



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

***THE COLLEGE OF APPLIED TECHNICAL SCIENCES
TEMPULLI***

INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION

FINAL REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

Brno, June 16, 2020



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation	5
2. INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION	6
2.1. Public mission and institutional objectives.....	6
2.2. Strategic planning, governance and administration	7
2.3. Financial planning and management.....	9
2.4. Academic integrity, responsibility and public accountability.....	10
2.5. Quality management	11
2.6. Learning and teaching.....	14
2.7. Research.....	16
2.8. Staff, employment processes and professional development.....	17
2.9. Student administration and support services.....	19
2.10. Learning resources and facilities.....	21
2.11. Institutional cooperation	24
1. OVERALL EVALUATION AND JUDGEMENTS OF THE ET.....	26



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: May 29, 2020

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Prof. Milan Pol, Masaryk University, Czech Republic*
- *Prof. Janez Vigrenc, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia*
- *Ms. Keti Tsojniashvili, PhD student*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

3



- *Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA*
- *Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Office for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation*
- *Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation*
- *Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-evaluation report (SER) and all the other documents submitted by the College of Applied Technical Sciences Tempulli (further College)*
- *Interviews during the site visit*

Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations

- *KAA Accreditation Manual*

1.2. Site visit schedule

29th May 2020

09.00 – 10.20	Meeting with the management of the institution (<i>no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion</i>)
10.30 – 11.10	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative services
11.10 – 12.00	Lunch break (<i>to be provided at the site visit place</i>)

4



12.10 – 13.00	Meeting with the heads of study programs
13.00 – 14.00	Meeting with teaching staff
14.00 – 14.40	Meeting with students
14.40 – 14.55	Short break
14.55 – 15.40	Meeting with graduates
15.40 – 16.20	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
16.20 – 16.30	Internal meeting – Expert Team and KAA
16.30 – 16.40	Closing meeting with the management of the institution

1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

The College is built on the basis of the institution that started to provide education and training for candidates of driving licenses in 1992. Since 2001/2002 it offered bachelor education, and since 2007/2008 master education in specific fields of technical sciences focussing on traffic, transport and telecommunications.

After not succeeding in evaluation of 2019, the College started to re-work a number of its documents, starting from the College mission.

At the moment, it offers Traffic Engineering and Road Transport (bachelor level program) with a total of 587 students, out of them 84 have an active status (according to



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

the SER). Besides to it, a strong part of the institution is the Centre for Professional Development that offers a large number of professional training and certification programs in the above-mentioned field.

2. INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION

2.1. Public mission and institutional objectives

The College has defined new mission statement recently, and this statement is formulated in a balanced way – it relates to all three main pillars of the College as the higher education institution: teaching, research, and community service (public reach). Namely, the formulation of the College mission is as follows: “Tempulli builds on its positive tradition, organizing teaching (in academic and professional programs), expertise, applied research, training and community services for students and community at large in the field of traffic, transportation, insurance, environment, geology and energy in view of the development of economy, employment and the development of the society” (SER, p. 12). Such a formulation of a mission statement can be viewed as acceptable.

Some areas of concern that are explicitly mentioned in the mission statement are not emphasised, however, in Strategic Development Plan of the College, neither they are strongly represented in education programs and/or research activities of the staff. A question raises then why this focus remains a part of the mission. Namely, it relates to environment, geology and energy.

The College claims in its SER and other documents that the process of reviewing and redefining the mission statement was done with the involvement of a number of people across the College and beyond. The ad hoc group and permanent group of insiders as well as involvement of HE experts from the outside are mentioned in the College documents, and some other processes relevant to the mission revision were described, too. This can be seen as indication that the



mission statement revision was a process managed by the College with the involvement of representatives of main groups within and beyond the College in some extent.

During the interviews some respondents were more, some others were less aware of the mission of the College. The mission which is also a part of the College's newly defined Statute, as well as vision of the College, are visibly displayed on the webpage of the College.

