

Accreditation of Academic Programs

University of Prizren

Final Report

Accreditation

- ✓ Business Administration (BA) and International Management (BA)
- ✓ Management in Agribusiness (MA)
- ✓ International Law and European Integration (MA)

1. Participants:

1.1. Expert Team (ET):

- ✓ Prof. Dr. Jochen Kantelhardt / University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences (Austria)
- ✓ Prof. Dr. Frédéric Mertens de Wilmars / University of Valencia (Spain)
- ✓ Prof. Dr. Hans Tümmers / (formerly) University of Hohenheim in Stuttgart (Germany)

1.2. KAA Coordinators:

- ✓ Prof. Dr. Ferdije Zhushi-Etemi (National Quality Council / KAA)
- ✓ Ms. Furtuna Mehmeti (Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation / KAA)
- ✓ Mr. Fisnik Gashi (Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring / KAA)

2. Program re-accreditation

The ET was formed to undertake the programme of re-accreditation of 3 academic programs, one at a bachelor level and 2 at Masters level: Business Administration (BA); Management in Agribusiness (MA) and International Law and European Integration (MA).

The procedure of re-accreditation is based on:

- ✓ The University of Prizren Self Evaluation Report (SER) dated 2014/2015
- ✓ The visit of the University facilities of Prizren (on May 28-29 2015) and the discussions with: the management of the university, the people responsible for the study programs, a teaching staff and 8 students

- ✓ The additional documents requested by the ET following the visit

3. Documents received prior and following the site visit

The documents received are:

- ✓ Self-evaluation report (SER): If some inconsistencies and mistakes concerning some of the data were corrected in the previous SER, there are additional errors of English translation (still phrases in Albanian language like in the academic staff's CV) and vague descriptions of some academic programs. Therefore, the meetings during the site visit with the staff clarified some aspects and the ET thanks the senior management and the people responsible for each academic program.
- ✓ The site visit program for May 28-29 2015
- ✓ KAA Guidelines for experts (academic programmes and institution), Code of Good Practice for Site visits, and Standards.
- ✓ Three reports of evaluation for program accreditations: 31 March–1st April 2014; 13-14 May 2013; 1st June 2012 and 2nd July 2011.
- ✓ 20 staff CVs in Agribusiness; 11 staff CVs in Business Administration and in International Management; and 4 staff CVs in International Law and European Integration (all received electronically by the KAA on 1st June 2015)
- ✓ The University of Prizren comments about the ET intermediate report. The University indicates: *“Comments are done, based on EER of KAA. Management and Academic staff responsible for study programs worked on this document. All of academics worked individually and as a result, there might be a slight difference in the way of answering on comments”*.

4. Observations for each study program

4.1. Business Administration (BA) and International Management (BA) (Prof. Dr. Hans Tümmers)

4.1.1. General observations drawn from the meetings and the visit

The mission statement reflects a very ambitious strategy for the programmes with the aim “to create and maintain the highest standards in the field of teaching and learning, research and artistic creativity”. This strategy obviously needs enormous financial means that will not be available in the near future. Therefore, a more application-oriented teaching philosophy based on close cooperation with industry and administration seems to be more adequate for the university.

An ambitious research programme would need another administrative structure with many more professors, assistants and doctoral students.

However, as the programmes have started just four years ago, they are still in an experimental stage and not all the goals can be achieved within this short period. However, there seems to be a strong commitment and some enthusiasm to bring both programmes to success.

4.1.2. Academic programmes

The two Bachelor programmes in Business Administration and in International Management of the University of Prizren were launched in 2011; a year after the university was founded. Their structures correspond to the typical 3 years Bachelor degree of the Bologna system, including a total of 180 ECTS credit points each.

The Bachelor programme in Business Administration is taught with two concentrations: one in Accounting and one in Agricultural Business Management. This reflects the needs of the Kosovar economy: finance and accounting are the fundamental topics of any business, and in view of the importance of the agricultural sector, a concentration in this field opens probably promising perspectives to the graduates.

