

External Evaluation Report

University of Prizren “Ukshin Hoti”

Final Report

April 22th, 2015

1. Introduction

1.1. Context

The present document contains the final evaluation report 2015 about the Public University of Prizren “Ukshin Hoti”, Kosovo. It is the result of the collegial work of an international team of experts appointed by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) to evaluate the institutional management of the UoPz and five (or six??) study programs. The report bases on the self evaluation report (SER) of the University of Prizren, the visit of the expert group in Prizren on 20th of March 2015 and further information of the UoPz, asked by the expert group.

1.2. Experts

The team consisted of following experts:

- Prof. Dr. Balint Bachman/ University of Pecs (HU)
- Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak/ University of Tallin (EE)
- Prof. Dr. Volker Frederking/ University of Erlangen-Nürnberg (DE)
- Prof. Dr. Markus Conrads/ University of Reutlingen (DE)
- Ms. Simona Dimovska/ European Students Union (EU)

1.3. Abbreviations used

The following abbreviations are used in the present document:

ET	Experts team
HE	Higher education
KAA	Kosovo Accreditation Agency
OSV	On-site visit
QA	Quality Assurance
SER	Self-evaluation report
UoPz	University of Prizren
UoP	University of Pristina

1.4. Procedure and evidence collection

1.4.1 Self-Evaluation Report (SER)

The UoPz submitted a detailed Self-Evaluation Report (SER) as the central document for the institutional accreditation and the accreditation of the study programs. The report describes on 453 pages especially the study programs. The description of other general aspects of the UoPz like ‘history of the university’ (p. 3-5), ‘mission statement’ (p. 6-9) and ‘organisation, management and planning’ (p. 10-11), however, is rather short.

Nevertheless, the SER enabled the ET to get a clear picture of the current situation of the University and was a good information base to prepare the OSV.

1.4.2. On-site visit

On March 19th, the five experts gathered in the evening for a preliminary working dinner together with two members of the KAA:

Ms Furtuna Mehmeti, Expert for Evaluation and Akkreditation (KAA)

Mr Fisnik Gashi, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring (KAA)

They talked about their first impressions of the self-evaluation report (SER) of UoPz and the program for the OSV at the following day.

On March 20th the ET spent one day at the UoPz.

The ET was accompanied by four members of KAA:

- Prof. Dr. Ferdije Zushi-Etemi (State Council of Quality/KAA)
- Ms Furtuna Mehmeti, Expert for Evaluation and Akkreditation (KAA)
- Mr Fisnik Gashi, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring (KAA)
- Mr Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring (KAA)

The OSV took place as planned. The scheduled OSV started in the morning of 20th with a meeting with the management of the institution from 9.00-11.00:

- Prof. Dr. Ramë Vataj, Rector of University
- Prof. Dr. Florie Govori-Fejzullahu, Vice Rector for Budget, Finance and Infrastructure
- Prof. Dr. Malush Mjaku, Vice Rector for Teaching, Student's Affairs and Research
- Prof. Dr. Sadik Idrizi, Vice Rector for International Cooperation and Quality
- Prof. Dr. Jasmin Isufi, Officer for Quality Assurance

A visit to facilities followed (11.00-12.00). After a working lunch the ET separated in small groups for meetings with responsible persons of the several study programs (Curriculum, teaching, researches and recommendations) (13.30 – 15.30). Then meetings with academic staff (15.30-16.30) and students (16.30-17.30) took place. The visit ended with short consultations of ET and KAA (17.30) and a final meeting with the management of the institution (17.45).

The ET like to express its gratefulness to management of the UoPz and the representatives of the several study programs for the very good organization of the visit.

In addition, the experts warmly thank the KAA and its representatives for their outstanding support and cooperation before, during and after the visit.

1.4.3. Additional documents

During the meeting with the management of UoPz in the morning and after the meetings with academic staff and students in the afternoon a few additional documents were requested. They were sent immediately by the management of the institution.

2. Institutional evaluation

The institutional evaluation has its base on the *Standards* document from the KAA, itself grounding on Kosovar legal regulations and administrative instructions.

2.1. Mission statement and strategy

The Public University of Prizren was founded in 2010 following a decision by the Government of the Republic of Kosovo. It was supposed that the UoPz should be the southern counterpart of the older and larger Public University of Pristina. The profile of the UoPz should have been that of a University of Applied Sciences.

The UoPz undergoes its fourth institutional accreditation procedure. At the university 13 accredited programmes are taught, five master and eight bachelor programs. According to the university's mission the institution serves the region by recruiting, developing and educating students to be successful graduates in the market of Kosovo, the region and Europe.

In comparison with the situation of the UoPz at 2011 and 2012 there are clear signals that the new management of the UoPz, which started 2014, had been successful in the attempt, to stabilize and improve the working conditions of the staff of UoPz in teaching and researching furthermore. However, as already in the SER of 2011 and 2012, the fundamental aims of the UoPz are formulated only in a general way in the SER of 2014/15. Moreover, the actual SER describes general aspects of the UoPz like 'mission statement' (p. 6-9) and 'organisation, management and planning' (p. 10-11) very short. A detailed strategy plan still is missing.

Of course, the ET understands very well that the starting process of a university absorb a great part of energy and time capacity. On that note, the experts' statements shall always be understood as suggestions rather than as mere criticism.

Recommendation:

Like 2012 the experts recommend again a specification of the mission statement and the strategy of the University. There is still also a need to advance the research profile of the whole university.

2.2. Organisation and management

Since 2014 the University of Prizren has a new management with Prof. Dr. Ramë Vataj, Rector of University, Prof. Dr. Florie Govori-Fejzullahu, Vice Rector for Budget, Finance and Infrastructure, Prof. Dr. Malush Mjaku, Vice Rector for Teaching, Student's Affairs and Research, Prof. Dr. Sadik Idrizi, Vice Rector for International Cooperation and Quality and Prof. Dr. Jasmin Isufi, Officer for Quality Assurance. The presented "Organizational chart" (p. 10) illustrates main structures of organization and responsibilities at UoPz with Board, Rector and Senate. Generally spoken the structure is convincing, because it guarantees a functional management of the university. (Little further remark: In the SER the organizational chart can be read only with great difficulties, because it is too small in the print version.)

Recommendation:

The experts recommend that the organizational chart of the UoPz should be presented for the next time in a version, which can be read more easily. Furthermore the organizational chart should be presented at the homepage of the university in English language, too.

2.3. Staff, staff appointment, staff development

The SER of the UoPz of 2012 (p.25-27) has shown, that the university has only few permanent full staff. The SER of 2014/15 presents similar dates. The UoPz currently employs 35 full time academic staff, 142 members of the staff only have half time contracts. With regard to the distribution of the 35 full time professors another problem of the UoPz can be seen: Seven full time professors teach at the faculty of education, twelve at the faculty of economy, ten at the faculty of computer science and six at the faculty of law. But actually there is no full time professor working for the faculty of philology – here the employment of three full time professors is planned over the next three months.

Another great problem is, that most of the new contracts are limited to half a year. Again the ET emphasizes the negative effects of such uncertainty. The contract of employment provides that the professor has to teach ten hours weekly. Apart from that he has to supervise student's work. The contract of employment also provides that the professor has to conduct researches on his course area. An extra salary for the production of intellectual contributions is not provided by the contract. A reduction of teaching hours would be possible to conduct research work. That did not happen in the past.

Already in the expert reports of the year 2011 and 2012 has been noted that staff development is a key issue for the quality in research and teaching of the UoPz. At least, in a two- or three-year perspective, the UoPz will have to establish a framework for the didactical training of its staff. This can only take place in a productive and harmonious way as soon as the staff members have signed firm contracts lasting for more than half a year.

Recommendation (to the Ministry):

The experts recommend that the contract period for part-time staff should not be less than two or three years after the first positive evaluation.

2.4. Finance

The UoPz presented a well structured budget plan. In comparison with the SER of 2012 it is evident, that the hopes of that time haven't fulfilled. 2012 the UoPz has a budget of about 3.029,387,00€. The former management expected an increase to 4.861539,00€ in the year 2015. In reality the actual financial budget of the UoPz still is very limited. 2014 the budget was 3,163,573.88 €, in 2015 in total 3,146,267.00 € are expected. This very limited budget causes problems in the presence and in the future.

