mechatronics	4
12	Digital Signal Processing	4
13	Embedded System Design	4

Semester 3

No	Subject	ECTS
13	Research Methods	5
14	Operations and Project Management	5
15	**Concentration** *Students opt for one of the concentration* • *Mechatronics Management* • *Industrial Product Design* • *Production Process Engeneering and Technology*	20

Semester 4

No	Subject	ECTS
19	Applied Mechatronics/Laboratory Project	6
20	Thesis	24

Remark for the Experts:

For a detail analysis of syllabies a more detailed structure of the program has to be offered by UBT.

Some titles of courses seem to be the same in the bachelor program as in the master program, f.e. "Embedded Systems Design". This may result in the fact that based on the Bologna System also students from other bachelor programs has to be accepted not only students from the respective internal Bachelor program. However, a written statement on pent-up demand as required skills is established and is communicated to students from other Bachelor programs as a prerequisite prior to their study. As a result overlaps of courses from Bachelor and Master program should be prevented to fully challenge master students.

V.2.5. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

The staffs are highly motivated most likely as a result of their laboratory.

The laboratory itself is modern equipped, but for continuous training of multiple students' simultaneously the equipment should be present in multiples. This investment will burden the budged of UBT in the next years.

The special Albanian language situation in Kosovo requires foreign languages as an absolute must.

As an alternative to English courses also technical courses can be offered in English language, as long as there are no governmental restrictions to that. This would give not just the students the opportunity to train their English skills, but also gives the staff the possibility to train their English.

UBT has the potential to play an important role in further development of the country in academic education and scientific research in applied fields of Kosovan industry and culture. The international contacts will help to increase the speed of progress.

Final Recommendation:

There is an ongoing process of continuing improvement visible, therefore the E.T. recomments the reaccreditation of the Master Programme in Mechatronics Management.

VI. Political Science BA Reaccreditation and International Relations MA Accreditation

List of Additional Documents
Political Science BA:

- List of political journals currently used on the degree - is access monitored?
- The total number of politics texts in the library (if available) + any newly acquired;
- Details of - and any funding commitments to purchase new politics texts;

- An example of an exam paper from any third year module (untranslated = OK);
- An example of a good quality BA Political Science Diploma thesis (untranslated OK);
- Details/documents associated with the UBT 'teaching and learning policy/support unit'.

International Relations MA:

- A list of active research staff, who have published in last 2 years, and have been proposed to teach on the new degree;
- Full details of the relationship with the Warsaw MA International Relations.

Denotes additional document received

General Observations

General observations and issues drawn from the meeting with senior management

- *The meeting began by a useful presentation of UBT by the Rector;*
- *It was indicated that their policy was to teach in English for all programmes at Masters level = a positive point;*
- *UBT has a strong research strategy and is involved with the 'EU Smart Specialisation at Regional level' initiative = a positive point;*
- *They have some double degrees - but not clear if they are Double or Joint Degrees. There is an important distinction;*
- *UBT has built a high rate of staff/student mobility via Erasmus+ (best in Kosovo);*
- *UBT has impressive plans for development + rapid expansion - courses and buildings at their new 'Innovations campus';*
- *They have developed the IDEAA unit that will aid the development of teaching and learning = potentially a very valuable and important initiative;*
- *In future they seek to establish PhD graduate schools linked to foreign partners + will apply after 2 generations of Master programmes.*

VI.1. Political Science BA Reaccreditation

VI.1.1 Programme Analysis for Reaccreditation

Professor Adam: met with Prof Dr. Ardian Emni; PhD Cand. Alfred Marleku; Emrush Ujkani (MA); Prof Dr. Besim Gallopini; PhD Cand. Bujar Gallopeni ; Prof Dr. Islam Lauka; Prof Dr. Metush Sulejmani; Prof Dr. Selami Sula. In addition there were two representatives from the University of Warsaw MA International Relations programme: (i) Aleksandra Jaskolska MA, programme coordinator at the Institute of International Relations, International Relations MA, and guest staff at UBT; (ii) Barbara Regulska MA, programme coordinator for MA International Relations - exchange.

