16TH-17TH MAY 2017

FACULTY OF LAW

PROGRAM REACCREDITATION PROCEDURE AT UNIVERSITY OF PRISHTINA

FINAL REPORT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	3
Bachelor Study Programme in Law	9
Master in Contracts and Commercial Law	19
Master in Penal Law	28
Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law	37
Master in Financial Law	42
Master in Civil and Property Law	52
Master in International Law	62
Doctoral Program in Constitutional and Administrative Law	71
Doctoral Program in International Law	77

PROGRAM REACCREDITATION PROCEDURE AT FACULTY OF LAW, UNIVERSITY OF PRISHTINA 16TH-17TH MAY 2017

Executive summary

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) is requested by the Minister of Education, Science and Technology of Kosovo to evaluate academic programs at all institutions of Higher Education operating in the Republic of Kosovo. According to this request, University of Prishtina underwent the accreditation and re-accreditation process with respect to a number of study programs in May 2017. The members of the Experts Team were:

- Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum, (Baden-Württemberg Cooperative State University DE) Chairman.
- Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez Echevarría (Universidad CEU San Pablo ES).
- Prof. Dr. Peter Várnagy (University of Pécs HU).
- Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino (University of Leon, ES).

The Experts Team is grateful to University Prishtina for hosting their visit on 17th of May 2017. The members of the Experts Team are aware of the historical situation that continues to affect the contemporary social, cultural, political and economic environment in Kosovo. The Experts Team therefore appreciates the continued efforts of the management, the academic staff and the students of University Prishtina to develop the quality of its resources and teaching programs in difficult local and national circumstances.

The Experts Team recognizes University Prishtina's position in the market for providing a real university level of education in Kosovo. The ET would like to stress that all comments offered in this Report are intended to contribute to further improvements of the institution as it strives towards the achievement of its mission.

The members of the Experts Team wish to thank the KAA and especially Mrs. Furtuna Mehmeti, Mr Fisnik Gashi and Shkelzen Gërxhaliu of KAA for their hospitality, support and cooperation during this accreditation procedure. They accompanied the Experts Team on all stages of the site visit. The review process was informed by the KAA policy document on Standards for Accreditation. Relevant documents given to the review team included *Guidelines for Experts on Academic Programs*, *Guidelines for Experts on Institutional Programs* and a *Code of Good Practice for Site Visits*.

The evaluation procedure consisted of the following steps:

- 1. Preparation of Self Evaluation Report by University Prishtina;
- 2. Site visit by the Experts Team;
- 3. Preparation of Draft report by Experts Team;
- 4. Response to Draft report by University Prishtina;
- 5. Preparation of Final evaluation report by Experts Team.

Before the site visit took place a Self Evaluation Report (SER) was provided by University Prishtina, which included an overview of the institution's mission statement, organization, quality management, funding, facilities, academic staff, as well as information about University Prishtina's study programs, students, international cooperation and research.

The site visit and review included meetings with members of the institution's management team and individuals responsible for designing particular study programs, as well as a tour of the relevant facilities. This report has been compiled in response to all of the information presented to the Experts Team during the visit and in materials provided subsequently on request.

On the evening of the 16th of May 2017, the members of the Experts Team met with Mr. Fisnik Gashi of the KAA for a preparatory meeting and working dinner. Hardbound copies of the SER were provided, and the committee was formed. Prof. Dr. Falterbaum agreed to be the Chairperson of the committee, and responsibilities for study programs were allocated as follows:

- Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum: Bachelor in Law and Doctoral Program in Constitutional and Administrative Law.
- Prof. Dr. Peter Várnagy: Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law, Master in International Law and Doctoral Program in Constitutional and Administrative Law.
- Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez Echevarría: Master in Contracts and Commercial Law, Master in Penal Law, Master in Financial Law, Master in Civil and Property Law, Doctoral Program in International Law.

 Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus-Rufino: Master in Contracts and Commercial Law, Master in Penal Law, Master in Financial Law, Master in Civil and Property Law, Doctoral Program in International Law.

The Experts Team submitted to KAA a request for additional documents on the same evening of 18th May of 2017:

- Detailed table about Erasmus+ mobility (outgoing teachers and students; incoming teachers and students).
- List about the Erasmus+ Agreements.
- Template of the teaching staff evaluation by the students and the results
- List about the members of the Faculty Council (students' participation)
- List about books, journals etc. (national and international) which were bought by the library or were donated to the library in 2016 and 2017.
- Actual budgetary plan of the faculty in English translation.
- List about the number of beginning students the last five years and a plan for the next five years.
- List about the number of dropping out students and "passive students" the last five years

All these documents were provided to the Experts Team by 18th of May.

Site Visit Program

<u>16th May</u>

19:45	Meeting in the Reception of the Hotel
20:00	Working dinner
	<u>17th May</u>
07:30	Meeting in the Reception of the Hotel
09:00 - 09:30 Institution	Meeting with the management of the

09:30 - 11:30	Meeting with responsible person for the study programs (<i>Curriculum, teaching, researches, recommendations</i>)
11:30 - 12:30	Visit to facilities
12:30 - 14:00	Lunch and discussion of ET and Coo. KAA
14:00 - 15:00	Meeting with academic staff
15:00 - 16:00	Meeting with students
16:00 - 16:15	ET and Coo., KAA consultation
16:15 - 16:30	Closing meeting with the management of the Institution
16:30	The end of the site visit

Meetings with responsible persons

N r.	Study programs	Responsible persons of study programs			Experts
1	Law (LLB), 240 ECTS, Reaccreditation	Beqir Sadikaj	Remzije Istrefi Peci	Visar Morina	Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum 09:30-10:30
2	Contracts and Commercial Law (LLM), 60 ECTS, Reaccreditation	Rrustem Qehaja	Valbona Mulaj	Vjosa Osmani	Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez- Echevarría 09:30-10:00
3	Penal Law (LLM), 60 ECTS, Reaccreditation	Haki Demolli	Azem Hajdari	Rexhep Gashi	Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino Prof. Dr. Alfonso

					Martínez- Echevarría 10:00-10:30
4	Constitutional and Administrative Law, (LLM), 60 ECTS, Reaccreditation	Hava Bujupaj Ismajli	Murat Jashari	Gjyljeta Mushkola j	Prof. Dr. Péter Várnagy 09:30-10:00
5	Financial Law (LLM), 60 ECTS, Reaccreditation	Bedri Peci	Mejdi Bektashi	Agim Paca	Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez- Echevarría 10:30-11:00
6	Civil and Property Law (LLM), 60 ECTS, Reaccrditation	Haxhi Gashi	Nerxhiva ne Dauti	Iset Morina	Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez- Echevarría 11:00-11:30
7	International Law (LLM), 60 ECTS, Reaccreditation	Qerim Qerimi	Besfort Rrecaj	Flamur Mrasori	Prof. Dr. Péter Várnagy 10:00-10:30
8	Constitutional and Administrative Law, (Dr.Sc), 180 ECTS, Reaccreditation	Arsim Bajrami	Mirlinda Batalli Zhubi	Fisnik Korenica	Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum Prof. Dr. Péter Várnagy 10:30-11:00
9	International Law, (Dr.Sc), 180 ECTS,	Enver Hasani	Hajredin	Iliriana	Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino

Reaccreditation	Kuci	Islami	Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez- Echevarría
			11:30-12:00

The Experts Team has overall a quite good impression about the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina. So is to distinguish a very open atmosphere and the possibility to discuss concrete problems very factual and differentiated. So the Experts Team could perceive a big progression since the last accreditation procedure less than two years ago.

This good impression concerns not only the manner of presentation but as well very concrete steps. So the Experts Team appreciate especially big development in decreasing the number of students, the implementation of an electronic quality assurance system, electronic library and efforts concerning the facilities and infrastructure.

The Experts Team perceives the Faculty of Law as an unity of teaching and researching. Respecting the different programmes of the faculty it has advantages, as the Experts Team could determine, to have good cooperation and connections between the departments. Because the programmes build on each other and have of course the same academic standards it is to appreciate this existing unity of the faculty. But considering that the accreditation procedure is distinguishing between the various programmes the Experts Team has decided to dedicate below every programme a separately part in the Report.

Not least must be observed that the circumstances in Kosovo are still very difficult in different aspects. The Experts Team intended to support the Faculty of Law to find his own way in these circumstances.

Bachelor Study Programme in Law

Referring to the reaccreditation processes in the years 2009, 2012 and 2015 the Experts Team sees continuous progress realizing the Bachelor study programme of Law (LLB) in the University of Prishtina. This report can particularly be based on the last report less than two years ago, avoiding unnecessary receptions.

Particularly the last reaccreditation procedure in the year 2015 showed that the biggest weakness of the programme is not the syllabus or teaching staff but the number of students. It was obvious that there was no acceptable relation between the number of students and the need of lawyer/jurists in the labour market and as well no acceptable relation between the number of students and capacity of facilities, academic staff and infrastructure. That was the main reason why reaccreditation 2015 took place under different conditions. This is overall a problem for the Bachelor programme which has less relevance for the other programmes.

The Experts Team with pleasure could find out that the faculty made big efforts decreasing the number of students. Especially the Experts Team could perceive that the responsible persons had recognized the need of reducing the number of students as their own interest for a good development of the programme. In this process of decreasing the number of students the Experts Team perceive that there is a big demand for young people to study law because of the special situation of unemployment in Kosovo and that the reason for the surplus of students is of course as well the offer from other universities and colleges in Kosovo.

Regarding this different circumstances the Experts Team considers the necessity of a further continuous reduction of the number of study beginners. It is to praise that the faculty plans to reduce the number of beginning students from 944 students (638 regular and 306 part time) in the academic year 2016/2017 to 600 (500 regular and 100 part time) in the academic year 2021/2022. For a serious and professional accompaniment of this process it is first indispensable that the faculty undertake a serious research of need for lawyers/jurists in the actual labour market of Kosovo. This recommendation of the reaccreditation procedure 2015 is still not fulfilled. Second it is indispensable to improve the quality assurance system (see below).

Recommendation: In the next Self-Evaluation-Report the faculty should propound the results of a research of the need of lawyers/jurists in the labour market in Kosovo and to expose an according further reduction of the number of students for the next years.

1. Academic Programmes and Student Management

• Does the academic programme correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation?

The Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina has a very clear mission and is well accepted in Kosovo. The Bachelor programme is the base for the other academic degrees of the faculty and has therefore a central place. The Faculty of Law is an essential part of the varied and extensive offer of this public university of University of Prishtina.

• Are the programme's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?

As already the previous evaluations show the programme's quality, range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree. Particularly the syllabuses avoid now largely overlapping subjects with the Master and PhD programmes and show a clear structure. The Bachelor programme is a self-contained and balanced programme which gives an academic degree qualifying for juridical labour market and as well giving a fundament for further academic graduations. The basis for this assessment is the good and consistent presentation the Experts Team could find in the various papers. It rests a doubt if the faculty can realize this high standard completely in praxis. That is the reason why the Experts Team proposes progress in the evaluation process (see below).

Without doubt the Faculty has improved the constitution of the modules and units. Particularly the overlap between the various parts of the curriculum and to the Master programmes is comprehensible and transparent now.

• Is the programme based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated to and adopted by the teaching staff?

Because of the big number of students and the unsatisfactory situation of facilities it is very difficult to realize an appropriate contact between students and teaching staff. The reduction of the number of students and the amelioration of the facilities is the base to realise an overarching didactic concept. It is very important to have various forms to learn, of research and present knowledge. At the moment the situation is just sufficient.

• Does the academic degree correspond to international standards?

The bachelor programme of Faculty of Law as presented in the Self-Evaluation-Report 2017 corresponds to international standards, particularly level of western European universities.

• Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? (E.g. what is the proportion of independent study time compared to online/distance teaching and classroom units?)

As described before (see above) in dependence of the number of students the faculty has improve the quality for independent study, reflection and analysis.

• Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?

As already confirmed in the reaccreditation procedures before, the ECTS are well balanced and distributed in the curriculum.

• Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

As already confirmed in the reaccreditation procedures before we confirm that the required workload is manageable for students.

• Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes (competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills)?

The teaching methods were not in the centre of this reaccreditation procedure. The Experts Team assume that the teachers of the Bachelor programme realize different and various methods of teaching and promoting independent and creative learning and researching of students. This should include working groups and individual presentations and seminar papers.

• How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?

The main admission criterion is that the students have completed high school and passed the Matura test. This is western European standard. The University of Prishtina can reflect to open the programme under certain conditions for applicants with lower ability.

Additional the admission depends of passing a test organized by the Faculty of Law. It is to appreciate that the faculty design active the membership of the academic programme installing an own system of regulation the admission. This is a differentiated procedure respecting the knowledge of the applicant of a university place, the standards of the Law faculty of the University of Prishtina and the school examinations. During the site visit the management of the institution explained that by this system it is possible to regulate the admission flexible in ratio to the number of places the faculty offers. The Experts Team accept this mode of admission-regulation considering that every regulation keeps insufficient and reform able.

• Is the ratio of academic staff to students appropriate?

Respecting certain difficulties of the Law faculty in Kosovo, the deficit of well-educated academic staff in Kosovo and the high number of students the relation between academic staff and students seems to be appropriate. During a next accreditation procedure it could be helpful to explore more exactly the quantity and quality of the academic staff.

2. Staff. Academic Staff Development Plan for a three-year period

The Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina reports in its Self-Evaluation-Report (page 233) that they have "asked all department chairs to regularly monitor academic staff development achievements and plans. In this regard, the Faculty has developed a review form focusing on the following: a) Reflections on previous academic year;

b) Reflections on previous academic year by department chairs;

c) Determination of future objectives and competences by staff and department chairs; and

d) Notes on any relevant topic arising from meetings of staff or department chairs.

Department chairs have asked their staff to prepare a report describing their achievements in the previous year regarding the learning process, curriculum development, research work mentoring and other relevant activities. This report will serve as a framework for meetings and for discussing and planning activities. The reports submitted by department chairs will help prepare the Academic Staff Development Plan for the upcoming three years. The Scientific Research Institute will advance academic development plans for scientific research as well."

