



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

# UNIVERSITY OF PEJA "HAXHI ZEKA" MANAGEMENT IN TOURISM, HOSPITALITY AND ENVIRONMENT /BSc - RE/ACCREDITATION

#### And

# MANAGEMENT OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM /MSc - ACCREDITATION

## REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### DATE, PLACE

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### Contents

TABLE	OF CONTENTS	2
1. IN	TRODUCTION	3
1.1.	Context	3
1.2.	Site visit schedule	4
1.3.	A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	5
2. PR	OGRAM EVALUATION	5
2.1.	Mission, objectives and administration	5
2.2.	Quality management	7
2.3.	Academic staff	8
2.4.	Educational process content	10
2.5.	Students	12
2.6.	Research	13
2.7.	Infrastructure and resources	14
3. OV	ERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	15





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1. Context

This document represents the draft evaluation report about two programmes: *Management in Tourism, Hospitality and Environment /Bsc - (Re-Accreditation)* and *Management of Environment and Tourism (Msc - Accreditation) offered by the* Public University of Peja "Haxhi Zaeka". The Report will be used by the Accreditation Council to decide on the accreditation request made by the institution.

The body of this report is organised to reflect the fact that the two programmes under evaluation are to be assessed separately.

Date of site visit: 10 May, 2019

#### **Expert Team (ET) members:**

- Prof. Dr. Mirjana Pejic Bach
- Prof. Dr. Nevenka Cavlek
- Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino

#### Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Avni Gashi, Acting Director of KAA
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation

#### **Sources of information for the Report:**

- Self-evaluation report (SER)
- On-site visit
- Additional documents

#### Criteria used for program evaluation:

- KAA Guidelines Accreditation Manual
- Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance
- European standards





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 1.2. Site visit schedule

#### Site Visit Program

### 9th of May

	<u></u>			
19.45	Meeting at the Reception of the Hotel			
20.00	Working dinner			
	10 <sup>th</sup> of May			
07.30	Meeting at the reception of the hotel			
09.00 – 09.30 Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated (no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion)				
09.40 - 10.40	Meeting with the head of the study programme			
10.50 – 11.40	Meeting with quality assurance representatives			
11.50 – 12.50	Meeting with teaching staff			
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch break			
14.00 – 14.30 of the programme)	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure (used for the implementation			
14.40 – 15.20	Meeting with students			
15.30 – 16.00	Meeting with graduates			
16.10 – 16.50	Meeting with employers of graduates			
17.40 – 18.00	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program			





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 1.3. A brief overview of the institution and programme under evaluation

"Haxhi Zeka" University in Peja, was founded as a public university in 2011, thus ending its status as a subsidiary of the University of Prishtina. The University offers several study programmes in five faculties: Faculty of Business, Law Faculty, Faculty of Tourism, Hospitality and Environmental Management, Faculty of Agribusiness, Faculty of Arts. The programmes follow the Bologna structure of the first (Level VI) and second cycle (Level VII). The third stage of the Bologna cycle is in its preparation stage as a joint programme with the University of Zagreb and a University from Malta.

Faculty of Tourism, Hospitality and Environmental management offers *Management in Tourism*, *Hospitality and Environment* as bachelor (Bsc) programme and is proposing a new study programme at level VII - *Management of Environment and Tourism (Msc)*.

# 2. PROGRAM EVALUATION - Management in Tourism, Hospitality and Environment (Bsc)

#### 2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The study programme under evaluation has a distinctive mission in Kosovo with a view to offering an innovative and competitive programme that strives to have a leading role in the development of education related to the transformation of management in tourism, hospitality and environmental protection which combines a double mission focused to train managers who in the course of their careers will be able not only to combine management expertise in tourism, hospitality and environmental commitment, but who will also be able to shift from conventional free-market missions to environmental and social ones and vice-versa. *Thus the study programme mission fully complies with the overall mission and the strategic orientation of the institution* and has been enhanced since the last accreditation visit by the previous expert team.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The study program is well oriented in the didactic aspect as well as in research aspect. Staff and students comply with internal regulations (the Code of Ethics; the Regulation on disciplinary procedures, both approved by the Steering Council; the Regulation on Evaluation Procedure and the Advancement of Academic Personnel; the Regulation for Basic Studies, approved by the University Senate). All the policies and regulations regarding the programme management are reviewed at least every two years and are changed based on the specific conditions and circumstances that are created at the Faculty/University.