A number of potential confusions arise from the list of those attending the meeting:

- *There is some confusion in documents concerning the exact roles of Dr. Ardian Emni and PhD Cand. Alfred Marleku. In the SER (pages 23 and 183) they are listed joint leaders of both BA and MA programmes. There should be separate course leaders for each programme of study. In the meeting with responsible staff concerning the BA and MA the same staff attended and the discussions were mainly with Prof Dr. Ardian Emni and PhD Cand. Alfred Marleku.*
- *The KAA site visit programme indicates that the following were listed*
  A Responsible persons of the study programmes:

9	Political Sciences/ BA		Ardian Emini	Besim Gollopeni	Isak Sherifi
10	Political Sciences/ MA		Abdullah Azizi	Selami Suli	Metush Sulejmani

- *In the SER 2016, PhD Cand. Bujar Gallopeni is not listed as having a role on either BA or MA programme and according to the KAA list of accredited staff (No. 89) is a specialist in Management, Business studies and Computer science. His role in both programmes needs to be clarified.*
- *In the KAA academic staff list both Emrush Ujkani and Islam Lauks are indicated as having 'N' - no diploma nostrification. It is not clear if this is significant).*

The issues above need to clarified and resolved.

The meeting with the staff responsible for the academic programme was open, useful and conducted in a positive and friendly atmosphere. The Political Science BA has operated successfully for three years and the third year cohort are about to finish their studies. There was an initial intake of 40 students and a small growth in student numbers was allowed. Currently the intake stands at 60 and there are a total of 150 students enrolled in years I, II, and III. The dropout rate was indicated to be 5%, which is low and admirable. There is also small number of students who transfer into the programme. Projected student intakes (SER, page 162) must be accompanied by a commensurate increase in FT staffing, library provision and accommodation.

The main changes and issues to confront the programme since the last accreditation were discussed. It was indicated that ECTS credits have been attached to modules and the course description has been enhanced. The availability and provision of texts remain a challenge. It was reported that there were 8000 politics texts and this includes 2000 new ones. The number of texts observed in the library was not large but many could be with students.

Student feedback was extensively gained via an electronic questionnaire in a twice-yearly survey. The results were fed back to staff.

There was some information on student graduate destinations, indicating that 40% of the students were in employment. However, this is a function of the large number of their students who study the BA Political Science whilst they are already in employment. It

would be useful to know which students change or get promoted in their jobs as a result of their studies.

The lecturing staff are well qualified and the majority hold PhDs. However, the staff list engaged permanently in the BA programme is identical to that for the MA (SER pages 160 and 221. There need to be a disaggregation of staff between the two degrees.

VI.1.2. Academic Programme, Rationale and Structure

The BA Political Science was first accredited in 2013 and the current third year (first cohort intake) will complete their studies later this year. The labour market rationale and student target group is well argued and appropriate. The statement (2016 SER, section 2.1.1, page 14) at the start of section 2.1.1, '*...the Bologna agreement dictates a principle content of the curricula of the college*.' is incorrect. The Bologna/European Higher Education Area (EHEA) reforms do not dictate curricula content but do describe the accepted duration and credit values (ECTS) ranges of programmes of study (BA and MA).

There are a number of regulatory issues and questions that arise (see the 2016 SER hardcopy book, section 2.2-2.5, pages 17-21. These are stated to cover BA, MA and PhDs. The following aspects are of concern or require clarification:

- It is not appropriate that the student assessment regulations are identical for BA, MA and PhD (see also further comments in the section of this report on the MA International Relations. There are fundamental differences in the purposes, outcomes and assessment of different levels of education.
- It is stated that in nearly all courses the ‘course coordinator’ writes the final exam. It is normal practice for the module leader/lecturer (subject expert) of each module to write the exam and assessments, which are then checked by senior staff. Is this what happens? Is the course coordinator the lecturer delivering the module?
- The final grade is calculated as a weighted average of the assignments submitted and the exam. This is fine but how is the 'participation' element included (often weighted at 10%)? Furthermore how is it assessed - what criteria are used to measure participation?
- It is stated that 'the exams assess the learning outcomes' and this is appropriate but also so do the assessment diets associated with in-course seminar papers, essays, etc. This issue requires clarification in the regulations.

The current modular structure of the programme raises several issues for consideration. Currently, students will study six modules per semester and thus, 36 over the complete programme. This is a very high number of individual study elements. The structure and size of courses (modules) has huge implications for the delivery of learning and the assessment burden. Many institutions have fewer modules that provide students with more depth of learning and so avoid over-assessment.

