



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

UBT COLLEGE
Master of Management, Business and Economics
Branch Campus - Peja

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

01 July 2021, Riga



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo

Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	5
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	5
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration	5
2.2. Quality management	9
2.3. Academic staff	13
2.4. Educational process content	18
2.5. Students	23
2.6. Research	27
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	31
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	34
4. APPENDICES (<i>if available</i>)	37

2



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 28th of May 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga

Ms. Asnate Kazoka

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA

Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation

Ilijane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-evaluation Report, 2020/21, Prishtina, Master of Management, Business and Economics*
- *National Qualifications Framework*
- *KAA's Formal Policies, guidelines and regulations*
- *Course Syllabuses in Management, Business and Economics programme*
- *Staff CVs*
- *Annex (Code of Ethics; MBE Faculty Strategy; Partnership Agreements; UBT Code of Ethics to Students; MBE organisational chart; Scientific Research plan, Regulation for Students Complaints UBT; Regulation for Student Registration; Handbook of Student; Industry Board Members; Quality Assurance Regulation of the UBT; etc.)*

Additional documents requested by the ET:

- *List of teachers who will be involved in the teaching process with the subjects taught for the MSc. in Management, Business and Economics at the Peja branch.*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- *Study plan and syllabuses for MA programmes “Marketing and sales “ and “Procurement logistics and management”.*
- *Amount of students on current UBT programs in MBE in different branches.*
- *Regulation of the maximum number of students in lectures and seminars/workshops*
- *Regulation for the Industrial Board involvement in the study process*
- *KPI for Academic Staff*
- *Module Handbook/Manual for ‘Master Thesis’*
- *Regulation for internship and list of Partnership agreements in the regions*
- *Availability of own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature in Peja branch for implementation of MBE study programme (titles and quantity of each title)*
- *All quality assurance reports for the Faculty for Management, Business and Economics for the year 2020 and year 2021*
- *Detailed admission requirements for MBA in Peja*
- *Organogram of UBT Peja branch with names and job positions of all administrative employees employed by the Peja branch and planned to be employed with the establishment of MBA study programme*
- *Templates of all quality assurance surveys (questionnaires) used in UBT*
- *Information on complaints and appeals cases in the Faculty for Management, Business and Economics in the year 2020 and 2021 (if any) – what was the content of complaint and what was the decision*

Received documents:

- *MBE Teaching Staff at Peja Branch for Master Program*
- *Study plan and syllabus*
- *New registered students for 2020/2021*
- *Regulation of Classroom Size and Facility Operating Procedures for 2019/2020*
- *Industrial Board Reference*
- *Quality Assurance Regulation of the UBT COLLEGE*
- *Key Performance Indicators for Academic staff*
- *Framework for MA Thesis*
- *Master graduation process*
- *Career Center and its services*
- *UBT Internship Regulation*
- *UBT Partnership Agreements*
- *MBE book register*
- *Semestral reports 2020/21*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- *Staff evaluation report*
- *Brief summary of the academic staff evaluation by students*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards & performance indicators for external quality assurance, Accreditation Manual, July, 2018;*
- *Triangulation criteria;*
- *Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impacts, Sustainability*

1.2. Site visit schedule

09.00 – 09.50	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated (<i>no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion</i>)
09.55 – 10:40	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
10:40 – 11.30	Lunch break
11:30 – 12:30	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
12:35 – 13:20	Meeting with teaching staff
13:25 – 14:10	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
14:10 – 14:20	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
14:20 – 14:30	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

No	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs		
1	Management, business and economy/ MSc Peja (Accreditation)	Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga Ms. Asnate Kazoka	Ardian Berisha	Enver Daci	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The University for Business and Technology (UBT) is a private University in Kosovo. UBT was licensed to operate as a private bearer of higher education by the Ministry of Education in 2004. It was built on the experience of the Institute of Enterprise Engineering and Management (IEME), which was founded in 2001. The UBT Website lists several locations and branches, and within the infrastructure is apparently housed one of the largest libraries in Kosovo and over 80 laboratories. Thus UBT has a presence in several regions of Kosovo and also abroad, namely - UBT Prishtina Campus, (main Campus), UBT Lipjan Campus, UBT Prizren Campus, UBT Ferizaj Campus, UBT Peja Campus – Dukagjini College, UBT Gjilan Campus – Arberi College. There is also apparently an UBT Austria Office and UBT Hungary Office.

The SER states that “the main proposition of the UBT is to support Resilience and Sustainable Development of Kosovo”. Also “The philosophy of the Institution has been to offer competitive programmes in applied education that would base teaching on labour market demands and international practices”.

The Website shows that UBT operates a broad range of Bachelor and Masters level programs. There are currently around 17,000 students, the claim being that 98% of these enter the job market, Graduates of UBT being “leaders in entrepreneurship and new businesses, managers in the banking sector, public sector, information technology, engineering, architecture and construction”.

MA Management, Business and Economics is announced to be implemented at the UBT Peja branch which is located approximately 100 km from the capital Prishtina. The UBT Peja branch is currently undergoing an institutional accreditation process. According to the information provided by KAA, in early 2021 a newly developed BA Management, Business and Economics at UBT Peja branch was submitted for accreditation and will start operating once the Peja branch itself is accredited. In addition to the UBT Peja branch, Peja is also the home city of the Haxhi Zeka University - a large public university.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

According to the mission of UBT, it aims at providing competitive programmes in applied education that would base teaching on labour market demands and international practices. As

6



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

stated in the SER (p.5) the goal of the MA Management, Business and Economics is to contribute to the region with accessibility and variety of studies in this field. UBT has based its decision on the fact that a number of students from the Peja region are currently attending master's studies in Prishtina and the offer of local opportunities would reduce their study costs.

However, there are several contradictions in the strategic reasoning behind the establishment of the study programme.