The University/Faculty has established the performance indicator at the level of the study program meaning that an **evaluation of the performance of academic staff is conducted regularly at the end of each semester**. The students' voice is heard on a regular basis both informally and through formal QA processes (questionnaires). All the data is analysed by management staff and any necessary actions are taken before the start of the new semester. Academic staff is engaged in a semester contest, and at the end of the academic year, the performance evaluation of each academic staff is presented in a matrix.

The institution keeps record and monitors students' exams passing rate, including grade distribution, progression and completion rates. After completing each exam period based on statistical reports, the Quality Assurance Office compiles the student's passing ratio for three regular terms and two terms by the Senate's decision. Although the passing rate has risen since the last accreditation visit, it is still below the expected level. However, the institution has prepared a tutorial system that helps students with less knowledge on teaching. This system shows results and there has been a slight progress in raising the quality of students who have difficulties in learning and passing exams.

The presentation of the management team on the mission of the university and the development strategy was formulated clearly. Still, the University and the programme seem to have under-developed institutional culture regarding sustainability issues. They are more focused on economic and environmental sustainability and neglect the socio-cultural aspects of sustainability. Furthermore,





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

since the set strategic target goal at the University level is to increase the number of qualified professors, this will be difficult to achieve at the level of the Faculty because this does not correspond to the University's Budget Planning (it is planned to spend less on salaries for academic staff, and zero resources for investment into research).

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A-Necessary re-evaluation of Budget Planning
- 2. B-Dedicate resources necessary for investment into research
- 3. *C Develop institutional culture regarding sustainability issues.*

#### 2.2. Quality management

A quality management system is set at the University level. Procedures and processes for programme design approval and monitoring teaching quality are in place and appear to be adequate. The Quality Assurance (QA) is based on internal and external standards and regulations. Internal processes ensure that the whole staff participates in self-assessment identifying strengths and weaknesses based on regular monitoring system and evaluation of the performance of academic staff. Internal QA is ensured through QA Strategy of the University; Peer to Peer Systems, Tutorial System and Q Offices and Academic development for each academic unit. External QA is based on self-evaluation reports and has an educational role for further improvements (providing training, effective teaching and learning projects, staff mobility etc.) Employers are engaged in the programme review.

As stated previously in 2.1. survey data is collected regularly from students, and students participation in class and at exams is monitored by the e-system of check-in and check-out. Some performance indicators are collected informally (performance of graduates, employers) and thus some formal procedures need to be set in place.

The University/programme urgently needs software for plagiarism detection.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The programme under review has gone through significant changes in its content based on suggestions and recommendation made by the Evaluation Experts and their Evaluation Report of 2015 resulting in a modified single program entitled *Management in Tourism*, *Hospitality and Environment*. The current programme offers two years of common obligatory courses plus four elective courses (depending on the students' future interests in specialization – tourism, hospitality or environment - students have to choose two out of four courses). In the third year the programme splits into three specialisations: Management of tourism; Management of hospitality and Management of environment. Thus, the new programme has resulted in a clearer set of programme objectives and target markets. It offers an appropriate balance between theory and practice with clear emphases on applied research and an enhanced regional orientation. The program is now more competitive in the labour market, both domestic and in neighbouring region. Enhancements from the previous evaluation relate to the academic rigour, meaning that there is a stronger students' engagement with relevant literature; research oriented and tutored studies; staff research incorporated in teaching; and variety of assessment.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A Establish formal procedures for assessing employment outcome data and employer feedback
- 2. B-Obtain software for plagiarism detection

#### 2.3. Academic staff

In the SER the University provided all necessary data to evaluate the academic staff for the programme under evaluation. There are 11 full-time academic staff members engaged in the programme (3 associate professors, 3 assistant professors, 2 assistants with PhD, and 3 assistants with