The coherence of the syllabus of both programmes was discussed within the last evaluations, and will not be discussed here again. However, some comments seem to be appropriate:

Recommendations:

- ✓ An intake of 400 students for each programme does not seem manageable under the present conditions, namely the lack of sufficient teaching staff, computer facilities, libraries, classrooms, internships etc. Even 200 students per programme would be ambitious. The fact, that the dropout rate after the 1st year is at 40 % indicates, that the mentoring of the students is not sufficient. It also seems unrealistic to find 400 appropriate internships per year in the Kosovar economy.
- ✓ In both programmes, the language training, especially in English, should be extended. In the meeting with the students, the level of English was noticeably low.
- ✓ A second foreign language (other than Turkish) should be compulsory from the very beginning. Today, business is international, and without sufficient language skills, the possibility of employment for the graduates is very limited. The students are ambitious and determined to succeed and therefore need adequate working skills.

4.1.3. Faculty and faculty development

The lists of professors and other staff were not very clear. Thus, it is not always understandable how many full professors resp. associate or assistant professors are on the payroll of the University of Prizren, who are teaching on a part-time basis coming from other universities and who are part-time lecturers coming from industry. However, the CV's and the personal discussions with staff gave the impression that the faculty is sufficiently qualified to teach in the programmes.

Recommendations:

- ✓ For the further recruitment of professors, it would be very helpful to consider linguistic qualifications. Especially professors of business administration should be able to communicate in English. It was disappointing that translations were necessary during the conversations.
- ✓ Most of the scientific literature is in English and any international cooperation is simply impossible without the command of English. It is also recommended to hire new professors with an international background and to invite more guest lecturers from abroad.

4.1.4. Research

Teaching at the university is based on research, as well on the personal research of the professor as well as from the scientific community, presented in conferences and published in books and magazines. It arises from the CV's of the professors, some of which are involved in research projects and publish the results. However, in most of the cases, these activities are individual, not part of the university's international projects, and presented in international conferences.

As stated under point 5.1.1, an ambitious research programme would need another administrative structure with many more professors, assistants and doctoral students. As long as the necessary means are not available, other possibilities should be examined.

Recommendation:

- ✓ In order to stimulate the research activities, it is recommended to establish a research institute of Business Administration in the Economics Department in order to merge and to stimulate all the individual research activities. By doing this, the faculty could improve its public perception as a center of research and participate as a university in international research projects.

4.1.5. Facilities and equipment

The situation of the faculty concerning the library and the electronic equipment with access to worldwide resources and scientific documents are still extremely insufficient and need to be improved. At present, there are no scientific magazines available in the university and the number of scientific books (in English) is very limited.

Apart from that, the equipment of the classrooms are sufficient and respond to the criteria for effective teaching.

Recommendation:

- ✓ The university should develop the library and provide access to international databases. Additional funding should be raised on national and international level (EU Commission, Tempus and other programmes).

4.1.6. International cooperation

This is probably one of the most critical points in the development of both programmes. To study business – and even international Management! – in only a national or even local

Accreditation of academic programs: University of Prizren – May 2015 (FINAL REPORT)

environment is totally outdated today. As mentioned above, the internationalization of the programmes requires, above all, good language skills in English, the professors as well as the students. It also requires the possibility to study abroad and to invite professors as guest speakers from other countries.

At present, the Self Evaluation Report mentions cooperation with 14 foreign universities, among them 4 in Turkey, 4 in other countries of former Yugoslavia, 3 in Germany and one in the U.S.A. (see page 432 of the report). These relations concern mainly research activities and produce only minor effects for the students.

It is obvious, that traditional exchange programmes based on the ERASMUS model can only play a very limited role, since only a very few students from outside Kosovo would choose to study in Prizren. Therefore, other possibilities have to be examined.

Recommendations:

- ✓ The faculty should pursue the objective to find universities in OECD countries as sponsors. For these sponsorships funding is available on a national and international (European Union, international companies) level.
- ✓ It would include the possibility for students to study one semester abroad and to invite guest professors to Prizren. Therefore, the faculty should develop an international office and study all possibilities of developing its international relations.

4.1.7. Comments from University of Prizren

1. Business Administration Programme (BA): Subject "E-Commerce and Business" should replace with subject "Entrepreneurship"- semester first, first year.
2. International Management Programme (IM): Subject "E-Commerce and Business" should replace with subject "Entrepreneurship", semester four, second year.

