



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

UBT COLLEGE

***MASTER OF SCIENCE IN
ARCHITECTURE AND SPATIAL PLANNING PROGRAM
PROVIDED IN PRISTINA***

REACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM



3 May 2021, Budapest

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule.....	5
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	5
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION.....	6
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	6
2.2. Quality management.....	8
2.3. Academic staff.....	11
2.4. Educational process content.....	14
2.5. Students.....	17
2.6. Research.....	19
2.7. Infrastructure and resources.....	22
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	24
4. APPENDICES (<i>if available</i>).....	25



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 13 April 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Prof. Dr. Bálint Bachmann*
- *Christoph Back (student expert)*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA*
- *Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation*
- *Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-evaluation report (SER) Bachelor (BSc) in Architecture and Spatial Planning*
- *KAA Accreditation Manual*
- *The Manual for External Evaluation of Higher Education Institutions*
- *Sample of Final Evolutional Report*
- *Annexes from UBT: Quality Assurance Regulation, Regulation for Academic Advancement, Faculty Academic Council, Code of Ethics, Organogram, Research Strategy, ect.*

Requested additional documents sent by UBT College:

- *Detailed data about the number of enrolled students per year and overall, in the study programmes Architecture and Spatial Planning MSc (Prishtina) and the same program on BSc level (Prishtina, Ferizaj and Prizren) of the at least last 3 years on all campus sites one by one,*
- *Semester timeplates for BSc and MSc programs for all sites,*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- *Students' work in architectural planning related subjects: Architectural Design, Architectural Construction, Architectural Studio, Urban Design Studio, Heritage Restoration Studio of BSc and MSc courses provided on all campuses,*
- *Examples of Moodle-based textbooks or other publications supporting students during online education,*
- *Description of Final Project and Thesis work of BSc and MSc programs,*
- *Information about Knowledge Centre regarding research outcomes, heritage database, etc.*
- *Example of an improvement within (at least for one of the study programs) which was implemented because of the monitoring process,*
- *Link of QA Documents published on the website*
- *The „improvement plan” mentioned in the SER (Section 2.2), and its public access,*
- *More detailed information about the infrastructure for all three locations, videos and photos,*
- *Base for the student fees for 2022 and 2023 (section 7.2) estimation and its evidence,*
- *The missing budget plan (section 7.2) for the MSc program (in the SER of the MSc the budget plan of the BSc program is mentioned),*
- *Clarification of Matura subjects requirement (in the SER of the BSc programs in section 5.2: “... 40% or higher national Matura examination in these subjects”),*
- *Clarification of how and which Antiplagiarism-Software is used in the programs*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *KAA Accreditation Manual, Standards and Performance Indicators for External Evaluation*
- *The Manual for External Evaluation of Higher Education Institutions*



1.2. Site visit schedule

13th April 2021

09.00 – 09.40	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
9:45 – 10:45	Meeting with the heads of the study programme 1. Architecture and Spatial Planning, BSc
10:50 – 11:50	Meeting with the heads of the study programme 2. Architecture and Spatial Planning, MSc
11:50 – 12:30	Lunch Break
12:30 – 13:10	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
13:15 – 13:55	Meeting with teaching staff
14:00 – 14:40	Meeting with students
14:45 – 15:25	Meeting with graduates
15:30 – 16:10	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
16:10 – 16:20	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
16:20 – 16:30	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

UBT College offers a dynamic and innovative XXI. century academic environment. It provides a supportive and challenging opportunity for the students, faculty and staff in participatory and self-governance setting. UBT College is a preeminent centre of intellectual and cultural activity in Kosovo, improving the region's quality of life through the skills, knowledge, experience and engagement of its faculty, staff, students and alumni. UBT College will be a leading contributor to the growth, and strategic development of the Kosovo and region. It will serve the Kosovo and region, by preparing leaders for the XXI. century with a global outlook and the skills needed for educational, social, economic, political, environmental and cultural advancement.

In delivering the mission statement for the benefit of students and all other stakeholders, the institution has identified several strategic objectives:

- achieving academic excellence,
- developing research, innovation and social responsibility,
- creating a positive working and learning environment,



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- maintaining and increasing internationalization and regional partnerships and partnering with the community.

