

**UBT KOLEGJI**  
***PRPGRAMME REACCREDITATION***  
**REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM**

1. INTRODUCTION .....	3
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION/ACCREDITATION – MA POLITICAL SCIENCE.....	6
3. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – BA INTEGRATED DESIGN (Prizren) .....	17
4. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – BA INTEGRATED DESIGN (Ferizaj).....	26
5. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – BSc AGRICULTURE AND ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING .....	35
6. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – MSc FOOD SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY .....	50
7. FINAL SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....	65

## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Context

**Date of site visit:** 14<sup>th</sup> May 2019

**Expert Team (ET) members:**

- Prof. Dr. Balint Bachmann
- Prof. Dr. Joachim Mueller
- Prof. Dr. Reiner Doluschitz
- Prof. Stephen Adam

**Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):**

- Avni Gashi, Acting Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation

**Sources of information for the Report:**

- The new KAA guidelines for institutional and programme evaluation + FR samples;
- Self-evaluation report (SER) 2019 submitted by UBT;
- Previous External Evaluation Report (FR) dated 27<sup>th</sup> June 2016;
- Information obtained during the site visit;
- Supplementary documents requested see list below:

**MA Political Science – additional documents requested \* denotes documents received:**

- i. All module outline documents, including reading lists, assessment diets, content, learning outcomes, etc.\*
- ii. UBT and/or Faculty master degree regulations and any document that cover: module size, ECTS credits, appeals, progression rules, assessment regulations, pass/fail rules, grading regulations, etc.\*
- iii. Any staff support policy and process documents that cover research, staff development and support. \*
- iv. UBT and Faculty strategic development plans. \*
- v. Admissions process and criteria for proposed MA Political Science. \*
- vi. Library development plan (general and specific) associated or impacting on the proposed Master programme. \*
- vii. UBT/Faculty teaching, learning and assessment policy. \*

*All document requested above should only be sent if they exist already – no new documents to be created.*

**Criteria used for program evaluation:**

- The new KAA Accreditation Manual, guideline materials plus example ‘new style’ reports.

### 1.2 Site visit schedule

Expert Team

- Prof. Dr. Balint Bachmann
- Prof. Dr. Joachim Mueller
- Prof. Dr. Reiner Doluschitz
- Prof. Dr. Stephen Adam

#### Coordinators of KAA

- Avni Gashi, Acting Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation

#### Site Visit Program

##### (14<sup>th</sup> May)

<b>11.00</b>	Meeting at the reception of the hotel / Lunch
<b>13.00 – 13.30</b>	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated ( <i>no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion</i> )
<b>13.30 – 15.00</b>	Meeting with the head of the study programme
<b>14.40 – 15.15</b>	Meeting with quality assurance representatives
<b>15.20 – 16.10</b>	Meeting with teaching staff
<b>16.10 – 17.00</b>	Meeting with stakeholders
<b>17.00 – 17.40</b>	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure ( <i>used for the implementation of the programme</i> )

Nr.	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs		
1	Integrated Design (Prizren)/ BA	Balint Bachmann	Besa Jagxhiu	Rineta Jashari	Safete Veliu
2	Integrated Design (Ferizaj)/ BA	Balint Bachmann	Arnisa Kryeziu	Artan Behluli	Mimoza Sylejmani
3	Political Science/ MA	Stephen Adam	Shqipe Mjekiqi	Dritero Arifi	
4	Agriculture and Environmental Engineering/ BSc	Reiner Doluschitz	Smajl Rizani	Ismet Babaj, Shkelzim Ukaj	Medin Zeqiri, Besa Veseli
5	Food Science and Technology/MSc	Joachim Mueller	Kastriot Pelivani	Valon Derguti	Violeta Lajqi, Ibrahim Mehmeti

### 1.3 A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

UBT was established in Prishtina, Kosovo in October 2004 by Prof.Dr. Edmond Hajrizi. The institution was built on the previous experience of the Institute of Enterprise Engineering and Management (IEME). The College holds the license of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) No.808/02-1 dated 18.10.2004.

UBT College is based in Prishtina, Lagjja Kalabria PN. It operates four campuses: UBT Prishtina, UBT Innovation Campus, UBT Prizren and UBT Ferizaj. It is also supported by its centres in various other cities in Kosovo.

The College holds both institutional and programme accreditation by Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) to offer about 30 undergraduate and graduate programmes in areas of business, computer science, social science, architecture, engineering and arts. The full list of programmes under current evaluation/accreditation are listed in section 1.2 above

## 2. PROGRAM EVALUATION/ACCREDITATION – MA POLITICAL SCIENCE

<b>Faculty/Department</b>	<b>Faculty of Political Science</b>
<b>Main Campus or Branch</b>	Main Campus
<b>The program applies to Branch</b>	No
<b>Name of the study program</b>	MA Political Science
<b>Person responsible</b>	Prof.Dr. Arian Starova
<b>Accreditation/Reaccreditation</b>	Accreditation
<b>NQF Qualification Level</b>	NQF Level 7
<b>Academic degree conferred</b>	MA
<b>ECTS</b>	120
<b>Program profile (specialization)</b>	Political Science

### 2.1 Mission, objectives and administration

The initial meeting was with Prof Dr Arian Starova and Liri Kosovare Bllaca 1300-1330. Prof. Dr Starova is listed as the faculty/department person responsible for the proposed MA Political Science. He and Liri Kosovare Bllanca jointly discussed the proposed programme. It was indicated that the proposed MA was a logical addition to the existing BA Political Science programme.

This meeting began with a discussion of general questions. The accreditation was hampered by the lack of several key ‘additional documents’ listed above in section 1.1 of this report. The lack of sight of such materials prior to the site visit makes it impossible to gauge how appropriate is the level and nature of the proposed programme modules and the policy framework that supports them.

It was noted that the MA Political Science was already listed on website and prior to the visit, UBT institutional website indicated that it was a university. The website has since been corrected and UBT is now listed as an institution of higher education.

The fit of the MA Politics proposal with the faculty plan and UBT mission was explored. Subsequent analysis of the UBT Mission and the Faculty of Political Science ‘strategic plan 2018-2021’ demonstrates that the MA proposal is consistent with this strategic plan. However, the strategic plan is dominated by fine aspiration but contains little detail of its resourcing and associated measurement criteria of objectives to be achieved. A further complication is that the MA rationale contains a number of aims and goals but these are not clearly expressed in terms of overall programme learning outcomes (see SER 4.13.1).

No formal structured market research was undertaken associated with the demand for the MA except that it was stated that it naturally fitted and supported the existing UBT BA Political Science.

The title of the proposed MA Political Science was explored. It was confirmed that the proposed title is problematic as the SER also indicates the title '*MA Foreign Policy, International Diplomacy and International Security*'. Furthermore, the proposal includes two distinct and exclusive pathways that are explained in one sentence: '*In the second year of the master studies, it is foreseen to have two special branches: "Foreign policy and Diplomacy" and "Studies in International Security"'*' (SER section 4.13). There is no further explanation of these except in the module and semester table (SRE 4.13.4). This table shows the two distinct year II semester III sets of modules for the pathway chosen. The problem here is that MA students cannot be awarded the title '*MA Foreign Policy, International Diplomacy and International Security*' if they have only studied one of the named components. There is no exploration of the implications for students of which choice they might make nor rationale of the two routes. There would also have to be separate learning outcomes associated with each pathway. The presentation section of the SER includes a number of reasonable aims but these need to be expressed in terms of clear learning outcomes.

The SER initially indicates an intake of 50 students (SER 4.13) but later mentions an intake of 30-40 (SER 4.13.5). Student intake needs to be confirmed as this has an impact on resources.

Given the nature of the programme and its anticipated goal '*Kosovo badly needs specialists of international relations as well qualified diplomats*', it is difficult that the programme is designed to be full-time only. There is presumably a potentially large untapped market for part-time study by Kosovans working in these areas.

It was established that the MA programme was 70-75% based on similar programmes existing in Warsaw, Salzburg and Ljubljana. This is not problematic but the UBT programme must be fully owned and UBT is responsible for the coherence and nature of what it offers.

The dominant language for the delivery for the proposed MA is Albanian. This raises a number of serious issues given the prospective outcomes, profile, nature and aims of the MA. The importance of English is acknowledged in the proposal regarding information sources and this, combined with the lack of key literature available in Albanian, would seriously hamper effective advanced study and learning in this area. The SER itself states: '*Because of the irreplaceable importance of English language in the teaching areas of this Master program, we have deemed necessary to consider the advanced study of this foreign language as an optimal subject...(sic)*' (SER section 4.13.1)

The proposed solution to include in Year II, semester IV a 5 ECTS credit module in English. This is introduced very late in the programme of studies and therefore cannot help those students who have studied semester I-III without access to significant key learning resources. Furthermore, it is difficult to see what benefits the study of a compulsory 5 ECTS credit module at this stage would have. Similarly, the role and purpose of a 5 ECTS credit compulsory 'regional language' module introduced at a similar late stage is questionable. The 10 ECTS credits associated with these final year semester IV compulsory study units might be better allocated to the semester IV Diploma thesis.

UBT has formal policies, guidelines and regulations encompassing procedural and academic issues which are available to staff and students. There are 62 separate regulations and policies listed on the UBT website in English and local language but these cannot be accessed.

However, hard copies of the key regulatory documents requested were provided. UBT has a sophisticated student record and management information system.

The SER with its 1330 pages provides externals with huge levels of information but the sheer volume of information creates problems for externals. However, the new KAA standards/performance indicator approach does encourage this sort of information overload and has implications for the nature, agenda and time allocation of any site visit (SVP).

The ‘*UBT and Faculty Strategic development Plan 2018-2021*’ is a useful document that indicates a clear vision but it is not costed, lacks resource commitment and tools/criteria to measure the achievement of medium- and longer-term goals.

### **ET recommendations:**

- A. *Essential background and policy documents such as those indicated in the additional documents requested list (above in this report section 1.1) must be made available prior to any site visit. Without these no judgement about level, coherence, content and approach is possible.*
- B. *Express the programme aims and goals as a set of (6-10) clear overall programme learning outcomes (see SER section 4.13.1).*
- C. *The title of the MA Political Science requires reconsideration and/or refinement. The title ‘MA Foreign Policy, Diplomacy and International Security’ is also used in the document (SER section 4.13.1, page 907). This is a more accurate title but is also problematic. The title issue(s) needs to be clarified along with some rationale and explanation of the two alternative study routes in year II, semester III. Separate pathways need to be reflected in appropriate learning outcomes.*
- D. *Clearly establish the proposed student intake numbers.*
- E. *Consider offering the programme in PT mode. Given the target employment groups for the proposed MA it should prove to be highly attractive to those staff already employed in Ministries, outside agencies, NGOs, international organisations, media, etc.*
- F. *Review the place, role and nature of the final year, semester IV, language modules.*
- G. *Significantly revise the level of the modules delivered in English and make appropriate changes to the admission requirements. It is strongly recommended, given the content, nature and anticipated outcomes of the proposed programme, that the bulk of it should be delivered in English.*
- H. *‘The UBT/Faculty strategic development plans’ lack information on resource implications, costings, criteria for measuring the achievement of goals.*
- I. *The KAA need to consider the level of information now required from institutions and the impact of the new standards/performance indicators approach on the nature, agenda and time allocation of site visits (SVP).*

### **Compliance with KAA standards and performance indicators (KAA manual refs):**

Standard:	1.1	1.2	1.3	1.4	1.5	1.6					
Compliance:	yes	no	no	yes	?	?					

**Compliance level:** Partially compliant.

## **2.2 Quality management**

UBT has a complex approach to quality management detailed in SER section 5, pages 59-70. The meeting with quality assurance faculty representatives (X. Cupi and N. Brovina - Faculty representatives for quality assurance) explored the faculty quality assurance processes. It was indicated that they saw such proposals as the MA and were involved with it. However, they indicated that they had no role in rejecting proposals before they are passed on. They can provide advice only. There is also some student consultation and involvement in the QA processes.

It is apparent that internal QA systems do not have the formal power to review new proposals and pick up some of the problems identified in section 2.1 of this report (above). Their role appears to be administrative, data generation and analysis and not judgemental or programme evaluative. UBT acknowledges the slow rate of quality enhancement (see SWOT analysis) and lack of experience in quality management. A stronger culture of quality enhancement and review needs to develop. Too many problematic issues appear to be unquestioned by the review and internal validation process. The lack of overall programme learning outcomes is one example of a weak system

UBT and the Faculty of Political Science have systems in place to continuously improve the teaching process with periodic review, evaluation and self-evaluation involving staff and students. It is difficult to understand why the detailed module outlines for the MA Political Science were not attached to the SER documentation. Without these it is impossible for any external to make any sort of judgement about the level, sequencing, nature, learning outcomes, assessment, etc., of the proposed programme of studies.

The Master degree (second cycle) regulations were provided with the additional documents requested. These are reasonable but not completely comprehensive. However, they also contain information that might better exist within a UBT/Faculty second cycle 'teaching, learning and assessment policy', e.g, what constitutes good assessment, or what constitutes 'evaluation exam'. Appeals policy and procedures are briefly mentioned in these regulations but not the grounds for appeal. Similarly, there is information on the thesis but this is very basic and includes general information on 'internships' that suggest that they are obligatory along with research (see article 21 of the regulations).

