



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

UBT COLLEGE
Advanced Integrated Design, MA

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

23 May 2021, Zagreb



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	5
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	9
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	10
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	10
2.2. Quality management	13
2.3. Academic staff	16
2.4. Educational process content.....	19
2.5. Students.....	24
2.6. Research.....	27
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	31
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	34



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 30 April 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Prof. Diana Milčić, PhD*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Arianit M. Krasniqi*

Sources of information for the Report:

a) *Received documents*

- *Self-evaluation report: accreditation of Advanced Integrated Design /MA*
- *Syllabi*
- *Staff CVs (Full time, part time)*
- *Program Development Plan 2020-2024*
- *Scientific Research Plan, January 2021*
- *Code of Ethics*
- *Students Appeals Procedure*
- *Organogram Faculty of Integrated Design*
- *List of academic staff_MA Design Prishtine*
- *Integrated Design Staff Publications*
- *Industrial Board, Integrated Design SubComissions_Design 2021*

b) *Documents available on the website in English*

- *Statute*
- *Books of Proceedings 2019: Proceedings 8th UBT Annual International Conference – Psychology and Integrated Design (<https://conferences.ubt-uni.net/2019/>)*
- *Regulation Scientific Research and Publications*
- *Regulation of Quality Assurance, UBT Quality Manual*



- *Regulation for Student Assessment*

Subsequently requested documents:

- lists with the number of students for the past three academic years (2018./2019., 2019./2020., and 2020./2021.)
 - enrolled in the first, the second and the third year of studies BA
 - enrolment quotas for study BA and MA with decision of the number of enrolled students (who decides the number of enrolled students and the criteria upon which this is decided)
 - number of graduate students who completed BA, the ratio between graduated and enrolled students, average length of studying
- Internal regulations of the Faculty which define the number of students in a group for lectures and for exercises
- strategic planning of the institution
- Work plans of the Quality Assurance, Quality Assurance annual plan and report
- the internal evaluation documents of QA (results and reports) in the past three academic years (2018./2019., 2019./2020., and 2020./2021.)
- examples of all conducted questionnaires (a student survey form, survey form for graduates, surveys for teachers and administrative staff, surveys for employers)
- summary reports of the student survey and graduates exit survey for the past three academic years
- description of training activities mentioned in “Development plan” with names of attendants and evaluations’ report (2018./2019., 2019./2020., and 2020./2021.)
- self-evaluation report for Integrated design BA program from the accreditation 2016
- provide more information and explain cooperation with local industry, example of good practice
- an internal process document about introducing a new study program Advanced Integrated Design with explanation why this program is introduced, market needs research, how teachers are selected etc.
- CV of all teachers involved in the study programs

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Kosovo Accreditation Agency, Accreditation manual, July 2018*
- *Kosovo Accreditation Agency, The manual for external evaluation of higher education institutions, February 2021*



1.2. Site visit schedule

Expert Team

- Prof. Diana Milčić, PhD– University of Zagreb Faculty of Graphic Arts

Coordinators of KAA

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Site Visit Program

No slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion and this applies for each session.

9.00-9.45	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
	Participants in the meeting
	1. Egzon Bajraktari 2. Aferdita Statovci 3. Cennet Lika 4. Mirjeta Arifi
9.50-10.50	Meeting with the heads of the study programme 1: Integrated Design/ BA



	Participants in the meeting
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Milot Gusija;2. Ariana Gjoni;3. Gëzim Radoniqi;4. Fatmir Mustafa;5. Albert Mustafa;6. Arbresha Hoxha;7. Sebil Spat;8. Drenusha Kryeziu.
10.55-11.55	Meeting with the heads of the study programme 2: Advanced Integrated Design / MA
	Participants in the meeting
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Ajhan Bajmaku;2. Penesta Dika
11.55-12.35	Lunch break
12.35-13.15	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
	Participants in the meeting
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Fitore Isufi2. Artrit Bytyqi3. Dardan Luta4. Artan Tahiri
13.20-14.00	Meeting with teaching staff
	Participants in the meeting
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Arben Arifi2. Fatmir Azemi3. Anton Gojani4. Mimoza Sylejmani5. Sezgin Boynik6. Alisa Sadiku7. Ardita Rizvanolli



