



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

***COLLEGE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES “REZONANCA”
MSc HEALTH MANAGEMENT***

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

June 7, 2021 Salzburg



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	5
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	8
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	8
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	9
2.2. Quality management	11
2.3. Academic staff	13
2.4. Educational process content.....	15
2.5. Students.....	18
2.6. Research.....	20
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	23
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	25
4. APPENDICES (<i>if available</i>)	27



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: May 11, 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Univ.-Prof. Dr. med. Wolfgang Patsch*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Naim Gashi, Executive Director KAA*
- *Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation*
- *Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Ilijane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-Evaluation Report (SER), MSc Health Management, College of Medical Sciences Rezonaca, 01.02.2021, Pristina*
- *KAA Accreditation Manual, July 2018*
- *Staff CVs*
- *Appendices to the Self-Evaluation Report*

Received additional documents

- *Curriculum Master of Science Health Management 2021/2022 and syllabuses, not dated, received May 18, 2021*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standard and performance indicators for external quality assurance, Re-accreditation of bachelor and masters study program, KAA Accreditation Manual*
- *ESG, Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education area, (partially) 2015*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.2. Site visit schedule



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA)

Site Visit Program

Programme Accreditation Procedure at Rezonanca College

Date: 11 May 2021

Expert Team

- Prof. Dr. Wolfgang Patsch

Coordinators of KAA

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring



- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Site Visit Program

11 May

09.00 – 09.45	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated (<i>no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion</i>) – Joint session
09.50 – 10:30	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff - Joint session
10:30 – 11:10	Lunch break
11:10 – 12:10	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
12:15 – 12:50	Meeting with teaching staff
12:55 – 13:40	Meeting with employers of graduates
13.40 – 13:50	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
13.50 – 14.00	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

No	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs			
1	Health Management/ MSc (Accreditation)	Prof. Dr. Wolfgang Patsch	Mimoza Maksutaj	Fitim Skeraj	Milazim Gjocaj	Valdet Hashani



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Other information

Overall instructions for HEIs

1. Each meeting should be attended by maximum 6 persons;
2. The students selected for the meeting should reflect a diversity in terms of fields of study, programme, study cycle, year of study, students with special needs if any, etc;
3. The teaching staff selected for the meeting should reflect a diversity in terms of faculties and programmes, full-time and part time, local and international, etc;
4. The students, graduates and employers of graduates should not be employed at the institution;
5. Anyone whose attendance won't be agreed in advance with KAA and the Expert Team will be asked to leave the interview session;
6. Nametags are to be provided for all people attending the meetings.

Contacts of the participants from KAA:

Shkelzen Gerxhaliu – 044 836 831

Arianit Krasniqi – 045 499 951



1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The College of Medical Sciences “Rezonanca” was established on May 12, 2003 by Dr. Sc. Ramadan Idrizaj in accordance with the Law on Higher Education in Kosovo Nr. 2003/14. In December 2008, Rezonanca joined with the ILIRIA College to install academic units. Rezonanca was accredited for three years in July 2015. The accreditation of the institution and study programs was extended in 2018 for an additional year up to September 2019. Based on the SER, the current accreditation status was not clear for the experts, but at the virtual site visit, college representatives indicated that the accreditation was extended until 2023.

The general mission of Rezonanca focusses on:

- The development and application of new concepts of medical education in the 21st century in Kosovo
- Offering, promoting and developing qualitative curriculums consistent with international standards
- Increasing the general capacities for academic and scientific research work for the higher education
- Creating institutional infrastructures and increasing intellectual capacities for academic and scientific research work
- Enriching the health system in the community with quality medical services, especially the Kosovo’s deficit-based medical services for the current period.

Rezonanca offers BSc. studies in Laboratory Biochemistry, Community Pharmacy, Medicine, Nursing, Sanitary Medicine, Diagnostic Radiology, an Integrated Dentistry Program (Dr. stom.) and master programs in Pharmacy and Nursing.