UBT College's Master of Science in Architecture and Spatial Planning program provided in Pristina went through general changes and development since its first accreditation from 2012.

The new site in the suburb of Pristina in Lipjan is a necessary extension of the main campus to host technology and engineering focused study programs, among them Architecture and Spatial Design Bachelor and Master courses with their space consuming needs.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

UBT College's open door policy for applicants allows a wide immersion of students for its study programs. The enrolment process includes a personal interview with the applicants, providing information about the desired profession and about the students' engagement and activities during the studies, helping to make the right choice.

Recommendations of the Expert Teams were followed in terms of students' enrollment and development of staff and infrastructure to fulfill KAA quality requirements and local labor market needs at the same time. UBT recently finished its new site of Lipjan in the suburb of Pristina, the buildings serve the science and engineering programs well-fitted with technological equipment in its spacious halls.

The architectural planning is a regulated occupation – with another 600 professions - in the European Union by a Directive, it means that not only the education and its outcomes are prescribed and controlled (for automatic recognition of diplomas in the EU), but the internship and professional portfolio which are necessary for free licensing of architectural planning shall be regulated on national level. Since the Republic of Kosovo pursues to fulfil the regulations of the European Union for its planned smooth integration to the 27 member states, the establishment by the lawmaker of professional chambers of the disciplines like engineering, attorney, medicine and architecture shall promote their maintenance.

European and International standards for the architectural education:

- The content of the curriculum takes into consideration the Directive EC/2005/36 on the mutual recognition of diplomas, certificates and other evidence of formal qualifications in architecture, including measures to facilitate the effective exercise of the right of establishment and freedom to provide services. The program shall be balanced between the theoretical and practical aspects of architectural training and shall ensure the (1)

6



acquisition of the ability to create architectural designs and satisfy both aesthetical and technical requirements, (2) an adequate knowledge of the history and theories of architecture and the related arts, technologies and human sciences, (3) the knowledge of fine arts as an influence on the quality of architectural design, (4) an adequate knowledge of urban design, planning and skills involved in the planning process, (5) an understanding between the relationship between people and buildings and between buildings and the environment, (6) an understanding of the profession of architecture and the role of architect in the society [social factors]. (7) methods of research and investigation for design project, (8) an understanding of the structural design and engineering problems associated with building design, (9) knowledge of physical problems and technologies, (10) necessary design skills to meet users' requirements within the constraints imposed by cost factors and building regulations and (11) knowledge of the industries, organizations, regulations and procedures involved in translating design concepts into buildings and integrating plans into overall planning.

- The UNESCO/UIA Education Committee undertakes upgraded global dissemination of architectural education and published its Chapter in 2017 with 16 points – overlapping with EC Directives 11 points – of recommendation:

<https://www.uia-architectes.org/webApi/uploads/ressourcefile/178/charter2017en.pdf>

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	x	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	x	
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	x	
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	x	



Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	x	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	x	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. The fulfilment of recommended European (11 points) and global (16 points) measures and evaluation standards shall be substantiated in the statement of the study program and referred in the subject descriptions.*
- 2. UBT College provides scholarship for applicants with excellent grades and personal interview for orientation of the applicants to compensate the consequence of open door policy. Particular priority for the successful knowledge transfer is the selection of capable applicants, therefor ET recommends to introduce further criteria and method to measure visual knowledge, technical sense and communication skills during the enrolment.*

2.2. Quality management

The program is integrated in the overall quality management mechanisms of UBT which consists of the Governing Body, President, Academic Council, Quality Assurance Committee, Quality Manager, Heads of Faculties and Departments and the Faculty Councils. In addition, the faculty of Architecture and Spatial Planning has a designated Quality Assurance Officer and Quality Assurance Sub-Committee. This Sub-Committee has three members, a teaching staff representative, an administrative staff representative, and a student representative. The QA Officer and the QA Sub-Committee are the connecting link between the application of the QM outputs and the reporting of the QM results to the strategic QM committees above (Quality Assurance Committee, ...).



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The whole composition of this processes and procedures with the involvement of different QM boards and responsible positions is described in the Faculty Quality Assurance Manual which is based on the overall UBT Quality Manual.