The Experts Team appreciate explicitly that the Faculty of Law has started to create a development plan for a three year period. This should concern not only numbers of students and academic staff but especially curriculum development, research planes and other relevant activities. The plan should distinguish the different academic programmes of the Faculty of Law. In the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should present a concrete three year development plan.

Recommendation: In the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should present an Academic Staff Development Plan for a three-year period.

• Does the institution have an adequate proportion of permanent staff and appropriate proportions of permanent and external staff?

The Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina includes 83 members of academic staff. 69 of them are regular and 14 adjunct staff. This is sufficient for a decreasing number of students.

• Do the academic staffs demonstrate proven ability at a high academic and didactic level and are their qualifications

appropriate to the positions they hold within the institution according to the basic criteria?

Proved by the CV's of the academic staff the lectures shoe a high academic and didactic level and their qualifications appropriate to the positions they hold. Particularly they have profound experiences in various fields of law, administration and politics.

3. Research and International Cooperation

• Are the teaching staffs involved in research activities inside or outside the institution, and do these research activities feed back into teaching/course contents?

The faculty presented a list of publications of the members of teaching staff. There could be more proofs of cooperative research in cadre of the University. About involving the students see below.

• Are the extent and the quality of international cooperation in research and teaching adequate?

International cooperation in research and teaching is essential for the faculty, particularly because of the dimensions of the Republic of Kosovo. Considering the difficult circumstances of Kosovo the Faculty of Law present a respectable list of international cooperation with different countries.

• Are students involved in research and cooperation projects? It is to distinguish between the involvement of students in research and practical cooperation in internships for students.

In the Self-Evaluation-Report the faculty expound their cooperation with institutions of the legal community, such as the judiciary, the prosecution, lawyers, private executors, notaries, the parliament, the government – various ministries, Customs, the airport, and other organizations and institutions with which new cooperation agreements are reached every year. This reciprocal contributes in continuity to improving the quality of students by enabling them to apply theory into practice. The application process for internships goes through the Career Centre, which maintains files of candidates and their attendance using a database created for this purpose. This internship during the programme is very important to ensure students' quality improvement.

Furthermore an academic programme –already of bachelor level- has to realize the connection between practice and theory as a challenge for research. So the faculty has not only to promote and organize internships for students but as well to work out the relevance of practical questions for research in an academic level and as a part of the study programme.

In this context the Experts Team approve that the faculty management in collaboration with the academic staff continuously work to ensure an effective and innovative research plan. This plan includes, as expound in the Self-Evaluation-Report, individual initiatives of teachers, collective plans of departments and plans developed together with students. A new initiative consist of the establishment of the Scientific Research Institute within the Faculty of Law, which will increase initiatives for scientific research and initiatives through various projects that can be implemented through this institute.

This initiative has to be work out and implement more visible in the programme structure.

Recommendation: Till the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should work out improved the participation of students in research projects in connection with various internships.

4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

• Does the institution have an adequate budget plan?

The scope for the Faculty of Law is still very small to make own decisions realizing the study programme. The budget plan is centralized for the whole university. But there is no perspective to change it soon.

• Does the institution have adequate buildings and specialized infrastructure for the requirements of the programme?

As already determined in the last accreditation procedure the infrastructure is not sufficient. Even not for a decreasing number of students. The faculty could report progress in the last years as new seats in the classrooms, digitalisation and rebuilding of the amphitheatre (see page 8 and 255 of the Self-Evaluation-Report 2017).

There is still not enough space for the big faculty. But the responsible persons could report that the university had decided to create a new building for the Faculty of Law or the Faculty of Economy.

Recommendation: Till the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should report about progress of more space/new building.

5. Quality Management

• Are the institution's programmes assessed regularly within the context of internal evaluation processes?

The Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina has installed an extensive quality assurance system (see page 256 of the Self-Evaluation-Report 2017). The Vice Dean and the Quality Assurance Office is responsible for organizing, realizing and further development of these activities. As provided in the rules of procedure dealing with the questionnaire, the Law Faculty has assigned a quality assurance official, responsible to facilitate the student evaluation process. This quality assurance system includes activities for scientific research too. In this capacity, the Vice Dean on quality issues is cooperating with the department heads, collecting data in relation to individual research plans of the academic personnel; is identifying opportunities for the development of research projects and quality evaluation methods.

In the academic year 2016-17, the teacher evaluation system by the students was launched through the electronic form –SEMS, which is done through the Web page of the faculty. The system is anonymous and preserves evaluation confidentiality. Data collected by this system shall be generated by the system and the results issued. These results are planned to be discussed with department heads, the Study Commission and the Council of the Faculty, and standards are to be taken to advance the quality of the studies.

Likewise, upon initiative of the management, the Council of the Faculty of Law issued a decision in 2016 on the evaluation manner of the students, by determining criteria for the preparation of tests to be unique for the whole faculty, taking into account the inclusion of study cases and transparency of required points to pass the exams. The Experts Team has big respect for implementing this immense quality assurance system in the Faculty of Law. This is a big progress and this structure has without doubts western European standard.

Unfortunately there was no English translation of the questionnaire and the answer diagram the Experts Team received as additional documents on the occasion of the site visit in May 20017.

As a next step the Faculty of Law should give account that the outcomes of this evaluation process flow in the development process of the academic programme. To cope with this challenge cannot be given advices from outside. The faculty has to find out itself how to take consequences of the questioning of students. There will be no need of a rigid automatism but a transparent handling of appreciation of the students' feedback.

Recommendation: Till the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should explain how to guarantee consequences of the questioning of students in the quality assurance process.

6. Conclusion

The Experts Team observe concerning the Bachelor Programme (LLB) of the Faculty of Law of the University in Prishtina big progress in various aspects of the programme.

Therefore the Experts Team propose a reaccreditation of the programme for the durance of three years.

In this period the Faculty of Law should consider the following recommendations:

- In the next Self-Evaluation-Report the faculty should propound the results of a research of the need of lawyers/jurists in the labour market in Kosovo and to expose an according further reduction of the number of students for the next years.
- In the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should present an Academic Staff Development Plan for a three-year period.
- Till the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should work out improved the participation of students in research projects in connection with various internships.

- Till the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should report about progress of more space/new building.
- Till the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should explain how to guarantee consequences of the questioning of students in the quality assurance process.

Master in Contracts and Commercial Law

1. Introduction

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of Enqa, has received a petition of the Faculty Law of University of Prishtina to reaccredit the Master in Contracts and Commercial Law in order to evaluate the KAA has set up two expert: Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez Echevarría / University CEU San Pablo (ES) and Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus-Rufino/ University of Leon (ES) both professor worked with a team of experts from another European universities and countries.

During the assessment process the expert followed all the guidelines of the KAA for evaluating academic programs. The expert was able to visit the facilities and the building of the Faculty of Law. The Dean of the Faculty of Law made a complete presentation included a brief background of the Faculty, Study Programmes offered, Study programmes under reaccreditation, Staff, Students in Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes, Quality Assurance, Equipment and Facilities, Research and International Cooperation, Financing and the recommendations of the accreditation procedure of 2015. Finally the experts hold a meeting with three professors of the Master in Contracts and Commercial Law: Rrustem Qehaja, Valbona Mulaj and Vjosa Osmani. Therefore a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 17, 2017.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for experts (Institutions and Academic Programmes), edited by the KAA, the experts have written the following evaluation report.

The evaluation report is based upon a Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina concern with the Master in Contract and Commercial Law of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the experts during the site-visit and the meetings.

One day later we received more documents with the complete *syllabi* of the courses, the short curriculum vitae of the professors and a complete list of agreements.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA. This is a draft of

the evaluation report that must be sent to the KAA in order to give the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina the opportunity to comment on the draft report.

The KAA asked expert to evaluate the Master in Contract and Commercial Law and deliver a report with a provisional resolution to offer the opportunity to the Faculty of Law to make appropriate arguments. The decision of the expert is in the number 3 of this report and is based upon the findings, which are stated in the second part of the report.

The Faculty of Law offers a Master in Contract and Commercial Law of one year (60 ECTS) for the students of four years (eight semesters) and has got a Bachelor in Law of 240 ECTS. All candidates must have the Bachelor in Law. The Master does not admit candidates with other degrees.

The meeting with professors served to confirm that the Faculty form a united, motivated and committed team with the project they want and have the training and experience necessary to offer and develop the Master in Contract and Commercial Law in Prishtina University.

However there are some problems to be resolved as soon as possible to ensure the quality of the Master which it is one of the main points of the mission that describe the Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law.

2. Academic Programmes and Student Management

In the meeting with the professor became clear that the Master in Contract and Commercial Law aims to provide theoretical and practical training at the same time. The Master in Contract and Commercial Law is a multidisciplinary programme intended to educate future professionals in this specific field of Law that has a great demand in the market, for governments, companies and individual persons. For the last decades, 80% of Kosovo lawyers were focused in criminal law. One of the main purposes of this Master is to provide students with a deep understanding of the essential analytical tools and knowledge needed to tackle current problems in the commercial sphere; it also aims to develop transferable skills that can be applied to any career.

The Master's programme presents an innovative proposal to meet the challenges that have arisen from the globalisation of recent years.

Students are required to possess a high level and fluency in English language. US Aid provides University of Prishtina Law School with bibliography and each student can borrow books for his or her personal use. The professors and the Self Evaluation Report of Faculty of Law insisted that the goal of the Master is to educate professionals with excellent abilities when it comes to understanding and analysing the deep problem of contract in two domains: national and international. On page 176 of Self Evaluation Report are exposed and explain new skills and competencies that are proposed to achieve with the master. All of them are very adequate and consistent with the proposed curriculum. Every subject is taught by two persons, one international and another international. The sessions entrusted to the international member of the staff can be hold via Skype, when it is not possible a face to face class.

The master program is in general comparable with other programs offered in different universities. The teaching organization is well distributed among the teachers of the master. A compulsory course can be extended and completed with another elective normally taught by the same teacher. This structure facilitates the specialization of students and future professionals demanded by the labour market, business and administration of Kosovo.

General information about the programme is short, although aspects of the assessment, exams, tests and grades are sufficient for the student. On the other hand, the information about the details of courses, the description of the contents, the development, the teachers and the teaching methodology of all program is enough and very complete for the students and for the evaluators to get a precise idea of the structure of the master.

In the interview, the professors told that in this program there are students who are already working and other that are full time students. For this reason, it seems appropriate that the master thesis of 10 ECTS because a student can spend between 250 and 300 hours even if he works. At the same time, the Master intend to strengthen its practical profile, hence 10 ECTS has been considered an appropriate weight for the master thesis within the 60 ECTS of the Master programme configuration. Although it is advisable to consider increasing the ECTS of the thesis to 15, the change would not mean much more work for students. It means that the program must cut some courses or reduce the electives courses. The distribution of credit points according to the ECTS is in line with the Bologna rules and the transparency about rules and requirements is guaranteed but with a restriction concerning full time studies.

The Experts Team suggest that Master's syllabus could be oriented to make up of a combination of core subjects and a wide range of electives that reflect the students' individual interests. Building on knowledge acquired in the first. In the second semester the students will take a pathway speciality and, in this way, build their education according to their individual interests within the different areas of specialization in contract or in commercial law.

The wide international relations of University of Prishtina could attract students who have studied or worked abroad. One of the most successful goals of this Master is to get a very international atmosphere, in which the students' different viewpoints favour crosscultural debates and reflections, both during and outside classes.

The number of maximum and minimum of students is detailed in the Self Evaluation Report minimum 20 and the maximum 60. The maximum is too high for a Master, which must combine theoretical and practical lectures, with seminaries, special works of students and final thesis. It is very difficult to work in a personalized way to many students. Better proposed fewer students in order to better meet their learning and training.

The balance between theoretical lectures and practical activities of students is correct. 30% of the formation received by the student has a practical content and/or orientation: cases or practical lessons, activities organized by the Career Centre and, mainly, internships for 2, 3 or 6 months. Also, it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The Master in Contract and Commercial must be more specific about knowledge, skills and competences acquired. The experts' team could suggest some as follow:

- Advanced knowledge of Contract and Commercial Law.
- Ability to apply the knowledge acquired to formulate new development of the Contract and Commercial Law.
- Ability to study and propose solutions to the problems issues taking the social consequences thereof into account.

- Ability to design and carry out coherent projects in the fields of international commerce and national contract oriented to the international relationships.
- Ability to make proper use of qualitative and quantitative techniques for collecting and analysing data for enterprises developments or internationalization of the businesses.
- Ability to communicate the hypotheses, methodology, results and practical implications of research clearly and concisely to both specialist and non-specialist audiences.
- Ability to analyse the commerce international and to write reports and documents, which could help to develop the international project of a country as Kosovo.

Structure. The optional courses allowing students to tailor their training to their specific interests. Master's degree thesis is necessary to complete the program. All students must undertake a compulsory master's degree final project under the supervision of an academic tutor. Students work on the project over the course of the year, and it is assessed at the end by an academic board consisting of at least two members.

Arbitration is an elective course that deserves to be highlighted. Students who choose this course take part in an International Arbitration Moot, which requires 9 months of intensive work. University of Prishtina Law School has achieved a high position in the last edition of the competition -within the 10% first competitors-.

3. Staff

The number of teachers seems sufficient to run with quality the Masters programmes. There are many professors who has full time contract. Every course has a doctor as coordinator of the lectures and student's work.

A significant number of teacher's majority have studied abroad in well-known universities. The Master has 13 teachers; it is enough professors for a total of 15 courses (compulsory and electives). Also, the numbers of professors are enough to take care of the all-master theses. With 50 students each teacher has conduct only one or two master theses. It is a warranty to preserve and increase the quality and the attention to the students in the master program.

The Experts Team recommends that could be very good for students and staff to increase in the future the number of professional practice or experts in some field that are very useful in a master primarily oriented to the practice. Also, it is necessary implement a real and objective evaluation and monitoring about the external activities of all professors.

The balance of gender in academic positions is unbalanced. There are more men than women. Should establish a procedure for monitoring the gender balance of academic staff across the Faculty.