#### **ET recommendations:**

- A. *The approach to quality assurance needs to be enhanced with a stronger judgemental dimension where new proposals are checked and approved before being passed on. The checking/approval dimension should cover structural issues, presence of learning outcomes, up to date reading lists and journal citations, conformity to UBT regulations, etc.*
- B. *The faculty and institutional quality assurance policies and processes clearly exist and are well documented but staff in the faculty quality assurance/management have no formal power or role to reject or call for significant amendment of a new proposal.*
- C. *The Master degree (second cycle) regulations should be reviewed and rationalised to distinguish them from the 'UBT/Faculty teaching, learning and assessment policy domain. An addition to the regulation might usefully be the possibility of a Master degree completely by research.*

#### **Compliance with KAA standards and performance indicators (KAA manual refs):**



**Compliance level:** Substantially compliant

## 2.4 Educational process content

The MA programme has a number of appropriate aims but these are not clearly translated into a set of overall programme learning outcomes. The MA is designed to be ‘*tightly linked with the conditions of Kosovo, the region and international conditions*’ (SER section 13.1). It is clear that many of the proposed modules reflect this. Many comparable foreign MA programmes have larger, more themed module units. This has the benefit of reducing the fragmented (a plethora of small ECTS modules and their multiple assessment burdens) and constantly interrupted nature of studies, and encourages deeper study.

Given the nature and the student profile for the projected programme there should be some formal, regular and agreed set of outside speakers (easily available from Pristina) to support the programme including Ministry officials, Kosovo diplomats, Ambassadors/Embassy officials, NGOs, politicians, etc. The proposed MA would be greatly enhanced by the provision of regular outside speakers and practitioners built into the programme. This would enhance the practical aspects of studies. In addition, such individuals could also act as an advisory committee on the development of the programme. The proposal document emphasises ‘the need in Kosovo for specialists in international relations as well as qualified diplomats’ (SER section 4.13.1). The problem is that the design of the MA does not currently match these stated needs – linguistically, structurally and in the development of practical skills.

The meeting with stakeholders was particularly informative and useful. This meeting included three students on the MA on the Public Policy and Management programme plus: Lir Deda (Member of Parliament of Kosovo), Besnik Tahiri (Government coordinator on State reforms) and Artan Murati (Transparency International Kosovo). Several strong messages came through this meeting where all those consulted strongly supported the idea and need for such a Master programme. It was suggested that any intake should be kept relatively small and it should be delivered and taught mainly in English. This is due to the nature of the subject disciplines and the employment outcomes envisaged. There is by definition a limited amount of texts, journals and materials available in the local language. Cutting-edge, Master-level studies requires access to such sources which are predominately in English. Obviously, there are consequences for the admission requirements for any programme that demands a high level of English proficiency. The practitioners emphasised how useful the applied practical element would be to prospective students and prospective employers.

Analysis of the module reveals a number of issues for further consideration:

- The module outline proforma do not indicate staff responsible;
- Several modules could easily be amalgamated to deepen the learning experience as a reduction in the number of modules reduces the constant start and ending of new units of study and the plethora of assessments;
- There is no rationale for, or explanation of the large number of elective modules on offer. The purpose and implications of elective choices is unclear or why so many electives are necessary. Do any elective choices link together and what information do students receive to aid them in choices?
- Module outlines are not uniform in the nature and level of content provided – some have aims but not learning outcomes, etc;

- Very few modules specify journal articles which are essential for such master level studies;
- There is no full module outline for the crucially important Diploma Thesis module (20 ECTS credits). Its role, purpose, nature (disciplinary/interdisciplinary, theory/practice balance), learning outcomes, generic assessment and weighting criteria, support elements, etc.; all require full explanation.
- There appears to be no proper internship module outline – this type of MA would particularly benefit from such a possibility with allocated ECTS credits attached to those who undertook it. Such a module must have defined learning outcomes, a clear process outlining the nature and approval of internships, mechanisms criteria for the evaluation and nature of the experience, weighted assessment elements, mentor criteria and support mechanisms, etc.
- Specific module issues include:
  - Why is the module '*Foreign Policy of the Balkan States*' an elective and not a core component of the MA?
  - Why does the '*English for Political Science*' 5 credit semester III module appear so late in the programme; its stated learning outcomes might be better suited to a BA. Furthermore, the stated module learning outcome '*read and understand texts dealing with political science in English*' is fine – but all students on the proposed MA will need to do this already (not at the end of the programme) as stated previously key journal/texts in this area are in English.
  - The '*Strategic Behaviour*' module has no learning outcomes.
  - The '*Advanced Quantitative Research Methods*' module would be more useful if it also delivered skills associated with 'qualitative' research methods. The latter perhaps being more useful for those taking the MA. As a mandatory course which is very specialised and states 'the ultimate goal of the course is to enable students to write a sophisticated, quantitatively-oriented Master thesis'. Few students will do this and thus it is questionable as a core compulsory study. This is not to suggest the module is poor in itself.
  - The '*Comparative Foreign Policy*' compulsory module is very broad in scope and might benefit from a reduction in the number of countries covered to improve the depth and level of study.
  - The '*International Law*' core module appears to enjoy an assessment weighting that totals 125%.
  - The '*History of Political Thinking*' module might be better suited to a BA politics.
  - Why is the '*Foreign Policy of the USA*' module an elective when its foreign policy has such a significant role and impact on the region and the MA? Its emphasis is quite historical and it might better be focused on contemporary European/Balkan/Kosovo aspects.
  - The '*Advanced Study on Diplomatic Negotiations*' module looks excellent but the evaluation methods do not necessarily reflect the important skills it develops (e.g. negotiations, role-play, writing of briefs, teamwork/groupwork, practical briefing, diplomatic etiquette, etc.). It is not clear how a final exam is appropriate.
  - The '*Cooperation for Balkan Security*' module looks very interesting but the assessment (self-study 40% and final exam 60%) give no information (like many other modules) if this is appropriate and closely links to the module learning outcomes. The learning outcomes stated are not really learning outcomes.

- The ‘*Master Diploma Thesis*’ list of research areas (SER section 4.13.6) contains many broad areas of study which would be better replaced by specific MA level titles to emphasise the focus and level of work expected.
- The majority of modules have multiple assessment elements/diets. At MA level this is unusual. A variety of challenging assessment tasks is excellent but these do need to closely link to learning outcomes and the purposes of the MA. Modules must be appropriate to provide subject specific skills and knowledge associated with employment needs;
- The bulk of module assessments include weighted elements that are more common in undergraduate programmes including: ‘regular presence at lectures’, ‘active participation in class’, ‘seminar work’, ‘presence’, ‘self-study’, ‘attendance and activation in lectures’ etc. It not clear what the purpose of these are at Master level study. They also present difficulties in transparent and fair evaluation. Why should students get any marks simply for attending? The achievement of learning outcomes is the only way to obtain ECTS credits. The transparent assessment of ‘participation’ is very challenging – what criteria are to be used and how are marks allocated?
- There is no overall assessment rationale for the programme, especially for the similar patterns that predominate (e.g. some small variations on the following: book/essay = 20%; regular presence in lectures =10%; active participation = 20%; mid-term/end exam = 50%). It is not that this is inappropriate but most modules have multiple individual assessments – are these always appropriate? Some modules just indicate some variation of self-study 40% and exam 60% whilst some modules have no assessment diet specified.
- There is also quite an emphasis on formal examinations and tests, the nature of which is not specified. Studies at this level should employ a range of assessed activities including: role-play, joint and individual presentations, teamwork, negotiations, group-work, simulations, debates, briefing, and in particular, real-world practical activities linked to the specified module/programme outcomes (skills and competences). It is not clear how any transferable skills agenda is delivered (a significant Bologna reform element). Furthermore, the necessity and importance of this sort of activity is paramount given the nature of the MA and the sorts of skills and abilities the graduates would require to use in their future employment.
- ‘Active learning’ is highlighted in the 2018-2021 Strategic Plan but does not appear to feature in the ‘Teaching, learning and assessment policy’. This sort of student-centred focus is consistent with Bologna recommendations but does not appear to sufficiently come through in policies and practices.
- The role and placing of the ‘English’ and the ‘foreign’ language modules studies is questionable.
- Advanced quantitative research methods would usefully contain a qualitative element especially if the degree ‘as stated’ is to aid progression to PhD studies.

In the set of crucial additional documents requested was the UBT/Faculty ‘Teaching, learning and assessment policy’. This includes an excerpt from the Kosovo ‘law Nr. 04/L-037 for higher education’ and the disposition of article 88 of the statutes of UBT and President’s decision dated 15.05.2019. This regulation for student assessment appears to regulate and constrict the nature and type/categories for assessment. It is not clear if this regulation covers graduate and postgraduate studies. It includes several references to ECTS credits with emphasis on academic hours - workload for the purposes of calculation. The regulations indicate very little about the role of learning outcomes. ECTS now emphasises the workload-learning outcome linkage. There does need to be some separation of elements of any Teaching, learning and

assessment policy that focus on the postgraduate level. The ‘Faculty of Political Science strategic goals 2018-2021’ are clear and positive statements but need to include resource implications, funding commitments and short- and medium-term measurement criteria. Several of the policies might/will require further update of existing UBT/Faculty policies.

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Develop a precise set of overall learning outcomes associated with the MA and its two discrete pathway choices.*
- B. *Consider the integration of similar themed modules to deepen studies and reduce the plethora of units and individual assessments.*
- C. *Re-evaluate the proposed assessment pattern that includes a rationale to justify an overall MA appropriate approach that reflects the module and programme learning outcomes. A rich, appropriate and diverse set of assessments covering theory and practice should exist for the MA.*
- D. *Review and develop the UBT/Faculty teaching, learning and assessment policy with particular reference to the assessment policy and clarify if it is designed and appropriate for MA studies. Update it in terms of ‘student-centred learning’ and ‘active learning’.*
- E. *Establish a formal schedule of outside speakers and practitioners to deepen and enhance the study and learning process.*
- F. *Establish an advisory practitioner group to suggest and advise on the enhancement of the programme.*
- G. *Respond the general and specific points made (see above bullet points) concerning modules;*

**Compliance with KAA standards and performance indicators** (KAA manual refs):

Standard:	4.1	4.2	4.3	4.4	4.5	4.6	4.7	4.8	4.9	4.10	4.11	4.12
Compliance:	no	no	no	yes	no		no	no	no	yes	no	

**Compliance level:** Non-compliant

## 2.5 Students

There was no meeting with students as this was a new proposal. However, the meeting with stakeholders included three students from the MA Public Policy and Management. These were very supportive of UBT and their studies and welcomed the idea of the new MA. They were also supported of such a Master programme being delivered in English as this has multiple benefits in terms of future employment.

The information provided in the SER document indicates the existence of policies and procedures covering admissions, feedback mechanisms, an effective student record system/management information system (MIS), etc.

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *None*

**Compliance with KAA standards and performance indicators** (KAA manual refs):

Standard:	5.1	5.2	5.3	5.4	5.5	5.6	5.7	5.8	5.9	5.10	5.11
Compliance:	yes	yes		yes	yes		yes		yes	yes	

**Compliance level:** Substantially compliant but not able to check everything as the programme is currently just a proposal.

## 2.6 Research

Staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria. The SER contains very detailed information and processes associated with their policy towards research.

The MA Political Science document include brief information (one short paragraph) on the Diploma Thesis part of the proposed degree.

It was indicated that there was no development plan for the MA staff focused on their specialisms and the modules they are responsible for.

### ET recommendations:

- A. *It is recommended that a staff research and development plan for the proposed MA is developed.*

### **Compliance with KAA standards and performance indicators** (KAA manual refs):

Standard:	6.1	6.2	6.3	6.4	6.5	6.6	6.7	6.8	6.9	6.10	
Compliance:		yes	yes	yes	yes			yes			

**Compliance level:** compliant but not all standards could be verified due to time pressures.

## 2.7 Infrastructure and resources

The Political Science section of the SER (a two-line statement) indicates that there exist within UBT and the faculty all appropriate facilities exist to support the programme. The site does clearly have excellent up to date teaching facilities.

The library currently has 25000 books of which currently 2074 are politic texts. The library does not have great strength in depth in terms of hardcopy texts available for the MA. It does hold a number of texts (often multiple copies) translated in Albanian. Its holding of suitable advanced texts in English need to be enhanced. It was indicated that all the texts for the proposed MA are currently in the library. The library gives student access to all the key current and relevant electronic journal articles (via EBSCO, JSTOR, Sage, Cambridge based journals, etc.).

The library development plan 2019-2022 is dominated by excellent aspirations but these need to be backed by detailed resource commitment, measurable criteria, short-medium- and long-term monitoring targets, etc.

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Enhance the number and variety of key relevant MA texts available in English.*
- B. *Create a designate budget for texts for the proposed MA.*
- C. *Add costings and measurable staged outcome to the new Library development plan.*

**Compliance with KAA standards and performance indicators** (KAA manual refs):

Standard:	7.1	7.2	7.3	7.4	7.5	7.6					
Compliance:	yes	no		yes	no						

**Compliance level:** Partially compliant but not all standards could be explored/verified in the time allocated for the visit.

**OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET**

**FINAL RECOMMENDATION:** MA Political Science is not recommended for accreditation. However, UBT are strongly encouraged to seriously consider and act on the suggested changes and recommendations and resubmit a revised proposal as there is a proven need for such a programme in Kosovo.

Expert: Prof. Stephen Adam, June 2019

### **3. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – BA INTEGRATED DESIGN (Prizren)**

#### **3.1 Mission, objectives and administration**

The mission statement of UBT College is accessible on their homepage and specifies the fields of education and science of the institution, namely business and technology. As it is stated in its mission, the evaluated study program of Integrated Design on Bachelor-level as applied art complies with the academic aims of UBT College.

The intended learning outcomes of the Integrated Design BA are in line with the National and European Higher Education Area's Qualifications Frameworks. The program intends a design-based, problem-solving approach balancing between technical and artistic aspects. Critical analysis of relevant research is the basis of concept-making design towards the ability of working in the creative industries. The study program is taking relevance on leading art schools curricula like Parsons School of Design, University of Arts London and regional institutions like Mimar Sinan University Istanbul.

The description of the subjects refers to the learning outcomes intended by national and European directives.

The study program is divided in three equal parts of lectures 1/3, practical art work 1/3 and peer workshops 1/3. The aim for practice-oriented study content is supported by external lecturers from art and the industries, field trips and individual research-based projects of the students own design topics throughout the whole program. According to Bachelor level requirements, research work will be limited to the extent of collecting references and basic data of the design topic and to collaborate with internal and external mentors and experts. Practical experience of the relevant art fields of the concentrations fashion, product design, interior design and graphic design can be gained through internship.

Policies and regulations of the academic activities are accessible on the homepage of UBT. The Regulations and Guidelines of the Academic Council and the Statute of UBT are the basic for the maintenance of the college. The administration of programs is based on the Regulation for Undergraduate/Graduate Studies. Updating and development of the programs and the organization education are made with decisions of the Faculty Council or Academic Council. Teaching staff and especially persons in charge of the study programs are fully aware of formal procedures outlined in policies and regulations of the college.

Academic ethics are regulated by the Code of Ethics and Conduct, that can be reached digitally for all students and staff. In case of violation of the regulated norms the Dean may initiate proceedings before the Faculty Sub-Committee on Ethics is activated. There is an appeal against the decision of the Sub-Committee, before the highest authority UBT Ethics Committee investigates breaches of the Code if necessary.

The Faculty management led by the Dean - elected for 4 years - and the governing body of the Faculty Council newly established the Quality Assurance Sub-Committee to monitoring performance and to produce enhancement measures. The Sub-Committee submits the Annual Quality Report with the help of the QA Officer (Mr. Aririt Bytyqi). It contains facts and

figures using the Performance Assessment Scorecard. The Faculty Performance Assessment Framework tracks the results and KPIs set for input, outcome and process. Finally, the Annual Narrative and Statistical Report is submitted to the Faculty Council, the Dean and UBT Quality Assurance Committee. The quality improvement issues are discussed annually with the aim to be part of the Annual Plan of UBT.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Strengthen awareness of the staff of major objectives of excellence in education.*
- B. *Make documents of policies more visible on UBT homepage both in Albanian and English.*

### 3.2 Quality management

All staff interviewed during the site visit were aware of the processes of their responsibility. Especially persons in charge of the study program Integrated Design BA in Prizren, Besa Jagxhiu PhD, Rineta Jashari MA and Safete Velju MA were active on reporting about regulated processes of self-evaluation and improvement issues on program level. SWOT considers the fact that all academic staff and administration take actively part in quality assurance related issues as one of the strengths.

UBT is well equipped with bodies being in charge of evaluation and further improvement: The Governing Body, President, Academic Council, Quality Assurance Committee, Quality Manager, Heads of Faculties and Departments, Faculty Councils, Faculty-level Quality Assurance Officer and Faculty-level Quality Assurance Sub-Committee, UBT Quality Assurance Committee and UBT Quality Manager. Staff and even students are involved in the processes of QA and to further decision making upon the annual report. KPIs and QA measures are integrated to the annual plan of operation of the college.

The recently announced UBT Quality Manual shall assure the overall quality improvement procedure including services and resources of the whole institution. The services that are reviewed are quality procedures, governance, teaching and research at Faculty-level, student admission, progression and graduation, staff selection, recruitment and development, student support services, physical infrastructure and equipment and public information.

UBT Quality Manual points out all aspects of the quality issues including the study programs with its components. QA tracks the results and KPIs set for input, outcome and processes of the study programs from designing the through launching and maintenance of the courses.

Quality Assurance Officers on Faculty-level are in charge to ensure the effectiveness of the intended improvement. The process summarises the findings of the Annual Quality Assurance Report and implements those to the Faculty Annual Plan. Latest achievements of UBT in both quantitative and qualitative aspects show the development to meeting standards and to improving performance.

Surveys from students, alumni and stakeholders are part of the QA at UBT. The college is proud of its wide cooperation with external entities and is eager to analyse the processes in the labour market and in the academic community in Kosovo and internationally. The results

of the surveys are taken in consideration in the improvement of the college for sure. The SER of 2019 states the findings in many aspects and consequences are visible in the decisions of the management based on those data. Private HEIs tend not to share information gained during their operation with the public. They try to protect their interests on a competing market this way.

The results of Faculty-level quality reports are taken into account by improvement of the curricula and changing of admittance criteria for example. All participants of the education are involved in an annual cycle of updating of the study programs. Especially Integrated Design BA went through major changes in delivering the competences by improving infrastructure and recruiting competent staff reflecting on earlier recommendation during the accreditation

UBT undertakes a regular periodic evaluation of all programs once every three years as part of the re/accreditation process and it is essential to reflect on the needs and labor market too. The self-evaluation process may also include external experts of local or international HEIs.

The college undergoes regular internal and external audits to ensure continuous improvement of its study programs. The procedure includes internal audit by the Governing Body, periodic institutional audit and management quality assurance review.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Results and consequences of QA surveys shall be made more public for transparency of the HEI and to prove its vocation for continuous improvement of academic activities.*

**3.3. Academic staff**

Staff representatives reported about good level of knowledge of position description and conditions of their employment. Employees of UBT supposed to be FT and not to have a PT job in another HEI. The SER 2019 contains a table with names, scientific degree, Employment FT/PT, workload per week. English/Albanian CVs were provided in various format, that made comparison of achievement of the staff complicated.

The program Integrated Design BA is launched successfully in Pristina for 3 years now, and meets all legal requirements. The staff intended to conduct the studies in Prizren is partly certified in earlier accreditation procedures. The ratio of FT/PT staff meets the provision as well.

Most of the teaching staff are FT employees who are not involved within an academic year in other position. The SER states, that the list of staff has been verified with the e-Accreditation System operated by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency, which was not accessible for the ET unfortunately.

More than 50% of the staff are FT, and they cover 80% of the subject of Integrated Design BA program.

The program has three qualified staff members, Besa Jagxhiu PhD, Rineta Jashari MA and Safete Veliu MA, who meet the requirements for responsible teaching staff for artistic/applied science institutions.

The staff is provided with development opportunities within UBT both in their teaching and management skills. Lately they focused on pedagogical training at IDEAA Institute of the college. Some of the young educators have been supported in their PhD procedure (Mimoza Sylejmani), however, more financial aid shall be dedicated for sustainable human resource development, which is planned for the extended infrastructure and growing student population in the coming years.

The Faculty Council Workload Policy ensures all staff's engagement for consultations and other services. Especially FT staff members shall take part in designing, launching and developing of academic activities in benefit of the HEI and the wider society as well. In case of the Integrated Design BA the responsible persons and the leaders of the four concentrations are extremely engaged and sometimes overloaded by conducting the courses and organizing events.

Staff evaluation is conducted on Faculty level, by the Regulation for Staff Appraisal. According to the Employment, Performance and Progression Policy of UBT the annual review records productivity in research, artistic work, teaching, service and administration. At the end of each semester, the staff is assessed by the students. Assessment is anonymous and is conducted manually to reach higher attendance of the reviewers. QA Sub-Committee reports the Dean in its Annual QA Report, research/artistic productivity is drawn from the Research Development of UBT. The ET has no information about making the evaluation results public.

The Teaching and Learning Strategy focuses on outcomes of the QA system. Individual Professional Development Plan is implemented for teaching methods, research abilities and technical skills Quality of teaching strategies and learning materials is supervised on Faculty level, generally the Deans are in charge for the enhancement of those areas. Since Faculties cover mainly one discipline of study program on BA and MA level, the competence of the Dean, program leaders and staff secures the implementation of new strategies and methods.

Not applicable according to lower age of staff and private status of UBT College.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Accessible database for academic staff's scientific and artistic achievements would make the HEIs performance transparent and could contribute to their overall recognition as well. A database on national level would be even more useful for the regular evaluation of Kosovo institutions.*
- B. *Dedicate finances for professional development of the staff, especially for academic career.*

**3.4. Educational process content**

3.4.1. Integrated Design BA program consisting four study concentrations: Graphic Design, Fashion Design, Product Design, and Interior Design. The core philosophy of the program is the interdisciplinary nature between these relevant fields of applied art, where students benefit from the synergy of different ideas, coming from exposure of design. The practice oriented attitude of the staff ensures students' personal development and the labor market's needs at the same time.

3.4.2. The core subjects are practice oriented and conducted in small groups in a laboratory/atelier-like infrastructure. The program syllabus provides detailed information about the content and helps students to organize their individual working plan for each semester. The study program integrates professional competences in the main subjects of the four concentrations, meanwhile general knowledge is transferred through common courses for all design students. This way individual components of the concentrations can achieve an ideal specification of the studies, but ensure an overall applicable teaching method at the same time.

3.4.3. Several – more than seven – learning outcomes are defined in the SER for the Integrate Design BA program, considered as strengths of the education. The learning outcomes shall be formulated in a more general manner, because the subdivision of the competences among the subjects allows it.

3.4.4. The syllabus is unified by the Faculty Council for all subjects. Objectives, outcomes, lecture /seminar ratio method, ECTS, assessment, requirements and literature are defined for all subjects in electronic form.

3.4.5. Not applicable.

3.4.6. The Dean delivers an introduction at the beginning of the academic year, providing all necessary preliminary information for the students. The Students' Handbook states all introduction information in written form.

3.4.7. UBT College adopted an overarching didactic concept, the Competency Based Approach in curriculum to develop teaching methods across all study programs offering possibilities for active learning, include case-studies, project work, problem-based learning and simulated learning. Site visits in museums, galleries and fashion shows are important features of applied art education.

3.4.8. The assessment of performance is regulated in the Students' Rulebook, assessing coursework during and at the end of the semester. The Faculty Council regulates the mode of the exam, but the content is determined by the Subject Leader in charge. The method and frequency of assessment is clearly communicated to the students in the course syllabus and during the oral introduction of the subject.

3.4.9. The Integrated Design BA program has reference from the last three years conducting successful in Pristina. The administration of students' performance and its assessment is secured through the Student Management Information System (SMIS). Colloquium documents and portfolios are kept for three years. The work required for different grades is defined and consistent, it is comparable with other HEIs' regulations. Assessment records and grades can be appealed at the Appeals Committee, its decision is final and can't be changed.

3.4.10. The students who are identified to be in risk of non-completion are monitored upon their performance. Learning style inventory and in case of a need the mentor program helps individually. Effective pedagogical skills are trained at IDEAA Institute to provide staff with service oriented and integrated teaching methods.

3.4.11. The program is divided in four concentrations, but there is a general part of the applied art education for all students from the beginning. ECTS reflect the workload required by the courses which make out 30 credits per semester. Students are awarded by credits if they fulfil all requirements, they can step to the next concentration-related semester, if they completed the previous semester course.

3.4.12. UBT's Industry Board consists of representatives of various entities, who are involved in education with guest lectures and helping students with their Capstone/Thesis in form of creative industry-related, research-based project work.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant.

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Learning outcomes shall be formulated in a more general manner, the subdivision of the competences among the subjects allows a coherent description of the aim of the four concentrations too.*
- B. *If Integrated Design BA is launched in different location, concentration(s) adequate for the local circumstances shall be emphasised later.*

**3.5. Students**

The ET hasn't met students of Integrated Design BA, since the program doesn't exist in Prizren yet, comments are based on the SER description on student issues.

3.5.1. According to the law, students with graduate degrees from relevant specialized secondary schools can be admitted. UBT considers the right to study as a basic human right, and as a private institution it is its interest to attract more students, the College welcomes all interested applicants to study in the field of design on Bachelor level. At the same time UBT is dedicated to enhance the quality of its education, applicants have to undergo an admission test including motivation interview and portfolio of artwork of the candidates to select.

3.5.2. Students' admission is regulated by the national authorities MEST and KAA, that is respected by the Regulation of Admission of UBT College in case of the applied art programs too.

3.5.3. The indicated number of 100 students to admit in Prizren requires to split them into smaller study group of 15 to 20 students for hand-on practice oriented and integrated learning atmosphere.

3.5.4. SMIS provides results of assessments promptly and is accompanied by a system for assistance. Monitoring is set to identify students at risk, a mentor program is established to help students in need of assistance from the staff. Tutorials are in charge to assist fellow-students with services.