Regarding academic standards, the Faculty Council is in charge to check and verify that all academic policies are met within the program. These policies can be found in the Academic Council Regulations on Graduate Study and Quality Assurance Manual.

The QA Officer and the QA Sub-Committee regulating the evaluation (and self-evaluation) of the academic and administrative services. This information is the main input for the whole QM system and leads (with the help of an improvement plan which contains changes and implementations) to an improvement in quality.

During the interviews with the Expert Panel, UBT was able to provide enough evidence that this procedure is working for the academic site. For the evaluation of the administrative services no sufficient evidence for a closed QM circle with inputs, outputs, changes and check-ups could be delivered.

The Quality evaluation is described in the Faculty Quality Assurance Manual and the UBT Quality Manual. The Quality evaluation process is structured into this fields: Procedures for student assessment, Procedures for ongoing monitoring of programmes, Procedures for programme evaluation, Procedures for selection, appointment, appraisal and development of staff and Procedures for evaluating premises, equipment and student services. All these procedures assure, that the standards of Kosovo Accreditation Agency are met. The Expert Panel is pleased about this level of gathering QM inputs and outputs on the paper-based dimension. During the interviews, the Expert Panel found some cases where this high level of QA was not well adapted into the “daily UBT life”. The Expert Panel is aware that this process of creating a quality culture is difficult and long-term. The Experts wants to motivate UBT to stay on track with its development in QA. The status quo of the QM at UBT is sufficient, this is clear to say. With further development, it could become significant in Kosovo.

Regarding the topic of academic integrity and potential cases of academic misconduct, UBT was not able to provide sufficient information for an appropriate handling. Policies for these cases are defined, but during the interviews the answers on how to handle that kind of an issue were unspecific and contradictory. UBT has to change its view on this very important topic, otherwise the creation of the mentioned “quality culture” is not persistent.



This topic (which is a widespread issue at HEI's in Kosovo) is also very important for the acceptance of UBT in the academic landscape in Europe.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	x	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	x	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.		x
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	x	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		x
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	x	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	x	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	x	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	x	



Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The evaluation process of the administrative services should be revised.*
2. *UBT has well designed QA policies and process descriptions. The better adoption of all of these policies in the “daily UBT life” would lead to a significant quality culture. The pathway is defined, UBT should go this way now.*
3. *The view and handling of the topic of academic integrity should be revised. UBT has to tackle these issues with higher importance.*

2.3. Academic staff

The Faculty of Architecture and Spatial Design puts emphasis on the development of human resources since its last program reaccreditation in 2017. They increased the number of PhD holders (33) and candidates (14) among the academic staff (86). Recently the Faculty hires six more colleagues to be prepared for the increasing number of students of Architecture. Reflecting on the recommendation of the experts the Faculty regularly monitors teaching load of staff to avoid overload in any discipline.

UBT improved its' staff significantly, young educators introduced themselves as highly motivated competent members of a community. The MSc in Architecture and Spatial Design conducted in Pristina/Lipjan is led by the full-time employees in charge: architect Dr. Sc. Lulzim Beqiri and architect Dr. Sc. Binak Beqaj.

The SER 2021/22 shows up (p.9) Dr. Lulzim Beqiri as responsible person in charge of the Architecture and Spatial Planning MSc program in Prizren. It is to clarify according to Kosovo national regulation, if one person is in charge for the whole MSc-level studies of Architecture and Spatial Planning at UBT College, or 2 persons (each dedicated to 60 ECTS) per study program at each branch.

The representatives of the employees made the impression of competent, enthusiastic and motivated staff. Artan Behluli for descriptive geometry, Venera Goxa PhD for law, Kujtim Elezi for architectural history, Gezim Radoniqi for 3D design, Penesta Dika for research methods, Banush Shyqerie for structure and Driton Lleshi for integrated design demonstrate comprehensive and holistic approach for delivering competences and skill of architectural education.



The BSc program in Architecture and Spatial Design is conducted parallelly in the 3 separate branches, the students shouldn't to go to the main campus in Pristina/Lipjan during their studies. All of the courses are taught at separate locations and this impacts the resource utilization both in infrastructure and HR. The impressive development of the last years at UBT college allows, that full-time staff with the participation of local professionals can manage to take the working load at all 3 locations.

