

Introduction

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) has been appointed by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology of Kosovo to evaluate academic programs at all institutions of Higher Education operating in the Republic of Kosovo.

The University "Haxhi Zeka" in Peja (UHZ) was established in 2012, as a successor of the Faculty of Applied Sciences in Business. It includes five schools: Faculty of Business, Faculty of Law, Faculty of Management in Tourism, Hospitality and Environment, Faculty of Agribusiness and Faculty of Arts. The UHZ submitted application for re-accreditation of several study programmes, and KAA appointed an expert team (ET) to evaluate these programs. This report refers to three of these programs, as seen in the table below.

Before the site visit took place, a Self Evaluation Report (SER) was provided by the UHZ, which included an overview of the institution's mission statement, organization, quality management, funding, facilities, academic staff, as well as information about UHZ's study programs, students, international cooperation and research.

On the evening of the 17th May 2017, the members of the ET met with Mr. Fisnik Gashi of the KAA for a preparatory meeting and working dinner. Hardbound copies of the SER were provided, the committee was formed, and responsibilities for study programs were allocated as follows:

Faculty	Programme	Level / Award-type	Number of Credits	Lead Expert
Business Faculty	Human Resource Management	MSc	120	Tanja Dmitrović, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia
Faculty of Management in Tourism, Hospitality and Environment	Environmental Management	MSc.	120	Mladen Krajačić, University of Zagreb, Croatia
Faculty of Law	Constitutional - Administrative Law	LLM	60	Salvador Rus Ruffino, University of Leon, Spain

KAA officers Mr. Fisnik Gashi, Mr. Elmi Kelmendi and Mr. Sokol Daka provided the administrative support during the site visit.

The experts compiled this report according to the Accreditation Standards of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency, the Guidelines for Experts on Academic Programs, and a Code of Good Practice for Site Visits. Programme evaluation is based on the UHZ's SER, dated March 2017, and the factual evidence gathered during the site visit on 18th May, 2017. No additional materials were requested after the site visit. The findings and recommendations of the program evaluation reports in previous accreditation cycles (provided by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency) were also taken into account in order to evaluate progress and establish whether continuous quality improvement is pursued at the institutional and program level.

The ET is grateful to University Haxhi Zeka for hosting their visit on 18th May 2017. The members of the ET are aware of the historical situation that continues to affect the contemporary social, cultural, political and economic environment in Kosovo. The ET therefore appreciates the continued efforts of the management, the academic staff and the students of University Haxhi Zeka to develop the quality of its resources and teaching programs in difficult local and national circumstances.

The ET recognizes University Haxhi Zeka's endeavour to provide a real university level of education in Kosovo. The ET would like to stress that all comments offered in this Report are intended to contribute to further improvements of the institution as it strives towards the achievement of its mission.

The members of the ET wish to thank the KAA and especially Mrs. Furtuna Mehmeti, Mr. Fisnik Gashi, Mr. Elmi Kelmendi and Mr. Sokol Daka for their hospitality, support and cooperation during this accreditation procedure.

1. MASTER PROGRAM IN HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT (Faculty of Business)

Preface

Master degree program in Human Resource Management was first accredited in 2013. In 2016, the evaluation expert team recommended the program not be re-accredited. The main reason was that, despite the demonstrated commitment of UHZ staff to develop the program, the majority of shortcomings and deficiencies identified at the time of initial accreditation were not remedied. At the time, the ET found that commitment was not backed by rigorous measures for improvement of the core areas of the study program and by a coherent, proactive system of quality assurance based on a comprehensible documentation of improvement processes. At the same time, evaluation report of 2016 highlights some positive features of the program, which indicate program's potential.

UHZ resubmitted application for program's accreditation in 2017. By comparing self-evaluation reports of 2016 and 2017, we find that only minor changes were made in the text. Program's positioning and market labor justifications remain vague. The text is at times repetitive and it lacks substantive information. As established during the interviews, it is also plagued by mistakes (e.g., SER, p. 378, states that 262 students are enrolled to the HRM program in 2016/2017 even though there was no enrollment in that year), and incorrect wording (e.g., SER, p. 56, indicates that UHZ has agreement for student transfer with Tetovo State University although the student exchange was actually meant). The most problematic issue is that the SER does not reflect upon comments in evaluation report of 2016. The section addressing recommendations of previous evaluation (SER; p. 67-68) refers to recommendations of 2012 (?), while the report of 2016 is not even mentioned.

Overall, the SER was poorly prepared and shows certain indifference of the UHZ's management to make a case why the program should be accredited. The meeting with professors responsible for the program (assist. prof. dr. Theranda Bequiri and assist. prof. dr. Bedri Statovci) has made much better impression and provided some necessary clarifications regarding program structure and delivery, as well as grounding why certain decisions were made.

