



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

***BPRAL UBT COLLEGE  
FACULTY OF LAW***

***PROGRAM: CRIMINAL LAW  
LEVEL: MASTER (LLM)***

***ACCREDITATION***

**REPORT OF THE EXPERT**

*April 2020, PRISTINA*



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION .....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule .....	5
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	6
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION.....	7
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	7
2.2. Quality management .....	9
2.3. Academic staff .....	11
2.4. Educational process content.....	14
2.5. Students.....	18
3.1. Research.....	21
3.2. Infrastructure and resources .....	24
1. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET .....	26
1. APPENDICES ( <i>if available</i> ): N/A .....	28



## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1. Context

**Date of site visit: March 9th, 2021**

**Expert Team (ET) members:**

- *Prof. Dr. Goce Naumovski*

**Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):**

- *Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA*
- *Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Accreditation and Evaluation*
- *Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*
- *Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*

**Sources of information for the Report:**

- *Self-Evaluation Report (SER) of the UBT College, Faculty of Law, Program: Criminal Law as of 10/03/2021, (LLM)*
- *Law on Higher education in the Republic Kosovo*
- *National Qualifications Framework*
- *KAA`s Formal Policies, guidelines and regulations*
- *Syllabuses on Criminal Law LLM*
- *CVs of academic staff*
- *Appendix to the SER*
- *Code of Ethics*



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

- Study Regulations
- Regulation on the organization of master studies
- Quality assurance guideline
- Video for assessing UBT premises.
- *Requested documents:*
  - (a) *Tables with number students enrolled at the UBT LLB and LLM programs*

**Criteria used for program evaluation:**

- *Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance; Re/accreditation of bachelor and master study programs, Accreditation Manual; July 2018*



## 1.2. Site visit schedule

### Site Visit Program

#### 9<sup>th</sup> March

09.00 – 09.40	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated ( <i>no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion</i> )
09.45 – 10:45	Meeting with the heads of the study programme 1: Law/ LLB – Prizren
10:50 – 11.50	Meeting with the heads of the study programme 2: Criminal Law/ LLM – Prishtine
11:50 – 12:30	Lunch break
12.30 – 13:10	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
13.15 – 14.05	Meeting with teaching staff
14.10 – 14.50	Meeting with employers of graduates
14:50 – 15:00	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
15:00 – 15:10	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

No	Study program	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs		
1	Law/ LLB (Accreditation) Prizren	Prof. Dr. Goce Naumovski	Behar Selimi	Njomeza Zejnullahu Xhavit Shala	Egzone Osmanaj Blerim Reka
2	Criminal Law/ LLM (Accreditation) Prishtina	Prof. Dr. Goce Naumovski	Mensur Morina		



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

### **1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation**

UBT was established in Pristina, Kosovo in October 2004, built on the previous experience of the Institute of Enterprise Engineering and Management (IEME). The College holds the license of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) No.808/02-1 dated 18.10.2004 and it is also supported by its centers in various other cities in Kosovo.

UBT has undergone a number of external accreditation (both institutional and program) procedures. The philosophy of the institution has been to offer internationally competitive programs in higher education and lifelong learning.

The institution has introduced innovative programs that are essential for economic and social development in areas of law, political sciences, media and communication, mechatronics, energy efficiency, medicines sciences and integrated design.

UBT also offers programs that were meant to service the existing demand in the areas of international and European studies, economy, public policy and medicine. The institutional context where UBT operates is characterized by an evolving regulatory framework on higher education, dualization of education system into both public and private and high demand for higher education programs and certification.

The activity is based on strategic goals and the development and review of Strategy takes into account the educational philosophy, national educational policies and the social economic environment within which graduates will work. Institutional Strategy1 is based on surrounding educational environment and it provides steps in education, which integrates academic excellence, humanistic education and entrepreneurial education.

With regard to the changes in the external environment UBT devotes particular attention to initiatives and developments in the context of EU Lisbon Strategy, the Bologna Group, the European Network of Information Centers, EU Directives on Regulated Professions and European Qualification Framework. With regard to developments and best practices in quality assurance UBT regularly monitors the European Association of Quality Assurance in Higher Education.

