



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

COLLEGE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES “REZONANCA”

Study program: Public and Environmental health, BSc

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

June, Zagreb

TABLE OF CONTENTS



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	1
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	5
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	7
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	9
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	9
2.2. Quality management	12
2.3. Academic staff	15
2.4. Educational process content.....	18
2.5. Students.....	22
2.6. Research.....	25
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	28
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	31
4. APPENDICES (<i>if available</i>)	34



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: May 11, 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. sc. Sanja Kalambura, University of Applied Science Velika Gorica

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Naim Gasshi

Sources of information for the Report:

- Self-evaluation report of College of Medical Sciences “Rezonanca”
- Professors CV (full time and part time)
- Document named Appendices

Requested documents:

1. The list of EU study programs with which the new program has been compared
2. Detail explanation about ECTS methodology
3. Syllabuses for study program
4. Tutorial procedure if applicable
5. Photo or movie documentation for Laboratory, classroom, library
6. Library description – number of books for study program Peer to peer procedure if applicable
7. Practice manual and procedures
8. Laboratory exercise manual
9. Quality Politics
10. Quality Assurance manual
11. Student electronic management system – link



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

12. Link to all relevant documents on English on web site

Additionally, Received documents:

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of KAA, July 2018*
- *Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact, Sustainability*



1.2. Site visit schedule

Date: 11th of May 2021

Expert Team

- Prof. Dr. sc. Sanja Kalambura

Coordinators of KAA

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Site Visit Program

09.00 – 09.45 Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated

No.	Staff	Position
1	Acad.Prof.dr. Ramadan Idrizaj	President of College
2.	Acad.Prof.dr. Arian Idrizaj	Rector
3.	Prof.asoc. Blerim Krasniqi	Vice-rector for Academic Affair
4.	Prof.dr. Ibrahim Behluli	Vide-rector for Research
5.	Prof.asoc.Milazim Gjocaj	Dean of Faculty of Medical Sciences
6.	Prof.asoc. Nita Kelmendi	Dean of Faculty of Pharmacy

09.50 – 10:30 Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff -
Joint session

No.	Staff	Position
-----	-------	----------



1	Prof.asoc. Nazim Dakaj	Vice-rector for Foreign Relations, Development and Quality Assurance
2.	Prof.asoc. Basri Lenjani	Office for Quality Assurance - Director
3.	Prof.dr. Rexhep Hoxha	Office for Quality Assurance
4.	Prof.ass. Kujtim Thaqi	Office for Quality Assurance
5.	Drenica Llauka	Senior Quality Control Officer
6.	Margareta Mustafa	Administration Officer

10:30 – 11:10 Lunch break

11:10 – 12:10 Meeting with the heads of the study programme

No.	Staff
1	Prof.ass. Ardita Sylejmani
2.	Prof.asoc. Raif Bytyçi
3.	Prof.ass. Luan Daija

12:15 – 12:50 Meeting with teaching staff

No.	Staff	Subject
1	Lecturer Arsim Kurti	Microbiology
2.	Lecturer Jetmir Sejdiu	Human Anatomy
3.	Prof.ass. Lendita Berisha	Infectology
4.	Ass.MSc. Daniela Zeneli.	Food Safety and Hygiene
5.	Prof.ass. Nderim Kryeziu	Vice-dean for Research
6.	Ass.dr. Vera Ndrejaj	Infectology

12:55 – 13:40 Meeting with employers of graduates

No.	Staff	Position
1.	Prof.dr. Naser Ramadani	National Institute of Public Health of Kosova - Director
2.	Dr.sc. Ilirjana Zymberaj	Food and Veterinary Agency of Kosova - Sanitary Department - Director

13:40 – 13:50 Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts

13:50 – 14.00 Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

No	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs
----	----------------	---------	---------------------------------------



1	Public Health, Environmental Health and Food Safety/ BSc (Accreditation)	Prof. Dr. Sanja Kalambura	Raif Bytyçi	Luan Daija	Ardita Sylejmani	
---	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------	-------------	------------	---------------------	--

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

College of Medical Sciences "Rezonanca" was established at 2003, in 2008 joint with College "ILIRIA" as its academic units. In 2015 it is accredited as College of Medical Sciences "Resonance" for the period of three years. Today the College of Medical Sciences "Rezonanca" offers bachelor studies in BSc Biochemistry Laboratory, BSc in Community Pharmacy, BSc in Medicine, BSc in Nursing, BSc Sanitary Medicine, BSc in Diagnostic Radiology, Integrated Dentistry Program (300 ECTS Dr.stom.), and two master programs: BSc in Pharmacy and MSc in Nursing.

