

**Re-accreditation of Bachelor Program “Turkish Language and Literature”,
Faculty of Philology, University of Prishtina
Final report**

Team Members:

Barbara Kerovec

Vjeran Kursar

The statements and observations in this report on the Department of Turkish Language and Literature are based on:

- (a) Self-Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Philology (University of Prishtina “Hasan Prishtina”) from 2015 (hereinafter: SER), particularly the Study Program: BA in Turkish Language and Literature (pp. 313-390)
- (b) Expert Review of the Faculty of Philology of the University of Prishtina, Final Report, from 2010 (pp. 29-33)
- (c) Report of the expert team in Accreditation inspection of the University of Prishtina Faculty of Philology 2013 (pp. 45-49)
- (d) Annex UP Philology 2016: Department of Turkish Language and Literature - 6 curricula vitae (Ergin Jable, Esin Hudaverdi, Suzana Canhasi, Nebahat Sulçevsi, Nuran Muhaxheri, Salih Okumuş)
- (e) Annex UP Philology 2016: Department of Turkish Language and Literature – 47 syllabi
- (f) Annex UP Philology 2016: Plan for implementation of recommendation from the last institutional accreditation (July 2013)
- (g) Annex UP Philology 2016: Projects International co-operation of the Faculty of philology
- (h) Annex UP Philology 2016: Scientific work and Field of expertise
- (i) Findings collected during the site-visit of two experts, Asst. Prof. dr. Barbara Kerovec (University of Zagreb, Croatia) and Asst. Prof. dr. Vjeran Kursar (University of Zagreb, Croatia), on 10 June 2016. During the site-visit interviews were held with a) representatives of the management of the Faculty, including Asst. Prof. dr. Nysret Krasniqi (Vice dean for Academic affairs), Asst. Prof. dr. Albulena Blakaj-Gashi (Vice dean for Sciences), M.Sc. Besfort Krasniqi (Secretary), and M.Sc. Shpëtim Elezi (Coordinator of Faculty for Academic Development), b) representatives of the Department of Turkish Language and Literature, including Asst. Prof. dr. Nuran Muhaxheri, Assoc. Prof. dr. Ergin Jable and Isa Sulçevsi (PhD Candidate), c) members of academic staff of the Department of Turkish Language and Literature, including Assoc. Prof. dr. Suzana Canhasi, Assoc. Prof. dr. Salih Okumuş, and M.Sc. Nebahat Sulçevsi, and d) student representatives of the same department. Members of KAA present during the meetings were Elmi Kelmendi (Senior Legal Officer) and Shkelzen Gërzhaliu (Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring).

Introductory remarks

Department of Turkish Language and Literature (hereinafter: Department) was established in 1989 in order to meet the needs of the Turkish-speaking national community in Kosovo. The great majority of the students have Turkish as a first language (according to the information given by the staff at the meeting, there is a small number of non-native Turkish speakers), and courses are delivered in Turkish language. Before its establishment, the Department was a part of the Department of Oriental studies, which today exists as a separate unit. The Department of Orientalistics also delivers courses of Turkish language, but from a zero-level. Therefore the two departments do not overlap in their programs nor do they share the same body of interested candidates.

Academic program

Bachelor program of the Department lasts 4 years, which allows the graduates to teach at state and private schools (where Turkish is taught as a first language) on both, elementary and secondary level. Although the majority of the graduates in the Bachelor program is engaged as school teachers, the Bachelor program with its courses of Turkish and Ottoman language, Turkish literature, folkloristics and history courses opens the way for various fields of occupation such as officials, researchers, translators or interpreters in central institutions and local administration, archives, media, cultural institutions and business enterprises. This wide specter of employment possibilities is certainly one of the strong sides of the program which proves its practical character, especially considering the national structure of Kosovo, history of the region and a collection of Ottoman documents and manuscripts in the National Library of Kosovo. Given these facts, it can be claimed that the study program was compiled in compliance with the guiding mission principles of the Faculty: higher education of the youth in humanities and philological sciences, education of professionals in different disciplines, and education of translators and interpreters for the needs of society and institutions.

The program's range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree and the academic degree corresponds to international standards. While compiling BA program, the Department has taken as models Turkish universities such as İstanbul Üniversitesi, Ankara Üniversitesi and Ege Üniversitesi.

The allocation of ECTS is appropriate and the workload required for the academic program is manageable for students. The students have in average 20 hours of classes per week (exception are students of the first year with 24 hours of classes per week), which covers about 40% of the general workload. Therefore, the structure of the program leaves enough time for independent study.

The ratio of academic staff to students can be considered as privileged. According to the data in the SER (p. 315, 702), the Department has 6 full-time and 2 part-time staff members, and 20-30 students enter the program every year. Total number of students at the Department is around 70-80. These numbers show that the staff-student ratio is about 1:9/10.