In relation to best practices in HE management, programs, services and funding models it regularly monitors the developments in the European University Association (EUA). Best practices related to student and staff mobility it follows the developments in the EU Erasmus

6



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

+ Initiative. Developments related to research and industry cooperation are monitored in the context of Horizon 2020 Initiative, Western Balkans Research and Innovation Initiative, OECD SEE Reports and Regional Cooperation Council (RCC) Smart Growth Initiative. Monitoring National Environment.

UBT follows national trends and changes in the education legal framework, standards and administrative instructions. In the dimension of quality management, it regularly participates and contributes to Kosovo Accreditation Agency Capacity Development Seminars and EU Tempus Seminars. With regard to institutional management and standards, it regularly monitors legal standards and amendments to the Law on Higher Education, Administrative Instruction on the Accreditation of Private Bearers of Higher Education, National Qualification Framework and Administrative Instruction on the Licensing of Private Bearers of Higher Education and National Bologna Group Experts.

The master programme in criminal law that is under evaluation is offered to gain general theoretical knowledge such as criminal justice, global crime problems and human rights.

## 2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

### 2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The management team has informed the expert that the program mission is to offer in-depth theoretical knowledge of criminal law such as criminal justice, global crime problems and human rights and also aspects related to public policies in this field. The program objective is for the students to develop critical thinking and research skills in traditional and coherent criminal law area (as computer crimes, organized crime, penitentiary system challenges). Also, it aims to identify political, economic, demographic, cultural factors and people's perceptions that shape criminal justice policies and system.

As stated in the SER an indicator of the correlation between the institutional mission and of the mission of the program is the possibility for advancement of learning and the application of this knowledge for benefit of the people. Through this master programme and the research track, it ensures the possibility to prepare students for doctoral studies in the same area.

The SER outlines that the above-mentioned indicators will speed up the students in their postgraduate studies. Having in mind the level of post graduated in Kosovo this will help to increase the level of professional capacities in the country. This program comes as a necessity

7



of traditional aim to provide the students with advanced knowledge and critical awareness on the field of criminal law, and also providing them with the new factors, which have indicated the criminal justice in the country. The profound judicial reform of the legal system in Kosovo has affected every aspect of the social, economic, political and juridical system. The need for democratic governance, for the protection of human rights, and in accordance with European criteria and standards, has influenced during the program design, to enable students to apply and interpret the rules of criminal law fairly. Beyond that, an internship in the second semester is outlined, as a steppingstone to get in contact with professional practice, excelling with the skills and knowledge acquired throughout the program

In order to provide a program that will be with the wanted quality the management team consulted experts in the criminal field. The experts provided valuable inputs on the academic content of the study program, as reported in the SER. The study program has been is based on inputs collected from the academic community and external stakeholders.

The SER includes an explanation that the program is built on a didactic and research concept aiming to offer supportive and challenge opportunity through this program, which is in line with the latest development of criminal law sciences. So, the general structure of the courses, with a quantitative emphasis quite similar to other Master’s Programs in Europe (computer crimes, organized crimes, human right protection and punishment policies).

As underlined in the SER, the mission and the purpose of this program is to provide advanced theoretical and practical knowledge in criminal law as well as a high level of mastery of empirical and theoretical-scientific research skills. **It can be concluded that the management team is pleased that mission of the proposed program is in line with the mission of UBT.**

The formal policies, guidelines and regulations are publicly available as highlighted in the SER and as the expert had the opportunity to see on the UBT’s website. As the management team informed the expert during the site visit, and as it was described in the SER, the management and the decentralization has been promoted as a management concept.

**Finally, the expert acknowledged the management of the team for their honesty, awareness and strict dedication for fulfilling their mission and vision.**

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	x	
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National	x	





Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	
<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

**Compliance level:** Substantially compliant

**ET recommendations:** /

## 2.2. Quality management

UBT has settled a system for quality assurance on a college level with different bodies. The main teams and individuals with responsibility for quality assurance at the institutional level are The Governing Body, President, Academic Council, Quality Assurance Committee, Quality Manager, Heads of Faculties and Departments, Faculty Councils, Academic Staff and Students. The Faculty Quality Assurance Manual is based on UBT Quality Manual. The Faculty has a designated Quality Assurance Officer and Quality Assurance Sub-Committee that work in conjunction with UBT Quality Assurance Committee and Quality Manager. The Faculty Quality Assurance Sub-Committee is composed of three members and includes a teaching staff representative, administrative staff representative and a student representative.