The regulated (imposed?) assessment diet for most modules is very similar and the introduction of more diverse forms (e.g. book review, work-based problems, preparation of committee of enquiry reports, writing of briefing papers, role playgroup work, etc.) closely linked to appropriate learning outcomes, needs to be considered.

Some reconsideration of the large number of modules would also have the benefit of providing space for a common size for all modules. One further solution is to link more modules together as you have done with 'Foreign Policy Analysis I and II, or just create some double modules. The important issue is to have larger modules that provide more depth and continuity of learning.

The programme learning outcomes (SER pages 28-29) are generally reasonable but it is not clear why there are separated sets. Some of these learning outcomes focus on Kosovo and the Balkans and this is excellent. However, there are questions (see also the sections below of this report) concerning some Kosovo-focused elective (optional) status modules that may well not be studied. They could be integrated and some deepened to reflect the overall stated Kosovo and regional focus of the course. There appear to be no overall learning outcomes associated with group work/teamwork, leadership, self-management, etc. These skills are vital for most employment and a focus of the Bologna/EHEA student-centred learning and employability competencies agenda.

The overall programme learning outcomes *'Understanding the key political theoretical contexts*' is very vague and could be related to specific areas. *'Political justification of major developments in national politics*' could be revised to *'Critical evaluation of...*'? It is important that the overall learning outcomes relate to all the compulsory and elective modules. A way to do this is to present a matrix that cross-references the overall learning outcomes with those of the modules. This ensures everything is consistent and that the same learning outcomes are not covered again and again. In addition, the SER states the curriculum theoretical/practical ratio (page 29) but this should logically vary with the nature of the learning outcomes of each module. It is a common aspiration in BA programmes to ensure progression in student learning from more factual (basic) work (year I) to later deeper and more demanding studies (year III) that is designed to create more 'autonomous learners'. Student progression in depth and understanding is reflected in different patterns of delivery and assessment of modules. There needs to be more explanation on the nature and impact of progression within the whole programme.

The overall structure of the programme is reasonable and the existence of three specialist pathways is a positive element. The significance and linkages between the various electives on offer should be explained further. Do electives build on each other in any way?

The burden and implications of a six modules per semester structure have been mentioned, together with various solutions. The current structure has led to the creation of very small modules. ALL semester 6 pathway electives of 2-credit value are very questionable and appear to have no 'L' or 'P' time allocation! Serious consideration should be made about dropping these 'inoperable' electives and increasing the time and value of the Diploma thesis to 10 ECTS credits.

Recommendations:

- Re-visit the course regulation and structural challenges identified above;

- Any projected student increases must be accompanied by a commensurate increase in FT staffing, library provision and accommodation
- Examine the various assessment related issues identified above;
- Asses and refine the stated learning outcomes and ensure all are fully delivered by the compulsory and elective modules;
- Clarify the progression in learning as students move through the course;
- Re-evaluate the role, size and status of key electives modules.

VI.1.3. Curriculum, Modules and Units

There is a wide range and large numbers of modules necessitated by the 36-module structure of the degree and the consequences of this have been discussed above. There is also evidence that the general pattern of assessments resulting from so many modules can lead to over-assessment and a system that over-emphasises factual recall. Different modules and different learning outcomes require different patterns of assessment. It is not clear what is meant by 'effective participation', or how it is measured and then integrated into a final grade calculation. It is not possible to gauge if assessment fits with stated learning outcomes as the module assessments lack detail.

A number of modules have learning outcomes that are particularly vague, using such terms as 'understand' and 'get acquainted with'. Some modules have 'learning outcomes' that really are 'aims'. Module learning outcomes should be revisited to ensure they are appropriate and increase in complexity for years II and III studies.