4. Research and International Cooperation

The Master of Contract and Commercial Law is not a program primary oriented to research. But the students have perform a final research thesis. Therefore, the research in the Master is not specified in the proposal. It might put some examples of research topics on which students could orient their research. It could be a practice that can be distinguished the Master in Contract and Commercial Law of the Faculty of Law.

All professor of the Master must elaborate a list of topic of research every two-year term and offer at least one title for the theses of the students.

Additionally, some students who successfully complete the master's programme may continue on to the doctoral programme and, thus, an academic career at a university or research institution.

The student has the opportunity to publish their papers and commentaries in the university reviews or order publication even on line in the web page of the Faculty of Law or the University of Prishtina.

Internationalization. The Faculty of Law has several general agreements with foreign universities and institutions. But there is no specific agreement to develop the Master for mobility of professors and especially students.

This Master must establish a strategic plan, which includes a strong international activity. The Faculty of Law needs now to develop an explicit and realistic strategy for internationalisation its activities, its projects and its programmes. Also, the professors and the students must collaborate in this strategy.

If the Master in Contract and Commercial Law wants to attract academic staff from outside of Kosovo, it is necessary to develop a

strategy to archive this goal with specific agreements and other initiatives.

As part of the Master's in Contract and Commercial Law, Faculty of Law must be committed to supporting its students in numerous ways to enter the international labour market. Building on this, Faculty of Law must offer a professional internship program as a first step in moving towards an international career.

Practical formation and employability. The program must contain internships in public and private institutions -enterprises, foundations and so on- with which Faculty of Law has already signed a cooperative agreement. Companies contact directly the LLM staff asking for internship students. Additionally, the Experts Team aims to the directory of the Master to organize a "Job Market Week" during which already established professionals in the world of national and international enterprises and organizations offer informative and practical courses in areas such as public speaking, job interviewing, and communication, apart from specific seminars on job and internship opportunities in national organizations and international field, i.e., the European Union.

Furthermore, and through an Academic Management office, which must be created as soon as possible, students could receive detailed and updated information regarding current internship and job openings in the private and public sector, but also in academia.

Finally, improve the field of research is particularly important for different reasons. Firstly, in order to establish a high-level international studies centre, this contributes to connect Kosovar society's interests and concerns with the strong currents of globalisation and international economic activity. It will be more and more important to have our own in-depth knowledge of those aspects of the domestic and international commerce that affect or will affect Kosovo. Secondly, to have an institution with an excellent academic reputation at an international level, and situate a space of recognised academic prestige on the international academic scene, acting as an attraction and facilitating links to the world's most prominent centres. Finally, in order to guarantee a high standard in terms of the education of professionals and researchers in these fields, it is necessary to strengthen the connection between postgraduate education and quality research.

5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The building of the Faculty of Law is shared with Economics. The facilities are sufficient to run the programme, but it must be better in the future has more space. There are few small meetings or seminars rooms for students. Therefore, the University must make a great effort to get the means to ensure quality teaching.

One of the most critical aspects to run successfully a master and to develop the research in the Master in Contract and Commercial Law is the absence of a specialized library, with sufficient books and reviews to write the research theses. Establish a library is a question of investing money and time. But now there are some ways to cut this investment and time. In any case, it is impossible to develop the research without a library or to have access to online library resources.

The Master in Contract and Commercial Law does not have a separate budget. All money received or captures, is managed by the University of Prishtina in its overall budget. A primary objective is to achieve some economic independence and attract more resources from public and private institutions, in order to develop their research projects and improvement plans. Teaching, research and development of students improve their quality if more resources become available. Just looking for economic independence can develop and extend their teaching plans and offer specialized courses.

6. Quality Management

The Self Evaluation Report as it was clarified in the meeting, writes nothing about the government of the Master. There is a general coordination but nothing more. Therefore, to evaluate the organization is virtually impossible.

According to University the Master has a questionnaire to assess annually the professors and faculty. Students must complete a questionnaire paper. There are no evidences if the most of students deliver or not the questionnaires. Maybe the Master should rethink how to get the answers of the students. An online questionnaire to guarantee the anonymity of the student would be a solution, but could also apply other measures such as the student could not see their scores in the subjects until complete and return the questionnaire. In this way it could get better information on the quality of professors and the education provided at the Master. There is a procedure for evaluating the student, which combines the continuous evaluation, as the written exams and tests and personal student work. There is not a document containing such a procedure for quality assurance and evaluation, the Experts Team has this evidence in the self-evaluation Report.

Finally it is necessary, as soon as possible, to establish a Coordination Team of Master in Contract and Commercial Law with this staff:

- 1. Director: is responsible for the design and general supervision of the programme.
- 2. Two professors in charge of Academic Affair: is responsible for managing the Master programme, students and teaching staff. They are available to answer queries from both students and teachers, as well as deal with the matriculation process and the material needed for each subject. They also monitor attendance, coordinate the course calendar and handle coursework submission and academic records. It also manages the internship programme and the quality assurances processes.
- 3. Coordination of Admissions.

7. Recommendations

- 1. Having an internship program for students in institutions and in international universities.
- 2. The Master should introduce a formalized program of professional development and support in teaching for its entire teaching.
- 3. It is necessary to establish a coordinator for the professional activities of the students.
- 4. It is necessary to have a library for the Master.
- 5. The Master must elaborate a document to fix the criteria to develop the quality.

8. Proposal for accreditation

Experts Team proposes **the reaccreditation** of the Master in Contract and Commercial Law study programme of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina **for three years.**

Master in Penal Law

1. Introduction

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of Enqa, has received a petition of the Faculty Law of University of Prishtina to reaccredit the Master in Penal Law in order to evaluate the KAA has set up two experts: Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez-Echevarría / University CEU San Pablo (ES) and Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus-Rufino/ University of Leon (ES) both professor worked with a team of experts from another European universities and countries.

During the assessment process the experts followed all the guidelines of the KAA for evaluating academic programmes. The experts were able to visit the facilities and the building of the Faculty of Law. The Dean of the Faculty of Law made a complete presentation included a brief background of the Faculty, Study Programmes offered, Study programmes under reaccreditation, Staff, Students in Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes, Quality Assurance, Equipment and Facilities, Research and International Cooperation, Financing and the recommendations of the accreditation procedure of 2015. Finally, the experts hold a meeting with three professors of the Master in Penal Law: Haki Demolli, Azem Hajdari and Rexhep Gashi. Therefore, a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 17, 2017.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for experts (Institutions and Academic Programmes), edited by the KAA, the experts have written the following evaluation report.

The evaluation report is based upon a Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina concern with the Master in Penal Law of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the experts during the site-visit and the meetings.

One day later we received more documents with the complete *syllabi* of the courses, the short curriculum vitae of the professors and a complete list of agreements.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA. This is a draft of the evaluation report that must be sent to the KAA in order to give

the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina the opportunity to comment on the draft report.

The KAA asked expert to evaluate the Master in Penal Law and deliver a report with a provisional resolution to offer the opportunity to the Faculty of Law to make appropriate arguments. The decision of the expert is in the number 8 of this report and is based upon the findings, which are stated in the second part of the report.

The Faculty of Law offers a Master in Penal Law of one year (60 ECTS) for the students of four years (eight semesters) and has got a Bachelor in Law of 240 ECTS. All candidates must have the Bachelor in Law. The Master does not admit candidates with other degrees.

The meeting with professors served to confirm that the Faculty form a united, motivated and committed team with the project. They want and they have the training and experience necessary to offer and develop the Master in Penal Law in Prishtina University.

However, there are some problems to be resolved as soon as possible to ensure the quality of the Master which it is one of the main points of the mission that describe the Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law.

2. Academic Programmes and Student Management

In the meeting with the professors became clear that the there was a previous edition of the Master in Penal Law, which started in 1984, and that one was followed by the present edition of the Master in Penal Law, which begun in 2011. It was established with the help and advice of professors from the University of Graz (Austria). The main objective is to offer training to students and advanced studies oriented to professional practice. There are 16 subjects: only 5 are mandatory and 11 are elective. There is a Master Thesis (18 ECTS). From the beginning, three major areas of expertise were established: criminology, criminal law and criminal prosecution. At present the students must specialize in two or three of the three itineraries.

The Master in Penal Law is a real multidisciplinary programme intended to educate future professionals in this specific field of Law that has a great demand in the market, for governments, companies and law firms. One of the purposes of this Master Programme is to renew and the Kosovo Criminal Law practice. Its aim is to provide students with a deep understanding of the essential analytical tools and knowledge needed to tackle current problems in the criminal law sphere; it also aims to develop transferable skills that can be applied to any career.

Seventy per cent of the students complete their master thesis in one year or 14 months. Also, a big number have the opportunity to practice in different companies, law firms, public administration and private institutions with which the University of Prishtina maintains agreements. However, a very small group of students continue their training in the doctoral programme.

The Master's programme presents an innovative proposal to meet the challenges that have arisen from the globalisation of recent years. The professors and the Self Evaluation Report of Faculty of Law insisted that the goal of the Master is to educate professionals with excellent abilities when it comes to understanding and analysing the deep problem of criminal law in two domains: national and international. On pages 100-101 of Self Evaluation Report are exposed and explain five main skills and competencies that are proposed to achieve with the master. All of them are very adequate and consistent with the proposed curriculum.

The master programme is in general comparable with other programmes offered in different universities. The teaching organization is well distributed among the teachers of the master. A compulsory course can be extended and completed with another elective normally taught by the same teacher. This structure facilitates the specialization of students and future professionals demanded by the labour market, business and administration of Kosovo.

General information about the programme is short, although aspects of the assessment, exams, tests and grades are sufficient for the student. On the other hand, the information about the details of courses, the description of the contents, the development, the teachers and the teaching methodology of all programme is enough and very complete for the students and for the evaluators to get a precise idea of the structure of the master.

In the interview, the professors told that in this programme there are student who are already working and other that are full time students. For this reason, it seems that the master thesis of 18 ECTS because a student can spend between 450 and 550 hours even if he works. It is maybe too much time for a student that combines his job with the Master. Although it is advisable to consider decreasing the ECTS of the thesis to 15, the change means much less work for students who have a job and mix their time with the master. It means that the programme must increase some compulsory and the electives courses, i.e. something about the international criminal organization.

The distribution of credit points according to the ECTS is in line with the Bologna rules and the transparency about rules and requirements is guaranteed but with a restriction concerning full time studies.

The Experts Team suggest that Master's syllabus could be oriented to make up of a combination of core subjects and a wide range of electives that reflect the students' individual interests. Building on knowledge acquired in the first. In the second semester, the students will take a pathway speciality and, in this way, build their education according to their individual interests within the different areas of specialization in contract or in commercial law.

The wide international relations of University of Prishtina could attract students who have studied or worked abroad. One of the most successful goals of this Master is to get a very international atmosphere, in which the students' different viewpoints favour crosscultural debates and reflections, both during and outside classes.

The number of maximum and minimum of students is detailed in the Self Evaluation Report: minimum 20 and the maximum 70. The number of applicants is around 220, which makes possible to choose the best students. Nevertheless, the maximum is too high for a Master, which must combine theoretical and practical lectures, with seminaries, special works of students and final thesis. It is very difficult to work in a personalized way to many students. Better proposed in maximum fewer students in order to better meet their learning and training.

The balance between theoretical lectures and practical activities of students is correct. There is a legal clinic and the students do practice at the Courts. Also, it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The Master in Penal Law must be more specific about knowledge, skills and competences acquired. The experts' team could suggest some as follow:

- Go deeper in advanced knowledge of Penal Law.
- Ability to apply the knowledge acquired to formulate new development of the Penal Law.
- Ability to study and propose solutions to the problems issues taking the social consequences thereof into account.
- Ability to design and carry out coherent projects in the fields of nature, structure and causes of crime, in order to build up preventive and combative measures against it.
- Ability to make proper use of qualitative and quantitative techniques for collecting and analysing data.
- Ability to communicate the hypotheses, methodology, results and practical implications of research clearly and concisely to both specialist and non-specialist audiences.
- Ability to analyse the international criminal organization.
- Ability to write reports and documents, which could help to develop the national project of a country as Kosovo.
- The optional courses allowing students to tailor their training to their specific interests.

3. Staff

The number of teachers seems sufficient to run with quality the Masters programmes. There are many professors who has full time contract. Every course has a doctor as coordinator of the lectures and student's work. Most of the academics teach as well in the LLB, which gives them a better knowledge of student's background and necessities.

A significant number of teacher's majority have studied abroad in well-known universities. The Master has 11 teachers; it is enough professors for a total of 16 courses (5 compulsory and 11 electives). Also, the number of professors is enough to take care of all master theses. With 50 students one teacher has conduct only one or two master theses. It is a warranty to preserve and increase the quality and the attention to the students in the master programme.

The Experts Team recommend that it could be very good for students and staff to increase in the future the number of professional practice or experts in some field that are very useful in a master primarily oriented to the practice. Also, it is necessary implement a real and objective evaluation and monitoring about the external activities of all professors. The balance of gender in academic positions is unbalanced. There are more men than women. Should establish a procedure for monitoring the gender balance of academic staff across the Faculty.

4. Research and the International Cooperation

The Master of Penal Law is not a programme primary oriented to research. But the students have to perform a final research thesis. Therefore, the research in the Master is not specified in the proposal. It might put some examples of research topics on which students could orient their research. It could be a practice that can be distinguished the Master in Penal Law of the Faculty of Law.

All professor of the Master must elaborate a list of topic of research every two-year term and offer at least one title for the theses of the students.

Additionally, some students who successfully complete the master's programme may continue on to the doctoral programme and, thus, an academic career at a university or research institution.

The student has the opportunity to publish their papers and commentaries in the university reviews or order publication even on line in the web page of the Faculty of Law or the University of Prishtina.

Those students who get a grade over 8 may continue their formation with PhD studies, as a way of promoting a combination between practical and theoretical knowledge in future Penal Lawyers.

Internationalization. The Faculty of Law has several general agreements with foreign universities and institutions. But there is no specific agreement to develop the Master for mobility of professors and especially students.

This Master must establish a strategic plan, which includes a strong international activity. The Faculty of Law needs now to develop an explicit and realistic strategy for internationalisation its activities, its projects and its programmes. Also, the professors and the students must collaborate in this strategy.