**The expert would like to commend the Faculty and the College for working hard on building and sustain quality assurance culture.**

The quality assurance system is based on questionnaires for students, academic staff, and external stakeholders based on which reports with the results are made, and submitted to the management team aiming to serve as a basis for further improvements. As the expert learned from the meeting with the quality assurance representatives, the Faculty is obtaining a self-assessment through questionnaires for the students.



As stated in the SER, the ongoing feedback from staff, students, and external stakeholders, including external examiners and strategic partners, and the consideration of the output from the institutional and programmatic reviews' self-evaluation processes and feedback have largely contributed to the development of the practice. The overall quality assurance policy and the procedure are based on a recently updated UBT Quality Manual.

Moreover, the stakeholders are involved in the quality assurance system through various other mechanisms such as participation in working groups, ad hoc committees, decision making structures, and levels of academic units. Finally, the results of the whole process for ensuring quality is being integrated into future work planning and processes within the faculty in accordance with the Development Plan as well as the Annual Work Plans, as reported in the SER.

During the visit, the expert has been provided with detailed explanation regarding the procedures of the quality evaluations. This particularly refers to the overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with attention given to learning outcomes for students.

The Faculty is obtaining detailed self-assessment reports, when compiling the self-assessment report on the accreditation process that occurs at least once every three years, as reported in the SER.

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	x	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	x	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	x	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	x	



Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	x	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	x	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	x	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	x	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	x	

**Compliance level:** Fully Compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- 1. The expert team would like to recommend the Quality Assurance Office to enhance the presence of the factors contributing to staff motivation processes and outputs in the procedures and questionnaires of the quality evaluation procedure.*
- 2. The expert team also recommends continuation of the modernization of the Quality Assurance Office in terms of human resources and strengthening of the monitoring scheme.*

**2.3. Academic staff**

SER notes that the Law Faculty of UBT has improved in terms of hiring new staff, out of which 13 are tenure position devoted to the proposed LLM program (p.33). Furthermore, SER notes that academic staff engaged in the Law Faculty of the UBT does not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time).

SER SWOT analysis indicates the following weaknesses: The engagement of staff into activities other than teaching is still under the possessed capacities; Lack of formal mentoring across faculties members in joint papers, thesis or research activities, according to the existence of capacities; There is still the need to improve leadership skills and the ability to manage activities to develop services from the staff members, lack of external funding for postdoctoral studies of academic staff; retirement of staff with long teaching experience; and insufficient number of visiting staff.



The expert has analysed the composition of the academic staff, their qualifications, including the field of specializations and particularly their research work.

In the general context of the Law faculty, the academic staff meets the minimal requirements regarding the proposed LLM program, however the findings of the expert show prevalence of disciplines including political science, and international relations staff. For the purpose of balance of adequate academic staff (namely full time), specialized in Criminal Law as an important pillar of legal science (together with civil law), the expert team encourages the initiatives of the management in strengthening the criminal law department.

Following professors are delivering the courses of the LLM in Criminal Law, according to SER tables: Albulena Ukimeraj, Elton Tota, Mensur Morina, Xhavit Shala, Arian Kadriu, Behar Selimi, Gelina Maliqi, Denis Celcima, Nuredin Lytciu, Fatos Haziri, Hasan Metin, Elmi Kelmendi, Lavdim Krasniqi.

The expert has also intrinsically analysed the components relevant to the academic staff, outlined the additional documents sent by UBT, namely the cooperation list with the universities and institutions as well as the master studies regulations.