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Msc. degree). Compared to the previous accreditation evaluation this is a significant improvement in staff members who hold PhD title (as well as professor title), proving the fact that the University has taken remarks/suggestions from the previous evaluation experts seriously and is taking care for additional professional development of teaching staff. The EE were also impressed with several young and very enthusiastic PhD candidates with excellent English language skills, which indicates that the Faculty is going in the right direction. However, there is still too many academic staff who were not willing or who were not capable to have conversation in English language which is not really commendable bearing in mind that English language is *lingua franca* in the field of tourism and hospitality education and that the major literature is written in English language.

Additionally, seven engaged staff in the programme comes from other faculties within the University, two are from the University of Pristina and four are engaged from competitors. Since 75% of staff teaching in the programme are regular staff members within the University, the programme complies with required standard. The academic staff that the EE had the pleasure to interview were very enthusiastic and dedicated professionals who engage their students in practical projects work and incorporate their experience in each subject that they are responsible for. However, it is highly recommended that the students are more exposed to the industry through guest lectures with invited professionals.

A major concern which relates to academic staff is short term employment contract, and continued long-term perspective on career development beyond the PhD level. Furthermore, the University plans to increase the number of students, but at the same time there are no planned resources for increasing the number of qualified professors in regular long-term working relationship. The ratio – number of students per academic staff member comes into question, too. The number of student places should be closely related to the ability of the institution and the programme to offer an expected quality of provision for the students as well as be aligned with the level of academic standards required.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Some academic staff members lack a close link/cooperation with the corporate world in the field of tourism and hospitality.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A-To increase the number of regular academic staff (improve the ratio: number of students per professor)
- 2. B-To raise the English language skill competences of academic staff
- 3. C To improve connections of academic staff with the corporate world (invited lecturers, engagements in research projects).

#### 2.4. Educational process content

The bachelor programme is a three year programme with 180 ECTS credits requiring the completion of 30 subjects including common core subjects in the first two years and specific subjects in the third year when students specialise in one of the three modules: Management of Tourism, Management of Hospitality or Management in Environment. Although each programme offers a different focus in the third year (and through elective courses in the first and the second year) they share a common core of the most important business and management modules (mathematics, management, information technology, accounting, statistics with specialised tourism, hospitality and environment study areas). The programme is concentrated on development of students' business and entrepreneurial skills by balancing practical skills and theoretical knowledge with a global tourism perspective. What is particularly important to emphasise is the orientation of the programme towards sub-specialisations. Such approach enables the students to gain a solid business degree with aforementioned specialisation.

The programme recruits dominantly domestic students from its local market.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Analysing the entire programme and course content it comes evident that there is some overlapping of course content through different subjects, especially in the field of tourism and hospitality. Although it seems that the programme has standardised course syllabi templates, not all course coordinators follow the instruction (some courses do not have, or have a very poor course description - like *Tourism industry; Tourism and Hospitality Management; Travel Agency*); some curses have explanations in SER but are not part of the programme or have different titles - *Tourism and Hotel finance*..); some mention intended learning outcomes clearly, some quite purely and some have skipped it completely). The EE is of the opinion that a coordinated strategic action planning across all courses is missing. It became clear during the interview with academic staff that they lack coordination/communication among themselves to harmonise the course contents so that each course complements the other, thus avoiding unnecessary overlapping. In general, the course syllabi needs to be harmonised throughout the programme, objectives of the course have to be properly specified, intended learning outcomes should be clearly defined for each course, the literature should be divided in basic and supplementary for each course.

Concerning the learning outcomes (LO) there was not clear evidence that the faculty is involved in development of the programme LOs. The extension of the programme level objectives into the LOs at the course level was not evident either and the syllabi do not clearly communicate which LOs are being covered within the course. LOs must be institutionalised, anchored in the organisation, and developed and implemented with broad involvement. This is an area which requires significant additional work at course level in order to make a necessary explicit link between programme LOs, course syllabi and assessment. The EE is therefore of the opinion that the LOs need to be presented in a more consistent, compact and coherent manner and that they should be institutionalised by involvement of all stakeholders including faculty.

