

Evaluation Report University “Haxhi Zeka”, Peja

Re-Accreditation on Bachelor Programmes General Music Education and Music Education

Re-Accreditation on Master Programme Human Resource Management

Expert Team:

Doris Carstensen

Bettina Henkel

Dietmar Paier

CONTENTS

1.	Accreditation Process.....	3
1.1	Study Programmes under Review	3
1.2	Expert Team	3
1.3	Basis of the Evaluation	3
1.4	Site Visit.....	5
2	Introductory Remarks and General Findings	5
2.1	The University and its Mission	5
3	Faculty of Arts	6
3.1	General Remarks	6
3.2	Academic Programme “General Music Education” and Student Management.....	8
3.3	Academic Programme “Music Education” and Student Management.....	11
3.4	Staff	13
3.5	Research and International Co-operation.....	15
3.6	Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment.....	16
3.7	Quality Management	17
4	Faculty of Business.....	19
4.1	Academic Programme “Human Resource Management” and Student Management	19
4.2	Staff	25
4.3	Research and International Co-operation:.....	26
4.4	Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment.....	28
4.5	Quality Management	29
5	Recommendations for Re-accreditation	31

1. ACCREDITATION PROCESS

1.1 Study Programmes under Review

The expert team visited the University of Peja, Faculty of Business and Faculty of Arts, in June 6th, 2016, for the purpose of evaluating the re-accreditation of the following study programmes:

Faculty of Business	Faculty of Arts
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Human Resource Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• General Music Education• Music Education

1.2 Expert Team

The expert team consisted of:

- Doris Carstensen, MBA, Higher Education Consultant, Vienna (A)
- Doz. Mag. Bettina Henkel, Institute of Fine Arts, Academy of Fine Arts Vienna (A)
- Mag. Dr. Dietmar Paier, University of Applied Sciences Krems (A)

The Expert Team (ET) was supported by a member of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):
Mr. Fisnik Gashi, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring.

We want to thank Kosovo Accreditation Agency and its office for support, and for engaging us as experts and their expressed trust.

1.3 Basis of the Evaluation

The expert team based its evaluation on the Self Evaluation Report¹ (SER) initially submitted by the University of Peja in April 2016 and other documents provided such as the evaluation report 2013 (referred to as ER 2013), CVs of teaching staff and other relevant materials; the site visit

¹ Regrettably, there is a need to improve the documents in terms of nomenclature, consistency with terminology and accuracy of expression.

made by the expert team to the Faculty on 6th of June 2016; and additional documents requested by the expert team at the end of the site visit.

The experts took into account the information which the Department of General Music Education and the Department of Music Education, both Faculty of Arts, and the Department of Human Resource Management imparted on the draft version of the evaluation report as far as possible.²

Additional Documents:

The University of Peja provided on request of the ET the following documents:

Concerning the University in general

- Quality Management – Regulation
- Action Plan And Budgetary Strategy

Faculty of Arts

- CVs
- Financial Planning
- Research Plan
- Quality office report 2016.docx

Faculty of Business

- 12 CVs
- Quality office report
- Financial Planning of the Faculty of Business
- Research plan 2016 – 2019 of the Human Resource Management Department

The experts compiled this report according to the standards of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency and its guidelines for experts regarding the evaluation of academic programmes as well as its code of good practice for site-visits. The expert panel gives recommendations on the basis of an in-depth analysis of the material submitted before and after the site visit, and the information obtained during the site visit. Experts’ recommendations from the previous accreditation proposals are also taken into the account.

²

The Faculty of Art provided revised curricula overviews together with the statement on the draft report. These **cannot be taken** into consideration because of formal reasons according to the guidelines for Experts of Kosovo Accreditation Agency. We appreciate the suggestions as another step towards European Standards, and encourage the Faculty of Arts to discuss the curricula development in the follow-up phase of the accreditation procedure. It also needs to be said that changes in the study programme Human Resources Management, which were reported in the comment to have taken place after the draft evaluation report, cannot be taken into consideration.

1.4 Site Visit

The expert team visited the Faculty of Arts and the Faculty of Business on Monday, 6th of June, 2016. During this site visit, the expert team had meetings with:

- Members of the Rectorate, a representative of the Board, and members of the university management
- Members of the faculties with responsibility for the study programmes evaluated, including those with responsibility for the curriculum development and for teaching.
- Members of the academic staff
- Students

The site visits by the expert team concluded with a closing meeting with the management of the university.

2 INTRODUCTORY REMARKS AND GENERAL FINDINGS

2.1 The University and its Mission

The University Haxhi Zeka in Peja offers several study programmes in five faculties. The University of Peja was founded as an independent higher education institution in 2011 after more than 40 years of higher education experience as a subsidiary of the University of Prishtina. Today the University of Peja offers study programmes according to the Bologna structure in five faculties: Faculty of Business, Juridical Faculty, Faculty of Management of Tourism, Hotel Business and Environment, Faculty of Agrobusiness, Faculty of Arts. The third stage of the Bologna cycle is not at stage yet.

The current management team was appointed in spring this year. It started in the middle of the term of office. The budgetary independence and staff recruitment were topics of discussion in the session with top management during the site visit.

The mission of the university is fourfold: academic education, scientific research, artistic creativity, professional counselling. The University is a strong player in regional development and aims for further impacts in Kosovo and internationally. Tempus and Erasmus projects give reason to be confident.

The presentation of the management team on the mission of the university and the development strategy was formulated clearly and the measures planned seem purposeful with respect to the university's objectives. The ET welcomed the emphasis made on these important strategic issues.

In the SER, the mission of the University and the Faculty of Arts is described in a general way as a “classical university”, seeking to provide students with practical skills and competences needed in

the labour market, too. During the management meeting the ET followed a presentation about the institution’s future mission striving towards an “entrepreneurial university”, to attract more external funding through commercialization of projects. The management team reported that a new university development strategy is being developed to bring forward these objectives. During the presentation it wasn’t clear which faculties of the university are addressed. The ET recommends critically overthinking entrepreneurial strategies for the arts, respecting academic and artistic freedom.

The number of academic full time (FT) and part time (PT) employees has now grown to 57 FT and 144 PT. The number of students in the academic year 2014/15 was 6337 in bachelor programs and 729 on the master level.

The University of Peja is very ambitious to contribute music and artistic education. Actually the main focus is on teacher education in music, expanded by instrumental studies in woodwind instruments and Film Directing and TV. The university management was very proud of the department of music and its national and international concert activities. Thereby the teachers and the students enriches the cultural life. The university management has planned to build a building complex especially designed for the needs of artistic studies for some years. It seems that the planning phase ends now and the realisation of the construction is nearby with the financial support by the ministry.