3.5.5. SMIS provides results of assessments promptly throughout the whole study cycle including assessments, colloquium scores and final exam scores grades.

3.5.6. The disability support provides help for students with learning difficulties and with illness or injury. Multiply examination opportunity helps students to make up missed courses.

3.5.7. Students' records are collected on Faculty level, Examination Log is kept in the SMIS. UBT aims to reduce the drop-out rate radically.

3.5.8. The Code of Ethics and Student Conduct regulates standards of behavior during education, examination and written assignments. The Faculty Sub-Committee on Ethics has been tasked to promote ethical behavior. The Student Handbook also includes advice and guidelines for ethical behavior. The Faculty operates the plagiarism detection software Turnitin to detect potential violations.

3.5.9. Students' rights and obligations are introduced by the Dean in a session every academic year. The Students' Handbook contains all relevant information in written form, that is handed over for all students. Regulations are available on the homepage of UBT.

3.5.10. Free transfer of ECTS and students is a basic achievement of the European Higher Education Area, which Kosovo doesn't belong yet, but takes it in consideration in its regulations. The process of students' transfer is determined by MEST and followed during the procedure at the HEIs. The Transfers' Commission reviews the submitted applications of the students.

3.5.11. The Student Support Officer is in charge to handle administrative issues including consultation, mentoring and tutoring. There is a three phases system to offering counselling and support to students: briefings during the registration process, weekly meetings with tutors, individual consultations on concentrations.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

A. *No recommendations.*

**3.6. Research**

3.6.1. The Integrated Design BA program doesn't aim to provide scientific work, meanwhile field study, interviews, database analysis and researched based design are part of the study method. The practice of applied art in the creative industry is R+D focused, students of design must be aware of the importance of innovation and its impact on the economy and their own career. Members of the staff are dealing with research based design and are successful in their artistic field. With their assistance UBT can set up research groups or centres of excellence by cooperating with economic entities.

3.6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are specified and is respected by the annual evaluation of the staff' performance. The outcome of scientific/artistic work per year is registered and required by the Faculty. UBT allocates funds for professional activities and supports academic achievements of the staff. Many of the staff

members cooperate with prestigious international art schools in applied art projects considered equal to scientific work. Artists with a degree (PhD, DLA) are promoted at UBT, fulfilling the accreditation criteria becoming program leaders.

3.6.3. Recognised research outcomes are defined by UBT, that are consistent with international standards: articles in indexed journals, conference papers, proceedings, books, art exhibitions, fashion shows, design fairs.

3.6.4. The academic staff has a wide range of artistic record measurable with scientific achievements, since many of them have international experience not only as acting artists but as academics as well.

3.6.5. The scientific activities at UBT are demonstrated by the Annual International Conference inviting all fields of applied science and art conducted by UBT. Staff members are expected to lecture about their artwork during the conference. More relevant to peer reviewed scientific and artistic work are the international appearances of the staff members on independent forum such as group exhibitions, biennales and fairs.

3.6.6. UBT as private HEI is active of organising scientific events, like the Annual International Conference. October 2018 the first Integrated Design conference took place with participants from seven countries. Participation of staff on international events abroad is seriously impacted by the strict visa regulations against Kosovo natives.

3.6.7. UBT tracks the publications of its staff through the Knowledge Centre. According to list of the SER most of the staff members of the Integrated Design BA fulfil the requirement to publish /produce at least one scientific/art result per year for the past three years. The consequent and continuous publication of the staff can ensure the development of the study programs in applied arts.

3.6.8. UBT requires FT academic staff to publish under the name of UBT. Academics have their own Google Scholar and ORCID accounts for the visibility of their tracks.

3.6.9. Protection of intellectual property is stated at the Code of Ethics, but no evidence for commercialization of ideas was detected. The Integrated Design program goes back only three years, considering the developing economy in Kosovo, growth of the creative industry is expected, parallel can R+D activity strengthen in academia.

3.6.10. All thought described in the SER that Integrated Design BA program activities in Pristina include various research activities, despite of the artistic work of the staff, it can't be acknowledged as research. Further resources of all kind are needed to make an impact through R+D to the economy and society in Kosovo. UBT is on the right track with its study portfolio concentrating on business and technology, since these fields are expected to drive global economic growth in an ecologically sustainable way.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *More international appearance of the staff can result in artistic/scientific visibility.*
- B. *Academic promotion on a regular basis and frequency can emphasise staff to achievements.*

- C. *Fund raising through local business entities and participation in international projects can contribute to the academic acknowledgement of UBT as applied sciences university.*
- D. *Establish flagship R+D projects with dedicated staff in charge and acknowledge their work equal to teaching activity.*

### **3.7. Infrastructure and resources**

3.7.1. UBT has well equipped campus in Prizren hosting the Integrated Design BA with labs and studios for the concentrations. Facilities of the concentrations are already there, according to the intended high number of applicants, study groups of 15 to 20 students can use the facilities at the same time, which is manageable. The staff responsible for the study program are partly from Prizren, some of the staff members will have teaching obligations both in Pristina and Prizren which can result in high working load.

3.7.2. The Faculty recently operating Industrial Design BA in Pristina allocates a three-year budget of the Prizren campus based on the income of the students' fees, which is reliable if the expectation of the high application numbers are being met.

3.7.3. The Prizren campus offers approximately 1000 square meters of facilities with a capacity of 300 students. The property is owned by the HEI and can be extended on the neighboring site.

3.7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms and laboratories are related to the expected groups' size. Specialized tools for the design concentrations are there, IT equipment is installed in the labs..

3.7.5. The library of all campuses at UBT must be improved, though design related books were bought recently, the quantity and the range of printed literature is still not satisfactory. Most of the books related to design are international publications not older than 5 years. The Prizren campus offers some specific group work space outside of library, but those areas shall be better equipped for the needs of the students.

3.7.6. The facility in Prizren is not fully accessible for students and staff with disabilities.

#### **ET recommendations:**

- A. *Improve the quality of the library by quantity of art and design related literature and magazines.*
- B. *Provide well equipped space for students' independent work. Support students' and staff's needs with disabilities.*

### **OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET**

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Integrated Design BA offered by UBT College at its campus in Prizren is Substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 100 students to be enrolled in the program.

Expert: Prof. Dr Balint Bachmann, June 2019.

## **4. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – BA INTEGRATED DESIGN (Ferizaj)**

### **4.1. Mission, objectives and administration**

4.1.1. The mission statement of UBT College is accessible on their homepage and specifies the fields of education and science of the institution, namely business and technology. As it is stated in its mission, the evaluated study program of Integrated Design on Bachelor-level as applied art complies with the academic aims of UBT College.

4.1.2. The intended learning outcomes of the Integrated Design BA are in line with the National and European Higher Education Area's Qualifications Frameworks. The program intends a design-based, problem-solving approach balancing between technical and artistic aspects. Critical analysis of relevant research is the basis of concept-making design towards the ability of working in the creative industries. The study program is taking relevance on leading art schools curricula like Parsons School of Design, University of Arts London and regional institutions like Mimar Sinan University Istanbul. The description of the subjects refers to the learning outcomes intended by national and European directives.

4.1.3. The study program is divided in three equal parts of lectures 1/3, practical art work 1/3 and peer workshops 1/3. The aim for practice-oriented study content is supported by external lecturers from art and the industries, field trips and individual research-based projects of the students own design topics throughout the whole program. According to Bachelor level requirements, research work will be limited to the extent of collecting references and basic data of the design topic and to collaborate with internal and external mentors and experts. Practical experience of the relevant art fields of the concentrations fashion, product design, interior design and graphic design can be gained through internship.

4.1.4. Policies and regulations of the academic activities are accessible on the homepage of UBT. The Regulations and Guidelines of the Academic Council and the Statute of UBT are the basic for the maintenance of the college. The administration of programs is based on the Regulation for Undergraduate/Graduate Studies. Updating and development of the programs and the organization education are made with decisions of the Faculty Council or Academic Council. Teaching staff and especially persons in charge of the study programs are fully aware of formal procedures outlined in policies and regulations of the college.

4.1.5. Academic ethics are regulated by the Code of Ethics and Conduct, that can be reached digitally for all students and staff. In case of violation of the regulated norms the Dean may initiate proceedings before the Faculty Sub-Committee on Ethics is activated. There is an appeal against the decision of the Sub-Committee, before the highest authority UBT Ethics Committee investigates breaches of the Code if necessary.

4.1.6. The Faculty management led by the Dean - elected for 4 years - and the governing body of the Faculty Council newly established the Quality Assurance Sub-Committee to monitoring performance and to produce enhancement measures. The Sub-Committee submits the Annual Quality Report with the help of the QA Officer (Mr. Aririt Bytyqi). It contains facts and figures using the Performance Assessment Scorecard. The Faculty Performance

Assessment Framework tracks the results and KPIs set for input, outcome and process. Finally, the Annual Narrative and Statistical Report is submitted to the Faculty Council, the Dean and UBT Quality Assurance Committee. The quality improvement issues are discussed annually with the aim to be part of the Annual Plan of UBT.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Strengthen awareness of the staff of major objectives of excellence in education.*
- B. *Make documents of policies more visible on UBT homepage both in Albanian and English.*

**4.2. Quality management**

4.2.1. All staff interviewed during the site visit were aware of the processes of their responsibility. Especially persons in charge of the study program Integrated Design BA in Ferizaj, Mimoza Sylejmani PhD, Artan Behluli MA and Amisa Kryeziu MA were active on reporting about regulated processes of self-evaluation and improvement issues on program level. SWOT considers the fact that all academic staff and administration take actively part in quality assurance related issues as one of the strengths.

4.2.2. UBT is well equipped with bodies being in charge of evaluation and further improvement: The Governing Body, President, Academic Council, Quality Assurance Committee, Quality Manager, Heads of Faculties and Departments, Faculty Councils, Faculty-level Quality Assurance Officer and Faculty-level Quality Assurance Sub-Committee, UBT Quality Assurance Committee and UBT Quality Manager. Staff and even students are involved in the processes of QA and to further decision making upon the annual report. KPIs and QA measures are integrated to the annual plan of operation of the college.

4.2.3. The recently announced UBT Quality Manual shall assure the overall quality improvement procedure including services and resources of the whole institution. The services that are reviewed are quality procedures, governance, teaching and research at Faculty-level, student admission, progression and graduation, staff selection, recruitment and development, student support services, physical infrastructure and equipment and public information.

4.2.4. UBT Quality Manual points out all aspects of the quality issues including the study programs with its components. QA tracks the results and KPIs set for input, outcome and processes of the study programs from designing the through launching and maintenance of the courses.

4.2.5. Quality Assurance Officers on Faculty-level are in charge to ensure the effectiveness of the intended improvement. The process summarises the findings of the Annual Quality Assurance Report and implements those to the Faculty Annual Plan. Latest achievements of UBT in both quantitative and qualitative aspects show the development to meeting standards and to improving performance.

4.2.6. Surveys from students, alumni and stakeholders are part of the QA at UBT. The college is proud of its wide cooperation with external entities and is eager to analyse the processes in the labour market and in the academic community in Kosovo and internationally. The results of the surveys are taken in consideration in the improvement of the college for sure. The SER of 2019 states the findings in many aspects and consequences are visible in the decisions of the management based on those data. Private HEIs tend not to share information gained during their operation with the public. They try to protect their interests on a competing market this way.

4.2.7. The results of Faculty-level quality reports are taken into account by improvement of the curricula and changing of admittance criteria for example. All participants of the education are involved in an annual cycle of updating of the study programs. Especially Integrated Design BA went through major changes in delivering the competences by improving infrastructure and recruiting competent staff reflecting on earlier recommendation during the accreditation

4.2.8. UBT undertakes a regular periodic evaluation of all programs once every three years as part of the re/accreditation process and it is essential to reflect on the needs and labor market too. The self-evaluation process may also include external experts of local or international HEIs.

4.2.9. The college undergoes regular internal and external audits to ensure continuous improvement of its study programs. The procedure includes internal audit by the Governing Body, periodic institutional audit and management quality assurance review.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Results and consequences of QA surveys shall be made more public for transparency of the HEI and to prove its vocation for continuous improvement of academic activities.*

**4.3. Academic staff**

4.3.1. Staff representatives reported about good level of knowledge of position description and conditions of their employment. Employees of UBT supposed to be FT and not to have a PT job in another HEI. The SER 2019 contains a table with names, scientific degree, Employment FT/PT, workload per week. English/Albanian CVs were provided in various format, that made comparison of achievement of the staff complicated.

4.3.2. The program Integrated Design BA is launched successfully in Pristina for 3 years now, and meets all legal requirements. The staff intended to conduct the studies in Ferizaj is partly certified in earlier accreditation procedures. The ratio of FT/PT staff meets the provision as well.

4.3.3. Most of the teaching staff are FT employees who are not involved within an academic year in other position. The SER states, that the list of staff has been verified with the e-Accreditation System operated by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency, which was not accessible for the ET unfortunately.

4.3.4. More than 50% of the staff are FT, and they cover 80% of the subject of Integrated Design BA program.

4.3.5. The program has three qualified staff members, Mimoza Sylejmani PhD, Artan Behluli MA and Amisa Kryeziu MA, who meet the requirements for responsible teaching staff for artistic/applied science institutions.