Recommendations:

1. On the first year of the program it seems that there is a gap between the course Turkish Phonetics (SER, p. 314) and Morphology of Turkish language I, i.e. that phonology is missing. The name of this discipline should be added either to the first or to the second course (for example: Turkish Phonetics and Phonology).
2. As observed from one of the learning outcomes for the course Phonetics of Turkish language (SER, p. 325), Turkish is being classified as an Ural-Altaic language. Since the hypothesis of genetically relatedness of Ural and Altay languages is widely abandoned and

- considered as outdated in contemporary linguistic research, the classification of Turkish as an Ural-Altaic language in the program should be reconsidered.
3. The expert team observed that among the required literature for all courses almost no non-Turkish author is offered. It is understandable that the program relies mostly on Turkish sources/authors, but the opinion of the expert team is that including of works of non-Turkish scientists who are renowned in the field of Turkish studies would broaden perspectives on the subject matters, enrich the program with different methods of the research and gain access to international standards. Additionally, the literature in languages other than Turkish would strengthen the students' knowledge of foreign languages, especially of English which is considered to be lingua franca of the scientific community. Inclusion of foreign authors and literature in foreign languages would also be helpful to students' integration into international science scene of the respective field.
 4. Some of the learning outcomes on both program level and course level should be reformulated in the way that they clearly show what graduates will be able to do (the use of verbs such as *learn, adopt, be aware of* etc. and structures such as *the student is informed / introduced* (teacher's perspective) is not recommendable when formulating learning outcomes; instead, active verbs such as *explain, describe, translate* etc. should be used. Precise formulation of learning outcomes is necessary to make qualifications comparable across sectors and countries.
 5. Concerning the syllabus of the course "General Turkish history", we find inclusion of the Sumerians into the Turkish history scientifically unfounded, and recommend the instructor to focus strictly on the history of Turkic peoples. In this respect, the bibliography of the course should be updated as well.

In the response sent on 23 June 2016 by the Department of Turkish Language and Literature via KAA, the expert team was informed that the Department has already taken into consideration the recommendations of the Expert Team and has already submitted to the Dean's office the revised syllabi and course descriptions as suggested by the Expert Team.

Academic staff

The Department has an adequate proportion of permanent staff and appropriate proportions of permanent and external staff. According to the data in the SER (p. 315), the Department has 6 full-time staff members: 1 full professor, 2 associate professors, 2 assistant professors and 1 assistant. As part-time staff members the Department has 2 PhD candidates. The qualifications of the academic staff are appropriate to the positions they hold within the institution according to the basic criteria. The history classes, however, ideally should be taught by the experts in the history field. We hope that the Department will consider hiring an appropriate expert in the future, perhaps in cooperation with the Department of Orientalistics, which has a similar problem. The other option might be cooperation with the Department of History of the Faculty of Philosophy.

During the meeting of the expert team with student representatives, students expressed their high motivation and interest for the study, which is, according to their claims, largely enhanced by professionalism and helpfulness of the academic staff.

Research and International co-operation

According to the information given during the site-visit, the teaching staff is involved in research activities which feed back into teaching and course contents. The Department organizes international conferences in collaboration with Turkish universities or institutions and encourages

students to attend them and participate in their organization, which aims at fostering research and creative skills among students. International co-operation of the Department is oriented mostly towards Turkish universities and institutions (formal agreement with the University of Sakarya, formal co-operation with the university of Trakya, and informal co-operations with the Gazi University, Başkent University, Turkish Language Institute and Turkish language center TÖMER, Mevlana Exchange Program), and is realized through students' and teachers' exchange, conference organization, and seminars on teaching methodologies.

Recommendation:

Although intensive co-operation with Turkish universities and institutions is natural and important, it is strongly recommended that the Department broaden its research activities and knowledge transfer by widening international co-operation towards European universities and institutions. The Department should encourage its staff and students to participate in exchange programs such as ERASMUS or to benefit from agreements with European universities signed on the level of the Faculty of Philology or within the framework of International Agreements of the University of Prishtina.

In the comments sent on 23 June 2016 by the Department of Turkish Language and Literature via KAA, the Department made clear that it holds the same opinion regarding the recommendation of the Expert Team related to widening international co-operation towards European universities and institutions. Nevertheless, the Department stressed the fact that the regional circumstances pertaining to the free movement of the Kosovo citizens are not, in most cases, propitious to such initiatives. The Department furthermore explained that, in addition, the economic conditions of the majority of Kosovo students have not allowed them to go abroad as part of the academic mobility. As a near solution to the first problem, the Department sees the Council of Europe's latest report in support of visa liberalization for the Kosovo citizens, which should create favorable conditions for the free movement of the Kosovo citizens and consequently facilitate new contacts with regional and European academic institutions. As a solution to the second problem, the Department noted that the ratification of the Stabilization and Association Agreement (SAA) between Kosovo and the European Union (EU) in April of this year would pave Kosovo's path to launch EU membership talks, which would also enable the country's institutions to have access to EU funds. Consequently, students will have the opportunity to enjoy various EU scholarship funds, which should enable them to join the exchange student programs available.