On a positive side, UHZ has employed additional faculty (on a full-time basis) that has expertise in HRM and thereby improved program's academic qualification portfolio. Most notably, assist. prof. dr. Theranda Bequiri, the current Head of the program, has some international experience and relevant publications in the HRM field. She was instrumental in making the necessary changes in program curriculum, which improved its quality and comparability to the international benchmarks.

1. Academic Programs and Student Management

Master Program in Human Resource Management is a 2-year (four semesters) program with 120 ECTS credits. It includes 11 mandatory courses and two elective courses (to be chosen out of two sets of three courses in the 2nd and 3rd semester).

The objectives of UHZ indicate that it aims, as an autonomous higher education institution, to further knowledge, academic education, scientific research, and artistic creativity in order to contribute to the development of Kosovo. It aspires to uphold the highest standards in teaching and learning, scientific research and artistic creativity by using available resources efficiently. The vision of UHZ is to become a well-known university in the region for creating and applying knowledge (Quality Assurance Strategy of the University of Haxhi Zeka, 2016, pp. 7-8). In the interview, UHZ's management emphasized regional perspective and importance of forging close ties with business community. To this end, UHZ formed business advisory board, and signed several cooperation agreements with local companies.

The positioning of Master Program in Human Resource Management within UHZ's program portfolio and its correspondence to UHZ's mission is rather vague. This issue is not addressed in the SER even though this has been recommended in all previous evaluation reports. The UHZ's management and teachers responsible for the program indicated that the Master Program in Human Resource Management is the only such program in Kosovo and they believe that it is needed, as Kosovo has 130.000 companies, which require specialized expertise in HRM to boost their market competitiveness.

UHZ does not perform market research to establish market needs. The labor market requirements have been estimated based on heuristics: general impressions and practical experience of faculty gained through business contacts. Some graduates are expected to find work in HRM departments of large and medium-sized firm, and for the others, UHZ expects they could offer consultancy services in the area of recruitment, training and management of employees.

One of the major issues identified in the previous evaluation reports was the structure of the curriculum. The status and placement of some courses was deemed inappropriate, and some important courses were missing. These deficiencies have now been addressed in a relatively satisfactory manner. Program has been designed according to the international benchmarks and the curriculum corresponds to international standards. Faculty members participated in program development.

The allocation of ECTS is appropriate and sufficiently comprehensible. The program has in total 120 ECTS, and is run in a full-time mode. The first three semesters include course work (courses account for 6-8 ECTS each), while the last semester is devoted entirely to the master thesis (30 ECTS). Each course consists of lectures (2-3 contact hours per week) and exercises (1-2 contact hours per week). UHZ uses a formula 1 ECTS = 30 hours of work for a student. On average, one third of allocated hours are contact hours, the rest are devoted to independent study, which is comparable to the international standard.

Many students work (part-time or full-time), hence the lectures are organized in the afternoon hours and/or Saturdays. The students reported that the workload is manageable for them. Nevertheless, progression and completion rates are not very encouraging. A certain number of students also abandon their studies. To address this issue, a tutorial system was introduced in 2016/2017. This is commendable as it may represent an important step towards improving study results.

The courses include a variety of teaching methods, combine theoretical and practically oriented work and use a range of assessment methods. At a face value, they are sufficient for the meeting the program's goals and outcomes. During the interview, students indicated that the program helps increase their competences, knowledge and skills which helps them in their daily jobs and contributes to career advancement. Required literature also seems

appropriate and up to international standard. However, availability of literature in the library seems to be rather limited.

The study program aims to combine "academic studies and professional training" (SER, p. 19). As already noted in previous evaluation reports, professional training in terms of technical and vocational training requires highly specialized knowledge in occupational fields and didactic knowledge, which is distinct from academic teaching. It is not clear from the program curriculum and course syllabi how "professional training" is achieved. Program leaders mentioned that students get practical insights through project work and guest speakers. However, student reported that projects are not linked to specific companies and/or real-life business problems. Internships, although mentioned in the SER (p. 24), are not included in the curriculum. It seems that acquiring practical professional experience is left to the ambition and resourcefulness of students, even though the combination of academic and professional work is presented as program's distinguishing feature.

Admission criteria include entrance exam and take into account grade point average at the bachelor level. In principle, this is comparable to international standards, however, it is not clear, what are the weights assigned to each element. This question remained unanswered in the interviews. It seems that admission procedures lack transparency. Also, no data could be provided on the ratio between applicants and accepted students, although the general claim was that demand exceeds the number of available study places. This is at odds with statistical data presented in the SER (p. 57) which indicates that despite the annual intake of 100 students in 2013-2015 and 50 in 2015/2016, the number of active students in the program was 61, 105 and 66 respectively. At the time of preparation of the SER (the beginning of 2017), only 19 students graduated.

