UNIVERSITY OF PRISHTINA
"HASAN PRISHTINA"
FACULTY OF PHILOLOGY

TURKISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE (BA)

RE-ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

26 May 2021, Zagreb

1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

2

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

2

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 15 April 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

Asst. Prof. Dr. Barbara Kerovec, University of Zagreb

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

● Self-Evaluation Report (hereinafter: SER) from January 2021 submitted by the Faculty of Philology (University of Prishtina „Hasan Prishtina"), which includes:

- brief overview of the institution and the Department of Turkish language and literature with its program (pp. 3-12);

- self-evaluation of the BA program Turkish Language and Literature (pp. 13-126);

● CV - Turkish Language and Literature_BA (7 curricula vitae: Suzana Canhasi, Esin Hydaverdi Llapashtica, Ergin Jable, Nuran Malta Muhaxheri, İrfan Morina, Salih Okumuş, Nebahat Sülçevsi);

● Syllabi - Turkish Language and Literature_BA - 47 syllabi;

● Annexes:

Study Program-Turkish-BA;
Scientific work and projects 2020;
Faculty of Philology - International cooperation and scientific projects;

3

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

● Information collected during the site visit on the 15th of April 2021. During the site visit meetings were held with:
- representatives of the management of the Faculty;
- quality assurance representatives and administrative staff;
- heads of the Department of Turkish Language and Literature;
- teaching staff of the Department of Turkish Language and Literature;
- students;
- graduates;
- employers of graduates
(detailed lists of participants are given below)

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- KAA Accreditation Manual
- KAA Manual Annex 4.4. Template of the External Review Report for programs
- Sample of a Final evaluation report (provided by KAA)

1.2. Site visit schedule (as provided by KAA)

09:00 – 09:40   Meeting with the management of the faculty where the program is integrated
Prof. Dr. Lindita Rugova, dean
Asst. Prof. Dr. Elton J. Bahtiri, Vice Rector for Quality and Academic Development
Prof. Dr. Avdi Visoka, vice dean for teaching
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Isa Memishi, vice dean for infrastructure
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Milote Sadiku, vice dean for quality assurance and international relations
Besfort Krasniqi, MA, secretary

09:45 – 10:30   Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
Mr. Besnik Loxha, Head of the Academic development Office
Dr. Alban Zeneli, academic development officer
Mr. Emanuel Gjoleka, officer for students relations, MA

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

10:30 – 11:10	Lunch break
11.10 – 12:10	<u>Meeting with the heads of the study programme</u> Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ergin Jable, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nuran Muhaxher, Prof. Dr. Salih Okumuş, Dr. Nebahat Sylçevsi
12:15 – 12:55	<u>Meeting with teaching staff</u> Prof. Dr. Suzana Canhasi (Asst. Prof. Dr. Esin Hydaverdi was unable to attend the meeting due to health problems)
13:00 – 13:40	<u>Meeting with students</u> Gamze Pacolli, Ardiana Mehmeti, Toeman Glloboder, Vlora Salihu, Lorenta Blaca, Blerta Podvorica
13:45 – 14:25	<u>Meeting with graduates</u> Caner Çüse, Murat Baca, Semih Bilurdag, Rezarta Kuleta, Leonora Bayoku, Birsen Adana, Neşe Kurteş
14:30 – 15:10	<u>Meeting with employers of graduates</u> Nebahat Bejtullah, Senior Officer for the Turkish Community/ Municipal Dirctorate of Education Zuleyha Ustaibo Mecihan, 1999-2020 US Embassy Kosovo and US Embassy Afghanistan, Office Management Specialist present-Executive Assistant at NOEXIS lab shpk. İnstructor in Turkish language pre-school Yllkat in Pristina. Erim Berisa, Ministry of Regional Development
15:15 – 15:25	<u>Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts</u>
15:25 – 15:35	<u>Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program</u> Prof. Dr. Lindita Rugova, dean Prof. Dr. Avdi Visoka, vice dean for teaching Assoc. Prof. Dr. Isa Memishi, vice dean for infrastructure Assoc. Prof. Dr. Milote Sadiku, vice dean for quality assurance and international relations Besfort Krasniqi, MA, secretary