14.05- 14.45	Meeting with students
	Participants in the meeting
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Rita Hasani2. Drilon Gashi3. Albert Rexhepi4. Albin Kokolli5. Dhurate Ibrahim6. Agnesa Lusnjani7. Mexhid Mramori8. Liridona Koshi
14.50- 15.30	Meeting with graduates
	Participants in the meeting
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Leonita Trolli2. Shkurta Ejupi3. Nertila Memaj4. Arlind Berisha5. Erisa Restelica6. Fjolla Shala
15.35- 16.15	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
	Participants in the meeting
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Furkan Rada2. Gent Zeqiraj3. Dashmir Selmani
16.15- 16.25	Internal meeting of KAA
16.25- 16.35	Closing meeting with the management of Faculty



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

No	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs
1	Integrated Design, BA, (Re-accreditation)	Diana Milčić	Milot Gusija Ariana Gjoni Gëzim Radoniqi Fatmir Mustafa Albert Mustafa Arbresha Hoxha Sebil Spat Drenusha Kryeziu
2	Advanced Integrated Design, MA, (Accreditation)	Diana Milčić	Ajhan Bajmaku Penesta Dika



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

UBT was established in Prishtina, Kosovo in 2001 as IEME – Institute for Enterprise Management and Engineering. In October 2004 it was renamed to UBT – University for Business and Technology. UBT College organizes studies in 16 Faculties including Integrated Design, which is an integral part of the UBT College HEIPP, and it is not a legally independent entity. UBT offers a range of programs at undergraduate and graduate level.

UBT aims to implement an integrated strategy to establish itself as an internationally competitive, research-intensive Higher Education Institution, committed to the transfer of knowledge and the provision of a world-class education and service.

The vision of UBT is “will be a modern and leading higher education institution in Kosovo, committed to apply excellence in teaching, learning and research within an inclusive student-centered environment through applying a multi-disciplinary approach that will contribute to the economic, social and cultural development of Kosovo and beyond.”

Building on a tradition of cooperation between students, faculty, staff and administrators, UBT is committed to enhance its participation as an active member of community by providing learning opportunities through teaching and research excellence, intellectual interaction and creativity.

The governance of UBT is regulated by the Statute of the institution. UBT is governed by: UBT Board, Academic Council, President and Steering Committee. Every statutory body has standing and ad-hoc structures, sub-committees and working groups. The Governing Board is collectively responsible for the management and control of affairs of the College and for ensuring that an effective system of internal control and representation is implemented in the institution.

Regarding evaluated study programs, it was noticed that defined learning outcomes of master study program Advanced Integrated Design are identical to the learning outcomes defined for the bachelor study program Integrated Design. Furthermore, although master and bachelor study programs are of different level, the defined program study mission is identical for both study programs.



2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

As it is mentioned in the Self-evaluation Report (SER) based on current demand in local and regional level, the mission of the study program is to continue promoting best practices in the field of Design.

The above mentioned mission is the same as the mission of the bachelor study program Integrated Design. As master study level aims to the different knowledge, employment etc. the mission of the master study program should be clearly stated and differences/upgrade to/from the bachelor study level should be clearly emphasized.

Regarding the consistency of the program with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area, no evidence-based information was provided in the SER nor during the site visit. No explicit formulations which would connect the proposed learning outcomes of the program to specific level descriptors relevant to the program were provided.

The SER contains very general statements on didactical approaches and research activities. Quite often the statements are rather abstract or normative without providing any information on their practical implementation in the study program. Additional information on implementation of the important concept such as student-centred learning was not given. Since this is a master's study program, it is necessary to emphasize research.

The statements on the research concept in the SER are very general definitions of objectives in a research. This cannot replace the description of the particular action that would foster the involvement of students and academic staff in research activities at the program as well as on the course level.

Based on the SER, the additional documents from the website and the site visit (meetings with the management of Faculty and professors), considerable information was provided on formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. It can be assumed that program topics related to administration and quality assurance of the program, the interaction between teachers and students, rights and duties of all stakeholder are well developed and well-known.