UBT claims that there is no other study programme with specialisation in marketing management and project management currently offered in Kosovo. At the same time, UBT claims that the need of qualified specialists in marketing management and project management is the specific requirement of the Peja region. Even taking into account the ambition of specialisation expressed by the UBT, the actual specialisation is offered during one semester only and the rest of the study programme does not differ from a standard MA Management, Business and Economics that is offered elsewhere in UBT. This way it is not fully clear how one semester only, in addition to the semester foreseen for development of a master's thesis where no study subjects are taught, can deeply cover the requirements of the sector.

From the perspective of available resources and sustainability, the decision of establishing a BA and MA study programme in a new branch at the same time and offering a new specialisation in a branch rather than in the already existing main campus is not convincing.

When it comes to the compliance of the study programme with the general expectations of a master's level education, the SER included only a statement that the programme complies with EQF requirements but no other evidence was provided, for example, in the form of mapping the learning outcomes of the programme and the related study courses with the requirements of EQF. A number of the learning outcomes have been formulated and the titles of several mandatory subjects include “Advanced” thus suggesting that subjects provide in-depth understanding of these issues but due to the reasoning explained above the ET cannot conclude that advanced knowledge, skills and competencies are acquired in marketing management and project management.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

With regard to the didactic and research concept, the SER contains very general statements on didactical approaches and research activities. Quite often the statements are rather abstract or normative statements without giving information how they will be implemented in the study programme practically. As this is a MA study programme, the existence of a research concept that would be embedded in the study programme is crucial. However, there is no information provided about the research concept and the description of the particular measures that would foster the involvement of students in research activities at the program level as well as on the course level. There was also no evidence of any linkages that would be developed to relate teaching and research to each other.

According to the Accreditation Instruction for Accreditation of Higher Education Institutions in the Republic of Kosovo, the branch of an institution must demonstrate that it meets all the criteria and standards required for accreditation of study programmes at the centre or the main campus of the higher education institutions.

SER states that all the relevant regulations, policies and guidelines are made available on the intranet or on the UBT website.

According to the publicly available information, all the management representatives whom the ET met represented the Faculty of Management, Business and Economics (FMBE) and not the Peja branch. During the discussion they also confirmed that they represent the UBT central administration and not the Peja branch. Also the relevant strategic documentation provided to the ET for the purpose of accreditation of this study programme, for example, the MBE Strategy, indicates the development of the FMBE and not the branch. Therefore, while the ET is convinced that the FMBE is a well functioning entity, the ET did not receive any evidence that the Peja branch is an independent structural unit with its own goals and strategy rather than just a place for holding lectures.

The Albanian section on the Peja branch on the UBT website does not provide any information on the branch. The English section of the website provides more information and also lists the relevant regulatory documents. However, only a few of these documents have been actually published on the UBT website. In general, the situation creates an impression that the English website of the branch has been set up for the purpose of accreditation only. Also on the main website of the UBT only some regulations are available. The situation is the same both in English and Albanian.

8



The regulatory documents that the ET was provided and could access, indicate that the requirements set by the regulations are binding for the UBT staff and students and apply to all units of UBT, including the branches. Judging from the titles provided, all major issues of study programme implementation are covered by relevant regulations and, judging from the update status of some regulations, they have been updated very recently. The ET believes that these regulations are available on the intranet of the UBT and some of the interviewees also confirmed that they are aware of the content of certain documents. However, the ET would still raise the question about the accessibility and clarity of these regulations to all the involved parties and especially the way of communicating these regulations to the UBT Peja branch.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.		X



Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Ensure that the concept of the study programme is consistent*
- 2. Ensure that the study programme is compliant with the requirements of the Kosovo Qualification Framework and European Qualification Framework in regard to the level 7 and provides highly specialised knowledge, skills and competencies in marketing management and project management;*
- 3. Establish the didactic and research concept of the study programme and ensure that the programme content and teaching and learning mechanism is fully based on it.*
- 4. Ensure that the MA Management and Business Administration and the Peja branch overall are fully included in the UBT internal quality assurance system.*

2.2. Quality management

The UBT Quality Assurance Regulation states that the basic values in the mission of the UBT are academic excellence and assurance of high quality standards. However, from the Regulation and the mission statement the UBT concept of excellence is not clear, except that the education has to be relevant to the needs of the individuals and organizations in Kosovo. It is therefore recommended to develop a Quality Policy on the institutional level where the UBT statement on quality and the overarching principles would be listed.

The UBT Quality Assurance Regulation states the main quality assurance mechanisms related to different stakeholder groups and areas, procedures, roles of those involved,



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

reporting and data collection principles. However, the Regulation does not include information on each specific procedure that is carried out, its purpose and regularity and is not easy to navigate for operational use. It would be suggested to support it with an operational document (Quality Manual) specifying all separate procedures, their regularity, responsible persons and tools/forms that have to be used.

Although there are a number of different assessment mechanisms, from the information provided in the SER and during the visit, the ET did not obtain any evidence of staff self-assessment taking place in UBT or in UBT Peja branch. The Quality Regulation includes at least formal proof that there is staff assessment by peers and supervisors and staff assessment by students but no proof of self-assessment. The ET is aware that the UBT Peja branch is not operating yet but it would have expected to see such a process in the internal regulations.

The Strategy of FMBE lists a number of strategic objectives and some of them are directly related to quality assurance. However, the planning period indicated in the Strategy is not clear as the timeframe for completing all activities is 2021 - 2025 and in the annual plan all activities have been listed as continuing without fixed milestones. It is also not clear who and how monitors the implementation, what are the exact targets, what is the timeline, who is responsible and how the achievement of strategic objectives will be measured. The nature of a target foresees that the target has to be clearly measurable and indicate development over time.