2. Staff

In the site visit interview, management of UHZ identified academic staff sufficiency at the university level as one of the major issues. Master program in HRM is sufficiently staffed. The list of academic staff who teach in the program includes 12 professors (all holding Ph.D. degrees), 10 of which are employed full-time. Program curriculum includes one other professor (assist. prof. dr. Ibrahim Krasniqi) who is responsible for teaching one obligatory and one elective course. The proportion of permanent staff to part time and external staff is adequate. Also, the ratio of the academic staff and the students is favorable.

The criteria for teaching posts are getting more stringent over time, and consequently qualifications of academic staff have improved over the past few years. Inspection of faculty CVs reveals a medium level of fit between the nature of the courses and instructors' academic qualifications and research record. Majority of faculty hold Ph.D. degrees in economics and business, so they are qualified to teach general business, management and strategy courses. It was explained in the interviews that many faculty members work closely with companies, and they draw on this practical experience in their pedagogical work. International

cooperation projects, such as Tempus enabled some staff members to participate in pedagogical training (e.g., they attended the course on how to produce course syllabi at the University of Staffordshire) but such training should be extended to all faculty and be organized on a regular basis.

Faculty reported that full professors have enough time to devote to research. Assistants have higher workloads as most of them are doctoral students and they also have to perform various administrative tasks (e.g., serve as quality assurance officers). The actual teaching load of some professors exceeds the prescribed load. In such cases, extra teaching hours up to a certain limit are paid in addition to salary.

3. Research and International Co-operation

Internationalization remains one of the challenges for UHZ. The university management realizes that in order to increase international exposure of all stakeholders, some programs offered in English language are needed. For example, UHZ plans to merge some similar programs in order to make room for a program delivered in English.

International cooperation takes different forms. UHZ has signed several international agreements, mainly with a goal to establish international student and faculty exchange. It also participates in several international projects (e.g., Tempus, Euforia, Erasmus+), and cooperates with universities in the region in organization of conferences. International projects are aimed primarily at developing pedagogical and research skills of the academic staff.

Research record of the faculty is rather modest, and mostly limited to regional journal and conference publications. Support of research activities at the institutional level is still in the early stages of development. UHZ regularly monitors research record of academic staff, who have to report on their publications, conference participation, and consulting activities. UHZ is primarily a teaching university, but it aspires to become fully-fledged research institution. In order to achieve this, a concerted effort should be made to establish infrastructure conducive to research. Currently some support is provided in a form of research fund for financing the costs of the conferences. Academic staff expressed a wish to increase these funds, which would enable also some students to participate in the international scientific gatherings. Students indicated that UHZ should increase its involvement in the international programs in order to facilitate international exchange for students and professors. However, this may not be sufficient. In addition to the promotion criteria, which push professors to publish in peer-reviewed journals with impact factor, the research infrastructure should be developed.

4. Finances and Infrastructure

UHZ is financially fully dependent on the public funds, which are administratively allocated by the Ministry of Education. Finances are dealt with at the university level.

Faculties have no financial autonomy, and programs have no dedicated financial resources. UHZ's management believes that the current budget is sufficient to support the delivery of existing study programs. The main issue in the eyes of university management as well as the majority of professors that ET interviewed is insufficient physical infrastructure (not enough space, inadequate buildings, etc.). A construction of a new building for Faculty of Business is planned for 2018.

The program in the field of HRM does not require any specialized infrastructure. Rooms are large enough and are equipped with basic computer equipment (e.g., computer and overhead projectors are available). Computer classroom is available. Wi-fi (password protected) is available in all buildings. Students can access their study records on-line, and they can also perform some administrative tasks using on-line study system. However, UHZ does not have intranet where course webpages and other relevant information sources could be easily accessed. Intranet could be used also to facilitate teacher feedback to students (e.g., by grading and commenting the assignments within e-clasrooms).

Library resources are very modest. Library has received book donations from several donors (e.g., other universities), and was able to purchase some titles by using funds from the EU projects. However, this is not sufficient to assure access to the required literature for students. UHZ used to have access to EBSCO on-line journal database however, the subscription was recently cancelled. It is extremely worrying that vice-rector expressed the view that on-line journal databases are not necessary. Apparently, academic staff tries to overcome this serious deficiency by using access to on-line databases through accounts of research assistants and junior faculty members who study at other institutions, mostly abroad (and have access through their schools).