If the Master in Penal Law wants to attract academics staff from outside of Kosovo, it is necessary to develop a strategy to archive this goal with specific agreements and other initiatives. *Employability.* As part of the Master's in Penal Law, Faculty of Law must be committed to supporting its students in numerous ways to enter the international labour market. Building on this, Faculty of Law must offer a professional internship programme as a first step in moving towards an international career.

The programme contains internships in public and private institutions -enterprises, foundations and so on- with which Faculty of Law has already signed cooperative agreements: Ministry of Justice, Advocates Association, prosecution offices, law firms, etc. Additionally, the Experts Team aims to the directory of the Master to organize a "Job Market Week" during which already established professionals in the world of national and international enterprises and organizations offer informative and practical courses in areas such as public speaking, job interviewing, and communication, apart from specific seminars on job and internship opportunities in national organizations and international field, i.e., the European Union.

Furthermore, and through an Academic Management office, which must be created as soon as possible, students could receive detailed and updated information regarding current internship and job openings in the private and public sector, but also in academia.

Finally, improve the field of research is particularly important for different reasons. Firstly, in order to establish a high-level international studies centre, this contributes to connecting Kosovar society's interests and concerns with the strong currents of globalisation and internationalisation economic activity. It will be more and more important to have our own in-depth knowledge of those aspects of the domestic and international commerce that affect or will affect Kosovo. Secondly, to have an institution with an excellent academic reputation at an international level, and situate a space of recognised academic prestige on the international academic scene, acting as an attraction and facilitating links to the world's most prominent centres. Finally, in order to guarantee a high standard in terms of the education of professionals and researchers in these fields, it is necessary to strengthen the connection between postgraduate education and quality research.

5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The building of the Faculty of Law is shared with Economics. The facilities are sufficient to run the programme, but it must be better in

the future has more space. There are few small meetings or seminars rooms for students. Therefore, the University must make a great effort to get the means to ensure quality teaching.

One of the most critical aspects to run successfully a master and to develop the research in the Master in Penal Law is the absence of a specialized library, with sufficient books and reviews to write the research theses. Establish a library is a question of investing money and time. But now there are some ways to cut this investment and time. In any case, it is impossible to development the research without a library or to have access to online library resources.

The Master in Penal Law does not have a separate budget. All money received or captures, it manages by the University of Prishtina in its overall budget. A primary objective is to achieve some economic independence and attract more resources from public and private institutions. In order to develop their research projects and improvement plans. Teaching, research and development of students improve their quality if more resources become available. Just looking for economic independence can develop and extend their teaching plans and offer specialized courses.

6. Quality Management

The Self Evaluation Report were clarified in the meeting, writes nothing about the government of the Master. There is a general coordination but nothing more. Therefore, to evaluate the organization is virtually impossible.

According to University the Master has a questionnaire to assess annually the professors and faculty. Students must complete questionnaire paper. There are no evidences if the most of students deliver or not the questionnaires. Maybe the Master should rethink how to get the answers of the students. An online questionnaire to guarantee the anonymity of the student would be a solution, but could also apply other measures such as the student could not see their scores in the subjects until complete and return the questionnaire. In this way, it could get better information on the quality of professors and the education provided at the Master.

There is a procedure for evaluating the student combines the evaluation continues as the written exams and tests and personal student work. There is not a document containing such a procedure

for quality assurance and evaluation, the Experts Team has this evidence in the Self Evaluation Report.

Finally, it is necessary, as soon as possible, to establish a Coordination Team of Master in Penal Law with this staff:

- 1. Director: is responsible for the design and general supervision of the programme.
- 2. Two professors in charge of Academic Affair: is responsible for managing the Master programme, students and teaching staff. They are available to answer queries from both students and teachers, as well as deal with the matriculation process and the material needed for each subject. They also monitor attendance, coordinate the course calendar and handle coursework submission and academic records. It also manages the internship programme and the quality assurances processes.
- 3. Coordination of Admissions.

7. Recommendations

- 1. Having an internship programme for students in institutions and in international universities.
- 2. The Master should introduce a formalized programme of professional development and support in teaching for its entire teaching.
- 3. It is necessary established a coordinator for the professional activities of the students.
- 4. It is necessary to have a library for the Master.
- 5. The Master must elaborate a document to fix the criteria to develop the quality.

8. Proposal for accreditation

Experts Team **proposes the reaccreditation** of the Master in Penal Law study programme of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina **for three years**.

Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law

1. General Statements

Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina operates according to the laws that govern in the Kosovo Higher Education System. The Faculty of Law was created as a higher education institution in 1961. Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina has been operating as an independent faculty providing BA, MA and PhD studies since 1971 and was re-established in 1999.

The Faculty of Law is part of the European Higher Education Area and functions according to the Bologna process. The offer today is 12 different programmes of studies on different levels. They have 4-year long Bachelor Degree programme 6 Master Degree programmes of studies. The university is recognized as an institution with the right to organize doctoral studies (5 areas of doctoral research). Study programmes in foreign languages are missing at Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina at the moment.

There are not exact figures about the number of students. According to the additional documents requested by the ET in connection with the number of students the figures are the following in May 2017:

- Bachelor level: 4346+838 (active/passive) = 5184
- Master level: 355+1752 (active/passive) = 2107
- No data about the PhD students.

The current team of management of Faculty of Law is making a great effort to limit the permanence of students in the Faculty, and also to select the number of students every year, following the demands of the labour market

2. Academic, Management and Finances

Master programme in Constitutional and Administrative Law is available only at Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina. They have 70 study positions for this programme and about 210 applicants every year. The interest is very high for this programme. The Experts Team suggests that the maximum of 50 students because the human resources of the teaching staff and the facilities of the Faculty are limited to attend all students and to conducting the master thesis. Some of the admission criteria are still very flexible. The Programme learning outcomes are consistent with the programme title and the programme content. The curriculum and the programme well unify the diverse areas.

The curriculum is well structured. The course of "Non-profit Law" (elective subject) does not fit in the programme.

The programme has put more emphasis on research, helping the students learn to use research methodologies.

Some of the reading lists given to students on the programme have to be updated and the access to the literature is still cause some problem for the students.

3. Staff

In the current academic year teaching staff consists of 65 full-time and 8 part teachers according to the occupied job positions (including 8+5 professors, 9+2 associate professors, 14+1 lecturers, 31 assistant lectures and 3 language teachers). At the level of all the teaching personnel carrying out activities at Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina doctors in science represent 53.42% (39 /73), PhD students/candidates 43.84% (32/73) and MA 2,74% (2/73).

The structure of the teaching staff has be balanced. The faculty might encourage the experienced lectures to become associate professors and the experienced associate professors to become professors in order to maintain the quality. There are relevant differences among the different study fields. While the academic background is very strong in the field of international law or criminal law it cannot be told in the field of financial law.

Non-permanent staff from outside the faculty has accumulated experience in practical activities and/or in research. Every year the faculty evaluates the employees' performances.

Comment: The quality of human resources and the scientific potential at Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina is on a good level. (Many of them have MA or PhD degree from a reputable European or American university.) The transparencies of the personal records are clear. The ratio of students to the teaching staff is quite far from the OECD and European average level. The academic staff is overwhelmed because the high number of students.

4. Research and International Co-operation

Most of the scientific research appears in presented papers at conferences, in articles published in journals and books at national and international level.

There are 11 bilateral agreements within the framework of Erasmus+ Programme. The number of the contracts and the students participating in Erasmus program are very few for the size of the Faculty. There were only 11 outgoing students in the last three academic years and I have not received any data about the incoming students. The same number of students participated in Erasmus Mundus Programme in 2013 and 2014.

It is recommended to enter into more mutual agreements and involve more students taking part in mobility activities (Erasmus+). It will help the language qualification of the students and it is also suits to the EU recommendations which inspire the students to study one semester abroad. Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina could enter into other European Higher Education Programme like CEEPUS.

5. Facilities

The Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina functions in a building which needs some reconstruction. The equipment of the educational spaces is under the requirement of the European standards. The numbers of PCs which can be used by the students are very few and they are out of date.

Faculty of Law has a small library with little space and with a reading room. The library should update its documents in all fields in order to achieve the performance indicators set by international standards. In parallel with the development of the library publications, the material infrastructure should be improved too.

Faculty of Law has a bookshop which ensures the printing of the lecture notes, textbooks and of the necessary documents for the implementation of the curricula.

Comment: It is very important for the university to invest in its physical infrastructure when funds allow.

6. Students

At the appointment with the students (7 persons from the BA programme), the Experts Team found all of them very open minded, intelligent and they were fairly active. Nearly everybody spoke very good English. They seemed to be very loyal to their faculty and found most of the curricula and the academic staff very good. Generally they were pleased with the education and the circumstances except the high number of students especially in the first year. Also they would appreciate if there were a differentiation among the level of foreign language courses and also the number of them should be increased. They also find a preparatory course very useful for the future incoming students at Faculty of Law. It was mentioned that the practice should be improved in some of the programmes.

Faculty Council is the main decision making body of the Faculty which consists of 31 representatives: 29 teaching staff and 2 students (6,45%).

Comment: It is recommended to increase the number of students taking part in mobility activities especially doing a traineeship abroad. It will help the students to gain some practical experience abroad and it is also suits to EU recommendations. Raising the number of the student's representatives might grow the confidence of the students. I recommend involving more students in the Council of the Law Faculty.

7. Quality Management

The Faculty of Law pays a special attention to quality assurance and develops and improves its own system of assuring the quality of the educational activity. The Faculty also has structures and procedures for quality assurance of the teaching but it has be extended for research too.

Faculty of Law regularly reviews its courses and gathers student feedback. Although a high number of evaluation sheets were filled at the evaluation of academic staff by the students, the procedure seemed to be very formal.

8. Recommendations

• Faculty of Law should invest in physical infrastructure and facilities when funds allow.

- Experts Team strongly suggest developing international links and collaborations to support international research activities and encourage students taking part in exchange and mobility programmes.
- To involve the student's representatives much more in the decision-making processes and into management.
- To strengthen the relations with trade and industry actors for getting more information and feedback from the job market;
- The location and the traditions of Pristhina is a great opportunity for the Faculty of Law.

9. Proposal for reaccreditation

Experts Team proposes **the reaccreditation** of the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law study programme of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina **for three years.**

Master in Financial Law

1. Introduction

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of Enqa, has received a petition of the Faculty Law of University of Prishtina to reaccredit the Master in Financial Law in order to evaluate the KAA has set up two experts: Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez-Echevarría / University CEU San Pablo (ES) and Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus-Rufino/ University of Leon (ES) both professor worked with a team of experts from another European universities and countries.

During the assessment process the experts followed all the guidelines of the KAA for evaluating academic programmes. The experts were able to visit the facilities and the building of the Faculty of Law. The Dean of the Faculty of Law made a complete presentation included a brief background of the Faculty, Study Programmes offered, Study programmes under reaccreditation, Staff, Students in Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes, Quality Assurance, Equipment and Facilities, Research and International Cooperation, Financing and the recommendations of the accreditation procedure of 2015. Finally, the experts hold a meeting with three professors of the Master in Financial Law: Bedri Peci, Mejdi Bektashi and Agim Paca. Therefore, a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 17, 2017.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for experts (Institutions and Academic Programmes), edited by the KAA, the experts have written the following evaluation report.

The evaluation report is based upon a Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina concern with the Master in Financial Law of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the experts during the site-visit and the meetings.

One day later we received more documents with the complete *syllabi* of the courses, the short curriculum vitae of the professors and a complete list of agreements.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA. This is a draft of the evaluation report that must be sent to the KAA in order to give

the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina the opportunity to comment on the draft report.

The KAA asked expert to evaluate the Master in Financial Law and deliver a report with a provisional resolution to offer the opportunity to the Faculty of Law to make appropriate arguments. The decision of the expert is in the number 8 of this report and is based upon the findings, which are stated in the second part of the report.

The Faculty of Law offers a Master in Financial Law of one year (60 ECTS) for the students of four years (eight semesters) and has got a Bachelor in Law of 240 ECTS. All candidates must have the Bachelor in Law. The Master does not admit candidates with other degrees.

The meeting with professors served to confirm that the Faculty form a united, motivated and committed team with the project. They want and they have the training and experience necessary to offer and develop the Master in Financial Law in Prishtina University.

The Faculty of Law of Prishtina University has been in advance of the times with this master, because in Kosovo the financial, banking and investor systems have not yet been developed, as it exists in other parts of Europe and the world. For this reason, the authorities of the Faculty of Law should be praised for trying to prepare professionals for the future in a field that is still under development.

However, there are some problems to be resolved as soon as possible to ensure the quality of the Master which it is one of the main points of the mission that describe the Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law.

2. Academic Programmes and Student Management

In the meeting with the professor became clear that the Master in Financial Law begun in 2011. It was established to respond a present and future demand of professionals trained in the field of finance and its international projection. An area of interest that has not developed in the state of Kosovo. The main objective is to offer training to students and advanced studies oriented to professional practice. From the beginning, three major areas of expertise were established: Financial Markets, Banking and Commercial and International Fiscal System. At present the students specialize in each of the three itineraries. The Master in Financial Law is a real multidisciplinary programme intended to educate future professionals in this specific field of Law that has a great demand in the market, for governments, international and Kosovo companies and law firms. Its aim is to provide students with a deep understanding of the essential analytical tools and knowledge needed to tackle current problems in the financial law speciality; it also aims to develop transferable skills that can be applied to any career.

Each cohort has a maximum of 70 students, out of the 140 applicants, which allows the managers of the Master programme to do a selection of the students. Seventy per cent of the students complete their master's thesis in one year or 14 months. Also, a big number have the opportunity to practice in different companies, law firms, public administration and private institutions with which the University of Prishtina maintains agreements. However, a very small group of students continue their training in the doctoral programme.