Recommendation:

The experts again strongly recommend that policy should offer more financial resources for the UoPz. Only with a higher budget UoPz can grow to a University of international standard and reputation.

2.5. Development Plan

While the prospective and strategic statement SER of 2011 had been mainly a mix of day-to-day emergency measures, the SER 2014/15 contains – like the SER 2012 - only some general descriptions of the further development. A “development plan”, however still does not exist. The text only offers some general statements. For establishing a profile further clarifications are necessary.

Recommendation:

The experts recommend again that the development plan should be finished as quickly as possible.

2.6. Research and academic freedom

As the SER 2012 openly declared (p. 170), there was nearly no research being conducted at the UoPz in the year 2012. The SER 2014/15 informed about the starting of a research group “which is currently working on putting in place this very important condition of being a meaningful university” (p. 433). The goal of “setting a link where all of the professors can publish their scientific work” is useful. But there are still very few participations in international research program.

Recommendation:

The Experts recommend again, that research should be integrated in the upcoming development plan. The focus should be put on both, project-oriented and application-oriented research. It could be helpful, to establish or use formal contacts with businesses in the region with the perspective of performing research on their behalf.

2.7. Facilities and equipment

The UoPz has been very successful in improving the infrastructure of learning and teaching furthermore. The renovation of the second building offers students and the academic staff optimized conditions, which are very important for the attractiveness of the UoPz.

One actual problem still is the access to literature resources, both physical and electronic.

Recommendation:

The experts recommend, that the books in the library should be modernized continuously. There still are great lacks in German literature (primary and scientific literature), in law and in IT-related books and journals.

2.8. Quality management

The efforts of the management of the UoPz in 2012 has focused on the question of quality management. The foundation of the Quality Assurance Office (QAO) in cooperation with representatives of TEMPUS and Wus KOSOVA was a clear signal of progress. The leading principles of QAO have been successful. Evaluation has become a permanent instrument of quality management. Now the evaluation process after the semester is an important element of quality assurance. In particular for part time professors the results can effect that the contract – that is usually made for a period of six months – will not be made for a subsequent semester. However, six-months-contracts seem to be too short for the establishing of engagement and responsibility of staff.

Recommendation:

The Experts recommend that contracts with staff, which should be renewed must contain at least three years, if a staff member has been evaluated after his first working period in a positive way.

2.9. Internationalization

The UoPz has continued in improving its international networking. Established Partnerships exist to several universities in Germany, Austria, Turkey, India, Albania and Bosnia, Croatia and Slovenia. The SER 2014/15 (p. 433) gives a detail overview. But there is still no homepage in English language.

Recommendation:

International contacts have been intensified in the last three years. Several foreign universities were visited. In the future more exchange programs with foreign universities should be started. The experts - again - strongly recommend, that the homepage of the UoPz must be translated into English *language* as soon as possible, because a Internet-Presence *is* one important base of international visibility.

2.10 Students

Students are satisfied with their status and opportunities on the University. One of the positive things is that students feel that they are centre of learning process of University. They feel welcomed and their professors are open for communication with them. Quality of the lectures is on a high level. Students learn a lot from professors lectures so they do not have to spend much time in their home repeating reading materials. This means that their professors are well prepared and focused on their students.

Mainly they choose this University because it is close to their hometown and because of their financial issues and difficulties.

Students are quite good represented in the UoPz bodies and commissions. Some scholarship are provided for them. Mobility with very low rate is also present at the UoPz, but continuously is improving. Many of them shows good English skills.

Environment and current economic situation in Prizren region and in Kosovo in general makes some difficulties in students' motivation. They are not feeling confidently that they will find appropriate job after their studies.

Recommendation:

Weakness of the University from students' side is administrative staff, who are not polite and they are not doing their job properly. Students are not sure with administrative professional capability. So some extra training for them by external consultancy or by management should be provide.

Also staff from UoPz should work more on visibility of mobility opportunities for students (ex. Open debates, presentation of the programmes, visible information on the web site etc.).

3. Study programs

The various parts about the study programs were written by different members of the ET. Consequently, they may vary in their structure and form.

3.1 Architecture BA (new accreditation)

3.1.1. Starting remarks

The program of Architecture BA does not fit to the development of University of Prizren at the first sight, it has no obvious strategic role with the other programs delivered within the higher education institute. If the University of Prizren wishes to deliver an adequate program of Architecture, we recommend to follow the EC directive as guideline for developing a study plan with European recognition. Practically five years BA+MA educational programs shall be proposed for recognition. During the site visit it was stated to plan Master course of Architecture. It should be taken in account, that a less-than-4-years continuous Architecture study program or an early specialization (for example in Urbanism) can lead to rejection of the recognition as free lanced Architect of the holder of such a diploma within the EU. On the other hand the study program of a future MA with strong content in Urbanism/Management/Heritage can benefit the rapid development of the cities in Kosovo.

Republic of Kosovo orients its political, economic and cultural development on European standards, especially those of the European Union. The European Council's Directive 85/384/1985 gives the guidelines for mutual recognition of diplomas in the EU.

Architecture is one of seven professions to be examined by a Subcommittee of the European Commission for the notification of qualifications of EU Member States under Article 21(7) of Directive 2005/36/EC. This European organisation is in charge to list the European diplomas in Architecture for full recognition within the EU.

There are special criteria for studies in architecture on European level, eleven points mark the content of such studies:

„Education and training leading to diplomas (.....) shall be provided through courses of studies at university level concerned principally with architecture. Such studies shall be balanced between the theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training and shall ensure the acquisition of:

- 1. an ability to create architectural designs that satisfy both aesthetic and technical requirements;*
- 2. an adequate knowledge of the history and theories of architecture and the related arts, technologies and human sciences;*
- 3. a knowledge of the fine arts as an influence on the quality of architectural design;*
- 4. an adequate knowledge of urban design, planning and the skills involved in the planning process;*

5. *an understanding of the relationship between people and buildings, and between buildings and their environment, and of the need to relate buildings and the spaces between them to human needs and scale;*
6. *an understanding of the profession of architecture and the role of the architect in society, in particular in preparing briefs that take account of social factors;*
7. *an understanding of the methods of investigation and preparation of the brief for a design project;*
8. *an understanding of the structural design, constructional and engineering problems associated with building design;*
9. *an adequate knowledge of the physical problems and technologies and of the function of buildings so as to provide them with internal conditions of comfort and protection against the climate;*
10. *the necessary design skills to meet building users' requirements within the constraints imposed by cost factors and building regulations;*
11. *an adequate knowledge of the industries, organisations, regulations and procedures involved in translating design concepts into buildings and integrating plans into overall planning."*

Modernisation of harmonised minimum training requirements enters into force in 2016: the revised Directive (Modernisation of the Professional Qualifications Directive, Brussels, 9 Oct. 2013) introduces changes in the definition of the minimum training requirements for the professions benefiting from automatic recognition (doctors, nurses, midwives, dentists, pharmacists, veterinary surgeons and architects):

"For architects, the revised Directive sets the training requirement to either five years of university training or to not less than 4 years of full-time study at a university, supplemented by supervised professional traineeship of a minimum of two years. This solution offers the necessary flexibility to accommodate different approaches in the Member States (the duration of both the academic and practical components varies between Member States)".

It is important to mention these criteria, to underline the need of exact description of the content of courses in Architectural study programs. It is not just the European regulation, which is not mandatory for Kosovan higher education, but it is a general aim of the profession and the art of Architecture to be recognized in that manner, that should be taken in consideration.

3.1.2 Academic Program and Student Management

The program Architecture BA of University Prizren responds to the 11 points of studies balancing between theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training. Doing so ensures the quality and European recognition of diplomas of Kosovo. The overall program is a suitable architectural study plan, it fulfills European and international criteria of a 6-semester Bachelor of Architecture level. Design studio work has now about 50% of all classroom hours, which is appropriate. The weekly hours of lectures and

tutorials varies from semester to semester: 20 (1.), 23 (2.), 26(3.), 24(4.), 26(5.) and 19(6.), which is 23 in average, for studies like Architecture affordable. (Students' efforts to complete their design studio work outside lecturing hours can justify a lower workload 20 to 26 hours of contact hours a week.)

