# **External Evaluation Report**

# University of Prishtina

# Faculty of Education

- 1. Educational Leadership (MA 90 ECTS)
- 2. Preschool Education (BA 240 ECTS)
- 3. Primary Education (BA 240 ECTS)
- 4. Teaching and Curriculum (MA 90 ECTS)
- 5. Teaching in Albanian Language and Literature (MA 60 ECTS)
- 6. Teaching in Mathematics (MA 60 ECTS)
- 7. Teaching in Natural Sciences (MA 60 ECTS)
- 8. Teaching in Social Sciences (MA 60 ECTS)
- 9. Teaching in Technology and ICT (MA 60 ECTS)

# **Final Report**

1. Introduction	4
1.1. Context	4
1.2. Experts	4
1.3 Coordinators of KAA	4
1.4. Abbreviations used	5
1.5. Procedure and evidence collection	5
1.5.1. Self-evaluation report (SER)	5
1.5.2. Additional documents	5
1.5.3. On-site visit	
2. Study programs	8
2.1 Educational Leadership (MA 90 ECTS)	12
2.1.1 Curriculum and Teaching	
2.1.2 Research and Internationalization	
2.1.3 Staff	13
2.1.4 Recommendations	
2.2 Preschool Education (BA 240 ECTS)	15
2.2.1 Curriculum and Teaching	
2.2.2 Research and Internationalization	
2.2.3 Staff	16
2.2.4 Recommendations	
2.3 Primary Education (BA 240 ECTS)	
2.3.1 Curriculum and Teaching	
2.3.2 Research and Internationalization	
2.3.3 Staff	
2.3.4 Recommendations	
2.4 Teaching and Curriculum (MA 90 ECTS)	21
2.4.1 Curriculum and Teaching	21
2.4.2 Research and Internationalization	21
2.4.3 Staff	
2.4.4 Recommendations	
2.5 Teaching in Albanian Language and Literature (MA 60 ECTS)	24
2.5.1 Curriculum and Teaching	24
2.5.2 Research and Internationalization	26
2.5.3 Staff	27

2.5.4 Recommendations	
2.6 Teaching in Mathematics (MA 60 ECTS)	
2.6.1 Curriculum and Teaching	
2.6.2 Research and Internationalization	
2.6.3 Staff	
2.6.4 Recommendations	
2.7 Teaching in Natural Sciences (MA 60 ECTS)	30
2.7.1 Curriculum and Teaching	
2.7.2 Research and Internationalization	
2.7.3 Staff	
2.7.4 Recommendations	
2.8 Teaching in Social Sciences (MA 60 ECTS)	32
2.8.1 Curriculum and Teaching	
2.8.2 Research and Internationalization	
2.8.3 Staff	
2.8.4 Recommendations	
2.9 Teaching in Technology and ICT (MA 60 ECTS)	
2.9.1 Curriculum and Teaching	
2.9.2 Research and Internationalization	
2.9.3 Staff	
2.9.4 Recommendations	

# **1. Introduction**

(Prof. Dr. Frederking)

# 1.1. Context

The present document is the final report 2016 about the external evaluation of nine study programs at the University of Prishtina (UoP), Kosovo. The report is the result of the collegial work of an international team of four experts appointed by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA). The evaluation report bases on the self evaluation report of the Faculty of Education at the University of Prishtina (SER 2016) with special regard to the nine study programs and the visit of the expert group at the Faculty of Education of UoP on 3<sup>rd</sup> of May 2016.

# 1.2. Experts

The team consisted of following experts:

Prof. Dr. Erwin Bratengeyer / Danube University Krems (AT)

Prof. Dr. Josep Maria Duart / Open University of Catalonia (ES)

Prof. Dr. Volker Frederking / University Erlangen-Nürnberg, Germany (DE)

Prof. Dr. Milan Pol / Masaryk University (CZ)

# **1.3 Coordinators of KAA**

Ms. Furtuna Mehmeti Acting Director; Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation – KAA

Mr. Fisnik Gashi *Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring – KAA* Mr. Shkelzen Gerxhaliu,

Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring – KAA

# 1.4. Abbreviations used

The following abbreviations are used in the present document:

ET	Expert team
HE	Higher education
KAA	Kosovo Accreditation Agency
OSV	On-site visit
QA	Quality Assurance
SER	Self-Evaluation Report
UoP	University of Prishtina
FoE	Faculty of Education

# 1.5. Procedure and evidence collection

# 1.5.1. Self-evaluation report (SER)

The Self-Evaluation Report (SER) is the central document for the institutional accreditation. The report gives a very good overview about study programs, research activities and staff.

# 1.5.2. Additional documents

During the meeting with the representatives of the faculty ET got three further documents in addition:

- 1. Tracking Cluster Process April 25, 2016
- 2. Faculty of Education Research Strategy 2016-2021
- 3. A List about digital platforms

### 1.5.3. On-site visit

On May2<sup>nd</sup>, the four experts gathered in the evening for a preliminary working dinner together with two members of KAA. They talked about their first impressions of the SER and the program for the OSV on the next day.

On May3<sup>rd</sup>,the ET spent one day at the FoE at UoP, accompanied by KAA-Acting Director Ms. Furtuna Mehmeti and KAA-Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring Mr. Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, The OSV took place as planned. The scheduled OSV started in the morning of 3.<sup>rd</sup> of May with a meeting with the management of the institution.

Ethem Ceku – Dean Deme Hoti – Vice-dean for science Majlinda Gjelaj – Vice dean for teaching Rozafa Shala – Quality assurance officer in the Faculty of Education

From the Rector offices Teuta Pustina-Krasniqi – Vice –rector for Quality Assurance and Development Besnik Loxha – Director of Quality Assurance Office – University of Prishtina

Then the expert team split up in four subgroups for a meeting with responsible persons for the study programs (Curriculum, teaching, researches, recommendations). The meeting with responsible persons for the study program of natural sciences was attended by the whole ET with the aim to optimize the evaluation competencies.