General mission of our institution consists of:

1. Development and application of new concepts of the medical education of XXI cent. in Kosovo.
2. Offering, promoting and developing qualitative curriculums, according to international standards.
3. Increasing the general capacities for academic and scientific research work for the higher education,
4. Creating institutional infrastructure and increasing intellectual capacities for academic and scientific research work.
5. Enriching the health system in the community with quality medical services, especially the Kosovo's deficit-based medical services for the current period.

The college currently has 1441 students, of which 84 in the BSc Biomedical Laboratory program, 111 in the BSc Pharmacy Community Program, 180 in the BSc BSc STAIC program, 440 in the BSc Nursing program, 46 in the BSc Program of Diagnostic Radiology, 417 in Integrated Dentistry Program, 102 in MSc Pharmacy Program and 73 in MSc in Nursing.



Since I did not have opportunity to visit College due COVID -19 restrictions I can confirm from materials and movie that are satisfactory, equipped teaching rooms and laboratories and it is implemented true automated information system for student issues, human resources, accounting, online learning, assessment, library, etc.

BRIEF ANALYSIS OF ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES

ADVANTAGES OF THE HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTION:

1. College Rezonanca has ambition and opportunity to lead both education and science in the region
2. Very Good connection with the local and business community
3. Clear mission of the program and mission connected to general mission of the College
4. Good and motivated professors and management for study program
5. Prescribed clear duties and obligations for professors
6. Program offers a broad base of knowledge in the field of environmental health
7. Infrastructure is satisfactory: teaching rooms, library, web site (Albanian language)
8. Recognised quality assurance processes
9. Adopted teaching process to online forms – Moodle e-Learning
10. Appropriate Computer support from the IT officers
11. Good level of quality culture at College.

DISADVANTAGES OF THE HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTION

1. Internationalization aspects are not yet sufficiently developed
2. Slow and not so flexible management reaction to Statute revision
3. Respond to practical classes true pandemic times and future times
4. Focus on employment only in one sector – inspection
5. Systematic and computer data-based approach in quality missing
6. The transfer of knowledge and technology needs to be improved especially external visiting professors
7. Possible problems for student's enrolment since unemployment in Kosovo is high.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

EXAMPLES OF GOOD PRACTICE

1. Collection and analysis of quality data at College level
2. Integration into the local community
3. The proposed study program is created for the needs of society
4. Motivated staff ready to learn and teach.

Very important note is that this evaluation from the expert team were very difficult since SER does not provide proof for the listed statements. The additional documents received do not provide the necessary evidence. Accordingly, my expert evaluation report will be done according to the analyses of the submitted documents.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The mission of BSc Public and Environmental Health (P&EH) study program is in line with the mission and strategic goals of the College of Medical Sciences “Rezonanca”. Programme preparing the experts for environmental and public health in the field of sanitary science to learn the technical, technological, managerial and communicative skills necessary to intervene in dealing with the stressors impacting on our environment and health.

Programme provides students with the skills required to deal with public health and hygiene and provides them with the necessary know-how to preserve and promote the health of both the individual and the community. It also enables participants to identify and deal with the prevention of communicable and non-communicable diseases, provides useful insights about environmental factors affecting the community, and the legal aspects and managerial framework related to environmental and public health practice and food safety.

The program is in accordance with Directive 2005/36/EC of the European Committee and Directive 2013/55/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council for the medical professions. As such the program is comparable to programs of European Union countries.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The overall goals of study program respond to social needs of Kosovo and it has academic staff which are required to meet basic teaching skills. According to learning methods the essence of didactic and research concepts in the College is to develop competencies in students using a student-centred approach. The mission of the program is not clear, and it is not properly presented in SER.

Procedural and academic issues in the College are regulated by formal policies, guidelines and regulations, such as the College Statute, the Rules of Study, the Regulation of Academies of Units, etc.

