



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

# UBT COLLEGE Bachelor of Management, Business and Economics Branch Campus - Prizren

## **ACCREDITATION**

## REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

13 April 2021, Riga





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

## Contents

TABLE	E OF CONTENTS	2
1. IN	TRODUCTION	3
1.1.	Context	3
1.2.	Site visit schedule	4
1.3.	A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	5
2. PR	OGRAM EVALUATION	5
2.1.	Mission, objectives and administration	5
2.2.	Quality management	9
2.3.	Academic staff	13
2.4.	Educational process content	18
2.5.	Students	23
2.6.	Research	27
2.7.	Infrastructure and resources	31
3. OV	/ERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	33
4. AP	PPENDICES (if available)	36





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1. Context

**Date of site visit:** 19<sup>th</sup> of March 2021

#### **Expert** Team (ET) members:

• Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika Apoga

## Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

#### **Sources of information for the Report:**

- Self-evaluation Report, 2020/21, Prishtina, Bachelor of Management, Business and Economics
- National Qualifications Framework
- KAA's Formal Policies, guidelines and regulations
- Course Syllabuses in Management, Business and Economics programme
- Staff CVs
- Annex (Code of Ethics; MBE Faculty Strategy; Partnership Agreements; UBT Code
  of Ethics to Students; MBE organisational chart; Scientific Research plan, Regulation
  for Students Complaints UBT; Regulation for Student Registration; Handbook of
  Student; Industry Board Members; Quality Assurance Regulation of the UBT; etc.)

#### Requested documents:

- Regulation of the maximum number of students in lectures and seminars/workshops
- Regulation for the Industrial Board involvement in the study process
- KPI for Academic Staff
- Module Handbook/Manual for 'Bachelor Thesis'
- Regulation for internship and list of Partnership agreements in the regions





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Most recent meeting minutes of the Faculty Council and Ethics Committee
- Link to Campus Video/ Physical Resources (e.g. via YouTube)

#### Received documents:

- Classroom Size and Facility Operating Procedures
- Quality Assurance Regulation of the UBT COLLEGE
- Bachelor Thesis Manual
- Declaration of Authenticity of the diploma thesis given by the candidate
- Graduation process at the faculty of management, business and economics
- KPI for Academic Staff
- UBT Internship Regulation- 2019
- UBT Partnership Agreements
- Meeting of the Faculty Council at the Faculty of Economics
- Minutes of the Ethics Committe
- Link to campus video Physical Resources

## Criteria used for program evaluation:

Standards & performance indicators for external quality assurance, Accreditation Manual, July, 2018; Triangulation criteria; Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impacts, Sustainability

#### 1.2. Site visit schedule

#### 19th March

09.00 – 09.40 Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated (no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion)

**09.45 – 10:45** Meeting with the heads of the study programme 1: Management, Business and Economics/ BSc – Prizren

10:50 – 11.50 Meeting with the heads of the study programme 2: Management, Business and Economics/ BSc – Peja





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

11:50 – 12:30	Lunch break
12.30 – 13:10 staff	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative
13.15 – 14.05	Meeting with teaching staff
14.10 – 14.50	Meeting with employers of graduates
14:50 – 15:00	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
15:00 – 15:10	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

No	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs		
1	Management, Business and Economics/ BSc (Accreditation) Prizren	Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga	Hashim Rexhepi	Nora Dushi Sadiku	Albulena Jahja
2	Management, Business and Economics/ BSc (Accreditation) Peje	Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga	Hamez Rama	Enver Krasniqi	Aferina Skeja

## 1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The SER doesn't provide this section.

## 2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

## 2.1. Mission, objectives and administration





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The establishment of the UBT Program of Management, Business and Economics in Prizren aims to provide the local community with the opportunity to access a modern study program aimed at promoting and enhancing the professional human potentials that help the development of the local economy, as well as filling the gaps related to skills and knowledge in management, business and economics for the needs of local companies.

The mission of the Program of Management, Business and Economics in the Prizren region is to apply excellence in teaching and scientific research, within a comprehensive student-centered environment. The main goal is to prepare graduates to be ready to take on responsibilities and to enhance their leadership role in business, professions, industries, public services and society at large. These statements are too general and can be applied to any program.

According to the SER, the philosophy of the program fits in with the guiding principles and mission statement of UBT, providing essential areas of study and providing a study offering that supports learning and internationalization in key areas of management, banking, insurance and entrepreneurship practice. By linking theory and practice to the learning process, studies allow the student to take ownership of their education, but it also helps the institution to further advance its mission statement. However, there is no mention of what the mission of UBT College is.

The curriculum of the program is designed in a way that during the first two years of study it offers the broad range of core subjects related to management, business and economics, while in the third year it offers three specializations:

- 1. Finance, Banking and Insurance;
- 2. Marketing and Sales and,
- 3. Management, Entrepreneurship and Innovation.