It is gained the impression that a good level of compliance with internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching and assessments in most of the relevant areas has been achieved so far.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.		X
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept		X
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: ~~Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant~~ / **Partially compliant** / ~~Non-compliant~~



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

ET recommendations:

- 1. The mission of the master study program should be clearly stated and differences/upgrade to/from the bachelor study level should be clearly emphasized.*
- 2. The program mission should clearly define the intended learning outcomes at the descriptive levels of the European Framework of Qualification.*
- 3. The study program should strive for a revision of the didactic and research concept considering modern teaching practices (e.g. coherent concept of student centred teaching and learning) and integration of research at the program level and strengthening the connection between teaching and research.*
- 4. Due to the changing circumstances, all policies regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program should be reviewed continuously.*



2.2. Quality management

The SER contains a description of how quality management at the UBT College and Faculty works and which instruments it contains. The Faculty does not have its own internal quality management document, the main and only one available document is UBT Quality Manual, from October 2020. The Faculty of Integral Design is not mentioned in the above mentioned document (Curricula offered pp. 4, Quality circle pp.5).

As the mentioned on the page 3 of this report, the document “Regulation of Quality Assurance” available on the college web page is taken in consideration.

Overall, hardly any information was provided about the surveys which and when are conducted.

The document "Plani vjetor i punës për sigurimin e cilësisë 2020/2021" was additionally submitted in Albanian language.

From the available document, UBT Quality Manual, it is clear that students, teachers, administrators, and external stakeholders are involved in the work of the quality assurance office.

The UBT carried out the regular internal and external evaluations with students, academic staff, administrative staff, employers and graduates. As mentioned in UBT Quality Manual the evaluations are foreseen to be conducted on a regular basis: per semester or per academic year

The Faculty conducts a number of surveys and has defined procedures for dealing with survey results. There is no defined procedure which determines how survey stakeholders are informed of the steps taken based on their comments. The results of the conducted surveys should be publicly available as a complete presentation without specifying names.

From the available documents, it was not possible to conclude whether results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success, and employment of graduates.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		X
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.		X
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Compliance level: ~~Fully compliant~~ / **Substantially compliant** / ~~Partially compliant~~ / ~~Non-compliant~~

ET recommendations:

- 1. Adapt the questionnaires to the specifics of the Faculty. As the number of students per group is small, put in more effort to ensure the students anonymity*
- 2. Establish an Activity Plan which includes all activities that must be carried out in connection with monitoring and quality improvement such as standardization of syllabuses*
- 3. The results should be made public to make them available to everyone. The results are published without names, therewithal only general grades and descriptive statements.*
- 4. Make clear what changes have been brought as a consequence of the evaluation results. Ensure students receive feedback on measures implemented based on their comments.*
- 5. Establish internal mechanisms for monitoring the quality of scientific/research or artistic work that will be effectively implemented in practice.*



2.3. Academic staff

According to the statement in the SER, for the study program MA Integrated Design a total of 39 regular members of academic staff are engaged. In another statement is mentioned that there 38 members of academic staff are engaged. Also, tabular presentation of data of the academic staff includes 3 visiting members of academic staff but their role in the study program is not clear. The Faculty staff formally consists of teachers and lectures with PhD degrees, MSc and MA degrees.

Despite the disagreement of the mentioned number of academic staff members involved in the study program, it is evident from the Panel discussion as well as formal staff profiles (CV submitted prior to the review), that academic staff is able to deliver high level student learning experience through inclusive, relevant programmes and curricula while being professional and collaborative.

Each member of the academic staff is provided with a contract and as job description usually specifies exactly what are the duties of academic staff vis-a-vis students, research work, and administrative work, so it is assumed that it is the case here. The impression was gained that all employees are not aware of all their duties. The responsibilities and duties of staff, which all staff agree, are regular teaching, material design, and student consultations.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	



Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.		X
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: ~~Fully compliant~~ / **Substantially compliant** / ~~Partially compliant~~ / ~~Non-compliant~~

ET recommendations:

- 1. Continue evaluating and improving the standards of quality of teaching and learning.*
- 2. Motivate academic staff to achieve the goals defined in the strategy related to research and teaching.*
- 3. The results of the conducted surveys should be publicly available as a complete presentation without specifying names.*



2.4. Educational process content

At the study program level are defined eight learning outcomes. The same learning outcomes are defined for the bachelor study program Integrated design. Since these are study programs of different levels, level 6 and level 7, the learning outcomes cannot be identical.

