University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"
MSc in Electronics, Automation and Robotics

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

May 2021

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

2

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

2

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 6.05.2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak
- Ms. Laura Palac

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Faculty of Electrical and Computer Engineering, Self-Evaluation Report (SER-Faculty)*
- *Self-Evaluation Report (SER)*
- *Evolution and Last Time Development Registered from Previous Evaluation*
- *Appendix 1: Budget and Financing Planning*
- *CVs of the academic staff*
- *Syllabi of the subjects*
- *The Manual for External Evaluation of Higher Education Institutions*
- *Accreditation Manual*

3

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

Requested documents:

1. *Syllabi for subjects:*
   o *Entrepreneurship*
   o *Microeconomics*
2. *Minutes of the Advisory/Industry board meetings where the study programs Electronics, Automation and Robotics (bachelor and master) were discussed.*
3. *List of R&D projects during last three years where FECE (NB! As institution, not individuals) is/was an official partner.*
4. *Any other relevant documents concerning FECE (regulation activities of the Faculty).*

Received documents:

1. *Syllabi for subjects:*
   o *Entrepreneurship*
   o *Microeconomics*
2. *Information about the FECE Advisory Board meeting on 22.05.2017 where the study programs were discussed (the minutes of the Advisory/Industry board meeting was not provided).*
3. *Metadata of R&D projects in which FECE is/has been performing during the last three years as an official partner.*
4. *Regulation on Procedure and Disciplinary Measures for Students of the University of Prishtina (in Albanian, not in machine-readable form).*
5. *Documents about different aspects of examinations on MSc study program (four documents).*
6. *List of books available in the Library on the topics of the study programs.*
7. *Time-table of two two-day training for teaching staff.*
8. *Regulation on the Selection Procedures Related to the Appointment, Reappointment and Promotion of the Academic Staff at the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina".*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance (Re/accreditation of bachelor and masters study programs) set in the Accreditation Manual.*

4

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

1.2. Site visit schedule

09.00 – 09.40   Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
Dean: Prof.Asoc.Dr. Isak Shabani,
Vice deans: Prof.Asoc.Dr. Qamil Kabashi,
                 Prof.Asoc.Dr. Milaim Zabeli
                 Prof.Asoc.Dr. Kadri Sylejmani

09.45 – 10:25   Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
Coordinator for Academic Development at FECE: Prof.Ass.Dr. Hëna Maloku,
Head of office for academic development at UP: Besnik Loxha

10:30 – 11.30   Meeting with the heads of the study programme 1: Electronics, Automation and
Robotics, BSc:
Prof.Ass.Dr. Vjosa Shatri,
Dr. Drilon Bunjaku,
Prof.Dr. Marjan Dema,
Prof.Ass.Dr. Vezir Rexhepi

10:30 – 12:10   Lunch break

12.10 – 13:10   Meeting with the heads of the study programme 2: Electronics, Automation and
Robotics, MSc
Prof.ass.Dr. Lavdim Kurtaj,
Prof.Asoc.Dr. Milam Zabeli

13:15 – 13:55   Meeting with teaching staff
Prof.Dr. Enver Hamiti,
Prof.Asoc.Dr. Sabrije Osmanaj,
Prof.Asoc.Dr. Qamil Kabashi,
Mr.Sc. Arben Mashkulli,
Ass.Msc. Enkele Rama,
Msc. Kadrije Simnica

14:00 – 14:40   Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders

Eng, Glenn Noble - LabBox - Chief Technical Officer

Dijon Vula (Solaborate- Chief Hardware Architect)

Liridona Ajeti, (Automatics-KS - Design machinery with E-PLAN)

Getoar Ramadani, manager of UNI-CARE SH.P. K (official representative of Philips Healthcare Abbott Diagnostic for Kosovo,

Rexhep Bunjaku, Bionics SH.P. K (director)

Bujar Kamberi, N.T.SH. EKOINVEST-Control engineering and management

14:40 – 14:50   Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts

14:50 – 15:00   Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

Dean: Prof.Asoc.Dr. Isak Shabani,

Vice deans: Prof.Asoc.Dr. Qamil Kabashi,

Prof.Asoc.Dr. Milaim Zabeli

Prof.Asoc.Dr. Kadri Sylejmani

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

Faculty of Electrical and Computer Engineering (hereinafter the Faculty or FECE) was established in 1961 (under a different name), on the foundation of the Technical High School, which offered study programs in civil, electro-technical and mechanical engineering. After some restructuring and name changes, the Faculty has got its present name in 2001.

The Faculty has six departments: 1) Telecommunications, 2) Computer Engineering, 3) Computerized Automation with Robotics, 4) Power Engineering, 5) Electronics, 6) General Subjects.

The studies at the Faculty are concentrated in three main areas: 1) electricity generation and utilization, 2) information processing and transmission, and 3) computer engineering. The third group covers the analysis and design of computer systems, computer networks, software engineering, software systems security, operating systems, distributed and parallel systems, Web and data.

6

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

The Faculty has defined its mission in "educating the youth in the fields of Electric and Computer Engineering, at all levels of higher education, with the aim of preparing them for the demands of the labour market in the country and beyond, and for the continuous education in this highly dynamic field, and also to contribute directly to the sustainable technological, social and scientific development of Kosovo" (SER-Faculty, page 5).