The origins of the Faculty of Business date back to 1960, when the *Advanced Economic and Commercial School* was founded in Peja. Based on this long tradition, the school was reformed in 2001/2002 in accordance with the Bologna Declaration and became a Faculty of Applied Sciences in Business. Since then, the Faculty of Business managed to establish 5 Bachelor programmes and 2 Master programmes (SER, p. 7)

3 FACULTY OF ARTS

3.1 General Remarks

Teacher education for music and other artistic domains is a key area for societal development in which it is important that all concerned should be able to work profoundly and state-of-the-art as either members of academic institutions (professors and students) or in schools (teachers and pupils).

In the Faculty of Arts one can perceive a specific eco-system with a community of students and professors, and a unique spirit of musical performance and positive attitudes towards arts and teaching.

Evidence was provided that the academic leaders in the faculty are involved in the development of a modern teacher education in practice offering a school practise for students. These activities

should not only cover those schools with good partnerships but the ministry and the University of Prishtina as well.

The university management should be responsible for a vitalisation and participation of future development context. In particular, this is a consequence of current changes in the legal regulation of teacher education with a BA degree. In teacher education, students will have to have completed a master programme successfully to get permission for teaching at schools. The law is not in force because of the legislative procedures in parliament. Actually in music education BA students are teaching at general and music schools on both levels (primary 1-9 class and secondary 10-12 class). The next step in further development of teacher education in music might should be a master programme. This important issue might to be tackled in the strategic perspective by the university management.

The university management should encourage the management team of the Faculty of Arts and other members of the music education staff to attend and to contribute to international conferences on teacher education and to try out innovative pedagogic course formats and methods. The head of the study programs and staff members show an awareness of didactic approaches, motivation, feedback, supervision, responsiveness, assessment.

The organisational structure of the Faculty of Arts still follows the study programmes and thereby has grown little in staff. There is a slight tendency towards a team development and members of staff are open to cooperate in teaching and learning, art practice and research. Although the possibilities are limited, the leading responsibilities should be shared among more staff members.

In addition, the regulation for undergraduate studies of the University “Haxhi Zeka” should be adapted for the specified needs of Faculty of Arts for artistic education, e.g. in raising the contact hours from 20 to 25 hours per semester in both programmes.

It is difficult to assess the appropriateness of the content and structure of the two curricula, since module descriptions provided were limited and generalised. Both study programs have several similarities and unfortunately often uses the same formal course descriptions. But in practice they differ fundamentally. The rationale and the statement of learning outcomes, and course descriptions should be more specific. The experts were glad to receive additional information during the site visit that included a coherent description of the differences by the students. Thereby the experts felt certain that the lectures provided differ in practice.

Both study programs hold the same belief that only a good musician is a good teacher. Their purpose is to educate musicians as instrumentalists (solo or orchestra), solo singing or choir at first place and then to educate teaching aspects. Also practical applications like event management or acoustic engineering are among the purposes of the study programs. This approach is known as polyvalent and generalist education.

It is difficult to cover the topic of different school types and levels systematically by the course descriptions. If one priority were to develop the ability of the prospective teachers to teach children on different developmental stages, then it might be advisable to put greater emphasis on different demands for the school levels.

The following report deals with the curricula separately, while the review of institutional conditions and programmatic policies in internationalisation, research, staff, finances, infrastructure and quality assurance apply to both programs.

3.2 Academic Programme General Music Education and Student Management

- 3.2.1 The study programme General Music Education (GME) is a four-year bachelor programme at the Faculty of Arts. Its aim is teacher education in music for general primary and secondary schools in Kosovo. Its degree, bachelor of General Music Education with abbreviation BEdMus is corresponding to the given ET recommendation 2013.
- 3.2.2 A second study programme in music, here Music Education (ME), is offered. While differences between both programmes may be very complicated to understand from the SER, the ET was impressed by the clarity how students are explaining the difference out of their daily study routine. The ET recommend to explain the different and specialized school types addressed beforehand and the consequences following by this. Course descriptions and syllabi should mirror the differences as well.
- 3.2.3 The study programme in GME has ambitious goals. The main aim is music education and professional skills in music: leading orchestras and choirs, vocal and instrumental ensembles with pupils, young students and amateurs. The expected learning outcomes describe music education appropriate within the curriculum.
- 3.2.4 Additional aims and expected learning outcome are working as voice master in electronic media and in digital music recording of concerts, and being an organizer of music events. These fields need more attention within overworked structures to be more efficient.
- 3.2.5 Even it was not formulated in the SER or during the site visit, from the curriculum one can see, that the overarching didactic concept is following a quite classical understanding of teaching art. Meaning by undergoing an individual artistic process with further development, personally and artistic, reflecting that process in relation to theory and history, and transferring this into teaching.
- 3.2.6 The curriculum focuses on music education first: learning instruments (first and second), solfeggio, vocal technics and harmony, choral singing and conducting, history of music etc. Students will get about 45 % of ECTS of the whole programme in these subjects. Secondly focused on theory of music and an ECTS percentage about 29 % (music theory, music history, introduction in instruments, sociology of arts, musical forms, polyphony, national music history, arranger). Aspects of teaching with psychology of teaching, methodology in solfeggio, methodology of scientific research in music, analysis of harmony, methodology of music theory and pedagogy with educational practice in schools are about 13%. Beside this the diploma thesis is about 5 % of the ECTS and elective courses are about 8 %. Even taking into account that some subjects are not clearly within these categories and overlapping, the teaching aspect should be strengthened.

- 3.2.7 The ET appreciate that courses focused in teaching are starting from first semester. Teaching aspects should differ between elementary and secondary schools over the years of study and marked as such in the curriculum, course description and syllabus.
- 3.2.8 Between 2013 and 2016 changes were made according the ETs recommendation 2013. Not all recommendations are implemented and well matched. The main topic was the educational sector, which is valorised now and should be on going.
- 3.2.9 The internship in schools is implemented at the fourth year and appreciated by the students, as we got the impression. This practical application is supervised by a teacher at school and the professor of pedagogy at the university.
- 3.2.10 The allocation of the ECTS was changed from 2013 to 2016 due to the recommendations 2013.³ New is using half ECTS points, what isn't in common use of European standard. Contact hours, exercises and individual study time are better balanced, but could be still having more contact hours. The workload is manageable for students.
- 3.2.11 The music repertoire in practise is still mainly in classical music from the 18th-19th century and rarely in music from the 20th century or contemporary music composition. The ORFF-repertoire (important for musical development in the early childhood), jazz and pop music repertoire is missing. The faculty should instruct the internal and external teaching staff to extend the repertoire.
- 3.2.12 Per semester and study year consecutive courses are offered once in a study period: English language or information technologies, folklore or second instrument, acoustic engineering or ethnomusicology, reading scores or aesthetics. The expected outcome in the field of digital audio recording is in a weak position as elective course in competition with e.g. English language, which is an overlapping need for operating digital devices.
- 3.2.13 No attention is paid on cultural management as described as expected learning outcome. No specific courses (like e.g. “music event management”) conveying needed skills.
- 3.2.14 A body of shared elective courses together with the study programme of Music Education or shared modules could be built for students in both programmes (e.g. music event management, culture management).