Therefore, it was not possible to estimate how the curriculum's structure, corresponds to level 7 of the European Qualifications Framework.

The curriculum covers a broad range of qualifications required to work as a designer in local or regional companies, professional firms in the field. The MA Integrated Design program is primarily based on enhancing and implementing design skills in multidisciplinary products.

The subjects within the study program are well harmonized with the needs of the labour market and comparable to similar programs offered in the region and beyond.

The courses have the full course description within the curriculum has analytical syllabuses which comprise all necessary data, but the syllabi provided reveal uneven quality levels of course descriptions. This could be improved by making template with clear and explicit explanation of what the course description has to contain.

Some courses descriptions are developed in a very traditional way emphasizing mainly the provision of knowledge. The minority of syllabi is characterized by using active verbs for defining learning outcomes at the course level. A well-written learning outcome will focus on how the student will be able to apply their new knowledge in a real-world context.

Some of the learning outcomes are written very generally for example:

Improves research skills; Gain the ability of social sciences, Gain analytical thinking skills, Learns interdisciplinary study, Improves research skills, Gain experience of experimental work, Performs different design.

Learning outcomes at the subject level, should not be defined only as generic skills. In some subjects, the learning outcomes need to be reformulated by using active verbs.

Some courses have listed only one reference, relatively old and not cited with whole data (publisher, year of publishing etc.). Consequently, it can be concluded that the cited literature is not available in the library nor to teachers nor to the students.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The curriculum should be aligned with the student workload and the corresponding ECTS. According to some course descriptions, it can be assumed that the student's workload is not adequately assessed.

Presented information lead to the conclusion that there is complete lack of e-learning and online teaching as key elements of a modern teaching strategy.

The past academic year has provided good opportunities and fundament for further development of online teaching and e-learning, but these possibilities were not used and are not shown in Syllabi. Moodle e-learning is mentioned in some courses' description without any explanation.

The teaching method, which is in use, is an interactive method, where the student conducts seminars, different various projects for different subjects, as well as field research works required for this level of study. The teaching strategy is presented in a rather normative way without giving information on how it is implemented in the study program practically. Further information on how an important concept such as student-centred learning is implemented was not provided. The structure of teaching mainly relies on lectures combined with exercises.

The students are given ECTS credits for Presentation and Master Thesis, but the learning objectives and outcomes are not defined as well as other student's obligations. The program should seek to resolve this issue as soon as possible and arrange it according to European standards.

The Faculty has appropriate and valid mechanisms for verifying standards of student achievement.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		X
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	n/a	



Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	n/a	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.		X
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	n/a	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	n/a	

Compliance level: ~~Fully compliant~~ / ~~Substantially compliant~~ / *Partially compliant* / ~~Non-compliant~~



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

ET recommendations:

- 1. It would be necessary to provide the full course description within the curriculum which comprise all necessary data for all courses.*
- 2. Review all courses regarding a consistent, state of the art use of learning taxonomies and active verbs for defining learning outcomes.*
- 3. Review all literature / references citations for all courses, it should be up to the time.*
- 4. It would be necessary to organize courses for the teachers on how to write good learning outcomes.*



2.5. Students

Since this is a study program under the accreditation process, the assessment related to students was made based only on the available data.

Despite statement "The Students Admission is Regulated by the Department Council Regulation on Admission (<https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/study/students/study-at-ubt/registration-and-admission/>). " on the mentioned web page one could not find any information about admission for any master program offered by UBT. Therefore, the admission procedure at institutional level it is not clear and formal adopted, or publicly available for the any master program. It is not enough to make a statement "will have to undergo an admissions test which will be based on an interview and a portfolio of student works". It is necessary to more precisely define what a portfolio should include and how it will be scored.

Almost all rights and obligations of students are publicly available through different document as the Statue of, Student Organization Status, Code of Ethics, Handbook for Students, Regulation for Student Assessment, Academic Calendar 2020-2021. All above mentioned documents are available on the main website of UBT College.