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	x	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching position included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	x	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	x	
<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.		
<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the	x	



case of artistic/applied science institutions.		
<i>Standard 3.6.</i> Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	x	
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	x	
<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	x	
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	x	
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

**Compliance level:** Substantially Compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

*The subsequent steps of LLM programme management in coordination with the Faculty of Law management in terms of academic staff development would include the following measures:*

- 1. Further employment of full professors and ESRs in legal areas in order to contribute for improvement of the faculty-student ratio as an input for higher quality of the Criminal Law LLM programme. In this process efforts for gender balance should be increased.*
- 2. Efforts should be made for full realization of the Staff development plan at the Law Faculty namely in improving the knowledge, skills and behaviours of staff which will enhance personal growth and to embed all staff development activity into the institutions' academic calendar.*
- 3. Number of international, European and regional visiting professors in legal sciences (especially in emerging legal fields) should be increased (particularly with experience and education acquired at EU and US universities), as a tool for providing diverse approach to the students and enhancement of cooperation of UBT academic staff with colleagues from other countries. UBT should continue to use its cooperation agreements as a basis for this step. This will be a concrete input for overcoming the weaknesses and threats. Examples would include enhancing visiting positions in areas where criminal law components are relevant such as: EU aspects of criminal law, information technology law, sports law, piracy and criminal law aspects of intellectual property.*



4. Overcoming of the lack of formal mentoring across faculties members in joint papers, thesis or research activities, according the existence of capacities.

#### **2.4. Educational process content**

SER (p.44) strives for a study program which is modelled on objectives, which include acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The objective of the concept of the proposed LLM program is to prepare the students to develop critical understanding of the criminal procedure and criminal evidence, investigation's tools and methodology and also to develop advanced knowledge on particular areas of criminal law like criminalistics, preventive measures of organized crime, allocation of evidence and proofs. It is considered important to advance the student's writing and oral argumentation of the students, relevant to the labour market demand.

Furthermore, both from the SER (p. 45) and the interviews with the stakeholders and the employers of graduates, it is evident that a strong pillar of the educational process contents is the efficient collaboration with the Municipal Court of Pristina, Kosovo Bar Association and other stakeholders/future employers of graduates. Experts and professors from this stakeholders are engaged at the Faculty, which is a prerequisite for the LLM program proposes. This should also facilitate the practical review of the challenges of the justice system and the legal enforcement. Law Faculty in UBT has built the practice of visits realized in the prosecutor's office, in the Municipal Court and every other practical sector of the law, supervised by a professor of professional practice the curriculum of master program.

The expert's opinion is that the outlined concept of the Criminal Law programme is designed to be in line with the mission of the Law Faculty and the general mission of UBT College in order to respond to the labour market requirements. The study program strives to provide the students with knowledge specialized in the field of criminal law. The program in Criminal Law is a modular structure program consisting of compulsory and elective courses (units of study with clearly defined outcomes including a variety of teaching and learning methods)



Specifically, the programme is structured as follows:

Year 1						
Semester I			Hours/week		ECTS	Professor
Nr.	C/E	Subjects	L	E		
1.	C	Advanced Criminal Law	3	1	7	Mensur Morina
2.	C	Comparative Criminal Law Research	3	1	6	Elton Tota Elmi Kelmendi
3.	C	Criminology	2	1	5	Albulena Ukimeraj
4.	C	Leal Research	2	2	4	Xhavit Shala Hasan Metin
5.	C	Cyber Law	2	1	4	Fatos Haziri
6.	E	<i>One elective course Forensic Science, White collar crime; Judicial Statistics; Judicial Psychology</i>	2	1	4	Mensur Morina Behar Selimi Gelina Maliqi Denis Celicima
<b>Total</b>					<b>30</b>	
Semester II			Hours/week		ECTS	Professor
Nr.	O/E	Subjects	L	U		
1.	C	Advanced Criminal Procedure	2	1	7	Nuredin Lytfiu
2.	C	Organized crime	2	1	4	Arian Kardiru; Lavdim Krasniqi
3.	C.	Penitentiary Law	2	1	4	Albulena Ukimeraj
3.	C	Master Thesis			15	
<b>Total ECTS</b>					<b>30</b>	

SER (p.60) refers to the following weaknesses and threats regarding the educational process: Rushed transformation of the law system in Kosovo, which leads to inconsistencies irregularities and content; Not clear strategy on labour demands in the country and the lack of public planning of job positions or criminal professionals needed to work in law enforcement.