The ratio of L/E/ECTS of the subjects is nearly permanent. Every mandatory subject has 3L/2E/5-7ECTS, which seems too didactic, usually Design projects or courses like Architectural constructions need more workload than others like Geometric perspective (descriptive geometry) or Mechanics.

Strict selection of the applicants upon their final exam at secondary school results (40%) would raise the quality of students' performance. Admission criteria for culture of Architecture, logical tasks and artistic skills (60%) will secure the ability of the candidates.

The planned 100 students for the first year in Architecture BA is ambitious, even young academic/artistic staff can hardly handle such a big number of students. For the program Architecture BA a high proportion of permanent staff is necessary, an external professional staff can help to keep up with international movements in architecture. The ratio 1:8 of staff (12) to planned number of students (100) is getting worth if upcoming semesters having more and more entries. If University of Prizren is intending to enroll 100 students, they must count with the high working load of staff especially in tutorial demanding subjects like Design Studios or Architectural constructions.

The curriculum design meets legal requirement for bachelor's study programmes. The duration of studies in full-time mode of delivery is three years. Following from the general requirements, the total of 180 ECTS (30 ECTS per semester) is distributed as follows: 150 credits are allocated to the course units of the study field (none of them are dedicated to the final thesis); general university education subjects units account 16 credits, elective course units attract 12 credits. The number of subjects studied accountable for one semester is from 5 to 6.

The study subjects are spread across 6 semesters. The main axis of the studies should be dedicated to discipline of design projects it shall go horizontal across all 6 semesters. The axis is supplemented and supported by general university subjects and the training of creative methods skills. In every semester the design task is becoming more complicated therefore theory and practical subjects must help students in every step of the new task. But in table 2.11 (Description of the subjects included in the proposed study program, SER page 341) the number of subjects devoted to design during the semesters seems unevenly spread, specially semester I (Architectural constructions 1) and semester II (Architectural constructions 2), compared with 4 to 5 subjects in semester III, IV and V (Arch. Constructions 5., Interior Design 3., Industrial Buildings, Green Architecture ect.).

In semester VI are two subjects (Modern Systems and an elective) related to design, a final thesis or diploma work is fully missing.

The workload structure of the programme is focused on lectures (2-3) and theoretical exercises (2), practical work or contact with teachers/consultations is rather low (0,5) even in design oriented subjects like Residential buildings. Some subjects for complex understanding of the profession of Architects (Design methodology, Constr. Management, Regulations) are provided too late, in the last (6.) semester.

This structure is illogical to ensure study outcomes and programme aims.

Is not quite clear how students achieve learning outcomes from following competences:

- Competence to work in a group, associate with colleagues and specialists in contiguous areas, be leader and defend one's views in reasoned way;
- Competence to present work results in correct and suggestive native language, orally or in writing, and at least one foreign to different audiences;
- Competence to find business partners and maintain business-like relations, and be able to communicate.

The curricula covers the necessary theoretic and practical fields of Architecture, the competence of the profession Architect as a general outcome is secured.

An overarching didactic concept of teaching methods is widely acknowledged by the representatives of the teaching staff (Dr. Mimosa Dugolli and Bekim Ceko PhD-cand.).

There are clear guidelines in the EU Directives that underline the requirements for the education of Architecture. The program Bachelor of Architecture of the University of Prizren responds on these recommendations.

The development of Master studies is obvious to establish free lanced Architects' education.

The first cycle architecture studies are finalized with the final work project. The constituent part of the final work is enough to demonstrate skills as professional architect. Since the final project is missing at the end of the program, this can not be measured.

In general it could be argued that the scope of the programme is sufficient to ensure learning outcomes and the content of the programme reflects the latest achievements in science, art and technologies, but these courses are more topic driven: (Residential/Educational/Administrative buildings, Mechanics and material resistance, ect.) than problem and learning outcome oriented.

Group work experience is not or not sufficiently described in the subject syllabus. For professional work collaboration in architectural offices teamwork and collaborations with engineering science specialists are required.

Theoretical components linked to practical work tasks were missing or not sufficiently provided in the descriptions.

The hours of student's independent work per course should be re-calculated. Experts of Architectural studies often have the impression, that students are obliged to work much more for the courses than indicated in the descriptions of study modules.

Recommendation

The new programme scheme has to be developed to address Directive 13/55/EU requirements. Expert team strongly suggest to develop both 3 years of BA + 2 years of MA for the next cycle of accreditation.

The programme should develop specific identity to become more recognisable at the local international market to attract more students from Prizren region and abroad.

The expert recommends to stress the descriptions of the design studios (project based learning) in the BA level documentation.

The expert recommends to reformulate the descriptions of the studios in the different courses and semesters and to focus on problem orientation and providing group work experiences regularly to students in the curriculum design.

The experts group recommends to re-calculate the hours of students' independent work per course.

The study program of BA in Architecture should continue to process the curricula balancing theoretical (40-50%) and practical (50-60%) knowledge based on design studio work of the students,

Diploma work and other design studio/practical subjects should have in total 50% or more of the total ECTS.

Study program's subjects must be more clearly described; semester works, competences and evaluation should be developed in detail.

3.1.3 Research and International Cooperation

Architects present themselves as usual by competitions and publications of realized buildings and objects. Scientific activity and publishing must be promoted. Despite of Architecture, other disciplines of Science are active in national and international professional organizations, the scientific content of their efforts are well documented, it is important to establish the same attitude in Architecture too. The cooperation with other universities in Kosovo and abroad can allow students and their educators to measure their performance objectively. Some staff members, like Prof. Dr. Abdullah Zejdullahu (part-time staff member from UP) and Dr. Minosa Dugolli have a remarkable international professional activity, Gylar Mydyti is participating international architectural events and is and acting architect. It is to recommend to be involved in international research projects and publish in prestigious journals.

For Architects it is rather difficult to take part in research, but there are good practices in Europe to develop doctoral programs for Architecture especially in connection with Urbanism. The staff members submitting CVs (partly only in Albanian) who were available for the site visit (M. Dugolli, B. Ceko) are practicing Architects, Urbanists and Engineers, some of them with remarkable foreign experience and English language skills.

Recommendation

The academic qualification of staff is appropriate to their positions at the moment, regarding to the lack of young professors, educators' academic qualification (completing PhD/DLA programs) is a main topic of the development of Architects' education at University of Prizren even on Bachelor level.

Facilities and equipments for scientific work are still missing, a special attention must be payed for the literature and drawing, modeling and CAD tools during the refurbishing of the building devoted to Architecture studies.

International cooperation with ambitious higher education institutes of the wider region (South, East and Middle-East Europe) can accelerate the development of academic staff and scientific activity.

3.1.4 Staff

The planned Architecture BA program presently has twelve members:

- Prof.Ass.Dr. Mimisa Dugolli,
- Prof.Ass. Dr. Xhevahir Bajrami,
- Prof. Asc.Dr. Fahredin Shabani,
- Nazli Tyfekciu lecturer,
- Prof. Dr. Abdullah Zejullahu (part time, UP),
- Dr. Sc. Elizi Kujtim (parttime, SUT),
- Jakupi Enis (part time, Tetovo RM),
- Dr. Sadiku Hajdar (part time, UP),
- Gyler Mydyti (part time, Politecnico Mi),
- Saliu Nuran (part time, SUT),
- Bekim Ceko (Phd-cand)

But only three of these colleagues are listed in the table on page 418: 1. as full time academic staf and one of them as part time.. University of Prizren does not have enough full time Professor and other types of full time academic staff.

According to KAA Standards: “(4.) Teaching Staff

The qualifications of teaching staff in Higher Education Institutions must meet international scientific, artistic and professional standards. Legally binding contracts with these staff must be submitted with the application. These contracts should demonstrate the staff’s suitability for the institution’s planned studies”.

During the site visit it was stated, that staff members of other universities such as University of Pristina or SUT of Tetovo can be taken in account, this regulation is undertaken only for new-founded state-institutions, but not for University of Prizren founded back in 2010.