According to the SER, 1441 students are enrolled in the programs listed above. This number surprisingly includes 180 students involved in BSc and MSc programs of Health Management (HM).



2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

According to the SER, the proposed new MSc program in Health Management will enable graduates to advance knowledge and creative and scientific ideas in the field of health management in line with European standards. Furthermore, it aims to be fully integrated into the European Higher Education Area.

The learning outcomes for the MSc HM Program have been defined as follows:

1. To develop work-ready managers who can provide effective leadership in health service issues, teams and systems
2. To ensure that students have a strong grounding in the principles underpinning health systems and services
3. Strategic planning
4. Change management
5. Financial management and health economics
6. Evidence informed decision and policy making
7. Clinical governance and risk management
8. Innovation and improvement strategies

The mission of the program is in compliance with the overall mission statement of Rezonanca. The allocation of ECTS and the distribution between theoretical teaching and practical exercises is adequate. However, many sections of the SER, in particular the sections related to the new HM MSc program, have ample room for improvement. Specifically, the overall preparation of the application lacks important information. Frequently, rather general terms are used to claim fulfilment of the standards. A more appropriate approach would be to describe more detailed and testable statements that allow an assessment of adherence to standards. Furthermore, several sections of the current SER strongly suggest that it has been prepared for an application in previous years without necessary updates.

According to the SER, the developmental activities of programs are regular and systematic processes that include various stakeholders. Proposals of new study programs are based on



various analyses that include considerations of the demand in society and the ability and resources needed to deliver a high quality program. However, such an assessment is not presented in the SER and the jobs, professions and/or vocations targeted by the program are not listed.

The statement that the College produces competitive doctors for national and international labour markets is misleading, as doctors studies are only conducted at the Universities of Kosovo. Furthermore, they are irrelevant, as the completion of the program submitted for application conveys a MSc. level only.

The institution specified general key performance indicators for study programs, but relevant information such as grade distributions and progressions are missing. Systems are in place for central recording of course completion, program evaluation, and other parameters. However, a central database that includes statistical analyses and is accessible for defined college members is not yet available, but is planned. Policies and improvement procedures are delineated for students who are performing below standards. Concepts relating to equal opportunities of students with disabilities or other disadvantages are recognized and addressed.

An overarching research concept of the MH program is not present.

Standard	compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	x	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	x	
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		x
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	x	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	x	



Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	x	
---	---	--

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Rewrite SER, describe the actions used to fulfil the respective standard, provide information that refers to the present situation, explain which actions have or will be taken in response to SWOT analyses. Update CVs, give references in the internationally required format, reorganize the appendices and refer in the SER to the respective appendix, make sure that tables contain the information required to interpret the numbers, translate documents essential for the accreditation into English language*
- 2. Try to identify an overarching research target that could be used by the majority of program members*

2.2. Quality management

In the strategic plan of the College for 2019-2023, the link between enhancement of quality assurance and strategic planning is emphasized. The SER lists numerous quality control procedures relevant for the delivery of study programs as well as student and teacher evaluations. Students evaluate individual staff members, teaching subjects, courses and the overall study program. Teachers perform self-evaluation. Performance requirements of academic staff are documented and include teaching and research activities, engagement in international cooperation, administrative and governance activity as well as community service. Formal assessment of teaching and other staff are kept confidential, but documented and retained. Nevertheless, anonymized statistical analyses of employment groups should be made available for all college members and stakeholders. The SER also states that evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated in the planning process as required by Standard. This statement is rather general and the arguments which demonstrate how the standard is fulfilled are insufficiently described.



Peer review of teaching is not practiced and external surveillance is minimal. The latter process could be very useful to determine the level of learning outcomes at Rezonanca with other institutions in the European Higher Education area. Survey data are collected from students and graduates, but it is not clear whether employers are included in this process and whether surveys are made publically available.