> There is some discrepancy between the module titles (SER pages, 32-36) and those reproduced in the module descriptions (SER pages, 37-159). For the most part these are minor but some are more significant, e.g. *'EU Conditionality'* is presumably *'Conditioning Maastricht criteria of EU'*. The titles need to be reconciled. The title on page 93 requires correction! The module entitled *'Comparative government in SEE countries'* does not seem to appear in the curriculum structure SER pages 32-36.
>
> Regarding the pathways: (i) Public Administration: why are the Kosovo-focused modules all electives? (ii) International Relations: Why is '*Balkan regional relations'* just a minor elective. (ii) European integration: *'EU Policy towards the Balkans'* and *'Kosovo's EU accession path'* are both significant units of study (important local specialisms) that should be compulsory given the programme rationale and target group (SER pages 25, 26). These are matters to consider that link to your stated overall learning outcomes. A focus on Kosovo and the Balkans give your programme a unique and important focus.

The Internship opportunity is an important and very positive aspect of the course. However, there is little detail of the sorts of internship that are appropriate or how such work experience is approved. Most serious internships have clear learning outcomes and assessment associated with them. These need to be written along with clear assessment criteria. Without these the whole procedure is just an exercise in time served. In addition a

proper module outline is necessary and an ECTS credit value allocated to this significant part of student studies.

Many of the modules recommended reading lists still suffer from having outdated texts. This is particular detrimental for the subject discipline of Politics. e.g. *'Comparative Politics*' - the most recent text is dated 2009; *'Political History of Kosovo'* - 2012; *'Analysis of Public Policy'* - 2011; *'Peace and Conflict in Theory and Practice* ' - 2011; *'International Organisations'* - 2005. These are just as few examples. The implication of this is that no events from recent years are covered.

> The module *'English for Political Science'* is an important element in the programme but it is not clear what standard is reached. The ability to read academic texts provides a huge advantage to students where most key publications are in English. Is there further ongoing support? The admission criterion for the BA is vague and only states 'possess the basic skills and knowledge of English'. Are any modules entirely delivered in English?

The Diploma thesis module (eight ECTS credits) is an important element of the course. Unfortunately there is not full module outline (SER page 159) - just one paragraph of information. The previous external report commented on this. The nature, role, and expectations (including clear assessment criteria) must be fully explained. If this is not done there is no clear guidance for the student and its place as a summation or pinnacle of the individual student's studies is unclear.

The modules in the BA Political Science reasonable but should be further improved. Consideration should be given to the inclusion of some themed, cross-cutting ones: *'Terrorism, radicalisation and the rise of extremisms*', *'Post Soviet foreign policy'*, *'European integration and disintegration'*, etc. These are just suggestions.

Recommendations:

- Re-evaluate the size of modules and their assessments;
- Reconcile the module title variations in the SER;
- Consider the status of some key Kosovo-focused electives essential to the delivery of your stated programme learning outcomes;
- Develop a full module outline and credit value for the 'Internship';
- Ensure all recommended reading lists include a text from 2013-2016 plus appropriate journal articles;
- Include a full module outline with its purpose, regulations, length and assessment criteria and weighting for the Diploma thesis;
- Revisit weak learning outcomes;
- Consider the introduction of topical new modules.

VI.1.4. International Cooperation

UBT has a clear and active policy for international cooperation. This is comprehensively stated (SER, section 6, page 273-280). The policy is impressive and there are clear links to a range of foreign universities and researchers. The linking of teaching and learning to

research is admirable. UBT should be congratulated on its numerous international cooperation activities and encouraged to continue to develop such activities.

VI.1.5. Staff Development and Research

A number of teaching staff clearly publish (see SER pages 222-239 and 162-180). Unfortunately, there is no disaggregated information as the same list of published work is reproduced for both the BA and MA. The staff publications record is important. UBT has a clear policy to support research in their teaching staff and *'routinely makes available research and professional development allowances to staff...*" There is also a staff development plan (SER, page 260-261). This has impressive objectives. It would be useful if the results of any measurement of the stated performance indicators and objectives were analysed and published. It is not clear how many 'politics staff' benefit from this and it would be useful for this sort of information to be published.

Recommendations:

- The staff-development and research policy should be effectively monitored and the results analysed and published.

VI.1.6. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

The overall buildings at two sites were visited. Plans to move the Politics programmes of study and effectively all study programmes to the new green campus are clear. A new Social Science and Humanities building is planned there. The facilities (lecture and seminar rooms) that were examined looked appropriate and modern. The library is a matter of concern. It still has relatively few Politics texts and little strength in depth. The library texts are situated at the new site and students (currently all taught at the central Pristina site) have to travel there. This must deter students, and there were no students in the library when it was visited. The library needs to build up its journal collection. Some library staff need to be able to speak English as so many key texts are now published in this language.