The program is Management, Business and Economics, while the expert sees Management and Business clearly, the Economics part is missing, since Finance, Banking and Insurance is also management. According to the expert, this program should have a title and a degree in Management and Business.

Regarding the consistency of the program with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area, no evidence-based information was provided in the SER nor during the site visit. In particular, no explicit





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

formulations which would link the intended learning outcomes of the program to specific level descriptors relevant to the program were provided.

With regard to the didactic and research concept, the SER contains very general statements on didactical approaches and research activities. Quite often the statements are rather abstract or normative statements without giving information how they implemented in the study program practically. Further information on how an important concept such as student-centered learning is implemented was not received.

Another important fact concerns the lack of information on the state and the usage of elearning and digital media in the SER. It is surprising that this approach was not mentioned at all in the didactic concept. It is also interesting to note that the didactic concept does not contain information about formats and procedures of assessment. Thus, main components of a well-balanced didactic concept which would be based on a coherent concept such as the Constructive Alignment approach are missing.

In addition, there is no information provided about the research concept and the description of the particular measures that would foster the involvement of students in research activities at the program level as well as on the course level. Finally, no concrete linkages were developed to relate teaching and research to each other.

From this perspective, the didactic and research concept consists of a cumulative enumeration of didactical terms and research objectives, however, they seem to be only loosely connected, which makes it difficult to regard it as an elaborated, overarching concept in its entirety.

In the annexes belonging to the SER and during the site visit, considerable information was provided on formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. According to the SER, all the relevant regulations, policies and guidelines are made available on the intranet or on the institution's website. However, only few of available documents on homepage are active. It can be assumed that program topics related to administration and quality assurance of the program as well as the interaction between teachers and students as subjects of academic rights and duties are developed, but only partly available to these groups.

In the meetings with the program directors, professors and students, the expert gained the impression that a good level of compliance with internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching and assessments in most of the relevant areas has been achieved so far. One major difficulty that was reported concerns the lack of a system for plagiarism





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

detection. In the meetings, expert was informed that there is no software for plagiarism detection in Albanian language and teachers handle this individually.

The information received about the procedures and intervals for reviewing policies and regulations are ambiguous. According to the SER Council meetings occur at least twice a semester, before the semester begins and at the end of the semester and discuss / review and make recommendations for the next semester. The council is responsible for implementing institutional policies and overseeing academic performance by reviewing student achievement and whether program objectives have been achieved.

Standard		nce
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.		X
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X partial	
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X partial	
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X partial	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of	X	
responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are		
reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light		
of changing circumstances.		

**Compliance level:** Substantially compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. The program mission should clearly define the intended learning outcomes at the descriptive levels of the European Framework of Qualification.
- 2. The study program should strive for a fundamental revision of the didactic and teaching concept concentrating on three priorities: (1) creating a coherent concept of student-centered teaching and learning, (2) integration of modern teaching practices, (3) visible integration of research at the program level and strengthening the linkages between teaching and research.
- 3. The didactic concept should take into account all relevant stages and elements of the teaching and learning process. This would include assessment approaches and choosing a coherent overarching concept or fundamental principles which align the main stages and elements of teaching and learning.
- 4. Fulfilment of evaluation standards must be substantiated through evidence-based, empirically testable statements, not normative statements.
- 5. Formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues should be publicly available.

#### 2.2. Quality management

The SER contains a description of how quality management at the college works and which instruments it contains. The MBE Quality Assurance Manual is based on UBT Quality Manual. The Program has a Quality Assurance Officer and Quality Assurance Sub-Committee that work in conjunction with UBT Quality Assurance Committee and Quality Manager.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

While it was stated in the SER, that the Program identifies its stakeholders (students, staff, internal and external stakeholders), as well as the key processes involved in the implementation of programs and services to students. The next step involves the evaluation of the performance against stated policies and objectives and identification of gaps and deficiencies. The final step involves a report and recommendations for Improvement Plan for activities and policies that could be taken in order to address the identified challenges. However, no evidence was provided on site how this is achieved practically and on which concepts or methodologies the quality assurance system of UBT is based on.

The quality assurance processes are designed to enhance service and program delivery and include review of quality procedures, governance, teaching and research at the Program, student admission, progression and graduation, staff selection, recruitment and development, student support services, physical infrastructure and equipment and public information

UBT has developed Procedures for the development and approval of new programs, courses and modules whose purpose is to ensure that the proposed program or their modification is in compliance with the mission, policies and strategic plan, and fulfils the identified need for industry, business or the local community and at the same time is in compliance with the policies and procedures of the Kosovo Accreditation Agency, European Standard Guidelines and other best practices of the European Higher Education Area. However, it does not provide a procedure for assessing student achievement in learning outcomes. The main problem here is that the syllabuses do not indicate learning outcomes according to the National Qualification Framework. The NQF requires that learning outcomes are specified in three categories – as knowledge, skills and competence. Such classification isn't used in Course Syllabuses and also the number of outcomes fluctuates from few (3) to several (15) with the same ECTS number.