Enrolment

- 3.2.15 Student candidates need to have completed general secondary schools. The enrolment criteria are fulfilling an entrance exam in music theory with basic knowledge and in solfeggio (rhythmic melodic listening). This is the main fact of difference to the study programme Music Education: In GME students are starting from a basic knowledge and skills and will teach children in primary and secondary schools with that basic knowledge. The enrolment is transparent and appropriate for the target student group and comprehensive to European standards.

³ According to the general directive one ECTS is equivalent to 25 working hours (SER, 127)

Student Management

- 3.2.16 The ET would call it “informal contact hours” for students with their professors, which seems to be a very good and in a way familiar. Students are getting individual, artistic support from their professors away from the courses system. Teachers and students demonstrated this in a very convincing way caused by the relatively small amount of students. This seems to be the main factor for the quality of the study programme!
- 3.2.17 Nearly all students who want to become teacher at school are getting jobs at schools and students are quite optimistic concerning their future as teachers. But, students are not fully informed about the changes in legal limitation of teaching with a BA degree. In future they need to graduate in a Master programme to have the permission for teaching at schools.
- 3.2.18 At the faculty of art students can study in an undergraduate programme. A consecutive master programme is missing. For studying a master programme students have to go to the University of Pristina.
- 3.2.19 Preparation, adaptations and negotiations with the University Pristina for recognition to pass over from a BA in GME in Peja to a master programme in music at the University Pristina, faculty of arts, isn't done yet.
- 3.2.20 The ET appreciate the effort for a future “tutor to tutor” and “peer to peer” system, as well as an award of the University of Haxhi Zeka for qualified students. These innovations were presented during the management meeting.

Recommendations

- 3.2.21 *The ET recommends explaining the addressed different and specialized school types in the Kosovo within the curriculum and the consequences concerning the study programme. The legal regulation, which is not in force yet, provides that students with a BA in GME will not be allowed to teach in primary and secondary schools. Students are not informed about that, but urgently should. The ET assumes that due to the lack of teaching staff, students currently are engaged in all school types.*
- 3.2.22 *The educational sector should be an ongoing development process and be under supervision by the management. There is still a need to strengthen pedagogy and didactic subjects.*
- 3.2.23 *Preparation, adaptations and negotiations for accessing master programmes in music.*
- 3.2.24 *Reorganizing the curriculum concerning of the elective courses. Offer elective courses more than once during a period of study. Make all elective courses available during all semesters to enable students for individual focus and development.*

- 3.2.25 *Build shared modules for both programmes to focus on digital recording/mastering, music event organization, regional and national ethnic music, as well as in jazz and pop music.*
- 3.2.26 *Decreasing the ECTS, especially such with half ECTS points (2,5; 3,5; 4,5 according to the ECTS Users’ Guide⁴)*
- 3.2.27 *Increase the number of pedagogic courses.*
- 3.2.28 *Enlarging the music repertoire in all directions as named upon, especially in ORFF repertoire for schools.*

3.3 Academic Programme Music Education and Student Management

3.3.1 This is a proposal for re-accreditation for a degree course in Music Education, presented in eight semesters over four years in the full-time mode. The aim of the program is to prepare graduates not only for employment as teachers in primary and secondary music schools but also for musical careers, work in media, event management, and researcher. Additionally, entrepreneurship, culture management would be a suitable topic in year three and four.

The academic degree is BEd MUS, Bachelor in Music education.

3.3.2 The curriculum covers a wide range of core subjects. These include a first and second instrument, solo singing, choir, conducting, reading the scores, solfeggio, harmony, musical forms, arrangement and theoretical subjects such as history of music, psychology of music, sociology of music, IT, English, instruments, music forms, methodology (=pedagogical concepts). In a small number of subject’s additional practical applications (orchestrating, acoustic engineering) are taught. Consideration is also given to an internship at primary and secondary music schools, where the emphasis is on first practical experience in teaching the relevant core subjects in schools: Solfeggio, music history, choir, arranging orchestra, folklore, acoustic engineering.

3.3.3 There is no reason not to increase the repertoire of musical literature for teaching in all musical periods. Future potential can be estimated as high if one looks forward to international popular music, modern Albanian folklore, jazz etc.. If more expertise is necessary, master classes with guest teachers might be a first step. Such master classes should be implemented in the curriculum and budget.

3.3.4 The range and composition of subjects follow the structure of theoretical and practical studies. The instrumental and singing subjects cover a third of the contact hours. Music theory subjects span more than four semesters and cover another third of the contact hours. Pedagogy and methodology in the school subjects, related subjects (psychology/sociology e.g.) and professional applications cover less than a third of the contact hours.

⁴ http://ec.europa.eu/education/library/publications/2015/ects-users-guide_en.pdf

- 3.3.5 Since the development of a personality as a teacher and as musician is a long-term process the ET recommends reflecting the specifics of methodology and pedagogy for teaching music right from the start with corresponding lectures through all semesters.
- 3.3.6 The next step in developing the structure of the programme would be to increase the number of subjects further with an emphasis in pedagogy and teaching methods. Might a project will require the student to integrate the component in theoretical subjects and teaching practice by putting the knowledge and skills to work. Additionally, the internship should be an obligatory part of the curriculum.
- 3.3.7 The number of contact hours should rise to at least 25 hours per semester.
- 3.3.8 The ECTS equivalent of 30 hours do not meet the general directives (SER, p. 127)
- 3.3.9 In sum, Music Education is still a promising curriculum for teacher education. The program provides a sound basis on which to continue curriculum and subject development.

Learning Outcomes

- 3.3.10 The SER pointed out structured learning outcomes, and the qualification profiles of prospective students. The competencies focus on developing musical skills and understanding. General skills again belong to artistic skills and individual artistic concepts. And finally specific skills address teaching techniques and the integration of theoretical and practical knowledge (meaning: music interpretation and performance). The learning outcomes are almost consistent with the curriculum.

Assessment, Didactic Concept and Teaching Methods

- 3.3.11 Predominantly students are trained in performing in front of an audience solo or in an ensemble. Theoretical knowledge will be assessed with written assignments or presentations. Frequent mention is made in the curriculum descriptions of small group work, but it is not clear where students are to learn how to contribute effectively to the work of a team.
- 3.3.12 Concerning the assessment, the SER provides procedures only. Nor is there mentioned how to make a fair assessment on an individual’s artistic development, and individual’s development as a teacher. Criteria and methods should be aligned.
- 3.3.13 In terms of the development of appropriate levels of understanding and performing music, artistic skills, theoretical and practical knowledge, creativity and attitudes - a better alignment of assessment is necessary. Student’s commitment, their contributions to the community of musicians and teachers, and their works in seminars contain the student’s performance. To assess this and the progression criteria and different methods are necessary.
- 3.3.14 If students are able to attend an internship or already work in schools during their studies, then two things will be required:
- to establish some minimum level of oversight and supervision between the department and the schools concerned,

- minimum criteria how to assess the value of the learning experience and the performance of the student as a prospective teacher.