Recommendations:

- Access and use on key politics on-line journals should be monitored.
- A dedicated and fully resourced library acquisition plan should further enhance library holdings of politics texts.

VI.1.7. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

The BA Politics is a successful and robust programme of learning. It is very traditional in structure and could benefit from modernisation. The additional documents requested were delivered. The list of active researchers combined BA and MA staff and makes drawing judgments difficult. The rest of the additional materials provided positive confirmation of the standard of the BA Political Science programme. The IDEAA unit has the potential to be of great benefit to UBT.

Various points raised in the previous report (2013) when the programme was given its first approval have been responded to. However, there are a number of important issues the

course-team must now consider. All the recommendations in the sections above should be considered and acted upon. Furthermore:

- The course leadership of the BA Political Science must be separated from that of the proposed MA;
- The current structure of the course should be re-evaluated as the plethora of modules has a severe and detrimental impact on deep learning and the progression of students. This is compounded by a concomitant burdensome diet of uniformly structured, vey traditional and limited approach to assessment;
- All recommended module reading must be updated and more journal articles should be cited;
- The library should continue to be enhanced and the use off electronic journal articles monitored;
- The role, size, importance and nature of year three pathway electives must be reconsidered;
- Projected student intakes (increases) must be accompanied by commensurate increases in FT staff and expansion of the building and library provision.

Responses to UBT comments on Political Science BA:

- All the comments in the report need to be addressed;
- The course leaders for the BA and the MA should not be the same people;
- It is normal practice to have different regulations for Bachelor and Master programmes that reflect their different nature, role, requirements and levels;
- Structural issues (teaching - learning - assessment, etc.) must be addressed and the current structure (and all its academic implications) provided with a logical academic rationale.

Final Recommendation:

The Political Science (BA) is recommended for approval for a period of three years.

VI.2. International Relations MA Accreditation

VI.2.1 Programme Analysis for Accreditation

(Note: the first paragraphs below (all in italics) are reproduced from the BA report section 8.1.1- as they concern common issues and the same UBT staff attended the BA and MA meeting)

Professor Adam: met with Prof Dr. Ardian Emni; PhD Cand. Alfred Marleku; Emrush Ujkani (MA); Prof Dr. Besim Gallopini; PhD Cand. Bujar Gallopeni ; Prof Dr. Islam Lauka; Prof Dr. Metush Sulejmani; Prof Dr. Selami Sula. In addition there were two representatives from the University of Warsaw MA International Relations programme: (i) Aleksandra Jaskolska MA, programme coordinator at the Institute of International Relations, International Relations MA, and guest staff at UBT; (ii) Barbara Regulska MA, programme coordinator for MA International Relations - exchange.

A number of potential confusions arise from the list of those attending the meeting:

- *There is some confusion in documents concerning the exact roles of Dr. Ardian Emni and PhD Cand. Alfred Marleku. In the SER (pages 23 and 183) they are listed as joint leaders of both BA and MA programmes. There should be separate course leaders for each programme of study.*
- *The KAA site visit programme indicates that the following were listed as 'Responsible persons' of the study programmes:*

9	Political Sciences/ BA		Ardian Emini	Besim Gollopeni	Isak Sherifi
10	Political Sciences/ MA		Abdullah Azizi	Selami Suli	Metush Sulejmani

- *In the SER 2016, PhD Cand. Bujar Gallopeni is not listed as having a role on either BA or MA programme and according to the KAA list of accredited staff (No. 89) is a specialist in Management, Business studies and Computer science. His role in both programmes needs to be clarified.*
- *In the KAA academic staff list both Emrush Ujkani and Islam Lauks are indicated as having 'N' - no diploma nostrification. It is not clear if this is significant.*

The issues above need to clarified and resolved. In addition, there needs to be a separation of staff associated with each programme, and the details provided in the SER need to disaggregate the two teams, their research and publications. There is a minor typo mistake (SER page 183) where an incorrect study programme name is included.