The programme could benefit from introducing the regular practice from visiting professors from abroad to enhance the international teaching and learning environment. The quality of teaching material in most cases is appropriate. However, the literature for some courses needs to be updated.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The programme reputation is good and is held in good regard by employers. The skill development is well perceived by the students, and during the meeting they expressed a high level of overall satisfaction with educational experience. The same applies to graduate satisfaction.

There is a good balance between individual and group work assessment. The concept of professional practice is supported by the main dimensions of what students learn through practical work evaluated with ETC credits.

The Faculty of MTHE should be commended for the existing cooperating agreements with a large number of private and state enterprises, thus enabling students to acquire professional practice through internship and develop necessary skills and competences in accordance with the needs and demands of the labour market.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/ between Substantially compliant and Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A To avoid overlapping of contents between different subjects
- 2. B-To development of all aspects of learning outcomes is needed
- 3. C-To enhance students international study experience

#### 2.5. Students

The process of recruiting and students enrolment follows the officially accepted procedures at the institutional level and in accordance with the provisions of the University Statute. Eligibility criteria are applied consistently and right for all students in accordance with (Article 16.4) the Law of High Education. Students' admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied. The students who enrol in the study programme poses a high school graduation diploma or equivalent study documents defined and required by MEST. Studies are organized in accordance with the bachelor study program plan.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Through the interview with students the view was created that the students need more encouragement in expressing their views, independent of the language used. They would definitely benefit from including lessons in the English language and for those of lower English language skills of extending English courses in the third year. Students realised the essential need of coping with English, not necessarily in the strict grammatical sense, but would for sure welcome courses being presented in the English language, forcing them to adapt.

Overall the students were satisfied with the support they receive through special service (Career Service, the quality and availability of academic staff and the overall atmosphere). All of them seemed to have made an informed and determined decision when opting for this study programme.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A Introduction of English language course through all years to enhance language competencies of students necessary for labour market
- 2. B Regular invitations of visiting professors from outside of the region
- 3. C Internship should become obligatory for all students.

#### 2.6. Research

The institution has developed a clear policy and strategy for research activities. Research and international cooperation are managed at the institutional level. The University participates in some international projects and has signed cooperation agreements with a number of foreign universities and institutions. Additionally, cooperation agreements have also been signed with different companies in Kosovo (including several international companies) and with some tourism companies in Kosovo and abroad.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Based on the information of the previous External evaluation report, it is evident that the research activity of faculty members is gradually improving. The effort of publishing in the journals indexed in WoS and Scopus is well documented. Based on CV's of academic staff, engagement is also evident in various research projects and, as a result, in the quality of published articles and some spill-overs to teaching. However, there is a problem of a high concentration of publications by a few key faculty. The EE would strongly recommend not only having a better distribution of research active faculty, but also to fully utilise its research potential with its very strong corporate partners.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A-All necessary efforts need to be made in enabling academic staff and students to get access to research databases
- 2. B Stimulation of research activity
- 3. C Fostering research potential with the established network of corporate partners

#### 2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Budget is proposed and administered at the University level. The MTHE faculty uses available facilities together with the Faculty of Business. They also share human resources for common compulsory courses. The Faculty claims that it has a sufficient number of classrooms, seats and equipment for enrolled students for lectures and seminars. There are also IT labs available to students. Classrooms are equipped with the necessary technology for teaching and developing teaching activities. The faculty of MTHE has a library available, but with limited number of books and journals. However, the students have an access to EBSCO databases which help to overcome their major problem of access to the latest published literature in the field.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

There are formal plans for expanding the space infrastructure at the University level, as well as invest into facilities which would enhance practical studies of hospitality students (setting up kitchen equipment, lecture rooms adapted to practical fields of hospitality studies). All these planned measures are very commendable.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. A Investment into students social and economic standard (students dormitories, mobility and internationalisation)
- 2. *B* Assigning a senior staff member who would oversee development of infrastructure and resources

#### 3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program *Management in tourism*, *hospitality and environment /Bsc* offered by the University of Peja "Haxhi Zaeka", Faculty of Tourism, Hospitality and Environmental Management, is *Substantially compliant* with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends *to accredit* the study program for a duration of *three* (3) *years* with a number of 120 - 150 (maximum) students to be enrolled in the program.