QA procedures are implemented during the program life cycle to ensure the delivery of a superior and consistent product. These can be summarized under several interrelated steps: (1) Stakeholder Engagement, (2) Program Strategy and Plans, (3) Program Management, (4) Teaching, Learning and Research, (5) Program Human Resource Practice and Staff Development, (6) Public Information. Findings in the Annual Quality Assurance Report are summarized into an Improvement Plan for the subsequent year in the Program Annual Plan.

Survey data are collected, analyzed and used to compile periodic reports. As part of the quality assurance process, the institution implements regular surveys with students, staff and stakeholders. The survey data is collected, stored and processed in the institutional database. Advanced statistical analysis is performed to surface the main concerns, trends, correlations





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

and other descriptive variables. Their results are used in the context of internal quality management but are not published further. Accordingly, the transparency of these results is lacking.

In order to ensure a well-functioning quality system, UBT is continuously engaged in improving the quality assurance structures and procedures. The existing quality management framework is regularly reviewed in terms of the appropriateness and effectiveness. Taking into account internal and external guidance and recommendations, existing quality tools are systematically enhanced and optimized. At the UBT Level and MBE Program the improvement plan implements regular internal audits to ensure that its governance and quality assurance policy is effective and ensures continuous improvement. The procedure involves internal audit by the Governing Body, Periodic Institutional Audit and Management Quality Assurance Review.

Standard	Compli	ance
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	X partial	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

## Compliance level: Substantially compliant

## **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Establishment of alumni tracking and the corresponding integration into institutionalised surveys.
- 2. Discussion of the course evaluation results with the students.
- 3. Publication of the evaluation results from the general surveys should be available by public. In particular, make clear what changes have been brought about by evaluation results.
- 4. In quality evaluation, special attention should be paid to student learning outcomes.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 2.3. Academic staff

MBE Faculty has 70 teaching staff. For the Prizren Branch, there will be 28 academic persons assigned with teaching as shown in syllabuses and MBE will diversify teaching staff to ensure program delivery in terms of quality is similar delivered in the branch as well, substitution, diverse experience, and staff combination to bring unique experience from academia and industry to ensure student success.

According to Regulation for academic advancement of UBT academic staff the academic staff consists of:

- a) Professor;
- b) Assistant Professor
- c) Lecturer

However, how many teachers hold the position of professor, and how many other positions are not mentioned in the SER, and it is also impossible to understand from the resume of employees, since many lecturers call themselves professors. During the site visit and meetings with academic staff, the expert was informed that the contract is for 3 years and is usually prolonged. Also, in the SER is mentioned, that Staff contract extension as per contract article 4, page 7, the contracts are automatically extended for another three years if no party shows interest in contract termination prior contract expiration according to contract terms for both parties (The UBT and Staff). However, the expert did not get the impression that there is a clear policy on how contracts with academic staff are extended and what are the consequences of non-compliance with the faculty's requirements, for example, for the publication of scientific papers. Also, the Regulation for academic advancement of UBT academic staff doesn't provide the clear procedure of personal re-election.

According to the Statute of the UBT College, regular employed staff can only have one full time job, and is not eligible to engage in two full-time positions at any university, college, company, etc. Also, regular staff, who may be hired, elected or appointed to another public or private institution, have no right to be elected to the governing bodies.

According to the SER, more than 50% of the academic staff teaching at the bachelor level are full time staff. Professionalism and narrow field of study mean that most of the bachelor





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

lectures are covered by regular academic staff. As the program is planned to be open in Prizren, the expert doesn't have the possibility to check this fact and have to believe this statement.

Pursuing mainly new and motivated staff, the Program of Management, Business and Economics in Prizren offers conditions for its staff to participate in various development programs such as: training abroad, different workshops, seminars, mobility programs etc. The UBT statute supports these initiatives where the institution is obliged to provide appropriate conditions for scientific research and artistic creativity and to enable academic staff to achieve competitive results internationally.

The distribution of workload for academic and administrative staff is in accordance with the Program Council Workload Policy and is managed by the Dean of program. Some of the staff responsibilities are: preparation and delivery of lessons, seminars, exercises and other forms of lectures, preparation of university textbooks and relevant literature for study within the subject structure, supervision of seminars, workshops, mentoring in diplomas and administration of exams. In addition, among the assignments that academic staff must complete are student consultation hours, where each teacher must set a day within a week for student consultations.

The Year-End Review is a report that creates a record of staff productivity in the areas of research, teaching, service and administration. Student assessment of teaching quality is done through anonymous questionnaires coordinated by the quality assurance office. Upon completion of the evaluation process, the result is analyzed and distributed to the academic staff in order to enable them to see their evaluation. Their results are used in the context of internal quality management but are not published further. Accordingly, the transparency of these results is lacking.