Admission criteria, enrolment

- 3.3.15 Music Education follows high level of admission criteria to attract prospective students with previously obtained knowledge in music theory and experience in instrumental artistic practice. Students must have finished a secondary music school. During the admission procedure students undergo a test to show practical competencies in harmony, solfeggio, and an audition (piano) in front of a commission.
- 3.3.16 With regard to the infrastructure and the labour market demand, the strategic planning decided 20 students should start per year.
- 3.3.17 The number of studying while continuing in employment should be monitored to find an optimal proportion.

Recommendations

3.3.18 *Increasing the repertoire*

3.3.19 *Raising the number of contact hours up to 25 per semester*

3.3.20 *Integrating lectures on teaching methodology from the first semester*

3.3.21 *Integrating practice, internships at school into the curriculum*

Developing supervision, guidance and minimum criteria how to assess the early professional experiences

3.3.22 *Monitoring the number of part time students*

3.3.23 *Complement assessment procedures with criteria for judgements on individual artistic development and progress in artistic and theoretical subjects.*

3.4 Staff

- 3.4.1 The ET is impressed by the vigorous identification of the staff with the institution, with teaching and supporting students. The academic staff with full time contracts, as far as the ET met them, is ambitious, highly motivated and competent as artists/musicians or academic. From the CVs we also see, that they are very good trained and experienced musicians (obtaining a MA degree) with regular performance of concerts, as well as they are experienced teachers in other public or private universities. Also teachers from the region, e.g. Albania/Tirana, and others with educational experience abroad, e.g. Great Britten/London, were hired.

- 3.4.2 During the management meeting new access to online resources and international journals were presented: “EBSCO” for research (mainly for economics and social science), “Charanga” for music education and five international journals. The ET observes during the site visit, that the artistic staff does not yet know these resources.
- 3.4.3 Distant learning, development of course content in reflection of didactic methods of teaching isn’t a topic yet. In the session with the staff the ET experienced curiosity and openness towards new forms of teaching.
- 3.4.4 Also the staff for theoretical courses and other subjects, like IT and audio engineering, are highly qualified with PhD and experienced in research – but not necessarily in relation to the field of music. “Sociology of arts” is taught by a sociologist with high academic qualification and international contact and publications – but not in the relation to music and/or arts in general. He is a PhD candidate in military sociology. The ET asked about decision why choosing him. More and more it turned out to be a serious problem for the university in Peja and in overall Kosovo, that discipline-specific staff is rare. Kosovo it seems to be a lacking of qualified academics in specific disciplines, interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary subjects. This is also owed to the enormous need of qualified staff concerning the provision of education for the very young aged Kosovar society (46 % of the population is under 18 years⁵).
- 3.4.5 Full time staff members (8 persons, 2016) and part time members (18 persons, 2016) are supposed to teach in both programmes. The ratio is full time staff to students is 1:17 and part time to students 1:8, all together 1:5. This ratio is appropriate for fulfilling the programmes goals.
- 3.4.6 In case of the part time professor for pedagogy the ET recommend an engagement as full time professors rather than part time. Again the experts were told, that this is caused by the problem of finding qualified persons and the next problem, that such persons mostly already teaching in other universities and by law they aren’t allowed to teach more.
- 3.4.7 The gender ration is well balanced and female musician are heading both study programmes in a very structured and engaged way.

Recommendations:

- 3.4.8 *Since teaching methods are changing permanently in mirroring society and its communication technics, and there are good examples and networks even online, the ET recommends organizing professional trainings and networking for deeper integration of pedagogical and didactic skills.⁶*
- 3.4.9 *Continue acquisitions for highly specialized staff in music for theoretical courses like “sociology of arts” and “IT”, also for hiring a full time professor in pedagogic for (general) music education.*

⁵ <https://de.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kosovo>

⁶ The ET appreciates to get to know that through the statement from 28th of June three professors are member of EAS (European Association for School).

3.5 Research and International Co-operation

- 3.5.1 The management of the university send additional documents about the research activities of the Faculty of Arts. Information is given about participation at international conferences, doctorate conferences, master classes and publications in journals as well as invitations to international performances of concerts in various festivals. The ET appreciates these activities and still encourages increasing those activities and connecting to international networks. Research subjects as such, projects with partner institutions or methodologies of research are not described.
- 3.5.2 Understanding of research is quite general, not subject specific and it is in its first steps. Artistic research is still a challenge in overall Europe. Research, the way it is described in the additional documents and the SER with its general, very broad meaning⁷, is linked to teaching and students are participating. Management, staff and students are identifying very much with these so-called research activities. From the ET perspective, they seem to be very open and interested for further development and professional training.
- 3.5.3 During the management meeting new access to online resources and international journals for research were presented: “EBSCO” for research (mainly for economics), “Charanga” for music education and five international journals. The ET wouldn’t count “Charanga” as a resource for research, but a giving helpful courses and curricula for teaching. The ET observes during the side visit, that the staff does not yet know these resources.
- 3.5.4 A budget line for scientific publications and a commission for publication was installed recently. This effort will support further development in research and lift up quality.
- 3.5.5 The number of international activities increased over the years. The Faculty of Arts and its staff members reported an impressive scope of international cooperation in the region during the site visit. Unfortunately, student mobility is not a topic for future plans.

Recommendations:

- 3.5.6 *Professional training in artistic research would help a lot to reflect and develop the understanding of research.*
- 3.5.7 *Further training on voluntary basis for teachers in English language for science and musicology is recommended to empower them to participate and communicate actively in international research discourses with improvement of passive and active language skills.*

⁷ Not every performance or a concert is research already.

3.6 Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

- 3.6.1 The Faculty of Arts presents itself in a clean, orderly, proper, undamaged state with a good inventory. The faculty have dedicated great effort to install a concert hall and a library in recent years. The faculty managed building in three separate office rooms for members of the faculty management.
- 3.6.2 The room management is transparent and accordingly students are able to schedule their independent rehearsals and exercises during the week. 5 lecture rooms and 4 small exercise rooms are available for students between 4 and 8 pm (Mo-Fri).
- 3.6.3 The faculty has successfully organised additional pianinos and other instruments. So far some flutes, one clarinet, trumpets, violins, celli can be loaned by students.
- 3.6.4 A library is provided, but the book collection is very narrow. One licensed online teaching program is available (CHARANGA).
- 3.6.5 The expert team missed technical equipment for audio recording, video equipment for teaching and performing trainings. There was no specific equipment for acoustic engineering, nor specified computer labs.
- 3.6.6 As mentioned above the university managements plans to build a new building complex exclusively for the faculty of art. The first third of the cost occurs already in the budget plan 2016.
- 3.6.7 The budget plan of the faculty consists of expenditures. The ET missed information about the purpose of the expenditures. It is not transparent where the Faculty of Arts plans to invest in their infrastructure. Will there be more and better technical equipment? Will there be more online resources and material in the library? Do the faculty plan to buy more instruments? Etc.
- 3.6.8 The plan listed 87.000 Euro in 2017 for goods and services and more than 175.000 Euro for wages and salaries. With regard to the annual expenditure plan of the University the faculty of arts will be allocated with nearly a quarter of the total expenditures in goods and services and nearly 10% of the total expenditures on salaries. This budget allocation is rather generous and a very positive aspect that underpins the great determination to foster the development of art education in Peja. The planned expenditures are shown to be covered by the state.
- 3.6.9 The faculty aims to generate incomes from 7.000 Euro in 2017 up to 11.000 Euros in 2019. The sources of income are not named. The ET recommends to be more specific in income sources, particularly with regard to the general strategic mission of the University of Peja to become an entrepreneurial university.
- 3.6.10 The direct expenditures for study programmes are mentioned as extra funding above the planned expenditures. The amounts of 6.000 Euros in 2017 up to 11.000 Euros in 2019 are low compared to the extra budget on research activities. Considering the number of student enrolments is limited and shows a slight decrease in the recent years. Because of that the increase does not seem consistent or the actual funding situation should be positively corrected within the next years.