4.3.6. The staff is provided with development opportunities within UBT both in their teaching and management skills. Lately they focused on pedagogical training at IDEAA Institute of the college. Some of the young educators have been supported in their PhD procedure (Mimoza Sylejmani), however, more financial aid shall be dedicated for sustainable human resource development, which is planned for the extended infrastructure and growing student population in the coming years.

4.3.7. The Faculty Council Workload Policy ensures all staff's engagement for consultations and other services. Especially FT staff members shall take part in designing, launching and developing of academic activities in benefit of the HEI and the wider society as well. In case of the Integrated Design BA the responsible persons and the leaders of the four concentrations are extremely engaged and sometimes overloaded by conducting the courses and organizing events.

4.3.8. Staff evaluation is conducted on Faculty level, by the Regulation for Staff Appraisal. According to the Employment, Performance and Progression Policy of UBT the annual review records productivity in research, artistic work, teaching, service and administration. . At the end of each semester, the staff is assessed by the students. Assessment is anonymous and is conducted manually to reach higher attendance of the reviewers. QA Sub-Committee reports the Dean in its Annual QA Report, research/artistic productivity is drawn from the Research Development of UBT. The ET has no information about making the evaluation results public.

4.3.9. The Teaching and Learning Strategy focuses on outcomes of the QA system. Individual Professional Development Plan is implemented for teaching methods, research abilities and technical skills Quality of teaching strategies and learning materials is supervised on Faculty level, generally the Deans are in charge for the enhancement of those areas. Since Faculties cover mainly one discipline of study program on BA and MA level, the competence of the Dean, program leaders and staff secures the implementation of new strategies and methods.

4.3.10. Not applicable according to lower age of staff and private status of UBT College.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Accessible database for academic staff's scientific and artistic achievements would make the HEIs performance transparent and could contribute to their overall recognition as well. A database on national level would be even more useful for the regular evaluation of Kosovo institutions.*
- B. *Dedicate finances for professional development of the staff, especially for academic career.*

#### **4.4. Educational process content**

4.4.1. Integrated Design BA program consisting four study concentrations: Graphic Design, Fashion Design, Product Design, and Interior Design. The core philosophy of the program is the interdisciplinary nature between these relevant fields of applied art, where students benefit from the synergy of different ideas, coming from exposure of design. The practice oriented attitude of the staff ensures students' personal development and the labor market's needs at the same time.

4.4.2. The core subjects are practice oriented and conducted in small groups in a laboratory/atelier-like infrastructure. The program syllabus provides detailed information about the content and helps students to organize their individual working plan for each semester. The study program integrates professional competences in the main subjects of the four concentrations, meanwhile general knowledge is transferred through common courses for all design students. This way individual components of the concentrations can achieve an ideal specification of the studies, but ensure an overall applicable teaching method at the same time.

4.4.3. Several – more than seven – learning outcomes are defined in the SER for the Integrate Design BA program, considered as strengths of the education. The learning outcomes shall be formulated in a more general manner, because the subdivision of the competences among the subjects allows it.

4.4.4. The syllabus is unified by the Faculty Council for all subjects. Objectives, outcomes, lecture /seminar ratio method, ECTS, assessment, requirements and literature are defined for all subjects in electronic form.

4.4.5. Not applicable.

4.4.6. The Dean delivers an introduction at the beginning of the academic year, providing all necessary preliminary information for the students. The Students' Handbook states all introduction information in written form.

4.4.7. UBT College adopted an overarching didactic concept, the Competency Based Approach in curriculum to develop teaching methods across all study programs offering possibilities for active learning, include case-studies, project work, problem-based learning and simulated learning. Site visits in museums, galleries and fashion shows are important features of applied art education.

4.4.8. The assessment of performance is regulated in the Students' Rulebook, assessing coursework during and at the end of the semester. The Faculty Council regulates the mode of the exam, but the content is determined by the Subject Leader in charge. The method and frequency of assessment is clearly communicated to the students in the course syllabus and during the oral introduction of the subject.

4.4.9. The Integrated Design BA program has reference from the last three years conducting successful in Pristina. The administration of students' performance and its assessment is secured through the Student Management Information System (SMIS). Colloquium documents and portfolios are kept for three years. The work required for different grades is

defined and consistent, it is comparable with other HEIs' regulations. Assessment records and grades can be appealed at the Appeals Committee, its decision is final and can't be changed.

4.4.10. The students who are identified to be in risk of non-completion are monitored upon their performance. Learning style inventory and in case of a need the mentor program helps individually. Effective pedagogical skills are trained at IDEAA Institute to provide staff with service oriented and integrated teaching methods.

4.4.11. The program is divided in four concentrations, but there is a general part of the applied art education for all students from the beginning. ECTS reflect the workload required by the courses which make out 30 credits per semester. Students are awarded by credits if they fulfil all requirements, they can step to the next concentration-related semester, if they completed the previous semester course.

4.4.12. UBT's Industry Board consists of representatives of various entities, who are involved in education with guest lectures and helping students with their Capstone/Thesis in form of creative industry-related, research-based project work.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant.

#### **ET recommendations:**

- A. *Learning outcomes shall be formulated in a more general manner, the subdivision of the competences among the subjects allows a coherent description of the aim of the four concentrations too.*
- B. *If Integrated Design BA is launched in different location, concentration(s) adequate for the local circumstances shall be emphasised later.*

#### **4.5. Students**

The ET hasn't met students of Integrated Design BA, since the program doesn't exist in Prizren yet, comments are based on the SER description on student issues.

4.5.1. According to the law, students with graduate degrees from relevant specialized secondary schools can be admitted. UBT considers the right to study as a basic human right, and as a private institution it is its interest to attract more students, the College welcomes all interested applicants to study in the field of design on Bachelor level. At the same time UBT is dedicated to enhance the quality of its education, applicants have to undergo an admission test including motivation interview and portfolio of artwork of the candidates to select.

4.5.2. Students' admission is regulated by the national authorities MEST and KAA, that is respected by the Regulation of Admission of UBT College in case of the applied art programs too.

4.5.3. The indicated number of 100 students to admit in Prizren requires to split them into smaller study group of 15 to 20 students for hand-on practice oriented and integrated learning atmosphere.

4.5.4. SMIS provides results of assessments promptly and is accompanied by a system for assistance. Monitoring is set to identify students at risk, a mentor program is established to

help students in need of assistance from the staff. Tutorials are in charge to assist fellow-students with services.

4.5.5. SMIS provides results of assessments promptly throughout the whole study cycle including assessments, colloquium scores and final exam scores grades.

4.5.6. The disability support provides help for students with learning difficulties and with illness or injury. Multiply examination opportunity helps students to make up missed courses.

4.5.7. Students' records are collected on Faculty level, Examination Log is kept in the SMIS. UBT aims to reduce the drop-out rate radically.

4.5.8. The Code of Ethics and Student Conduct regulates standards of behavior during education, examination and written assignments. The Faculty Sub-Committee on Ethics has been tasked to promote ethical behavior. The Student Handbook also includes advice and guidelines for ethical behavior. The Faculty operates the plagiarism detection software Turnitin to detect potential violations.

4.5.9. Students' rights and obligations are introduced by the Dean in a session every academic year. The Students' Handbook contains all relevant information in written form, that is handed over for all students. Regulations are available on the homepage of UBT.

4.5.10. Free transfer of ECTS and students is a basic achievement of the European Higher Education Area, which Kosovo doesn't belong yet, but takes it in consideration in its regulations. The process of students' transfer is determined by MEST and followed during the procedure at the HEIs. The Transfers' Commission reviews the submitted applications of the students.

4.5.11. The Student Support Officer is in charge to handle administrative issues including consultation, mentoring and tutoring. There is a three phases system to offering counselling and support to students: briefings during the registration process, weekly meetings with tutors, individual consultations on concentrations.

Compliance level: Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

*A. No recommendations.*

**4.6. Research**

4.6.1. The Integrated Design BA program doesn't aim to provide scientific work, meanwhile field study, interviews, database analysis and researched based design are part of the study method. The practice of applied art in the creative industry is R+D focused, students of design must be aware of the importance of innovation and its impact on the economy and their own career. Members of the staff are dealing with research based design and are successful in their artistic field. With their assistance UBT can set up research groups or centres of excellence by cooperating with economic entities.

4.6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are specified and is respected by the annual evaluation of the staff performance. The outcome of scientific/artistic work per year is registered and required by the Faculty. UBT allocates funds for professional activities and supports academic achievements of the staff. Many of the staff members cooperate with prestigious international art schools in applied art projects considered equal to scientific work. Artists with a degree (PhD, DLA) are promoted at UBT, fulfilling the accreditation criteria becoming program leaders.

4.6.3. Recognised research outcomes are defined by UBT, that are consistent with international standards: articles in indexed journals, conference papers, proceedings, books, art exhibitions, fashion shows, design fairs.

4.6.4. The academic staff has a wide range of artistic record measurable with scientific achievements, since many of them have international experience not only as acting artists but as academics as well.

4.6.5. The scientific activities at UBT are demonstrated by the Annual International Conference inviting all fields of applied science and art conducted by UBT. Staff members are expected to lecture about their artwork during the conference. More relevant to peer reviewed scientific and artistic work are the international appearances of the staff members on independent forum such as group exhibitions, biennales and fairs.

4.6.6. UBT as private HEI is active of organising scientific events, like the Annual International Conference. October 2018 the first Integrated Design conference took place with participants from seven countries. Participation of staff on international events abroad is seriously impacted by the strict visa regulations against Kosovo natives.

4.6.7. UBT tracks the publications of its staff through the Knowledge Centre. According to list of the SER most of the staff members of the Integrated Design BA fulfil the requirement to publish /produce at least one scientific/art result per year for the past three years. The consequent and continuous publication of the staff can ensure the development of the study programs in applied arts.

4.6.8. UBT requires FT academic staff to publish under the name of UBT. Academics have their own Google Scholar and ORCID accounts for the visibility of their tracks.

4.6.9. Protection of intellectual property is stated at the Code of Ethics, but no evidence for commercialization of ideas was detected. The Integrated Design program goes back only three years, considering the developing economy in Kosovo, growth of the creative industry is expected, parallel can R+D activity strengthen in academia.

4.6.10. All thought described in the SER that Integrated Design BA program activities in Pristina include various research activities, despite of the artistic work of the staff, it can't be acknowledged as research. Further resources of all kind are needed to make an impact through R+D to the economy and society in Kosovo. UBT is on the right track with its study portfolio concentrating on business and technology, since these fields are expected to drive global economic growth in an ecologically sustainable way.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *More international appearance of the staff can result in artistic/scientific visibility.*
- B. *Academic promotion on a regular basis and frequency can emphasise staff to achievements.*
- C. *Fund raising through local business entities and participation in international projects can contribute to the academic acknowledgement of UBT as applied sciences university.*
- D. *Establish flagship R+D projects with dedicated staff in charge and acknowledge their work equal to teaching activity.*

**4.7. Infrastructure and resources**

4.7.1. UBT has well equipped campus in Ferizaj hosting the Integrated Design BA with labs and studios for the concentrations. Facilities of the concentrations are already there, according to the intended high number of applicants, study groups of 15 to 20 students can use the facilities at the same time, which is manageable. The staff responsible for the study program are partly from Ferizaj, some of the staff members will have teaching obligations both in Pristina and Ferizaj which can result in high working load.

4.7.2. The Faculty recently operating Industrial Design BA in Pristina allocates a three-year budget of the Ferizaj campus based on the income of the students' fees, which is reliable if the expectation of the high application numbers are being met.

4.7.3. The Ferizaj campus offers approximately 1000 square meters of facilities with a capacity of 300 students. The property is owned by the HEI and can be extended on the neighboring site.

4.7.5. The number of seats in the lecture rooms and laboratories are related to the expected groups' size. Specialized tools for the design concentrations are there, IT equipment is installed in the labs.

4.7.6. The library of all campuses at UBT must be improved, though design related books were bought recently, the quantity and the range of printed literature is still not satisfactory. Most of the books related to design are international publications not older than 5 years. The Ferizaj campus offers some specific group work space outside of library, but those areas shall be better equipped for the needs of the students.

4.7.7. The facility in Ferizaj is not fully accessible for students and staff with disabilities.

**ET recommendations:**

- A. Improve the quality of the library by quantity of art and design related literature and magazines.
- B. Provide well equipped space for students' independent work.
- C. Support students' and staff's needs with disabilities.

**OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET**

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Integrated Design BA offered by UBT College at its campus in Ferizaj is Substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 100 students to be enrolled in the program.

Expert: Prof. Dr. Balint Bachmann, June 2019

## 5. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – BSc AGRICULTURE AND ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING

### INTRODUCTION

#### Context

Date of site visit: 14.05.2019

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. Reiner Doluschitz
- Prof. Dr. Joachim Müller

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Arianit Krasniqi
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu

Sources of information for the Report:

- Self Evaluation Report (SER) of the UBT
- Site visit at UBT on 14.05.2019

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- Standards of KAA
- Standards and performance indicators for accreditation of MSc study programs

Compliance level CL Single Grade Final Grade

Fully compliant 3 =3

Substantially compliant 2  $\geq 2$

Partially compliant 1  $\geq 1$

Non-compliant 0  $< 1$

Not applicable n.a.