All staff and students are compliant with the regulations and Code of Ethics of the College.

The learning outcomes for the study program are set in line to describe study program but it need some improvements. For example, learning outcome: *„Prospective graduates will have successful careers in environmental consultancy, health and safety management, food industry, public water utilities and waste management “*, since in this form is not actually at all learning outcomes.

Learning outcome: *„Have general skills in management, relevant legal aspects and also communication and financial aspect “* is great but it does not correspond to any of the subjects in the study programme.

The research concept is very good.

I was not able to confirm with yes or no standard 1.6. since in this phase we are in accreditation process of P&EH study program. But, based on the Quality Assurance Policies Framework, and different surveys it is obvious that is strong will for this.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No



Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.		X
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	n.a.	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. The study program should strive for a fundamental revision of the SWOT analysis since strengths and weakness are not in balance and also threats are sometimes actually weakness.*
- 2. All learning outcomes need to be revised and improve with generic skills.*
- 3. The learning outcomes for study programme need to be revised. Especially part which is addressed to careers and general skills in management.*
- 4. Study program mission need to be clear and visible*
- 5. It is desirable that the total number of learning outcomes at the level of the study program be between 15 and 20.*
- 6. Revise the number of ECTS for professional practice.*
- 7. Integration of modern teaching practices and research at the program level,*



especially integration of e-learning and online teaching and learning at all levels of the teaching concept and the entire curriculum in a differentiated way.

- 8. The didactic concept should take into account all relevant stages and elements of the teaching and learning process.*
- 9. Include a learning outcome at the level of the study program which will clearly show that the study program contributes to the development of engineering spirit.*
- 10. Include a learning outcome at the level of the study program which will clearly show that the study program contributes to the development of communications skills.*

2.2. Quality management

Quality system is ensured true Office of Quality Assurance. According to set procedures academic staff is assessed on the basis of performance requirements for the staff of teachers and researchers. The criteria and processes for assessing the performance of teachers are specified in the document “Academic Staff Performance and Assessment” according to these criteria: Teacher Activity, Researcher Activity, Engagement in international cooperation, Administrative and Governance Activity, Community Services. According to self-evaluation report the evaluation of academic staff is done less than once a year, by evaluating the main aspects of responsibilities with the Academic Staff Performance and Assessment Form, which includes staff self-evaluation, student assessment and supervisor evaluation.

Expert team want to point to the fact that is challenging for the college to carry out numerous evaluations, especially in the case of electronic evaluations, when evaluation fatigue sets. Maybe to think about transparent communication and publication of evaluated results.

Unfortunately, there are no reports on how the public or college members are informed about quality development in a public report beside web site.

From the available documents and the discussions true our meetings, it is clear to the expert that the data collected will also be used for continuous development.

Information on the activities of the College is available on the website in Albanian and English. In addition, communication with stakeholders is maintained in a variety of ways.



The College taking its research role seriously which is very good elaborated at web site. Especially good example are research projects with the students. The quality of research includes assessment of capacity to perform research at the individual and Faculty/School/Institute level, assessment of the research relevance to the discipline, College, locally and globally, assessment of external research and internal funding, assessment of research management, assessment of research findings and dissemination, assessment of research & research training strategies whether they reflect international best practices. The P&EH has a strategy plan 2019-2023 which has strong focus to improvement of quality of all levels.

This expert team is not able to confirm with yes or no standard 2.2. since in this phase we are in accreditation process of P&EH study program. But based on the regulation on the Quality Assessment and Assurance System, the Quality Assurance Office and set off internal evaluations it is obvious that is strong will for this.