The quality assurance mechanisms listed in the UBT Quality Regulation seem to cover all areas related to operation of the study programme. However, the surveys for employers and graduates seem to be missing, while mentioned in the SER. There is a stakeholder survey but it provides only a very general opinion on the UBT but not on the quality of specific study programmes.

The MA Management, Business and Economics is not implemented yet and the UBT Peja branch is not operational yet, therefore, in order to assess the general capacity for the execution of the survey mechanisms, the ET requested the samples for the FMBE.

The reports provided to the ET indicate that different indicators are monitored on the level of study programmes and these data are analysed. However, the reports do not include any analysis of the results of surveys for the UBT community and staff. Consequently, there is no evidence of any conclusions and/or suggestions that would have been collected and submitted for further actions and also no information on what actions have been taken as a result of these surveys. It is also not clear what are the internal targets related to these quality



assurance processes and their results and what are the expected targets (key performance indicators) of each study programme. Neither these reports nor other quality assurance reports for the FMBE were available publicly at the time of drafting the expert report.

The SER contains some, although general, information about the improvements made to the quality assurance arrangements. However, the nature of these improvements is not clear as some of them are related to UBT institutional policies rather than the responsibilities that fall under the FMBE or the Peja branch.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.		X
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.		X
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		X
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	-	-



Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	-	-
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	-	-
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.		X

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop Quality Policy on the institutional level;*
2. *Develop operational Quality Manual which would define the purpose, frequency and practical execution of each quality assurance procedure;*
3. *Introduce self-assessment for academic staff and survey mechanisms for employers and graduates;*
4. *Define key performance indicators on the study program level;*
5. *Incorporate the results of all questionnaires as well as the monitoring results of certain key performance indicators in the overall activity reports either on the program or on the faculty level and make them available publicly;*
6. *Produce analytic quality assurance reports that would include recommendations for the relevant parties within UBT;*
7. *Develop operational plan for achieving the goals listed in the Strategy for the Faculty of Management, Business and Economics;*

2.3. Academic staff

FMBE has 70 teaching staff. For the Peja Branch, there will be a number of staff assigned -19 and MBE will diversify teaching staff to ensure program delivery in terms of quality is similarly delivered in the branch as well, substitution, diverse experience, and staff



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

combination to bring unique experience from academia and industry to ensure student success.

According to Regulation for academic advancement of UBT academic staff the academic staff (**dated May 2019**) consists of:

- Assistant
- Lecturer
- Assistant Professor
- Professor (equivalent to Associate Professor)

However, how many teachers hold the position of professor, and how many other positions are not mentioned in the SER, and it is also impossible to understand from the resume of employees, since many lecturers call themselves professors. Moreover, academic staff which is mentioned in documents and the CVs are not engaged in the Peja Branch. They are full time staff of UBT main campus, which is located in Prishtina, and they are spending their workload there.

During the site visit and meetings with academic staff, the ET was informed that the contract is for 3 years and is usually prolonged. Also, in the SER it is mentioned that Staff contract extension as per contract article 4, page 7, the contracts are automatically extended for another three years if no party shows interest in contract termination prior contract expiration according to contract terms for both parties (The UBT and Staff). However, the ET did not get the impression that there is a clear policy on how contracts with academic staff are extended and what are the consequences of non-compliance with the FMBE's requirements, for example, for the publication of scientific papers. It was mentioned that the person may get less teaching hours and the opportunity to attend some courses and training, however, how long this might last is unclear. Also, the Regulation for academic advancement of UBT academic staff doesn't provide the clear procedure of personal re-election. During the site visit it was noted that since this year, the promotion of the teaching staff has become more active, however, this does not explain such a low number of assoc. and full professors. Also, mentioned in the SER requirements for publication recognition are low and could be very easily obtained.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

According to the Statute of the UBT College, regular employed staff can only have one full time job, and is not eligible to engage in two full-time positions at any university, college, company, etc. Also, regular staff, who may be hired, elected or appointed to another public or private institution, have no right to be elected to the governing bodies.

According to the SER, all the academic staff teaching at the master's level is the full-time staff. Most lectures are covered by full-time academic staff who are adequate and professional in the narrow field of study according to the specializations of UBT College.

In the SER is stated that the Department also offers training to academic staff on the development of pedagogical skills on the following topics: student-centered learning, curriculum design, writing learning outcomes, lesson planning, design and delivery, group learning, problem-based and project-based learning, E-learning, Assessment and integrating key skills into the curriculum. As part of the faculty Development College UBT supports the formation phase of junior faculty. However, what opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff in Peja isn't mentioned.

The distribution of workload for academic and administrative staff is in accordance with the Program Council Workload Policy and is managed by the Dean of program. Some of the staff responsibilities are: preparation and delivery of lessons, seminars, exercises and other forms of lectures, preparation of university textbooks and relevant literature for study within the subject structure, supervision of seminars, workshops, mentoring in diplomas and administration of exams. According to the SER statement, “among the tasks that an academic staff member must complete our consulting hours for candidates, where within one week each academic staff must maintain a consulting schedule of candidates for at least one day” each teacher needs to consult for at least one day, what means at least 8 hours per week. Which doesn't look realistic.

MBE Comments: This is a misinterpretation during translation loss of the meaning of the sentence by MBE staff. This refers to perform a consulting session during the week / they have to select a day, this would be around 30 to 60 minutes per week depending on the students needs this may also be extended and that would be up to the teacher determining the needs for an extra time. This schedule is sent at the beginning of the semester as soon as the lecture starts so students and teachers can plan their available schedule ahead in time.

15



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The ET took in consideration these comments, however, 30 minutes per week is not enough for full staff workload and how the academic staff provides the consultations with community service is still unclear.

Workload allocation information for each staff member is used as a source of information for promotion. However, neither in the SEA and the documents presented, nor during the visit, the ET found confirmation of this connection. In addition, each staff member is responsible for 40% of the teaching tasks, 30% of the administration, and 30% of the research, which is different from the SER table provided in 3.1.standard.