Most Standards focus on institutional issues, and hence will apply equally to both study programs being evaluated. Accordingly, many text passages in the SER of the two study programs are widely the same. Therefore, the reports of the ET differ only in Standards of Chapter 2.3, 2.4 and 2.6, where specific comments are provided for the three programs individually.

#### Abbreviations

DLS	Department of Life Sciences
EHEA	European Higher Education Area
ET	Expert team
HEI	Higher Education Institutions
KAA	Kosovo Accreditation Agency
KAA18	KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018
SER	Self-evaluation report
SMIS	Student Management Information System
SWOT	Strength, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats
UBT	University of Business and Technology

Site visit schedule

13.00 – 13.30	Meeting with the management of the Faculty
13.30 – 15.00	Meeting with the head of the study programme
14.40 – 15.15	Meeting with quality assurance representatives
15.20 – 16.10	Meeting with teaching staff
16.10 – 17.00	Meeting with stakeholders
17.00 – 17.40	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure

A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation  
 UBT College was licensed to operate as a private bearer of higher education by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology with effect from 18.10.2004. UBT has 19 Faculties, whereof the Department of Life Science (DLS) is proposing the study program under evaluation. UBT shows a steadily growing number of annual student intakes which was 3416 in the year 2018. Current total number of students in Agriculture is 323. The Department of Food Technology and Biotechnology started in 2015, comprising Laboratory for Microbiology, Laboratory for Biochemistry, Laboratory for Physico-chemical analysis and Laboratory for Instrumental Analysis. The proposed BSc-study program “Agricultural and Environmental Engineering” comprises 180 ECTS over six semesters for 300 (3x100) students.

### 5.1. Mission, objectives and administration

Standard 1.1. (CL 3) The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.

Yes, the mission of the Study Program is in compliance with the one at University level. Both are aiming on contributing, in society, through contemporary programs of higher education. The different programs show a “Built in compatibility with other contemporary curricula, ...”. It has been mentioned in the discussion with the management of the faculty (FST) that the technology-orientation is an additional binding element between different study programs at UBT. Therefore, according to the SER and referring to the statements in the site visit the ET can confirm and agrees that UBT and its FST are important national factors.

Standard 1.2. (CL 3) Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

Particularly from the discussions with the academic staff and with graduates and employers it could be learned during the site visit that there is academic and professional advice included in the definition of learning outcomes. The SER also indicates that development of the University and its study programs are consistent with the National Qualifications Network and the Framework for Qualifications of the EHEA.

Standard 1.3. (CL 2) The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.

The question cannot sufficiently be answered since such a concept is not particularly and detailed mentioned in the SER and also did not become completely clear in the discussions with the management of the institution, the academic staff and the students. However, elements of such an overarching concept are visible and include a knowledge center, an

annually joint scientific conference with participation and contributions of all UBT-Faculties as well as an UBT-wide uniform learning platform (Moodle), open for all members of the University. There is also a common platform for exams (SMIS) and a common central library. In addition, there are common study methods and E-learning elements mentioned in the SER.

Standard 1.4. (CL 3) There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

The SER does contain references to policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. The ET trusts that such regulations are followed at UBT, because from the SER it becomes not completely clear to what extent these regulations become applied.

Standard 1.5. (CL n.a.) All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.

The documents provided, particularly the SER refers to this subject. The ET assumes that the regulations and issues mentioned there are operational. However, the ET does not see itself in a position to assess the ethical conduct of all staff and students. However, the ET trusts that staff and students comply with such regulations.

Standard 1.6. (CL 3) All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.

Yes, the SER refers to this issue on p. 67 ff. The ET assumes that these regulations mentioned there are applied. In addition, there are compulsory accreditation and re-accreditation procedures established and regularly conducted by KAA on a regular basis. International experts from the respective fields of the study programs are necessarily a backbone-component of such procedures.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.8)

**ET recommendations:**

A. *None.*

## **5.2. Quality management**

Standard 2.1. (CL 3) All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.

The ET has met only a limited part of the staff in the interviews and cannot comment on “all” staff. Interviewed staff members showed ability for self-reflection and self-evaluation. The ET trusts that the staff will follow the reporting and improvement processes of the UBT, once the program will be operational.

Standard 2.2. (CL 3) Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.

Evaluation and improvement processes are integral part of the quality management of UBT as comprehensively described in the SER.

Standard 2.3. (CL 3) Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.

The “Institution’s body-Quality assurance” is involved in all steps of the design of study programs.

Standard 2.4. (CL n.a.) Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

Learning outcomes will be evaluated on course level by assessment, which includes “tracking lectures, seminar work, individual/ team presentation, final exam”. Further quality parameters of the study program such as enrolment number, completion rate, and grade overview are not available because the study program is not yet operational.

Standard 2.5. (CL n.a.) Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.

The ET trusts that the quality management of UBT is adequate to ensure that standards are met and an improvement in performance is stimulated. However, “continuing improvement in performance” cannot be judged by the ET team, because time series of quantitative quality parameters are not available.

Standard 2.6. (CL n.a.) Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.

Standardized surveys of students, graduates and employers are described in the SER and were mentioned during the site visit. According the opinion of the ET, such survey data of students, graduates and employers should be only communicated to the respective persons and should not being made “publicly available” as requested in Standard 2.6.

Standard 2.7. (CL 3) Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.

The ET trusts that results of the internal quality assurance system are used by the quality management of UBT to further develop the study program. Work load is documented in the SER and appears to be adequate. Results of course evaluation, academic success and employment of graduates are not available as the program is not yet operational.

Standard 2.8. (CL 3) The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (e.g. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.

The quality management of UBT is preparing annual reports. Furthermore, the system of reaccreditation will ask for such a report, once the program will be established. Examples of SWOT analyses were provided in the SER.

Standard 2.9. (CL 3) The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.

The ET trusts that the quality management of UBT is supervising, evaluating and improving the internal quality assurance system.

Compliance level: Fully compliant (CL 3.0)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *Quantitative performance parameters such as number of applicants, number of students enrolled, completion rate, grade overview should be provided when the program is operational*

**5.3. Academic staff**

Standard 3.1. (CL 3) Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

As it is written in the SER (p.122 f.) position descriptions and conditions of employment are available and become provided to candidates. They have not made available to the ET. However, the ET trusts that such documents of employment are provided to candidates by UP.

A list of the academic staff, including CV with all the information mentioned above has been provided to the ET.

Standard 3.2. (CL n.a.) The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.

The ET trusts that academic staff does comply with legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation. The ET does not see itself in a position to check this standard and does not regard this as its task either.

Standard 3.3. (CL n.a.) Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.

The academic staff having been present during the site visit fulfills this requirement. However, the ET does not see itself in a position to check, whether this is true for the entire academic staff according to this standard and does not regard this as its task either.

Standard 3.4. (CL 3) At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.

As reported and confirmed by the management of FST during the site visit, this requirement is fulfilled.

Standard 3.5. (CL 3) For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.

According to the information provided during the site visit this requirement is fulfilled. A substantial number of permanent teaching staff is available at the faculty and in addition part-time staff and teaching assistants are engaged temporarily. As it has been reported during the on-site visit the FST-faculty employs 50 Professors, of which 70% are full time. In addition there are teaching assistants available at the Faculty.

Standard 3.6. (CL 2) Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.

There was no formal procedure reported during the site visit. However, as it has been reported there are training opportunities at UBT-level for staff as well as for students. The academic staff taking part in the discussion reported about respective courses, mostly done during visits abroad and in many cases quite some time ago. Some teaching assistants are professionally engaged in HEIs abroad where they have the opportunity to participate in activities for additional professional development.

Standard 3.7. (CL 3) The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.

According to the information provided during the site visit this requirement is fulfilled. The academic staff taking part in the site visit discussions reported that they offer such kind of consultancy for students on a regular basis.

Standard 3.8. (CL 2) Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.

There is a formal procedure established for academic staff evaluation done by students. This is based on a standardized questionnaire which is filled in anonymously. However, as it has been reported during the site visit the respective results become made available only to the dean who forwards these results to teaching staff only in cases of insufficient performance of respective staff. The ET strongly recommends that this process in future becomes more transparent. The results should always be provided to the respective teaching staff. Staff should reflect on the results of the questionnaire and - even more importantly - to the

comments in the free-text section of the questionnaire. Finally, the actions taken and expected impacts should be reported to the students in a feedback-loop.

Standard 3.9. (CL n.a.) Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.

See Standard 3.8

Standard 3.10. (CL 3) Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.

It has also been discussed during the site visit in detail. Retired teachers are considered as part time professors on a teaching load of 2 hours/week.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.7)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *The ET recommends that the course evaluation by students in future becomes more transparent: the results should always be provided to the respective teacher. Teachers should reflect on the results of the questionnaire, especially to the free-text section. Finally, the actions to be taken and the expected improvements should be discussed with the students.*

**5.4. Educational process content**

Standard 4.1. (CL 3) The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018 especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.

The study program Agriculture and Environment Engineering (BSc) has clearly employment oriented qualification objectives. The study program is designed to offer sufficient opportunity to acquire disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies.

Standard 4.2. (CL 3) The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.

The program is designed according EU Directives 2005/36 and complies with the framework of the EHEA. The ET trusts that this will also cover the National Qualifications Framework.

Standard 4.3. (CL 3) The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.

The courses within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow. The study program is compatible with curricula delivered in the EHEA. Learning outcomes are defined on course level in the syllabus. Overarching learning outputs are implicitly addressed and listed in the SER (p. 639). Furthermore, specific objectives are listed in the categories teaching, research and service.

Standard 4.4. (CL 1) The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.

The individual course descriptions comprise: course objectives, learning outcomes, thematic content, teaching methods, students' assessment system and bibliography. The quality of course descriptions differs among the various courses. It does not appear very convincing that essential fields are filled in copy/paste-mode, e.g. same assessment methods (tracking lectures, seminars, group/individual presentations, final exam) are mentioned for all courses – even for the course “Professional practice”, where where it makes no sense at all.

Standard 4.5. (CL n.a.) If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.

The language of instruction will be Albanian.

Standard 4.6. (CL n.a.) The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.

Since the study program is not yet operational, Standard 4.6 cannot be commented to a full extent. Learning outcomes are described in the syllabus. The ET trusts that the degree of achievement of the learning outcomes will be verified in students' assessments and discussed in individual consultations, when necessary.

Standard 4.7. (CL n.a) Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.

“Different groups of students” are neither defined in the KAA18 nor in the site visit discussions. The ET team trusts that students under special circumstances (illnesses, disabilities, family situation) are treated with appropriate flexibility, see also Standard 5.6.

Standard 4.8. (CL n.a.) Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.

Since the study program is not yet operational, Standard 4.8 cannot be commented to a full extent. The ET trusts that the assessments are communicated at the beginning of the course and are conducted fairly and objectively during and at the end of the course.

Standard 4.9. (CL n.a.) Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.

Since the study program is not yet operational, Standard 4.9 cannot be commented to a full extent. The ET trusts that verification of students will be done properly and comparable to courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at “highly regarded institutions”.

Standard 4.10. (CL n.a.) Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018 inconsistently assessed.

Statutes of UBT are online available. As Standard 4.10 is addressing exceptional situations, the ET does not see itself in a position to check this standard and does not regard this as its task either.

Standard 4.11. (CL 3) If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.

The study program includes an obligatory practice stage called “Professional practice” of 1 month (3 ECTS) in the 6th semester. The practice stage will be supervised by faculty mentors and mentors at the hosting enterprises.

Standard 4.12. (CL 3) In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.

UBT is maintaining contracts with numerous companies and institutions active in the field of the study program.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.4)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. The ET expects that the syllabus will be prepared more carefully, avoiding unreflect copy/paste-style

**5.5. Students**

Standard 5.1. (CL 3) There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.

The admission procedure is comprehensively described in the SER (p. 151 ff). The ET trusts that Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.

Standard 5.2. (CL 3) All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.

The study program is open to all students who meet the legal requirements in Kosovo for the registration in the first academic year of a BSc program (SER p. 663).

Standard 5.3. (CL 2) The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.

The study program is designed for 100 students per cohort. This number is too high for an effective and interactive teaching and learning process. In the third year the program offers three specializations. The resulting distribution of students suggests will lead to a more suitable group size.

Standard 5.4. (CL 3) Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.

A Student Handbook provides information on assessment specifications, the assessment regulations, available student supports, code of conduct, student complaint and disciplinary procedures and deferral information (SER p. 154)

Standard 5.5. (CL 3) The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

Students' academic records are kept via an electronic platform called "Student Management Information System (SMIS)".

Standard 5.6. (CL 3) Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.

UBT disability support provides support for students with disabilities and to assist the achievement of educational goals. UBT infrastructure has been certified as meeting the minimum standards for special needs students (SER p. 171).

Standard 5.7. (CL 3) Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.

UBT maintains various student records: examination register, application, list of students taking the examination in the given examination period, examination report, students logbook, student files containing information on students' re-examination activities and final grades. The Examination Log and applications are administered using the SMIS (SER p. 151).

Standard 5.8. (CL 0) Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.

In some other program descriptions of UBT it is stated, that the plagiarism detection software Turnitin will be used to detect potential violations. This reference is missing for the program under evaluation.