5

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The tradition of the Faculty of Philology traces back to the year of 1960, when the Cathedra of Albanian Language and Literature and the Cathedra of Serbo-Croatian Language and Yugoslav Literature were established within what was then Faculty of Philosophy. In the next 13 years four more philological cathedrae were established within the same Faculty: English Language and Literature, Russian Language and Literature, French Language and Literature, and Orientalistics. Soon the cathedra-based system has been replaced by the department-based one. In 1989 the Department of Turkish language and Literature has been established too. The increase of philological studies within the Faculty of Philosophy led to the establishment of a separate, independent institution with the name of Faculty of Philology (hereinafter: Faculty), in 1989. Today the Faculty operates within the University of Prishtina „Hasan Prishtina" (hereinafter: UP). It offers 18 study programs at the Bachelor, Master and PhD level organized within 8 departments: Department of Albanian Language, Department of Albanian Literature, Department of English Language and Literature, Department of French Language and Literature, Department of Orientalistics, Department of Turkish Language and Literature, Department of German Language and Literature, and Department of Journalism (the only non-philological department). The Faculty thus provides study programs in the field of philological sciences, teaching, foreign languages, literatures and cultures, as well as journalism and public relations.

As stated in the SER, the mission and objectives of the Faculty are in compliance with those determined by the UP, and all the programs offered by the Faculty have been drafted according to the UP leadership principles, important strategic documents and current regulations (https://www.uni-pr.edu/inc/doc/PLANI-STRATEGJIK1.pdf). The basic principles of the Faculty are mainly guided by the aim of focusing on the development of young people in the field of humanities and communication sciences (journalism and public relations), as well as on the development of professionals such as lecturers of Albanian and foreign languages, translators / interpreters and philologists in various scientific disciplines for the needs of society and its institutions.

The Department of Turkish Language and Literature (hereinafter: Department) has been established in 1988/89. Its mission and objectives include developing, managing and coordinating teaching and scientific research in the field of Turkish studies focusing mainly on Turkish language and literature. It offers two study levels: 1) four-year BA program in Turkish language and literature (last re-accredited in 2016), and 2) one-year MA program in Turkish language and literature (accredited in 2019). BA Program ensures basic qualification in Turkish language and literature, supplemented with courses of methodology and didactics of Turkish, Turkish history, folklore, mythology, and courses building a foundation for the theory of

6

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

translation and translation practice. On the other hand, MA program is of scientific profile, thus research oriented.

BA program has been developed according to social and economic needs of the Kosovo society and institutions. It offers members of Turkish-speaking national community the opportunity to study their national sciences and to complete high education in their mother-tongue (since all the courses are delivered in Turkish). The program also meets the needs of the labor market which offers employment opportunities in various fields such as translation, media, public administration and education (teaching mainly in Turkish language courses, and in public and private schools on both, elementary and secondary level). According to the information given at the meetings during the site visit, the majority of students have Turkish as their mother-tongue, but in recent years there has been a significant increase of interest among students whose first language is Albanian and among foreign students coming within the framework of different exchange programs.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The mission and objectives of the BA program in Turkish language and literature are focused on students' acquisition of fundamental knowledge in the field of Turkish language and literature from contemporary and historical, as well as from geographical point of view. To ensure this aim, the program with its main philological courses is enriched with courses in the field of dialectology, history, folklore and mythology, with special attention given to Turkish linguistic, cultural and historical contacts with the Balkans, especially Kosovo. Being supplemented with courses focusing on theory of translation and translation practice, methodology of teaching and methodology of scientific research, the program also aims at ensuring the students' acquisition of basic methods and skills in teaching, translation, and scientific research. Such a structure of the program opens the way for various fields of occupation such as teachers, translators or interpreters, researchers in central institutions and local administration, archives, media, cultural institutions and business enterprises. This wide spectre of employment possibilities is certainly one of the strong sides of the program which proves its practical character, especially considering the national structure of Kosovo, history of the region, a collection of Ottoman documents and manuscripts in the National Library of Kosovo, and a growing number of Turkish companies, institutions and media in Kosovo and the surrounding area. Given these facts, it can be claimed that the study program has been compiled in compliance with the guiding mission principles of the Faculty: higher education

7

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

of the youth in humanities and philological sciences, education of professionals in different disciplines, and education of translators and interpreters for the needs of society and institutions.