Primary education:
Hatixhe Ismajli, Xhavit Beqiri, Rrezarta Avdyli and Adhurim Rasimi
Preschool education:
Majlinda Gjelaj, Blerta Perolli and Albulena Metaj
MA_Leadership in Education 90 ECTS:
Blerim Saqipi
MA_Teaching and Curriculum 90 ECTS:
Naser Zabeli
Master in Teaching Albanian Language and Literature 60 ECTS:
Begzad Baliu, Atdhe Hykolli
Master in Teaching Social Science 60 ECTS:
Bahtije Gërbeshi. Pleurat Kabashi
Master in Teaching Mathematics 60 ECTS:
Eda Vula
Master in Teaching Technology and ICT60 ECTS:
Kastriot Buza and Kyvte Shatri
Master in Teaching Natural Science 60 ECTS:
Zeqir Shaqiri, Fatlume Berisha and Arlinda Damoni
A visit to facilities followed.

After a working lunch the ET had two brief interview sessions with academic staff and students.

Academic staff:

Xhevat Krasniqi, Fahri Marevci, Linda Salihu, Vlora Sylaj, Valentina Nimonaj, Vjollca Ahmedi, Edona Berisha- Kida, Jehona Rrustemi, Florent Bunjaku, Sedat Baraliu, Agnesa Canta, Teuta Danuza.

Students:

Erblina Sopa, Blinera Llugaliu, Vajleta Zeqiri, Njomza Rrecaj, Bege Ramadani, Kushtrim Gashi, Ali Krasniqi, Astrit Hoxha, Fatlum Hetemi, Besim Kryeziu, Naim Demiri, Avni Isufi, Besarta Bublica, Ermira Gashi, Nazlije Latifaj.

The visit ended with short consultations of ET and KAA and then a final meeting with the management of the institution.

Ethem Ceku– Dean Deme Hoti – Vice-dean for science Majlinda Gjelaj – Vice dean for teaching Rozafa Shala – Quality assurance officer in the Faculty of Education

The ET would like to express its gratefulness to the UoP respectively the Faculty of Education for the very good organization of the visit.

In addition, the experts warmly thank KAA for their outstanding support and cooperation before, during and after the visit.

# 2. Study programs

The following chapters are focused on nine study programs of FoE:

- Educational Leadership	MA 90 ECTS
- Preschool Education	BA 240 ECTS
- Primary Education	BA 240 ECTS
- Teaching and Curriculum	MA 90 ECTS
- Teaching in Albanian Language and Literature	MA 60 ECTS
- Teaching in Mathematics	MA 60 ECTS
- Teaching in Natural Sciences	MA 60 ECTS
- Teaching in Social Sciences	MA 60 ECTS
- Teaching in Technology and ICT	MA 60 ECTS

Three aspects should be mentioned in general:

1. All chapters have a common structure. At first the curriculum itself has been analysed and commented on in each chapter, then questions of research, internationalization and staff followed. Because the chapters have been written by different members of the ET, their forms may vary nevertheless.

2. Five of the named nine study programs - Teaching in Albanian Language and Literature MA; Teaching in Mathematics MA; Teaching in Natural Sciences MA; Teaching in Social Sciences MA; Teaching in Technology and ICT MA – have been accredited 2014 under the precondition that the 1-Year-Structure of the Masters with 60 ECTS generally would be substituted by Masters with a 2-Year-Structure and 120 ECTS. In contradiction with these principles the study programs of SER 2016 again show a 1-Year-Structure with 60 ECTS. Nonetheless these contradictions haven't influenced the report of ET in a negative way, because they are results of external reasons and are not lying in the responsibility of FoE. Therefore this issue will not be mentioned in the individual analyzes of the study programs.

3. E-learning at FoE: To start from the premise that FoE is a centre of expertise in the field of education the use of educational technologies is mandatory in order to answer that claim,

and FoE is certainly entitled to raise such a claim. To a greater degree, in teacher education it is mandatory to provide education of how to professionally apply state-of-the-art teaching and learning methods. If FoE commits itself to keep pace with today's knowledge environment and ecosystem the implementation of e-learning is inevitable. For the purpose of this general comment, e-learning is understood as learning and teaching that involves the Internet and educational technologies, enabling collaboration and access to resources that extend beyond the classroom.

In the present case it seems that neither substantial competencies in the field of e-learning nor the infrastructure nor specific applications are available at FoE. While e-learning is being addressed in the development plan no concrete steps have been taken so far. It has been argued that the implementation of e-learning requires investments in hardware which is currently not possible because of financial straits. While this is certainly a noteworthy issue, it does not justify the lack of taking any concrete steps so far. Because the first steps to be taken do not depend on investments. In order to introduce e-learning in the curriculum no investment (in hardware) is required. Many aspects of e-learning (didactical, methodological, organisational, technological, and economical) can and should be treated from a conceptual point of view initially.

The importance of e-learning has been pointed out in each of the evaluation reports since 2010. In contrast to previous evaluations this time several staff and many students have addressed the importance of e-learning, regardless of the study programme. Teachers have developed e-learning resources and methods within their individual settings. Obviously bottom-up initiatives emerged successfully. But it was also argued that e-learning was not as properly supported institutionally as it should be. Top-down initiatives are missing. Unfortunately, this is also reflected in the faculty's research strategy 2016-2021 which does not include this topic in the list of research themes although development of e-learning allows for a plethora of research activities (see also chapter 2.9.2).

FoE should be enabled to exploit the essential benefits of e-learning - learning anytime and anywhere and utilising the multitude of micro-, meso-, and macro didactical variety. Thus fundamental limitations when it comes to e-learning implementation need to be addressed with care. Lack of awareness of the potential of e-learning, lack of skilled support staff, lack of computer literacy of teachers and students, lack of e-content can be addressed by information campaigns, training and further education as well as research activities. Teachers acceptance and learners engagement need to be addressed by proper university policy. Bandwidth and connectivity issues, access to equipment need to be addressed separately.