Recommendation

According KAA Standards, it is necessary to get permanent staff, at least for each competence field one permanent full time Professor or other permanent academic staff member. It is a basic criteria for a new accreditation.

3.1.5 Finances and Infrastructure / Space and Equipment

The spaces of the refurbished building in Prizren should be filled by students’ activities such as drawing room for independent work or storage of students’ models/drawings. University of Prizren’s existing facilities and the planned extension can host the needs of the Architecture BA course. It would produce a creative mood, which is needed for Architecture. Spaces of common activities like café or club can have a great impact on homelike atmosphere. All these are possible, but still do not exist.

According to KAA Standards “(5.) Facilities:

The applicant institution should have at its disposal sufficient staff, space and equipment (e.g. computers, library, etc.) for effective studies. These should be provided in accord with the type of educational institution.

Evidence about teaching and support staff, space and equipment should accompany the application”.

The buildings and facilities can meet those criteria after completion of the ongoing refurbishment, but can not be taken in account as existing equipment at the time of the present accreditation.

The library regarding books, magazines and journals shows the urgent need of development of literature in Architecture. Unfortunately there are no books at the library that are listed at the subject descriptions as recommended literature.

The experts provide a short list of recognized Architectural publications:

- Architectural Record
- Arquitectura Viva
- Domus
- The Architectural Review
- A10
- Deetail
- Internimagazine
- Architonic
- Frame
- Arq Future
- Architektur Aktuell
- Beside subscription of some of the international papers on design, internet-based information can be useful too:
- www.world-architects.com
- www.campobaeza.com
- www.barqo.cl
- www.arcspace.com
- www.archinect.com
- www.materialicious.com
- www.architonic.com
- www.epiteszforum.hu
- www.archi-europe.com
- www.archdaily.com
- www.archiworld.com
- www.arcspace.com
- www.worldarchitecturenews.com
- www.architectenweb.nl
- www.archiweb.cz
- www.dutcharchitects.com
- www.domusweb.it

- www.europaconcorsi.com
- www.nextroom.at
- www.archi-students.org
- www.worldarchitecture.org
- www.isayweinfeld.com
- www.kenji-tagashira.com
- www.materialicious.com
- www.dezeen.com
- www.designspotter.com
- www.moroso.it
- www.classic-design24.com
- www.boconcept.hu
- www.trendir.com
- www.designerjapan.com
- www.classic-design24.com
- www.architonic.com
- www.materia.nl
- www.madeindesign.com

Recommendation

The management of financing on university level must consider, that Architecture is one of the most expensive study programs despite Medicine and some high-tech disciplines. There is room at the refurbished building to establish the special conditions for Architects' education.

The library is very poor and needs improvement extensively, in terms of Architecture it does not correspond to European standards at the moment.

The lab with computers is adequate for the study program in Architecture.

The computer labs are shared by students of different disciplines. Computers should be available for Architects all day for the preparation of semester-work plans and for practice. Classrooms are available and in a good condition, the infrastructure is of European standard. Special rooms devoted for students of Architecture are under construction.

University of Prizren should provide appropriate teaching equipment including literature and professional journals of international architecture, design and urbanism.

The costs for up to date information are much higher than in other disciplines, such as Humanities, Economics or Law.

Modeling laboratories should be established and equipped devoted for architectural design studio work in the refurbished building.

3.1.6 Conclusion

Appreciated internationally acting Architects are involved, that ensures the development of practice oriented attitude of the graduates.

The program leader is keen to engage more teaching staff with international background, which will bring additional value to internationalization efforts.

Recommendation

Following the “Directive 2013/55/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 20 November 2013, amending Directive 2005/36/EC on the recognition of professional qualifications and Regulation (EU) No 1024/2012 on administrative cooperation through the Internal Market Information System (‘the IMI Regulation’)”, a total of at least five years of full-time study at a university or a comparable teaching institution, leading to successful completion of a university-level examination is claimed.

The self evaluation report (SER) briefly addresses programme aims. However, the needed analysis about the labour market’s needs is missing.

In the descriptions of the studios (project based learning) the expert had the impression that these courses are still more topic driven than problem and learning outcome oriented.

Group work experience is not or not sufficiently provided to students. For professional work collaboration in architectural offices teamwork and collaborations with engineering science specialists are required.

The necessity of practical internships linked to the BA programme in architecture is widely acknowledged, its integration into the curriculum structure should be reconsidered.

The hours of students’ independent work per course should be re-calculated. Experts often has the impression, that students are obliged to work much more for the courses than indicated in the descriptions of study modules.

The planned Architecture BA course is not sufficiently equipped in both technical and in spatial belongings yet. Space for students’ independent work, that is accessible 24 hours per day and 365 days per year is still under construction.

A modern equipment of a model building workshops is missing. Printing facilities and machines for efficient mock-up production should be established in the newly refurbished building.

CAD equipment and drawing facilities should be fully devoted to Architecture study program and will have to be kept up-to-date following the technical development of the devices.

Library and internet-access are in a good condition, but Architecture and Building Technology oriented literature is missing.

<p>The expert team recommends to KAA a new-accreditation of the bachelor level study program Architecture BA of University of Prizren after fulfilling the basic criteria – according to KAA Standards - for permanent staff and refurbishment of the building and equipments assigned for Architectural studies in a year.</p>

3.2 Software Design & Information Technology and Telecommunication (both reaccreditation)

The bachelor level study programmes *Software Design* and *Information Technology and Telecommunication* have been accredited in May 2012 without condition. Both programmes were managed jointly, the majority of teaching staff was also teaching in both programmes. Due to this overlap between those two programs the concerns and recommendations were nearly identical and thus they were treated jointly in the 2012 report. The following recommendations of improvement were proposed:

1. *Define the learning outcomes in addition to the course descriptions. A consistent representation of learning outcomes can be seen as a result of a well-defined planning process.*

The situation in 2015: each course description contains also the intended learning outcomes.

2. *Support this processes by following the DIN specification (PAS 1032-1/2) on “Education and Training with Special Emphasis on e-Learning”, which may serve as a guideline and a checklist.*

The situation in 2015: the PAS 1032-1/2 documents are developed in the *Deutsches Institut für Normung* and are not internationally widely used. Therefore the recommendation should be considered as a suggestion to elaborate systematic and consistent processes for advancing eLearning in the university. Currently eLearning is not regulated in the university.

3. *Implement eLearning at first only at this faculty. Only after having collected plenty of experience (after approx. one year of operation) by such a pilot implementation the deployment of eLearning should be extended to other programs.*

The situation in 2015: eLearning is not implemented in a systematic way, the teachers are individually using some elements of eLearning: put course materials into personal web area, provide students with web-addresses of the most significant sources, use personal *Moodle* account in teaching etc (a university-wide *Moodle* instance is in an implementation phase).

4. *Provide informative material on eLearning, tutorials, and training for all target groups (lecturers, administrators, students).*

The situation in 2015: in preparation.

5. *Constantly evaluate the curriculum due to the dynamic nature of ICT. Sufficient attention needs to be given to security related topics, mobile computing and cloud computing.*

The situation in 2015: all these topics are sufficiently represented in the new version of the curriculum. Moreover, the staff has plans for further improvement of the curriculum.

6. *Enable continuous university-wide access to the Internet which is to be considered as a characteristic feature of any modern educational site.*

The situation in 2015: there is campus-wide access to the Internet, although password-protected.

7. *Implement (re-activate) a Learning Management System (preferably an open source product like Moodle) to allow for a blended learning approach.*

The situation in 2015: still in process.

8. *Develop and employ an eLearning concept.*

The situation in 2015: not yet developed.

9. *Offer teacher training to ensure that eLearning principles are being applied properly.*

The situation in 2015: no evidences provided.

10. *Develop a faculty-wide research strategy and to initiate project-based research with industry partners.*

The situation in 2015: there is no faculty-wide research strategy developed and no project-based research with industry partners initiated.

11. *Employ permanent academic staff which is a precondition for sustainable development and for research activities.*

The situation in 2015: at the moment of site visit the university has employed ten full-time academic staff members. However, as the number of students grew rapidly in last years there is a need for more permanent staff members.