4.1.8. Conclusions about the re-accreditation of Business Administration (BA) and International Management (BA)

The Faculty of Economics is still in an early stage of its development and both evaluated programmes started just four years ago. The teaching programme corresponds to international standards. With the high number of students, they seem to be successful. The achievements of the last years are, thus, quite impressive.

The Self Assessment Report, the discussions with staff and the on-site visit on May 28 and 29 justify the re-accreditation of both programmes for another three years period. However, the general conditions (library, computer, international relations, language training) have to be improved and, as mentioned in this report, several measures have to be taken in order to justify finally their quality as university programmes.

4.2. International Law and European Integration (LL.M.) (Prof. Frédéric Mertens de Wilmars)

4.2.1. General findings

Profesor Mertens met with the Dean of the Law Faculty, Prof. Dr. Iur. Arif Riza and three assistant teachers. One of them made the English translation. The exchange was direct, honest and friendly with the mutual understanding goal and the goodwill to emphasize the academic programme's positive and negative aspects.

The material support in the meeting was the academic program's descriptive *International Law and European Integration* includes in the SER and it was discussed about next: programme's goals, teaching's methodology, student's practical, the possibility of doctoral thesis, methodology and research's line, the teaching staff profile and the academic programme content.

During the meeting, we saw the SER English version it was not a full and true translation of Albanian version, which created in several occasions, content and organization academic program difficulty understanding. For that reason and based on the meeting and Prizren's University visit, the evaluation and the recommendations relative to the study program are based on the analysis of the documents transmitted by the agency KAA.

4.2.2. Student Management

The student management seems to be right related to the student's join conditions in LL.M. The request of finish the Law School (4 years and 240 ECTS) and the standard of admission

based on English knowledge evaluation and in an International and European Law selected exam.

Besides, the small number of students admitted (25-35) allows an intensively training development as well as a close student's assistance by the teachers.

In this way, students has an important role because of the small pupil number, they become into a mentor or "coaches". They will be not only training in theoretical and practical lessons but also on the career opportunity preparation.

Recommendations:

- ✓ Provision should be made for tutorial system: every student must get a mentor/coach from the master admission to the end. The mentor must support, motivate and help to the student during its career. The mentor should deal with two students' tops and the mentorship frequency once a week (for example 1 hour/student).

4.2.3. Teaching Methodology – practical works

Regarding with teaching methodology, the SER and the meetings have not given satisfactory precisions about didactic and pedagogic methods and means that will be in use. In an evasive way, the possibility of master class has been mentioned but nothing concrete.

The SER shows nevertheless, the importance between the theoretical and practice programme parts. Every master subject will have several practices that the student must complete. However, it does not show the kind of practices the students will do, except visiting foreign embassies and international organizations management in Kosovo¹.

Although in the SER a few practices are expected with several institutions as the Ministry Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of European Integration², there is any instruction about the practices content, its organization and its evaluation.

During the meeting, the possibility of doing practices outside Kosovo was mentioned, but there was not any answer about the means possible for do it (for example grant). May be there is not any mean.

On the other hand, about "Diploma Subject ", is schedule that every student will have to realize an individual and significant work about a matter that it has been chosen under the teacher supervision. This part of the master is very important and they do not known how much it is in the global student evaluation. There is not any clarification about the tutorial weekly hours either.

¹ SER, n° 2.8, p. 401.

² SER, n° 2.10, p. 401.

Recommendations:

- ✓ To draw up a “Teaching Guide” for every subject, showing next points clearly:
 - Course Data
 - Course Summary
 - Results expected (learning)
 - Description of contents (with precision)
 - The workload (classroom activities and non-attending activities)
 - Teaching Methodology
 - Indications about the evaluation (assessment process)
 - **RECENT** bibliographic references (basic and additional) and minimum **THREE references in ENGLISH**
- ✓ In every “teaching guide”, indicate with precision the content of the practical part of the study with the elements mentioned above.
- ✓ To extend the offer of practices in the Institutions and Kosovo private Organizations through agreements that included the type of practice to do, the number of hours, the student’s evaluation and the supervision by a person of the partner institution .
- ✓ Through the university, make an effort to find some resources in order to offer any grant for the best students and let them make some practices outside Kosovo.
- ✓ In that way, establishment cooperation agreements with International Institutions (EU, Council of Europe, etc.) through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- ✓ Suggest two weekly hours of tutorial supervision³.