For Standard 2.6. it seems the same. I was in position to analyse existing analytical data delivered by College.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	n.a.	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	



Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		X
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	n.a.	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	n.a.	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Build the quality culture true open discussion of the course evaluation results with the teachers and students*
- 2. Strategic Plan and Strategy should be public document*
- 3. On web site, especially English version it is necessary to open part for the Quality*
- 4. The Quality Politics should be visible document*
- 5. QAS needs to be embedded into practice and mechanisms designed to enable feedback and action within appropriate timescales*
- 6. The College should make efforts to develop and implement a quality management system which ensures proactive involvement of all stakeholders following a PDCA-cycle approach*
- 7. The quality culture must change to one of continuous improvement with appropriate feedback and timely/efficient loops e.g., annual cycles*



8. *Be very clear in publication what changes have been brought about by evaluation results*
9. *The College should make efforts to set functional and operational quality system with all stake holders*
10. *In different operational quality bodies, it is necessary to involve external stakeholders and Alumni*
11. *Introduce additional subjects with a focus on current and future knowledge and skills, both for current students and for external experts who need more advanced knowledge.*

2.3. Academic staff

The institution employed qualified academic staff in regular or part-time employment. The selection of academic staff has regulated procedures, based on the public competition, which is published by the College Senate.

The academic staff of the College is qualified with a Master's and Doctor's degree in science, and specialization for clinical courses, as well as with academic degree: Prof.Dr., Prof. Asoc., Prof.Ass., Assistant, Lecturer, clinical mentor, in accordance with the legal requirements of College Statute, Higher Education Law No. 04 / L-037 of Republic of Kosovo and Administrative Instruction No.15 / 2018 on Accreditation of Higher Education Institutions in the Republic of Kosovo.

Total number of academic staff is 38, with very high percentage of PhD academic staff – 44,7%, since number of students is 60. The student:staff ratio is 4.3:1. All members of the academic staff can't occupy, within one academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, part-time). Full time academic staff is 50% and they cover 50% of the curricula needs. All new teaching staff need to pass pedagogical trainings.

In SER is pointed out that College offers opportunities for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who has difficulty what is a great especially in terms of different teaching improvements. Implementation of short teaching



method courses which are offered by the Centre for Excellence in Teaching and Learning has to be visible on the web site. Even Centre for Excellence in Teaching and Learning is not visible on the web site.

It is also evident from the Panel discussion as well as formal staff profiles submitted prior to the review, that academic staff at College Rezonanca is able to deliver high level learning process. All academic staff/teachers are highly motivated and cooperative to implement this P&EH program. From received CV of teaching staff expert can conclude that all of them has expertise and knowledge for this program. Staff appointment and ranking is determined by educational, scientific, research and service criteria.

It is not clear how it will be set the plan for establishing a Teaching Innovation Fund, Teaching Fellowship program. It is written in general plan like good will but real plans missing.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	



Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.		X
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.		X

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Improving the pedagogical competencies of teachers should become part of regular institutional activities and its obligation for all not just for the new one*
- 2. Improve the visibility of all implemented methods especially in terms of teaching staff qualifications*
- 3. Secure the visibility of Centre for Excellence in Teaching and Learning*
- 4. Evaluation of results for professors should be visible on web site not by name. It can be joined results for study programs. Or it has to be visible what did you change according to the evaluation results*
- 5. The professional development of teaching staff needs clear and yearly based plan*
- 6. The College should encourage teachers to significantly increase outbound mobility*
- 7. It is important to ensure objective and transparent grade weight given by each evaluator for academic staff*
- 8. Workload of teachers should be monitored as well as the total number of courses per teacher to boost the teaching quality and to give time for scientific activity and professional and personal development*
- 9. Make teachers aware of alternative teaching strategies, including the periodic evaluation of the alignment of teaching methods and learning outcomes (ongoing process)*
- 10. Teachers should to a greater extent include the latest research, trends and knowledge*



on the labour market in the teaching process

- 11. Provide access to a range of electronic tools for teaching, professional and research activities*
- 12. Increase the number of training and educations for teaching staff to achieve better results in the teaching process*
- 13. Formalize Peer review process.*

2.4. Educational process content

The P&EH program offers to students' knowledge related to all fields of the environmental health. Study Program is in compliance with the National Qualifications Framework and the Qualifications Framework of the European Higher Education Area. An academic year corresponds to 60 points of ECTS credits and study program 180 ECTS. Learning outcomes for the study Program are set but they need revision. It is Becleor level, and all learning outcomes should be on that level. For example: „Manage and intervene in dealing with the stressors impacting on our environment and health “need serious revision since after 3 years of education it is not obvious that student will be capable to do it. Also learning outcome: “Have general skills in management.....” need also revision since no one of the subjects do not provide education for this.