BA program of Turkish language and Literature is administrated by the Department and under the supervision of relevant Faculty bodies. As stated in the SER, formal policies, guidelines and regulations related to procedural and academic matters are accessible to everyone, including staff and students, by being made publicly available at Faculty's and UP's websites.

Table 1. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Mission, objectives and administration**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: 83% - Substantially compliant

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

ET comment concerning the Standard 1.2.:

Although the BA program Turkish language and literature with its structure and diversity of courses has a well-balanced didactic and research concept for preparing professionals in the respective field for the labor market, learning outcomes as defined in the SER on both, program level and course level, do not give evidence that they have been defined in complete accordance with the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. They should be reformulated in the way that they clearly show graduates' competences and skills. Precise formulation of learning outcomes is necessary to make qualifications comparable across sectors and countries and to make students' knowledge and skills more transparent to the employers in the sense of what they could expect from their potential employees.

2.2. Quality management

As stated in the SER and at the meetings during the site-visit, in the process of quality assurance and management, the Department operates in coordination with the management of the Faculty and the UP. There is a Center for Excellence in Teaching at the UP which regularly organizes different kinds of trainings for staff, some of them being methodology courses and trainings on writing syllabi, and trainings in technology, which is of a great importance especially in these times of changing conditions on the global level, particularly it the time of pandemia. In the SER itself there is no mention of how these changing conditions have influenced the organization of classes, but according to the information given at the meetings, the Faculty uses Google meet and Google class platforms for organizing online-classes with more than 10 students. Classes up to 10 students are being held live, as well as all the exams. It is also stated in SER that "the curricula, subject syllabi, academic staff and their CVs, administrative staff, lecture hours, exams and other information regarding studies at the Faculty of Philology can be found on the Faculty website: https://filologjia.uni-pr.edu/Ballina.aspx" (p. 12). Indeed, this information can be found on the Faculty's website, but the Departments' webpages (which are accessible through the Faculty's one) are almost completely empty. It seems that the Departments do not have their own official webpages where they could regularly update information on their own and communicate officially with students. On the other hand, the strong side is the existence of an Electronic Student Management System which enables monitoring of the student's academic activity and the implementation of the teaching process in electronic form.

According to the information given at the meeting with the management of the Faculty, the global pandemia has also influenced budget planning at the state level in the sense that, understandably, more money is being ensured for health sector, and less for others, including funds for research and scientific activities (e.g. conferences). Still, the Department is being

9

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

regularly financially and logistically supported by different (academic and non-academic) Turkish NGOs and institutions such as Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency, Yunus Emre Institute, Turkish Embassy in Prishtina, and Turkish Language Institute.

As stated in the SER and at the meetings during the site visit, in the process of reviewing the programs, the Faculty takes into account the administrative guidelines of MEST of the Republic of Kosovo, and the standards of European higher educational domain, labor market requirements, students' and graduates' comments, and experts' recommendations from accreditation procedures. Students' survey data is being collected regularly, the results of the anonymous questionnaires are available to the academic staff, but they are not made publicly available due to a low number of students interested or willing to participate in these questionnaires (in the SER, the Department also mentions as a weak side "a lack of an information bulletin, even in electronic form, regarding the evaluation of academic staff by students"). Graduates' and employers' survey data are not made publicly available neither; moreover, there is even no evidence that they are *regularly* and *officially* collected from graduates and employers. There is an Office of alumni at the level of the University, but neither the Faculty nor the Department possesses any official information regarding the employment of its graduates; there is no any specific office or a network for former students. So, both, the Faculty and the Department rely on individual communication with graduates. Since most of the graduates who participated at the meeting during the site-visit were actually still students at the Master Program in Turkish language and literature, it was not possible to collect any direct information on the matter of graduates' employment experiences from the graduates who do not have student status any more. Nevertheless, the positive fact is that many of the participants at the meeting stated that they already had some part-time (student) jobs that require proficiency in the field of Turkish language and literature, which can be considered as one of the positive proofs of their employability.