4.2.4. Contents of the LLM

In general terms, all the subjects correspond with this type of master. Nevertheless, from the SER⁴ and the meeting with Dean and assistants, several lagoons have been detected (mistakes of translation, bibliography exclusively in Albanian language and old way).

General Recommendations:

- ✓ In that way, please see recommendations in point 4.2.3.
- ✓ Show detailed program in every subject

³ Could be the same person who is the coach. According to the subject selected by the student.

⁴ SER, pp. 404-416.

Special Recommendations:

- ✓ 1.2. *European Law II*: clear the difference with the first part of and the first topic
- ✓ 1.5. *International Private Law*: no reference to European Union Law
- ✓ 1.6. *Actual issue of IPL*: no reference in current and past situation in Balkans
- ✓ 1.6.3. *Environmental Law*: re-formulate content. No reference EU Law!
- ✓ 2.1. *International organization II*: eliminate and distribute organizations between different subjects.
- ✓ 2.2. *Intern. Protect Human Rights*: re-formulate content. No reference about systems like UNO, OSCE, Council of Europe and European Union.
- ✓ 2.3. *International Economic Law*: no reference of EU Law
- ✓ 2.4. *Solving International Dispute*: eliminate and between different subjects
- ✓ 2.5. *International courts*: eliminate and distribute between different subjects.
- ✓ 2.5.3. *Comparative Consti*: re-formulate the content. Specify about the comparisons will be.
- ✓ Suggest one International Law teaching in **ENGLISH**.
- ✓ Suggest one European Law teaching in **ENGLISH**.

4.2.5. Research and International Cooperation

About the research, the meeting and documents received do not show us a research plan in despite of Prizen University indicate several times in SER the importance of the research and the establishment of a research group.

Regarding with teaching publications, the information receives is unrepresentative from a real scientific profile of every one (Only 4 CVs were communicated of 10 teachers enrolled under the programme).

As an international cooperation refers, there is not an effective cooperation between the Prizren University Law School and a European University, in which the LLM is inscribed.

Recommendations:

- ✓ To draw up – with the external expert help – an own LLM research's plan with two branches: International Law and European Union Law. This plan must indicate the research's lines, its goals, expected implementations, human and material resources, planning, etc.
- ✓ This research plan must include a doctor's join team in every branch (International and European Law).

Accreditation of academic programs: University of Prizren – May 2015 (FINAL REPORT)

- ✓ Establish connections with others research centers of UPZ, but with others Kosovo's Universities and European Union too, in order to treat the research subjects deeply.
- ✓ Search for funding research projects policy will be developed with the University President Senior Management.
- ✓ Take stock of every publications and the master scientific academic staff activities. Encourage the scientific academic participation in publications and international activities.
- ✓ Establish an ENGLISH international and national electronic review.

4.2.6. Staff

Following the site visit, the course team CVs were requested and only four were received - one in Albanian! This makes it difficult to gauge their postgraduate level experience and their exact status in the University of Prizren. CVs for all proposed teaching staff need to be available!

On the other hand, there is a clear confusion regarding the number of full – time teachers (contradictions in the own SER and during the meeting) and of the teachers' Statute (full-part time).

The 4 CVs received, shows the need to reinforce the science Publications level and quantity just like English language training and other European Union language.

The gender matter put a question because no women in teacher team exist and the Human Rights are taught!

Recommendations:

- ✓ Draw up a clear and true teacher list of every subject including the Statute (FT-PT), the professional and academic profile, and publications list.
- ✓ Reinforce the teaching team criteria selection: publications, experiences in doctoral environment, English knowledge.
- ✓ Start an active collective publication political.
- ✓ Start an active woman inclusion in master as a teachers, researchers and students.

4.2.7. Infrastructure/Space and Equipment/ Facilities

The visit of the facilities indicates that the classrooms are well equipped for the theoretical activities but the library is too modest to be a convenient place for research and studies activities.