During the virtual meeting with representatives of the quality assurance program, the impression was obtained that the program is likely underpowered. The response to questions about the quality control processes required for the potential start of 5 new programs (i.e. the programs under review for accreditation) were not satisfactory. It was also difficult for the representatives to cope with some other questions (for instance drop-out rates) relevant for quality control. Furthermore, the SER which should also have been examined by the QC committee shows substantial problems (see the following sections) that should have been discovered during the quality control process. This is not to say that the respective persons are not qualified; rather, it appeared that too many programs, questionnaires etc. cannot longer be handled without a central database that permits all necessary tasks and statistical calculations. Currently, Rezonanca delivers seven BSc and two MSc accredited programs. With the new 5 programs, personnel and resources of the quality assurance program should be considerably augmented.

Standard	compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participates in self-evaluations and cooperates with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	x	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes		x
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.		x
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		x
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		x
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		x



Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	x	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	x	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	x	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Strongly consider increases in personnel and resources (central database) to address the addition of new programs*
2. *Describe and/or provide flow charts to show the integration of evaluation processes into planning processes*
3. *Consider improving the quality insurance manual and describe how a substantial increase in study programs will be approached*
4. *Consider the public availability of anonymized data of surveys and key evaluations*

2.3. Academic staff

The requirements for teachers are mostly fulfilled at the institutional level. However, peer review is not practised and evaluations are not made publically available. Furthermore, quality enhancement of teaching strategies and supporting material is insufficiently dealt with. Teaching platforms available in the internet and harbouring relevant course content would strengthen strategies in a blended context.

Program specific aspects of teachers show deficiencies. The tables shown on pages 12 and 13 of the SER are difficult to interpret. Headings of columns are most likely displaced. Moreover, no units are given for the numbers in the tables, making their interpretation difficult. Surprisingly, the lead teacher of the program, Mimoza Maksutaj, seems to obtain her contract in 2023. Also, if these numbers refer to teaching in the HM program, it is difficult to understand that the respective workloads of the lead teacher and some other



teachers, who are not listed in the course program shown in section 4 of the SER, show only minor differences.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.		x
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	x	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	x	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	x	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	x	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	x	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	x	
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available		x
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		x
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers	x	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant



ET recommendations:

- 1. Select staff members who can successfully identify new online teaching resources*
- 2. Install peer review of teachers*

2.4. Educational process content

In the content of the education process, a very sparse course program is depicted and the options for professional employment after finishing the Rezonanca program are not provided. In MSc Health Management programs of other well-established institutions within the EU, a wide range of professional opportunities is presented. These include work in international organizations such as the WHO, public and private hospitals, nursing homes, rehabilitation facilities, companies in pharmaceutical and related health industries, social service and health insurance agencies and related companies to name a few. Accordingly, such institutions provide teaching that embraces numerous disciplines including qualitative and quantitative statistics, research design, programme managements, digitalization in health care etc. The number of courses is not only small, but their content was initially unclear, as syllabi were not included in the application. Moreover, there were several untitled elective program courses. Furthermore, an English language course should be included, at least, as an elective. Students should have or acquire the ability of advanced English reading, as important learning material is likely to be in English. It would also be beneficial as graduates can easier apply and qualify for work in international institutions. One week after the virtual site visit, additional documents on the curriculum of the MSc Health Management program were submitted. These documents somewhat clarified the content of the proposed program studies. For all the courses, the learning is mentioned to be self-directed without additional details. Learning material is included, but without any detailed citations. This does not allow an identification of the suggested learning material. It may seem trivial, but it is not, as correct citations not only allow the correct selection of the material, but also serve as a good example of proper methods and help students and teachers to become part of the research community.

Another point of criticism relates to the information about teachers. The large majority of teachers are physicians. There are only 3 persons, who are not medical doctors, but the disciplines in which these 3 PhDs are competent are not listed. Given the strong economic and social contributions of the program, one would also expect that teachers with a strong



background in finances, jurisprudence and general management would be included in the teaching staff.