The expert has examined the curriculum as well as the syllabus of each course. The main advantage of the curriculum is its approach which mainly corresponds to the challenges of the



Kosovar society, particularly with the expressed effort of the curriculum to address the needs for expertise of future graduates. This particularly refers to area such as Advanced Criminal Law, Cyber Law as well as the elective courses that also include complementary social sciences such as Judicial Statistics and Judicial Psychology. The syllabi are coherent with the general approach, even though the components that examine property crime and financial crime could be upgraded.

The expert team considers that the significance of application of statistical methods for the criminal law science are clearly visible in the syllabuses of the relevant courses (such as in the cases of Legal Research and Judicial Psychology). Application of empirical jurisprudence could also be enhanced in all other courses.

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	x	
<i>Standard 4.2.</i> The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	x	
<i>Standard 4.3.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.	x	
<i>Standard 4.4.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	x	





<i>Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program</i>		
<i>Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.</i>	x	
<i>Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students</i>	x	
<i>Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.</i>		
<i>Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.</i>	x	
<i>Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.</i>	x	
<i>Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.</i>	x	
<i>Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.</i>	x	

**Compliance level:** Substantially Compliant

**ET recommendations:**



*1. The expert encourages future enhancement of training in statistical methods and their application in criminal law disciplines (preferably multivariate statistical methods), as well as criminology, penology, and related sciences (having in mind the overall capacity of UBT. This would be a contribution for higher quality of the master theses, given the opportunities of application of quantitative methods in criminal law science.*

*4. Given the potentials of the academic staff and the labour market needs, there is a solid basis for enhancing legal clinic forms and regional moot court activities, possibly through the support of the applicative/donor projects.*

*4. Improving of the regulations is advised in terms of providing a more balanced distribution of LL.M candidates among supervisors (mentors) and topics, with emphasis on allocating mentorship by early stage researchers (ESR).*

*5. The LL.M programme management and the University/Law Faculty top level management could consider including additional innovative elements in the syllabi, such as in the case of crime in sports, criminal law protection of copyright and industrial property rights, counterfeiting, economic/financial crime, particularly through internships of students and regional Southeast European initiatives.*

*6. The programme management could explore the possibilities for joint/double degree programmes with institutions from the region or from the EU.*

## **2.5. Students**

The admission of students is organized in accordance with the rules and procedures applied at UBT College level, as highlighted in the SER. According to the SER (p.61), the management team considers admitting up to 50 students. The Regulation on the organization of master studies cover detailed explanation for the process of enrollment and the overall organization of the master study programs, such as the process and conditions of enrollment, the examination, assessment processes, and other regulative details in order to assure the quality of the master studies.

The target group that can attend this program covers all the students that have obtained a bachelor's degree in law and or another relevant qualification according to the Law on Higher Education, for a graduate program. Based on these rules by accomplishing studies in bachelor and master's degree, the students would acquire 300 ECTS.



According to the additional requested documents, specifically the requested *Table with a number of students for the last four years* (see bellow), the Law Faculty informed the expert about the number of students enrolled at the LLB program and the other LLM programs.

Tables of enrolled students submitted by UBT:

Number of first year students enrolled to LLB program in Pristina

Number of enrolled (admitted students) to first year	2017/2018	2018/2019	2019/2020	2020/2021
Law (LLB)	80	65	190	60

Number of total students enrolled to LLB program in Pristina.

Number of total enrolled students	2017/2018	2018/2019	2019/2020	2020/2021
Law (LLB)	300	315	420	385

Number of students enrolled in the first year per active LLM program

Number of enrolled (admitted students) to first year per active LLM program	2017/2018	2018/2019	2019/2020	2020/2021
International and European Business Law	17	25	29	34
Civil and Property Law	N/A	N/A	25	34
Computer criminology and forensics	N/A	N/A	20	22

Number of total students enrolled per active LLM program

Number of enrolled (admitted students) to first year per active LLM program	2017/2018	2018/2019	2019/2020	2020/2021
International and European Business Law	17	42	54	63
Civil and Property Law	N/A	N/A	25	59
Computer criminology and forensics	N/A	N/A	20	42



UBT College has developed a system for assessment, evaluation of the quality and for overall communication and dissemination of the information within the College. The students are using the system through which they can be informed about lectures, exams, exam submissions, results, learning materials uploaded by academic staff and others.