Recommendations

- ✓ Acquire reviews, as well as international law and European books.
- ✓ Acquire an electronic database and access to legal international and european sources.
- ✓ Connect Kosovo's libraries each other (create a network).
- ✓ Get in touch with foreign documents centers of international and European documents in order to achieve an English quality documental collection.

4.2.8. Comments from the University of Prizren

All of the recommendations are implemented in study program that is attached to the report. Changes are made based on recommendations and all of them are highlighted.

4.2.9. Conclusions:

Base on this inform, **recommend** the accreditation for three years, but with **with the requirement “sine qua non”** following aspects:

- ✓ LLM Organization and supervision under the teacher co-responsibility full-time (International part) of University of Prizren and some academic from any European University (European law part). This person will supervise the LLM definitive configuration, the part-time staff contracting, the coordination between the teachers, the elaboration of a research plan and the establishment of concrete and formal agreement with institutions and European and foreigner universities.
- ✓ Intensive training in English for the current teachers
- ✓ Renew the working and the supply of library (computers, books, reviews)
- ✓ Reformulate the content and presentation of LLM courses

4.3. Management in Agribusiness (Msc) (Prof. Dr. Jochen Kantelhardt)

4.3.1. Academic Program and Student Management

The study program “Management in Agribusiness – MSc” fits well into the institution’s mission statement; in particular, it is to emphasize that it contributes to the education of students in a field, which is of general relevance for Kosovo, and of particular relevance for the region of Prizren. It is noticed positively that the study plan reveals environmental concerns, expressed in the subject of “Economic of environment and natural resources”.

The study program “Management in Agribusiness – MSc” is based at two German master programs, namely “Agro-economics” and “Agribusiness” (run by the University of Hohenheim), and the Slovenian master program “Agro-economy” (developed by the University of Maribor). The study program selects in a reasonable manner courses that are of relevance for Kosovo and the region of Prizren. Consequently, the program designers suggest a program, which is of relevance for Kosovo and the Prizren region itself and which corresponds at the same time with regard to the syllabus to international standards.

With regard to the approval of students, it is to say that a successful and efficient execution of the study program requires that students have a certain pre-knowledge on agriculture and farm management. However, there is no possibility (at least there is no mechanism described) to exclude students from program participation or to oblige them to participate at certain additional basic courses. However, it is to recommend strongly to establish such a mechanism (and to establish and to describe it in the study program).

With regard to the mandatory courses, I miss a course on total quality management and I recommend adding such a course. With regard to the elective courses, it is to annotate that only a small number of courses is offered. It is to advice strongly to increase the number of elective courses by opening students the possibility to participate at courses offered in “Accounting” Master program; such a possibility would students also increase the possibility of students to shape their own study profile.

It is to remark negatively, that lecturers inform in the study program only in a very general manner on their teaching and learning methods; in general, they all give the same standard information: “Lectures, exercises, seminar papers, consultations, group work, tests”. Consequently, it is not clear if the training of students is really based on such a broad range of didactic methods. It is clearly to advice that teachers should better and individually elaborate their didactic concept tailored to the needs of their courses.

A positive aspect of the study program seems to be the close collaboration with local business. This is generally of high relevance in order to provide internships and foster subsequent job

opportunities of students. In Kosovo and the Prizren region, it seems to be of extraordinary importance due to the difficult situation of labor markets.

4.3.2. Staff

The numbers of permanent staff and the additionally engaged teachers from outside the faculty, as well as the ratio of both, seem adequate for the study program and principally allow a good supervision of students' thesis. Furthermore, it is positively to emphasize that most of the teaching staff is full time, internal and permanent. However, it seems that there is no regular professor engaged in the study program, as suggested by KAA guidelines. The qualification and ability of the academic staff with regard to the academic and didactic level of a university seem to be appropriate. This is underlined by the discussion with the students: Students expressed (in general) their clear satisfaction (such a judgement was possible since most of the teachers also give lectures in other study programs). However, judgement of teachers is complicated and, based on the provided material, only possible in a restricted manner.