Final recommendation for Accreditation Decision:

We recommend re-accreditation of the Bachelor Program "Turkish Language and Literature" for 3 years period.

Re-accreditation of Bachelor Program “Orientalistics”

Faculty of Philology, University of Prishtina

Final report

Team members:

Barbara Kerovec

Vjeran Kursar

The statements and observations in this report on the Department of Orientalistics are based on:

- (a) Self-Evaluation Report of the Faculty of Philology (University of Prishtina “Hasan Prishtina”) from 2015 (hereinafter: SER), particularly the Study Program: BA in Orientalistics (pp. 392-472)
- (b) Expert Review of the Faculty of Philology of the University of Prishtina, Final Report, from 2010 (p. 34-37)
- (c) Report of the expert team in Accreditation inspection of the University of Prishtina Faculty of Philology 2013 (p. 49-54)
- (d) Annex UP Philology 2016: Department of Orientalistics - 5 curricula vitae (Isa Memishi, Abdullah Rexhepi, Zeqiye Xhafae, Jahja Ondozi, Abdullah Hamiti)
- (e) Annex UP Philology 2016: Department of Orientalistics – 61 syllabi
- (f) Annex UP Philology 2016: Plan for implementation of recommendation from the last institutional accreditation (July 2013)
- (g) Annex UP Philology 2016: Projects International co-operation of the Faculty of philology
- (h) Annex UP Philology 2016: Scientific work and Field of expertise
- (i) findings collected during the site-visit of two experts, Asst. Prof. dr. Barbara Kerovec (University of Zagreb, Croatia) and Asst. Prof. dr. Vjeran Kursar (University of Zagreb, Croatia), on 10 June 2016. During the site-visit interviews were held with a) representatives of the management of the Faculty, including Asst. Prof. dr. Nysret Krasniqi (Vice dean for Academic affairs), Asst. Prof. dr. Albulena Blakaj-Gashi (Vice dean for Sciences), M.Sc. Besfort Krasniqi (Secretary), and M.Sc. Shpëtim Elezi (Coordinator of Faculty for Academic Development), b) representatives of the Department of Orientalistics, including Prof. Dr. Isa Memishi, Prof. Dr. Abdulla Hamiti, c) members of academic staff of the Department of Orientalistics, including Dr. Abdullah Rexhepi, M.Sc. Jahja Ondozi, and M.Sc. Zekije Xhafçe, and d) student representatives of the same department.
Members of KAA present during the meetings were Elmi Kelmendi (Senior Legal Officer) and Shkelzen Gërxhaliu (Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring).

Introductory remarks

The Department for Oriental Studies was established in 1973 (Expert review, 2010, p. 34). Originally part of the Oriental Studies department, the Department of Turkish Language and Literature was established as a separate body in 1989 in order to meet the needs of the Turkish-speaking national group in Kosovo. The separation of the Department of Turkish Language and Literature and Department of Oriental Studies makes sense in that both departments deal with a fundamentally different body of students and apply also different didactics of language teaching (first language vs. foreign language). Although these two departments are still 'genetically' close to each other, they do not – in general – share common courses. Furthermore, in contrast to the Department of Turkish Language and Literature, languages (here Arabic and Turkish) are taught as foreign languages (starting from the “zero level”).

Academic program

Bachelor program of the Department lasts 4 years, which allows the graduates to teach Arabic and Turkish language, work in institutes of Albanology, History, and Ethnography, bureaus of cultural protection and heritage, agencies of state archives, Ministry of Science, and Ministry of Foreign Affairs, according to the SER 2015 (p. 394). In addition, according to the interview with the staff, the graduates are expected to find jobs as translators, in media, business enterprises, etc. This wide specter of employment possibilities is certainly one of the strong sides of the program which proves its practical character, especially considering the national structure of Kosovo, history of the region and a collection of Ottoman documents and manuscripts in the National Library of Kosovo. Given these facts, it can be claimed that the study program was compiled in compliance with the guiding mission principles of the Faculty: higher education of the youth in humanities and philological sciences, education of professionals in different disciplines, and education of translators and interpreters for the needs of society and institutions.

The program's range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree and the academic degree partially corresponds to international standards, if the concept of the Middle East Studies, which is prevalent in EU and US is to be consulted. The Department is still primarily focused on philology and in part on literature, while the EU and US practice is more open towards cultural studies, history, etc.