Reportedly, MEST has addressed FoE to serve as a central hub for e-learning, however, it remains unclear which concrete steps have been taken so far. It was also mentioned that MEST was planning to implement a centralised learning management system (LMS) which is certainly a good move. However, it is quite challenging to select the right one out of several hundred LMSs currently offered on the market. One of the first dilemmas organisations face when choosing an LMS is to decide between open-source vs. proprietary. Commercial software offers clients support stuff and thus tends to be easier to deploy with the downside of costs for support service and of course licensing costs. Open-source software has a clear upside -it is for free. Of course, support is required and support requires investment. Skilled staff, well-educated to deal with a higher education's mission critical system – an LMS - should be available at any higher education institution. The vast majority of learning communities ranging from single primary school classrooms to large universities uses Moodle. Moodle is one of the most frequently used LMS, including business users, worldwide. Which one is the best LMS? Of course, there is no clear answer to that question. Moodle's main advantage is that a worldwide community is guaranteeing sustainability and competent support. When engaging external lecturers chances are high that they are already familiar with Moodle.

There is another challenge to FoE to be taken into account related to the use of ICT in education. Some academic staff and students comment to the ET during the visit that they don't use educational resources from Internet because most of them are in English. We believe that there is an opportunity here to launch, leaded by FoE and promoted by MEST, a call for Open Educational Resources in Albanian language. That could be a great opportunity to exploit the benefits of educational technologies at the Kosovan schools and to work together with school teachers and master students in an educational national project.

In order to promote the usage of educational technologies in education and to implement a faculty-wide, university-wide and finally nation-wide e-learning strategy we recommend to FoE:

- 1. Design and implement an institutional e-learning strategy for the Faculty and strive to be a leader of educational uses of ICT at the University of Pristhina.
- 2. Select an LMS (advisably based on open source) to manage the conceived e-learning strategy and support the implementation of appropriate policies and LMSs in any

educational domain to offer school children, students and teaching staff an integrated e-learning platform.

3. Promote the design and implementation of Open Educational Resources in Albanian Language.

We also would like to suggest to the Kosovo Accreditation Agency a recommendation for the MEST. The ET considers that MEST should offer to the country an e-learning strategy and implementation leadership based on two pillars: a) a comprehensive strategy for the educational use of ICT in general and of Internet-based resources in particular, b) a national call for design and implementation of an Open Educational Resources data warehouse in Albanian language.

# 2.1 Educational Leadership (MA 90 ECTS)

# (Prof. Dr. Duart)

The master's degree in Educational Leadership was designed and implemented to meet the basic needs and challenges detected due to the educational context in Kosovo. Students awarded this master's degree will become head teachers and leaders in Kosovan schools and will have to be aware of not only legal regulations, but also strategic perspectives and policies for the future. It will be necessary to work in coordination with the Ministry of Education if the challenges defined are to be met. This master's degree was first accredited in 2013.

The study plans were designed originally to be worth 90 ECTS credits. However, now the proposal is to increase it by 30 ECTS credits, resulting in a master's degree of 120 ECTS credits.

## 2.1.1 Curriculum and Teaching

There are interesting changes to the proposed curriculum for this master's degree, as we can see in the SER. Of particular note is the addition or improvement of some subjects such as International Education; Education Policies; Social Statistics; Organizational Development, and Professional Development of Teachers.

As the SER shows and as was observed in the meeting with the head of the master's degree and some of the programme's staff members, it seems that in the programme there is a clear idea of the importance of the relationship with the Kosovan school system. The main goal of the programme is to offer future school managers knowledge and criteria with which to handle and resolve diverse situations in schools in different educational contexts.

### 2.1.2 Research and Internationalization

The research and internationalization process is hosted by FoE and based on participation in the TEMPUS project funded by the EU. FoE has developed a Research Strategy 2016-2021 which includes developing an institutional research culture as well as research teams.

One of the challenges of this master's degree is to use correctly the potential of this institutional strategy in order to develop specific research teams and proposals related to the main topics and goals of the degree.

Introducing a subject on International Education could be considered part of the master's degree's international strategy, but the use of a cross-cutting international approach or vision for the programme could also be an interesting challenge in achieving the international goals mentioned in the SER. Developing and implementing an international strategy for the master's degree in accordance with the institutional one must be one of the main future goals of this programme, in particular in the area of educational leadership.

#### 2.1.3 Staff

Academic staff members are specialists in their scientific fields and the students are satisfied with them and their professional performance, but it seems that there is an opportunity to be seized or challenge to be met: namely, to improve teaching practices. There is an open opportunity there.

This master's degree needs the Kosovan school system's collaboration. One of the challenges that the programme faces is to improve the school mentor selection process. The school mentor plays an important role in the master's degree and close coordination with the master's degree academic staff is necessary.

### 2.1.4 Recommendations

Expert's Recommendation:

- 1. We recommend improving the master's thesis topic selection process, suggesting topics that are relevant and significant to the students. These suggested topics could come from the Ministry of Education's school strategy and from the main research or analysis topics chosen by academic staff. Topics must be focused on the real context of Kosovan schools and on the situation facing head teachers at the schools. We also recommend using a cross-subject-based strategy to select and solve the master's thesis topics selected.
- 2. We recommend defining a process to select the school mentors. It is also necessary to design a mentor training course and an assessment process for their activity according to the main goals of the master's degree.
- 3. We recommend developing an ICT use strategy for academic purposes, in particular to create an ICT-based network that helps and improves relations and knowledge sharing among academic staff, students, mentors and schools.

4. We recommend implementing a specific quality management system for this programme in order to provide specific information and data that can help master's degree leaders and academic staff in the quality assurance process.

#### **Conclusion:**

To provide accreditation to this master for the period of 3 years, and increase in 30 ECTS to 120 ECTS (two-years) in a shorter possible period.

Barcelona, 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2016

# 2.2 Preschool Education (BA 240 ECTS)

# (Prof. Dr. Pol)

The programme has undergone several changes recently, as for the curriculum, internships, research development, and more – many of these changes have been initiated within several international projects focused on the development (Tempus, USAID) in which the Faculty of Education was involved. In general, these changes seem to be of a positive nature. Also, what should be mentioned as a positive move, the university seems to emphasis other levels within its structure, namely the level of the Faculty in financial management – as a manifestation of this, Faculty of Education is supposed to have its own account (so far this area was strongly centralised).

### 2.2.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The programme corresponds acceptably to institution's mission and aims, it has realistic aims and learning outcomes are defined clearly and acceptably.

The quality, range and academic aims seem to be appropriate to the bachelor degree, and in principle, the academic degree corresponds to international standards. There is an implicit overarching didactic concept and this seems to be in some extent communicated with the staff (the main focus in on a child and its development).