#### **Expert Team**

Chair

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

15





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Member		
	Nevenka Čavlek	24 May, 2019
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 4. PROGRAM EVALUATION - Management of Environment and Tourism /Msc

#### 4.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The study programme under evaluation is a two year master programme (120 ECTS) at the Faculty of Tourism, Hospitality and Environmental Management. Its mission states that it aims to become "a centre of scientific and professional education that prepares a competitive student for the labour market, a leader in the field of environmental management and tourism..". The mission fully complies with the overall mission and the strategic orientation of the institution. This has been already elaborated in Chapter 2 of this report. Offering such a programme in the area of protected nature is not only very competitive, but rather necessary and therefore also very commendable. The Faculty stands out with this programme since it is the only institution in Kosovo to offer this interdisciplinary field of study. This study programme offers the opportunity to BSc graduates to continue their specialisation at the master level. The programme foresees 60 full time students per year.

The study program describes orientation in the didactic aspect as well as in research aspect. Staff and students issues are internally regulated at the University level (the Code of Ethics; the Regulation on disciplinary procedures, both approved by the Steering Council; the Regulation on Evaluation Procedure and the Advancement of Academic Personnel; the Regulation for Basic Studies, approved by the University Senate).

In the SER (p. 619) is stated that the curriculum is designed for students to assess the impact of human activities on the environment and human health, to balance social and economic needs with the realities of the environment by developing sustainable tourism, to learn how to use natural resources in sustainable way for tourism development and to acquire the necessary skills to formulate issues and create environmental and tourist policies. To achieve the main programme goals the University and the Faculty have developed guidelines, policies and regulations to address the issues of Study Programme Plans with defined KPIs, the Semester Valuation Reports, as well as their revision. Made mandatory by Statute of the University, the programme will have annual work reports with the data on





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

lectures track, their evaluations, and completion rates. The summaries of collected data will be automatically distributed to different levels of management structures. All other issues (admission and enrolment of students, class distribution, progress made by students, etc.) follow the procedure defined in Accreditation Standards Manuel.

As stated for the Bachelor programme in Chapter 2, the same applies to this programme. The presentation of the management team on the mission of the university and the development strategy was formulated clearly. However, the University and the programme seem to have under-developed institutional culture regarding sustainability issues. They are more focused on economic and environmental sustainability and neglect the socio-cultural aspects of sustainability.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A Investments in infrastructure to implement the programme's research objectives are of crucial importance for the programme.
- 2. B-Necessary development of institutional culture regarding the sustainability issues.
- 3. *C It is highly recommended that the programme in its mission recognises the need of Ethics and Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).*

#### 4.2. Quality management

As already stated for the assessed Bachelor programme, a quality management system is set at the University level. Procedures and processes for programme design approval and monitoring teaching quality are in place and appear to be adequate. The Quality Assurance (QA) is based on internal and external standards and regulations. Internal processes ensure that the whole staff participates in self-assessment identifying strengths and weaknesses based on regular monitoring system and evaluation of the performance of academic staff. Internal QA is ensured through QA Strategy of the University; Peer to Peer Systems, Tutorial System and Q Offices and Academic development for each academic





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

unit. External QA is based on self-evaluation reports and has an educational role for further improvements (providing training, effective teaching and learning projects, staff mobility etc.)

It is important to stress here that the management team of the programme confirmed to EE during the interview that all stakeholders were consulted to determine learning outcomes of the programme (from academic and professional circles to different advisory bodies).

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A Formal monitoring of the programme quality by liable institution
- 2. B Investments in necessary advanced study conditions for students at master level
- 3.C Participation in international interdisciplinary projects.