Recommendations

3.6.11 *Financial Planning should give more oversight how the budget will be spent and investments in maintenance and expansion of the equipment*

3.7 Quality Management

3.7.1 The quality assurance in the Faculty of Arts should consist of:

- performance evaluation of academic staff members
- Self-assessment of academic staff
- Exam statistics
- Students statistics
- Completion of CV’s of academic staff members
- Transparent overview of staff members
- Regular staff information about the curricula
- Technical control of Bachelor thesis
- A quality report
- A quality assurance team responsible for the self-assessment and action planning (follow-up on external reviews)
- Professional development to ensure and improve the quality of teaching
- Participation of representatives (students, staff, service, stakeholders).

3.7.2 The ET viewed the latest Report of the Quality Office and confirms that the quality office works with statistics on students, exams and placement, classroom assessment, and technical control of thesis, and public performing events and research or artistic development activities are organised by the quality assurance office.

3.7.3 Additionally, the syllabi are contributed (and revised?) regularly per year. The experts were impressed by the availability of detailed syllabuses. Since the course descriptions in the SER are that small and narrow, we hope by gaining more practice even the general course descriptions will improve. Syllabi, course descriptions and curriculum matrix should be harmonised, because of its inconsistencies.

3.7.4 The ET was irritated by the low number of questionnaires distributed per professor. Moreover, the ET suggests to develop a specified questionnaire for artistic teachers, because of the specific quality aims of artistic subjects and individual teaching methods.

3.7.5 The ET missed the professional self-assessment of staff members and differentiated classroom assessment results. Usually an annual action plan for quality development should exist in the faculty, otherwise the activities do not go beyond quality assessment.

3.7.6 Nevertheless, the faculty of arts is on the right path to create a permanent ownership for quality assurance. We would like to encourage more quality improvement activities after assessments, and an ongoing development towards a quality culture based upon artistic measurements.

3.7.7 We acknowledge the central action plan and budgetary planning with several aspects and activities to enhance the quality in teaching and learning and the quality culture.

Recommendations

3.7.8 *Developing a questionnaire for artistic subjects*

3.7.9 *Revising course descriptions in a precise and distinctive manner*

4 FACULTY OF BUSINESS

4.1 Academic Programme “Human Resource Management” and Student Management

Does the academic programme correspond to the institution’s mission statement and principles of operation?

- 4.1.1 Based on the documents provided and meetings with responsible persons for the study programme, professors, and students, one can assume that there are connections between the rationales of the study programme on the one hand, and the University’s strategy and operating principles on the other hand.
- 4.1.2 In the SER, there are few statements how the master programme corresponds to the university’s mission statement and principles of operation. Some sections provide information on the rationales of the study programme, but no particular references are made with respect to the mission statement.
- 4.1.3 More information was provided in the presentations of the management meeting and the meeting with the programme directors. Four main areas were addressed:
- Teaching
 - Research & Development
 - Quality Assurance
 - Internationalisation
- 4.1.4 The representatives of the study programme declared to aim at the creation of “highest standards in teaching and learning, scientific research and artistic creativity”. When asked for an explanation of this formulation, the management board clarified that the university follows the idea to be “competitive in comparison with regional universities” and to pursue the objective to “follow recent trends and to implement them according to the particular conditions of the university”. The expert appreciates these strategic objectives which are clear and realistic and, which constitutes sustainable concepts for future planning. The efforts made so far should be maintained in any case.
- 4.1.5 A new quality assurance strategy was said to be launched and implemented after the site-visit.
- 4.1.6 Regarding research, several measures were mentioned including study visits of universities abroad, conference participations, access to international journals and the fostering of publication activities through a recently adopted commission of publications and a particular budget line for publication activities.
- 4.1.7 The responsible officers of the study programme and the professors presented in a convincing way the efforts and activities made so far in internationalisation of teaching staff and collaborative research activities through participation in EU-funded projects,

- 4.1.8 The SER does not address the particular relevance of the university’s mission statement for the programme. The lack of an appropriate description was already stated in the expert report 2013 (ER 2013) and this deficiency has not been remedied.
- 4.1.9 In section 2.1.2 of the SER on the “reasonableness of the program for the labor market”, attention is given to the benefits of the programme for graduates in terms of competences that can be achieved. The responsible persons of the study programme emphasized the orientation of the programme towards the needs of the regional labour market and referred to market research with students which is undertaken continuously to determine market needs. This is highly valuable and an important approach and it is recommended to pursue this market research. In the course of the evaluation, the expert gained the impression that this objective is implemented as a part of teaching practice. It remained unclear, if this practice can substitute professional market research, since courses only have limited resources to develop and carry out far-reaching research projects and to transform data into information and knowledge for the further development of the study programme. Furthermore, it did not become clear how data was gathered and processed, which particular knowledge was gained and how the results of market research were used for further development of the study programme.
- 4.1.10 Further explanations in this section deal with the didactics, grade, and the prospective fields of occupational practice of the graduates.
- 4.1.11 In section 2.1.3 on “international comparability of the program”, no reference to the internationalisation strategy of the university nor criteria for comparison or a detailed self-assessment can be found.
- 4.1.12 Section 2.1.4 contains brief remarks of the admission criteria for the “target groups”. In section 2.1.5, entitled “The report of the study program to the guiding principles of the institution”, a repetition of paragraphs of section 2.1.2 is given without addressing the topics indicated in the section title.
- 4.1.13 However, the presentation of the management team on the mission of the university and the development strategy was formulated clearly and the measures planned seem purposeful with respect to the university’s objectives. The ET welcomed the emphasis made on these important strategic issues.

Are the programme’s quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?