The curriculum of the programme Preschool Education is well built, it covers main areas of the field, there can be seen inter-relations between/among individual disciplines, and the whole curriculum has a logical graduation, too.

The programme is designed for 240 credits, ECTS calculation is appropriate and it is stated in a detailed way.

A total number of teaching hours is still relatively high, but the structure and organisation of the programme enable independent study, too. Among the challenges that remain to be dealt with in the near future there is in particular more effective support of this independent study provided by the virtual learning environment and its effective use in teaching; linking study and research; and enriching substantially the library that is still in a rather poor shape.

In the syllabus, some literature to be studied in individual disciplines is still in English which raises a question about language skills of all students.

The relation between theoretical study and internships seems to be more balanced than in previous years. Internships are having certain gradation and are more concretely elaborated, they enable to pay more realistically attention to students' achievements and make it possible to link clearly theoretical issues and their reflection in practice.

Student involvement in the studies is partly done by the student evaluations of the teachers' work – while collection of the data seems to be done well, communication about the results with the students remains a challenge.

# 2.2.2 Research and Internationalization

One of the recent changes/strategies that is supposed to improve research performance of the staff is the set-up of so-called Research clusters (according to the fields of study, usually 3-4 staff members focusing on one theme). This initiative is supported by the international project. I find this positive, and I can also see positively the fact that research topics are mainly supposed to concern teaching processes.

Some staff members study their PhD abroad, incl. Western Europe – while they can enjoy some support from the university (some free time for the studies), they cannot get financial support to cover the travels, for instance. This makes their studies a private matter, in a way.

Internationalisation has recently benefited from the Tempus project and also USAID project that have been focused on improvement on teaching and research at the faculty. Yet, more possibilities both for teacher, and for student exchange are needed.

# 2.2.3 Staff

Staffing seems to be more stabilised.

Recent initiates were also focused on staff development in terms of their teaching skills, as well as research-related skills. Individual development plans, incl. portfolios were introduced to a number of staff members which is a positive move. This has been appreciated both by some staff, and by some students.

Staffing seems to be on an acceptable level in the programme concerned.

### 2.2.4 Recommendations

Expert's Recommendation:

1. Consider inclusion of the diploma thesis at the end of study.

2. Develop sophisticated e-learning system that would not replace traditional methods of teaching but could serve as a synergic means to support the study.

3. Improve a supply of the study literature written in Albanian language.

4. Work on linking more visibly staff and student research.

5. Support current PhD students who study abroad (those from the staff) by providing them more effective material support, incl. financing their travels, for instance.

6. Improve international exchange possibilities for the staff as well as for the students (within the limits of possible).

7. Decentralize the budget within the university and also within the faculty more clearly in order to support initiatives from within.

# **Conclusion:**

# To provide accreditation for the period of 3 years.

*Brno,* 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2016

# 2.3 Primary Education (BA 240 ECTS)

## (Prof. Dr. Pol)

Much of what has been mentioned in relation to the programme Pre-school Education, needs to be stated in case of Primary Education programme, too. Clearly, these two programmes have been developed and realised in a close co-operation. Also, the stimuli such as international projects, have been positively influencing both programmes. Consequently, the programme Primary Education has undergone several changes, as for the curriculum, internships, research development, and more – many of these changes have been initiated within the international projects (Tempus, USAID) in which the Faculty has been involved. In general, changes seem to be of a positive nature. Also, what should be mentioned as a positive move, the Faculty of Education is supposed to have established its own account (so far this was strongly centralised at the University of Pristina).

#### 2.3.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The programme corresponds acceptably to institution's mission and aims, it has realistic aims and learning outcomes are defined acceptably.

The quality, range and academic aims are appropriate to the bachelor degree, and in principle, the academic degree corresponds to international standards. There is an implicit overarching didactic concept (with the effort to emphasise child development as well as scholarly subjects in a certain extent) and this seems to be in some extent communicated with the staff.

The curriculum of the programme Primary Education is well built, it covers main areas of the field, there are inter-relations between/among the disciplines, and the whole curriculum has a logical graduation, too. The curriculum provided both obligatory, and optional courses.

The programme is designed for 240 credits, ECTS calculation is appropriate and stated in a detailed way.

Similarly to the programme Pre-school Education, also here a total number of teaching hours is still relatively high, but it enables independent study, too. More support of this independent study should be provided by the virtual learning environment and its effective use in teaching, by linking studies and research, and by enriching substantially the library that is still in a very poor shape, comparatively speaking.

Some literature to be studied in individual disciplines is still in English which raises a question about language skills of all students.

The relation between theoretical study and internships seems to be more balanced than in previous years. Internships are having a certain gradation throughout the whole study and are more concretely elaborated; consequently, they enable to pay more realistically attention to students' achievements and also they better deal with the link between theory and practice in the study programme.

Student involvement is mainly via student voice in evaluation of periodical teachers' work – results of these evaluations don not seem to be clearly communicated with the students so far.

# 2.3.2 Research and Internationalization

Research and I9nternationalisation still remain the areas of operation to be improved.

One of the recent changes/strategies that is supposed to improve research performance of the staff is the development of so-called Research clusters (according to the fields of study) – always 3-4 staff members focusing on one theme. This initiative is supported by the USAID project. I find this a positive move, moreover I can appreciate the effort to stay focused on the teaching processes as an object of research.

Some staff members study their PhD abroad, incl. Western Europe – while they can enjoy some support from the university (free time for the studies), they cannot get financial support to cover the travels, for instance.

Internationalisation has benefited from the Tempus project and also USAID project that have were focused on improvement on teaching and research at the faculty. Still, more international exchange of students as well as staff is desirable.

# 2.3.3 Staff

Staffing seems to be relatively stabilised at the moment.

Recent initiates were also focused on staff development in terms of their teaching skills, as well as research-related skills. Individual development plans, incl. portfolios were introduced to a number of staff members which is a very positive move – this was also appreciated by some teachers as well as students during the site-visit.

Staffing seems to be on an acceptable level in the programme concerned.

# 2.3.4 Recommendations

Expert's Recommendation:

Since both programmes seem to be developed and conducted in a close co-operation, and the contextual developments related to the programme in a very similar way, I can formulate the same set of recommendations as in the case of Pre-school Education programme.