To maintain and enhance quality trends, staff evaluation forms are provided in the UBT College Statute, evaluating the quality of teaching by students through anonymous questionnaires coordinated by the quality assurance office. Upon completion of the evaluation process, the result is analyzed and distributed to the academic staff to enable them to see their evaluation. According to the SER the program management also evaluates the staff by monitoring “*the arrival and departure of the teaching process*”, publishing lectures on the Moodle platform, publishing the results on the electronic platform - SMIS, holding consultations, and taking into account additional students comments on the way of teaching, conducting and content of the course. The ET can’t understand what results are published on the electronic platform, as a result, the management evaluation process is unconvincing. Each staff member also makes a self-assessment questionnaire.

It’s stated in the SER that appropriate strategies for improving the quality of teaching are implemented within the academic units, as well as the responsible departments and branches (e.g.the Office of Quality Assurance), however, the ET did not find sufficient confirmation of the implemented policies and procedures to ensure compliance with 3.9. standard.

The Year-End Review is a report that creates a record of staff productivity in the areas of research, teaching, service and administration. Student assessment of teaching quality is done through anonymous questionnaires coordinated by the quality assurance office. Upon completion of the evaluation process, the result is analyzed and distributed to the academic staff in order to enable them to see their evaluation. Their results are used in the context of



internal quality management but are not published further. Accordingly, the transparency of these results is lacking.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	<i>YES</i>	<i>NO</i>
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X partial	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	



<p>Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.</p>	X	
<p>Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.</p>	X	
<p>Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.</p>	X partial	
<p>Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.</p>	X partial	
<p>Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.</p>		X



Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Partially complaint

ET recommendations:

- It's recommended to mention in the SER the number of professors in the academic staff, and increase it, as probably it's very small.*
- Continue evaluating and improving the standards of quality of teaching and learning by addressing the following staff KPIs (Key Performance Indicators):*
 - Module monitoring processes and course team meetings (e.g. Course Committee);*
 - Views of the External Examiners for the course/ programme/ individual module - their visit and reports;*
 - Student performance data, career progression and feedback from alumni;*
 - Participation in Department Learning and Teaching events and conferences;*
 - Peer observation of teaching as required (with development of appropriate observation criteria);*
 - Staff appraisal in terms of identifying staff development requirements;*
 - Staff membership of the educational and professional bodies;*
 - Staff involvement with learning and teaching research initiatives.*
- The FMBE should recognise that teaching observations/ peer-observations should be carried out throughout the academic year on a multiple basis to obtain a full picture on one's performance. Also, in addition to teaching observations, a variety of other*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

methods should be effectively deployed to fulfil performance management functions in full (360° appraisal, line manager's observations, performance review meetings, etc). Teaching observation should be collaborative and centred around a professional and supportive dialogue. This can particularly be achieved when design of the process is informed by such criteria as planning, presentation, teaching approach and aids to share good practices in teaching (as well indicate one's performance). Finally, it is important to assess student response to one's teaching (e.g. general atmosphere, level of student engagement, etc.).

4. *Actively involve academic staff not only into regular CPD and research activities but also consulting activities in terms of delivery planning and quality enhancement at the FMBE level.*
5. *Nominate staff who can take lead on developing manuals/ teaching resources for Blended Learning Model in the light of current external challenges and transition to on-line learning model.*

2.4. Educational process content

According to the SER, the UBT principle guide strictly follows the Bologna system and Dublin descriptors regarding the qualification objectives. Every course is designed in such a way that will contribute toward the main objectives of the program. The first year is designed to provide and equip candidates with general skills and competencies. In the third semester, candidates will have a specialization in “**Management, Entrepreneurship, and Innovation**”, where each subject is designed to achieve specific objectives that will enable candidates to have a suitable job following their studies. However, the specialization of this program is different. In addition, mentioned skills and competences are not connected with specialisation, they are general and can be applied to the management program as a whole.

Analysis of Study Plan and Syllabus shows that the content of specialisation **MARKETING MANAGEMENT** is identical to other specialization **MARKETING AND SALES** already offered by UBT. When asked by the ET about the difference between these two specializations during the site visit, the ET received the answer that the program in Peje will

20



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

be more focused on management rather than sales. However, the program study plan shows that both programs are identical. Given that the number of undergraduates in 2020/21 was low, it is impractical to offer 2 identical majors on the main campus and in Peja. With regard to the Project Management specialization, there are some similarities with the subjects of the Logistics and Procurement Management specialization, but the overall program is different. However, the ET recommends offering the Project Management specialization on the Main Campus given the strong industry demand for project management professionals. In addition, the curriculum for the Project Management specialization should be more focused on project management subjects and not overlap with the Logistics and Procurement Management specialization, which offers similar subjects such as Global Supply Chains and Logistics and Project procurement and contract management.

In the SER it is stated that the UBT follows the model of progressive differentiation of student's learning, components of the program are combined in a way that goes from general skills and competences to more specific advanced skills and competences that are related to the MBE. However, this statement is not supported by any facts or documents. According to the National Qualification Framework, learning outcomes are to be specified in three categories – as knowledge, skills and competence. Such classification isn't used in Course Syllabuses and Study Program. These categories are to be translated and listed in at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation (Standard 4.3 of KAA). The SER includes 7 learning outcomes for each specialization, but they are not clearly classified as knowledge, skills and competencies. SER doesn't reflect these issues of educational process content related to the most important issues like learning outcomes, qualification objectives, competences and skills. According to the SER, during the first year of the program, the candidate is expected to prepare in general terms at the academic and professional level, understanding the key academic and business principles, which is clearly insufficient for a master's level program.