The part of the meeting that focused on the proposed MA International Relations was friendly and constructive. It continued with the same staff present as for the BA Political Science. The two staff from the Warsaw Institute provided some useful clarifications and input to discussions. The context for the UBT proposal rests on two key aspects:

(i) The previous accreditation (FR UBT 2013) for a BA European Studies and International Relations was not recommended for approval. However, the previous expert report did indicate - *'Rather invite UBT to apply for a Master program in European Studies and International Relations after a revision, refreshment, and qualitative upgrading of the majority of the BA modules to Master standards in a year's time.*' and,

(ii) The close working relationship developed between UBT and the University of Warsaw Institute of International Relations, which has an MA International Relations programme. This Institute is '*...offering the programme for the students of Western Balkans, where UBT of the contributing partners. The UBT has created this partnership through an Ermasmus Mundus Programme: STEM 2, SIGMA and SIGMA Agile and Erasmus + Key Action 1 Mobility Grant. Through this cooperation, the University of Warsaw has offered the opportunity for students of the Western Balkans the possibility to attend programs at BA and MA Level. Through this exchange programme, students from Warsaw have come to UBT and UBT students have gone to Warsaw. It is important to mention that the content of the curriculum is covered by Warsaw (50%) while the rest have been offered by various*

*partners in WB. In sum, the programme has been offered and covered by the University of Warsaw. UBT has profited from this cooperation and exchange to both enhance it teaching capacity and extend its assistance to mobility options for its students. The proposed MA International Programme, currently in the process of accreditation, is a UBT programme. The intention is that after the accreditation, UBT would participate in an already established platform for joint-masters degree (*Quote from the additional information requested)'.

The latter clarifies the situation. The UBT MA International Relations is clearly a freestanding UBT degree that would subsequently participate in the established platform for joint masters degree (joint - where one 'joint' degree is awarded by two institutions). It is not clear what KAA rules and requirements might be associated with this process. This sort of consideration (not part of this accreditation) normally involves: a comprehensive Memorandum of Association; joint degree regulations; special quality assurance mechanisms and regulations (including blind cross-marking and special institutional monitoring systems); appeals regulations; process agreements; coordination agreements (and terms of reference for co-ordinators); sequencing and recognition procedures; termination agreements, etc.

The proposed UBT MA International Relations would be delivered completely in English. It is unfortunate that the 2016 SER contains virtually no detail on the relationship with Warsaw (see SER, pages 183, 185, 193, 260, 270, 273, 279). This very surprising. The relationship with Warsaw is of potential great benefit in terms of UBT MA staff training, research, general regulations and procedures, development of transfer regulations, programme design, etc. In addition it was stated during the meeting that the UBT MA International Relations was largely based on the Warsaw model. This is not problematic in itself. The key point is that the focus of the current accreditation is the UBT MA International Relations - its UBT structure, staffing, resources, etc.

VI.2.2. Academic Programme, Rationale and Structure

The structure of the programme (SER pages 194-5) is very unusual for a Masters programme. Furthermore, on closer examination there are a number of serious defects. The issues of concern (in no particular order) are:

- Semester one and two have seven compulsory modules and two electives = a total of nine modules, whilst semester three appears to have 10 compulsory modules although one is marked as an elective. Whatever the situation, the whole programme suffers from an excessive number of small units of learning of unequal ECTS value (most having an ECTS value of 2-4 credits). This is not appropriate for MA level studies where depth of study is a major feature. There are also potential implications for any joint-degree excahnges.
- There is no information provided on the role and nature of the 'general electives'. Where are the module outlines of the general electives? How do they fit the programme?