1. Consider inclusion of the diploma thesis at the end of study.

2. Develop sophisticated e-learning system that would not replace traditional methods of teaching but could serve as a synergic means to support the study.

3. Improve a supply of the study literature written in Albanian language.

4. Work on linking more visibly staff and student research.

5. Support current PhD students who study abroad (those from the staff) by providing more effective material support, incl. financing their travels, for instance.

6. Improve international exchange possibilities for the staff as well as for the students (within the limits of possible).

7. Decentralize the budget within the university and also within the faculty more clearly in order to support initiatives from within.

### Conclusion:

To provide accreditation for the period of 3 years.

Brno, 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2016

# 2.4 Teaching and Curriculum (MA 90 ECTS)

# (Prof. Dr. Duart)

The master's degree in Teaching and Curriculum has been designed to prepare professional teachers to implement, develop and promote educational change in classrooms and in schools using the curriculum and the appropriate teaching and learning methodologies.

Recently the Ministry of Education has developed a new skills-based curriculum proposal for Kosovan schools. This new curriculum is at the implementation stage in Kosovo and it affects the main curricula proposed for this master's degree. Academic staff responsible for this programme are working together in order to adapt the master's degree's main goals to the new context.

# 2.4.1 Curriculum and Teaching

As the assessment panel of the 2013 accreditation process mentioned in its assessment report, this master's degree programme uses a very general approach and this may be one of the problems that will need to be addressed in the future. Today, in 2016, we can observe how some of the recommendations suggested by the 2013 AP have been followed; the approach to the master's degree includes some of the recommendations suggested. In that sense, the master's degree curricula have been changed and include new subjects and topics, for instance: Teaching: Theory and Practice; Digital Thinking; and Inclusive Education and Special Needs.

The master's degree curriculum has three main focuses: curriculum development, innovative teaching practices, and action research. Developing these three main focuses in line with the needs and context of the new Kosovo curriculum is one of the main challenges of this programme.

### 2.4.2 Research and Internationalization

Internationalization is one of the main challenges of this master's degree. The programme must have a national approach in regard to the curriculum in order to provide students with the keys to implementing and developing this curriculum at Kosovan schools. But the

programme would be incomplete if it were not also given an international curriculum, giving students the opportunity to continuously improve and adapt the national curriculum.

The master's degree should use the master's thesis credits to develop a particular master's degree research proposal based on the analysis and study of the innovative teaching methodologies and new curriculum developed. Master's thesis results could have a strong influence on the Kosovo school context if the master's degree academic staff and the school teachers use its value as a basis for continuous improvement.

#### 2.4.3 Staff

Academic staff have the challenge of improving their teaching practices. This is particularly important in this master's degree if new didactic models and teaching practices are to be offered to the students and to the schools.

Academic staff have the qualifications to be part of this master's degree programme and the ratio of permanent to non-permanent staff is adequate.

### 2.4.4 Recommendations

Expert's Recommendation:

- 1. We recommend developing training courses on innovative teaching practices targeted at academic staff members. We also recommend developing training courses on design courses based on skills and on learning outcomes and skills assessment.
- 2. We recommend exploring the potential of ICT in education as a tool for the creation of new courses or teaching and learning resources developed by master's degree students in the Albanian language. Those resources, developed as open educational resources, should be used by school teachers and school students for specific teaching and learning purposes.
- 3. We recommend exploring the possibility of using some of the main contents of this generic master's degree to develop specific and focused master's degree proposals. For instance, programmes in special educational needs, in skills-based curricula, or in innovative teaching practices.

#### **Conclusion:**

To provide accreditation to this master for the period of 3 years, and increase in 30 ECTS to 120 ECTS (two-years) in a shorter possible period.

Barcelona, 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2016

# 2.5 Teaching in Albanian Language and Literature (MA 60 ECTS)

(Prof. Dr. Frederking)

### 2.5.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The Study program 'Teaching Albanian language and literature' is conceived as a one-year Master (SER 2016, p. 149). Its special function is to allow those students finishing their studies with a Master degree, who have made a Four-Year-BA in teaching Albanian language and literature. In other words: As already has been pointed out in the Final Report of 2014 the 'One-Year MA' 'Teaching Albanian language and literature' is an intermediate solution only for a few years created for the special situation at the FoE in Pristina. Actually is planned, that the One-Year MA will end as soon as possible. Then it should be replaced by a Two-Year-Master with 120 ECTS – according to international standards. On this background the allocation of 60 ECTS and the structure of one year is comprehensible and convincing. The workload is manageable for the students. Two types of students are differentiated:

Type A - Students with a BA of the Faculty of Education (240 ECTS)

Type B - Students with a BA of (240 ECTS) of other "educational" universities with "at least 20 ECTS" of courses in the field of didactics" (SER 2014, p. 14)

Not included in this description are students with a BA with at least 20 ECTS "of courses in the field of didactics", who have studied at universities, which are not specified as "educational" ones – in Germany for example 80% of all universities. On the one hand it cannot be expected that many students of other countries will come to FuE in the next years to make a One-Year-MA. On the other hand there should be a possibility for students who have finished a Four-Year-BA in another country to make a Master degree at the FuE.<sup>1</sup> This aspect has mentioned already critically at the Final Report in 2014. In the study program for the Two-Year-MA being planned this lack should be closed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The background: It may be that some of those students had left the Kosovo with their parents because of the war and had grown up in other countries. Now they can be in an age, that they could have finished their BA for example in Germany and now want to come back to Kosovo.

Leaving aside this aspect it must be emphasized that the conception of the program is developed with regard to the named two groups of students A and B and their special needs. In the whole the programs are a solid fundament for this purpose.

Both, the programs for Group A and B, offer well balanced for both groups courses which are obligatory and those, which are selectable. In both groups there are obligatory or mandatory courses, which are identical - for example: 'Effective Teaching' in semester I and 'Research Methods in Education', 'Teaching Practice' and ,Theses' in semester II. That is plausible for the background on both substantive requirements and personal resources. Some contradictions in the version of 2014 have been eliminated (For example: The courses ,Advanced Language and Literature Teaching' (A) and ,Advanced Language Teaching' (B) are in one part identical. But the students of group B didn't have the chance to learn something about literature teaching). In other cases there are still the same contradictions as 2014. It is not comprehensible, why for group A novels 'Albanian Novel' and for group B 'Modern Albanian Prose' are obligatory. Reading the study plan from an outstanding point of view, it seems to be more reasonable, to give the students of both groups the chance to choose between both courses.