The Master's programme presents an innovative proposal to meet the challenges that have arisen from the globalisation of recent years. The professors and the Self Evaluation Report of Faculty of Law insisted that the goal of the Master is to educate professionals with excellent abilities when it comes to understanding and analysing the deep problem of Financial Law in two domains: national and international. On pages 152 of Self Evaluation Report are exposed and explain five main skills and competencies that are proposed to achieve with the master. All of them are very adequate and consistent with the proposed curriculum.

The master programme is in general comparable with other programmes offered in different universities. The teaching organization is well distributed among the teachers of the master. A compulsory course can be extended and completed with another elective normally taught by the same teacher. This structure facilitates the specialization of students and future professionals demanded by the labour market, business and administration of Kosovo.

General information about the programme is short, although aspects of the assessment, exams, tests and grades are sufficient for the student. On the other hand, the information about the details of courses, the description of the contents, the development, the teachers and the teaching methodology of all programmes is enough and complete for the evaluators to get a precise idea of the structure of the master.

In the interview, the professors told that in this programme there are student who are already working and other that are full time students.

The distribution of credit points according to the ECTS is in line with the Bologna rules and the transparency about rules and requirements is guaranteed but with a restriction concerning full time studies. Master thesis with 15 ECTS is very proportional and adequate to the whole content of the Master.

The Experts Team suggest that Master's syllabus could be oriented to make up of a combination of core subjects and a wide range of electives that reflect the students' individual interests. Building on knowledge acquired in the first. In the second semester, the students will take a pathway speciality and, in this way, build their education according to their individual interests within the different areas of specialization in Financial Law.

The wide international relations of University of Prishtina could attract students who have studied or worked abroad. One of the most successful goals of this Master is to get a very international atmosphere, in which the students' different viewpoints favour crosscultural debates and reflections, both during and outside classes. The content of subjects of the Master, strongly based on EU Law, also contributes to the internalisation of the programme.

The number of maximum and minimum of students is detailed in the Self Evaluation Report minimum 25 and the maximum 70. The maximum is too high for a Master, which must combine theoretical and practical lectures, with seminaries, special works of students and final thesis. It is very difficult to work in a personalized way to many students. Better proposed in maximum fewer students in order to better meet their learning and training. Maybe 70 students can be considered few if we think about that the Faculty of Law receives more than twice applications as offered places. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a real demand among the law graduates that need to be attend. Especially the actual student could be the professionals who will establish and will lead Kosovo's financial institutions in the near future.

The balance between theoretical lectures and practical activities of students is correct. The methodological conception of the Master programme tries to connect theory and practice. It is remarkable, at this regard, not only the practical content of the subjects and of the activities, but also the agreements with financial institutions, where the students do internships. There are agreements with the Tax Administration and with the Central Bank of Kosovo. Also, it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The Master in Financial must be more specific about knowledge, skills and competences acquired. The experts' team could suggest some as follow:

- Go deeper in advanced knowledge of Financial Law.
- Ability to apply the knowledge acquired to formulate new development of the Financial Law.
- Ability to study and propose solutions to the problems issues taking the social consequences thereof into account.
- Ability to design and carry out coherent projects in the fields of structure of financial and baking, in order to build up preventive and combative measures against it.
- Ability to make proper use of qualitative and quantitative techniques for collecting and analysing data.
- Ability to communicate the hypotheses, methodology, results and practical implications of research clearly and concisely to both specialist and non-specialist audiences.
- Ability to analyse the international financial activity and baking organizations.
- Ability to write reports and documents, which could help to develop the national project of a country as Kosovo.
- The optional courses allowing students to tailor their training to their specific interests.

The experts suggested the Master managers to open the Master application not only to Law students, but also to other graduated, such as Business graduated.

3. Staff

The number of teachers it is not sufficient to run with quality the Masters programmes. But every year the master receives two or more visiting professors from abroad.

A significant number of teachers' majority have studied abroad in well-known universities. The Master has 4 teachers of the University of Prishtina and two visiting professors from abroad. For the future, it is not enough staff for a total of 11 courses (compulsory and electives). Also, the number of professors is not enough to take care of the all-master theses. With 70 students one teacher has conduct more than 17 master theses, which is too much. This situation doesn't warranty the quality and the attention to the students in the master programme. Prof. Peci has teach 16 ECTS compulsory and 4 ECTS elective, plus students' works, master theses and regular lectures in the university.

The Experts Team recommends that could be very good for students and staff to increase in the future the number of professional practice or experts in some field that are very useful in a master primarily oriented to the practice. Also, it is necessary implement a real and objective evaluation and monitoring about the external activities of all professors.

The balance of gender in academic positions is unbalanced. There are more men than women. Should establish a procedure for monitoring the gender balance of academic staff across the Faculty.

4. Research and the International Cooperation

The Master of Financial Law is not a programme primary oriented to research. But the students have perform a final research thesis. The students have access to research tools facilitated by US Aid, some of them available on-line. Every teacher might put some examples of research topics on which students could orient their research. It could be a practice that can be distinguished the Master in Financial Law of the Faculty of Law.

All professor of the Master must elaborate a list of topic of research every two-year term and offer at least one title for the theses of the students.

Additionally, some students who successfully complete the master's programme may continue on to the doctoral programme and, thus, an academic career at a university or research institution.

The student has the opportunity to publish their papers and commentaries in the university reviews or order publication even on

line in the web page of the Faculty of Law or the University of Prishtina.

Internationalization. The Faculty of Law has several general agreements with foreign universities and institutions. But there is no specific agreement to develop the Master for mobility of professors and especially students.

At the present moment, the Master offers a valuable contribution of visiting professors, mainly from Austria. This Master must establish a strategic plan, which includes a strong international activity. The Faculty of Law needs now to develop an explicit and realistic strategy for internationalisation its activities, its projects and its programmes. Also, the professors and the students must collaborate in this strategy.

If the Master in Financial Law wants to attract academics staff from outside of Kosovo, it is necessary to develop a strategy to archive this goal with specific agreements and other initiatives.

As part of the Master's in Financial Law, Faculty of Law must be committed to supporting its students in numerous ways to enter the international labour market. Building on this, Faculty of Law must offer a professional internship programme as a first step in moving towards an international career.

The programme must contain internships in public and private institutions with which Faculty of Law has already signed a cooperative agreement. Additionally, the Experts Team aims to the directory of the Master to organize an "Job Market Week" during which already established professionals in the world of national and international enterprises and organizations offer informative and practical courses in areas such as public speaking, job interviewing, and communication, apart from specific seminars on job and internship opportunities in national organizations and international field, i.e., the European Union.

Furthermore, and through an Academic Management office, which must be created as soon as possible, students could receive detailed and updated information regarding current internship and job openings in the private and public sector, but also in academia.

Finally, improve the field of research is particularly important for different reasons. Firstly, in order to establish a high-level

international studies centre, this contributes to connecting Kosovar society's interests and concerns with the strong currents of globalisation and internationalisation economic activity. It will be more and more important to have our own in-depth knowledge of those aspects of the domestic and international commerce that affect or will affect Kosovo. Secondly, to have an institution with an excellent academic reputation at an international level, and situate a space of recognised academic prestige on the international academic scene, acting as an attraction and facilitating links to the world's most prominent centres. Finally, in order to guarantee a high standard in terms of the education of professionals and researchers in these fields, it is necessary to strengthen the connection between postgraduate education and quality research.

5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The building of the Faculty of Law is shared with Economics. The facilities are sufficient to run the programme, but it must be better in the future has more space. There are few small meetings or seminars rooms for students. Therefore, the University must make a great effort to get the means to ensure quality teaching.

One of the most critical aspects to run successfully a master and to develop the research in the Master in Financial Law is the absence of a specialized library, with sufficient books and reviews to write the research theses. Establish a library is a question of investing money and time. But now there are some ways to cut this investment and time. In any case, it is impossible to development the research without a library or to have access to online library resources.

The Master in Financial Law does not have a separate budget. All money received or captures, it manages by the University of Prishtina in its overall budget. A primary objective is to achieve some economic independence and attract more resources from public and private institutions. In order to develop their research projects and improvement plans. Teaching, research and development of students improve their quality if more resources become available. Just looking for economic independence can develop and extend their teaching plans and offer specialized courses.

6. Quality Management

The Self Evaluation Report were clarified in the meeting, writes nothing about the government of the Master. There is a general coordination but nothing more. Therefore, to evaluate the organization is virtually impossible.

According to University the Master has a questionnaire to assess annually the professors and faculty. Students must complete questionnaire paper. There are no evidences if the most of students deliver or not the questionnaires. Maybe the Master should rethink how to get the answers of the students. An online questionnaire to guarantee the anonymity of the student would be a solution, but could also apply other measures such as the student could not see their scores in the subjects until complete and return the questionnaire. In this way it could get better information on the quality of professors and the education provided at the Master.

There is a procedure for evaluating the student combines the evaluation continues as the written exams and tests and personal student work. There is not a document containing such a procedure for quality assurance and evaluation, the Experts Team has this evidence in the Self Evaluation Report.

Finally, it is necessary, as soon as possible, to establish a Coordination Team of Master in Financial Law with this staff:

- 1. Director: is responsible for the design and general supervision of the programme.
- 2. Two professors in charge of Academic Affair: is responsible for managing the Master programme, students and teaching staff. They are available to answer queries from both students and teachers, as well as deal with the matriculation process and the material needed for each subject. They also monitor attendance, coordinate the course calendar and handle coursework submission and academic records. It also manages the internship programme and the quality assurances processes.
- 3. Coordination of Admissions.

7. Recommendations

1. Having an internship programme for students in institutions and in international universities.

- 2. The Master should introduce a formalized programme of professional development and support in teaching for its entire teaching.
- 3. It is necessary established a coordinator for the professional activities of the students.
- 4. It is necessary to have a library for the Master.
- 5. The Master must elaborate a document to fix the criteria to develop the quality.
- 6. It is necessary have a strategic to increase the number of teachers. This number for 70 students must be 15 or 20 teachers. Now only 4 are teaching regulary.

8. Proposal for accreditation

Experts Team **proposes the reaccreditation** of the Master in Financial Law study programme of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina **for three years**.

Master in Civil and Property Law

1. Introduction

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of Enqa, has received a petition of the Faculty Law of University of Prishtina to reaccredit the Master in Civil and Property Law in order to evaluate the KAA has set up two experts: Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez-Echevarría / University CEU San Pablo (ES) and Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus-Rufino/ University of Leon (ES) both professor worked with a team of experts from another European universities and countries.

During the assessment process the experts followed all the guidelines of the KAA for evaluating academic programmes. The experts were able to visit the facilities and the building of the Faculty of Law. The Dean of the Faculty of Law made a complete presentation included a brief background of the Faculty, Study Programmes offered, Study programmes under reaccreditation, Staff, Students in Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes, Quality Assurance, Equipment and Facilities, Research and International Cooperation, Financing and the recommendations of the accreditation procedure of 2015. Finally the experts hold a meeting with three professors of the Master in Civil and Property Law: Haxhi Gashi, Nerxhivane Dauti and Iset Morina. Therefore a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 17, 2017.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for experts (Institutions and Academic Programmes), edited by the KAA, the experts have written the following evaluation report.

The evaluation report is based upon a Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina concern with the Master in Civil and Property Law of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the experts during the site-visit and the meetings.

One day later we received more documents with the complete *syllabi* of the courses, the short curriculum vitae of the professors and a complete list of agreements.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA. This is a draft of the evaluation report that must be sent to the KAA in order to give

the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina the opportunity to comment on the draft report.

The KAA asked the experts to evaluate the Master in Civil and Property Law and deliver a report with a provisional resolution to offer the opportunity to the Faculty of Law to make appropriate arguments. The decision of the expert is in the number 8 of this report and is based upon the findings, which are stated in the second part of the report.

The Faculty of Law offers a Master in Civil and Property Law of one year (60 ECTS) for the students of four years (eight semesters) and has got a Bachelor in Law of 240 ECTS. All candidates must have the Bachelor in Law. The Master does not admit candidates with other degrees.

The meeting with professors served to confirm that the Faculty form a united, motivated and committed team with the project. They want and they have the training and experience necessary to offer and develop the Master in Civil and Property Law in Prishtina University.

The Faculty of Law of Prishtina has raised a master's degree in Civil Law and Property that responds to the needs of the labour market and the development of legislative activity in Kosovo. Civil Property Law, as cited on pages 117 and 118 of the Self Evaluation Report, has become a problem since 1999 and it is necessary to educate, instruct and train lawyers and jurists capable of offering solutions and developing legislation in this area of civil law. It must be taken into account that the Dean of the Faculty of Law -member of the academic team of this master- and another professor of the Master in Civil Law have participated in the legislative works for the preparation of the Kosovo Civil Law and the Notary Regulation. For this reason, the authorities of the Faculty of Law should be praised for trying to prepare professionals for the future in such a new and modern field that is still under development.

However, there are some problems to be resolved as soon as possible to ensure the quality of the Master which it is one of the main points of the mission that describe the Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law.

2. Academic Programmes and Student Management

In the meeting with the professor became clear that the Master in Civil and Property Law begun in 2011. It was established to respond a present and future demand of professionals trained in the field of civil and property law. An area of interest that has not developed in the state of Kosovo. The main objective is to offer training to students and advanced studies oriented to professional practice. Civil Law is a complex subject in Kosovo. This programme tries to cover most of the specific areas included in Civil Law -such as Property and Cadastre, which is important for its relationship with agriculture; Environmental Law, or the above-mentioned Notary Law-. From the beginning, several major areas of expertise were established. At present the students specialize in each of the three itineraries.

The Master in Civil and Property Law is a real multidisciplinary programme intended to educate future professionals in this specific field of Law that has a great demand in the market, for governments, international and Kosovo companies and law firms. The managers of this master degree evaluated the market -Courts and Law Firmswhile they were designing the programme. Its aim is to provide students with a deep understanding of the essential analytical tools and knowledge needed to tackle current problems in the Civil and Property Law speciality; it also aims to develop transferable skills that can be applied to any career. International experts agreed with the design of the programme and recommended this master degree.

A high number of the students complete their master's thesis in one year or 14 months. Also a big number have the opportunity to practice in different companies, law firms, public administration and private institutions with which the University of Prishtina maintains agreements. However, a very small group of students continue their training in the doctoral programme.