Student/staff ratio is satisfactory, although the high number of students per semester can be difficult to manage in the weekly timetable. If UBT College is intending to enrol 120 students in Pristina/Lipjan on MSc level, they must count with the high working load of staff especially in tutorial demanding subjects like Architectural Heritage and Restauration Studio or Integrated Planning Studio.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	x	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	x	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	x	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	x	



Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	x	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	x	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	x	
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	x	
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	x	
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	x	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Whilst the Faculty of Architecture has done significant progress in HR development recently, they shall keep on preparing their teaching staff for the high working load of consultation with 100+ students per semester intake. Introduction of online content implemented to the subjects requiring participation can facilitate the success of knowledge transfer to students with different skills.*
2. *Participation in research projects outside the institution and international mobility ensure the increasing academic quality of the staff.*
3. *Despite the Faculty of Architecture stated to monitor the workload of the teaching staff, providing the same study program of Architecture and Spatial Design BSc on three campuses is still a challenge for the colleagues responsible for the Master (MSc) level study program subjects taught on multiple sites. ET recommends to hire local*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

professionals responsible for site-specific topics and projects beside the commuting staff members with degree.

2.4. Educational process content

The focus of Architecture and Spatial Planning MSc program of UBT College has been revised since it has been launched 2012. It follows national learning outcome standards and teaching performance indicators by law and recommendations of the evaluation experts on directives of the European Commission and on the Charter of Architects' global organization UIA and UNESCO. The study program responds to the 11 points of the Directive EC/2005/36 on Architect' training balancing between theoretical and practical aspects of the profession. Taking in consideration those aspects UBT College ensures the later European recognition of its diplomas in Architecture. The overall program is a suitable architectural study plan, it fulfills European and international criteria for the Bachelor level.

According to the recognition of Professional Qualifications in the European Union (Directive EC/2005/36 Article 21/7) and its Modernization of the Professional Qualifications Directive (Brussels, 9 October 2013) "for architects, the revised Directive sets the training requirement to either five years of university training or to not less than 4 years of full-time study at a university, supplemented by supervised professional traineeship of a minimum of two years. This solution offers the necessary flexibility to accommodate different approaches in the Member States (the duration of both the academic and practical components varies between Member States)". Following the EC guidelines, it is important to observe the 3 year-BSc and the 2 year-MSc curricula together, though the directive requires five years of university training.

UBT College's Master program in Architecture and Spatial Planning adopts a balanced (50-50%) theoretical instruction and practical exercises. The subjects dedicated to heritage protection and restauration, urban and regional planning, building energy efficiency as well as interior, landscape and traffic infrastructure planning reflect on demanding fields of the profession. The Master program promotes a process-oriented curriculum throughout the 4 semesters to promote students' contribution to the building sector in the form of the thesis work by integrating design experience and industry-relevant research. The specialized studios and the semester-long Research Project and Master Thesis subjects allow students of Architecture to develop projects of personal relevance. Studios of the finale year are comprehensive and

14



research-oriented refining students’ ability to not only identify a specific spatial or functional issue, but to develop innovative interventions or solutions. The outcomes of the studio work courses are real-life projects based on a research statement of the students.

The weekly hours of lectures and tutorials is up to 30, which is rather high, but common for studies in Architecture. Students’ efforts to complete their design studio work outside lecturing hours could justify a lower workload (24 to 26 hours) of contact hours a week.

Since the last reaccreditation additional courses were introduced with up-to-date topics such as Advanced Design Methods, Management and Entrepreneurship, Design Studios: Interior, spatial planning, landscaping and traffic infrastructure, and building energy efficiency. These topics cover the master-level architectural education without overlapping or repeating the bachelor program’s content.

UBT College provided additional documents about the Master Thesis work process and its outcome, that shows significant progress compared with earlier years in technological, architectural, info-graphical and other competences of the final designs of graduates on master level.

The 4 semesters MSc program based on the 6 semesters BSc program are dedicated to overall, general architectural competences, fulfilling the requirement of an all-in-all 5-years generalist education of Architects. The revised study program is now in accordance with the EC Directive and UNESCO/UIA Charter, meanwhile the earlier program intended an early study-phase specialization/concentration, which is not recommended.