One can see the current mission to be in its major part a guide for further strategic planning, decision-making and operations of the College, incl. medium- and long-term objectives that mainly seem to be in line with the mission and support it. But this cannot be said about all parts of the mission statement (see above). In principle, the mission is formulated in such a way that it enables evaluation of progress.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Make sure the focus of the mission responds to the College activities in all parts of the mission statement.*

2.2. Strategic planning, governance and administration

The College has the Strategic Development Plan for the period 2020-2024. This plan was developed quite recently.

The text of this Strategic Development Plan also contains a description of the process of its development, emphasizing six coordination meetings and five workshops as key forums. These activities are described in a sufficient detail and there is a logical line of the development with the focus on: assessing the current situation; defining areas of intervention, vision, mission, objectives; defining intervention measures; drafting the Action Plan and defining the costs of activities; and finally designing performance assessment framework incl. risk assessment and its prevention, incl. communication plan. The whole procedure is described in the SER (incl.

7



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

minutes of the meetings), participation of representatives of relevant groups within the College and beyond is declared in the documents of the College, and it was at least in part confirmed during the interviews, too.

The Strategic Development Plan identifies areas of intervention, strategic objectives, and activities. There are six strategic objectives defined in the Strategic Development Plan (management and leadership; teaching and quality assurance; research; co-operation and communication; infrastructure and digitalization; student affairs). Activities related to the strategic objectives are then enlisted. Criteria/indicators for the objectives/activities are not a part of the Strategic Development Plan.

An overall budget as well as its specification for individual years and objectives/activities is demonstrated in the Strategic Development Plan. There is a visible link between the Strategic Development Plan and Action Plan with annual and longer-term budget allocations.

As for the content, it seems the Strategic Development Plan is taking only in some extent a realistic account of aspects of the internal as well as external environment that (could) affect development of the College. Some activities related to strategic objectives concern the issues that are supposed to be a part of the College already (developing a number of regulations). Some others seem to be very, perhaps too ambitious considering the performance results of the staff so far (for instance developing programs in English; or applications for high-prestige international research projects, such as Horizon scheme). Some activities that are planned seem to be close to a practice which is not appreciated in mainstream academic world (on the contrary is often viewed with a strong criticism) and which indicate a certain misunderstanding (for instance the plan to set up its own journal to make it possible for local staff to publish – 3.5). Other activities seem to be acceptable and fitting well to the strategic objectives.

Monitoring of the implementation of Strategic Plan is not sufficiently developed yet, according to the information the panel received, it is only in the process of development at the moment. The very first documents related to this were delivered (they are of a general nature, though), and more is expected to be done in a visible future, as the ET was informed during the interviews.

The structure of the College emphasizes three lines – academic, support, and research and commerce. This is not clear where is the place of the academic program and of the academic



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

staff in this organization chart; also, it raises a question how strong and effective can be the interlinks between teaching and research under such a structure. Consequently, this also raises a question about effectiveness of decision-making structure/system.

The election criteria and processes of the decision-makers as well as other elected positions are described, and they are published in the College's internal documents. The same can be said, in principle, about responsibilities of decision-making bodies.

It is declared by the College in its documents, student representatives are involved in main bodies of the College, and they also have their own Student Council.

The administration of the College seems to be organized, and also qualified in a relevant way, their responsibilities are described.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Make sure all activities formulated in the Strategic Development Plan are realistic and in line with academic integrity principles.*
- 2. Make sure there is a pivotal role of the study program(s) and the academic staff, incl. clear and strong links between teaching and research activities in the organisational chart of the College.*
- 3. Develop more detailed and effective monitoring and evaluation plan.*

2.3. Financial planning and management

Based on the information the ET received, the College can demonstrate it has sufficient financial resources in the short as well as medium term (three years) period, and it appears the College can therefore reach its mission and objectives as formulated in the Strategic Plan (with reservations mentioned above as for the mission scope).