- The stated purpose of the MA is to develop interdisciplinary skills (SER page 186 and 187) and such an approach is normally obtained through integrated themed study modules. Furthermore the sequence and progression through the course is not clear. The modules appear to be simply a collection of units of study.
- The profile of the programme (SER page 187) states '...owing to the principles and mechanism of education at the second-cycle studies, *the student should acquire elementary knowledge about the types of international entities...*' The use of the term 'elementary' is problematic in any Master programme and certainly not part of any second cycle level descriptor (EHEA or EQF).
- The programme learning outcomes (SER pages 187-191) are numerous. They are excessively broad in nature and need to be focused. It is more normal to have a maximum of 8-10 overall programme learning outcomes. It is not clear how the extensive list of 'social skills' is delivered and assessed in the programme.
- The curriculum structure (SER pages 194-195) contains some slightly different titles to those in the subsequent module outlines (pages 195-219).
- The statement concerning the calculation of ECTS credits is problematic (SER page 192). The current 2015 ECTS Users' Guide clearly indicates that workload is one aspect of calculating ECTS credit allocation. Credits must link to learning outcomes and workload. In the SER it is indicated that courses ending in an exam were allocated more points. Several statements in this section (SER 2..5.5.6) indicate a flawed understanding of ECTS credits. It does not matter how learning is assessed and/or delivered - if the learning outcomes are achieved then credits must be awarded.. Providing there is appropriate assessment then credits must be allocated. One form of assessment and/or delivery is not superior to another.
- The admission criteria only demand 'basic skills and knowledge of English'. This is not sufficient if the course is to be delivered in English. It is not clear what is meant by 'basic skills'.
- The assessment regulations are currently inappropriate for a Master programme (SER page 18-20). It is stated that these regulations cover BA, MA and PhD (page 20). A Master programme would normally require a separate set of assessment criteria and general regulations reflecting the differences in their depth and nature of studies.
- The various assessments attached to each module all appear to follow an identical pattern and theory/practice ratio. This is a highly contentious approach for a Masters level qualification where variations in the learning outcomes (and delivery methods) will necessitate big variations in assessment. This is especially true when considering your overall programme learning outcomes. There is no detail provided of assessment. It would be useful to include some Indication for each module where group-work, preparation of a briefing document, role-play, leadership and teamwork, work-based projects and problem solving, etc. are displayed. Formal exams are fine but should not necessarily predominate at this level. It is common for several modules at this level to result in the assessment of some sort of an extended project.

- The current structure of the programme contains seven modules (arguably eight) focused on Economics, Management and Finance. Not withstanding the nature of any 'general electives' this is very unbalanced for an MA International Relations.

Recommendations:

- Reconsider the whole programme rationale and structure in terms of all the points indicated above.
- Provide a detailed rationale that justifies the stated structure/sequence and the progression in learning skills, knowledge and abilities that are delivered.

VI.2.3. Curriculum, Modules and Units

The modules offer a wide range of studies but there is no purely Kosovo-focused module. Indeed, the whole programme does not have any unique flavour or distinctiveness. Many students (especially in any future joint degree arrangement) would seek to attend UBT for precisely local and regional specialist insights. One very broad module *'Foreign Policy of Central and Eastern Europe*' is compulsory but has a study credit load of only three ECTS credits. Furthermore, there are no exciting modules on *'Terrorism and insurgencies'*, *'Putin's post Soviet foreign policy'*, *'Counter-terrorism'*, *'EU integration/disintegration'*, etc. It is surprising that individual modules cover the foreign policies of the EU, US, China and India, and Central and Eastern Europe. The latter module presumably includes Russia - which might normally merit a full module of its own. The learning outcomes for the '*Foreign policy of Central and Eastern Europe*' module are simplistic and undemanding for an MA final year study.

In addition, a number of modules have outdated and limited recommended reading, e.g *'European Institutions'* recommends texts dated 2002, 2004 and 2002. Thismodule also indicates the EU consists of 27 states. There is also a disjunction between what it covers and its stated learning outcomes. The course description states it '*...also analysis the activities of a dozen of other regional and sub-regional organisations which exist in Europe*' (SER Page 208). Its learning outcomes only refer to the EU. The module *'Transnational Actors and Movements'* recommends texts dated 2002 and 1997. Several other modules suffer from similar flaws to those mentioned above. There are many other modules that have really outdated references. This suggests that recent events and situations would not be analysed.

The modules presented are mostly very traditional and conservative in nature. They offer very small units of learning, which are unsuitable for a Masters programme where depth is required. Several modules appear to be introductory in nature, more suitable for a BA programme; in part this relates to the programme structure of multiple small modules

There is no module outline, nor credits awarded for the internship (SER page 192). If it has no credit value then it could be argued it has no purpose. This is obviously not the case and it provides a valuable opportunity, but one that is not taken full advantage of. The internship is an important and very positive aspect of the course. However, there is little detail of the sorts of internship that are appropriate or how such work experience is approved. Most serious internships have clear learning outcomes and assessment

associated with them. These need to be written, along with clear assessment criteria. Without these the whole procedure is just an exercise in time served. If suitable internships cannot be arranged for all students the internship could be a useful elective.