Standard 5.9. (CL 3) Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.

The procedure how to communicate and enforce students' rights and obligations is comprehensively described in the SER (p. 154).

Standard 5.10. (CL 0) The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.

In contrast to some other programs of UBT, regulations about students' transfer is not described for the program under evaluation.

Standard 5.11. (CL 3) Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.

The UBT system offers counselling and support to students during all phases of their study (SER p. 159).

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.4)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *The ET recommends that plagiarism detection software will be used*
- B. *The ET recommends that regulations for students' transfer will be developed*

**5.6. Research**

Standard 6.1. (CL 3) The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.

Specific research objectives for the study program in context to the research strategy of UBT are described in the SER (p. 664 ff). The majority of academic staff interviewed during the site visit expressed interest in research and they are aware of the linkage between research and the highly requested higher level scientific publications. Stakeholder involvement in developing topics for research are planned for the future as it has been reported in the site visit discussions.

Standard 6.2. (CL 3) Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.

Expectations for teaching staff in terms of research are clearly specified and communicated. Research performance is part of the end-year-review (SER p. 92).

Standard 6.3. (CL 3) Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.

UPT is applying international standards for defining the quality of research output (SER p. 89 ff).

Standard 6.4. (CL 1) The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.

Publication lists of the teaching staff have been provided as an annex of the SER. However, those lists are prepared in a chaotic way. The ET recommends that publication lists are provided in a standard format as it is customary in international scientific journals. The publications should be grouped in categories “refereed journal articles”, “other journal articles” and “conference proceedings”. Also the number of publications and h-index of a scientific database like SCOPUS should be presented for each member of the teaching staff, as shown in the sample below. The ET does not see it as its task to retrieve this data for the entire teaching staff, but expects a well prepared documentation.

Name	Topics	Publications	h-index	
Smajl Rizani	Water quality	0	0	
Ismet Babaj	Vegetable	9	2	
Medin Zeqiri	Dairy	0	0	
Shkelzim Ukaj	Heavy metals	6	1	
Besa Veseli	Pollution	0	0	

SCOPUS, accessed 29.05.2019

Data has been retrieved by the ET for responsible teaching staff. Generally, track record of research is low for the responsible scientists. The topics are only fitting partly to the study program.

Standard 6.5. (CL n.a.) The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.

The publication activity is already addressed in Standard 6.4.

Standard 6.6. (CL n.a.) Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.

To the opinion of the ET, this standard does not apply to the study program, but to the institution.

Standard 6.7. (CL 3) Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.

This requirement is fulfilled by the members of the teaching staff. Unfortunately, Standard 6.7 is not addressing the expected quality of publications. To the opinion of the ET, at least one publication per year in an international peer reviewed journal should be required. The ET recommends that a table is prepared where the number of “refereed journal articles”, “other journal articles” and “conference proceedings” is listed for all members of the teaching staff, divided into groups of “full time” and “part time”.

Standard 6.8. (CL 3) Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full time staff.

The ET trusts that academic and research staff is publishing under the name of UBT. Random sampling has been positive.

Standard 6.9. (CL 3) Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.

Based on the impression from the site visit, the ET trusts that the teaching staff is integrating own research outcomes into teaching.

Standard 6.10. (CL 3) Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.

The UBT Technology Transfer Centre (TTC) supports staff and students of UBT with protecting intellectual property (SER p. 96)

Standard 6.11. (CL 3) Students are engaged in research projects and other activities. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

The curriculum of the study program contains a BSc-thesis with 10 ECTS credits in the 6th semester. During the site visit the stakeholders of the labour market confirmed, that BSc-theses can be performed in joint research projects with companies and other organisations.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.8)

#### **ET recommendations:**

- A. *The ET recommends that a table is prepared where the number of “refereed journal articles”, “other journal articles” and “conference proceedings” is listed for all members of the teaching staff, divided into groups of “full time” and “part time”.*
- B. *The ET recommends that the research activities of the involved teaching staff will be increased.*

## **5.7. Infrastructure and resources**

Standard 7.1. (CL 3) The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.

UBT has new buildings, lecture halls and laboratories in good quality, adequate to implement the study program.

Standard 7.2. (CL 0) There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.

A kind of financial plan is presented in the SER (p. 644). However, the tables have been prepared carelessly and are based on only two study years for a 3-years program. The ET can't take this plan seriously.

Standard 7.3. (CL 3) The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:

a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;

Lecture halls, seminar rooms and laboratories are available. The ET does not see it as its task to verify the relevant documents.

b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;  
KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

Laboratories of UBT are well-equipped for experimental work.

c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence;

Software and databases are available. The ET does not see it as its task to verify the user licenses.

d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.

A well-equipped library is available, see also Standard 7.5.

Standard 7.4. (CL 3) The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.

The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories are sufficient.

Standard 7.5. (CL n.a.) The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:

- a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;
- b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;
- c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;
- d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;
- e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.

The time scheduled for the site visit did not allow to verify the specific requirements of this standard. Furthermore, the ET does not see it as its task to verify the quality of the library according to the listed in-depth criteria. This would be a task for librarians.

Standard 7.6. (n.a.) The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.

“Special needs” are not defined in the standard. Concerning disabled students, UBT offering special support.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.3)

**ET recommendations:**

A. *None.*

**OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET**

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program “Agriculture and Environment Engineering (BSc)” offered by UBT Prishtina is substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 300 (3x100) students to be enrolled in the program.

Expert Team: Prof. Dr. Reiner Doluschitz  
Prof. Dr. Joachim Müller

28.05.201  
28.05.2019

## 6. PROGRAMME EVALUATION – MSc FOOD SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

### INTRODUCTION

#### Context

Date of site visit: 14.05.2019

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. Reiner Doluschitz
- Prof. Dr. Joachim Müller

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Arianit Krasniqi
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu

Sources of information for the Report:

- Self Evaluation Report (SER) of the UBT
- Site visit at UBT on 14.05.2019

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- Standards of KAA
- Standards and performance indicators for accreditation of MSc study programs

Compliance level CL Single Grade Final Grade

Fully compliant	3	=3	
Substantially compliant	2	≥2	
Partially compliant	1	≥1	
Non-compliant	0	<1	

Not applicable n.a.

Most Standards focus on institutional issues, and hence apply equally to both study programs being evaluated. Accordingly, many text passages in the SER of the two study programs are widely the same. Therefore, the reports of the ET differ only in Standards of Chapter 2.3, 2.4 and 2.6, where specific comments are provided for the three programs individually.

#### Abbreviations

EHEA	European Higher Education Area
ET	Expert team
FST	Faculty of Food Science and Technology
HEI	Higher Education Institutions
KAA	Kosovo Accreditation Agency
KAA18	KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018
SER	Self-evaluation report
SMIS	Student Management Information System
SWOT	Strength, Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats
UBT	University of Business and Technology

#### Site visit schedule

13.00 –13.30	Meeting with the management of the faculty (FST)
13.30 – 15.00	Meeting with the head of the study programme

14.40 – 15.15	Meeting with quality assurance representatives
15.20 – 16.10	Meeting with teaching staff
16.10 – 17.00	Meeting with stakeholders
17.00 – 17.40	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure

A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

UBT College was licensed to operate as a private bearer of higher education by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology with effect from 18.10.2004. UBT has 19 Faculties, whereof the Faculty of Food Science and Technology (FST) is proposing the study program under evaluation. UBT shows a steadily growing number of annual student intakes which was 3416 in the year 2018. Current total number of students in Agriculture is 323. Department of Food Technology and Biotechnology started in 2015, comprising Laboratory for Microbiology, Laboratory for Biochemistry, Laboratory for Physico-chemical analysis and Laboratory for Instrumental Analysis. The proposed MSc-study program “Food Science and Technology” comprises 120 ECTS over four semesters for 100 students.

### **6.1. Mission, objectives and administration**

Standard 1.1. (CL 3) The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.

Yes, the mission of the Study Program is in compliance with the one at University level. Both are aiming on contributing, in society, through contemporary programs of higher education. The different programs show a “Built in compatibility with other contemporary curricula, ...”. It has been mentioned in the discussion with the management of the faculty (FST) that the technology-orientation is an additional binding element between different study programs at UBT. Therefore, according to the SER and referring to the statements in the site visit the ET can confirm and agrees that UBT and its FST are important national factors.

Standard 1.2. (CL 3) Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

Particularly from the discussions with the academic staff and with graduates and employers it could be learned during the site visit that there is academic and professional advice included in the definition of learning outcomes. The SER also indicates that development of the University and its study programs are consistent with the National Qualifications Network and the Framework for Qualifications of the EHEA.

Standard 1.3. (CL 2) The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.

The question cannot sufficiently be answered since such a concept is not particularly and detailed mentioned in the SER and also did not become completely clear in the discussions with the management of the institution, the academic staff and the students. However, elements of such an overarching concept are visible and include a knowledge center, an annually joint scientific conference with participation and contributions of all UBT-Faculties as well as an UBT-wide uniform learning platform (Moodle), open for all members of the University. There

is also a common platform for exams (SMIS) and a common central library. In addition, there are common study methods and E-learning elements mentioned in the SER.

Standard 1.4. (CL 3) There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

The SER does contain references to policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. The ET trusts that such regulations are followed at UBT, because from the SER it becomes not completely clear to what extent these regulations become applied.

Standard 1.5. (CL n.a.) All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.

The documents provided, particularly the SER refers to this subject on p. 681. The ET assumes that the regulations and issues mentioned there are operational. However, the ET does not see itself in a position to assess the ethical conduct of all staff and students. However, the ET trusts that staff and students comply with such regulations.

Standard 1.6. (CL 3) All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.

Yes, the SER refers to this issue on p. 67 ff. The ET assumes that these regulations mentioned there are applied. In addition, there are compulsory accreditation and re-accreditation procedures established and regularly conducted by KAA on a regular basis. International experts from the respective fields of the study programs are necessarily a backbone-component of such procedures.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.8)

**ET recommendations:**

A. None.

## **6.2. Quality management**

Standard 2.1. (CL 3) All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.

The ET has met only a limited part of the staff in the interviews and cannot comment on “all” staff. Interviewed staff members showed ability for self-reflection and self-evaluation. The ET trusts that the staff will follow the reporting and improvement processes of the UBT, once the program will be operational.

Standard 2.2. (CL 3) Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.

Evaluation and improvement processes are integral part of the quality management of UBT as described in the SER (p. 685 ff).

Standard 2.3. (CL 3) Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.

The “Institution’s body-Quality assurance” is involved in all steps of the design of study programs.

Standard 2.4. (CL n.a.) Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

Learning outcomes will be evaluated on course level by assessment, which includes “tracking lectures, seminar work, individual/ team presentation, final exam”. Further quality parameters of the study program such as enrolment number, completion rate, and grade overview are not available because the study program is not yet operational.

Standard 2.5. (CL n.a.) Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.

The ET trusts that the quality management of UBT is adequate to ensure that standards are met and an improvement in performance is stimulated. However, “continuing improvement in performance” cannot be judged by the ET team, because time series of quantitative quality parameters are not available.

Standard 2.6. (CL n.a.) Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.

Standardized surveys of students, graduates and employers are described in the SER and were mentioned during the site visit. According the opinion of the ET, such survey data of students, graduates and employers should be only communicated to the respective persons and should not being made “publicly available” as requested in Standard 2.6.

Standard 2.7. (CL 3) Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.

The ET trusts that results of the internal quality assurance system are used by the quality management of UBT to further develop the study program. Work load is documented in the SER and appears to be adequate. Results of course evaluation, academic success and employment of graduates are not available as the program is not yet operational.

Standard 2.8. (CL 3) The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (e.g. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.

The quality management of UBT is preparing annual reports. Furthermore, the system of reaccreditation will ask for such a report, once the program will be established. Examples of SWOT analyses were provided in the SER.

Standard 2.9. (CL 3) The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.

The ET trusts that the quality management of UBT is supervising, evaluating and improving the internal quality assurance system.

Compliance level: Fully compliant (CL 3.0)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. Quantitative performance parameters such as number of applicants, number of students enrolled, completion rate, grade overview should be provided when the program is operational

**6.3. Academic staff**

Standard 3.1. (CL 3) Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

As it is written in the SER (p.122 f.) position descriptions and conditions of employment are available and become provided to candidates. They have not made available to the ET. However, the ET trusts that such documents of employment are provided to candidates by UP. A list of the academic staff, including CV with all the information mentioned above has been provided to the ET.

Standard 3.2. (CL n.a.) The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.

The ET trusts that academic staff does comply with legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation. The ET does not see itself in a position to check this standard and does not regard this as its task either.

Standard 3.3. (CL n.a.) Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.

The academic staff having been present during the site visit fulfills this requirement. However, the ET does not see itself in a position to check, whether this is true for the entire academic staff according to this standard and does not regard this as its task either.

Standard 3.4. (CL 3) At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.

As reported and confirmed by the management of FST during the site visit, this requirement is fulfilled.

Standard 3.5. (CL 3) For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.

According to the information provided during the site visit this requirement is fulfilled. A substantial number of permanent teaching staff is available at the faculty and in addition part-time staff and teaching assistants are engaged temporarily. As it has been reported during the on-site visit the FST-faculty employs 50 Professors, of which 70% are full time. In addition there are teaching assistants available at the Faculty.