Qualifications concerned with skills and competences are also not in place. This is a new area of the NQF. Qualifications may consist of modules which can be assessed and certified, and modules are expressed as learning outcomes. Kosovo's draft curriculum framework specifies six key competences for compulsory education (from Learning up to work competence). However, a clear list of competences and qualifications are absent in both Course Catalogue and Course Syllabuses.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 4.4. Each syllabus should include clearly: (i) Course description, (ii) Course objectives, (iii) learning outcomes, (iv) teaching methodology, (v) assessment methods, (vi) literature and (vii) as well as the learning plan of topics covered in each week of lectures. The Course Syllabuses check show that the “learning outcomes” are directly written in the subjects, however their number fluctuates significantly from few to 23 with the same ECTS. Moreover, during the site visit, the academic staff agreed that it should be better regulated how many learning outcomes should be mentioned. In addition, the **classification of teaching / learning methods** included in the program is incorrect, as lectures, group projects and workshops are not teaching methods, but a form. Although the teaching academic staff are professionals in their own areas, it is becoming important to ensure the “learning outcomes” with classification knowledge, skills and competences, are written down for each subject in Syllabuses both for the deep understanding of students and professors. Moreover, the curriculum lacks an explanation of how each learning outcome is tested, especially if some subjects have more than 20 of them. In addition, the literature in the Syllabuses should be divided into Main Literature and Additional/Supplementary literature, but at present this is all together, and the list of references is often too long. Some Syllabuses include **old literature**, for example, the subject that is vitally important for MA program ADVANCED RESEARCH METHODS uses a book that Patton, M. Q. (1990), the same is true for other subjects, as MANAGEMENT AND FINANCIAL ACCOUNTING (uses only one book, published in 2006), ADVANCED PROJECT MANAGEMENT and others.

The title of the subject MANAGEMENT AND FINANCIAL ACCOUNTING is misleading as it only covers management accounting topics.

The language of the program is the Albanian language, as result Standard 4.5. is not relevant.

The student-teacher relationship is very important to UBT, this is closely linked to transparency. In the syllabus of the course, the academic staff is obliged to list the learning outcomes and topics that will be taught in order to achieve the learning outcomes. According to the SER the assessment process is designed to ensure that learning outcomes are achieved. Academic staff is required to explain in detail the syllabus to students in the first lecture and make the curriculum available to students through the Moodle so students are fully aware of expectations / assessments / course length etc. However, explaining tasks to students is not enough to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes, especially since some subjects



define more than 20 learning outcomes. The ET advises to include a table in the Syllabus, where the type of test is indicated for each learning outcome.

The only provided explanation how UBT meets 4.7 Standard is “ Strategies of teaching are a choice of professors, and the institution provides resources according to the requirements of the academic staff to achieve the learning outcome.” The choice of teaching strategy must be approved by the pedagogical council or other responsible body, this cannot be assigned to the professors. “As part of the syllabus, the academic staff lists the resources required for teaching-learning. For example, if the professor needs an IT lab, the institution provides one, or if the course foresees a field trip, the institution provides the right vehicle”. Again, there is no general approach in Syllabus to defining course resources.

According to the SER, teaching at UBT is highly industry-related, if the subject has a practical part then lecturers can assist students in practical ways or they can assign tutoring to assist students. In some subjects, students need to write a reflection report about their practice. The ET noticed that several syllabuses include “Practice in industry” with a total workload of 12 and 15 hours (spending 1 every week) and teaching method- study visits. The ET did not receive a convincing answer as to how it managed and the impression was that the classes were attended by industry experts, and not vice versa, as it should be.

UBT have signed Memorandums of Understanding (MOU) with different stakeholders and provide professional support to their students so that they benefit from internships and practical work. Beside exploiting MOUs and creating opportunities for internships, the college encourages all students to seek internship experiences in international organizations where they can acquire, share and benchmark their knowledge and skills whilst gaining an international experience which nowadays is becoming a necessity to succeed in the labor market.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No



Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.		X
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		X
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.	X partly	
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes , the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	X partly	
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	-	-
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X partly	



Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.		X
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ECTS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		X
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: Partially complaint.

ET recommendations:

1. *Include and reflect the issues of SER educational process content according to NQF, and standards of KAA*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2. *Remove the mistakes from the Syllabus as well as include all necessary elements (from general requirements up to didactics), with the use of technologies, etc.*
3. *Learning outcomes should be defined in three categories: knowledge, skills and competences, and their quantity should be regulated, since each learning outcome must subsequently be achieved.*
4. *The ET recommends implementing a more systematic approach to assure the achievement of learning outcomes on a yearly basis. This could be done by the Study Programme Management or an independent group within the FMBE or the HEI. The ET also advises to include a table in the Syllabus, where the type of test is indicated for each learning outcome.*
5. *It is recommended to review the study courses titles and their content. For example, too many "Advanced " subjects, given the number of ECTS; also some subjects as "Management and Financial Accounting", "Advanced Research Method" should be reconsidered.*
6. *It is strongly recommended to divide the literature into Main Literature with 1- max3 main study books and Additional/Supplementary Literature.*
7. *It is recommended to offer the Project Management specialization on the Main Campus given the strong industry demand for project management professionals. In addition, the curriculum for the Project Management specialization should be more focused on project management subjects and not overlap with the Logistics and Procurement Management specialization.*

2.5. Students

According to the SER, the candidates for MA Management, Business and Economics could be attracted from Banking, Finance, and Accounting; Marketing and Sales; Entrepreneurship; Logistics and Procurement; Retail; Manufacturing; Public and Non-profit Sector, IT / Telecom and Consultancy. The graduates of these areas do not have equal preparation for in-depth studies in Management, Business and Economics therefore an entrance examination or at least a test for assessing the previous knowledge would be expected.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The Regulation for Student Registration provided to the ET states that study programmes are open to a public competition but does not specify the requirements for exact study programmes or the general approach how the applicants are rated. Also the SER and the supporting documents do not mention that there would be an entrance examination.