No details or full module outlines exist for the Diploma Seminar and Diploma Thesis. These are very important components of any programme. Clear guidance for the student of the place of these elements is essential. Students need to know the assessment criteria and weight of components in their dissertations. It is particularly significant for Master level studies. The thesis represents a crucially important element that allows students to specialise (often integrate their studies) and show the skills and abilities they have acquired.

Recommendations:

- All the structural and organisational points and issues identified above should be addressed, as well as the referencing of outdated texts and relative lack of references to journal articles.
- Several modules do not appear to be second cycle in character, learning outcomes or assessment, and thus level. All modules need to be re-examined to ensure they are appropriate to Bologna/EHEA second cycle and EQF level

VI.2.4. International Cooperation

UBT has a clear and active policy for international cooperation. This is comprehensively stated (SER, section 6, page 273-280). The policy is impressive and there are clear links to a range of foreign universities and researchers. The linking of teaching and learning to research is admirable. UBT should be congratulated on its numerous international cooperation activities and encouraged to continue such activities. In particular the relationship between UBT and the University of Warsaw Institute of International Relations is a very positive development. The linkages should be enhanced by joint discussion of the issues raised in this report. This will be particularly important where any proposed future joint degree is further discussed.

Recommendations:

- Presumably some UBT staff have been used as guest lecturers on the Warsaw MA International Relations programme delivered at UBT. All UBT prospective MA staff should get this sort of opportunity as part of their staff development and the process logged to support the accreditation of a UBT MA.

VI.2.5. Staff Development and Research

Teaching staff clearly publish (see SER pages 222-239 and 162-180). Unfortunately, there is no disaggregated information as the same list of published work is reproduced for both the BA and MA. The staff publications record is important for both programmes of study but arguably more so for the MA. Disaggregated information is useful for experts when they attempt to make good judgements.

UBT has an impressive approach and policy to support staff research and staff development. It would be beneficial to have a detailed staff development and research plan that indicates the specific support for the proposed MA. It is disappointing that the list of UBT research themes and priorities does not include anything focused on International Relations (SER page 276-277).

The lecturing staff are generally well qualified and the majority hold PhDs. However, the staff list of those engaged permanently in the BA programme is identical to that for the MA (SER pages 160 and 221. There need to be a disaggregation of staff between the two degrees. Also, all staff due to deliver the proposed MA International Relations presumably are fluent in English. Approximately 15 of the lecturers on the course have not published anything according to the lists of staff publications included in the SER. This conflicts with the policy aspiration linking teaching and research (stated in the SER, page 280).

Recommendations:

- Develop a staff development and research plan for staff designated to teach on the proposed MA

VI.2.6. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

The overall building, lecture and seminar rooms visited were all of high quality. Unfortunately, the library is still poor and lacks strength in depth in terms of International Relation. It does subscribe to a number of electronic journals but reference to the use of these does not appear in the module outline documentation. The problems and shortcomings of the library are acknowledged and future resources need to be dedicated to the acquisition of new International Relations texts. The vital use of journal articles needs to be emphasised in the modules.

Recommendations:

- Specific funding should be allocated to support the acquisition of new texts in International Relations. Colleagues from Warsaw could advise on the range of suitable texts.
- All modules should include recent journal articles in their recommended texts. The key International Relations-related journal should be identified in the MA proposal.

VI.2.7. Expert's Recommendations to KAA

The proposed MA International Relations has a number of positive aspects but also suffers from a serious number of structural, content, focus, didactic and regulatory flaws. There are also several missing elements (module outlines) and confusing aspects. These are collectively severe enough to prevent any accreditation at this time. However, the course team is encouraged to re-present a suitable revised MA programme of studies building on the active support of their foreign partners.

Responses to UBT's comments on International Relations MA:

- All the comments in the report need to be addressed;

- The course leaders for the BA and the MA should not be the same people;
- It is normal practice to have different regulations for Bachelor and Master programmes that reflect their different nature, role, requirements and levels;
- The size of learning units (and their impact on assessment) has enormous consequences for the possibility for 'high level deep learning' to take place.

Final Recommendation:

The International Relations (MA) is not recommended for approval.

For and on behalf of the Experts' Team:

Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak, ET Chair, Prof. Dr. Balint Bachmann, ET's Coordinator