Standard	Con	Compliance	
	YES	NO	





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<b>Standard 3.1</b> . Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X partial	
<b>Standard 3.2</b> . The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
<b>Standard 3.3.</b> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
<b>Standard 3.4.</b> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
<b>Standard 3.5.</b> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<b>Standard 3.6</b> . Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
<b>Standard 3.7.</b> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
<b>Standard 3.8.</b> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X partial	
<b>Standard 3.9</b> . Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
<b>Standard 3.10</b> . Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

## **ET recommendations:**

1. It's recommended to mention in the SER the number of professors in the academic staff, and increase it, as probably it's very small.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 2. Continue evaluating and improving the standards of quality of teaching and learning by addressing the following staff KPIs (Key Performance Indicators):
- Module monitoring processes and course team meetings (e.g. Course Committee);
- · Views of the External Examiners for the course/ programme/ individual module their visit and reports;
- · Student performance data, career progression and feedback from alumni;
- · Participation in Department Learning and Teaching events and conferences;
- · Peer observation of teaching as required (with development of appropriate observation criteria);
- · Staff appraisal in terms of identifying staff development requirements;
- · Staff membership of the educational and professional bodies;
- Staff involvement with learning and teaching research initiatives.
- 3. The Faculty should recognise that teaching observations/ peer-observations should be carried out throughout academic year on a multiple basis to obtain a full picture on one's performance. Also, in addition to teaching observations variety of other methods should be effectively deployed to fulfil performance management function in full (360° appraisal, line manager's observations, performance review meetings, etc). Teaching observation should be collaborative and centred around a professional and supportive dialogue. This can particularly be achieved when design of the process is informed by such criteria as planning, presentation, teaching approach and aids to share good practices in teaching (as well indicate one's performance). Finally, it is important to assess student response to one's teaching (e.g. general atmosphere, level of student engagement, etc.).
- 5. Nominate staff who can take lead on developing manuals/ teaching resources for Blended Learning Model in the light of current external challenges and transition to on-line learning model.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 2.4. Educational process content

According to the SER, the UBT principle guide follows strictly the Bologna system and Dublin descriptors regarding the qualification objectives. Every course is designed in such way that will contribute toward the main objectives of the program. First two year are designed to offer and equip students with general skills and competencies. However, the first years should provide knowledge as a base for skills and competencies. Whereas, in the third-year students may choose their concentration/specialization, where each course is designed to achieve specific objectives that will enable students to have adequate employment compatibly with their studies.

Analysis of Study Plan and Syllabus shows that it contains too many "Introduction" subjects, given the number of ECTS, these subjects should have the names "Macroeconomics", "Financial Accounting", "Microeconomics", "Human Resources". The "Investment and Financial Analysis" study course is not a good combination, both topics deserve separate study courses. The current subject contains more "Investments" with little financial analysis. The expert recommends changing it to "Investments".

The UBT follows the model of progressive differentiation of student's learning, components of the program are combined in a way that goes from general skills and competences to more specific advanced skills and competences that are related to the MBE. However, according to the National Qualification Framework, learning outcomes are to be specified in three categories – as knowledge, skills and competences. Such classification isn't used in Course Syllabuses and Study Program. Also, site visit meetings with academic staff and department members confirmed that such requirements do not exist. These categories are to be translated and listed in at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation (Standard 4.3 of KAA). The SER includes 7 learning outcomes for each specialization, but they are not classified as knowledge, skills and competencies. For instance, in the SER, Marketing and Sales specialisation will provide only knowledge, no skills and competences, as students will understand some issues connected to Marketing.

Standard 4.4. Each syllabus should include clearly: (i) Course description, (ii) Course objectives, (iii) learning outcomes, (iv) teaching methodology, (v) assessment methods, (vi) literature and (vii) as well as the learning plan of topics covered in each week of lectures. The Course Catalogue reflects learning outcomes in subjects (in Annexes), and the related Course





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Syllabuses check show that the "learning outcomes" are directly written in the subjects, however their number fluctuates significantly from 3 to 15 with the same ECTS. Moreover, during the site visit, the academic staff agreed that is should be better regulated how many learning outcomes should be mentioned. Although the teaching academic staff are great professionals in their own areas, it is becoming important to ensure the "learning outcomes" with classification knowledge, skills and competences, are written down for each subject in Syllabuses both for the deep understanding of students and professors. In addition, the literature **Syllabuses** should be divided Main Literature Additional/Supplementary literature, but at present this is all together, and the list of references is often too long.

The language of the program is the Albanian language, as result Standard 4.5. is not relevant.

The student-teacher relationship is very important to UBT, this is closely linked to transparency. In the syllabus of the course, the academic staff is obliged to list the learning outcomes and topics that will be taught in order to achieve the learning outcomes. Furthermore, the assessment process is designed to ensure that learning outcomes are achieved. Academic staff is required to explain in detail the syllabus to students in the first lecture and make the curriculum available to students through the Moodle so students are fully aware of expectations / assessments / course length etc.