The nine courses shown in the SER will be taught by 6 of the 17 full-time teachers. The role of the 11 remaining teachers in the study program is unclear. Also, the content and/or locations of practise sessions or internships are not or insufficiently detailed.

The SER delivers insufficient information, as to how the combination of program components represents a logical flow and how the components will achieve the qualification objectives. Student assessment is only described in general terms and potential program-specific aspects are not mentioned, as syllabuses are missing.

The number of admissions is stated to be 60 students. This seems to be high for a new MSc course that requires more attention and is more challenging than a BSc course. A dissertation seminar would be useful in the preparation of dissertations by the students. Participation of international or external experts and external quality control mechanisms are unlikely to be substantial.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.		x
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		x
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		x
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic	x Sent	



thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	late	
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	Not applicable	
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	x	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	x	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	x	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.		x
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	x	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		x
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	x	



Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Strongly consider an adaption of the program and course content to international standards; present the employment opportunities for graduates of the program*
2. *Whenever possible, use knowledge, skills and competences to classify learning outcomes and distinguish disciplinary, methodical analytical and generic skills and competences.*
3. *Continue to improve and update the lecture content according to new developments and continue to improve e-learning.*
4. *Describe the logical flow of courses and how the individual components of the program may achieve the qualification objectives*
5. *Describe the learning methods in greater detail in syllabuses and their interactions with the respective teaching, give full and correct citations of the minimal bibliography*
6. *Describe the details of practise stages; develop a plan of internships showing institutions, teaching contents, number of students admitted to a particular institution, and the respective responsible teacher*
7. *Design a table showing names and academic grades of the teacher, their teaching experience in disciplines relevant for the program and their track record in research relevant for the program*
8. *Strongly consider reducing the number of students to 40*

2.5. Students

The code of ethics is mandatory for all teachers and students. The admission of students is regulated by a formal admission procedure at the College level. Rights of admission include all candidates who successfully completed bachelor studies in health programs in Kosovo or abroad. For external candidates, proper educational documentation is required. Without questioning the fairness in selecting the students (when the application number exceeds the number to be admitted), the selection procedure should be briefly described to ensure that students are selected in a fair, unbiased manner. Group sizes have been defined for the

18



different learning activities and seem to be adequate. However, the interactions of teaching and learning activities is insufficiently detailed in the syllabuses.

Use of the Moodle platform facilitates the prompt interaction with students at various activities (assessment results, feedback for improvements etc.). Determination of the final grade is described. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines, formal requirements and examinations.

The transfer of students between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is explained, but it is not clear, whether students are informed about the process of transfer in the introduction sessions. The procedures ensuring that work submitted by students is original should be improved.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	x	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	x	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.		x
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	x	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	x	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	x	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	x	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		x



Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	x	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	x	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	x	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Describe the interaction of teaching and learning methods in syllabuses*
2. *Establish clearly defined procedures to prevent plagiarism*

2.6. Research

As outlined before, there is no overarching research project in the program and areas of research interest are not sufficiently presented. The weakness of research activities is recognized in the SWAT analysis presented in the SER. The current SER is not very helpful to evaluate research strategies and research activities, as it only gives the total publication activities of the program staff over an unspecified time interval. Analyses of CVs show that the current research activities are clearly below the requirements set forth by KAA. Very few teachers have 1 publication/year between 2017 and 2019 and even less between 2018 and 2020. The latter result may be partially explained by the pandemic, but there was no pandemic between 2017 and 2019. The research output of several teachers was difficult to evaluate. Citations were in many cases incomplete, as not all authors of the respective scientific contribution were named. As pointed out before, correct citations of teachers are important, as teachers serve as role models for students. An internationally accepted citation format strengthens the visibility of an institution. Also, the financial support from the college is not impressive. The strategic plan for 2019 – 2023 indicates that 300.000 Euro will be

20



spent for research and innovations, but a representative of the college indicated that the money dedicated to research will be spent in 2023/2024. Nevertheless, the teaching staff is involved in research activities, and research performance is considered in the evaluation of staff and represents a criterion for promotion. Clear policies for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards were not found in the SER or any document provided. Whether the academic staff has a track record of research in the same topics as its teaching activity, was difficult to ascertain, as the teaching activities of the majority of the teachers was insufficiently described.