Subject selection is done according to available experts and needs in surrounding so from that point of view it is acceptable. But still there are some parts which need to be improve, especially in methodical approach and applying the modern learning methods.

Learning outcomes for study program has to be in direct correlation with competencies. Basically, they are the same but just written on another way. This part is very important for employers since they would like to know on the end of the day what graduates can do (competences) and you have to teach them that (learning outcomes). It has to be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.

The curriculum contains some weaknesses regarding the structure. In some parts literature is not written at all (for example Biochemistry).

The syllabi provided reveal different quality levels of course descriptions. The majority of syllabi is characterized by using active verbs for defining learning outcomes at the course level.



Some course descriptions are developed in a very traditional way emphasizing mainly the provision of knowledge. Some learning outcomes are very optimistic and need to be revised and some of them are the same for all lessons (for example in course Medical Microbiology and Vector Biology mostly used learning outcome is: Describe). This is not acceptable, and it has to be completely changed. Perhaps the reason for this uneven description of learning outcomes is mainly a matter of wording and can be improved by making these parts more explicit in the course descriptions.

Syllabus for Public health and administration provide these learning outcomes: Effectively express themselves in written and oral form, demonstrate ability to think critically, locate and use information, demonstrate ability to integrate knowledge and ideas in a coherent and meaningful manner and work effectively with others but all of this is not in correlation with subject content. Also, in this example list of literature is not properly written. It is too many publications put just in numerical order. It has to be revised in all subjects on the way that you need to split obligatory and extra literature.

All learning outcomes have active verbs but they need to be developed to the second level using the verbs for generic skills.

From received document – Curriculum – it is obvious that you need to improve all documents since in this form is not uniform. It has to be written in the same way and style. Course content also needs revision since some courses are too optimistic, especially from the ECTS point of view – for example Introduction to Public health and environmental health.

In SER document General chemistry is missing.

Human Anatomy, Biochemistry and Physiology need to be split into separate courses.

Biochemistry should be in the second semester.

The first semester needs to be organized in the order to fill general subjects. Ethics and Public health can be in the third semester.

It is not clear ECTS methodology. Some subjects with 90 lecture hours have 8 ECTS and at the same time some of them with 30 hours of lectures have 7 ECTS.

If the language of the student is different from Albanian, a training course for Albanian language is organized prior to the start of the study.

The most important part in creating an efficient and quality defined program is to make a matrix table with all learning outcomes for courses and learning outcomes for the study program. After that you will be able to say that all of your courses contribute to the study program in an equal way. In this moment this expert team cannot conclude what is the contribution of all courses in the program.



Literature is a week part of this presented study program. It has to be revised for all courses.

Overall, not much information was provided about the why and how of the curriculum's structure, however, the definition of the learning outcomes at the program level corresponds to level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework in general.

The complete lack of e-learning and online teaching as key elements of a modern teaching strategy is missing. It is necessary to develop online teaching and e-learning and integrated in practical teaching.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X	
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.		X



Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	X	
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	n.a.	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.		X
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified, and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		X
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:



1. *Revise and standardize all learning outcomes*
2. *Compare the study program with similar in the region*
3. *It is recommended to have 4-7 outcomes per course and a maximum of 10-12 for the study program*
4. *Make a constructive alignment and incorporate the acquisition of generic skills into the outcomes*
5. *Multiple electives that will generate general competencies such as management*
6. *Link the learning outcomes of the study program with the competencies*
7. *In order to better support international exchange, it is necessary to introduce lectures and courses in English in all studies. These lectures and courses should be defined as compulsory for all students, including homework*
8. *Ensure the practical classes and exercise.*
9. *Completely ECTS revision is obligatory.*

2.5. Students

The expert team concluded according to self-evaluation report and site visit that:

The College has defined a clear and formal admission procedure at institutional level applied for all students.

However, I would suggest improvement of College webpage regarding the recruitment and general information about the program itself. I would also like to see more foreign students enrolled and improved student mobility as College has opportunity to become a leader in teaching of the environmental health in this region.

Number of enrolled students in the first year is 60 and study groups in the programs are designed to be small (10-15 students) and seem to support effective and interactive exchange among study groups. Because of the study groups, I found in principle a good level of communication and support from Academic staff concerning students.