UBT College is dedicated to supporting ethical behavior, protection from plagiarism, and promotion of the importance of the uniqueness of the students` work. The plagiarism and the need to obtain plagiarism software was recommended in the previous accreditation process. The expert team acknowledged the Law Faculty for all realized activities in this regard and advise the Faculty to continue with their and explore different ways of expanding them.

The Study Regulations are covering the rights and the obligations of students. They are published on the College`s website. Specifically, the Study Regulations are covering the explanation about the students` assessments, different forms of teaching and studies and regulations, complaints, and appeals process in details.

Finally, the expert would like to highlight the need for more research work for the students.

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 5.1.</i> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organizing students` recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	x	
<i>Standard 5.2.</i> All students enrolled in the study program posses a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	x	
<i>Standard 5.3.</i> The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	x	
<i>Standard 5.4.</i> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	x	
<i>Standard 5.5.</i> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	x	
<i>Standard 5.6.</i> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	x	
<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	x	



<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	x	
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	x	
<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	x	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	x	

**Compliance level:** Fully compliant

**ET recommendations:**

- 1. The academic staff should motivate the students to be involved in their research and into using the internalization processes. The academic staff should promote research and internal exchanges opportunities among the students.*
- 2. The graduates and employers are highly satisfied by the respective program. The Faculty of Law should include them more frequently in the program, call them as presenters, student`s motivators, and even as ambassador of the respective program.*

**3.1. Research**

As noted in the SER (p.73) and as explained by the academic staff during the site visit, the scientific research in the Law Faculty is realized in three main dimensions: a) individual level - every professor conducts research as part of his academic career (scientific and/or applied research publications, conference presentations, projects engaged in the role of experts); b) institutional level (through 7 institutes); c) and the relation between the community needs and the service realized from the professors.

UBT's Research department manages the research funds, the internal administration of the performance-based Research Fund, and externally funded research from government agencies.

UBT promotes the academic integrity and prevents the plagiarism through platforms like TURNITIN, which is available to every student and each of the staff members The academic



council within the faculty prioritises in particular empirical research in order to increase publication productivity, influence and competitiveness in the short-term future.

From the interviews with the academic staff, it was evident that the criminal law research in UBT could be enhanced as a project area. This refers to scientific projects that could be stimulated with the other complementary areas from other UBT Faculties. While applicative projects are present, realisation of research projects could be enhanced. Criminal law as a research topic should be also present at equal level at areas such as constitutional law, administrative law, EU integration and other areas such as international law and political sciences.

SER (p.84-86) mentions not sufficient fund sources for research from the public budget. It also states that scientific activities are conducted mostly in individual level and scopes.

UBT has a consistent policy for promoting the academic integrity and prevent the plagiarism through platforms like TURNITIN, which is available to every student and each of the staff members.

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	Partly	
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	x	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	x	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	x	



Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	x	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	x	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	x	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	x	
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	x	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	x	
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities		

**Compliance level:** Substantially Compliant

**ET recommendations:**

1. *Strengthening research projects initiatives in legal areas where criminal law studies would contribute for application of scientific results in the society of Kosovo, such as, juvenile delinquency, sports crime, counterfeiting and intellectual property piracy, cybercrime etc.*
2. *Intensification of access to on-line data bases for staff and students /additional subscriptions to online libraries/.*
3. *Boost interdisciplinary research with other university departments in terms of application of quantitative statistical methods (particularly multivariate) as an indispensable tool for criminal law related sociological and psychological disciplines.*
4. *Explore the possibilities for additional stimulus for staff to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.*
5. *Additional regional projects are an indispensable tool for the development of the program and UBT in general.*



### 3.2. Infrastructure and resources

UBT Campus has a modern infrastructure which provides the necessary space for studying and research. The SER SWOT strengths notes that it is the largest campus in Kosovo of 27,000 m<sup>2</sup> under construction modelled on a smart– city concept.