#### 4.3. Academic staff

In the SER the University provided all necessary data to evaluate the academic staff for the programme under evaluation. There are in total 9 academic staff members engaged in the programme (7 full-time academic staff members and two par-time). All of them hold PhD titles and according to their CV's are qualified for the job. However, the most worrying fact is that the majority of professors assigned to deliver the lectures in this programme are course coordinators of four or even five courses. Although it is mentioned in the SER that some course coordinators might overcome this serious challenge by a policy implementation in which every course coordinator will conduct lectures with co-worker. However, there are only two course conductors that adopted this policy. This strongly implies to the conclusion that the University is lacking qualified staff to deliver this master programme. One has also to bear in mind that the majority of these professors are also engaged in the Bachelor programme, meaning that they will be overloaded with teaching responsibilities and their





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

research obligations will more than suffer. As a result the expected quality of the programme is seriously threatened.

The strategy of the University is to include a larger number of articles and books in English at this study level as required reading material for the students. This leads to a conclusion that both professors and students will have necessary level of competencies in English language. The EE was able to talk to some of the enthusiastic course coordinators for this programme, and the competencies in this respect were much higher than at the bachelor level. They also have a very good links with the corporate world and some of them already cooperate on research projects with them. Another major concern relates to academic staff with a short-term employment contract.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. A An urgent need to employ additional qualified academic staff
- 2. B Ensure research project funding for younger staff capacity building
- 3. C Fostering international staff mobility.

#### 4.4. Educational process content

The master programme is a two year programme with 120 ECTS credit. The students specialise either in Tourism or Environment. However, the first two semesters students acquire knowledge and competencies through common course subjects which enable them to understand close related linkages between tourism and environment, or *vice versa*. In the second year they decide on their major specialisation. The programme is concentrated on development of students' business and entrepreneurial skills and competencies in the field of environmental management and tourism. It is created to ensure the education of a new generation of experts in the field of environment and tourism.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

This new interdisciplinary degree is supposed to prepare its graduates for profit or non-for-profit sector to ensure sustainable tourism development in sensitive natural areas.

Analysing the entire programme and course content it comes evident that there is significant overlapping in several course contents and expected learning outcomes in many cases are not appropriately defined for this study level. For example, the course Tourism and Environmental protection will provide the students "with basic knowledge about the notion of tourism and environment". The basic knowledge students already acquired at the bachelor level. Furthermore, it is stated that they will explore advantages and disadvantages of tourism as a form of sustainable development. The same is also addressed in the content of course Sustainable development. Expected learning outcomes at this level cannot refer to "define tourism, its role and importance for the development of society" and again - "the forms of tourism their role and importance (SER p. 642)"... All of these was already defined and explained at the level VI!. Additionally, literature does not correspond to the supposed course content under this title. Another example is the course Sustainable Development. The course content cannot relate only to environmental issues and environmental sustainability. Sustainable development has to cover all three pillars of sustainable development (economic, environmental and socio-cultural sustainability). The expected learning outcomes in this case are identical to the expected learning outcomes of Tourism and Environmental Protection course (both mention exactly the same: define key environmental concepts; interpret the main environmental components; determine the main/major global, European and national mechanisms for environmental protection; interpret the local environment and its problems." Since this course should relate to Sustainable tourism development, the question naturally arises why the literature is only about global issues of sustainable development (focused only on environmental issues) and not specific issues related to sustainable tourism development. There are numerous contemporary books covering the topic, as well as thousands of academic articles. But then we would come to the course Sustainable tourism, which actually deals with sustainable tourism development, and therefore the more appropriate title of the course should be Sustainable Tourism Development. There are many more examples of inconsistency and lack of coordination in defining the courses and course contents of the programme.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

As a conclusion the EE is of the opinion that the whole programme is missing a coordinated strategic action planning across all courses. A strong coordination in alignment of learning outcomes of entire programme with each course will need to be implemented to avoid unnecessary overlapping and to ensure that the competencies and skills acquired correspond to this level of academic study.

Concerning the learning outcomes (LO) the EE could not create the opinion that the faculty really understands that the learning outcomes of their courses have to correspond with the defined learning outcomes of the programme. It is of highly importance that the LOs are institutionalised, anchored in the organisation, developed and implemented with broad faculty involvement. This is an area which requires significant additional work at course level in order to make a necessary explicit link between programme LOs, course syllabi and assessment. The EE is therefore of the opinion that the LOs need to be presented in a more consistent, compact and coherent manner and that they should be institutionalised by involvement of all stakeholders including faculty.