Conclusion: the recommendations are taken into account except those related with eLearning. On the other hand, some of the eLearning-related recommendations require university-wide solutions.

We will below discuss the *Software Design* and *Information Technology and Telecommunication* academic programmes jointly, indicating specific aspects separately where relevant.

The following bases on the documents presented to the expert team, on the site visit and on discussion with some academic staff members: Artan Dermaku, Edlira Qefaliu, Bujar Krasnizi, Xhevahir Bajrami, Ziriye Hasani, Nysret Demaku, Ercan Canhasi. Edlira Qefaliu and Bujar Krasnizi were employed after submission of SER.

1. Academic Programmes and Student Management

- Does the academic programme correspond to the institution's mission statement and principles of operation?

The mission statement of the University emphasizes a desire to promote integration of Kosovo into the European Union, and does not specify any subject area. Therefore, formally both academic programmes – *Software Design* (SD) and *Information Technology and Telecommunication* (TIT) – correspond to the mission statement of the institution.

- Are the programme's quality, range and academic aims appropriate to the academic degree?

Common remarks:

The intended learning outcomes of the SD and TIT programmes coincide. As these

learning outcomes are adequate for SD programme only, these were evidently mechanically copied for TIT programme. The learning outcome “students will be able to resolve complex problems in programming field” is not quite adequate for TIT because this programme contains in fact considerable amount on hardware-related subjects as well. Overall, the expected learning outcomes should have been formulated in a more specific manner, allowing to differentiate the expected competences of the graduates. Currently the formulations of expected learning outcomes are:

- 1) too general not describing explicitly enough actual learning outcomes. For example, what does “To encourage scientific and technological development of the society” mean?
- 2) partly trivial. For example “To develop and strength individual and to improve their capacities in theoretical and practical dimensions” (original spelling).

It is difficult to adequately decide about the relevance of each particular course without having a clear understanding about the expected learning outcomes of the whole study programme.

It is written in the Self-evaluation Report (SER, pages 161 and 204) that the graduates of the programmes “are expected to be employed frequently ... in management positions ...”. However, it is widely accepted that bachelor graduates are normally not managers, but have specialist’ positions. Managerial positions can be expected primarily from graduates of master programmes.

The objective of the courses is in many cases formulated as “The objective of the course is to give the students information about ...”. This means remaining on the lowest level of the *Bloom’s* taxonomy, and therefore does not harmonize with modern pedagogy (for example, with the *flipped classroom* method).

The lists of literature in the course descriptions are partly inadequate and partly not accessible to the students. For example, 1) the book “Distributed Systems: Principles and Paradigms” of A. Tanenbaum and M. van Steen is placed first in the literature of the *Cloud Computing* course (SD programme). On the other hand, the word “cloud” is not mentioned in this book (about 700 pages), and *vice versa*, the course description does not contain the word “distributed”. Moreover, this book is in the list of literature of the *Distributed Systems* course as well, although incorrectly cited (SER, p 197); 2) *Introduction to Programming* course bases only on C++ literature.

Concerning the structure of learning: 30 hours are foreseen for teaching (lecturing?), 30 hours for laboratory work and 90 hours for individual studies for each 6 credit subject, not depending on how theoretical a subject is, what are the needs for practical work in laboratories etc. For example, there is no need for laboratory equipment in conducting independent studies in mathematics, what is not the case, for example, in *Sensors and Interfaces* subject.

SD:

Each student has to take 4 compulsory and 1 elective (out of 3) subject each having 6 credits each semester during the first two years. The *Project* and *Bachelor Thesis* have 12 credits, and are both compulsory.

Concerning the programme, the following remarks can be made:

1. Some topics should deserve more attention (for example, device-to-device communication, i.e. Internet of things, IPR, licensing and agile development methodologies, formal languages and grammars) while the necessity of some topics is questionable (for example, paradoxes in set theory).
2. The description of the *Cloud Computing* course is copied from the course materials of the Cloud Computing course of *New York University*, without any reference (<http://www.nyu.edu/classes/jcf/CSCI-GA.3033-009/handouts/Cloud-Computing-Course-Description-and-Syllabus-Spring2014.pdf>).
3. Description of some courses is presented in such a general terms that does not allow to decide about the actual content of the course (for example, *Machine Learning* course, page 183 of SER, or how does the project look like in *Discrete Math* course, page 176 of SER).
4. Relation between the learning outcomes and the actual content of a course remains hidden in many cases (for example, how the learning outcome “Have experience of working as a member of a team on a software engineering project” is supposed to be achieved in Software Engineering and Project Management course, page 180 of SER).

Conclusion: *The programme’s quality, range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree.*

Recommendation: pay special attention to the emerging and important areas in further development of the academic programme (for example, device-to-device communication, i.e. Internet of things, IPR, licensing and agile development methodologies).

TIT:

Each student has to take 4 compulsory and 1 elective (out of 3) subject each semester (except the 6th semester where there are no electives). *Bachelor Thesis* is considered as one of the compulsory subjects..

Concerning the programme, the following remarks can be made:

1. Some topics deserve more attention (for example, device-to-device communication, i.e. Internet of things, robotics, IPR, licensing and agile development methodologies, finite automata as formal models of controllers).
2. *Discrete Mathematics* is placed on 4th semester. At the same time, some concepts of discrete mathematics are used already from the very beginning of the studies (for example, in *Digital Technology* course).
3. The course *Research Methods* does not in fact handle research methods as such, neither qualitative nor quantitative (or combined) methods. Even collecting and handling of empirical data what is fundamental for conducting research in many cases is not mentioned. Remark that the same teacher (Vehbi Mifyari) offers *Research Methods* course also in SD programme, and this course is really devoted to research methods in this programme!

Conclusion: *The programme’s quality, range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree.*

Recommendation:

1. Pay special attention to the emerging and important areas in further development of the academic programme (for example, device-to-device communication, i.e. Internet of things, robotics, IPR, licensing, finite automata as formal models of controllers).

2. Consider the possibility to bring Discrete Mathematics to a more earlier semester.

- Is the programme based on an overarching didactic concept that has been adequately communicated to and adopted by the teaching staff?

SER does not describe any overarching didactic concept. The teaching and learning methods are described in the most formal way, using almost an identical formulation; the description is more thorough in few cases only.

Recommendation: implement the methods of modern pedagogy (for example, the flipped classroom method).

- Does the academic degree correspond to international standards?

The fundamental principles of the design of the programme are not revealed in the SER nor explained during the site visit. According to the explanation of participating teachers, similar programmes of other universities were taken as examples. In this relation, *Vienna University of Technology*, *Johannes Kepler University in Linz*, *Kingston University*, *Imperial College London*, *Technische Universität München* were named in the SER. As a whole, the academic degrees correspond to the international standards, although the curricula recommendations of international professional organizations and frameworks (ACM, SWEBOOK of IEEE) are not been considered.

- Does the structure of the programme give sufficient opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis? (E.g. what is the proportion of independent study time compared to online/distance teaching and classroom units?)

The majority of subjects have the size of 6 ECTS and weekly 2+2 or 3+3 hours learning in the classes (in total $15 \times 4 = 60$ or $15 \times 6 = 90$ hours). Therefore, the number of hours for independent work of the students during a course is supposed to be 90 or 60; that gives the students' enough opportunity for independent study, reflection and analysis. However, due to the big amount of hours for independent study, supervision and support of independent work of students as well as the access to the literature should be guaranteed. The SER does not discuss this topic. It was explained during the site visit that students are provided mostly with electronic copies of the textbooks. It should also be mentioned that the data in SER did not always coincide with the data in the course descriptions (syllabus) – some course descriptions presented during the site visit allocated for lectures and exercises 45+45 hours while a unified scheme of 30+30 hours was used in the SER .

- Is the allocation of ECTS appropriate and justified?

Although the guiding principles of composing the study programme were not clear neither satisfactory explained, and the course descriptions were sometimes quite sketchy, the principle that the study programme consists of relatively big courses is in general appropriate.

- Is the workload required for the academic programme manageable for students?