In the Regulation on Classroom Size and Facility Operating Procedures for FMBE it is recommended that the lectures would take place for 60 - 80 students and in large auditoriums for 80 - 120 students depending on the lecture type. The practical exercises are recommended for 50% of the lecture size but these numbers are not strictly fixed. These numbers have been defined both for the BA and MA levels. The ET assesses these numbers as generally feasible and appreciate the autonomy that is left to the teaching staff. However, as the MA study level is more specialised and requires more independent studies and specialised advice from the academic staff, it would be suggested to define smaller group sizes for the MA study level.

The Regulation on Bachelor Studies defines certain deadlines for the academic staff for publishing the exam results, depending on the number of the students in a group and at a request of the student the teacher is obliged to give to the student a written assessment of the exam.

The SER (p.57) states that after every midterm and final exam lecturers are obliged to organize consultation schedules with students, where students receive feedback on their assessment scores. However, neither the SER nor any supporting documents mention the existence of regular consultation sessions with the academic staff and how this will be provided in the UBT Peja branch.

The exam results are entered in the UBT SMIS platform while the results during the semester are recorded in the Moodle platform. The reports of FMBE provided to the ET confirm that the data on attendance, performance and completion rates are collected and analysed.

At the same time neither the SER nor the supporting documents include any evidence of flexible treatment of the students in regard to the examination results, attendance, selected assessment methods and other elements of flexible approach. There are no specific indicators that would have been defined on the study programme level and the reports provided for the FMBE in general do not show that the statistical data would be analysed in a systemic and comparative manner and any conclusions and suggestions for development would have been made.



There is a separate Regulation on Student Complaints that describes the possibility for contesting the marks and also the general procedures for submitting complaints related to any issues. The complaints procedure is described in a clear and comprehensive manner.

The SER states that plagiarism detection mechanisms are applied to the final thesis throughout the UBT. There are several manual mechanisms and currently also the Turnitin software is claimed to be in place. However, the ET is not able to assess the actual implementation of it in this study programme and also in the Peja branch in general.

The information about the student rights and responsibilities is included in the Statute. There is also a Student Handbook which generally includes valuable information but there is no reference to student rights and responsibilities. It would be suggested to communicate the student rights and responsibilities to the students in a friendly way through the Student Handbook and also include in the handbook links to any relevant legal documents, for example, the Regulation on Master Studies, if such document exists.

According to the SER (p.60) the transfer of candidates between higher education institutions, faculties, and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents based on the MEST statute, regulations, and administrative instructions. The UBT Statute states that provisions on the criteria for enrollment of new students and the provisions for admission of students transferred from other higher education institutions are done based on the Admission Regulation. However, the ET did not find any reference to such a document in the SER and also could not locate such document among the annexes provided.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.		X



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	-	-
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.		X
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	-	-
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	-	-
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.		X
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.		X

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

29



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1. *To introduce an admission examination for the MA Management, Business and Economics students and explain it clearly in Regulation on Admission or similar document;*
2. *Reduce the classroom sizes for master's level study programmes;*
3. *Define regular consultation hours for the MA Management, Business and Economics students at the Peja branch*
4. *Define the arrangements of flexible treatment of the students, for example, when a student could be allowed to take the exam at a different time without sanctions.;*
5. *Include student records among the key performance indicators on the study program level, regularly monitor them and include the results in annual reports on study programs;*
6. *Complement the Student Handbook with information about student rights and responsibilities and with links to relevant UBT internal documents.*
7. *Develop clear regulation of student transfer between study programmes in UBT and other higher education institutions.*

2.6. Research

The objectives of the UBT institutional research strategy relate to the establishment of research centers, promote the development of research and group activities to maximize opportunities for research groups, create the right critical level, improve and build relationships and partnerships with stakeholders in industry, academia and the public sector, to increase the combined research capacity and foster the transfer of knowledge and technology from the college, creating an integrated quality research and study framework in line with the best international practices, support programs in delivering research and strengthening the link between research and teaching. According to the SER, the research activities of the MBE program are carried out on the basis of the UBT Research Center for Economics and Strategy. In addition, the ET found on UBT Research and Innovation homepage also the Business Administration Research Center, that also researches the topics of the MBE program. However, **the study program hasn't defined scientific/applied research objectives, it uses the general research objectives of the FMBE.** According to the SER, *“The objectives and methods applied by UBT in Prishtina will be replicated to the UBT*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

branch Peja by adapting it to the regional needs.” During the site visit, the ET asked about the research needs of the Peja region, but did not receive a convincing answer.

UBT homepage section: Research and Innovation consists of nine subsections, including Research and Innovation Strategy, UBT Research Policy and Regulation, UBT Institutes, Research Centers, etc. It would be necessary to create a separate research section on the FMBE homepage: Priority research directions for each Department; Journals, Conferences etc.

According to their contracts, UBT academic and research staff members are required to make 2 publications every year. Moreover, as stated in the SER, the staff is not given more than 10 hours of teaching load on average. This is considered as 20 hours of total workload. Given the fact that academic staff members work 40 hours per week, they have 20 hours of working time for research and other duties during academic term. The discussion with academic staff members during the site visit showed that academic staff is informed about the criteria for evaluating and promoting staff and considers them achievable. In addition, the academic staff confirmed that staff is not given more than 10 hours of teaching load on average. Nevertheless, according to the SER, the Human Resources department along with the research support office has been working on a research performance evaluation system that UBT will use as a performance measurement tool in the upcoming years, as a result the Standart 6.2 is only partly achieved.

In accordance with the SER, to meet Standard 6.3 requirements, the academic council of the MBE department recognizes research as:

- Publications in the indexed journals, books and book chapters
- Conference participations and publishing in the proceedings.