5. Quality Management

Quality assurance mechanisms and system are defined at the university level, hence they are uniformly applied at all Faculties and in all programs. UHZ has recently adopted Quality Assurance Strategy, which outlines the mission, vision, objectives, measures, action plan and budgetary strategy. It serves as the basis to create and consolidate its structures and mechanisms that promote and apply quality assurance standards and ensure the quality assurance is a key part of teaching and learning process (Quality Assurance Strategy of the University of Haxhi Zeka, 2016).

Procedures for reviewing study programs and assessing teacher performance are in place, and feedback loops exist. The new strategy thus provides the basis for continuous improvement process that was lacking in the past (as pointed out by the previous evaluation reports).

6. Recommendations

In order to increase the quality of the program, as well as its international comparability and stature, the following recommendations are offered:

1. Define mission statement at the program level.
2. Conduct structured market research regarding market needs in order to further develop the program, adjust it to the specific needs of Kosovo, and thus increase employability of students.
3. Create internship opportunities for students, and include internship into the curriculum.
4. Increase transparency of admission procedures and establish unequivocal criteria and ranking procedures.
5. Support younger academic staff members to devote more time to research (which would lead not only to faster completion of their Ph.D. degrees but also to preparing academic publications).
6. Establish research infrastructure, increase funds for research support, and reward research achievements.
7. Support and stimulate regular pedagogical training, and make it available to all faculty members.
8. Assuring access to on-line journal databases is paramount for increasing quality of teaching and research. It would be worth considering that library consortium at the national level be formed, as this would substantially alleviate cost burden for all participating universities.
9. Establish information infrastructure (intranet) that would facilitate program delivery and information flow (e.g., e-classrooms, e-bulletin boards, etc.).

7. Proposal for accreditation

The Master Program Human Resource Management meets minimal European standards and criteria hence the ET **recommends it to be re-accredited for the period of three years.**

2. MASTER PROGRAM IN CONSTITUTIONAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE LAW (Law School)

Preface

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA), member of Enqua, has received a petition of the University Haxhi Zeka in Pejë to accredit the Master Program in Constitutional and Administrative Law (one year and 60 ECTS). In order to evaluate the KAA has set up an expert:

Prof. Dr. Salvador Rus-Rufino of University of Leon (ES), who works with a team of experts from another European universities and countries.

During the assessment process, the expert followed all the guidelines of the KAA for evaluating academic programs. The expert was able to visit the facilities and the building of the University Haxhi Zeka in Pejë. The Vice-Rector of the University Haxhi Zeka made a presentation of the institution. Prof. Dr. Rus Rufino hold a meeting with two professors of the Master Program in Constitutional and Administrative Law. It was a meeting planned with three masters teachers, Avdullah Robaj, Academic Director, Sabiha Shala and Veton Vula. Finally they came to the appointment only two, Prof. Robaj and Prof. Vula, the last one does not teach any lecture in the Master. Therefore a site-visit was organised by the KAA for May 18, 2017.

According to the Code of Good Practice for site-visits and the Guidelines for Experts (Institutions and Academic Programs), edited by the KAA, the expert has written the following evaluation report. The evaluation report is based upon a Self Evaluation Report of the University Haxhi Zeka concern with the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law of March 2017, and further upon the findings of the expert during the site-visit and the meetings.

The frames of reference for the evaluation report are international standards of comparable institutions of higher education (benchmarks) and the standards, edited by the KAA. The KAA asked the expert to evaluate the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law and deliver a report with a resolution to offer the opportunity to the University Haxhi Zeka make appropriate improvements.

The University Haxhi Zeka offers two masters one-year (60 ECTS) one in Constitutional and Administrative Law and other in Criminal Law. The report refer to the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law, which is opened only for the students who got the Bachelor Degree in Law in four years (eight semesters) and completed 240 ECTS. The second program will be accredited next year.

The meeting with the cited professors served to confirm that they have formed a team motivated with the project to offer a Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law in University Haxhi Zeka. In addition, the whole teaching team put a special emphasis on transmitting to the evaluator that difference of this the master degree in relation with other similar masters that are offered in public and private universities in Kosovo. The fundamental orientation is to prepare graduates who have a very practical profile with capacity to analyze legal problems, ability to write document to present their ideas and resolutions and, finally, to be able to analyze situations taking as reference the laws and the most authoritative opinions.

However there are some problems to be resolved as soon as possible to ensure the quality of the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law, which is one of the main

points of the mission that was described in the Self Evaluation Report of the University Haxhi Zeka.

1. Academic Programs and Student Management

In the meeting with the professors became clear that the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law aims to provide theoretical and practical training at the same time. The University of Haxhi Zeka pretends to incorporate professional and expert, who is not professor, to teach to the students the technical methods and the practical of constitutional and administrative law. The University of Haxhi Zeka wants to offer a program in which is it possible to combine in a balanced way the lectures in the classroom, as stated in the *syllabus* for each subject, with several practical seasons to get a practical training in public or private institutions, focused in public institutions of the legal system of Kosovo.