Student will participate in survey, but they need to receive feedback. College should envisage other forms of feedback in form of student guidance and career advice. Administrative staff is involved in supporting the students by keeping their records of progression.



Student rights and obligations are publicly available. However due to malfunction of the College webpage I had difficulties confirming this aspect. Nevertheless, I recommend an upgrade of accessibility that student can reach online.

I did not find effective procedure to ensure that the work submitted by students is original. In order for their works to be of the highest quality, the College has Manual for information on the methodology for the preparation of seminars, academic essays, diploma theses, the originality of the works submitted by the student is evaluated by the subject teacher during the process of checking the work but is not enough.

Publishing the thesis online and guidance by thesis supervisors is not good enough to prevent plagiarism among all students. To prevent this, procedure needs to be clear and effective and should consists of use of the plagiarism software.

College adheres in its work to the principles of morals and professional ethics as defined in the Ethical Code of the College. When the students join the academic community, they are obliged to hold themselves to the highest standards of moral integrity, ethics as well as scientific and professional honesty.

I did not observe high participation of students in the mobility programmes and even less number to none of incoming foreign students.

I found good practice of collaboration and agreements with the industry and fully support its further development to ease the employment of the student. Feedback I received ensured us that there is increasing need for production of highly skilled science graduates and that College is doing well on that aspect.

Good practice are tutorial meetings.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	



Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	n.a.	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		X
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant



ET recommendations:

- 1. Provide mechanisms to ensure that work submitted by students is original (use of plagiarism software)*
- 2. Increase the number of the foreign students and ensure gender balance through the recruitment*
- 3. Improve the design of your webpage to promote the recruitment of students*
- 4. Improve the number of incoming foreign students through mobility programs*
- 5. Implement additional support for student for their professional counselling*
- 6. Continue good practice of industrial collaboration providing internships for the students*
- 7. Continue further developing the ALUMNI organization.*

2.6. Research

During the analysing the data from SER and Panel discussion this expert team conclude that there is a lack of research dedicated funds and lack of modern equipment necessary to conduct research. We also note a limited access of both students and academic staff to international databases of scientific journals.

The expectations of the involvement of College Academic staff in research and academic activities for Program are clearly specified and are considered in the performance evaluation and promotion criteria. As indicators and performance parameters related to the involvement of academic staff in research, the College has determined that every regular member of the academic staff should publish at least one scientific paper per year for the last three years

Regarding the academic staff involved in the program, they are involved in research activities that are taking part at the College and in cooperation with Research Institute. Expectations for conducting research are clearly defined and is one of the main criteria in assessing their performance taken in account the promotion of the academic staff.



Publication activities are various but passive attendance is too large – 174 meetings and also Abstract publishing is too big according to the total amount of scientific research. Only one written chapter book is also very pour.

At Ethic Code Rezonanca 2017, Article 27, there is prescribe Classification of publications.

The number of professional trainings is high – 92, but it is not clear to this exert team is this relevant for this study programme.

In this Bachelor program students are rarely participating in the research activities outside the practical courses offered within the program because there is not any specific scientific research objective set. We highly encourage higher participation of students in Research even it is a bachelor level, especially while conducting their Bachelor Thesis.

In general, I found that academic staff has a history of scientific research and that in context of country, College has contributors of research activity.

The problem in the presentation is that is no uniform and standardised CV format and also paper publication list. In Appendix document there is a list of research activities by academic staff. From that list I can conclude that mostly presented papers are congress papers and certificates for trainings. Last updated for is 2018. Important Journal paper list missing.

More support from the government and the College is needed to fully implement research objectives. There is a need for improvement of the Research Facilities as well.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No



Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	n.a.	
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	



Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.		X
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities		X

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Provide access to scientific journals to both academic staff and students*
- 2. Continue further increase of number and quality of scientific publications*
- 3. Engage all students in the research activities*
- 4. Explore the use of research funding from international organisation to improve research capacities, especially equipment*
- 5. Try to increase agreements with public sector for the research*
- 6. Organise good and quality base of the professor's research*
- 7. Forster more international collaboration in scientific research*
- 8. Use standardized plagiarism tools to prevent plagiarism for both academic staff and students*
- 9. Communicated your research more in form of scientific papers in Journals*
- 10. Clear introduction of research activities on web site in corelation with study programme goals.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