On the website site <https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/study/current-students/> the title "Study Rules and Policies" one cannot find any description or document in English. On the website <https://www.ubt-uni.net/sq/ubt/per-ubt/politikat-rregulloret/> one can find the document in Albanian: Rregullorja për regjistrimin e studenteve (Regulation of student enrolment) Rregullorja për ciklin e parë të studimeve (Regulation of the first phase of studies) and Rregullorja për ciklin e dytë të studimeve (Regulation of the second phase of studies).

The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly explained in the SER. On the website <https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/ubt-en/about-ubt/regulations-and-policies/> one can find title "Regulation of transfer from one academic institution to another" but it is not publicly available.

The submitted written works or final papers have adequate check for plagiarism through software.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organizing students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.		X
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	n/a	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.		X
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	n/a	

Compliance level: ~~Fully compliant~~ / **Substantially compliant** / ~~Partially compliant~~ / ~~Non-compliant~~

ET recommendations:

- 1. All study rules and policies should be made public to make them available to everyone.*
- 2. The enrolment criteria should be clear and formally adopted and public available with explication what and how the portfolio will be scored.*



2.6. Research

The College has the documents “UBT Strategy 2025” and “Scientific Research Plan” (Faculty Integrated Design 11.1.2021).

One of the strategic objectives of UBT College is “Developing Research, Innovation and Social Responsibility” (the document “UBT Strategy 2025”).

But none of the mentioned documents makes it clear what are the objectives of the research in study program Advanced integrated design. The document “Scientific Research Plan” (Faculty Integrated Design 11.1.2021) has to specify the exact objectives, actions and timeline of actions.

In SER is stated “the following lectures with the topics of Integrated Design were presented at 8th International UBT Conference in October 2019”, but it is not clear what kind of the presentation was. However, in the “Books of Proceedings 2019: Proceedings 8th UBT Annual International Conference – Psychology and Integrated Design” the papers mentioned in the SER were not published.

Only the paper “Design for Repair as a Strategy to Foster Sustainable User Behaviour: A case of Undergraduate Product Design Studio” - Sarkan Bayraktaroglu” was published, but the author is not an employee of the Faculty.

Regardless to the fact that according to the employment contract, each member of the academic staff is obliged to do at least one publication/art work/exhibition/project within the academic year and to engage in other cooperation projects which aim to increase the quality of teaching at the Faculty, according to the SER, teachers do not fulfil the stated obligation.

Since it is a study program of Advanced integrated design, every member of academic staff should involve themselves in the research/art by having at least two exhibitions, or work on a joint project with colleagues or students, or publish a scientific and applied research paper.

In addition, academic staff should publish papers and artistic work under name of the Faculty.

UBT College publishes the Journal “International Journal of Business and Technology” (<https://knowledgecenter.ubt-uni.net/ijbte/>). This is an interdisciplinary peer reviewed journal that enables the publication of research in various fields. As a positive, it should be noted that the journal has the international editorial board and a blind review of papers, but on the other hand, in the journal there are no published papers in the field of integrated design.



Policies establishing intellectual property rights and clear procedures for commercialization of ideas are not provided in the contract with academic staff or another document, which stipulates that intellectual property rights in any work related to or created by the employee during the employment relationship (during working hours and in the workplace), is counted as the work of the employer and is given the full guarantee of the holder.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.		X
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in specialty magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.		X
Standard 6.6 Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centers, scientific parks and other structures for validation.		X



Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.9. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field. .	X	
Standard 6.10. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students..		X
Standard 6.11. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	n/a	

Compliance level: ~~Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant~~ /**Partially compliant/Non-compliant**

ET recommendations:

- 1. The study program needs to add the applied research/exhibition objectives based on the priority areas of research.*
- 2. Provide clear policies which define what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.*
- 3. Define the research strategy with all the necessary elements (action plan, responsible persons, execution deadlines, measuring method of the action execution)*
- 4. Establish the policies for ownership of intellectual property and set out the clear procedures for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

5. *Stimulate students and researchers to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.*
6. *Stimulate researchers/professors to published in the “International Journal of Business and Technology”*



2.7. Infrastructure and resources

The UBT College is located, as shown in the video presentation, in a newly building, has modern infrastructure and offers good study conditions for students and the organization of the academic teaching process.

UBT College premises are property of College.

The UBT College space consists of classrooms, graphic design studios, amphitheatres, painting and drawing workshop, graphic studio and fashion studio and workshop. The UBT College has several classrooms, and one of them, the biggest amphitheatre is 665 m².