The College seems to have annual budget as well as five-year budget. Its income is partly generated with student fees, partly with the fees of training courses participants (CPD), from expert work and some other activities (proportions are not clear). The budget seems to be sufficient for ensuring reaching of (most) of the College mission and strategic objectives. For some areas of activity the budget is rather low, though (research, for instance). Financial sustainability of the College can be assumed.

Oversight and management of the College budgeting and accounting functions is done by a specialized administration staff, a regular financial officer was hired from this year on. Taxation issues are covered by outsourced company.

Monitoring of expenditures and commitments is reported semi-annually with a broader control-like view at the end of the fiscal year.

A double accounting system is implemented in the College, following Kosovo as well as international standards, it is declared in the SER.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Consider sufficient allocation of money to some key areas of the College operation, as stressed in the mission (research in particular).*

2.4. Academic integrity, responsibility and public accountability

The College has the Code of Ethics through which it declares it is defending values of academic freedom, institutional autonomy and ethical integrity. The Code also defines rights and obligations of the staff as well as of the students and consequences of rule-breaking behaviour.

While the Code of Ethics requires in an expected way high standard of ethical conduct in all areas of the College operation, in reality one can see some discrepancies, or at least potential for improvement. For instance, the antiplagiarism software has only been adopted very recently and it is not much used so far, as far as ET was informed during the interviews –



here the College relies perhaps too much on academic staff's intuition or individual actions instead. Also, some academic staff members seem to be publishing in journals that are on the list of predator journals. Similarly, the above-mentioned plan to establish College's own journal to enable its staff to publish indicates a lack of harmony between formal documents and policies on the one hand, and practice on the other. Indeed, clear processes and mechanisms of enforcing the Code of Ethics are not visible at the College.

At the same time, the College has established designated structures responsible for analysis and resolution of potential breaches in the Code of Ethics (Ethics Committee, Disciplinary Committee). The ET was not informed about cases these bodies were dealing with in the recent period.

The College is publishing a significant amount of information about its academic staff, activities, procedures, programs, and more. Some information is a bit superficial, and it seems to be apparent that it was placed on the web very recently. This in some extent reduces the informative potential of some of it for the moment.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Make sure academic staff is well aware of ethical issues related to research and publications and follows these rules.*
2. *Make sure antiplagiarism is fought against effectively at the College.*

2.5. Quality management

Tempulli College has developed a Regulatory Framework for Quality Assurance and Management. The information in the regulation is provided in an unstructured manner, does not clearly define the processes, mechanisms, instruments and responsibilities of individuals and units involved in the quality assurance processes and their relationship. It gives useless information that is not relevant or precise to describe the QA system, several statements are repeated twice, and are not relevant to the Tempulli College, even the name of the QA unit is



different (The Office Team of Quality Assurance and Management, instead of Office of Quality Assurance as defined in the statute; the regulation states: “The Office of Quality Assurance and Management (CSMC) team standards for policies and procedures are overseen by trained internal audit teams on an annual basis and approved by external agencies for ISO evaluation”, however Tempulli College does not have a ISO certification and any planned ISO evaluation is not included in its strategic plan, the abbreviation KSO (p. 80, in the book of regulations) is not related to Tempulli College. The college has developed a separate regulation about Surveys and Evaluations. According to this regulation, college conducts the following survey and evaluation processes:

1. Self-Assessment Survey of Academic Staff;
2. Academic staff survey;
3. Administrative Staff Survey;
4. Student survey;
5. Student Assessment Survey for Academic Staff.

However, those instruments are not clearly described. The regulation about Surveys and Evaluations also includes several articles (e.g. articles 4, 5) that are not relevant or clearly linked to the context of this regulation. The regulations are only accessible at the college website in English language, while majority of the college community does not speak English (in the feedback on the draft report the college also provided a link with regulations in Albanian Language).

During the interview the ET learned that the QA office has two staff members and has developed its technologies to conduct the surveys via online platform. The budget also includes line for the development of the QA mechanisms.