In developing an overarching didactic concept, the College has adopted a Competency Based Approach in curriculum development. Program Learning Outcomes guide the teaching, learning and assessment methods. A variety of teaching methods employed across all departments offer possibilities for active learning. These include case studies, project work, problem-based learning and simulated learning. Site visits and practice placements are important features of the teaching and learning process. The expert noticed that several syllabuses include "Practice in industry" with total workload of 12 and even 24 hours (spending 1 or 2 hours every week) and teaching method- study visits. The expert did not receive a convincing answer as how it managed and the impression was that the classes were attended by industry experts, and not vice versa, as it should be. Opportunities for interactive learning are reinforced through project-based learning, case study analysis, visiting speakers, group work and e-learning. The use of these teaching methods is enabled by a favorable teacher-student ratio and small classes. The college emphasis on practical and relevant industry knowledge is a key feature of educational programs.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The policy of UBT in general and of the program of Management, Business and Economics considers internships and practical application a significant aspect and a supplement to theoretical (curricular) part of learning process. However, the study plan includes in the 6th semester -Project or -Internship program, no syllabus for the internship were provided. From the site visit the expert understood that the student could choose a project or internship. From UBT Internship Regulation the internship report is regarded as an exam that is evaluated with 15 ECTS, while according to Study plan it is only 6 ECTS. Also, in accordance with UBT Internship Regulation the internship report has to be assessed passed/ failed, from the point of view of the expert it should be valued with mark.

UBT have signed Memorandums of Understanding (MOU) with different stakeholders and provide professional support to their students so that they benefit from internships and practical work. Beside of exploiting MOUs and creating opportunities for internships, the college encourage all students to seek internship experiences on international organization where they can acquire, share and benchmark their knowledge and skills whilst gaining an international experience which nowadays is becoming a necessity to succeed in the labor market.

Standard	Compl	iance
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	Х	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		Х





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		х
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, <b>learning outcomes</b> , the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.		х
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	na	na
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	Х	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	Х	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	Х	





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	Х	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	Х	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ECTS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	Х	

**Compliance level:** Partially complaint.

## ET recommendations:

- 1. Include and reflect the issues of SER educational process content according to NQF, and standards of KAA
- 2. Remove the mistakes from the Syllabus as well as include all necessary elements (from general requirements up to didactics), with the use of technologies, etc.
- 3. Learning outcomes should be defined in three categories: knowledge, skills and competences, and their quantity should be regulated, since each learning outcome must subsequently be achieved.
- 4. The expert recommends implementing a more systematic approach to assure the achievement of learning outcomes on a yearly basis. This could be done by the Study Programme Management or an independent group within the faculty or the HEI.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 5. It is strongly recommended to include internship as obligatory requirement to graduate and include it as separate subject with credit points in Study Plan, syllabus and UBT Internship Regulation should be adjusted accordingly.
- 6. It is recommended to review the study courses titles and their contain. For example, too many "Introduction" subjects, given the number of ECTS; also some subjects, for example, "Investment and Financial Analysis" should be reconsidered.
- 7. It is strongly recommended to divide the literature into Main Literature with 1- max3 main study books and Additional/Supplementary Literature.

#### 2.5. Students

The study program is open to all citizens of Kosovo and foreigners without any distinction, having a high school diploma or equivalent school (Level 3A according to International Standards for the Classification of Education (ISCED) that allows the candidate to fulfil the university registration requirements. Also, the program is open for transfer of students from various local or foreign universities, in terms of making sure they are licensed and accredited by relevant institutions. Recruitment of candidates is done according to officially accepted procedures at institutional level and in accordance with the provisions of the Statute and the Law on Higher Education. Interested candidates complete the application for registration by attaching the necessary documents and submitting them to the Student Service Office.

Applications are considered on a case-by-case basis within the timeframe set for all students. In addition, from the information provided on the home page, all courses must be completed with a grade of 3 or better, otherwise the applicant should go through the exam. Unfortunately, no further information about the exam and case-by-case approach was provided, as a result, the expert was unable to assess the comprehensibility of the applied system when searching for suitable candidates.

Teaching is provided through interactive lectures, seminars and individual lessons. According to the SER, it is common practice to give a lecture and two exercises every week, as supported by the curriculum, but no evidence of actual classroom load was provided. In addition, there is a contradiction with another SER statement that, the usual student workload of theory vs. practices is applied at 60/40. Participation in the seminars is compulsory, however, what will happen if the student does not attend the seminars is not clear. Moodle's electronic platform makes professor-student communication much easier.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

SER does not provide information on Standard 5.3. according to the size of the study groups for lectures and seminars.

All results obtained by students during all study cycles are certified by academics' records. Based on the annual UBT alumni survey data, most students operate and work in the following areas: they have established their own businesses; continued to set up a family business, obtained managerial positions in SMEs; have taken up positions as consultants in various fields; have taken up positions as researchers or leaders in the public sector; banking and insurance and continue to pursue further doctoral studies at other international universities.