Standard 3.6. (CL 2) Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.

There was no formal procedure reported during the site visit. However, as it has been reported there are training opportunities at UBT-level for staff as well as for students. The academic staff taking part in the discussion reported about respective courses, mostly done during visits abroad and in many cases quite some time ago. Some teaching assistants are professionally engaged in HEIs abroad where they have the opportunity to participate in activities for additional professional development.

Standard 3.7. (CL 3) The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.

According to the information provided during the site visit this requirement is fulfilled. The academic staff taking part in the site visit discussions reported that they offer such kind of consultancy for students on a regular basis.

Standard 3.8. (CL 2) Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.

There is a formal procedure established for academic staff evaluation done by students. This is based on a standardized questionnaire which is filled in anonymously. However, as it has been reported during the site visit the respective results become made available only to the dean who forwards these results to teaching staff only in cases of insufficient performance of respective staff. The ET strongly recommends that this process in future becomes more transparent. The results should always be provided to the respective teaching staff. Staff should reflect on the results of the questionnaire and - even more importantly - to the comments in the free-text section of the questionnaire. Finally, the actions taken and expected impacts should be reported to the students in a feedback-loop.

Standard 3.9. (CL n.a.) Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.

See Standard 3.8

Standard 3.10. (CL 3) Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.

It has also been discussed during the site visit in detail. Retired teachers are considered as part time professors on a teaching load of 2 hours/week.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.7)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *The ET recommends that the course evaluation by students in future becomes more transparent: the results should always be provided to the respective teacher. Teachers should reflect on the results of the questionnaire, especially to the free-text section. Finally, the actions to be taken and the expected improvements should be discussed with the students.*

**6.4. Educational process content**

Standard 4.1. (CL 3) The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018 especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.

The study program Food Science and Technology (MSc) has clearly employment oriented qualification objectives. The study program is designed to offer sufficient opportunity to acquire disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies.

Standard 4.2. (CL 3) The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.

The program is designed according EU Directives 2005/36 and complies with the framework of the EHEA. The ET trusts that this will also cover the National Qualifications Framework.

Standard 4.3. (CL 3) The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.

The courses within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow. The study program is compatible with curricula delivered in the EHEA. Learning outcomes are defined on course level in the syllabus. Overarching learning outputs are implicitly addressed and listed in the SER (p. 677). Furthermore, specific objectives are listed in the categories teaching, research and service.

Standard 4.4. (CL 1) The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.

The individual course descriptions comprise: course objectives, learning outcomes, thematic content, teaching methods, students' assessment system and bibliography. The quality of course descriptions differs among the various courses. It does not appear very convincing that essential fields are filled in copy/paste-mode, e.g. same list of teaching methods and assessment methods is used for all courses.

Standard 4.5. (CL 2) If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.

The ET recommends that the language of instruction should be English. English proficiency of the students during the discussion has been good. In contrast, translation has been partly required by discussions with the teaching staff. During the site visit, the FST management confirmed that members of the teaching staff have to complete a TOEFL test.

Standard 4.6. (CL n.a.) The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.

Since the study program is not yet operational, Standard 4.6 cannot be commented to a full extent. Learning outcomes are described in the syllabus. The ET trusts that the degree of achievement of the learning outcomes will be verified in students' assessments and discussed in individual consultations, when necessary.

Standard 4.7. (CL n.a) Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.

"Different groups of students" are neither defined in the KAA18 nor in the site visit discussions. The ET team trusts that students under special circumstances (illnesses, disabilities, family situation) are treated with appropriate flexibility, see also Standard 5.6.

Standard 4.8. (CL n.a.) Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.

Since the study program is not yet operational, Standard 4.8 cannot be commented to a full extent. The ET trusts that the assessments are communicated at the beginning of the course and are conducted fairly and objectively during and at the end of the course.

Standard 4.9. (CL n.a.) Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.

Since the study program is not yet operational, Standard 4.9 cannot be commented to a full extent. The ET trusts that verification of students will be done properly and comparable to courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at “highly regarded institutions”.

Standard 4.10. (CL n.a.) Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018 inconsistently assessed.

Statutes of UBT are online available. As Standard 4.10 is addressing exceptional situations, the ET does not see itself in a position to check this standard and does not regard this as its task either.

Standard 4.11. (CL n.a.) If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.

The study program does not include practice stages. As practice stages are included in the BSc program “Food Technology” and as the MSc-thesis will offer opportunities to cooperate with industry and research institutes, the ET trusts that sufficient practical relevance will be provided.

Standard 4.12. (CL n.a.) In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.

The study program does not include practice stages. However, stakeholders mentioned during the site visit discussions that they are willing to cooperate with students and teaching staff of the proposed study program.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.4)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *The ET expects that the syllabus will be prepared more carefully, avoiding unreflect copy/paste-style*
- B. *The ET recommends language training for the teaching staff.*

*C. The ET recommends cooperation with members of the labour market during the MSc-thesis*

## **6.5. Students**

Standard 5.1. (CL 3) There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.

The admission procedure is comprehensively described in the SER (p. 151 ff). The ET trusts that Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.

Standard 5.2. (CL 3) All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.

The study program is open to all students who meet the legal requirements in Kosovo for the registration in the first academic year of a MSc program. Applicants are expected to have a degree in previous studies such as: Food Sciences, Biotechnology, Agriculture Engineer, Agribusiness (SER p. 700).

Standard 5.3. (CL 2) The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.

The study program is designed for 50 students per cohort. This number appears too high for an effective and interactive teaching and learning process in the obligatory courses. In the second year the program offers three specializations. The resulting distribution of students suggests will lead to a more suitable group size.

Standard 5.4. (CL 3) Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.

A Student Handbook provides information on assessment specifications, the assessment regulations, available student supports, code of conduct, student complaint and disciplinary procedures and deferral information (SER p. 154)

Standard 5.5. (CL 3) The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

Students' academic records are kept via an electronic platform called "Student Management Information System (SMIS)".

Standard 5.6. (CL 3) Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.

UBT disability support provides support for students with disabilities and to assist the achievement of educational goals. UBT infrastructure has been certified as meeting the minimum standards for special needs students (SER p. 171).

Standard 5.7. (CL 3) Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.

UBT maintains various student records: examination register, application, list of students taking the examination in the given examination period, examination report, students logbook, student files containing information on students' re-examination activities and final grades. The Examination Log and applications are administered using the SMIS (SER p. 151).

Standard 5.8. (CL 0) Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.

In some other program descriptions of UBT it is stated, that the plagiarism detection software Turnitin will be used to detect potential violations. This reference is missing for the program under evaluation.

Standard 5.9. (CL 3) Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.

The procedure how to communicate and enforce students' rights and obligations is comprehensively described in the SER (p. 154).

Standard 5.10. (CL 0) The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.

In contrast to some other programs of UBT, regulations about students' transfer is not described for the program under evaluation.

Standard 5.11. (CL 3) Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.

The UBT system offers counselling and support to students during all phases of their study (SER p. 159).

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.4)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *The ET recommends that plagiarism detection software will be used.*
- B. *The ET recommends that regulations for students' transfer will be developed*

## **6.6. Research**

Standard 6.1. (CL 3) The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.

Specific research objectives for the study program in context to the research strategy of UBT are comprehensively described in the SER (p. 703 ff). The majority of academic staff interviewed during the site visit expressed interest in research and they are aware of the linkage

between research and the highly requested higher level scientific publications. Stakeholder involvement in developing topics for research are planned for the future as it has been reported in the site visit discussions.

Standard 6.2. (CL 3) Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.

Expectations for teaching staff in terms of research are clearly specified and communicated. Research performance is part of the end-year-review (SER p. 92).

Standard 6.3. (CL 3) Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.

UPT is applying international standards for defining the quality of research output (SER p. 89 ff).

Standard 6.4. (CL 1) The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.

Publication lists of the teaching staff have been provided as an annex of the SER. However, those lists are prepared in a chaotic way. The ET recommends that publication lists are provided in a standard format as it is customary in international scientific journals. The publications should be grouped in categories “refereed journal articles”, “other journal articles” and “conference proceedings”. Also the number of publications and h-index of a scientific database like SCOPUS should be presented for each member of the teaching staff, as shown in the sample below. The ET does not see it as its task to retrieve this data for the entire teaching staff, but expects a well prepared documentation.

Name	Topics	Publications	h-index	
Violeta Lajqi-Makolli	Biofuels, packaging	6	2	
Valon Durguti	Mycotoxins	0	0	
Kastriot Pehlivani	Brewery	3	0	
Ibrahim Mehmeti	Dairy	19	7	

SCOPUS, accessed 29.05.2019

Data has been retrieved by the ET for responsible teaching staff. Track record of research is low for some of the members. The topics are fitting to the study program.

Standard 6.5. (CL n.a.) The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.

The publication activity is already addressed in Standard 6.4.

Standard 6.6. (CL n.a.) Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.

To the opinion of the ET, this standard does not apply to the study program, but to the institution.

Standard 6.7. (CL 3) Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.

This requirement is fulfilled by the members of the teaching staff. Unfortunately, Standard 6.7 is not addressing the expected quality of publications. To the opinion of the ET, at least one publication per year in an international peer reviewed journal should be required. The ET recommends that a table is prepared where the number of “refereed journal articles”, “other journal articles” and “conference proceedings” is listed for all members of the teaching staff, divided into groups of “full time” and “part time”.

Standard 6.8. (CL 3) Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full time staff.

The ET trusts that academic and research staff is publishing under the name of UBT. Random sampling has been positive.

Standard 6.9. (CL 3) Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.

Based on the impression from the site visit, the ET trusts that the teaching staff is integrating own research outcomes into teaching.

Standard 6.10. (CL 3) Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.

The UBT Technology Transfer Centre (TTC) supports staff and students of UBT with protecting intellectual property (SER p. 96)

Standard 6.11. (CL 3) Students are engaged in research projects and other activities. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

The curriculum of the study program contains a MSc-thesis with 30 ECTS credits in the 4th semester. During the site visit the stakeholders of the labour market confirmed, that MSc-theses can be performed in joint research projects with companies and other organisations.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.8)

**ET recommendations:**

- A. *The ET recommends that a table is prepared where the number of “refereed journal articles”, “other journal articles” and “conference proceedings” is listed for all members of the teaching staff, divided into groups of “full time” and “part time”.*
- B. *The ET recommends that the research activities of the involved teaching staff will be increased.*

## 6.7. Infrastructure and resources

Standard 7.1. (CL 3) The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.

UBT has new buildings, lecture halls and laboratories in good quality, adequate to implement the study program.

Standard 7.2. (CL 0) There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.

In contrast to other programs of UBT there is no financial plan presented for the study program under evaluation.

Standard 7.3. (CL 3) The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:

a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;

Lecture halls, seminar rooms and laboratories are available. The ET does not see it as its task to verify the relevant documents.

b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;  
KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

Laboratories of UBT are well-equipped for experimental work.

c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence;

Software and databases are available. The ET does not see it as its task to verify the user licenses.

d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.

A well-equipped library is available, see also Standard 7.5.

Standard 7.4. (CL 3) The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.

The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories are sufficient.

Standard 7.5. (CL n.a.) The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:

- a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;
- b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;
- c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;
- d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;
- e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.

The time scheduled for the site visit did not allow to verify the specific requirements of this standard. Furthermore, the ET does not see it as its task to verify the quality of the library according to the listed in-depth criteria. This would be a task for librarians.

Standard 7.6. (n.a.) The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.

“Special needs” are not defined in the standard. Concerning disabled students, UBT offering special support.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant (CL 2.3)

**ET recommendations:**

A. *None.*

**OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET**

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program “Food Science and Technology (MSc)” offered by UBT Prishtina is substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 100 (2 x 50) students to be enrolled in the program.

<b>Expert Team</b>	Prof. Dr. Reiner Doluschitz	28.05.2019
	Prof. Dr. Joachim Müller	28.05.2019

## 7. FINAL SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

### MA POLITICAL SCIENCE

The MA political Science is **not** recommended for accreditation. However, UBT are strongly encouraged to seriously consider and act on the suggested changes and recommendations and resubmit a revised proposal as there is a proven need for such a programme in Kosovo.

*(Prof. Stephen Adam)*

### BA INTEGRATED DESIGN – PRIZREN

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Integrated Design BA offered by UBT College at its campus in Prizren is Substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 100 students to be enrolled in the program.

*(Prof. Dr. Balint Bachmann)*

### BA INTEGRATED DESIGN – FERIZAJ

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Integrated Design BA offered by UBT College at its campus in Ferizaj is Substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 100 students to be enrolled in the program.

*(Prof. Dr. Balint Bachmann)*

### MSC AGRICULTURAL AND ENVIRONMENT ENGINEERING

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program “Agriculture and Environment Engineering (BSc)” offered by UBT Prishtina is substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 300 (3x100) students to be enrolled in the program.

*(Prof. Dr Reiner Doluschitz and Prof. Dr Jooachim Mueller)*

### MSc FOOD SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program “Food Science and Technology (MSc)” offered by UBT Prishtina is substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 100 (2 x 50) students to be enrolled in the program.

*(Prof. Dr Reiner Doluschitz and Prof. Dr Jooachim Mueller)*