On the level of the Department, topics and issues relevant for the improvement of the academic and administrative work are discussed on meetings which are held on regular basis.

Table 2. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Quality management**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		X
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: 89 % **-** substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. The Faculty and the Department should find ways to encourage students to participate in electronic questionnaires because students' complaints, suggestions and requests contribute to the improvement of programs and staff quality, making them aware of their strengths and weaknesses. Furthermore, it is recommended that the Faculty and the Department consider establishing a formal network of former students to enable official collection and storage of information regarding the employment of their

11

graduates (and not to rely only on personal contact with graduates and their employers), and to enable easier and accurate information exchange among graduates, students and academic staff.

2. The Faculty has its website, but the departments do not have their webpages where they could regularly update information on their own. For distant communication with students the Department uses social media (besides e-mail and notice boards). Since this issue is beyond the competence of the Department, the Faculty should consider activating departments' official webpages in the way that they become controllable and updatable by the departments themselves.

2.3. Academic staff

The Department has 6 full time members engaged in the BA program of Turkish Language and Literature. Two of them are full professors, two are associate professors, one is assistant professor, and one PhD Assistant. Almost all of them have their MA or PhD degrees from recognized Turkish universities (Gazi University, Trakya University, Sakarya University). One retired professor, ex-member of the Department, is also being engaged in the teaching process.

The members of the Department regularly attend different teaching trainings organized by the UP (Center for Excellence in Teaching at the UP) and by Turkish institutions (Ankara University – TÖMER, Yunus Emre Institute). The majority of the staff participated in Turkish mobility program Mevlana. As claimed in the SER, due to their experience gained in various institutions, members of the academic staff possess good mentoring skills, the fact that was confirmed by students at the meeting during the site-visit. The students also expressed their high satisfaction with the members of the Department concerning not only their mentoring, but also teaching skills, their openness for consultation and cooperation, readiness to help students to be included into academic community and to deal with different kinds of challenges they encounter during the study and research processes. Regarding staff evaluation by students, the Department reported as weakness in the SER a "lack of an information bulletin, even in electronic form, regarding the evaluation of academic staff by students" (p. 17). As already mentioned in the previous section (*2.2. Quality management*), students' survey data is being collected regularly by anonymous questionnaires, but their results are not made publicly available due to a low number of participating students. Evaluation of staff by students should certainly be conducted on regular basis, and it should include a broader sample of student, but the above-mentioned students' comments given at the meeting during the site-visit are a positive indicator on staff's qualities.

The Departments' staff members have created good relations with different academic and cultural institutions in Kosovo, Turkey, and the region, promoting this way the importance of

12

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

education and scientific research in the field of Turkish language and culture. In this respect, they are also active in organizing and attending international conferences, and publishing their scientific work in journals with international reviews. These activities can certainly be considered as strengths, but they also have their weak side in that they are mostly limited to Kosovo, Turkey and a few countries of the (near) region (some exceptions excluded) since the most of the work done by the staff members is in Turkish or Albanian language. Although the staff members, in addition to Turkish as their mother tongue, possess knowledge of Albanian, and some of them of Bosnian, Serbian or Macedonian, the majority of them lack knowledge of English or other Western language (the Department itself reported this as a weakness in the SER, p. 20). Limitedness of scientific activities of staff members' to the particular geographic area is natural concerning the field of their studies, but it can also be regarded as a consequence of the already mentioned lack of knowledge of English, and certainly of a restricted freedom of movement due to economic (lack of funds) and political circumstances.

One of the biggest challenges of the Department is certainly a teaching overload of the majority of staff members. Although the condition determined by the standard 3.5 (below) seems fulfilled ("for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title"), according to the information given in the SER (*2.4.4. Program table*, pp. 23-26) the total teaching load of the six members of the Department is 146 contact-hours (/classes) weekly (out of them 118 mandatory and 28 elective), which would make in average 24 contact-hours per member weekly (and this is only for the BA level; the same staff members are engaged in teaching at the MA level too). It was very surprising to notice that one of the staff members has a teaching load of 38 contact-hours per week (not including preparations for classes, reading homeworks or seminars, consultations, exams, etc.). According the information given at the meeting with the Faculty management, the Collective employment agreement prescribes the total work-load of 40 hours per week, which should include teaching, research and administration. Such an enormous workload in teaching do not leave enough space for research, and is thus unsustainable, especially in long-term perspective.