The idea of specializations are adequate and highly needed in the profession of the Architects. It is possible to introduce special modules into the MSc program, not stepping over the European Commission’s (EC) recommendation of 10% of non-general architectural skills of the all-together 300 ECTS study program of BSc+MSc levels. A too early specialization, like during BSc is not wishful, specializations, if any, should be mentioned only in the final year of the 3+2 years programs of Architecture.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students’ personality.	x	



Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	x	
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.	x	
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	x	
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	Not relevant	
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	x	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	x	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	x	



Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	x	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ECTS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	Not relevant	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/ organisations/practical training units.	x	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *ET recommends to further equip dedicated space for students' of Architecture independent work at the new site of 27.000 sqms and concentrate even more on Design Studio work methods and the documentation of its outcomes.*

2.5. Students

The Students Admission is Regulated by the Faculty Council Regulation on Admission. For the application process it is mandatory that a bachelor's degree-Diploma is available (for international applicants additionally a document for degree equivalencing from Ministry of Education of Kosovo is required). If this requirement is not met, the application is not valid and an enrolment is not possible.

The whole process is transparent described and handled.

During the interviews UBT was able to credibly assure that the teaching and learning process is interactive and student centred. In the interview with the students the Expert Panel was able to gather sufficient evidence. Furthermore, the Experts did not find any signs or complaints that the size of the study groups are inappropriate.



An academic record is available for the students during their whole student life at UBT. The Expert Panel did not find any signs of dissatisfaction of the students regarding to the feedback they get. UBT provided some examples of a flexible treatment of students in special situations (ongoing illness, pregnancy, ...). Overall, the Expert Panel is satisfied with the handling of UBT on the mentioned topics.

Student completion rates for all courses and for the program as a whole are taken into account within the monitoring system of the QM (see chapter 2.2). Appropriate quality indicators are defined.

Regarding the topic of academic integrity and the check-up procedure if the work submitted by students is original, the Expert Panel did not find satisfying information. As mentioned in chapter 2.2., policies for academic misconduct are defined but the handling of these kind of issues is insufficient. During the interviews, UBT was not uniformly able to explain the usage of an antiplagiarism software.

The rights and obligations of students are summarized in the student handbook, which every student gets on the beginning of his studies. Also, the transfer of students (between HEI's, faculties or programs) is possible at UBT. The policies regarding this topic are appropriate and transparent. The Expert Panel is satisfied how UBT is handling this policy driven aspects.

During the interviews (especially the interview with the students) the Expert Panel was able to get a good impression of the availability of the academic staff for consultation and assistance. At the UBT Main Campus in Pristina, the availability is very good, no complaints or any other signs of discontent was found.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students	x	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	x	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	x	



Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	x	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	x	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	x	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	x	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		x
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	x	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	x	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	x	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

- The view and handling of the topic of academic integrity should be revised. UBT has to tackle these issues with more importance. The usage of an antiplagiarism software should become normal. Also, a training for the academic staff on how to use this software could be helpful.*

2.6. Research

The study programs on Master of Science level aims to provide scientific work by the students' field study, interviews, database analysis in form of researched based design are part of the knowledge and competence transfer. UBT College and its Faculty of Architecture and Spatial Planning can achieve the state of university of applied science by focusing on R+D+I activity for the building and creative industries. Staff are already dealing with research-based design and are successful in their fields of interest. UBT College can set up



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

research groups within the existing Knowledge Centre for academic excellence by cooperating with economic entities.

Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are specified and is respected by the annual evaluation of the staff performance. The outcome of scientific/artistic work per year is registered and required by the Faculty. UBT College allocates funds for professional activities and supports academic achievements of the staff. Many of the staff members cooperate with prestigious international art schools in applied art projects considered equal to scientific work. Artists with a degree (PhD or DLA) are supported and promoted at UBT College, fulfilling the accreditation criteria becoming program leaders.

Recognised research outcomes are defined by UBT College, that are consistent with international standards: articles in indexed journals, conference papers, proceedings, books, art exhibitions, architectural competitions, design fairs.