The number of hours spent in classes is adequate, especially when 45+45 hours are

allocated for lectures and exercises. However, fast majority of the literature is not available in the university's library. As already mentioned above, students are supposed to do 90 hours individual studies for each 6-credit subject. This makes altogether about $5 \times 90 = 450$ hours for a whole semester, or $450/15 = 30$ hours a week. However, meeting with students (of all specialties) it turned out that they devote in average to independent studies about half of that. Therefore, the actual amount of independent work is adequate in the case of "45+45" courses only where the amount of independent work is supposed to be 60 hours for a 6-credit course.

Recommendation: implement the methods of modern pedagogy (for example, the flipped classroom method).

- Are the teaching methods and content of teaching units sufficient for the successful achievement of the programme's goals and outcomes (competences and qualifications, knowledge and skills)?

It is not possible to answer this question satisfactory on the programme level because the aims of the programmes, profile and expected learning outcomes are given in very general terms. Concerning the teaching methods, the SER uses standard formulations in most cases, as mentioned above. As to the separate courses, the time for discussing thoroughly enough the content of all courses was far too limited. Some topics that should be strengthened in the study programmes, are discussed above.

- Is the overlap of academic content between the various parts of the curriculum comprehensible and transparent?

There is no other division into parts of the curricula as division to semesters. There seems to be no considerable overlap between the different courses.

- How do the admission criteria and admission procedures measure up to international standards?

The admission criteria are the same as for other bachelor programmes, no specific conditions or requirements will be applied – an admission test is used as it is internationally a common practice.

- Is the ratio of academic/artistic staff to students appropriate?

According to the table on page 437, there are in total $946 + 1171 = 2117$ students admitted to SD and TIT programmes in years 2010-2015. The number of currently active students is much less (some are graduated and some are dropped out – the yearly drop-out rate is about 10%). According to the programme descriptions (pages 167-169 and 208-211 of SER), there are altogether 20 teachers teaching on Software Design and TIT bachelor programmes (8 full-time and 10 part-time). Even if the number of active students is only half of the admitted students (say, about 1000), the ratio of academic staff to students (about 1:100 for full-time academic staff and 1:50 for all teachers) is significantly lower than in leading universities. The university cannot expect from the teachers high quality teaching and high-level research with such a low teacher-student ratio.

2. Staff

- Does the institution have an adequate proportion of permanent staff and appropriate proportions of permanent and external staff?

According to the SER, there are 8 permanent academic staff members (the number of courses teaching on TIT and SD study programmes are indicated in the brackets): Artan Dermaku (4, 6), Xhevahir Bajrami (2, 4), Ercan Canhasi (3, 4), Mimoza Dugolli (2, 3), Malush Mjaku (1, 3), Samedin Krrabaj (2, 2), Naim Baftiu (1, 1), Ziriye Hasani (0, 1). At the time of site visit two more teachers were employed.

Also according to the SER, there were 10 part time teachers involved in teaching: Rexhep Gjergji (3, 1), Nysret Demaku (7, 3), Nazli Tyfekqi (5, 3), Besim Limani (3, 2), Isak Shabani (4, 3), Sabriye Osmani (1, 0), Lutfi Bina (1, 0), Arianit Maraj (2, 0), Marjan Demaj (1, 1), Vehbi Miftari (1, 1).

The share 1:1 between the total numbers of full-time and part-time teachers is adequate. However, work contracts of two abovementioned part-time teachers (I.Shabani, A.Maraj) have been terminated before the date of site visit. This raises the question of rationality of short-term work contracts: the motivation to enhance the courses may suffer in the case of short-term work contracts.

Recommendation: a possibility to introduce long-term work contracts for part-time academic staff.

- Does the academic staff demonstrate proven ability at a high academic and didactic level and are their qualifications appropriate to the positions they hold within the institution according to the basic criteria?

The qualification of the academic staff is appropriate – 7 (out of 8) full-time and 5 part-time teachers have doctoral degrees.

3. Research and International Cooperation

- Is the teaching staff involved in research activities inside or outside the institution, and do these research activities feed back into teaching/course contents?

The Google Scholar gave (18.03.2015) about permanent ICT teachers the following results: Artan Dermaku has 45 citations to his publications, Xhevahir Bajrami – 196, Ercan Canhasi – 14, Mimoza Dugolli – 0, Malush Mjaku – 0, Samedin Krrabaj – 1, Naim Baftiu – 0, Ziriye Hasani – 0. Only one staff member (S. Krrabaj) has indicated Prizren University as the home university on his publications. Therefore, A. Dermaku, X. Bajrami and E. Canhasi are in fact the only internationally visible teachers. Note also that there are currently no research contracts with the local industry.

- Is the extent and the quality of international cooperation in research and teaching adequate?

International cooperation in research is conducted on individual level. The partners are mainly from Austria and Germany. Concerning teaching, the university has participated in some Tempus projects. Many teachers have conducted some of their studies in foreign universities and still keep academic contacts with these universities.

- Are students involved in research and cooperation projects?

No evidences about student involvement in research and cooperation projects were

presented.

4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

- Does the institution have an adequate budget plan?

The expert committee was given the budget and expenses for year 2014. According to this, the ICT investments were in amount of 4 198,99 euro. Although – as it was explained during the site visit – the university is mostly using freeware, this sum is extraordinary small. Taking into account the fact that computer labs depreciate in universities in 3-5 years, it can be expected that at least one computer lab should be replaced each year.

- Does the institution have adequate buildings and specialized infrastructure for the requirements of the programme?

The number and size of rooms for lecturing is adequate. The university has five computer labs, 20-30 PC computers in each. Taking into account the current structure of studies where there are in average 5-7 hours lectures and 5-7 hours exercises in 1 ECTS, this is satisfactory. On the other hand, the share of practical work (exercises) in computer labs is relatively small; for its' increasing more computer labs are needed.

Recommendation: beside of traditional computer labs, set up specialized technology labs for conducting exercises on hardware-related courses, especially for the TIT academic programme.

5. Quality Management

- Are the institution's programmes assessed regularly within the context of internal evaluation processes?

The university has established internal quality assurance regulations and procedures. The programme was previously internationally accredited in 2012. Concerning internal evaluation process, no additional procedures on top of the general university procedures were demonstrated.

<p>The expert team would recommend to KAA an accreditation of the bachelor level study programmes Software Design and Information Technology and Telecommunication as it stands as long as the continuous improvement process of the programmes is evident.</p>

3.3 German Language and Literature (re-accreditation)

3.3.1. Starting remarks

Regrettably the meeting with the representatives of the department of German Language and Literature of the UoPz – Prof. Dr. Izer Maksuti and Dr. Arsim Rexhepi - started with an incident. Dr. Rexhepi refused the request to speak English during the meeting. He insisted to speak German ignoring the fact that the representative of the students, Ms Simona Dimovska (European Students Union, EU), and Ms Furtuna Mehmeti (Acting Director / Expert for Evaluation and Accreditation / KAA) also participated in the talk. They both are not able to speak German. Even the proposal of Prof. Dr. Frederking to translate the German sentences of Dr. Rexhepi into English language was refused by him. Prof. Dr. Ferdije Zhushi-Etemi (National Quality Council / KAA) and Vice Rector Prof. Dr. Sadik Idrizi (UoPz), who both have been sent for, were not successful in convincing Dr. Rexhepi, too. Even more Dr. Rexhepi became rather aggressive in his voice. After a short talk on the floor with the involved representatives of KAA – Ms Mehmeti and Prof. Dr. Ferdije Zushi-Etemi – Prof. Frederking (Expert) decided to continue the meeting with the representatives of the department, Prof. Dr. Maksuti and Dr. Rexhepi, because the misbehavior of one person should not disturb the process of evaluation and accreditation of the whole study program.

3.3.2 Academic Program and Student Management

The academic program of the department of German Language and Literature, which is presented in the SER 2014/15, corresponds to international standards. The curriculum is conceived as a four year BA program. There is no doubt that quality, range and academic aims of the curriculum are in accordance with the principles intended by the Bologna process. The profile of the intended academic degrees and the allocation of ECTS are conforming with international standards, too. The workload is manageable for the students.