The master program is very popular among students who complete their studies at Haxhi Zeka University. In the three editions have been offered 50, 50 and 45 places and there have been almost three times more requests. This fact shows that for students of the University the program is useful to complete their training in a specific area such as the constitutional and administrative law for a nation that is developing its legal system.

The master program is in general comparable with the programs offered in other law schools. But the one-year Master program has a critical point: the teachers and the distribution of courses of the program.

The structure of the master is as follows:

- First semester 24 ECTS (21 compulsory and 3 electives)
- Second semester 19 ECTS (16 compulsory and 3 electives)
- Master thesis 17 ECTS

The master offers 60 ECTS. Of all these credits one Professor, Arsim Bajrami, is in charge of 11 ECTS in two courses in the first semester and 8 in two courses, one compulsory and another optional, in the second; Professor Avdullah Robaj, responsible for the master, has 8 ECTS in two courses, one compulsory and one elective, in the first semester and another 6 ECTS in the second. The other four teachers have a more balanced teaching responsibility. This distribution of teaching activity is clearly inadequate because, in addition, Professor Bajrami has partial dedication to the university and he occupies a top position in the Government of Kosovo. In addition, a teacher who is coordinator of the master with fifty students does not seem appropriate to teach eleven ECTS in the program. Perhaps this is the reason why in two years only nine students have obtained the diploma and completed their studies by presenting the master's thesis.

The program also has another problem. The library of the Law School contains few texts and most of them are manuals or handbooks, commentaries or books written by the professor of the School, oriented to the study of the subjects of the Bachelor. Therefore, it

is difficult for the students to perform a real research work when they write the master thesis.

In the Self Evaluation Report the information about the program is short, i.e. teaching and learning methodology of every topic. Although aspects of the assessment, exams, tests and grades are more complete. It is surprising that no reference is made to the master thesis. The School of Law has a very complete and very specific document to orient the students about the character, extent, content and method of the final master's work, but it is not included in the Self Evaluation Report. The expert could see this document in Kosovo language.

The document Self Evaluation Report stated that the numbers of teachers who teach classes in the master are six. It is a very small number for the 45 students who currently attend it, as well as to take care of master's degree thesis. Each teacher would have to manage more than seven proposals each year. This situation is negative to the training of the students, the quality of the work and the prestige of the master. Therefore, it is necessary and urgent to enroll more teachers in the master. The balance between theoretical lectures and practical activities of students is correct. Also, it is a good balance the value of the individual and independent work of students in each course.

The order of the courses warrants that the students can receive a good training in the theoretical, practical and empirical foundations of Constitutional and Administrative Law. The reason is that the organization and the schedule is a balanced mixture between practical, theoretical, specific and general courses.

The classes must be more participative, and students are given preparatory work to complete before class, it is necessary in a master oriented to the practice. A Faculty member with a relevant expertise, together, must supervise the master's theses, is due at the end of the academic year and must reflect the theoretical knowledge and research skills the student has acquired.

The selection of candidates to complete the master is fair and complete. A minimum score is required in the Bachelor and a very adequate test to know which the best candidate to study the master is. It is recommended to be strict in its application to prestige the master and attract students from other Kosovo regions and bordering countries.

2. Staff

The Staff to be assessed is the teaching for the one-year master has problems. The number of professors seems insufficient to run with quality the program.

About the teachers who teach the master: three are full-time, three are employed part-time. The list of professors who facilitated to the team of experts seems excessive responsibility for supporting with six teachers all courses, research works and theses of the Master. As it is cited, a teacher has to teach 19 ECTS in four courses and he is a part-time

professor, and he has in charge the main and important courses "Positive Constitutional Law", "Constitutional Judiciary", "Comparative Constitutional Law (all of them are compulsory) and "Constitutional Clinic". so many different courses such as Criminal Procedure and Legal Medicine. Dr. Robaj coordinates the Master and also he is responsible for three courses. Dr. Zhilla he is part-time professor and he teaches three courses. This situation shows that the Master does not have enough professors for a total of 11 courses; also those professors have to take care of research papers, commentaries of practical cases of each student and the master thesis of every student. For example, if the master has 45 students enrolled six professors are not enough to evaluate more or less 90 research papers and commentaries and oriented the students for 45 master theses.

It is necessary to increase the number of professors who teach in order to warranty the quality and the attention to the students in the master program.

There is no mention on professors who come from professional practice or are experts in some field that are very useful in a master primarily oriented to the practice. Also, there is nothing about the control, evaluation and monitoring the external activities of all professors.