4.3.3. Research and International Co-operation

The site visit generally indicated that (international) research in the field of agribusiness is not very strong at the University of Prizren. Moreover, the responsible persons for the study programs did not present international co-operation strategies. With regard to the involvement of students into research activities, it is to emphasize that it became not clear within the discussions how and to what degree students are informed on and integrated into ongoing (international) research activities. Though it is to assume that preconditions for integrating research into study programs are not promising, it is to annotate, that a proper analysis to which extent research activities feed back into teaching and training could not take place (due to the planning situation of the study program). Nevertheless, it is to recommend to expand (international) research activities and, with regard to the evaluated study program, and it is to advise to include students into the research activities (e.g. within the scope of master theses).

4.3.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

Teaching facilities and an appropriate learning infrastructure are basic requirements for successful academic studies: the faculty provides sufficiently large lecture halls and seminar rooms, which are equipped with a basic technical infrastructure (particularly beamers), as well as blackboards. The major concern is about the library. Especially the access to recent technical literature is insufficient: the inventory is small and only few technical books and textbooks are available. Scientific journals are (fairly) not present and accessibility via internet on a university subscription basis could not be approved.

4.3.5. Quality Management

The study program does not plan to set up a specific quality management program, but plans to use the regular university program. However, since this study program is in the initial phase, it is to recommend to intensively using the evaluation system, to control its regular application and to make use of respective statistical analyses.

4.3.6. Comments from the University of Prizren

1. Entrance test will apply, along GPA for students applying from other areas. The test will be held from basic subjects. Through the entrance test will select students who demonstrate known in this area.

Based on your recommendation, we have added compulsory courses “Quality Management” and one “elective course each semester we added. In addition, we will give this program enables students to pursue courses in Accounting program which is UPZ (for adding text to see red in curricula).

Professors will inform ACA requirements to apply the methodology of teaching, so as interactive. Which will include clear objectives and application exercises.

2. In this year in UPZ has a PhD in the field of agribusiness a professor, Drtia Krasniqi who are likely to engage in this program. It is from this academic year will be a regular professor at UPZ and will be able to engage in the program.
3. UPZ has achieved cooperation with the University of Ljubljana, who expressed willingness to cooperate with UPZ in the exchange of students and professors from this field (for more can check the link: <http://uni-prizren.com/sq/ngjarje/> / 538). UPZ also has cooperation with the Agricultural University of Tirana, Albania, with whom we will cooperate, especially in this context with the Faculty of Economics and Agribusiness. In addition, with the Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Agribusiness Korqa - Albania. In addition, we aim to achieve cooperation with the University of Maribor and the University of Hohenheim, which are based on the design of these program curriculums, where we intend exchange professors and students with them
4. Students will have the opportunity to use funds from the Library of UPZ, which after accreditation of the program will be enriched with relevant literature in this area. In addition, students can use electronic libraries.
5. UPZ at the end of each semester rating system applies to cases professors. We thought the students for each professor, then this considering the overall assessment and re-election of professors to cases.

6. We have close cooperation with the Agricultural University of Tirana and Prishtina. Respectively University of Agriculture and Veterinary. From University Economy and Agribusiness in Tirana Albania, we will engage Prof. Ass, Dr. Ilir Kapaj.

4.3.7. Recommendation(Conclusions)

Annotations with regard to Management in Agribusiness (Msc) I decided that I am satisfied with the answers and accept them, and that I recommend the accreditation of the study program for three years.

In particular, I appreciate the integration of the two new ass. professors, Mr. Ilir Kapaj and Ms. Drita A. Krasniqi; their employment is clearly enriching the study program, it is increasing the number of English speaking staff and it is of positive value from the point of view of gender issues.

Furthermore, I appreciate the effort of the study program responsables to foster international contacts and I hope that the managers of the study program will be successful in establishing a teacher exchange with Hohenheim University.

Furthermore, I value positively the adaptation of the syllabus and the integration of new courses. However, I want to emphasize again, that it seems very important for me to set up a development plan, in particular demonstrating how an integration of full regular professors into the program can be successful realized within the next three years.

5. General conclusions of ET

The ET recommend for 3 YEARS the re-accreditation and accreditation of:

- ✓ **Business Administration (BA) and International Management (BA)**
- ✓ **Management in Agribusiness (MA)**
- ✓ **International Law and European Integration (MA)**

Prof. Dr. Hans Tümmer

Prof. Dr. Frédéric Mertens de Wilmars

Prof. Dr. Jochen Kantelhardt

Final Report, June 22 2015