During the interviews the college representatives could not give specific examples of improvements made based on the results of the quality evaluation. They explained that the questionnaires were recently developed, and the surveys were not completely implemented yet. According to the SER the college has developed the following questionnaires:

- Questionnaire for student;
- Questionnaire for evaluation of academic staff by students;
- Questionnaire for administration and support staff;
- Questionnaire for academic staff;
- Questionnaire for alumni;
- Questionnaire for business-industry;
- Questionnaire for evaluation of academic and administrative staff by management.



However, the SER and the QA report only included the questions and results of student surveys. The questionnaire includes the questions about the implementation of programs and professors in general together with the questions related to the infrastructure and services at the college. Thus, it does not provide information about individual courses or the professors. Students choose one of five options for each question (Don't agree; Partially Agree, Agree, Fully Agree, Don't Agree). The results are reported in the form of pie charts, but the charts are not built for each question, but it expresses the percentage of each answer option across all 39 questions, specifically, what percentage of students chose e.g. Agree for each question. This is an unsuitable application of the pie chart which leads to misinterpretation of the results. The college has submitted one sample of evaluation of professor by students (with the feedback on draft report), however as the mechanism are not described in the regulations, ET cannot assume that the evaluations are formalized and systematic.

According to the Regulatory framework for quality assurance and the SER the college has established the quality committee, however students and the teaching staff are not aware about its existence, functions and operations; the committee does not include all members of the academic community such as student and the academic staff. The college has submitted the decision on establishing the quality committee, which defines the composition of the committee and its functions. However, the functions and responsibilities of the quality committee, or the criteria for selecting the members in the committee are not defined in the major regulations of the college, such as the college Statute.

According to the SER the college has updated the electronic data management system and starting from the winter semester of the academic year 2019/2020 all forms of assessments are conducted electronically.

The college has recently revised its QA regulations and mechanisms; however, they are still not clear and functional. ET notes that the further development of the system is included in the strategic development plan.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Revise the Regulatory Framework for Quality Assurance and the Regulation about the Surveys and Evaluations and ensure that it includes clear description of quality assurance system, its processes, mechanisms, instruments, data collection, time-frames, quality cycle and it covers all of the college's activities; ensure that the regulation is clear for the academic community and it is implemented in practice.*



2. *Ensure that the roles of the QA office, councils and other staff responsible for QA functions and the reporting channels are clearly defined;*
3. *Ensure that quality assurance functions throughout the institution are integrated in a defined cycle of planning, implementation, assessment and review and that the data is used to guide enhancement and as a base for improvement;*
4. *Develop, revise and implement the QA system and the data collection instruments that cover the whole range of institutional activities (academic activity, student services, administration - students, academic and administrative staff, graduates and employers); Increase student participation in quality assurance processes;*
5. *Incorporate the functions and responsibilities of the QA council in the college statute, and the criteria and procedure for selecting the members. Ensure that the committee is functional, and the college community is aware about its performance and decisions.*
6. *Ensure that data is being collected from all relevant stakeholders, including students, staff, graduates, and employers and the results are made publicly available;*
7. *Develop the capacity of the QA system to ensure that the staff involved in QA function have relevant knowledge and skills to design and implement the QA instruments, use efficient and valid methods of data collection and analysis.*

2.6. Learning and teaching

Tempulli College does not have the policy in place that defines the procedure for development, approval and revision of the academic programmes. The statute indicates the articles on “Programs Study” and “Procedures for revising study programs”; however, the content of those articles do not describe the relevant procedures. The college has developed the Regulation on Bachelor Studies and the Regulation on Master Studies. The regulation on Bachelor Studies includes the structure and organization of bachelor programs and describes: types of studies, conditions for enrollment, duration of studies, regulations related to the student status, rights and obligation of students, conditions for registration, deadlines for submitting and taking exams, completion of studies and diploma work.