The UBT College Library consists of two separate spaces: the space where are located books and reading space. The UBT College Library has created an electronic catalogue, which allows readers to be informed about all the material that exists in the library and can make the request for remotely obtaining books. The library is supplied with books in various international languages. The publications that are usually obtained are from well-known international centres such as the Vienna University of Technology, Harvard University, Oslo University, Oakland University, Nice University. Also, there is a wide selection of literature specializing in the field of International Diplomacy and the corner of NATO and the international committee, which focuses particularly on the situation in recent years in Kosovo.

UBT also offers its students full access to libraries and electronic academic platforms such as J-store, EBSO, UBT Koha, Sage Journals, which provide students and staff the opportunity to be up to date with the recent developments regarding academic affairs.

As stated in the SER, the number of seats and the work groups for the Law Faculty is within the forecasts of 10% of the total number of students in the study program. Each academic year, and together with the other part of the faculty students, the number of seats in the reading room and study room meets the minimum requirement of 10%.

The law faculty has drafted a financial plan on the main income and expenses items. This financial plan is drafted for 3 following years (2020- 1 till 2022 – 2023).

One of the UBT features is the Centre for Transfer of Technology (CTT)- the purpose of this centre is to secure the intellectual property protection of students and UBT staff, but also to other people who need expertise.





UBT has the infrastructure to facilitate studies for people with special needs and fulfills the criteria for inclusion of special needs students into the learning process.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	x	
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	x	
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities. c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilization license; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	x	
<i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the specialty disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment	x	
<i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign specialty literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or specialty courses of recognized publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;	x	

25



e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		
<i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.	x	

**Compliance level:** Fully complaint

**ET recommendations:** /

## 1. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The overall evaluation of the standards of the study program that is subject of re-accreditation includes the following:

The expert team has a highly positive impression from the site visit to the Law Faculty during the process of accreditation of the Criminal Law (LLM). Due to the pandemic caused by the Covid-19, the site visit was organized through the digital tools. However, we must commend the Faculty for organizing the site visit and all meetings very smoothly. The expert team would like to thank all participants, that were part of the meetings during the site visit, for their honest approach and for providing the needed information for the study program.

In general, the expert would like to thank the management of the Faculty, the academic staff, and the graduates and their employers for their willingness and hard work-oriented into improving the quality of the study program and for conducting serious and sustainable steps for development of quality culture on the Faculty level.

It is highly appreciated that the management team is aware of the challenges and issues with which they are facing. What is more important is that they are exploring different ways to solve and overcome the current challenges.

There are certain components that should be strengthened, so that the Faculty can achieve a greater level of quality and to achieve its vision and mission and the LLM program to be in the same line with the European ones.



First, the academic staff should be upgraded with additional full-time professors with PhD and expertise in criminal law, as well as visiting professors in emerging and legal disciplines.

Second, regarding the educational process content supplementary innovative elements in the syllabuses would increase the programme adequacy to the specifics of the Kosovar labour market and the European and international tendencies in legal science.

Third, given the potentials of the academic staff and the labour market needs, there is a solid basis for enhancing regional activities, possibly through the support of the applicative/donor projects. *In this context the possibilities for joint/double degree programs could be explored.*

Fourth, concerning research, enhancing international cooperation, incentives for staff, interdisciplinary approach and enhanced application of multivariate quantitative methods in criminal law studies are recommended.

<b>Standard</b>	<b>Compliance level</b>
1.Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially Compliant
2.Quality management	Fully Compliant
3.Academic staff	Substantially Compliant
4.Educational process content	Substantially Compliant
5.Students	Fully Compliant
6.Research	Substantially Compliant
7.Infrastructure and resources	Fully Compliant
<b>Overall compliance</b>	<b>Substantially Compliant</b>



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

**In conclusion, the expert considers that the study program *Criminal Law LLM* offered by the Law Faculty under the UBT College is *substantially compliant* with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends *accrediting* the study program for a duration of *3 years* with a number of *25 (twenty-five)* students to be enrolled in the program.**

**1. APPENDICES (*if available*): N/A**

#### **Expert Team**

**Chair**

**Prof. Dr. Goce Naumovski**

**05.04.2021**

---

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)