Table 3. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Academic staff**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract,		X

13

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.		
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.		X
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: 80 % **-** substantially compliant

14

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

ET recommendations:

1. Comment for the Standard 3.1.: information on each academic member's workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program has not been presented in tabular form in the SER, but from the *Program table* (pp. 23-26) it can be calculated that the majority of the staff members have a teaching overload which could in long-term perspective negatively affect the quality of teaching and research processes. Thus, it is strongly recommended that the Department and the Faculty find a way to address this issue (e.g. by employing more staff or by reconsidering the students' work-load at home).

2. Comment for the Standard 3.8.: Although students' survey data is being collected regularly by anonymous questionnaires, the results are not made publicly available due to a low number of participating students. Evaluation of staff by students should certainly be conducted on regular basis and it should include a broader sample of students. The Faculty and the Department should encourage students to participate in questionnaires or they should reconsider the way these questionnaires are conducted. Besides questionnaires organized at the level of the UP, the Faculty and the Department should have a right to, according to their needs and respecting all legal and ethical regulations, organize anonymous questionnaires on their own.

3. The staff members should make effort to overcome the lack of knowledge of English or other Western language by considering attending language courses or trainings. This would enable them not only to read and interpret literature and sources in other languages, but also to make accessible their scientific work to a broader academic community.

2.4. Educational process content

BA program in Turkish Language and Literature (hereinafter: Program) is a 240 ECTS credit, four years (eight semesters) program. The Program is modelled in a way to enhance students' disciplinary, methodological, pedagogical and generic skills by offering a range of different courses related to the field of turkology (mainly mandatory courses) as well as those related to methodology of teaching and research (mandatory and elective courses). Generic knowledges and skills are enhanced through mainly elective courses such as English language, Second foreign language, Informatics and Academic writing. All courses are delivered in Turkish. In the process of course delivery different teaching modes are used (lectures, exercises, seminars), which helps students to achieve both, theoretical knowledge and practical skills. It is stated in the SER that the Program provides 12 academic hours of lectures and 8-12 academic hours of

15

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

exercise per week (p. 20). The same information is given in the Program table (pp. 23-26). Nevertheless, some inconsistences related to the modes of course delivery can be noticed between the data presented in the above-mentioned *Program table* and the data given in the section *2.4.3 Course description*, under *Mode of course delivery*. For example, for the course *Introduction to Turkish language* two hours of lectures and two hours of exercises appear as modes of course delivery in the *Program table* (p. 23), while under the *Mode of course delivery* (p. 27) 2 hours of lectures and 1 hour of exercise are mentioned. This is only one example; the same inconsistences appear in many other courses as well. The correct information on this issue is important not only for calculation of the theory-practice ratio, but also for the calculation of the staff's workload in teaching. In spite of these inconsistences, it can be claimed that the Program has good overarching structure which is modelled on qualification objectives including acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. Related to the issue of theory-practice ratio, it is important to mention students' opinion reported at the meeting with students' representatives held during the site-visit. Although students expressed their high satisfaction with the Program in general, when asked on how they think the Program could be even more improved, they answered that they would prefer more practical work and exercise to theory classes because more practical work would prepare them better for the labor market.

The courses within the curriculum are in general provided in a logical flow, except for three courses that should switch their order, and these are *Semantics*, *Introduction to linguistics* and *General linguistics*. The course *Semantics* is being delivered in the 5th, *Introduction to linguistics* in the 7th, and *General linguistics* in the 8th semester of the Program. Since semantics is a subdiscipline of linguistics, it would be more logical for the course *Semantics* to be delivered earlier than the courses *Introduction to linguistics* and *General linguistics*. Furthermore, some of the course titles such as *Folkloristics*, *Introduction to World literature* and *Mythology* are too general. It is clear from the description of these courses that they focus more on topics related to the domain of Turkish studies than to general disciplines. It is thus recommended for the titles to be modified in a way that they correspond better to the topics they deal with.