According to the SER and the college representatives the college implements the current program in two ways: regular and correspondence modes of teaching. Out of 587 student that are currently enrolled in the college 84 have the active status (14% of students), and among them majority of students (47) attend the correspondence mode of study process. However, the regulation on Bachelor Studies does not define and does not even mention how the



correspondence mode of study process is or should be organized. Thus, the regulations and processes that are in place related to the program structure and organization, teaching process but do not include the critical components do not ensure achievement of the expected learning outcomes. Moreover, according to the description of the educational program and the interviews, the students do the mandatory internship during the last semester of their studies which has allocated 30 ECTS in the program. However, the internship manual does not define the terms, conditions, responsibilities and workload related to the internship. During the interviews ET learned that in some cases, during the internships students work at the Tempulli College Driving School as the instructors, thus the internship does not reflect the goals of the educational program; in various cases, it was mentioned that students do not have defined how many hours they should be spending or what they should be doing at their internship positions. As it was mentioned in section 2.5, the college has only conducted the student surveys, and the questionnaires only allowed to evaluate the teaching and learning process in general, but individual courses and professors were not evaluated. During the interviews the college representatives could not give examples of improvement of the programs made based on the quality evaluation results.

The expected learning outcomes for each program are in line with the National Qualifications Framework and the European Qualifications Framework for Higher Education. Teaching staff are appropriately qualified and experienced for their particular teaching responsibilities.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Develop an effective system and regulation that clearly describes the procedure for the development, approval and revision of the academic programmes which, among others, also includes the roles and responsibilities of relevant units, councils/commissions and staff engaged in this process; Ensure that the regulations refine the conditions for organization and implementation of the correspondence mode of teaching.*
- 2. Implement coherent process to monitor the quality of the study programs: define and monitor quality indicators and take action required to ensure that all programs meet required performance standards; Pay attention to the high rate of student status suspension and address the problems behind it.*



3. Revise the internship manual and define the clear terms, conditions, expectations towards students, workload, distribution of responsibilities between the college and the host organization;

5. Ensure that the teaching quality and the effectiveness of programs are evaluated through student assessments and graduate and employer surveys, with evidence from these sources used as a basis for plans for improvement.

2.7. Research

Tempulli College has no Research Development Plan. In the context of the Tempulli Strategic Development Plan 2020-2024 (at the point: Scientific Research Activities), activities to support research-scientific activities are mentioned. The planned activities are very general, without concrete objectives and without clearly specified indicators (e.g. creation of physical conditions and motivation of staff to participate in international projects; creating opportunities and awareness for academic staff and students to carry out their research). For research, the institution has planned EUR 18,000 in 2020, 2022 and 2023, EUR 19,500 in 2021 and EUR 20,000 in 2024. The team of experts proposes Tempulli College to increase the amount of money for scientific research, especially after they will develop a research plan with concrete indicators. The team of experts also proposes to increase the logistical and human resources to achieve the research objectives.

The research is validated through scientific and applied research publications, but based on the analysis of the scientific papers of the academic staff, it is obvious that some teachers have published their work in international journals that are not indexed in any important basis and that are on the list of suspicious or predatory journals (e.g. European Journal of Engineering Research and Science, International Journal of Scientific and Engineering). The university has to define strict rules for journals that are suitable for publication by academic staff, are of sufficient quality and should not be on the list of predatory journals. Based on the available data, many of the academic staff employed at Tempulli College did not publish at least one scientific research publication per year on average over the last three years. However, if one disregards the papers published in predator journals, the average number of papers per year and per staff member is much lower.



The interview with teachers and program directors showed that expectations regarding the involvement of teaching staff in research activities are not specified and that performance in relation to these activities should be taken into account more in the individual performance assessment system and promotion criteria. Academic staff only devote 10% of their working time to their research activities, and this answer was also given by teachers who are regularly employed at the institution and have no teaching hours this school year. Academic staff publish under the name of Tempulli College. The College has established a code of ethics. There is no reference to guidelines for the ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures for the commercialisation of ideas developed by staff and students. Teachers include in their teaching information about their research and scientific activities relevant to the courses they teach, along with other important research developments in the field.