The Master programme presents an innovative proposal to meet the challenges that have arisen from the globalisation of recent years. The professors and the Self Evaluation Report of Faculty of Law insisted that the goal of the Master is to educate professionals with excellent abilities when it comes to understanding and analysing the deep problem of Civil and Property Law in two domains: national and international. On pages 120 of Self Evaluation Report are exposed and explain five main skills and competencies that are proposed to achieve with the master. Also in pages 121-122 are referred all the

expected results based on courses of the programme. All of them are very adequate and consistent with the proposed curriculum.

The master programme is in general comparable with other programmes offered in different universities. The teaching organization is well distributed among the teachers of the master. A compulsory course can be extended and completed with another elective normally taught by the same teacher. This structure facilitates the specialization of students and future professionals demanded by the labour market, business and administration of Kosovo.

General information about the programme is short, although aspects of the assessment, exams, tests and grades are sufficient for the student. On the other hand, the information about the details of courses, the description of the contents, the development, the teachers and the teaching methodology of all programmes is enough and complete for the evaluators to get a precise idea of the structure of the master.

In the interview, the professors told that in this programme there are students who are already working and other that are full time students.

The distribution of credit points according to the ECTS is in line with the Bologna rules and the transparency about rules and requirements is guaranteed but with a restriction concerning full time studies. Master thesis with 20 ECTS is very proportional and adequate to the whole content of the Master.

The Experts Team suggest that Master's syllabus could be oriented to make up of a combination of core subjects and a wide range of electives that reflect the students' individual interests. Building on knowledge acquired in the first. In the second semester the students will take a pathway speciality and, in this way, build their education according to their individual interests within the different areas of specialization in Civil and Property Law.

The wide international relations of University of Prishtina could attract students who have studied or worked abroad. One of the most successful goals of this Master is to get a very international atmosphere, in which the students' different viewpoints favour crosscultural debates and reflections, both during and outside classes. The number of maximum and minimum of students is detailed in the Self Evaluation Report minimum 25 and the maximum 70. There is an average of 300 applications per year, which allows to do a selection of the best students among the candidates. The maximum is too high for a Master, which must combine theoretical and practical lectures, with seminaries, special works of students and final thesis. It is very difficult to work in a personalized way to many students. Better proposed in maximum fewer students in order to better meet their learning and training. Maybe 70 students can be considered few if we think about that the Faculty of Law receives more than three times applications as offered places. Therefore, it can be concluded that there is a real demand among the law graduates that need to be attend. Especially the actual student could be the professionals who will establish and will lead Kosovo's financial institutions in the near future.

The balance between theoretical lectures and practical activities of students is correct. The Master has a practical methodology, which is based mainly in cases. There are agreements with courts, companies, airports, the Notary Chamber, the Government, and law firms, so that students can do internships. Also, it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The Master in Civil and Property Law must be more specific about knowledge, skills and competences acquired. The experts' team could suggest some as follow:

- Go deeper in advanced knowledge of Civil and Property Law.
- Ability to apply the knowledge acquired to formulate new development of the Civil and Property Law.
- Ability to study and propose solutions to the problems issues taking the social consequences thereof into account.
- Ability to design and carry out coherent projects in the fields of structure of property.
- Ability to communicate the hypotheses, methodology, results and practical implications of research clearly and concisely to both specialist and non-specialist audiences.
- Ability to analyse the international financial activity and baking organizations.
- Ability to write reports and documents, which could help to develop the national project of a country as Kosovo.
- The optional courses allowing students to tailor their training to their specific interests.

3. Staff

The number of teachers seems sufficient to run with quality the Masters programmes. There are many professors who has full time contract. Every course has a doctor as coordinator of the lectures and student's work.

A significant number of teachers' majority have studied abroad in well-known universities. The Master has 13 teachers of the University of Prishtina. It is enough staff for a total of 12 courses (compulsory and electives). Also, the number of professors is enough to take care of the all master theses. With 70 students one teacher has conduct about 5 master theses. This situation warranties the quality and the attention to the students in the master programme. Prof. Gashi, Dean of Faculty of Law, has teach 4 courses (14 ECTS) and also share two courses with other teacher, plus students' works, master theses and regular lectures in the Bachelor programme. It seems too much responsibility for a teacher.

In the future the Experts Team recommend that could be very good for students and staff increase the number of professional practice or experts in some field that are very useful in a master primarily oriented to the practice. Also, it is necessary implement a real and objective evaluation and monitoring about the external activities of all professors.

The balance of gender in academic positions is unbalanced. There are more men than women. Should establish a procedure for monitoring the gender balance of academic staff across the Faculty.

4. Research and the International Cooperation

The Master of Civil and Property Law is not a programme primary oriented to research. But the students have perform a final research thesis. The managers of the programme try to facilitate a connection between the Master and the PhD Programmes of the Faculty of Law, so that students with the best grades and aptitudes for research can continue their studies at doctoral level. Every teacher might put some examples of research topics on which students could orient their research. It could be a practice that can be distinguished the Master in Civil and Property Law of the Faculty of Law. All professor of the Master must elaborate a list of topic of research every two-year term and offer at least one title for the theses of the students.

Additionally, some students who successfully complete the master's programme may continue on to the doctoral programme and, thus, an academic career at a university or research institution.

The student has the opportunity to publish their papers and commentaries in the university reviews or order publication even on line in the web page of the Faculty of Law or the University of Prishtina.

Internationalization. The Faculty of Law has several general agreements with foreign universities and institutions. *Distance learning* through Skype and other communication means makes possible to have lectures given by international professors. But there is no specific agreement to develop the Master for mobility of professors and especially students.

This Master must establish a strategic plan, which includes a strong international activity. The Faculty of Law needs now to develop an explicit and realistic strategy for internationalisation its activities, its projects and its programmes. Also, the professors and the students must collaborate in this strategy.

If the Master in Civil and Property Law wants to attract academics staff from outside of Kosovo, it is necessary to develop a strategy to archive this goal with specific agreements and others initiatives.

Employability. As part of the Master's in Civil and Property Law, Faculty of Law must be committed to supporting its students in numerous ways to enter the international labour market. Building on this, Faculty of Law must offer a professional internship programme as a first step in moving towards an international career.

The programme must contain internships in public and private institutions with which Faculty of Law has already signed a cooperative agreement. Additionally, the Experts Team aims to the directory of the Master to organize a "Job Market Week" during which already established professionals in the world of national and international enterprises and organizations offer informative and practical courses in areas such as public speaking, job interviewing, and communication, apart from specific seminars on job and internship opportunities in national organizations and international field, i.e., the European Union.

Furthermore, and through an Academic Management office, which must be created as soon as possible, students could receive detailed and updated information regarding current internship and job openings in the private and public sector, but also in academia.

Finally, improve the field of research is particularly important for different reasons. Firstly, in order to establish a high-level international studies centre, this contributes to connect Kosovar society's interests and concerns with the strong currents of globalisation and internationalisation economic activity. It will be more and more important to have our own in-depth knowledge of those aspects of the domestic and international commerce that affect or will affect Kosovo. Secondly, to have an institution with an excellent academic reputation at an international level, and situate a space of recognised academic prestige on the international academic scene, acting as an attraction and facilitating links to the world's most prominent centres. Finally, in order to guarantee a high standard in terms of the education of professionals and researchers in these fields, it is necessary to strengthen the connection between postgraduate education and quality research.

5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The building of the Faculty of Law is shared with Economics. The facilities are sufficient to run the programme, but it must be better in the future has more space. There are few small meetings or seminars rooms for students. Therefore, the University must make a great effort to get the means to ensure quality teaching.

One of the most critical aspects to run successfully a master and to develop the research in the Master in Civil and Property Law is the absence of a specialized library, with sufficient books and reviews to write the research theses. Establish a library is a question of investing money and time. But now there are some ways to cut this investment and time. In any case, it is impossible to development the research without a library or to have access to online library resources.

The Master in Civil and Property Law does not have a separate budget. All money received or captures, it manages by the University of Prishtina in its overall budget. A primary objective is to achieve some economic independence and attract more resources from public and private institutions. In order to develop their research projects and improvement plans. Teaching, research and development of students improve their quality if more resources become available. Just looking for economic independence can develop and extend their teaching plans and offer specialized courses.

6. Quality Management

The Self Evaluation Report were clarified in the meeting, writes nothing about the government of the Master. There is a general coordination but nothing more. Therefore, to evaluate the organization is virtually impossible.

According to University the Master has a questionnaire to assess annually the professors and faculty. Students must complete questionnaire paper. There are no evidences if the most of students deliver or not the questionnaires. Maybe the Master should rethink how to get the answers of the students. An online questionnaire to guarantee the anonymity of the student would be a solution, but could also apply other measures such as the student could not see their scores in the subjects until complete and return the questionnaire. In this way it could get better information on the quality of professors and the education provided at the Master.

There is a procedure for evaluating the student combines the evaluation continues as the written exams and tests and personal student work. There is not a document containing such a procedure for quality assurance and evaluation, the Experts Team has this evidence in the Self Evaluation Report.

Finally it is necessary, as soon as possible, to establish a Coordination Team of Master in Civil and Property Law with this staff:

- 1. Director: is responsible for the design and general supervision of the programme.
- 2. Two professors in charge of Academic Affair: is responsible for managing the Master programme, students and teaching staff. They are available to answer queries from both students and teachers, as well as deal with the matriculation process and the material needed for each subject. They also monitor attendance, coordinate the course calendar and handle coursework submission and academic records. It also manages the internship programme and the quality assurances processes.

3. Coordination of Admissions.

7. Recommendations

- 1. Having an internship programme for students in institutions and in international universities.
- 2. The Master should introduce a formalized programme of professional development and support in teaching for its entire teaching.
- 3. It is necessary established a coordinator for the professional activities of the students.
- 4. It is necessary to have a library for the Master.
- 5. The Master must elaborate a document to fix the criteria to develop the quality.
- 6. It is necessary have a strategic to increase the number of teachers. This number for 70 students must be 15 or 20 teachers. Now only 4 are teaching regularly.
- 7. It is necessary change the responsibilities of Prof. Gashi, and increases the number of teachers who could collaborate with him in the lectures.

8. Proposal for accreditation

Experts Team **proposes the reaccreditation** of the Master in Civil and Property Law study programme of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina for **three years**.

Master in International Law

1. Introduction

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of Enqa, has received a petition of the Faculty Law of University of Prishtina to reaccredit the Master in Contracts and Commercial Law in order to evaluate the KAA has set up the expert: Prof. Dr. Péter Várgany of the University of Pécs (Hu), he worked with a team of experts from another European universities and countries.

During the assessment process the expert followed all the guidelines of the KAA for evaluating academic programs. The Experts Team was able to visit the facilities and the building of the Faculty of Law. The Dean of the Faculty of Law made a complete presentation included a brief background of the Faculty, Study Programmes offered, Study programmes under reaccreditation, Staff, Students in Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes, Quality Assurance, Equipment and Facilities, Research and International Cooperation, Financing and the recommendations of the accreditation procedure of 2015. Finally the experts hold a meeting with three professors of the Master in International Law: Qerim Qerimi, Besfort Rrecaj y Flamur Mrasori. Therefore a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 17, 2017.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for experts (Institutions and Academic Programmes), edited by the KAA, the experts have written the following evaluation report.

The evaluation report is based upon a Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina concern with the Master in Contract and Commercial Law of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the experts during the site-visit and the meetings.

One day later the Experts Team received more documents with the complete *syllabi* of the courses, the short curriculum vitae of the professors and a complete list of agreements.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA. This is a draft of the evaluation report that must be sent to the KAA in order to give

the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina the opportunity to comment on the draft report.

The KAA asked expert to evaluate the Master in Contract and Commercial Law and deliver a report with a provisional resolution to offer the opportunity to the Faculty of Law to make appropriate arguments. The decision of the expert is in the number 8 of this report and is based upon the findings, which are stated in the second part of the report.

Master programme in International Law is available only at Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina. It is a Master program of one year (60 ECTS) for the students of four years (eight semesters) and has got a Bachelor in Law of 240 ECTS. All candidates must have the Bachelor in Law. The Master does not admit candidates with other degrees. The Master has 70 study positions for this programme and about 30 students. According to the number of applicants a limitation to a maximum of 40 students is suggested. In general the learning outcomes are relevant and consistent in this programme. The modules fit into the coherent framework of the curriculum and the programme well unifies the diverse areas.

The meeting with professors served to confirm that the Faculty form a united, motivated and committed team with the project they want and have the training and experience necessary to offer and develop the Master in International Law in Prishtina University.

However there are some problems to be resolved as soon as possible to ensure the quality of the Master which it is one of the main points of the mission that describe the Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law.

2. Academic Programmes and Student Management

In the meeting with the professor became clear that the Master in International Law aims to provide theoretical and practical training at the same time. The Master in International Law is a multidisciplinary programme intended to educate future professionals in this specific field of Law that has a great demand in the market, for governments, companies and individual persons. Its aim is to provide students with a deep understanding of the essential analytical tools and knowledge needed to tackle current problems in the commercial sphere; it also aims to develop transferable skills that can be applied to any career. The Master's programme presents an innovative proposal to meet the challenges that have arisen from the globalisation of recent years. The professors and the Self Evaluation Report of Faculty of Law insisted that the goal of the Master is to educate professionals with excellent abilities, when it comes to understanding and analysing the deep problem of: national and international. On page 176 of Self Evaluation Report are exposed and explain new skills and competencies that are proposed to achieve with the master. All of them are very adequate and consistent with the proposed curriculum.

The master program is in general comparable with other programs offered in different universities. The teaching organization is well distributed among the teachers of the master. A compulsory course can be extended and completed with another elective normally taught by the same teacher. This structure facilitates the specialization of students and future professionals demanded by the labour market, business and administration of Kosovo.

General information about the programme is short, although aspects of the assessment, exams, tests and grades are sufficient for the student. On the other hand, the information about the details of courses, the description of the contents, the development, the teachers and the teaching methodology of all program is enough and very complete for the students and for the evaluators to get a precise idea of the structure of the master.