Program maintains a list of student records, especially those with special abilities, such as: exam log, application, list of students taking the exam in the given exam period, exam report, student logbook, student files containing information on students' re-examination activities and final grades earned during these activities. Exam registration and applications are administered using the Student Management Information System (SMIS). Documents related to student exam application and exam results are kept forever, while colloquium documents are stored for three years.

The Program maintains a list of student records: examination register, application, list of students taking the examination in the given examination period, examination report, students' logbook, student files containing information on students' re-examination activities and final grades earned during these activities. The Examination Log and applications are administered using the Student Management Information System (SMIS). The documents related to student exam application and examination results are kept indefinitely while colloquium documents are stored for three years

According to the SER, the UBT, dealing with diploma works, applies a software which evaluates the originality or piracy of the work. Overall, UBT has now established an internationally recognized website, where their students' works will be posted and publications published once is not possible to be published again. With this initiative, the originality of students' work has come to light. Antiplagiarism software tracking system are now applied (Turnitin software). However, a site visit revealed a different current situation, the lack of official software to check plagiarism of work, and the individual responsibility of the academic staff to provide it.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

In accordance with SER, all rights and obligations of students are public and very transparent. They are promoted and applied equally to everyone. They are regulated by statute and must be respected by the students. Many of the regulations that include student obligations are published on the website, however, only few of published regulation on home page are active and available to users.

In the college's own SWOT analysis, a number of points have already been mentioned which the college should also pursue itself.

Standard	Standard Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.		X
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program posses a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.		X
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		X
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X partial	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Partially complaint.

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. A clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment should be provided.
- 2. The procedure for dividing students into smaller groups for lectures and seminars to achieve learning outcomes should be clearly indicated.
- 3. The expert highly recommends introducing the identification of plagiarism as a compulsory procedure not only for thesis, but for all graded course works at the faculty.
- 4. It is highly recommended to provide public access to the rights and responsibilities of students.
- 5. Ensure active involvement of students into the joint research activities and publications with professors.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 2.6. Research

The objectives of the UBT institutional research strategy relate to the establishment of research centers, promote the development of research and group activities to maximize opportunities for research groups, create the right critical level, improve and build relationships and partnerships with stakeholders in industry, academia and the public sector, to increase the combined research capacity and foster the transfer of knowledge and technology from the college, creating an integrated quality research and study framework in line with the best international practices, support programs in delivering research and strengthening the link between research and teaching. According to the SER, the research activities of the MBE program are carried out on the basis of the UBT Research Center for Economics and Strategy. In addition, the expert found on UBT Research and Innovation homepage also Business Administration Research Center, that also researches the topics of the MBE program. The study program has defined the research priorities too broadly, it should only focus on a few priorities, usually no more than five.

UBT homepage section: Research and Innovation consists from nine subsections, including Research and Innovation Strategy, UBT Research Policy and Regulation, UBT Institutes, Research Centers, etc. It would be necessary to create a separate research section on the Faculty homepage: Priority research directions for each Department; Journals, Conferences etc.

According to their contracts, UBT academic and research staff members are required to make 2 publications every year. Moreover, as stated in the SER, the staff is not given more than 10 hours of teaching load on average. This is considered as 20 hours of total work load. Given the fact that academic staff members work 40 hours per week, they have 20 hours of working time for research and other duties during academic term. The Human Resources department along with research support office has been working on a research performance evaluation system that UBT will use as a performance measurement tool in the upcoming years. The discussion with academic Faculty members during the site visit showed that academic staff is informed about the criteria for evaluating and promoting staff and considers them achievable. In addition, the academic staff confirmed that staff is not given more than 10 hours of teaching load on average.

In accordance with the SER, to meet Standard 6.3 requirements, the academic council of the MBE department recognizes research as:





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Publications in the indexed journals, books and book chapters
- Conference participations and publishing in the proceedings.

However, it does not indicate which indexed journals are counted, it is only Scopus and WoS, or also others like EBSCO, etc; or the faculty introduced their own list of accepted journals and publishing houses. In *Regulation for academic advancement of UBT* is mentioned some regulation as the Administrative nr. 01/2018, Principles concerning the recognition of platforms and international journals with review, but it was not provided to the expert. Taking into account the above, the expert recommends focusing on the quality of publications, rather than quantity, there is no need to request 2 low-quality publications annually from the academic staff.

UBT tracks the publications of the academic staff through UBT knowledge center repository. UBT knowledge center contains all the academic output generated through UBT conferences. In order to keep track of the staff publications in other platforms UBT has established a electronic system called RIIMS which is a tracking mechanism where staff can input all the scientific publications regardless where they are published. The academic staff are specifically recruited taking their research priorities into consideration that their teaching and research activities cohere with each other.