Nevertheless - the spectrum of selectable courses is wide. Students of group A have the possibility to choose between different courses dealing with issues according to Albanian Language and Literature. At the first semester each student for example has the alternative between the selectable courses 'Interactive Communication' or 'The History of the Twentieth Century Albanology'. Furthermore he or she can follow own interests while visiting the course 'Literary Text Analysis' or 'Literary Commentary'.

In the second semester the spectrum of selectable courses for students of group A has been widened in a reasonable manner. The students have to choose two courses with subject science issues and one course with special didactic accents.

Students of Group B also have the chose between electable courses. In the first semester the focus of these courses lies on cultural aspects and questions of different types of literature: 'Interactive communication (language, literature, culture, folklore, arts)' or 'Culture of Linguistic Communication' and 'Theory of Folklore' or 'Overlaps Between Oral and Written Literature.'

In the second semester the spectrum of electable courses for students of Typ B has been widened in a reasonable manner, too. Like the students of group A those of group B have to

choose two courses with special aspects of Albanian Language and Literature and one course with special didactic accents.

With regard to both study programs – A and B - it has to be emphasized positively, that the course 'Contemporary Practise in Inclusive Education' has be added.

Very disappointing is, that two two greater problems having been remarked in the Final Report of 2014 still not have been realized:

1. All courses, which deal with subject didactic aspects, are only titled in a unspecific manner. For example: 'Effective Teaching'; Communication in Education; Research Methods in Education'; 'Teaching Practise'. There is a fundamental difference between a course, which has its focus on general didactic questions, methods etc., and a course, which deals with the theory or practice of subject didactics, that means a didactic especially for learning and teaching Albanian language and literature.

2. Secondly it is remarkable, that there is no course dealing with subject specific medial aspects. Albanian language and literature, of course, must be seen under the circumstances of medial revolution. Children and adults have contact with Albanian language and literature not only in oral or literal way, but also in form of auditory, audio-visual and hyper textual texts. The students have to learn on the one hand about the characteristics of presentation and reception of Albanian language and literature in these medial forms. On the other hand they must learn how to use and present auditory, audio-visual and hyper textual texts in school lessons.

A third lack is the missing of a special course for the 'Education of Literature for children and adolescents'. This should focus on modern titels in Albanian language which have been written after the war (and not during the communistic area).

### 2.5.2 Research and Internationalization

The research outcome of the members of the department for 'Albanian Language and Literature' is not sufficient. There are few publications with the focus 'Albanian Language and Literature' in the added list of the SER 2016. Better is the impression in case of international conferences.

#### 2.5.3 Staff

As SER 2016 shows, the staff-student-ratio is sufficient. Although the number of Full Professors is small – only two are named: Prof. Begzat Baliu and Prof. Xhafer Ismaili – the staff-number all in all is a good base for the Study Programme.

#### 2.5.4 Recommendations

In order to improve the Study Program we give the following recommendations:

Experts' Recommendations:

- 1. The specification of group B should be overthought and improved to allow students with a Four-Year-BA with at least 20 ECTS "of courses in the field of didactics", who have studied in other countries at universities, which are not specified as "educational" ones to make a Master degree at the FuE. I propose to cancel the attribute 'educational'. The new formulation could be: "Candidates who have completed bachelor's studies in other faculties (240 ECTS) and had at least 20 ECTS of courses in the field of didactics".
- 2. Students of group A and B should have the possibility to choose one of the courses 'Albanian Novel' and 'Modern Albanian Prose'.
- 3. All courses with an educational focus should be specified as a course for 'subject didactic'. I suggest: 'Effective Teaching in School Subject Albanian'; Communication in Education of Albanian Language and Literature'; Research Methods in Education of Albanian Language and Literature'; 'Teaching Practise in School Subject Albanian' I propose to add a course dealing with subject specific medial aspects.
- 4. I also propose to add a course dealing with the education of Albanian literature for children and adolescents.
- 5. The research outcome and the number of publications of the members of the department for 'Albanian Language and Literature' should be improved.
- 6. The Study Program with a One-Year-Master with 60 ECTS should be replaced by a Two-Year-Master with 120 ECTS no later than 2019. The preparations for this substitution should be finished as soon as possible.

With these recommendations I propose the Re-Accreditation of the Master Program 'Teaching Albanian language and literature' as a One-Year Master with 60 ECTS for three years up to 2019.

Nuremberg, 15th of May 2016

# 2.6 Teaching in Mathematics (MA 60 ECTS)

(Prof. Dr. Bratengeyer)

The description of the study programme in the SER 2016 is identical to the one in the SER 2014. At the meeting the person in charge for the study programme (the dean), has been represented by a very qualified staff member (same as in 2014), who has explained that no changes have been implemented since the recent evaluation in 2014. It was understood that the start of the programme has been delayed. There was no reference made to the recommendations of the previous evaluation report.

# 2.6.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The evaluation report 2014, chapter 3.4, contains an exhaustive analysis including an annex drafted by the renowned mathematician Bruno Buchberger. Hence, concerning the comments on curriculum and teaching it is referred to the respective chapter. Due to the fact that no changes have been implemented so far, the recommendations basically still apply. However, for the sake of clarity the far reaching considerations will be left aside and recommendations will be consolidated.

At the meeting the study programme teaching in mathematics has been treated jointly with the study programme teaching technology and ICT. The common thread during the discussion was on teaching methodologies. It was pointed out that teaching mathematics in an appropriate way was not feasible without Internet access. Specifically, GeoGebra (a webbased dynamic mathematics software for all levels of education that brings together geometry, algebra, spreadsheets, graphing, statistics and calculus) was mentioned as a primary source for teaching and learning. In order to allow for such Internet-based teaching and learning activities proper policies and frameworks need to be in place. Teachers and students need to be provided with information and regulations concerning the use of digital resources.