Some manuscripts are published in scientific journals, but there is a large variability in the impact of the journals used. Students also are engaged in research. Policies for ownership of intellectual property are not fully established. The strategic plan from 2019 states that the faculty has to mention the affiliation with Rexonanca in all publications. This cannot be assessed as CVs show no publications after 2019 (which may be partially related to the pandemic). Access to scientific publications for teachers and students is available via several publication platforms and agreements with the University of Prishtina.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		x
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	x	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.		x
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.		x
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	x	



Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	x	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		x
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	Not applicable.	
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.		x
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students		x
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	x	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Establish research projects that integrate the scientific activities present in the study program to develop an overarching scientific strategy.*
2. *Correct citations (for journals: all authors, title of the manuscript, journal name, publication year, volume and pages; for books: all authors of the respective book chapter, title of the chapter, editors of the book, year of publication, pages in the book, publishing company) should be used by all staff members*
3. *Develop international collaborations in science and strengthen the local scientific connections (clinical and epidemiological research and others)*
4. *Create a Faculty Research home page identifying research directions and highlight important research articles authored by staff members as well as national or international research articles with relevance for the program*
5. *Apply for projects to get funding for databases that facilitate research*



6. *Strongly consider financial support for stays of college staff in established foreign institutions to learn needed specific procedures and techniques that can be transferred to your institution*
7. *Develop policies for intellectual property rights and procedures for commercialization of ideas and discoveries by staff and students.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Rezonanca college provides premises, human resources and equipment and fulfills the necessary standards to ensure long-term implementation of the MSc in HM program. Long-term projections are made in the strategic plan to ensure the sustainability of the institution. However, a specific budget plan for the MSc in HM program is not presented. Several e-labs with IT equipment dedicated to e-learning and distant learning have been created. The libraries within Rezonanca contain many books, but the number of books from the last 10 years is not given. Books and learning material are mainly in the Albanian language. The SER states an inadequate level of books in the field of medicine, due to the lack of publications in Albanian. Taken together, more books in the English language should be obtained, as this language has been commonly accepted in science and research. Furthermore, competency in English reading and writing will enhance the level of study programs. This is also required for publishing in journals with high reputation.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	x	
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.		x
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the	x	



following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence ; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula		
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	x	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		x
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs	x	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Include a financial plan at the level of the study program in the SER*
2. *Improve the book and journal entries in the book list of the libraries. This list should contain full citations or, at a minimum level, the name of the book, the book authors or editors, the year of its publication, the publishing company or the ISBN number*



3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

(Insert overall observations referring to the evaluation process, the quality at study program level, approach to the site visit, etc.)

The Panel would like to thank the programme development team for their hospitality and engagement with the Panel during the virtual site visit. It is evident that the staff has an interest to realize the program. The Accreditation Panel came to the following conclusions:

1. Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
2. Quality management	Partially compliant
3. Academic Staff	Substantially compliant
4. Educational Process Content	Partially compliant
5. Students	Substantially compliant
6. Research	Partially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
Overall Compliance	Substantially compliant

Generally, the assessment related to the institution showed a higher level of compliance than the assessment related to the specific program, which showed major deficiencies and needs further development. The overall compliance is assessed by the experts at the level of **substantially compliant**. The following recommendations need to be considered in relation to the programs accreditation:

- 1. Rewrite SER, describe the actions used to fulfil the respective standard, provide information that refers to the present situation, explain which actions have or will be taken in response to SWOT analyses. Update CVs, give references in the internationally required format, reorganize the appendices and refer in the SER to the respective appendix, make sure that tables contain the information required to interpret the numbers, translate documents essential for the accreditation into the English language*
- 2. Try to identify an overarching research target that could be used by the majority of program members*