Compliance level: Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop a research development plan with specific and realistic objectives and indicators. Increase the amount of money spent on scientific research and improve the logistical and human resources to achieve the research objectives.*
2. *Define strict rules for journals that are suitable for publication by academic staff, are of sufficient quality and should not be on the list of predatory journals.*
3. *Establish guidelines for the ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures for the commercialisation of ideas developed by staff and students.*
4. *Increase the number of scientific/applied research publications produced by academic staff.*
5. *Increase expectations of academic staff participation in research activities and reflect these expectations in the individual performance review system and in promotion criteria.*
6. *Increase the participation of students in research activities.*

2.8. Staff, employment processes and professional development



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The Tempulli College has produced an employment manual which is accessible to all teaching and administrative staff. However, the Employment Handbook does not contain all the information that someone needs to understand the professional position of a person working for Tempulli College. The employment handbook contains information on the recruitment process that ensures equal treatment of all applicants (Regulation on Equal Treatment and Non-Discrimination Mechanisms, there is also information on working hours, holidays, personnel files). There is a lack of information on responsibilities, supervision, performance evaluation, promotion, support processes and professional development. The book of regulations contains descriptions of jobs for administrative staff. The regulations mention an introductory week for new teachers, but during the interview with head of study programs and teachers, the team of experts was informed that they did not remember that a new teacher would be hired in the last few years. As a result, the expert team did not receive enough information that new staff would be given effective guidance to ensure familiarity with the institution and its services, programs and student development strategies and institutional development priorities. The level of provision of teaching staff (the ratio of students to full-time staff) cannot really be assessed, as only 84 students are enrolled at Tempulli College and only 19 regular academic staff and 29 part-time academic staff are employed. The expert team interviewed the group of teachers, only one of whom has 10 hours of teaching this school year, one has 4 hours and two of whom are not teaching this school year.

The criteria and processes for performance evaluation are not clearly defined and have not been communicated in advance to all staff. The criteria are: research activities, community service, student evaluation and the evaluation carried out by the head of department. Criteria are not specified, e.g. only the number of publications is important for research activities (the quality of the publication and the quality of the journal in which the paper is published is not important). It is also not important whether a paper was written by one author or by several authors - the number of points is the same: "If the number of published papers is more than one research per year, either individually or collectively (15 points)". The team of experts with the interview with head of study programs did not get any information on how the academic staff evaluation is done.

How academic staff evaluation is carried out is actually not clear. The expert team learned from the documents that this evaluation process includes the assessment of the head of department, the evaluation of the students, the research results and scientific activities of the college members and Community Services of the college members. It was clear from the interviews

18



that the heads of department are not aware of their role in the evaluation of academic staff and that the teachers are not aware of the criteria used to evaluate academic staff. The team of experts has also not received any information on what happens when the performance of the staff is considered less than satisfactory. At present the Tempulli College does not have a clear plan for the professional development of all staff, does not have a structured approach to identifying such needs and does not allocate adequate resources for its implementation. The Tempulli College has developed a document for a staff improvement plan, but does not yet apply it.

Compliance level: Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Develop the Employment Handbook with all the information that someone needs to understand the professional position of a person working for Tempulli College, especially information about responsibilities, supervision, performance evaluation, promotion, support processes and professional development.*
- 2. Provide a document with full position descriptions and conditions of employment also for academic staff.*
- 3. Specify criteria and processes for performance evaluation and inform all staff about this criteria.*
- 4. Develop a plan for all staff professional development, a structured approach in identifying such needs, and allocates appropriate resources for its implementation.*

2.9. Student administration and support services

The admission requirements and procedure at Tempulli College are defined in the Statute, according to which, the admission announcement for each study program includes the following information: the total number of vacancies for students, the conditions for registration and the criteria for the selection of candidates, the deadlines for registration and



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

the documents that should be submitted with the application form. All information regarding the admission procedure is published on the official website of the institution.

The college provides merit-based scholarships for students. The scholarship criteria, application and selection procedure of students is defined in the regulation on the scholarship allocation, which is publicly available on the college website.