Although the study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area, learning outcomes on both, program and course level do not give precise determination of the general and specific competencies that students will achieve after finishing a particular course and the Program. Additionally, out of at least 7 learning outcomes that should be defined for the program level, only 5 learning outcomes are listed.

As reported by student representatives at the meeting during the site-visit, all the information related to the study program, syllabi, learning outcomes, and student assessment mechanisms are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of each semester. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively. As stated in the SER, students' activities in

16

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

practice stages are monitored through activity reports, and students are appointed a course instructor from the Department. In order to ease the phases of practical work, the Faculty cooperates with different institutions and organizations. For practical internships in schools, the Department has signed a cooperation agreement with the municipality education departments and schools where education is conducted in Turkish language.

Table 4. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Educational process content**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X	
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	X	

17

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	X	
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	X	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

18

Compliance level: 92 % **-** substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. The information on the modes of course delivery should be provided consistently throughout all relevant documents.

2. It is recommended for the courses *Introduction to linguistics* and *General linguistics* to be delivered earlier than the course *Semantics*.

3. At least 7 learning outcomes should be defined on the program level. Additionally, learning outcomes on both, program level and course level should be reformulated in accordance with the guidelines of the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area in the way that they clearly articulate graduates' competences and skills.

4. It is recommended that the Department reconsiders the titles of the courses *Folkloristics*, *Introduction to World literature*, and *Mythology*. Since these courses primarily focus on topics within the field of Turkish studies, their titles seem too general and could thus be modified in a way that they correspond better to the topics they deal with (e.g. *Turkish folkloristics* instead of *Folkloristics*, *Turkish literature in the world context* instead of *Introduction to World literature*, *Turkish mythology* instead of *Mythology*).

2.5. Students

The enrollment quota for the BA Program in Turkish language and literature is 35 full-time and 10 part-time students. As reported at the meeting with the Department during the site-visit, the actual number of students in the first year of the program is between 25-30. Considering the growing needs of the labor market and the increasing interest for Turkish language in recent years, this number can be considered as well defined. Nevertheless, all students attend classes together, they do not split into groups even during exercise classes. A group of 25-30 students is too large for practical courses such as exercises.

Although the majority of students enrolled in the Program have Turkish as their first language, in last several years there has been a significant increase of students whose first language is Albanian. As reported at the meeting with students held during the site-visit, these Albanian students learn Turkish through different kinds of media and in Turkish language courses to enroll the Program with adequate language knowledge and skills.

19

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

According to the information given by students, the Department's staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice and provides adequate tutorial assistance to all students, especially those with special needs. The Department also encourages students in research by including them in scientific activities such as scientific projects and conferences. Furthermore, as reported in the SER (p. 116) and confirmed at the meeting with students, "based on rules of assessment, students attain scholarships on annual basis and receive recognitions as *distinguished students* issued by academic units". Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available and students are well acquainted with them.

Concerning procedures ensuring originality of work submitted by students, the expert gained an impression that there is no standard procedure by which plagiarism is managed, and that the Department's staff members handle this issue individually. When asked on whether there is any software for plagiarism detection, only one of the staff members was acquainted that the Faculty owes such a software since the last year.

Table 5. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Students**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organizing students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.		X
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	

20

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		X
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: 82 % **-** substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. The study groups for exercises and practical work are not dimensioned so as to optimally ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process. A group of 25-30 students (the number reported for the first year of study) is too large for such a mode of course delivery. Unfortunately, ss long as there is a teaching overload of the Department's staff, it is difficult to expect this issue to be solved.

2. Since there is a software for plagiarism detection at the Faculty level (as reported during the site-visit), the Department should use it to ensure the originality of work submitted by students.