The balance of gender in academic positions is unbalanced. In the Self Evaluation Report there are no women. Should establish a procedure for monitoring the gender balance of academic staff across the Faculty.

3. Research and the International Cooperation

A Master is not a program oriented exclusively to research. But in this case the students have to perform several papers and a final research thesis. Therefore, the research in the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law is not specified in the proposal. It might put some examples of research topics on which students could orient their research. It could be a practice that can be distinguished the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law of the University Haxhi Zeka.

All professors of the Master must elaborate a plan of research every year and offer at least one title for research papers and theses of the students. It will be his personal research activity and he will be evaluating at least every two years.

Additionally, some students who successfully complete the master's program may continue on to the doctoral program and, thus, an academic career at a university or research institution.

Students have the opportunity to publish their papers, commentaries and thesis in the university reviews or order publication even on line in the web page of the University Haxhi Zeka.

The Self Evaluation Report collects all the publications of the teachers of the School of Law. Among those who teach lectures and explain courses in the Master only one is a co-

author of three publications and another has published two contributions. This is a very low level of research for a postgraduate program that seeks to innovate and prepare lawyers with a practical and at the same time critical mentality.

Internationalization. The University Haxhi Zeta has several general agreements with foreign universities and institutions. The Law School maintains a close relationship with several universities, i.e. Graz in Austria, elsewhere there is no specific development for the Master for mobility of professors and especially students. This mobility is exceptional.

It is a new Master, now it is possible to establish a strategic plan, which includes a strong international activity. The School of Law needs to develop an explicit and realistic strategy for internationalization its activities, its projects and its programs. Also the professors and the students must collaborate in this strategy.

If the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law wants to attract academics staff from outside of Kosovo, it is necessary to develop a strategy to archive this goal with specific agreements and others initiatives.

4. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

The University has several buildings in two campuses. Therefore the School of Law shares the space with the Faculty of Arts and its class rooms can only be located on it. The facilities are not adequate, specially the library and some classrooms. There are few small meetings or seminars rooms for students; there is no space for a library in Constitutional and Administrative Law. Therefore, the University must make a great effort to get the means to ensure quality teaching.

One of the most critical aspects to run successfully a master and to develop the research in the Master is the absence of a specialized library with sufficient books and reviews to write the research papers and theses. Establish a library is a question of investing money and time. But now there are some ways to cut this investment and time.

- First, request to other universities the donation repeated copies, as the experts could see in the library, i.e. some US institutions.
- Second, reaching agreements with printer houses to buy funds and defer payments, as the agreements with EBSCO.
- Third, use available data on-line bibliographic repertoires and other materials. The library has not any access to those programs and data bases.
- Fourth, reaching agreements with public or private institutions to donate part of their funds to the library, or try to convince those institutions that the library of the Faculty of Law will be their library.
- Fifth, try to reputable lawyers and jurists have donated to the library faculty. In any case, it is impossible to development the research without a library or to have access to online library resources.

The Master does not have a separate budget. All money received or captures, it manages by the General Administration of the University in its overall budget. A primary objective is to achieve some economic independence and attract more resources from public and private institutions. In order to develop their research projects and improvement plans. Teaching, research and development of students improve their quality if more resources become available. Just looking for economic independence can develop and extend their teaching plans and offer specialized courses.

5. Quality Management

The Self Evaluation Report, which contains important errors that were not clarified in the meeting, writes nothing about the government of the Master. There is a general coordination and a scientific staff, but nothing more. Therefore, to evaluate the organization is virtually impossible.

According to University the Master has a questionnaire to assess every semester the professors and faculty. Students must complete questionnaire paper. There are no evidences if the most of students deliver or not the questionnaires. Maybe the Master should rethink how to get the answers of the students. An online questionnaire to guarantee the anonymity of the student would be a solution, but could also apply other measures such as the student could not see their scores in the subjects until complete and return the questionnaire. In this way it could get better information on the quality of professors and the education provided at the Master.

Finally, there is a procedure for evaluating the student combines the evaluation continues as the written exams and tests and personal student work. There is not a document containing such a procedure for quality assurance and evaluation, the expert team has this evidence in the Self Evaluation Report.

6. Recommendations

The recommendations of the ET could be summarize in those aspects.

1. Having an internship program for students in institutions and in international universities.
2. All professors (full, part, assistant and associate) should have personal research plans or project, which are reviewed regularly and evaluate by the academic coordination of the Master.
3. It is necessary to have a library with digital repertories and facilities for the Master.
4. The Master should to change the way to get the questionnaires of the students.
5. The Master must to elaborate a specific document to fix the criteria to develop the quality.

6. The Faculty must to develop a document setting out its international strategy.
7. The internationalization is a matter, which must be leaded by the Dean of the Faculty of Law with the assistant of the Coordinator of the Master.
8. Consider introducing optional courses on new technologies and deontology.