The college provides an orientation program for new students to explain the policies, procedures and services that operate at the institution. Additionally, the college recently developed the student handbook that includes all information necessary for student's life. According to the SER since 2020 student data is being stored through the software for student's management SEMS. This data is updated on a daily, weekly, monthly and yearly basis. Through these monitored data the attendance of students in their studies and their results is monitored. However, the ET could not find the examples on how the institution is using and addressing the results of the monitoring.

The college has developed the Code of Ethics and disciplinary procedures for staff and for students. The regulations are publicly available. However, the college recently started to implement the antiplagiarism software, however the college still relies on the judgement of the teaching staff to detect the plagiarism in students' work.

The college has the student support services, that mainly works on technical and administrative issues such as monitoring the student attendance, developing the schedule for classes and exams. The college also has the career support service, that gives consultation to students on development of the CV, or potential employment opportunities. The college does not have an academic or psychological counselling service. The student survey questionnaire that was described in section 2.5 includes questions related to the satisfaction level with the student services, however, the ET could not identify the examples of improvements based on the quality evaluation results. The strategic plan includes a section related to development of student services; however, it does not include the related action plan, timeline and the responsible staff of its implementation. Students are involved in various extracurricular activities.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

20



- 1. Establish effective processes in place to collect and analyse reliable data referring to the profile of the student population, student progression, success and drop-out rates (including the reasons for them), students' satisfaction with the learning resources and student support available, career paths of graduates; make sure that the results of the analysis is used to support students' academic achievements and improve institutional performance;*
- 2. Ensure that the policies related to the academic integrity are practiced and implemented by staff and students;*
- 3. Monitor the effectiveness and relevance of the existing student services and ensure their development based on the monitoring results and promote their diversification (e.g. student psychological counselling, academic counselling, etc. as required by standard 9.11.)*
- 4. Ensure that the plan for the development of student services includes specific steps, timeline and responsible staff assigned to its completion*

2.10. Learning resources and facilities

Tempulli College has already renovated internal and external premises, adapting them to the requirements of the international experts recommended in the final report of the external evaluation during the visit in spring 2019. In parallel with these investments in infrastructure and technology Tempulli College has submitted a project proposal for a grant of the European Commission by a request for technical and financial support. The construction of a new campus will begin in the near future. Tempulli College will renovate the library and improve the laboratories. In this regard ET has learned that last year Tempulli College has invested a lot of money in learning resources and facilities, and a new campus will certainly provide better facilities for staff and students, but from the video it is obvious that Tempulli College should provide more financial resources for acquisitions, cataloging, equipment, and for services and system development. Tempulli College should provide a more attractive and well-preserved physical environment for both the buildings and the grounds. During the interview the students also stated that they currently believe they have enough space because not many students are



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

enrolled at Tempulli College. However, the plan of Tempulli College is to increase the number of students and staff, consequently, the existing space at Tempulli College would not be sufficient.

Tempulli College has a library, but nevertheless that ET during the conversation with the management has learned that they have doubled the number of books in the library in the last year, ET believes that they still do not have enough literature as needed for the programs and researches organized at the institution.

Tempulli has created efficient access to online databases, research and materials from various journals in the field of traffic and transport. Tempulli College has also invested in computer equipment and has appointed a director of this office to make the software easily accessible and literature available. The library and related facilities and services are also available beyond normal classroom hours. ET has not received sufficient data on effective security systems in the library and at Tempulli College that would be used to prevent loss of materials. The self-evaluation report also includes information that Tempulli College during the summer break will work on scanning books in order to establish an effective security system to prevent loss of materials.

The expert team has not received sufficient evidence on whether and how feedback from key users on the adequacy and quality of facilities and mechanisms is taken into account and how responses to their views are incorporated into quality assurance processes.

There are no adequate arrangements for both facilities and learning resources for students and staff with physical disabilities or other special needs (such as visual or hearing impairments). The video shows that there is a mobility platform for students and staff with physical



disabilities at Tempulli College, but that no other arrangements are made for people with special needs and that all places at Tempulli College seem unsuitable for them.