The College has adequate facilities to conduct its teaching and research activities. The surface area of academic part is 1625 m² consisting of teaching rooms and laboratories, plus hospital



1500 m². All objects, properties and inventors are owned by the College. The number of seats in lecture halls, seminar rooms and laboratories is consistent with the size of the study groups. Teaching halls are equipped with appropriate IT tools, according to specific course requirements. Applicative activities for specialized disciplines included in the curriculum are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment, other clinical equipment, upon request of courses. Clinical Skills Laboratories are completed for work with 12 students.

College Library has a total of 150 reading places, and according to SER and movie the library has sufficient number of books and its cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for. It is necessary to build functional and equipped library with scientific literature for environmental health programme.

There is a new master plan for building the campus. Sustainability of the study program is ensured by developed financial plan for the upcoming years. We noted lack of technical staff to maintain the existing equipment and further investment in laboratory spaces is needed.

To ensure high quality of teaching and research further investment in infrastructure, particularly laboratories and equipment is highly recommended. Within the new facilities it is recommended that they are fully adapted to students with special needs as existing ones are not.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	



<p>Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:</p> <p>a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;</p> <p>b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;</p> <p>c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence;</p> <p>d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.</p>	X	
<p>Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.</p>	X	
<p>Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:</p> <p>a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;</p> <p>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective</p>	X	



discipline is provided for;		
e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs		X

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Try to upgrade Library fund with collaboration in Region*
2. *Continue collaborating with research Institutes to overcome lack of research infrastructure*
3. *Improve the library fund so that literature needed for the program is accessible and sufficient to all students enrolled*
4. *Continue improving digitalisation and distance learning facilities*
5. *Ensure that students with special needs will have adequate infrastructure when new Facilities are built*
6. *Ensure that new facilities will benefit both students and research.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The Expert team would like to commend the programme development team for their proactive engagement with the Panel during the validation event. There was a very strong sense of teamwork and ownership exhibited by the programme development team. Having considered



the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme development team, the Re-accreditation Panel recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance Level
Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
Quality management	Substantially compliant
Academic Staff	Substantially compliant
Educational Process Content	Partially compliant
Students	Substantially compliant
Research	Substantially compliant
Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
Overall Compliance	Substantially compliant

The overall compliance is assessed by the experts at the level of **Substantially compliant**.

However, the following recommendations need to be considered in relation to programmes re-accreditation in future period:

- The study program is good potential for students, professors and Kosovo so it has to be modern and based on good practices.
- You need revision of the SWOT analysis since strengths and weakness are not in balance and also threats are sometimes actually weakness.
- The program mission needs better definition of the intended learning outcomes at the descriptive levels of the European Framework of Qualification.
- Integrate of modern teaching practices and research at the program level, especially integration of e-learning and online teaching and learning at all levels of the teaching



concept and the entire curriculum in a differentiated way.

- Put a live open discussion of the course evaluation results with the students and teachers.
- The College should make efforts to develop and implement a quality management system which ensures proactive involvement of all stakeholders following a PDCA-cycle approach.
- Revise and standardize all learning outcomes, make a constructive alignment and incorporate the acquisition of generic skills into the outcomes.
- In order to better support international exchange, it is necessary to introduce lectures and courses in English in all studies. These lectures and courses should be defined as compulsory for all students, including homework.
- Provide mechanisms to ensure that work submitted by students is original.
- Continue further developing the ALUMNI organization.
- Use plagiarism tools to prevent plagiarism for both academic staff and students.
- The College should aim to create an environment which welcomes all students, enabling them to participate fully in university life. This applies to students with physical disabilities.

And on the end:

SER document is poor quality document and for next reaccreditation cycles need to be improved.

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program *Public and Environmental Health* offered by *College of Medical Sciences “Rezonanca”* is **Substantially compliant** with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends to



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

accredit the study program for a duration of **3 years** with a number of **60 students** to be enrolled in the program.

4. APPENDICES *(if available)*

None

Expert Team

Chair

(Signature)

(Prof. PhD. Sanja Kalambura)

(02.06.2021.)

Member – Student expert

None

(Signature)