The distribution of credit points according to the ECTS is in line with the Bologna rules and the transparency about rules and requirements is guaranteed but with a restriction concerning full time studies.

The Experts Team suggest that Master's syllabus could be oriented to make up of a combination of core subjects and a wide range of electives that reflect the students' individual interests. Building on knowledge acquired in the first and the second semesters, in the third and fourth semester's students will take a pathway speciality and, in this way, build their education according to their individual interests within the different International Relations themes.

Although all students have a degree in Law, could be possible to admit student with a degree in humanities or social sciences. Also with international relations could attract students who have studied or worked abroad before coming to Prishtina. One of the most successful goals of this Master is to get a very international atmosphere, in which the students' different viewpoints favour cross-cultural debates and reflections, both during and outside classes.

The number of maximum 70 and minimum 20 of students is appropriate. The maximum could be too high for a Master, which must combine theoretical and practical lectures, with seminaries and final thesis. It is very difficult to work in a personalized way to many students.

The balance between theoretical lectures and practical activities of students is correct. Also it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The Master in International Law must be more specific about knowledge, skills and competences acquired (pages 139-140 of the Self Evaluation Report. The Experts Team could suggest some as follow:

- 1) Advanced knowledge of International Relations and also include Diplomacy.
- 2) Ability to apply the knowledge acquired to formulate new development of the International Relations and Diplomacy.
- 3) Ability to study and propose solutions to international problems issues taking the social consequences thereof into account.
- 4) Ability to design and carry out coherent international projects in the fields of cooperation and diplomacy.
- 5) Ability to make proper use of qualitative and quantitative techniques for collecting and analysing data for enterprises developments or internationalization of the businesses.
- 6) Ability to communicate the hypotheses, methodology, results and practical implications of research clearly and concisely to both specialist and non-specialist audiences.
- 7) Ability to analyse the international relations and to write reports and documents, which could help to develop the international project of a country.

Structure. It is necessary to introduce more courses on Asia Pacific, European Union, International Baking and Business, International Institutions for Peace, Human Development, Human Culture, Agriculture, etc. Those optional courses allowing students to tailor their training to their specific interests.

Content. In the Self Evaluation Report there is a discrepancy between the list of courses in point 6.13 (page 142) and the

explanation of courses, their nature and duration on pages 143 et seq. The Experts Team suggests that the summary of page 142 is adapted to the explanations of the following pages.

The Experts Team suggests organizing the content as follow in order to get a specialisation of the students:

- A) Compulsory modules
- 1) Governance and Globalisation
- 2) Peace and Security
- 3) Political Economy of Development
- 4) Diplomacy
- B) Optional modules
- 1) Data handling techniques
- 2) Public speaking
- 3) Report writing
- 4) Negotiation techniques
- 5) Interview techniques
- C) Master's degree thesis

To complete the programme, students must undertake a compulsory master's degree final project under the supervision of an academic tutor. Students work on the project over the course of the year, and it is assessed at the end by an academic board consisting of at least two members.

The balance between theoretical lectures and practical activities of students is correct. Also it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The optional courses allowing students to tailor their training to their specific interests.

3. Staff

The number of teachers seems sufficient to run with quality the Masters programmes. There are many professors who has full time

contract. Every course doctor as coordinator of the lectures and student's work.

A significant number of teacher's majority have studied abroad in well-known universities. The Master has 16 teachers; it is enough professors for a total of 8 courses (compulsory and electives). Also the numbers of professors are enough to take care of the all-master theses. With 50 students one teachers has conduct only one or two master thesis It is a warranty to preserve and increase the quality and the attention to the students in the master program.

In the future the Experts Team recommend that could be very good for students and staff increase the number of professional practice or experts in some field that are very useful in a master primarily oriented to the practice. Also, it is necessary implement a real and objective evaluation and monitoring about the external activities of all professors.

The balance of gender in academic positions is unbalanced. There are more men than women. Should establish a procedure for monitoring the gender balance of academic staff across the Faculty.

4. Research and the International Cooperation

The Faculty of Law has several general agreements with foreign universities and institutions. But there is no specific agreement to develop the Master for mobility of professors and especially students.

This Master must establish a strategic plan, which includes a strong international activity. The Faculty of Law needs now to develop an explicit and realistic strategy for internationalisation its activities, its projects and its programmes. Also the professors and the students must collaborate in this strategy.

If the Master in International Law wants to attract academics staff from outside of Kosovo, it is necessary to develop a strategy to archive this goal with specific agreements and others initiatives.

As part of the Master's in International Law, Faculty of Law must be committed to supporting its students in numerous ways to enter the international labour market. Building on this, Faculty of Law must offer a professional internship program as a first step in moving towards an international career. The program must contain internships in public and private institutions -enterprises, foundations and so on- with which Faculty of Law has already signed a cooperative agreement. Additionally, the Experts Team aims to the directory of the Master to organize an "Job Market Week" during which already established professionals in the world of national and international enterprises and organizations offer informative and practical courses in areas such as public speaking, job interviewing, and communication, apart from specific seminars on job and internship opportunities in national organizations and international field, i.e., the European Union.

Furthermore, and through an Academic Management office, which must be created as soon as possible, students could receive detailed and updated information regarding current internship and job openings in the private and public sector, but also in academia.

Finally, improve the field of research is particularly important for different reasons. Firstly, in order to establish a high-level international studies centre, this contributes to connecting Kosovo society's interests and concerns with the strong currents of globalisation and internationalisation economic activity. It will be more and more important to have our own in-depth knowledge of those aspects of the domestic and international commerce that affect or will affect Kosovo. Secondly, to have an institution with an excellent academic reputation at an international level, and situate a space of recognised academic prestige on the international academic scene, acting as an attraction and facilitating links to the world's most prominent centres. Finally, in order to guarantee a high standard in terms of the education of professionals and researchers in these fields, it is necessary to strengthen the connection between postgraduate education and quality research.

5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The building of the Faculty of Law is shared with Economics. The facilities are sufficient to run the programme, but it must be better in the future has more space. There are few small meetings or seminars rooms for students. Therefore, the University must make a great effort to get the means to ensure quality teaching.

One of the most critical aspects to run successfully a master and to develop the research in the Master in International Law is the absence of a specialized library, with sufficient books and reviews to write the research theses. Establish a library is a question of investing money and time. But now there are some ways to cut this investment and time. In any case, it is impossible to development the research without a library or to have access to online library resources.

The Master in International Law does not have a separate budget. All money received or captures, it manages by the University of Prishtina in its overall budget. A primary objective is to achieve some economic independence and attract more resources from public and private institutions. In order to develop their research projects and improvement plans. Teaching, research and development of students improve their quality if more resources become available. Just looking for economic independence can develop and extend their teaching plans and offer specialized courses.

6. Quality Management

The Self Evaluation Report were clarified in the meeting, writes nothing about the government of the Master. There is a general coordination but nothing more. Therefore, to evaluate the organization is virtually impossible.

According to University the Master has a questionnaire to assess annually the professors and faculty. Students must complete questionnaire paper. There are no evidences if the most of students deliver or not the questionnaires. Maybe the Master should rethink how to get the answers of the students. An online questionnaire to guarantee the anonymity of the student would be a solution, but could also apply other measures such as the student could not see their scores in the subjects until complete and return the questionnaire. In this way it could get better information on the quality of professors and the education provided at the Master.

There is a procedure for evaluating the student combines the evaluation continues as the written exams and tests and personal student work. There is not a document containing such a procedure for quality assurance and evaluation, the Experts Team has this evidence in the self-evaluation Report.

7. Recommendations

1. Having an internship program for students in institutions and in international universities.

- 2. The Master should introduce a formalized program of professional development and support in teaching for its entire teaching.
- 3. It is necessary established a coordinator for the professional activities of the students.
- 4. It is necessary to have a library for the Master.
- 5. The Master must elaborate a document to fix the criteria to develop the quality.
- 6. It is recommended that the module reading list be given; using a number of more focused key texts and consideration should be given to providing students with some on-line material on the topic.

8. Proposal for accreditation

Experts Team proposes **the reaccreditation** of the Master in International Law study programme of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina **for three years**.

Doctoral Program in Constitutional and Administrative Law

1. General

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of ENQA, has received a petition of the Faculty Law of University of Prishtina to reaccredit the PhD in Constitutional and Administrative Law. KAA had appointed Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus Rufino/ University of Leon (ES), Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez-Echevarría/ Universidad CEU San Pablo (ES) Prof. Dr. Péter Várnagy of the University of Pécs (HU) and Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum/ Baden-Wuerttemberg Cooperative State University (DE) as team of experts from to evaluate this programme, together with other programmes of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina in May 2017. The team had engaged Porf. Várnagy and Prof Falterbaum responsible for writing this part of the report, presenting the whole team.

Therefore a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 17, 2017. The Experts Team was able to visit the facilities and the building of the Faculty of Law. The Dean of the Faculty of Law made a complete presentation included a brief background of the Faculty, Study Programmes offered, Study programmes under reaccreditation, Staff, Students in Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes, Quality Assurance, Equipment and Facilities, Research and International Cooperation, Financing and the recommendations of the accreditation procedure of 2015. Finally the experts hold a meeting with one responsible person of the PhD programmes in Constitutional and Administrative Law, Fisnik Korenica. Two other announced professors were unfortunately apologized.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for experts (Academic Programmes), edited by the KAA, the experts have written the following evaluation report. It based upon a Self-Evaluation-Report of the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the experts during the site-visit and their meetings. One day later the Experts Team received more documents with the complete syllabuses of the courses, the short curriculum vitae of the professors and a complete list of agreements about international cooperation.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA.

The Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina is part of the European Higher Education Area and functions according to the Bologna process. The faculty offers twelve different programmes of studies on different levels. They have a four-year long Bachelor Degree programme, six Master Degree programmes of studies and the university is recognized as an institution with the right to organize doctoral studies (five areas of doctoral research). Study programmes in foreign languages are missing at faculty at the moment.

2. Academic programme and student management

As in the Self-Evaluation-Report explored (see page 193) this doctoral programme aims to prepare specialized employees in the field of education, science and legal professions, who contribute through their involvement in the governance structure, including the courts and the constitutional court, as well as independent institutions such as the Ombudsman. Disputes in these areas affect the fundamental values of the legal order and constitute the most interesting issues of constitutional life in Kosovo. Therefore, investing in this programme of advanced study will significantly contribute to strengthening the rule of law, democratization and building of proper constitutional policies in the country, particularly with regard to the European integration process, part of which is the Republic of Kosovo.

In this regard the doctoral Programme in Constitutional and Administrative Law is essential for rebuilding a modern administration and functioning constitutional system in the still new Republic of Kosovo. The society needs well educated experts in this field from the well-recognized Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina. And there are very few possibilities to gain a doctoral degree of Law in Kosovo.

The academic programme correspond very good to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation as the biggest and most famous institution of Law-Education in the country..

In contrast to the Master Programmes and especially the Bachelor Programme the conditions of this doctoral programme don't create problems in realisation. Overall, as the responsible person while the site visit expound, there is a good relation between academic staff and candidates in the programme. With only five students in the doctoral programme in Constitutional and Administrative Law and five students in each other PhD programmes (all together about 25 students) it is possible to organize an ambitious offer for advanced studies, individual accompanying each student.

Regarding the last reaccreditation procedure two years ago the faculty has improved the syllabus so that the structure is now clear and consistent. The programme is coherent, integrated and transparent.

As attested already in the reaccreditation procedures before the distribution of credit points according to the ECTS is in line with the Bologna rules and the transparency about rules and requirements is guaranteed.

The learning outcomes of this programme are aiming to stimulate critical thinking and creativity by providing the students opportunities for professional performance related to Constitutional and Administrative Law. The modules fit into the coherent framework of the curriculum and the programme well unifies the diverse areas. So the programme is adequate to achieve the learning outcomes.

The programme all in all is complying with high educational standards. The modules in the curriculum structure meet international standards of academic evaluation.

3. Staff

In the current academic year teaching staff consists of 65 full-time and 8 part teachers according to the occupied job positions (including 8+5 professors, 9+2 associate professors, 14+1 lecturers, 31 assistant lectures and 3 language teachers). At the level of all the teaching personnel carrying out activities at the whole Faculty of Law doctors in science represent 53.42% (39 /73), PhD students/candidates 43.84% (32/73) and MA 2,74% (2/73).

The structure of the teaching staff has to be balanced; the faculty might encourage the experienced lectures to become associate professors and the experienced associate professors to become professors in order to maintain the quality. There are relevant differences among the different study fields. While the academic background is very strong in the field of international law or criminal law it cannot be told in the field of financial law.

Regarding the PhD Programme in Constitutional and Administrative Law the Experts Team could not locate deficits. The academic staff for this programme is well qualified and the ratio to students of the doctoral programme is not to complain. As well the Experts Team could see that the academic staff is consisting not only of juristic scientist but as well of persons working in the juridical practice as in responsible positions of ministries, courts and the parliament. Nonpermanent staff from outside the faculty has accumulated experience in practical activities and/or in research.

This is a good base for research and teaching in the doctoral programme.

The meeting with professors confirmed that the Faculty is a young, united, motivated and committed team.

4. Research and international cooperation

Most of the scientific research appears in presented papers at conferences, in articles published in journals and books at national and international level. The Experts Team could observe publications in Albanian, English and German language. It would be good to increase these activities.

Nevertheless the students' involvement in scientific activity seems to be limited although there are some good examples. There should be progression in the next future and not keep the result of individual initiatives.

Recommendation: Scientific research, if possible under participation of candidates of the PhD Programme, should be increased.

About international activities it is to respect that the circumstances for realizing are not easy for a university in Kosovo general and for the Faculty of Law particularly. There are eleven bilateral agreements within the framework of Erasmus+ Programme. The number of the contracts and the students participating in Erasmus programme are very few for the size of the Faculty. There were only eleven outgoing students in the last three academic years and the Experts Team has not received any data about the incoming students. The same number of students participated in Erasmus Mundus Programme in 2013 and 2014.

It is recommended to enter into more mutual agreements and involve more students taking part in mobility activities (Erasmus+). It will help the language qualification of the students and it is also suits to the EU recommendations which inspire the students to study one semester abroad. Perhaps the faculty could enter into other European Higher Education Programme like CEEPUS.