Adequate computer equipment is available and accessible for teaching, staff and students throughout the institution. Tempulli College has also provided technical assistance to students, and training programs to ensure the effective use of computer equipment and appropriate software for assessment, teaching and administration have been organized for students and staff. Tempulli College has an inventory of equipment in its possession, but in the expert team's opinion this inventory is not sufficient and does not include the equipment assigned to individual staff members. In fact, the name of this inventory is "List of equipment and tools needed".

Compliance level: partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Allocate adequate financial resources for acquisition, cataloguing, equipment, services and system development.*
- 2. Allocate adequate financial resources for the operation of the library and provide more materials in English.*
- 3. Provide effective security systems to prevent loss of materials.*
- 4. Increase institutional efforts to adapt teaching materials to students with special educational needs.*
- 5. Develop quality assurance mechanisms to collect feedback from staff and students on the quality of the facilities and use the results to further improve them.*
- 6. Develop a complete inventory of equipment owned or controlled by the institution, including equipment assigned to individual staff.*



2.11. Institutional cooperation

The Tempulli College has designed an internationalization strategy to guide institutional decisions and resource allocation in this area. The Internationalization Strategy has objectives and activities to achieve these objectives. Some objectives are concrete and realistic (e.g. increasing the proportion of Tempulli students trained abroad to give them the opportunity to get to know new places, cultures, languages and traditions), but some objectives are very general (e.g. improving international and intercultural perspectives on content, curriculum learning, increasing participation in co-curricular activities that are inclusive and promote intercultural understanding; improving our success as a world leader in research).

During the conversation with teachers and head of study programs it became clear that they do not know who is directly commissioned and responsible for the initiatives and results in the field of internationalization.

The Tempulli College has agreements and memorandums of understanding with relevant international partners. The Tempulli College very rarely participates in international research projects. The self-evaluation report mentions one Tempus project (project title: The role of qualification frameworks development in higher education reform in Kosovo; project duration: 01 September 2009 - 14 December 2011) and one LO @HEI project (project title: Encouraging the process of curriculum development based on learning outcomes and research guided teaching in the private higher education institutions in Kosovo; project duration: 15/10/2012 - 14/10/2014).

Tempulli College organizes an annual international conference on road safety. This is more or less the only event with international visibility. From the interview with teachers, head of study



programs and students, it became clear that Tempulli College should more encourage the international visibility of staff and students by supporting their participation in various study mobilities, forums, events, summer schools, etc.

From the documentation and during the interview with teachers and head of study programs the expert team did not receive enough information on how the commitment to international cooperation is included in the promotion criteria and staff performance. In this context, the expert team learned that no mechanisms have been put in place at the Tempulli College to support cooperation with international higher education institutions and that no support is provided to the teaching staff in developing cooperation agreements with the international community.

Relationships with local industries and employers are being developed to support program implementation and Tempulli College has various agreements with local organizations.

As part of the community services, Tempulli College, for many years in cooperation with the Ministry of Education, organizes and gives lectures in primary schools on the application of traffic rules and the consequences of traffic accidents.

Local employers and professionals are invited to join the relevant advisory committees or other structural units considering study programs and other institutional activities.

Alumni was founded in late 2019 and has 10 members. For this reason it is not possible to review the Alumni Club program.

Compliance level: partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Increase priority setting and resource allocation for internationalization and institutional cooperation.*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2. *Increase the supply of English-language courses and study programs in English*
3. *Encourage employees to participate in international research projects.*
4. *Encourage employees to participate and to start working with international institutions by including this measure as one of the criteria for their performance evaluation.*
5. *Better support and encourage staff to develop cooperation agreements with the international community.*

1. OVERALL EVALUATION AND JUDGEMENTS OF THE ET

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that The College of Applied Technical Sciences Tempulli is non-compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends not to accredit it.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Expert Team

Chair

Milan Pol

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)

Member

Janez Vogrinc

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)

Member

Keti Tsojniashvili

15/06/2020

(Print Name)

(Date)

Member

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)