- 4.1.14 Overall, the majority of subjects and fields of competences is highly relevant for professional Human Resource Management. This is also documented in the descriptions of the teaching contents in the syllabi.
- 4.1.15 Following a recommendation of the ER 2013, the number of ECTS credits for the Master Thesis was raised. The university decided to raise this number from 10 to 30 ECTS. On inquiry of the expert, the study programme directors explained that these 30 ECTS comprise supervision of the Master Thesis by professors, too. This is one important step making the programme appropriate

to the academic degree, i.e. “Master of Science in Business”. Further measures are necessary to achieve this goal, however.

- 4.1.16 Contrary to the recommendations of the ER 2013, the status and the placement of some courses remained unchanged. Especially, the particular relevance of the courses on “Systems Theory” and “Decision Theory” for Human Resources Management is still unclear due to the lack of more detailed information, how these courses contribute to the development of specific skills and competences needed for Human Resources Management. Some courses which should be key courses in the programme are placed only late in the curriculum, although they should be introductory courses. Furthermore, some of these highly relevant courses are electives, even though they address key areas of knowledge or management methods, such as “Payments”.
- 4.1.17 The study programme aims to combine “academic studies and practical training” (SER, p. 14). Practical training in terms of technical and vocational training requires highly specialized knowledge in occupational fields and didactic knowledge which is distinct from academic teaching. However, no particular references on how the objective of “practical training” is realised didactically are made in the SER and in the syllabi.
- 4.1.18 The overall quality of the programme in terms of teaching contents and range of subjects covered in the curriculum is not fully appropriate to the academic degree for the reasons explained. A main difficulty is that there are courses which have a major status in the curriculum, but would be better suited as electives; and that there are electives which should be obligatory courses.
- 4.1.19 Key subjects for Human Resource Management with introductory character should not be offered as electives but as obligatory courses and should be placed in semester 1 or 2, as was already recommended in the ER 2013.
- 4.1.20 Several areas in the study programme need further development. Since market demands may change quickly, additional subjects such as methods of personality assessment, talent management or HR marketing and recruitment policies are topics gaining more practical relevance in present Human Resources Management.

Is the programme based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated to and adopted by the teaching staff?

- 4.1.21 Professors described didactic approaches in the programme as covering a wide range of didactic methods including traditional, highly structured lectures, interactive teaching styles, practice-oriented teaching styles and game-based learning approaches, just to name but a few. This indicates that there exists a great variety of individual teaching practices in the study programme.
- 4.1.22 In the meetings with study programme directors and professors it turned out that an overarching didactic concept is achieved only partially: Individual variety of teaching approaches seems to be the lowest common denominator.
- 4.1.23 The syllabus description format contains a section entitled “The methodology for the realization of educational topics”. This term actually refers to the didactic methods applied by professors in the course. As mentioned before, the formulations on didactics across the courses of the

curriculum display a great variety of detail in describing the didactic approaches. Four main types of descriptions can be found: (1) A standard formulation which is identical in several courses and which seems to be duplicated by copy and paste; (2) Detailed descriptions indicating a more differentiated understanding of didactics; (3) Descriptions which mainly refer to formal characteristics of the course but not to didactic methods; (4) No description provided at all.

- 4.1.24 In the syllabi, only weak differentiation is made between “courses” and “exercises” regarding the didactic methods used in courses and in exercises, although it is logical that there must be differences in teaching methods in lecture-style courses on the one hand and in exercises which are characterized by more practice-oriented approaches on the other hand. Usually, it is a standard to provide separate syllabi for different types of courses. This also helps to resolve difficulties in the transparency of ECTS calculation and allocation. Furthermore, it provides better information on teaching contents, didactic methods and work load for students. In addition, this approach would support the study programme director and the teaching staff in continuous monitoring of teaching practices and further development of organization, contents and didactics of courses and provision of information on courses in the syllabi both for teaching staff and students.
- 4.1.25 The department has defined a truly ambitious objective in terms of providing both, academic education and practical training. In order to attain this goal, a suitable key strategy would be necessary to explain the consequences of this combination with respect to two levels of the study programme: (1) A hierarchy of learning objectives (e.g. following Bloom’s taxonomy) which classifies learning objectives by complexity and specificity and which guides the process of growing and deepening the student’s skills through the course of studies; (2) the variety of different types of courses needed to reach this goal.
- 4.1.26 A regular process of internal monitoring and reflection of the teaching practices in order to identify the best practices for particular purposes and course types seems not to be implemented.
- 4.1.27 Based on best practices, development of a mission statement on teaching standards and teaching practices is recommended which could serve as a reference document for further development of the teaching culture. In a mission statement of this sort, the differentiation of didactic approaches in courses and exercises would have to be a key element.

Does the academic degree correspond to international standards?

- 4.1.28 The academic degree corresponds to international standards largely regarding subjects and teaching contents covered.

Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? (E.g. what is the proportion of independent study time compared to online/distance teaching and classroom units?)

- 4.1.29 In view of the incomplete and erroneous entries in the syllabi, an assessment of this criterion cannot be based on solid evidence and must be treated with caution.

- 4.1.30 From the syllabi, the expert can only conclude that there are sufficient opportunities for self-study, since most courses consist of 3 teaching hours for “courses” (no particular course types are indicated) and 2 contact hours for exercises. Usually, a semester has 15 teaching weeks, making up for 75 teaching hours per semester.
- 4.1.31 For most mandatory courses (“courses” and exercises) 8 ECTS are allocated, which is a work load of 240 hours. This would mean that there are 165 hours per course for other activities. Most syllabi but not all specify these further activities. With respect to these courses, it can be concluded that there are sufficient opportunities for activities such as discussions with teachers and student colleagues, consultations of teachers, self-learning time, seminars, homework and other activities.

Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?

- 4.1.32 No.
- 4.1.33 The allocation of ECTS is a key element of any study programme that aims at corresponding to international level also in terms for formal requirements. This key element is not fulfilled.
- 4.1.34 The expert wishes to express his greatest worry about the poor calculation and allocation of ECTS credits. It needs to be said that there are many inconsistencies, formal faults and contradictions. This can be seen at three levels:
- within syllabi
 - between syllabi
 - between syllabi and course descriptions in the SER
- 4.1.35 The syllabus of a core course of the study programme, i.e. “Human Resources Development” illustrates these difficulties. In the syllabus, an instruction for calculation is provided as follows:
- “1 ECTS credit = 30 hours of commitment, the course has 6 ECTS credits, a student must have 180 hours during the semester”⁸
- The course determines 3 teaching hours per week for “course” and 2 teaching hours for “exercises” in the head sections. Given 15 weeks per semester, as is determined in the syllabus, this would make up for 75 hours. The specification of activities, calculation for “lectures” is done with 4 (sic) hours per week and 14 (sic) weeks per semester. Unfortunately, no figures at all are provided for “exercises” although they should have 2 teaching hours per week. Together with all figures for other activities, the sum of the total work load is 180 hours which would correspond to 6 ECTS. Unfortunately, in the head section of the syllabus 7 ECTS credits are allocated to the course. Interestingly enough, in the self-evaluation report 8 ECTS are allocated to the same course (SER, p. 21).