7. Proposal for accreditation

The Expert Team cannot propose the accreditation of the Master in Constitutional and Administrative Law of the University of Haxhi Zeka. The reasons are as follow:

- The one-year master program with 45 students every year needs more teachers than six. The distribution of the courses should be done in such a way that the total ECTS (43) are distributed among all teachers. For example, no teacher will be able to give more than 5 ECTS nor can he manage more than 4 master's theses.
- The Staff is too small to ensure the quality of the Master.
- There is no explanation in the Self Evaluation Report on the essentials of the master thesis, for example, methodology, purpose, orientations, topics, evaluation methods, criteria, etc.
- There is not a specific library for research and also for student with digital access to virtual libraries, repertories, handbooks and cases books.
- There is not a definition of a strategic plan for the internationalization of the Master exchanging professors and students.
- There is not a document which setting out the essential aspects of Quality Management.
- There are some problems in the structure, information and contents, explained in the Self Evaluation Report.

3. MASTER IN ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT (Faculty of Management in Tourism, Hospitality and Environment)

Preface

The Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) has received a request from the University Haxhi Zeka in Peja to undergo evaluation of the Master Study Program in Environmental Management. Professor Mladen Krajacic from University of Zagreb has been engaged to complete that evaluation as a member of the expert team established by KAA.

1. Program Structure and Student Management

Master Program in Environmental Management is a 2-year (four semesters) program with 120 ECTS credits. It offers nine mandatory courses and six elective courses, equally distributed to the three semesters, and students are expected to complete a total of 12 courses. The last semester is provided for completion of a master thesis. Different quantity of exercises is joint to the particular study courses, and the ratio of practical work to lectures is properly prescribed in the Self-evaluation report.

Similar ideas on an interdisciplinary master's program and research network, for students who want to apply deep scientific thought to the Earth environment and some of its most urgent problems, are certainly recognizable in both regional and European high-education area. Biologists, geoscientists, chemists, physicists, mathematicians, economists and lawyers come together to resolve environmental problems in a collaborative way. Study programs, resembling that of the University of Peja, deal with processes that control the Earth system and the impact of human activities on this system. They emphasize a rigorous process-level understanding of important environmental problems to learn how to analyze and manage the complex marine systems, ground and surface water systems, atmospheric and terrestrial systems. Mathematical models, integrated into those processes, should help in understanding topics like "biogeochemical cycles and global change" or "environmental pollution and remediation". Courses in legislation, policy and economics contribute to successful implementation of the process-level understanding of natural systems into different area of human activities. Graduates of such master programs have a wide range of job opportunities, for example, in public administration, authorities and federal offices; international organizations; planning, engineering and consulting offices; enterprises and infrastructure providers; science and research.

2. Staff

Although the general idea meets international standards, and the general concept is comparable to referent programs of some European universities, there are remarkable shortcomings discrediting the study program at the University of Peja. As emphasized above, interdisciplinary structure, in both research and teaching, should be accomplished by collaboration of experts in various topics and fields of primarily natural, but also social sciences. And the expert team has learned from Self Evaluation Report (SER) that just a few teachers are involved as lecturers to carry on that complex and delicate study program. Far too few to satisfy quality requirements.

The problem grows by taking into account that some lecturers are poorly experienced. Assistant professor who is in charge to accomplish three mandatory courses and two elective courses has fifteen years of experience in the secondary school, and only five at the University. In his CV document, there is a very confusing information that he received his assistant professor position in 2012, and his doctoral degree in 2013! Some of

his publications do certainly not qualify him to be a lecturer of the courses mentioned in SER. All the papers have been published in low-quality journals having dubious editorial boards including people from industry or ministries of some developmental countries! Most of the publications cannot be accessed.

Another lecturer who is in charge to accomplish three mandatory and two elective courses is a young assistant professor who is also not experienced enough, according to her age. However, unlike the previous one, she could be considered a prospective pillar of the study program. By receiving bachelor degree in ecology and environmental protection, and by improving her knowledge at the University of Zurich and the University of Karlsruhe (receiving MSc and PhD, respectively), she has been recognized as the right person, in the right place, at the right time. At least for a while, because another disappointment is coming soon. Too many dubious journals, too many papers that are not reachable, and not enough hard-science in her CV document, even when papers have been published in an international co-authorship. The topics, like "Feeding live prey to Zoo animals: response to Zoo visitors in Switzerland" or "Environmental education in high schools in Kosovo – a teachers' perspective" could certainly not qualify anybody to be a superior lecturer in "Management and biodiversity of protected areas", "Environmental hazards" or "Air, water and soil monitoring". Unfortunately, although designated as a responsible person to represent the program during the site-visit, she was not there.