The allocation of ECTS is appropriate and the workload required for the academic program is manageable for students. The ratio of academic staff to students is at the moment barely sufficient due to the retirement of two full-time professors and the death of one full-time professor, but this is expected to be changed in near future when several perspective doctoral students and assistants are expected to graduate and be hired by the department. Since two of the graduate students and potential staff members are supposed to graduate in the field of History according to the interview with the staff, this might open the way to further adapt to the EU and US standards and additionally increase the number of cultural and historical courses in the program. The department usually accepts around 30 students each year.

Recommendations:

1. As was suggested in the 2013 Expert report, although the program of the Department meets the international standards, there is still a place for improvement and adaptation to the EU and US standards by further increasing the number of obligatory and elective Middle East and Islamic culture and history courses. It has to be noticed that the Department in the meantime had increased its number, but further increase is welcomed. Such a perspective was confirmed during the meeting with the staff of the Department, which said it plans to hire one or two doctoral students of history upon their graduation. Thus, our impression is that the Department has a good strategy for the future.

In the response sent on 23 June 2016 by the Department of Orientalistics via KAA, the expert team was informed that the Department continues to engage itself in order to adapt its academic program to EU and USA standards. As stressed by the Department, in one year-master program which is being prepared, even more courses of Middle East culture and history will be included.

2. On the first year of the program it seems that there is a gap between the course *Arabic Phonetics* (SER, p. 314) and *Morphology of Arabic language*, i.e. that phonology is missing. The name of this discipline should be added either to the first or to the second course.

In the comments sent on 23 June 2016 by the Department of Orientalistics via KAA, the expert team was informed that the name of the course *Arabic Phonetics* will be changed as *Phonetics and Phonology of Arabian language*. For as much as the syllabus is concerned, it already contains the phonology, so it needs no changes to be made.

Academic staff

The Department has sufficient proportion of permanent staff and proportions of permanent and external staff. According to the list of the staff, the Department has 5 full-time staff members: 2 full professor, one Asst. Professor, and two assistants. The qualifications of the academic staff are appropriate to the positions they hold within the institution according to the basic criteria. The history classes, however, ideally should be taught by the experts in the history field. We hope that the Department will consider hiring an appropriate expert in the future among its own PhD student candidates, or in cooperation with the Department of Turkish Language and Literature, which has a similar problem. The other option might be cooperation with the Department of History of the Faculty of Philosophy. In the comments sent on 23 June 2016 by the Department of Orientalistics via KAA, the expert team was informed that regarding to experts in the field of Middle East and Islamic history, initially the Department will go for second option and establish cooperation with the Department of History of the Faculty of Philosophy and other related institution.

During the meeting of the expert team with student representatives, students expressed their high motivation and interest for the study, which is, according to their claims, largely enhanced by professionalism and helpfulness of the academic staff.

Research and International co-operation

According to the information given during the site-visit, the teaching staff is involved in research activities which feed back into teaching and course contents. The Department has cooperation with several Turkish universities. The cooperation with universities from the Arab world, however, is relatively weak. Our opinion is that this cooperation should be further developed as an important part of the programme.

Recommendation:

Although intensive co-operation with Turkish universities and institutions is natural and important, it is strongly recommended that the Department further develop its cooperation with universities from the Arab world and broaden its research activities and knowledge transfer by widening international co-operation towards European universities and institutions. The Department should encourage its staff and students to participate in exchange programs such as ERASMUS or to benefit from agreements with European universities signed on the level of the Faculty of Philology or within the framework of International Agreements of the University of Prishtina.

In the response sent by the Department of Orientalistics on 23 June 2016 via KAA, the Expert Team was informed that there are individual efforts in this directions and that the main goal of the Department is to raise this cooperation on the university level through bilateral agreements for students and academic staff exchange. The Department also stressed that it will put further efforts to encourage the academic staff and students to participate in exchange programs and take the full advantage of existing agreements for the good of the Department and the University.

Final Recommendation for Accreditation Decision:

We recommend the re-accreditation of the Bachelor Program “Orientalistics” for 3 years period.

**Evaluation of the Follow Up Plan for Bachelor Program “Balcanistics”, Faculty of Philology,
University of Prishtina**

The members of the expert team for the evaluation of the Follow Up Plan for Bachelor Program “Balcanistics”, Asst. Prof. Vjeron Kursar (University of Zagreb) and Asst. Prof. Barbara Kerovec (University of Zagreb), agree that the Follow Up Plan meets recommendations given by the experts Dr. Ljiljana Reinkowski (University of Basel) and Dr. Robert Pichler (University of Berlin) in the Final version of their Review dated 05/08/2015.