The programme could benefit from introducing the regular practice from visiting professors from abroad to enhance the international teaching and learning environment. There is a good balance planned between individual and group work assessment.

The Faculty of MTHE should be commended for the existing cooperating agreements with a large number of private and state enterprises, thus creating a good opportunity for students to further develop their professional skills and competences in accordance with the needs and demands of the labour market.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/ Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

22





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 1. A Necessary development of all aspects of expected LOs, re-definition of course content to correspond to the qualification level VII, and avoidance of unnecessary course overlapping.
- 2. B An urgent need to employ additional qualified academic staff to be able to deliver the expected quality of the programme
- 3. *C Introduce at least one course which would be delivered in English language only*

#### 4.5. Students

The process of recruiting and students enrolment follows the officially accepted procedures at the institutional level and in accordance with the provisions of the University Statute. The programme is offered to potential participants who obtained bachelor degree (180 ECTS), scored minimum average grade of 7.5 and have good command of English language. The Faculty controls the eligibility criteria and apply them consistently and right for all students in accordance with (Article 16.4) the Law of High Education. The planned number of students par year is 60. This should ensure an effective and interactive teaching process.

Since there are no students enrolled in the programme, the EE could not interview any of them. However, the graduates of bachelor programme expressed the desire to continue their studies at master level.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 4. A-To ensure international mobility programmes for students
- 5. B-To invite regularly visiting professors from outside of the region
- 6. C To enable personal development of students with special emphasis on soft and transferable skills.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 4.6. Research

The institution has developed a clear policy and strategy for research activities with special orientation towards innovation. There are several measures proposed to achieve this goal: establish a scientific journal at the level of academic unit, setting up a research institute in the field of tourism and environment, support academic staff to participate in joint research and publishing, involve students in research projects, and encourage academic staff to publish textbooks following the Publishing Regulations of the University. The Faculty has also developed a research plan for the programme.

The University also participates in some international projects and has signed cooperation agreements with a number of foreign universities and institutions. Additionally, cooperation agreements have also been signed with different companies in Kosovo (including several international companies) and with some tourism companies in Kosovo and abroad.

The research activity of faculty members is gradually improving. The effort of publishing in the journals indexed in WoS and Scopus is well documented. Based on CV's of academic staff, engagement is also evident in various research projects and, as a result, in the quality of published articles. The EE would, however, strongly recommend a better distribution of research active faculty, and better utilisation of its research potential with corporate partners.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. A-Investment in research infrastructure
- 4. B Enhancement of research cooperation with international partner institutions and researchers
- 5. C Fostering research potential with the established network of corporate partners





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 4.7. Infrastructure and resources

Budget is proposed and administered at the University level. The MTHE faculty uses available facilities together with the Faculty of Business. Laboratory exercises that are an indispensable part of this program are planned within the laboratories that are in the Agribusiness faculty located within the campus of the University. Laboratories are equipped with all the appropriate equipment to carry out the exercises of this program.

Within the campus there are two libraries which in total have 2838 titles of different books, many of which are books that will be used by the student of this program. There is also a reading room which enables students to work unobstructed and facilitate the preparation of exams. The reading halls are open from 8 am to 5 pm.

There are formal plans for expanding the space infrastructure at the University level, as well as invest into facilities which would enhance practical studies of students.

Compliance level: Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. A Investment into students social and economic standard (students dormitories, mobility and internationalisation)
- 2. B Consider the possibility of extending the working hours of libraries





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 5. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program *Management of Environment and Tourism* (*MSc*) offered by the University of Peja "Haxhi Zaeka", Faculty of Tourism, Hospitality and Environmental Management, is *partially compliant* with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends *not to accredit* the study program at this stage.

# Chair (Signature) (Print Name) (Date) Member Nevenka Čavlek 24 May, 2019 (Signature) (Print Name) (Date) Member (Signature) (Print Name) (Date)