3. *Strongly consider increases in personnel and resources (central database) in the quality assurance program to address the addition of new programs*
4. *Describe and/or provide flow charts to show the integration of evaluation processes into planning processes*
5. *Consider improving the quality insurance manual and describe how a substantial increase in study programs will be approached*
6. *Consider public availability of anonymized data of surveys and key evaluations*
7. *Select staff members who can take a lead to identify new online teaching resources*
8. *Install peer review of teachers*
9. *Strongly consider an adaption of the program and course content to international standards; present the employment opportunities for graduates of the program*
10. *Whenever possible, use knowledge, skills and competences to classify learning outcomes and distinguish disciplinary, methodical analytical and generic skills and competences*
11. *Continue to improve and update the lecture content according to new developments and continue to improve e-learning*
12. *Describe the logical flow of courses and how the individual components of the program may achieve the qualification objectives*
13. *Describe the learning methods in greater detail in syllabuses and their interactions with the respective teaching, give full and correct citations of the minimal bibliography*
14. *Describe the details of practise stages; develop a plan of internships showing institutions, teaching contents, number of students and responsible teacher*
15. *Design a table showing names and academic grades of the teacher, their teaching experience in disciplines relevant for the program and their track record in research relevant for the program*
16. *Strongly consider reducing the number of students to 40*
17. *Describe the interaction of teaching and learning methods in syllabuses*
18. *Establish clearly defined and effective procedures to prevent plagiarism*
19. *Establish research projects that integrate the scientific activities present in the study program to develop an overarching scientific strategy*
20. *Correct citations (for journals: all authors, title of the manuscript, journal name, publication year, volume and pages; for books: all authors of the respective book chapter, title of the chapter, editors of the book, year of publication, pages in the book, publishing company) should be used by all staff members*



21. *Develop international collaborations in science and strengthen the local scientific connections (clinical and epidemiological research and others)*
22. *Create a Faculty Research home page identifying research directions and highlight important research articles authored by staff members as well as national or international research articles with relevance for the program*
23. *Apply for projects to get funding for databases that facilitate research*
24. *Strongly consider financial support for stays of college staff in established foreign institutions to learn needed specific procedures and techniques that can be transferred to your institution*
25. *Develop policies for intellectual property rights and procedures for commercialization of ideas and discoveries by staff and students*
26. *Include a financial plan at the level of the study program in the SER*
27. *Improve the book and journal entries in the book list of the libraries. This list should contain full citations or, at a minimum level, the name of the book, the book authors or editors,, the year of its publication and the publishing company or the ISBN number*

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program MSc Health Management offered by REZONANCA is *substantially compliant* with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual. The Expert Team recommends *to accredit* the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 40 students to be enrolled in the program.

4. APPENDICES (if available)

On Friday, May 28, 2021 several documents were received from Rezonanca in response to the draft of the expert evaluation report. Some documents in Albanian language pertaining to some formal standards were sent and could not be translated by the expert. Nevertheless, it was clear that these documents had little relevance for the major points of criticism. The main points of criticism were related to i) the poor and outdated preparation of the SER and other documents included in the original evaluation; ii) the response of the quality assurance program to the increase in new programs; iii) the program content and its elaboration; iv) the presentation of the teachers in the program context; v) the research plan in the new program and the overall recent research activities of the staff.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Expert Team

Chair

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

Member

Univ.-Prof. Dr. med. Dr.h.c. Wolfgang Patsch June 7, 2021

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

Member

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

Member

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

Member



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

	Republika e Kosovës Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo	
Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency		
Expert Team		
Chair		
<hr/>		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
	Univ.-Prof. Dr. med. Dr.h.c. Wolfgang Patsch	June 7, 2021
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
<hr/>		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
<hr/>		
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
Member		
<hr/>		

29

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

29

29

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org