The structure of the programme and the students' workload seems appropriate. The issue concerning 60 ECTS only is being addressed separately in the introductory chapter. The subjects taught correspond to a traditional perspective. In the course of the ongoing training and research programmes the chance could be taken to develop a vision of a more future-oriented vision of mathematics.

### 2.6.2 Research and Internationalization

Till recently research and internationalization did not take top priority. However, now several activities have been launched which seem to make an impact. It is expected that this will directly result in appropriate developments of the master programmes. Remarkably, at least two professors of the study programme exhibit an impressive list of publications.

Master's programmes should address research. It is difficult to deal with research within a 10-ECTS master's thesis, which according to EQF should value approximately 30 ECTS.

### 2.6.3 Staff

The teaching load is quite unevenly distributed among the eight permanent scientific staff members listed. One of the names of the list doesn't even show up in the program, nor does the person in charge for the programme. It is expected that the person in charge for a programme is a subject matter expert and thus naturally is being involved in teaching. It looks as it's even possible that students in one semester are taught by on professor only.

#### 2.6.4 Recommendations

Expert's Recommendation:

It is recommended to draft a forward-thinking master's curriculum for the new 120-ECTS study programme in a joint effort by FoE and FMNS of UoP.

It is recommended to increase the ECTS allocation for the master's thesis.

*It is recommended to increase the number of staff teaching in the programme.* 

With these recommendations the accreditation of the study programme "Teaching in Mathematics MA" for three years is proposed (the shortest possible period, until the 120-ECTS programme is in place, and limited to specified target groups).

Krems, 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2016

# 2.7 Teaching in Natural Sciences (MA 60 ECTS)

(Prof. Dr. Bratengeyer, Prof. Dr. Duart; Prof. Dr. Frederking & Prof. Dr. Pol)

The Study program 'Teaching in Natural Sciences' (MA) also is conceived as a one-year program. The workload is manageable for the students. The orientation to the established structures at the faculty of Education of the University of Tirana is a clear signal of accepting and striving for international standards. xxx

#### 2.7.1 Curriculum and Teaching

Aims and learning outcomes are formulated clearly and acceptably. A 60 credits framework is very tight, no doubt. But there seems to be a balanced combination of disciplines focused on natural sciences as well as disciplines leading to understanding of learning, teaching and management in schools. The theory and practice have been elaborated in a proportion 70:30 in the curriculum and there is an effort to follow this. ECTS are elaborated well. Internships are planned to be conducted at schools across the country, specific attention to their design is a potential for further development. Efforts to link teaching and research can be found.

Some recommended literature is in English which raises a question of language abilities of <u>all</u> students.

#### 2.7.2 Research and Internationalization

The research outcome of the members of the department for 'Natural science' is very well. A lot of publications can be found in the added list of the SER 2016 – most of them in peer reviewed journals. This is a very positive signal.

#### 2.7.3 Staff

As SER 2016 shows (p. 502-505), the staff-student-ratio in Biology, Chemistry and Physics is sufficient. But there is only one Full Professor (for Physics) named in the list of staff. ,In the nearer future one more Full Professor (in Biology or Chemistry) would be ideal.

#### 2.7.4 Recommendations

Expert's Recommendation:

1. It is necessary, to offer sufficient literature in Albanian language to the students. The department should prove and make sure this question.

With these recommendation we propose the Re-Accreditation of the Master Program 'Teaching in Natural Sciences' as a One-Year Master with 60 ECTS for three years up to 2019.

Krems / Barcelona / Nuremberg / Brno, 15th of May 2016

# 2.8 Teaching in Social Sciences (MA 60 ECTS)

(Prof. Dr. Frederking)

# 2.8.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The Study program 'Teaching Social Sciences' (MA) is conceived as a one-year program (SER 2014, p. 238). Its special function is to allow those students finishing their studies with a Master degree, who have made a Four-Year-BA in Teaching Social Sciences. In other words: As already has been pointed out in the Final Report of 2014 the 'One-Year MA' 'Social Sciences' is an intermediate solution only for a few years created for the special situation at the FoE in Pristina. Actually is planned, that the One-Year MA will end as soon as possible. Then it should be replaced by a Two-Year-Master with 120 ECTS – according to international standards. On this background the allocation of 60 ECTS and the structure of one year is comprehensible and convincing. The workload is manageable for the students. The orientation to the established structures at the faculty of Education of the University of Tirana is a clear signal of accepting and striving for international standards.

Two Specifications of 'Teaching in Social Sciences' (SER 2016, 239ff.) are differentiated:

History and Civic Education
History

Both - the modul plans of 'History and Civic Education' (3) (SER 2016, 293ff.) and 'History' (4) (SER 2014, 314ff.)) are convincing.

The structure of the two curricula is very clear and convincing. Both programs offer courses, which are obligatory and those, which are selectable (SER 2014, p. 293-333) in a well balanced way.

Very reasonable are the specific accents of both curricula. On the one hand special obligatory courses for civic education (1) like 'Teaching and Learning civic Education' or 'History of Kosovo. Cent. XX-XXI' (SER 2016, 293) make students familiar with the specific issues and challenges of the study specification. On the other hand students can learn in a special obligatory course for history (2) like 'Wars and conflicts in Europe in the twentieth century' (SER 2016, 313) more central facets of history itself.

A remarkable positive aspect also is, that the spectrum of selectable courses is wide. In both curricula there are identical courses in the selectable area. For example in semester I students of (3) and (4) at first can choose between the courses 'The history of civilization in ancient and medieval times' and 'The history of modern and contemporary civilizations' and secondly between 'World politics - trends and transformations' and 'Globalization and cultural diversity' (in the curriculum of (4) the Albanian formulation must be replaced by the English version – I recommended it already in the Final Report of 2014).

Although the structure of the curriculum essentially is convincing, there is one problem to be pointed out: It is remarkable, that there is no course dealing with subject specific medial aspects. The students have to learn on the one hand about the characteristics of presentation and reception of historical issues or themes belonging to civic education in these medial forms. On the other hand they must learn how to use and present digital media in school lessons and to use for example audiovisual documents about historical themes.