MBE department organizes an annual conference every year and encourages its staff members to make presentations and publish in the book of proceedings of the conference. According to SER, in 2020, the online conference of MBE department attracted academicians of the field both from and outside the region. There were 72 abstracts submitted to the 9th UBT International MBE Conference 31 from which were presented, while the number of full papers was 29. The MBE staff was encouraged to present their papers and publish them in case they are selected by peer reviewers in proceedings that are published in ISBN, ISSN scientific journals. The expert revised 2019 proceedings and noticed that the common template for paper formation is missing and many articles were of low scientific quality.

Unfortunately, the SER doesn't provide information about the subscription to science databases to promote the research, except online library access to Jstore, Sage, Ebsco. It is recommended to look for the EU projects to obtain financing for the purchase of databases as Scopus and WoS, as well as data access as Orbis, Market Line etc.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

SE report didn't provide information for the standard 6.3.: clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.

The list of publications provided by UBT is of very low quality, many articles are missing for years, publishers, pages; conference presentations are also included in the list by some individuals. Statistics on the number of published works of academic staff shows that majority of academic staff members and researchers haven't produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication per year for the past three years (2020, 2019 and 2018), having only 2 papers (for example, Afërina Skeja, Albulena Jahja-Lubishtani, Bashkim Nurboja, Ermira Shehu etc) or zero papers (Ardian Uka). In the SER, the MBE department motivates academic and research staff to achieve the goal of making at least two publications as stated in their contracts. However, reality shows that even one publication per year has failed so far.

UBT in general pays significant attention to transparency that, every staff member is expected to publish under the name of UBT and they are encouraged so. Staff members are required to post their publications on the platforms like Google Scholar and Research Gate.

According to the SER, the students of MBE department are encouraged in research projects and other research activities like conference presentations and publications. There were several paper submissions by students in the UBT international conferences from 2012. Moreover, students were involved in research clusters like compatibility analysis of Kosovo as well. However, no evidence of this statement was provided.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research	X	
objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary		
program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the		
institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for		
achieving the proposed research objectives.		
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and	X	
scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these	partia	
expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	Î	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as		X
research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the		
field of study of the program.		





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X partia	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	X partai 1	

Compliance level: Partially complaint

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. It is recommended to develop targeted research priorities showing focused MBE specialization in several areas with a limited number.
- 2. Create separate faculty home page with Research section, identifying Priority research directions for each Department; Journals, Conferences etc.
- 3. It is highly recommended to introduce clear criteria for recognized publications and reduce the number of required publications annually based on the ranking of journals and proceedings.
- 4. It is strongly recommended to improve the quality of collected information by using one template for CV, publication list, presentations at the conferences.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 5. Networking with international universities in the organisation of conferences.
- 6. Stimulate students to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.
- 7. Apply for projects to get funding for databases as Scopus, WoS, Orbis, Market Line etc.
- 8. The program should develop and implement measures for better involvement of students in research activities.

#### 2.7. Infrastructure and resources

The proposed facility in Prizren meets the standards to conduct and expand our operations. The labs, library, program and student office support provides sustainability of the program. The branch in Prizren will apply similar activities as those in Prishtina to enhance and strengthen its activities in research, projects with industry and unviersity partners around the world, *etc*.

Regarding to Strategy implementation through years, there is a financial plan that demonstrate sustainability of the study programs having in mind short term objectives and long-term strategic objectives. The number of students at MBE has been increased steadily despite the fact that other colleges have declined and are unable to maintain their stability. SER provides a reasonable budget for income and expenses for the next three years; however, it was not specified how many students it is based on, most likely a maximum of 200 people. It would be necessary to calculate the critical number of students that would make the program profitable.

The premises that will be used for the program submitted for evaluation is rented and is suitable for the learning process. UBT management tracks the needs for adequate facilities, inventories, teaching and learning spaces, computer services, software, libraries and reading rooms on each campus related to curriculum and curriculum activities. The utilized software are those from generic Microsoft package – Office, SAP (authorized licenses), Accounting software, SPSS, Stata etc. They are available at the premises of UBT. The libraries are set inside the facility and available space.

The number of seats in the lecture, seminars and laboratories rooms is satisfactory and in adequate level regarding to study program needs. Labs space usually have between 20 to 30 seats. Lectures are organized depending on the needs of the groups and are from 50 - 60 seats





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

for students of the MBE program. Typically, the lecture size is split into half for practical exercises to ensure adequate interaction.

In accordance with the SER, the program expects about 200 students in the first year, so the number of seats in the reading room (45 seats) and in the group work rooms meets the minimum requirement of 10%.

According to the SER, UBT has a library of about 250,000 titles featuring significant and rich resources, including online (Jstore, Sage, Ebsco) which cover the disciplines within the curricula. Nevertheless, how many book titles are available in the Prizren library is not specified. Students can also refer to the materials available on the Moodle platform provided and adapted by professors for their needs. The teaching staff is required to provide available reference books and corresponds to the course content - including some of the books present in the UBT library. However, the specified requirements of Standard 7.5c, d, e have not been clarified, as a result the expert estimates it as "No Compliance".