2.6. Research

Members of the academic staff of the Department conduct their research in various disciplines of Turkish studies, mainly in linguistics (Turkish dialects in Kosovo, teaching Turkish as

21

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

21

foreign language), literature, and folklore. They disseminate the results of their research by presenting them on scientific conferences in the country and abroad, and by publishing them within monographies or in local or international scientific journals. As reported at the meeting with the heads of the Department, the academic staff members reached the number of 90 scientific publications in a 10 years period. However, according to the CVs provided by the academic staff members, not all of them comply with the standard 6.7. (below) according to which each academic staff member should have produced "at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication (…) per year for the past three years". This could be a consequence of teaching overload (already mentioned in the section 2.3.) which leaves little time for research.

The staff members of the Department are very active in organizing scientific conferences. As reported at the meeting with the heads of the Department and in the SER, at least once a year they "participate in the organization and presentation of their works in the conferences in the region and beyond", for which they are financially or logistically supported mostly by different Turkish institutions such as partner universities, Turkish Cooperation and Coordination Agency, Yunus Emre Institute and Turkish Embassy in Prishtina. CVs of the majority of the Department's members confirm this remarkable number of publications and conference attendances. Nevertheless, the weak side is that the majority of journals and conferences where their work is presented are of a "regional" character in the sense that, although international, they are published or organized mostly in Kosovo, Turkey and countries from the neighboring region (as already described in the section 2.3 of this report). Additionally, only small number of the publications is written in English or in some other world/Western language which makes the results of their research less visible and less accessible to a wider international scientific community. The Department's staff members are aware of this problem too since in the SER they have reported as a challenge "publishing scientific researches of the academic staff in European academic circles" (p. 120).

As stated in the SER, the Department is engaged in publishing two journals with international reviews indexed in international platforms (CEEOL and EBSCO). The Department's members have good connections with academic and scientific circles in Turkey (e.g. cooperation with many Turkish universities and with the Turkish Language Institute in Ankara) and the region with whom they cooperate through different projects within similar fields of scientific research. New findings of the expertise of the staff are included in the content provided to students, who also participate in projects.

Although the policies of promoting scientific research within the University are included in the Strategic Education Plan in Kosovo and the National Science Program, the Department reported in the SER that the aspect of research is deficient in terms of financial and logistical support (p. 118). Regarding the access to digital scientific platforms, the information given in the SER by the Department and at the meeting with the Faculty management is somewhat contradictory and not completely clear: according to the SER and the information given at the

meeting, the University of Prishtina has in recent years provided its staff (but not students!) with access to various scientific platforms (such as ScienceDirect, Web of Science, Elsevier, EBSCO). To encourage staff participation in research and participation in the conference, the UP has also made available a special office – the Research Office and Sponsored Projects. Still, the Department reports in the SER a lack of accessibility to web platforms for the use of digital scientific resources (libraries, magazines, collections of manuscripts) as well as a "lack of readiness of archives, libraries, etc. for unimpeded access to the necessary resources which hinder continuous information on recent decade research in the region" (p. 120).

Table 6. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Research**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	

Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full time staff.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	X	

Compliance level: 80 % **-** substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. As already mentioned in the ET recommendations of the section 2.3. of this report, the members of the Department should make effort to make their research more visible and more accessible to a wider international scientific community by publishing more in English (which has the status of *lingua franca* of science and academic world), and by presenting more their research work in journals and conferences other than regional or Turkish.

2. To approach weaknesses reported in the SER regarding financial and logistic support, it is recommended for the Department to try to profit better from some opportunities offered in recent years by the UP, such as the office *Research Office and Sponsored Projects* established by the UP which encourages staff participation in research and conferences.

24

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

24

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Supervision of infrastructure and financial policies for investments are regulated at the level of the Faculty and the University, so it is beyond the Department's competences. As stated in the SER, basic infrastructure and operating expenses for the Program are guaranteed by being included within the Prishtina University budget, which is allocated by the Assembly of Kosovo, and by revenues generated by the institution.