The study program is in its basic structure well balanced and according to the needs of the society of Kosovo in presence and future. It is very plausible that the curriculum offers two opportunities between students can choose: either education or translation. In the first semester all students of German Language and Literature have to finish the same courses. During the following seven semesters students are able to specialize. There are obligatory and elective courses. In the obligatory courses general basic knowledge in German language and literature is offered, in the elective courses students have the opportunity to choose courses with a focus on special issues in subject education or in the field of translation. Structure, aims and contents of both types of courses are convincing. The experiences of the first four academic years confirm this appraisal.

The descriptions of the courses are differentiated and clear. The proposed literature is up to date and represents a good level of knowledge and teaching capacities.

The ET acknowledges that a lot of the expert recommendations of 2011 and 2011 have been realized in the new curriculum:

1. It is delectable, that the new curriculum doesn't force the students in the first courses any longer to start with medieval literature. It makes much more sense to offer a course 'Introduction to the German Literature', like Course 1.4 does.
2. It is a great progress that the Curriculum offers courses for didactics and methodology of the German language and literature (4.5, 5.2, 6.2, 7.2, 8.6 and 8.7). Thereby the qualifying of students for a teaching-profession has been optimized in a very convincing way.
3. It must be remarked as a further positive aspect, that a course of creative writing (4.4) is obligatory.
4. It has to be pointed out furthermore that a practical course at school (8.2) is obligatory, complemented by a course dealing with theoretical didactical aspects (8.3).

However, with regard to the curriculum some problems still exist and cause questions and recommendations, especially, because some of the aspects already have been mentioned in the Final Report of ET 2012.

Recommendation

- 1) There is still a gap in the curriculum related to the integration of technical media. Forms of teaching and learning based on computer and internet offer great opportunities to improve learning and teaching processes in connection with German language and literature in both areas: education and translation. Audio books and films also should be added into the obligatory part of the curriculum, because they offer other ways of learning German language and literature and other aesthetical codes. These special chances should be used for teaching and learning in a modern way. In the expert recommendation of 2012 these problems already have been remarked. In the near future (the new semester in autumn 2015) the program should be expanded by at least one course dealing with computer and internet based forms of learning German language and literature. It should include audio books and films in German language, too.
- 2) Another aspect of the curriculum that already has been mentioned in the expert recommendation of 2012 and that should be optimized in the new semester in autumn 2015 is the content of the curriculum for education. Especially literature for children and young people should be part of the curriculum, because young children need literature in accordance with their age. Students focussed on Education of German language and literature must have knowledge in that special kind of literature and its medial adaptations (audio books, film, internet (for example www.antolin.de) etc.).
- 3) Students should have the opportunity to enhance their knowledge of the German language on their own. For this reason a language laboratory or specific software for independent studies are necessary.

3.3.3 Research

The research opportunities of the department of German Language and Literature are still limited. The department should continue in its efforts to improve the research strategy in the near future.

Recommendation

The focus of research should be the development and empiric investigation of didactical concepts in the area of 'German as a foreign language'. In order to strengthen the real research possibilities it is necessary, that new scientific literature will be added in the library of the UoPz (cf. the general report of the ET).

3.3.4 International Cooperation

International cooperation of the department of German Language and Literature is still based on personal contacts of the staff. Cooperation exists with universities in Macedonia, Austria and Germany. To be connected with other universities, departments and scientists it is necessary that the department soon starts to develop a homepage in English and German language.

Recommendation

As 2012 already has been remarked: The international contacts should be intensified and expanded to other countries and other universities. It is necessary, that the department of German Language and Literature will participate in EU-Projects. To be successful in the process of internationalization the department has to improve its international visibility and develop a homepage in English and German language.

3.3.5 Staff

The department of German Language and Literature presently has ten members.

- Prof.Dr. Arbër Çeliku (BA, Tetovo, PhD, Mannheim),
- Mr. Arsim Rexhepi (PhD, Bochum),
- Ilir Krusha (PhD Candidate, Vienna),
- Ilir Lenjani (PhD Candidate, Vienna),
- Prof. Dr. Izer Maksuti (MA, PhD, Vienna),
- Shkurte Veliu-Ajdini (PhD Candidate, Vjenë),
- Mr. Vilson Marku (PhD Candidate, Graz),
- Vjosa Elezi-Morina (PhD Candidate, Vienna)
- Mag. Regine Schwendinger (Austrian Teacher, OEAD, Vienna)
- Katharina Ertle, MA (DAAD Teacher in Prishtina, Volunteer)

But none of these colleagues is listed in the table on page 418: 1. Full time academic staff. In other words: the department does not have a full time Professor and it does not have other types of full time academic staff.

Recommendation

It is necessary, that the department of German Language and Literature will get permanent staff, at least one permanent and full time Professor and one or two

other permanent academic staff members. In my opinion this is a *conditio sine qua non* for an accreditation.

The expert team recommend to KAA a re-accreditation of the bachelor level study program *German Language and Literature*.

Volker Frederking

Erlangen-Nürnberg 1.4.2015

3.4 Law Program of the public University of Prizren

3.4.1 Study Program Law BA

Basis of the following evaluation report are the Self Evaluation Report (SER) of UPz 2014/2015, the results of the site-visit that took place on March 19th 2015 and the documents handed over at the site-visit and submitted by mail on March 26th 2015.

3.4.1.1. Academic Programmes and Student Management

The law programme is an eight-semester BA programme. It does not perfectly meet the standards set by the Bologna-structure (Bologna): According to Bologna study programs should have a modular structure, that means a module shall consist of courses. The structure of the Law BA of UPz each semester has four obligatory courses and one elective course. Insofar UPz should check possibilities to create a modular structure: A module could connect the courses of a certain legal discipline and ensure that they will be taught within a reasonable period of time. In the present curriculum for example the student is concerned with constitutional law in the first (1.2.), third (3.2.) and eighth (8.5.2.) semester. Other courses in second (2.3.) and eighth semester (8.5.1.) are connected with this field of law. A modular structure of the study programme could ensure a more focussed learning of constitutional issues for the students. According to the present architecture of the programme the students are concerned with constitutional problems over the whole four years of study.

Apart from the missing modular structure the program consists of in total 240 credit points over a period of four years. This meets international standards. In respect of the submitted syllabi the allocation of ECTS appears to be appropriate and justified: Each semester consists of 13 to 14 lecture hours weekly, this totals in between 130 to 210 lecture hours per semester. In respect of the discussions with the students UPz is good advised to check whether the self-learning process of the students really totals 750 hours per semester: If 30 ECTS are granted per semester in between 70 and 80% of the student's learning activities must take place outside the lecture hall. A subsequent accreditation could check whether this requirement is fulfilled.

According to its mission UPz serves the region of Prizren and The Republic of Kosovo by recruiting, developing and educating students to be successful candidates in the labour market of Kosovo, the region and Europe. The academic programme corresponds to this mission statement: the student gains universal judicial knowledge and serves as a solid basis for further specializations in different legal disciplines. During the site-visit in particular the study-programme in the first academic year containing lectures in legal sociology, judicial psychology, Roman law and parliamentary and practice were discussed. From the point of view of the expert it is doubtful whether such lectures

combining law with other academic disciplines really make sense before the student gained an overview about the law in general.

This point was discussed during the site visit: the faculty's dean is with no doubt correct arguing that other study programmes outside the Kosovo have a similar program-architecture and that such courses can make an interdisciplinary understanding of the law possible. But that itself does not mean that foreign concepts automatically work at UPz and that such courses at that early state of academic education make sense in institutions that are focussed on the regional employment market. UPz would be good advised to define an own way of teaching the law taking the special conditions of the region and its employment market into account. That would be much better than copying foreign concepts that are by the way not necessarily better just because they were developed for example in Graz, Munich or elsewhere. Nevertheless the programme's quality, range and academic aims are appropriate to the academic degree.

One of the recommendations of the last evaluation report was to ensure that the courses enable the student to analyse concrete law cases and to solve legal problems. The expert shares this point of view. During the discussions with the dean at the site-visit it appeared to the expert that teaching law in Kosovo focuses on theory without providing practical knowledge for the student. In respect to Bologna UPz is good advised to think this position over: intention of Bologna is to support the graduate's employability. Employability requires the faculty to analyse concrete law cases and to solve legal problems. An institution must assure such learning objectives if it wants to meet Bologna's standards.