⁸ According to the general directives one ECTS is equivalent to 25 working hours (SER, 127)

- 4.1.36 It must be noted that this course is just one example: From 22 syllabi provided, 2 were formally correct. What makes this all the more regrettable is that the syllabi format seems well-considered and practical.
- 4.1.37 When asked about these deficiencies, the study programme directors referred to mistakes in the translation. From the expert’s point of view, these deficiencies suggest clearly the need for more attention for formal issues at the managerial level of the study programme.
- 4.1.38 Substantial improvement of calculation and allocation of ECTS credits and resolving inconsistencies in syllabi have been key recommendations in the ER 2013, but were not implemented to date.
- 4.1.39 For different types of courses such as lectures and exercises, separate syllabi are standard in order to give more precise and transparent information to students on particular teaching contents, didactic methods and work load.

Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme’s goals and outcomes (competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills)?

- 4.1.40 With respect to the subjects and its teaching contents the materials and presentations in the site visit provided support the impression that they are partly sufficient for the achievement of the programme’s goals and outcomes.
- 4.1.41 In principal, the curriculum needs re-arrangement in order to sharpen the programme profile by deciding whether or not the programme wants to provide practical training in terms technical and vocational training in addition to academic training. If so, this would imply further development of professional expertise and teaching skills of the staff as well as developing an overarching didactic concept.
- 4.1.42 Taking into account the aim of providing also practical training, it is clear that collective efforts and additional resources at the study programme level are needed to expand the teaching skills in the direction of training skills in relevant fields of professional practice of Human Resources Managers.

Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?

- 4.1.43 There are clear linkages between the most parts of the curriculum, which are comprehensible and transparent. The focal points of these subjects are clear and complement each other without showing to much overlaps.

The relevance and the status of other courses such as “Systems Theory” and “Decision Theory” for the particular still are not clear with respect to the particular educational objectives. Purposeful revision of the curriculum was already recommended in the ER 2013.

How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?

- 4.1.44 In the SER, p. 15pp., two admission criteria are specified: completion of a bachelor programme and knowledge of English language. While the first criterion is measuring up to international standards, the language criterion is formulated too general. Here, the expert has learned from the persons responsible for the study programme that the admission criteria in language skills are following existing legal provisions
- 4.1.45 For enrolment in master studies, the following standard language skills are often required at the C1 level of the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages:
- Cambridge English Advanced: Grade B at minimum
 - Cambridge English Proficiency: Grade C
 - IELTS (academic): 7.0 points at minimum
 - TOEFL (iBT): 100 points at minimum

Is the ratio of academic staff to students appropriate?

- 4.1.46 The ratio of academic staff to students seems to be appropriate. The students feel very satisfied with the teaching support provided by the teaching staff.
- 4.1.47 15 staff members were said to teach in the study programme, of which 10 are full-time and 5 part-time. These staff members are teaching in other study programmes of the Faculty of Business, too.
- 4.1.48 A reliable assessment of the academic staff-student ratio would require reliable figures on the Full Time Equivalent (FTE) working for the study programme exclusively.

4.2 Staff

Does the institution have an adequate proportion of permanent staff and appropriate proportions of permanent and external staff?

- 4.2.1 During the site-visit, a list with 15 staff members was presented in the meeting with study programme directors. In the self-evaluation report of the university, dated April 2016, 11 CVs of staff members were transmitted.
- 4.2.2 The staff (of 15) consists of 3 Associate Professors, 11 Assistant Professors and one Professor, all of which have doctoral degrees. In the list of the entire university staff, the field of study is specified. According to this list, 6 staff members come from the field of economy/macroeconomics, 3 from management, 2 from insurance, 1 from informatics, 1 from law and 1 staff member from philology (1 staff member has no record in the list of the university staff).

Does the academic staff demonstrate proven ability at a high academic and didactic level and are their qualifications appropriate to the positions they hold within the institution according to the basic criteria?

- 4.2.3 Both in the meeting with the responsible persons for the study programme and in the meeting with professors, the expert gained the impression of a teaching staff with high motivation and commitment as well as teaching skills which ensure great variety in teaching at a high level.
- 4.2.4 This understanding was also confirmed in the student meeting where students reported on interesting teaching contents, courses with well-structured didactics and much helpful support by professors. Also, students highlighted courses where field research and practical work is done with companies, which in some cases could also be used for working with real company data. In particular, students acknowledged staff which participates in mobility programmes and seeks to establish cooperation with businesses.
- 4.2.5 A review of the CVs revealed that the majority staff members do not cite any research projects carried out or publications that unambiguously relate to their field of teaching, while for 3 staff members there is evidence for scientific experience in their field of teaching. However, due to the economical and management backgrounds of many staff members, there is sufficient expertise and knowledge to teach courses on business and general management issues as well as contents related to law.
- 4.2.6 There is no evidence in the CVs that there is sufficient specialist knowledge available in methods and techniques of human resources management which would come from practical business experience or specialised training in human resources management. With regard to the study programme’s objective to provide “practical training”, this must be regarded as a lack, since it cannot be assumed that academic knowledge can replace practical in-depth knowledge.
- 4.2.7 The qualifications of the academic staff are appropriate to the positions within the institution, since all teaching staff hold a doctoral degree. It should be emphasized that the department is highly engaged in further development of academic and didactic skills through participation in international programmes.

4.3 Research and International Co-Operation:

Is the teaching staff involved in research activities inside or outside the institution, and do these research activities feed back into teaching/course contents?

- 4.3.1 A considerable part of the teaching staff is or was involved in research activities both in and outside universities.

- 4.3.2 There is a strong commitment of the persons responsible for the study programme and the staff members for participation in international programmes. This is a promising approach which should be maintained in the future in any case. Also students report that the benefits of this engagement can be felt in the study programme.
- 4.3.3 For the past years, an explicit research strategy in the department did not exist. A new research plan 2016-2019 of the department of Human Resource Management was presented during the site visit. This research plan is supposed to be put into effect very soon, shows three core topics. Two of them belong to core areas of Human Resource Management. The research questions defined are:
- Building a proper HRM workforce to meet the local and regional market needs
 - How to create capable workforce
- 4.3.4 These research questions address important topics and there are good reasons for any economy to expand research efforts in these areas. However, the particular differences between these two topics remained unclear to the expert. It might be reasonable to resettle these research questions through further differentiation to avoid unnecessary duplication.
- 4.3.5 The third core topic is of high interest for a country seeking closer relations with the EU and it is definitely well-chosen for general political reasons. However, the topic of “Good Governance and EU Integration” seems to be rather remote from the key areas of the study programme. For that reason, it is questionable if this topic supports the further development of the primary objectives of the study programme. It might be an option to shift this question to other departments of the faculty and to clarify its relevance for human resource management.
- 4.3.6 A further pillar of the study programme’s research activities is collaborative projects in the greater region, especially with Albania and Montenegro, which are supposed to become more important in the future.
- 4.3.7 In an update of the research plan 2016-2019 which was transmitted to the expert after the site visit, a vision and strategy for future expansion of research at the national level and international collaborations is formulated. A set of realistic indicators attributed to each objective for monitoring the implementation of the strategy would have completed this strategy paper.