Assistant professor who received just his BSc degree in natural sciences, improving his proficiency in tourism (MSc, PhD), is qualified in "Ecotourism and environment", but not much in "Resource management and environmental planning". According to his age, a development towards proficiency, required in the study program courses, is very uncertain.

It is unclear what is the role of the professors and assistants whose CV documents are presented in the Annex file, although they are not mentioned in the courses overview (Selimaj, Gashi, Lulaj, Begolli Dauti, Latifi Sadrija...). They are mostly economists or have a specialization in the field of tourism. Additionally, some assistants with MSc in Literature, with "linguistic skills in languages", could be found.

Some professors have included daily newspaper news on the list presenting their publications in scientific journals.

Mentioning of membership or president-position in a political party is not welcome at any university.

3. Research and the International Cooperation

The expert team has not expected a research-intensive university, but the research level at the UHZ is far too low in the particular field of study program. The evaluators are disappointed with the topics that professors have chosen to be focused on. One could hardly believe that a student knowledge, skills and competences, expected as learning outcomes (SER), would emerge from an environment that is exclusively oriented to tourism. It was very

indicative that one of the persons who represented the study program during the site-visit announced her affiliation as "Faculty of Management and Tourism", omitting "Environment" from the Faculty name, as less important.

Cooperation agreement between the UHZ and the Humboldt University is mentioned in SER. However, it remains uncertain what is the particular feature of that collaboration.

4. Finances, Infrastructure Facilities

As the expert team was told, both the Faculty, and the whole University, suffer insufficient financial support. Nevertheless, there is enough money for extra teaching hours to be paid.

The total budget structure of the University and the Faculty is uncertain which is comparable to other Kosovo universities. The Master study program in Environmental Management does not have a separate budget. According to the power-ratio at the Faculty and the University, an orphan-status of the program could be presumed.

The facilities seem to be satisfactory, at least concerning lecture-rooms and seminar-rooms. Following insisting, the practical-work rooms were shown to the expert team. Those laboratories belong to another faculty, the Faculty of Agribusiness what should not be a problem in itself on unique universities. However, laboratories look little bit empty and sterile, missing some infrastructure elements, consumables and chemicals. Being asked if those capacities were sufficient to be employed in study programs of the two faculties, the University representatives announced that the practical work was organized in small groups even on Saturdays.

5. Quality Management

The representatives of the study program were not asked about students' evaluation of the quality of professors and the education provided at the Master study program.

However, information available from the staff CV documents reflects low quality requirements at the institutional level.

The responsible person for the study program was absent during the site-visit. In that way, the Expert Team could not be provided with some additional information. Another representative, expected to be in charge to present the program and the institution was not there. One single person, who does not speak English, was available in the respective part of the reaccreditation procedure. Moreover, in the afternoon session with the Faculty staff, there was no one included in the program under evaluation. It does not give much credit to the program and the institution.

Finally, the Expert Team learned from students that the practical work is extremely restricted, in fact, it is represented only by visiting different institutions, and demonstrating

some practical environmental problems. It is insufficient to develop skills in environmental management.

6. Recommendations

The mission of the Master study program in Environmental Management – to provide students with the advanced interdisciplinary training necessary for solving environmental problems (SER) – could only be accomplished as follows:

1. strong effort of carefully chosen and sufficient staff, oriented towards disciplines that perfectly match requirements of the study program, is necessary.
2. The quality criteria should dramatically be raised at the institutional level.
3. The staff could not be allowed to build up their salaries by being overloaded in teaching hours.
4. Much more attention should be paid on exercises and practical work, it could not be compensated by demonstration, site-visits, and study-tours (although the latter is beneficial and welcome, it is certainly not enough to produce graduates who will be really skillful, professional and useful for Kosovo society).
5. Much more commitment is needed when the study program, together with facilities and staff, should be presented to an Expert Team in a process of accreditation.

7. Proposal for accreditation

For all the reasons mentioned above, but primarily because:

- the study program could not properly be presented to the Expert Team, by missing the responsible person, as well as other staff representatives who have been announced in the site-visit schedule,
- the Expert Team learned from students' representatives that the practical work, joint to the study program courses, is actually not running,

the Expert Team **cannot propose the accreditation of the Master Study Program in Environmental Management** at the University of Haxhi Zeka in Peja.

4. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PROGRAM ACCREDITATION

The ET finds that:

1. The master degree program **Human Resource Management** meets minimal European standards and criteria, and **can be re-accredited for the period of three years.**
2. The master degree program in **Constitutional and Administrative Law** should not be **re-accredited.**
3. The master degree program in **Environmental Management** should not be **re-accredited.**