UBT-Prizren has the infrastructure to facilitate studies for people with special needs.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:  a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and	X	
laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups,		
subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in		
the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.		
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the		X
study programs:		
a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the		
total number of students in the study program;		
b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10%		
of the total number of students in the study program;		
c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature,		
enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50%		
should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers,		
from the last 10 years;		
d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as		
to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective		
discipline is provided for;		
e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications		
and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation	X	
of the program is adapted to students with special needs		

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Develop the list of free library resources to all categories of users (from students up to professors). Prepare the additional source of information like the Guide to Free Online Library Resources.
- 2. It would be necessary to calculate the critical number of students that would make the program profitable.

#### 3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The Expert would like to commend the programme development team for their proactive engagement with the expert during the validation event. There was a very strong sense of teamwork and ownership exhibited by the programme development team. It is evident that a good level of care and attention has been given to the (re)design of the programmes for the upcoming cohorts of students. Having considered the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme development team, the accreditation expert recommends the following:





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard	Compliance Level
Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
Quality management	Substantially complaint
Academic Staff	Substantially complaint
Educational Process content	Partially complaint
Students	Partially complaint
Research	Partially complaint
Infrastructure and resources	Substantially complaint
Overall Compliance	Substantially complaint

The overall compliance is assessed by the expert at the level of **Substantially Compliant.** However, the SER report should include more detailed information on compliance with the standards, fulfilment of evaluation standards must be substantiated through evidence-based, empirically testable statements, not normative statements. The expert spent a lot of time looking for confirmation on the college homepage when it should be included in the report. Moreover, the following recommendations need to be considered in relation to programme accreditation:

1. A number of grammatical, translation, spelling and formatting errors have been recorded across all sections of original self-evaluation report; this often impeded understanding and could raise further questions. It is important for the institution to verify that the report is





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

written as a third-person narrative, i.e. without using 'we' or other pronouns, and that all comments are written with the consistent choice of grammatical tense. As a third-person narrative, the comments and observations should have a neutral tone throughout.

- 2. It is strongly recommended that the program develops a differentiated catalogue of intended learning outcomes which is complemented by significant explanations how these learning outcomes and the competences to be acquired by students relate to the relevant descriptor levels of the European Qualification Framework.
- 3. For achieving greater publicity about Faculty research activities, it is recommended that a separate faculty home page with Research section, identifying priority research directions for each specialisation is created. Information about student opportunities for applying for independent research grants and funds from the external donors should be included into the same dedicated area; as well as clear policies for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program are provided.
- 4. It is recommended to develop targeted research priorities showing focused MBE specialization in several areas with a limited number.
- 5. It is strongly recommended to include internship as obligatory requirement to graduate and include it as separate subject with credit points in Study Plan, syllabus and UBT Internship Regulation should be adjusted accordingly.
- 6. The expert highly recommends introducing the identification of plagiarism as a compulsory procedure not only for thesis, but for all graded course works at the faculty.
- 7. Work more actively and with a long-term plan for attracting teaching staff abroad.
- 8. Formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues should be publicly available.
- 9. The didactic concept should take into account all relevant stages and elements of the teaching and learning process. This would include assessment approaches and choosing a coherent overarching concept or fundamental principles which align the main stages and elements of teaching and learning.
- 10. Establishment of alumni tracking and the corresponding integration into institutionalised surveys.
- 11. In quality evaluation, special attention should be paid to student learning outcomes.





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 12. It's recommended to mention in the SER the number of professors in the academic staff, and increase it, as probably it's very small.
- 13. It is recommended to review the study courses titles and their contain. For example, too many "Introduction" subjects, given the number of ECTS; also some subjects, for example, "Investment and Financial Analysis" should be reconsidered.
- 14. It is strongly recommended to divide the literature into Main Literature with one- max three main study books and Additional/Supplementary Literature.
- 15. It is highly recommended to introduce clear criteria for recognized publications and reduce the number of required publications annually based on the ranking of journals and proceedings.
- 16. It is strongly recommended to improve the quality of collected information by using one template for CV, publication list, presentations at conferences.
- 17. Apply for projects to get funding for databases as Scopus, WoS, Orbis, Market Line etc.
- 18. The program should develop and implement measures for better involvement of students in research activities.

In conclusion, the Expert considers that bachelor of science in Management, Business and Economics study programme (Full Time form) offered by the UBT college branch campus Prizren is Substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation Manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the above study programme for a duration of 3 years with 70 students to be enrolled on the programme.

## 4. APPENDICES (if available)

- 1. A
- 2. B
- 3. C

#### **Expert**





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Member

Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga

(Print Name)

**13.04.2021** (Date)