Is the extent and the quality of international cooperation in research and teaching adequate?

- 4.3.8 The department is actively involved in several EU-projects in programmes such as Erasmus and Tempus. For the future, participation in R&D programmes, particularly in Horizon 2020, is envisaged. Regarding the extent and quality of international cooperation, the expert received information from different stakeholders that there is a high commitment of the academic staff for international cooperation.

- 4.3.9 The persons responsible for the study programme are seeking to exploit the opportunities from international training projects for further development and further training of the entire staff through staff exchange and international training courses. On this occasion, the expert was presented the agenda of a workshop co-funded by the Tempus Programme to take place at the University of Peja in June 2016, where participants learn about teaching didactics, supervision of master thesis and curriculum development.
- 4.3.10 In the meeting with teaching staff, it was reported that the majority of professors participated in at least one EU training programme, be it in teaching or in quality management. Overall, the university and the department are undertaking serious efforts for further development of international cooperation. One major impact is that students feel to benefit much from these activities in teaching. The great readiness to use the opportunities of international co-operation for learning is a distinct feature of the representatives of the staff members of the university.

Are students involved in research and cooperation projects?

- 4.3.11 Students are involved in both, research and cooperation projects.
- 4.3.12 Both, persons responsible for the study programme and students reported unanimously that great efforts are made to strengthen linkages with the industry. This cooperation is used for applied research projects with students to gain insights in real work-life and to gain experiences in the practice of research. Students highly acknowledge this practice-oriented approach. In principal, the expert highly welcomes these efforts as they support orientation towards business needs and – from a systemic perspective - offers the opportunity for “productive irritation” as a key element for further development of the study plan.
- 4.3.13 The persons responsible for the programme are also seeking to engage students in collaborative publication activities.
- 4.3.14 An important issue is to determine market needs based on empirical field work and particularly the persons responsible for the study programme emphasized that data and information on market needs is used for further development of the curriculum, too.

4.4 Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

- 4.4.1 The Faculty of Business is located in a set of smaller buildings, which are kept in good condition in relation to the age of most of the buildings which formerly were military barracks.
- 4.4.2 For the future, a new faculty building is planned with start of construction scheduled for 2017. As is shown in an additional document on the financial planning of the Faculty of Business which was requested by the expert, costs for this construction are calculated in a separate line in the faculty budget indicating total construction expenses of EUR 1.350.000 from 2017-2019. The size of the existing facilities seems big enough for this project.

- 4.4.3 There is urgent need for bringing teaching facilities, computer labs and library up-to-date. However, the university has sufficient, yet not satisfying facilities and equipment to maintain teaching.
- 4.4.4 In the document on the financial planning of the Faculty of Business, extra funds are disclosed for the Department of Human Resource management. While for one budget line displaying EUR 21.000 for 2017, 2018 and 2019 the particular purpose of spending is not explained, some EUR 20.000 are specifically allocated to research in the department of Human Resource Management for 2017, 2018 and 2019.
- 4.4.5 The overall budget plan for the Faculty of Business is ambitious, since it is intended to gain additional income that surmounts the regular state funding by 25% each year.

4.5 Quality Management

- 4.5.1 On request of the expert, the university submitted the Report of the Quality Office of the Faculty of Business which refers to the year 2015. The report contains
- statistics on students structured by departments, programmes, programme levels for the academic years 2014/15 and 2015/16, and
 - a description of general activities in quality assurance: monitoring of student’s progress, design of schedules for lectures and examinations, collection of syllabi, student evaluation, documentation of academic staff, documentation for the reaccreditation program of HRM, and technical control of dissertations.
- 4.5.2 The section most relevant for this evaluation, “documentation for the reaccreditation programme of HRM” contains a list of activities which are presented as measures of quality assurance. These measures comprise:
- “Declarations,
 - Diplomas: BA, MA and PhD
 - Notifications of diplomas (for those who have finished their studies outside the Kosovo)
 - Contracts,
 - List of FULL TIME and PART TIME staff”
- 4.5.3 It is a prerequisite for any kind of quality management to keep documents and records complete, correct and up to date. Unfortunately, as, for example, the CVs have shown, many documents fail to meet these standards.
- 4.5.4 The Report of the Quality Management does not provide any information on a continuous improvement process following the recommendations of the ER 2013. Undoubtedly, the “list of quality measures” as quoted in section 4.5.2 refers to essential activities of professional administration of study programmes. However, a “strong understanding” of continuous improvement and further development of the study programme under review should leave much more room to detailed descriptions, how the study programme director and the staff have dealt

- with the recommendations, how measures for improvement were developed and implemented, and how their impact was assessed in terms of academic quality.
- 4.5.5 In general, there is need for further development of the quality management system in terms of an actively managed system of gathering information, assessing results, and deriving measures for improvement which eventually become visible in the curriculum.
- 4.5.6 Information on how the recommendations of the ER 2013 were taken up, was provided in the meeting with the persons responsible for the study programme only with respect to the increase of ECTS credits for the Master thesis.
- 4.5.7 An indicator for the overall development of the study programme is the statistics on students. According to the SER (p. 91), there were 100 students in the programme in the academic year 2013/14 and as many in the academic year 2014/15. For the academic year 2015/16, a decrease to the number of 50 students is reported. The motivation for this - intended - decrease was to raise the quality of the programme as it was explained in the programme director’s meeting.
- 4.5.8 Although there were 100 students in the academic year 2013/14 and the master programme’s duration is 4 semester, it is reported in the SER that there were no graduates until April 2016.

Summary and Conclusion

In the site visit, all relevant groups convincingly demonstrated high interest and high commitment in the study programme. Furthermore, there are plans for further development of internationalisation, didactics and research in the future.

Overall, the expert gained the impression that, unfortunately, this commitment is not backed by rigorous measures for improvement of the core areas of the study programme in the past and by a coherent, proactive system of quality assurance based on a comprehensible documentation of improvement processes.

Thus, there is a serious gap between commitment and actual achievements in the last three years.

The recommendation for re-accreditation in the ER 2013 was formulated under the condition of amendment of serious deficiencies. Most of the recommendations of the ER 2013 were not given sufficient attention or were not tackled. Serious deficiencies as explained in this evaluation report still exist.

5 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR RE-ACCREDITATION

The Bachelor programme *Music Education* can be re-accredited. It meets European standards and criteria on a basic level. The development of teacher education is an ongoing process.

The Bachelor programme *General Music Education* can be re-accredited. It meets European standards and criteria on a basic level. The development of teacher education is an ongoing process.

The Master programme *Human Resource Management* is not recommended for re-accreditation.