The above mentioned space is sufficient for conducting of lectures and exercises for study program.

The facilities of UBT College have lecture halls, laboratories equipped with adequate equipment such as computers, scanner, equipment for VR and AR, printing machines, sewing-machines, etc.

The number of seats in the lecture rooms and seminar rooms are sufficient for the number of student in lecture/exercise groups.

In accordance with the provisions of the Statute, UBT College provides financial resources from the different sources for example from tuition fees, and other payments made by students; grants and payments from research and scientific work, donations, revenues from the development and implementation of projects, etc. As shown in the SER, the financial plan of the study program is in the line with the UBT Statute.

The College has its own library, it has sufficient number of books and learning materials. Students and other researchers, academic staff also have access to the electronic resources through online library.

According to the video “UBT Dizajn I intergruar – Ingrastrukutra- Video per akreditim”, the facility is not equipped with electric stairs, elevators or other relevant infrastructure for students with special needs.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with a equate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	



<p>Standard 7.5. Standard 7.5. The education institution’s libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:</p> <p>a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognized publishers, from the last 10 years;</p> <p>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;</p> <p>e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.</p>	X	
<p>Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.</p>	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant/ ~~Substantially compliant~~ /~~Partially compliant~~/Non-compliant



3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

First of all, the Panel would like to commend the programme development team for their proactive engagement with the Panel during the validation event. The Panel is very pleased with the level of optimism and positive atmosphere among all interviewed groups. The communication between the students and the management seems to be very open and on an admirable level.

Having considered the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme development team, the Accreditation Panel recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance Level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Partially Compliant
2. Quality management	Substantially Compliant
3. Academic Staff	Substantially Compliant
4. Educational Process Content	Partially Compliant
5. Students	Substantially Compliant
6. Research	Partially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Full Compliant
Overall Compliance	Substantially - Compliant

*The overall compliance is assessed by the experts at the level of **Substantially -Compliant**.*

However, the following recommendations need to be considered in relation to programme accreditation:

- 1. The self-evaluation report (SER) provides a lot of significant information, but to enable proper evaluation, more documents mentioned in the SER should be attached. Besides the lack of the documents, all attached documents need to be translated into English. Without these documents, it is hard to properly evaluate and give recommendations for improvement.*



2. *The mission of the master study program should be clearly stated and differences/upgrade to/from the bachelor study level should be clearly emphasized.*
3. *The program mission should clearly define the intended learning outcomes at the descriptive levels of the European Framework of Qualification.*
4. *Regarding evaluation of staff performance, it is suggested that the following criteria are integrated into individual staff records:*
 - *Systematic collection of data career progression and feedback from alumni and include their opinion in learning process;*
 - *Peer observation of teaching as required (with development of appropriate observation criteria);*
 - *Regular staff appraisal in terms of identifying staff development requirements;*
 - *Staff membership in the educational and professional bodies;*
 - *Staff involvement in learning and teaching research initiatives;*
 - *Participation in learning and teaching events and conferences, the Faculty should develop effective policies for teachers' improvement.*
5. *The Panel detected various discrepancies between the formulation of learning outcomes that led it to conclude that the Faculty does not have clear and uniform learning outcomes methodology. It is strongly advised to formulate a precise methodology of defining learning outcomes and apply it.*
6. *It would be necessary to further develop and integrate e-learning as a form of teaching strategy and provide online courses that are feasible to specifically needs of students.*
7. *The Faculty has developed quality policy and procedures that include regular collection and analyses of relevant data with the purpose of ensuring and improving the quality of all institutional activities, especially student participation. Nevertheless, there is room for improvement, especially in quality improvement e.g. standardization of syllabuses.*
8. *To achieve greater publicity about Faculty and its activities, it is recommended to set up a separate active Faculty's page where student and teacher achievements and all faculty activities would be presented. This would enable the public to be better acquainted with Faculty's capabilities and working methods.*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

*In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Advanced Integrated Design MA program offered by UBT College **Substantially - Compliant** with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to **accredit** the study program for a duration of three years with a number of 50 students to be enrolled in the program.*

Expert Team

Chair

Diana Milčić

23. 5.2021.

Member

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)