The academic staff has a wide range of artistic record measurable with scientific achievements, since many of them have international experience not only as acting artists but as authors of scientific articles as well.

The scientific activities at UBT College are demonstrated by the Annual International Conference inviting all fields of applied science and art conducted by the institution. Staff members are expected to lecture about their scientific/professional work during the conference. More relevant to peer reviewed scientific and artistic work are the international appearances of the staff members on independent forum, that has to strengthen further on.

UBT College is active of organising scientific events, highlighted the Annual International Conference since 2018. Participation of staff on international events abroad is less impacted now by the visa regulations against Kosovo natives. The global COVID-19 lockdown influences recently the scientific mobility, all events took place online.

The institution tracks the publications of its staff through the Knowledge Centre. According to list of the SER most of the FT staff members of the Faculty fulfil the requirement to publish /produce at least one scientific/art result per year for the past three years. UBT College requires FT academic staff to publish under the name of the HEI. Academics have their own Google Scholar and ORCID accounts for the visibility of their tracks. Protection of intellectual property is stated at the Code of Ethics, but no evidence for commercialization of ideas was detected ever since.

UBT College Faculty of Architecture and Spatial Planning is on the right track with its study portfolio concentrating on business and technology, since these fields are expected to drive global economic growth in an ecologically sustainable way.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	x	
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	x	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	x	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	x	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.		x
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	x	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		x
Standard 6.8 (1) Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	x	



Standard 6.8. (2) Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	x	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	x	
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	x	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Set specific research topics for research by design serving the needs of the local building industry conducted by the staff of the Faculty of Architecture. According to rapid urban development of Kosovo, future issues of the built environment, like social housing, urban comfort, sustainable maintenance and energy conscious technologies can be in focus of scientific activities.*
- 2. Based on the focus of scientific interest of architectural research, facilitate proper infrastructure in form of laboratories, hardware and software and allocate maintenance costs at the new campus in Lipjan.*
- 3. Academic promotion on a regular basis and frequency can emphasise staff to achievements.*
- 4. Fund raising through local business entities and participation in international projects can contribute to the academic acknowledgement of UBT as applied sciences university and can substitute the lack of national state funding for private higher education.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Because of the Covid19 pandemic, the Expert Panel was not able to visit UBT in person. So, the basis for the Experts to decide about this standard were videos and photos provided by UBT, the impression from the interviews and last but not least the experience of the chair of



the Expert Panel, who had the chance to visit UBT some years ago in context to another Kosovo Accreditation Agency evaluation.

The UBT Campus in Lipjan (Pristina) provides everything what is needed for the delivery of the program. The quantitative resources (space, human resources and equipment) are sufficient for the long-term implementation of the program for the intended number of students (see chapter 3.). The number of seats in lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories are also well dimensioned for the program. This is also the case for the capacity of the library.

Adequate documents for evidence regarding the facilities were provided by UBT (for the premises in general, equipment, software and library).

UBT provided a completely and comprehensible financial plan to the Expert Panel. The Experts assess the numbers within the plan as realistic and sufficient to sustainably deliver the program for the next years.

The UBT Campus in Lipjan (Pristina) is well suited for the delivery of the program. Only the preparations for students with special needs is insufficient. For example, the lack of elevators or high stair steps are a problematic.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	x	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	x	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;	x	



c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.		
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	x	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	x	
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs		x

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- UBT should design the facilities in a manner, that students with special needs can participate at the academic life without any restrictions.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Standard	Compliance level
----------	------------------



1. Mission, objectives and administration	Fully compliant
2. Quality management	Substantially compliant
3. Academic staff	Fully compliant
4. Educational process content	Fully compliant
5. Students	Fully compliant
6. Research	Substantially compliant
7. Infrastructure	Substantially compliant
Overall compliance	Fully compliant

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Master of Science in Architecture and Spatial Design offered by UBT College in Pristina/Lipjan is overall Fully compliant compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 5 years with a number of 120 students to be enrolled in the program.

4. APPENDICES *(if available)*

1. A
2. B
3. C

Expert Team



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Chair

Signature

Prof. Dr. Bálint Bachmann

3rd May 2021

Member

Signature

Christoph Back.

3rd May 2021