3.4.1.2. Staff

According to the table on page 418 of the SER the law faculty has four full-time professors. During the site-visit the expert team was informed that UPz employed two more full-time law professors. These six full-time professors teach and support the currently enrolled 1106 students of the faculty of law. That means that one full-time professor has to supervise more than 180 students. It is impossible to handle this amount of students in an adequate way: according to a statistics of the German Wissenschaftsrat (WR, Drs 2558-12, Hamburg 2012, page 110) between 2000 and 2012 one full-time university professor was concerned with 100 to 120 students in average. Accordingly a law program of the UPz's size would need between 9 and 11 full-time law professors to run this BA-program.

Apart from the full-time professors there are part-time professors that support and supervise students and hold lectures. Basis of their employment is a six-month contract ending at the end of the semester and that only continue if dean and rector agree. Evaluating the adequacy of academic staff and students it is doubtful whether professorships on such a contractual basis can be taken into account: accreditation is granted over a period of three years. If the status of employment is based upon six-month contracts a sustainable development of the program is not foreseeable.

Part-time professors hold a significant number of lectures in the Law BA program. Working on a one-semester contractual basis means that the program management is free to change a significant number of lecturers over the three year period of accreditation. Accordingly it is doubtful whether a sufficient academic and didactic level is guaranteed over the whole period of accreditation. Discussing the issue of permanent academic staff during the site-visit it was mentioned that it is difficult to find adequate candidates for professorships. Accordingly it was argued that the faculty depends on such part-time relationships. It is admitted that it is difficult to find adequate candidates for full-time professorships. But nevertheless it is necessary to guarantee a sustainable faculty and programme development.

The only reason to accept the lecture hours of the part-time professors as an equivalent to those of the full-time professors is that the students are obviously satisfied with the performance of these part-time professors, that they feel well supported by the law faculty in general and the professors in particular and reasonable steps were taken to raise the amount of full-time professors. Accordingly it should be up to an accreditation in future to evaluate whether the proportion of full-time professors and students will be significantly changed by university and faculty.

3.4.1.3. Research and International Co-operation

There is no research programme connected with the BA-programme. The programme itself is created for the local market and consequently the aspects taught in that programme are very general. Accordingly there was no need to create bespoke research activities to run the programme adequately. In respect of the submitted CV's many of the involved professors did a lot of substantial research work that also had impact on the professor's field of research. For a programme with regional impact extent and the quality of international cooperation in research and teaching is adequate.

3.4.1.4. Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

During the site visit the expert time had the opportunity to visit the faculty's infrastructure. That appeared to be adequate for the requirements of the programme.

3.4.1.5. Quality Management

Also the BA-Law is implemented in the university's evaluation process.

Proposal for the decision of accreditation

Six full-time professors for 1108 students are inappropriate. Only because of the qualification of the members of the academic staff involved in the law program and their motivation to support young people in obtaining degrees in higher education I propose the accreditation of the submitted law program.

3.4.2. Study Program Financial Law MA

3.4.2.1. Academic Programmes and Student Management

The MA-program “Financial Law” (MA) is a three-semester programme. It does not meet the standards set by the Bologna-structure (Bologna): According to Bologna study programs should have a modular structure, that means a module shall consist of courses. During the first two semesters the program provides that the students will have six courses per semester: during the first two semesters ten of the courses will be obligatory and two elective. The third semester is reserved for the “diploma thesis”.

According to its mission UPz serves the region of Prizren and The Republic of Kosovo by recruiting, developing and educating students to be successful candidates in the labour market of Kosovo, the region and Europe. The program structure provides lectures in banking, insurance, bankruptcy and tax law that have a high practical relevance. Insofar graduates could enrich Kosovo’s employment market. In this context it should also be mentioned that according to the representatives of the faculty the curriculum was discussed with local service providers.

The chosen structure of the program architecture does not show that the single lectures are linked with each other: it appears as if a few topics connected with financial law were collected and then summarized in a curriculum. Here it appears that the study program has room for improvement.

All courses end with a seminar thesis at the end of the course. Because each course grants 5 ECTS the student’s workload is 125 hours in total. Because there are 30 lecture- and 15 practice-hours provided by the curriculum 80 hours of self-study will be necessary for the student. Such a seminar thesis can justify this allocation of ECTS here, but it is doubtful whether such a seminar thesis is useful in all provided courses. Alternatively modern types of examination methods – like case studies or role-plays – could also support to reach the learning goals and objectives.

On the whole the program as it was explained during the site-visit in the SER corresponds to international standards. In detail there is room for improvement as far as the modular structure, didactic concept and teaching methods are concerned. But such improvements can only be made if the program runs and the faculty will be confronted with the routine-problems of the own program architecture.

3.4.2.2. Staff

The MA program has to be seen in connection with the BA program: Currently six full-time professors support 1108 students in the BA-program. Now the UPz strives to get an accreditation for an MA although it does not even have enough full-time professors for the

BA program. This point was discussed during the site-visit: the representatives of the university mentioned that they need MA-programs for students that have just graduated in the BA-program. Without any doubt it would be helpful for the students in the region to carry on with their studies in a MA-program of the UPz. But such studies only make sense if the institution has an adequate proportion of professors and students. This proportion is not given if a professor in this MA-program also has to supervise 180 students in a BA program simultaneously.

The representative of the faculty argued that there are currently three more potential professors waiting for employment. They were just waiting for the nostrification of their degrees. Furthermore it would be very difficult to find sufficiently qualified lawyers for professorships. Even if all the efforts UPz made to find new professors are taken into account this cannot justify the accreditation of the MA-program at this stage: Six full time professors cannot supervise 1108 BA and an undefined number of MA-students. This is the current situation at UPz and this situation is to be evaluated in this accreditation process. And if there are three potential professors waiting for employment UPz does not need them for an MA-program – UPz needs these professors for the BA-program.

Finally it should be mentioned that only three of the fourteen courses in MA-program will be held by full-time professors of the UPz: “Insurance Law”, “Globalization and European economic integration” and “International Financial Institutions”. Accordingly during the first two semesters the average student will have 25% of the courses together with full-time professors. That means that 75% of the courses will be taught by part-time professors. This is by far not sufficient if this is compared to standards of foreign countries: under the German standards for example more than a half of the courses of a program must be held by full-time professors (compare Wissenschaftsrat, Leitfaden der institutionellen Akkreditierung, Potsdam 2010, Drs 9886 page 23). Even this point was discussed during the site-visit. It was mentioned that the employment of one professor is intended that will hold three obligatory and one elective course. But even if this professor can be employed – that means in best case - only 55% of the courses will be taught by full-time professors and this would be quite close to the minimum standard of 50%.

As far as the ability to teach at a high academic and didactic level is concerned it should be mentioned that all lecturers have a Dr-degree and are – insofar – formally qualified to teach in a MA program. Doubtful is whether all the lecturers are qualified to hold law lectures: the submitted CVs show that five out of eleven law-lectures will be held by lecturers that do not have a degree in law. Maybe the lecturers worked in their field of teaching practically and academically. In respect of the submitted CVs it cannot be finally judged in how far they are qualified to hold such lectures.

3.4.2.3. Research and International Co-operation

There is no research programme connected with the MA-programme. In respect of the submitted CV's many of the involved professors did a lot of substantial research work that also had impact on the professor's field of research. Taking into account that an MA-

programme is to be accredited research of the lecturers with a particular finance-focus is missing. UPz should encourage the lecturers to show more research activities of the full-time professors on that academic field. The reason that they have not done that yet may be that they have to much to do with the 1108 students in the BA-program.

3.4.2.4. Finances and Infrastructure/Space and Equipment

During the site visit the expert time had the opportunity to visit the faculty's infrastructure. That appeared to be adequate for the requirements of the programme.

3.4.2.5. Quality Management

Also the MA-Financial Law is implemented in the university's evaluation process.

Proposal for the decision of accreditation

Because of the inadequate number of full-time professors I do not propose the accreditation of the submitted MA – financial law program.