The building of the Faculty is very old and partially renovated. Many infrastructural aspects are improved in the recent years, but there are still many which need to be addressed such as adaptation of the facilities to students with special needs, ensuring enough offices for academic staff, ensuring a webpage on the departmental level for free communication between staff and students (as already mentioned in the section 2.2.), ensuring a budget to follow new technological trends in teaching and science, painting of the facility, adjustment of the sanitary and toilet nodes, etc. In spite of these weak sides, the Department has satisfactory conditions for work, partly due to many investments made in equipment from external Turkish institutions and stakeholders (e.g. a supply of advanced equipment and technology of the media lab in the Department). The Department has two available classrooms with internet access and projectors and with an average of 40 seats. It also has its own library equipped with relevant literature in the field of Turkish studies, and students also use the Faculty's library which is equipped with the basic literature of the Program, has a reading room in capacity of 80 seats, reading corners, and a computer room where 20 students can work. Unfortunately, the library does not have an electronic book fund.

Table 7. Compliance with the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual in the area **Infrastructure and resources**

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years		X

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

25

Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission	X	
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.		X

Compliance level: 67 % - partially compliant

26

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

26

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Having considered the relevant documentation and all the information provided by the Faculty and the Department in written form and at the meetings held during the site-visit, the expert evaluates the BA Program in Turkish Language and Literature as a well-structured program with a solid proportion of theory and practice, and a good balance of disciplinary, methodological, pedagogical and generic courses providing students with relevant content and enhancing their skills in the field of Turkish studies. Regarding Kosovo's historical, civilizational, cultural and socio-economic background as well as contemporary circumstances, such a design of the Program prepares students to respond well to the requirements of the labor market and to contribute to the development of the society.

Besides its strengths, the Program also shows some weak sides and challenges which need to be addressed. Thus, the expert calls on the Department and the Faculty to consider the following recommendations (which are further elaborated in the respective sections of this report):

1) Learning outcomes on both, the program and the course level should be clearly defined by using active verbs and by relying on the descriptive levels of the European Framework of Qualification.

2) The Faculty and the Department should encourage students to participate in electronic questionnaires in order to contribute to the improvement of the Program and the staff quality. They are recommended to detect the reason for a low number of students who participate in the questionnaires, and, accordingly, to reconsider the way questionnaires are conducted. Additionally, the Faculty and the Department are recommended to establish a formal network of former students in order to enable official collection and storage of information regarding the employment of graduates. A summary of the results of evaluations made by students, graduates and employers should be made public.

3) The Faculty should activate the departments' official webpages in the way that they become controllable and updatable by the departments themselves.

4) It is strongly recommended that the Department and the Faculty find a way to address the issue of teaching overload of the Department's academic staff members (e.g. by employing more staff or by reconsidering the students' work-load at home). Teaching overload could in long-term perspective negatively affect the quality of teaching and research processes.

5) It is suggested that the Department uses software for plagiarism detection to ensure the originality of work submitted by students.

27

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

27

6) The members of the Department should make effort to make their research more visible and more accessible to a wider international scientific community by publishing more in English and by presenting their research work in journals and conferences other than regional or Turkish.

7) Although the SER of the Department is structured in line with the KAA Accreditation Manual and provides a great deal of the relevant information, the expert has noticed that it also contains some inconsistencies, redundancies, mistakes and translation or spelling errors. Additionally, for some of the standards the information is not precisely articulated. In other words, the SER should be compiled more carefully and it should articulate information precisely in order to show more clearly the compliance or noncompliance with a respective standard.

Taking into consideration all the strengths, opportunities, weaknesses and challenges of the Program, the expert evaluates the Program's compliance to the standards required by the KAA Accreditation manual as follows:

Standard	Compliance Level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	83% - substantially compliant
2. Quality management	89% - substantially compliant
3. Academic Staff	80% - substantially compliant
4. Educational Process Content	92% - substantially compliant
5. Students	82% - substantially compliant
6. Research	80% - substantially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	67% - partially compliant
Overall Compliance	**82% - Substantially compliant**

In conclusion, the Expert considers that the study program TURKISH LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE (BA) offered by the Department of Turkish Language and Literature, Faculty of Philology (University of Prishtina „Hasan Prishtina"), is **substantially compliant** with the

standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, **recommends to accredit** the study program for a duration of **3 years** with a number of **35 students** to be enrolled in the program.

Expert Team

Chair / Member

(Signature)	Barbara Kerovec	May 26, 2021
	(Print Name)	(Date)

4. APPENDICES *(if available)*

None