However, it does not indicate which indexed journals are counted, it is only Scopus and WoS, or also others like EBSCO, etc; or the FMBE introduced their own list of accepted journals and publishing houses. In *Regulation for academic advancement of UBT* is mentioned some regulation as *the Administrative nr. 01/2018, Principles concerning the recognition of platforms and international journals with review*, but it was not provided to the ET, as a result the ET can't confirm the existence of established clear policies for defining recognized as

31



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

research. Taking into account the above, the ET recommends focusing on the quality of publications, rather than quantity; there is no need to request 2 low-quality publications annually from the academic staff. MBE Comments regarding journals/ advancement provided to the ET contains the extract from the regulation: **General criteria for academic titles**, which indicates that lectures and assistants have no publication requirements.

The ET believes that the majority of academic staff have a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching (*Standard 6.4.*), however, some academic staff (for example, Fidane Spahija – Gjikolli, Arbiana Govori) lack publications on teaching topics. At the same time, Enver Dachi and Ardian Berisha, both in charge of this program, were not included in the publication list, and no information on renewals of their contracts was provided in SER either. From Ardian Berisha's CV, the ET concluded that Ardian Berisha had not had any publications for the last 3 years, the CV is provided only in Albanian. In addition, his previous publications have little to do with the subjects he intends to teach: Advanced Operations Management and Advanced Project Management. Information about Enver Daci's publications is incomplete, only titles and conferences are mentioned, which makes it difficult for the ET to assess its scientific value. No information for Kozeta Severani was provided.

UBT tracks the publications of the academic staff through the UBT knowledge center repository. The UBT knowledge center contains all the academic output generated through UBT conferences. However, the repository does not contain the publications of the staff that are generated on the other platforms. That is why the research support office tracks the publications manually as well. The academic staff are specifically recruited taking their research priorities into consideration that their teaching and research activities cohere with each other.

The MBE department organizes an annual conference every year and encourages its staff members to make presentations and publish in the book of proceedings of the conference. According to SER, in 2019, the conference of the MBE department attracted academics of the field both from and outside the region. There are 68 abstracts submitted for the 8th UBT International MBE Conference, while the number of full papers was 47. The MBE staff was encouraged to present their papers and publish them in case they are selected by peer reviewers in proceedings that are published in ISBN, ISSN scientific journals. The ET revised 2019 proceedings and noticed that the common template for paper formation is missing and many articles were of low scientific quality.

32



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Unfortunately, the SER doesn't provide information about the subscription to science databases to promote the research, except online library access to Jstore, Sage, Ebsco. It is recommended to look for the EU projects to obtain financing for the purchase of databases as Scopus and WoS, as well as data access as Orbis, Market Line etc.

The list of publications provided by UBT is of very low quality, many articles are missing for years, publishers, pages; conference presentations are also included in the list by some individuals. Academic staff published work statistics show that not all academics and researchers have produced at least one scientific / applied research publication per year over the past three years (2020, 2019 and 2018). Some of them have only one paper (Fidane Spahija – Gjikolli, Arbiana Govori) or two papers (Rajan Arapi, Nazmi Maksutaj), or have no information at all, as is the case with Kozeta Severani. Many publications in 2020 have only author names and titles, which does not qualify them as publications (Arta Mulliqi, Fidane Spahija-Gjikolli, Osman Sejfiija, Bashkim Nuredini and others), these publications aren't included in the CV as well. During the visit, the ET was informed that UBT was hosting an international conference in 2020, and UBT employees took an active part in this conference. Probably such a large number of publications in 2020 with only the titles of articles or presentations is the result of this conference, but the ET cannot verify this as there is no information about this conference on the UBT homepage, the latest available conference proceedings and information is for 2019. Information provided in the publication list differs from publications mentioned in the CV. For some people, for example Besnik Skenderi, it was impossible to distinguish publications from presentations at a conference because of the way the publications were reflected. In the SER, the MBE department motivates academic and research staff to achieve the goal of making at least two publications as stated in their contracts. However, reality shows that even one publication per year has failed so far.

UBT in general pays significant attention to transparency that every staff member is expected to publish under the name of UBT and they are encouraged to do so. Staff members are required to post their publications on platforms like Google Scholar and Research Gate.

According to the SER, the students of the MBE department are encouraged in research projects and other research activities like conference presentations and publications. There were several paper submissions by students in the UBT international conferences from 2012.



Moreover, students were involved in research clusters like compatibility analysis of Kosovo as well. However, no evidence of this statement was provided.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.		X
<i>Standard 6.3.</i> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.		X
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X partia l	
<i>Standard 6.5.</i> The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
<i>Standard 6.6.</i> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
<i>Standard 6.7.</i> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
<i>Standard 6.9.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property	X	



and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.		
<i>Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities</i>		X

Compliance level: Partially complaint

ET recommendations:

1. *It is recommended to develop targeted research priorities showing focused MBE specialization in several areas with a limited number.*
2. *Create a separate FMBE home page with a Research section, identifying Priority research directions for each Department; Journals, Conferences etc.*
3. *It is highly recommended to introduce clear criteria for recognized publications and reduce the number of required publications annually based on the ranking of journals and proceedings.*
4. *It is strongly recommended to improve the quality of collected information by using one template for CV, publication list, presentations at the conferences.*
5. *Networking with international universities in the organisation of conferences.*
6. *Stimulate students to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.*
7. *Apply for projects to get funding for databases such as Scopus, WoS, Orbis, Market Line etc.*
8. *The program should develop and implement measures for better involvement of students in research activities.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

The proposed facility in Peja meets the standards to conduct and expand the study process. The labs, library, program and student office support provides sustainability of the program. Current infrastructure in Peja, provides a solid base and experience on the needed tools and equipment necessary to ensure continuity for over 12 years now.