Especially considering the doctoral programmes it would be very important to expand the international contacts and the knowledge of languages already in the Bachelor and Master degree.

Recommendation: The faculty should develop international links and collaborations to support international research activities and encourage students taking part in exchange and mobility programmes.

5. Finances and infrastructure/space and equipment

The building needs some reconstruction. The equipment of the educational spaces is under the requirement of the European standards. The numbers of PCs which can be used by the students are very few and they are out of date at the moment of the site-visit. But the faculty has made progression in the last years without doubts.

As well the library is relatively small and there is only a little space for reading room. The library should update its documents in all fields in order to achieve the performance indicators set by international standards. In parallel with the development of the library publications, the material infrastructure should be improved too. Fortunately the faculty has a quite good electronic library system.

Ideal is a bookshop installed inside the building of the faculty which ensures the printing of the lecture notes, textbooks for factory costs and the necessary documents for the implementation of the curricula.

Recommendation: The University should invest more in its physical infrastructure.

6. Quality Management

The Faculty of Law of the University Prishtina pays a special attention to quality assurance and develops and improves its own system of assuring the quality of the educational activity by an electronic system. The faculty also has structures and procedures for quality assurance of the teaching. This has to be praised. It is confirmed (see page 205 of the Self-evaluation-Report) that in relation to quality assurance of this study programme all standards and mechanisms established by the Faculty of Law, as well as at the University centre will be applied. But in this report are not manifested concrete results of the evaluation process.

It is not clear who the quality assurance process is concrete realizes. Does indeed the electronic process for the Bachelor Programme is applied as well for the doctoral programmes? Anyway the questionnaire is not relating to the characteristics of doctoral programmes. And at the moment there is no consideration of research in the actual quality assurance system. Regarding the PhD programmes there is no need to eliminate this lack by another electronic system and very formal questionnaires. Because of the small number of students in the doctoral programmes there are more different opportunities. Perhaps the faculty could choose a communicative method. But the programme should give account about the concrete results of a quality assurance process, including research and participation of students.

Recommendation: The faculty should implement a quality assurance structure for the special need of PhD programmes.

7. Conclusion

Because of this good impression the Experts Team propose to grant the reaccreditation of the Doctoral Studies in Constitutional and Administrative Law study programme for five years.

Till the next reaccreditation procedure the faculty should consider the following recommendations:

- Scientific research, if possible under participation of candidates of the PhD Programme, should be increased.
- The faculty should develop international links and collaborations to support international research activities and encourage students taking part in exchange and mobility programmes.
- The University should invest more in its physical infrastructure.
- The faculty should implement a quality assurance structure for the special need of PhD programmes.

Doctoral Program in International Law

1. Introduction

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of Enqa, has received a petition of the Faculty Law of University of Prishtina to reaccredit the Doctoral Program in International Law in order to evaluate the KAA has set up two expert: Prof. Dr. Alfonso Martínez Echevarría / University CEU San Pablo (ES) and Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus-Rufino/ University of Leon (ES) both professor worked with a team of experts from another European universities and countries.

During the assessment process the expert followed all the guidelines of the KAA for evaluating academic programs. The expert was able to visit the facilities and the building of the Faculty of Law. The Dean of the Faculty of Law made a complete presentation included a brief background of the Faculty, Study Programmes offered, Study programmes under reaccreditation, Staff, Students in Bachelor, Master and Doctoral programmes, Quality Assurance, Equipment and Facilities, Research and International Cooperation, Financing and the recommendations of the accreditation procedure of 2015. Finally the experts hold a meeting with three professors of the Doctoral Program in International Law: Enver Hasani, Hajredin Kuci and Iliriana Islami. Therefore a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 17, 2017.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for experts (Institutions and Academic Programmes), edited by the KAA, the experts have written the following evaluation report.

The evaluation report is based upon a Self Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina concern with the Doctoral Program in International Law of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the experts during the site-visit and the meetings.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA. This is a draft of the evaluation report that must be sent to the KAA in order to give the Faculty of Law of University of Prishtina the opportunity to comment on the draft report.

The KAA asked expert to evaluate the Doctoral Program in International Law and deliver a report with a provisional resolution to offer the opportunity to the Faculty of Law to make appropriate arguments. The decision of the expert is in the number 8 of this report and is based upon the findings, which are stated in the second part of the report.

The Faculty of Law offers a Doctoral Program in International Law of six year maximum for the students who got the Bachelor in Law of four years (eight semesters 240 ECTS) and has got also a master program in Law (two semesters 60 ECTS). The Doctoral Program does not admit candidates with other degrees.

The meeting with professors served to confirm that the Faculty form a united, motivated and committed team with the project. They want and they have the training and experience necessary to offer and develop the Doctoral Program in International Law in Prishtina University.

The Faculty of Law of Prishtina has raised a Doctoral Program in International Law that responds to the needs of the labour market and the development of legislative activity in Kosovo. In the Self Evaluation Report cited the necessity to educate, instruct and train lawyers and jurists capable be candidates who meet the criteria to pursue a career as legal scholars, international jurists, and international career of diplomatic and official in international organizations. For this reason, the authorities of the Faculty of Law should be praised for trying to prepare professionals for the future in a field that is still under development.

2. Academic Programmes and Student Management

In the meeting with the professor became clear that the Doctoral Program in International Law was established to respond a present and future demand of professionals trained in the field of international relations and international law. An area of interest that has not developed in the State of Kosovo. The main objective is to offer training to students an advanced studies oriented to professional practice in the international world. From the beginning, three major areas of expertise were established: international law, international practice and international diplomacy. At present the students specialize in each of the three itineraries. The Doctoral Program in International Law is a real multidisciplinary programme intended to educate future professionals in this specific field of Law that has a great demand in the market, for governments, international and Kosovo companies and law firms. Its aim is to provide students with a deep understanding of the essential analytical tools and knowledge needed to tackle current problems in the international law and diplomatic relationships; it also aims to develop transferable skills that can be applied to any career.

There are six students in the program. None of them have finished yet the doctoral thesis. It is accepted that the first of them will finish the thesis in the next two o three years. Also all students are professional and they are working in different companies, law firms, public administration and private institutions with which the University of Prishtina maintains agreements. This is the reason because is very difficult the mobility of the students.

The Doctoral Program presents an innovative proposal to meet the challenges that have arisen from the globalisation of recent years. The professors and the Self Evaluation Report of Faculty of Law insisted that the goal of the Doctoral Program is to educate professionals and future academics and scholars with excellent abilities when it comes to understanding and analysing the deep problem of International Law in a global context. On pages 120 of Self Evaluation Report are exposed and explain five main skills and competencies that are proposed to achieve in the Doctoral Program. Also in pages 210-211 are referred all the expected results based on courses of the program. All of them are very adequate and consistent with the proposed curriculum.

The doctoral program is in general comparable with other programs offered in different universities as cited in Self Evaluation Report page 209. The teaching organization is well distributed among the teachers of the program. A compulsory course can be extended and completed with another elective normally taught by the same teacher. This structure facilitates the specialization of students and future professionals demanded by the labour market, business and administration of Kosovo.

General information about the programme is short, although aspects of the assessment, exams, tests and grades are sufficient for the student. On the other hand, the information about the details of courses, the description of the contents, the development, the teachers and the teaching methodology of all programs is enough and complete for the evaluators to get a precise idea of the structure of the Doctoral Program.

In the interview the professors told that in this program there are student who are already working and other that are full time students.

The distribution of credit points according to the ECTS is in line with the Bologna rules and the transparency about rules and requirements is guaranteed but with a restriction concerning full time studies.

The Experts Team suggests that the syllabus of the Doctoral Program could be oriented to make up of a combination of core subjects and a wide range of electives that reflect the students' individual interests. Building on knowledge acquired in the first year. From the second year the students will take a pathway speciality and, in this way, build their education according to their individual interests within the different areas of specialization in International Law.

The wide international relations of University of Prishtina could attract students who have studied or worked abroad. One of the most successful goals of this Doctoral Program is to get a very international atmosphere, in which the students' different viewpoints favour crosscultural debates and reflections, both during and outside classes.

The number of maximum and minimum of students is not necessary detailed in the Self Evaluation Report. The aim is offer to the students a personalized instruction, learning and training. The balance between theoretical, methodology lectures and practical activities of students is correct. Also it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The Doctoral Program must be more specific about the time that the students need to acquire the knowledge, skills and competences.

3. Staff

The number of teachers seems sufficient to run with quality the Doctoral Program. There are many professors who has full time contract. Every course doctor as coordinator of the lectures and student's work.

A significant number of teachers' majority have studied abroad in well-known universities. In the future the Experts Team recommend

that could be very good for students and staff increase the number of professional practice or experts. Also, it is necessary implement a real and objective evaluation and monitoring about the external activities of all professors.

4. Research and the International Cooperation

The Doctoral Program in International Law is a program oriented to research. The students have to perform a final research thesis at least in six years.

All professor of the Program must elaborate a list of topic of research every two-year term and offer at least one title for the theses of the students. It could be a practice that can be distinguished the Doctoral Program in International Law of the Faculty of Law.

Additionally, some students who successfully complete the phases of the research of the programme may help to the new students in their career.

The student has the opportunity to publish their papers and commentaries in the university reviews or order publication even on line in the web page of the Faculty of Law or the University of Prishtina.

Internationalization. The Faculty of Law has several general agreements with foreign universities and institutions. But there is no specific agreement to develop the Program for mobility of professors and especially students.

This Doctoral Program must establish a strategic plan, which includes a strong international activity with the universities cited in Self Evaluation Report. The Faculty of Law needs now to develop an explicit and realistic strategy for internationalisation its activities, its projects and its programmes. Also the professors and the students must collaborate in this strategy.

If the Doctoral Program in International Law wants to attract academics staff from outside of Kosovo, it is necessary to develop a strategy to archive this goal with specific agreements and others initiatives.

Furthermore, and through an Academic Management office, which must be created as soon as possible, students could receive detailed

and updated information regarding current internship and job openings in the private and public sector, but also in academia.

Finally, improve the field of research is particularly important for different reasons. Firstly, in order to establish a high-level international studies centre, this contributes to connecting Kosovo society's interests and concerns with the strong currents of globalisation and internationalisation economic activity. It will be more and more important to have our own in-depth knowledge of those aspects of the domestic and international commerce that affect or will affect Kosovo. Secondly, to have an institution with an excellent academic reputation at an international level, and situate a space of recognised academic prestige on the international academic scene, acting as an attraction and facilitating links to the world's most prominent centres. Finally, in order to guarantee a high standard in terms of the education of professionals and researchers in these fields, it is necessary to strengthen the connection between postgraduate education and quality research.

The evaluators take as reference to issue the report the organization of the doctoral program in its maximum extension: six years. The research plan proposed on pages 212-213 seems to us to be very successful for the training of students. Throughout the years students who follow strictly the proposed instruction path have the opportunity to expand their knowledge with specific seminars, check their level of knowledge through tests of strict evaluation, learn to formulate a research project that is the guide to carry out the doctoral thesis, strive to write excellent texts to publish the results in the journals of greatest impact, expose and discuss the results of research in congresses and scientific meetings and finally prepare the text of the doctoral thesis for public defence. This calendar allows students to achieve both theoretical and practical training to become a researcher, a teacher or an excellent professional.

5. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The building of the Faculty of Law is shared with Economics. The facilities are sufficient to run the programme, but it must be better in the future has more space. There are few small meetings or seminars rooms for students. Therefore, the University must make a great effort to get the means to ensure quality teaching.

One of the most critical aspects to run successfully the program and to develop the research in the Doctoral Program in International Law is the absence of a specialized library, with sufficient books and reviews to write the research theses. Establish a library is a question of investing money and time. But now there are some ways to cut this investment and time. In any case, it is impossible to development the research without a library or to have access to online library resources.

The Doctoral Program in International Law does not have a separate budget. All money received or captures, it manages by the University of Prishtina in its overall budget. A primary objective is to achieve some economic independence and attract more resources from public and private institutions. In order to develop their research projects and improvement plans. Teaching, research and development of students improve their quality if more resources become available. Just looking for economic independence can develop and extend their teaching plans and offer specialized courses.

6. Quality Management

The Self Evaluation Report were clarified in the meeting, writes nothing about the government of the Doctoral Program. There is a general coordination but nothing more. Therefore, to evaluate the organization is virtually impossible.

According to University the Doctoral Program has a questionnaire to assess annually the professors and faculty. Students must complete questionnaire paper. There are no evidences if the most of students deliver or not the questionnaires. Maybe the director of Doctoral Program should rethink how to get the answers of the students. An online questionnaire to guarantee the anonymity of the student would be a solution, but could also apply other measures such as the student could not see their scores in the subjects until complete and return the questionnaire. In this way it could get better information on the quality of professors and the education provided at the Doctoral Program.

There is a procedure for evaluating the student combines the evaluation continues as the written exams and tests and personal student work. There is not a document containing such a procedure for quality assurance and evaluation, the Experts Team has this evidence in the Self Evaluation Report. Finally it is necessary, as soon as possible, to establish a Coordination Team of Doctoral Program in International Law with this staff:

- 1. Director: is responsible for the design and general supervision of the programme.
- 2. Two professors in charge of Academic Affair: is responsible for managing the Doctoral Program, students and teaching staff. They are available to answer queries from both students and teachers, as well as deal with the matriculation process and the material needed for each subject. They also monitor attendance, coordinate the course calendar and handle coursework submission and academic records. It also manages the internship programme and the quality assurances processes.
- 3. Coordination of Admissions.

7. Recommendations

- 1. Having an internship program for students in institutions and in international universities.
- 2. It is necessary established a coordinator for the professional activities of the students.
- 3. It is necessary to have a library for the Doctoral Program.
- 4. The Doctoral Program must elaborate a document to fix the criteria to develop the quality.
- 5. It is necessary have a strategic to increase the number of teachers.

8. Proposal for accreditation

Experts Team **proposes the reaccreditation** of the Doctoral Program in International Law study programme of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina **for five years**.