#### 2.8.2 Research and Internationalization

The research outcome of the members of the department for 'History' is not sufficient. There are no publications to be found in the added list of the SER 2016.

### 2.8.3 Staff

As SER 2016 shows, the staff-student-ratio is sufficient. But there is no Full Professor named in the list of staff, only five Assistant Professors. In the nearer future at minimum one Full Professor is necessary.

### 2.8.4 Recommendations

Expert's Recommendation:

#### In order to improve the Study Program I formulate three recommendations.

- 1. I propose to add a course dealing with subject specific medial aspects.
- 2. The research outcome and the number of publications of the members of the department for 'History / History and Civic Education' should be improved.

3. The Study Program with a One-Year-Master with 60 ECTS should be replaced by a Two-Year-Master with 120 ECTS no later than 2019. The preparations for this substitution should be finished as soon as possible.

With these recommendations I propose the Re-Accreditation of the Master Programs "Teaching Social sciences/History and Civic Education" (3) and "Teaching Social sciences/History" (4) as One-Year Masters with 60 ECTS for three years up to 2019.

Nuremberg, 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2016

# 2.9 Teaching in Technology and ICT (MA 60 ECTS)

### (Prof. Dr. Bratengeyer)

The description of the study programme in the SER 2016 is identical to the one in the SER 2014. The only difference is in chapter 8.13. of SER 2016. In this current report the overview of the programme also includes the names of the responsible professors for each of the main subject. At the meeting the person in charge for the study programme explained that no changes have been implemented since the recent evaluation in 2014. Hence, the following paragraphs in chapter 2.9.1 are in line with those from the evaluation report 2014, except for current findings which have been included.

#### 2.9.1 Curriculum and Teaching

The study programme 'Master in Teaching Technology and ICT' (MA) is conceived as a oneyear programme (see SER 2014 and 2016). Its special function is to allow those students finishing their studies with a master's degree, who have completed a four-year BA (240 ECTS). In other words: the '60 ECTS one-year MA' is an intermediate solution only for a few years created for the special situation at the Faculty of Education in Prishtina.

The curriculum focusses, broadly speaking, on learning and teaching methods in general and addresses selective topics in the field of information technology (programming, computer networks, ...) and technology (energy efficiency, environmental protection, advanced materials...) which is according to the aims and mission statement of the faculty. The technology-related topics seem to be selected wisely, given the broad spectrum of possible topics. At a first glance, some ICT-related subjects which can be considered as crucial elements of a modern curriculum seemed to be missing. However, it has been assured that those subjects like data security, mobile computing, or copyright law have been addressed sufficiently in the bachelor programme 'Technology-Informatics' the completion of which is mandatory.

There is one subject which immediately suggests itself to be included. The subject Educational Technologies and Electronic Learning is taught in the Teaching and Curriculum master's programme, it should be taught in the technology and ICT programme too.

A lack of literature in Albanian language was mentioned frequently, both by teachers and students.

#### 2.9.2 Research and Internationalization

Research and Internationalisation has been developed in a positive way by means of two initiatives. Through USAID-TLP project research communities have been established and through TEMPUS project training programmes have been implemented. Staff involved in the study programme is also involved in USAID-TLP projects.

Both initiatives seem to come to fruition. Support from University of Indiana allows for using their learning management system (Canvas), which can be seen as an intermediate solution for teachers offering online services to their students. It is also quite helpful for becoming more familiar with e-learning activities and meet current needs. Eventually, FoE needs to run its own learning management system.

Development of e-learning allows for a plethora of research activities. Applied research in this field can yield many benefits, ranging from drafting theoretical concepts to practically implementing hard- and software like a learning management system or communication tools. This field of research can include both target groups, staff and students. Master's students can contribute to develop the field of e-learning by writing appropriate thesis. However, the allocation of only 10 ECTS for a research-oriented master's thesis may not be sufficient.

The development of e-learning can be a challenge. Thus learning from leading researchers is advisable and "*The SAGE Handbook of E-learning Research*" (2<sup>nd</sup> edition, edited by Caroline Haythornthwaite, Sage Publications Ltd., 2016), focusing on technology, theory, practice, pedagogy, and methods of analysis can make a valuable contribution to the faculty's research ambitions.

Online access to scientific and scholarly information is provided in a free and unrestricted way by the Open Access (OA) initiative. OA repositories should be made accessible to teachers and students.

#### 2.9.3 Staff

A lack of staff has been reported in as much as staff complained about too much workload, i.e. too many students to be supervised. According to the programme overview 8 staff are engaged in the programme, 7 full time, 1 part time. According to the CVs of the permanent scientific staff teaching in the programme only one lecturer has a sound background in ICT. Teaching this programme on master level, however, requires that substantial professional expertise is represented at FoE. This should be considered when hiring new staff.

Fortunately, staff has been undergoing advanced training which is a very positive move. Students have reported that they were quite satisfied with the teaching performances of their teachers, also their flexible and open way of communication was emphasised. Nonetheless, even more training was on the wish list of the teachers including support for connecting with experienced teachers, funds for participating in further training, and last not least institutional support for e-learning.

#### **2.9.4 Recommendations**

Expert's Recommendation:

It is recommended to adjust the current curriculum by integrating e-learning resp. blended learning. The subject Educational Technologies and Electronic Learning, which is taught in the Teaching and Curriculum master's programme, should be included.

It is recommended to implement a Learning Management System (e.g. the open source LMS Moodle) allowing for introducing blended learning in some courses and thus also introducing contemporary teaching methods. This bottom-up approach is meant as a first step to support the pending strategic approach in line with the development plan (see introduction).

It is recommended to continue to train staff and to hire new staff with substantial computer literacy and sound ICT background to allow for establishing comprehensive professional expertise at the faculty.

It is recommended to include and even focus on e-learning-based research activities.

It is recommended to increase the ECTS allocation for the master's thesis.

It is recommended to unlock the potential of "Open Access" to the faculty allowing for publishing at nocost and accessing literature free of charge. Librarians need to be updated about the potential of OA.

With these recommendations the accreditation of the study programme 'Master in Teaching Technology and ICT' for three years is proposed (the shortest period possible, until the 120-ECTS programme is in place, and limited to specified target groups).

Krems, 15<sup>th</sup> of May 2016