Regarding Strategy implementation through years, there is a financial plan that demonstrates sustainability of the study programs having in mind short term objectives and long-term strategic objectives. Program functioning, research and staff development rely heavily on



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

student tuition fees, including other project revenue and training. SER provides a budget for revenues and expenditures for the next three years, based on 100 first year students and 190 students in subsequent years. From the ET's point of view, this dependence on first-year tuition fees, given the large number of students and the fact that Peja hosts a public university with a specialization in management, makes it unsustainable. It is necessary to calculate the critical number of students that would make the program sustainable and look for other sources of funding.

The premises that will be used for the program submitted for evaluation is rented and is suitable for the learning process. UBT management tracks the needs for adequate facilities, inventories, teaching and learning spaces, computer services, software, libraries and reading rooms on each campus related to curriculum and curriculum activities. The utilized software are those from the generic Microsoft package – Office, SAP (authorized licenses), Accounting software, SPSS, Stata etc. They are available at the premises of UBT. The libraries are set inside the facility and available space. **However, no information about available book stock in Peja is provided.**

The number of seats in the lecture, seminars and laboratories rooms is satisfactory and in adequate level regarding study program needs. Labs space usually has between 20 to 30 seats. Lectures are organized depending on the needs of the groups and are from 50 - 60 seats for students of the MBE program. Typically, the lecture size is split into half for practical exercises to ensure adequate interaction.

In accordance with the SER, the program expects about 100 students in the first year, so the number of seats in the reading room (70 seats) and in the group work rooms (2 labs) meets the minimum requirement of 10%. However, the same premises are shared with different programs and faculties, which makes it difficult for the ET to evaluate, since information is provided only for one program.

According to the SER, UBT has a library of about 250,000 titles featuring significant and rich resources, including online (Jstore, Sage, Ebsco) which cover the disciplines within the curricula. **Nevertheless, how many book titles are available in the Peja library is not specified.** Students can also refer to the materials available on the Moodle platform provided and adapted by professors for their needs. The teaching staff is required to provide available reference books and correspond to the course content - including some of the books present

36



in the UBT library. **However, the specified requirements of Standard 7.5c, d, e have not been clarified, as a result the ET estimates it as “No Compliance”.**

UBT-Peja has the infrastructure to facilitate studies for people with special needs.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.		X
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X partia l	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature,		X



<p>enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;</p> <p>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;</p> <p>e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.</p>		
<p>Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs</p>	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop the list of free library resources to all categories of users (from students – up to professors). Prepare the additional source of information – like the Guide to Free Online Library Resources.*
2. *It would be necessary to calculate the critical number of students that would make the program profitable.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The ET would like to commend the programme development team for their proactive engagement with the ET during the validation event. There was a very strong sense of teamwork and ownership exhibited by the programme development team. It is evident that a good level of care and attention has been given to the (re)design of the programmes for the upcoming cohorts of students. Having considered the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme development team, the ET recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance Level
----------	------------------



Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
Quality management	Partially compliant
Academic Staff	Partially complaint
Educational Process content	Partially complaint
Students	Partially compliant
Research	Partially complaint
Infrastructure and resources	Partially complaint
Overall Compliance	Partially complaint

The overall compliance is assessed by the ET at the level of **Partially complaint** and the ET recommends **not to accredit** the study programme.

The SER report should include more detailed information on compliance with the standards, fulfilment of evaluation standards must be substantiated through evidence-based, empirically testable statements, not normative statements. Moreover, the following recommendations need to be considered in relation to programme accreditation:

1. A number of grammatical, translation, spelling and formatting errors have been recorded across all sections of the original self-evaluation report; this often impeded understanding and could raise further questions. It is important for the institution to verify that the report is written as a third-person narrative, i.e. without using 'we' or other pronouns, and that all comments are written with the consistent choice of grammatical tense. As a third-person narrative, the comments and observations should have a neutral tone throughout.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2. It is strongly recommended that the program develops a differentiated catalogue of intended learning outcomes which is complemented by significant explanations how these learning outcomes and the competences to be acquired by students relate to the relevant descriptor levels of the European Qualification Framework.
3. For achieving greater publicity about FMBE research activities, it is recommended that a separate FMBE home page with Research section, identifying priority research directions for each specialisation is created. Information about student opportunities for applying for independent research grants and funds from the external donors should be included into the same dedicated area; as well as clear policies for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program are provided.
4. It is recommended to develop targeted research priorities showing focused MBE specialization in several areas with a limited number.
5. Work more actively and with a long-term plan for attracting teaching staff abroad.
6. Formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues should be publicly available.
7. The didactic concept should take into account all relevant stages and elements of the teaching and learning process. This would include assessment approaches and choosing a coherent overarching concept or fundamental principles which align the main stages and elements of teaching and learning.
8. In quality evaluation, special attention should be paid to student learning outcomes.
9. It's recommended to mention in the SER the number of professors in the academic staff, and increase it, as probably it's very small.
10. It is recommended to review the study courses titles and their content. For example, too many "Advanced " subjects, given the number of ECTS; also some subjects as "Management and Financial Accounting", "Advanced Research Method" should be reconsidered.
11. It is strongly recommended to divide the literature into Main Literature with one- max three main study books and Additional/Supplementary Literature.

40



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

12. It is highly recommended to introduce clear criteria for recognized publications and reduce the number of required publications annually based on the ranking of journals and proceedings.
13. It is strongly recommended to improve the quality of collected information by using one template for CV, publication list, presentations at conferences.
14. Apply for projects to get funding for databases such as Scopus, WoS, Orbis, Market Line etc.
15. The program should develop and implement measures for better involvement of students in research activities.
16. It is recommended to offer the Project Management specialization on the Main Campus given the strong industry demand for project management professionals. In addition, the curriculum for the Project Management specialization should be more focused on project management subjects and not overlap with the Logistics and Procurement Management specialization.

Experts

Member

01.07.2021

Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga

Ms. Asnate Kazoka

41