The Vision is to become a "national and international model of a contemporary and innovative faculty with integrated teaching, whereby practice complements theory and professional skills and research skills are developed for the benefit of society" (SER-Faculty, page 5).

Strategic objectives and strategy for achieving the mission and vision have been developed.

There are around 2200 students currently enrolled in FECE's Bachelor programs and another 210 in its Master programs. FECE counts among its personnel 33 full time academic staff, 24 part-time academic staff and 5 retired professors while there are 13 administrative employees.

***

It is pertinent to note here that the self-assessment report submitted by the university was composed two years ago and therefore some information was outdated. This was also the reason that conversations with representatives of the university were under some time pressure to find out the actual situation.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

1.1. The mission of the bachelor's program in Electronics, Automation and Robotics is "the provision of up-to-date, flexible content that will easily follow up-to-date technological developments as well as local, regional, and global industry and labor market demands" (SER, page 2). On the other hand, as the mission of FECE (see section 1.3 above) explicitly defines *electric and computer engineering* as the scope of the Faculty's academic activities, the study program's mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.

7

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

1.2. It is argued (SER, pages 6 and 105) that the study program is in line with the National Qualifications Framework (incorrect citation on pages 6). However, no comparison or explanation is provided. Consistence with the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education is not even mentioned in the SER. No evidence was provided about involvement of professional institutions in the formulation of intended learning outcomes.

1.3. The study program has 11 expected learning outcomes. Although not explicitly stated in the documents, development of transferable skills, in particular critical and creative thinking, as well as skills for independent work and teamwork is stated in the SER as important principles.

1.4. SER-Faculty lists (page 10) 12 regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues: *Statute of UP*, *Regulation for Master Scientific Studies*, *Regulation for Disciplinary Procedures*, *Regulation on Quality Assurance*, *Regulation on Academic Mobility* etc. However, these documents seem to be on the university public web in Albanian only.

1.5. The university has adopted principles of ethical conduct for academic staff only, according to the *Code of Ethics for the Academic Staff of the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"*. However, there are no internal regulations for the ethical conduct of students and administrative staff; some aspects of this are scattered across different documents.

1.6. Approximately half of the documents submitted to the experts date from 2019 or 2020. Some of the remaining documents (such as the University Statute) were those that do not need to be amended frequently. Some documents (for example the templates of questionnaires) did not contain the date of their approval. The competence to amend most of these documents lies with the central bodies of the university, not the Faculty.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X

8

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	**X**	
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	**X**	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.		**X**
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	**X**	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Make also English versions of formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues available through the university's public web pages.*

2. *Develop code of ethical conduct for students and administrative staff, and publish in a separate document or update the existing document for academic staff.*

2.2. Quality management

2.1. The main quality instruments are feedback questionnaires for academic staff, for administrative and support staff and for students. Students evaluate at the end of each semester subjects/courses electronically through the SEMS system. Since filling in the questionnaires is voluntary, the available data are not representative and therefore no correct conclusions can be drawn from them.

2.2. *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina* is the main document that states the actors, their duties and the quality assurance processes. Each faculty has the Quality Assurance and Evaluation Committee and the Coordinator for the Academic Development who "instructs academic staff and students on the practical aspects of ECTS implementation, guides and monitors the relevant department and study commission during the accreditation/re-accreditation

9

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

process to design/review study programs, advises, plans and monitors the evaluation process of courses and teaching, as well as internal quality assessment, in co-operation with the academic unit management, takes care of and monitors the involvement of all stakeholders (academic staff, students, businesses or Advisory Board members) for the design/review of study programs" (SER, page 7/8). She also advises managers and students in academic departments on the implementation of student mobility, advises, plans and monitors quality assurance schemes, events and activities in the academic department, collects and reports data on relevant activities.

2.3. Quality assurance issues belong to the responsibilities of the Vice-Rector for quality assurance (ex-officio). Quality assurance on the Faculty level belongs to the responsibility of the Coordinator for the Academic Development who coordinates the activities of program planning and delivery (see section 2.2 above). The main tools used are: 1) Questionnaire for Academic Staff, 2) Questionnaire for University Administrative and Support Staff, 3) Bachelor Level Students' Questionnaire. Students evaluate the quality of teaching at the end of each semester. Additionally, student passing rate is used as an indicator to assess the quality of both the study programme and the teacher.

2.4. Quality assurance focuses on the quality of the subjects. The questionnaires referred to in section 2.3 above do not address the quality of the study program as a whole. Nor were other instruments presented to ET that would address issues of the quality of the study program as a whole, such as analysis of the learning outcomes and their coverage, the relationship between theoretical and practical learning, links between subjects, etc.

2.5. As the standards 2.4 and 2.6 are clearly not met (as well as some standards in other sections), the quality assurance process does not ensure compliance of the study program with all standards.

2.6. No regular feedback from graduates and employers on the study program is collected. And since filling out the questionnaire for students is not mandatory, only a small part of the students do it. There are developed questionnaires for graduates and labour organizations, but these cover the general issues of studies and the competences of graduates, respectively. As was explained to the ET, there is mostly sporadic communication on the study program with the graduates and employers. At the meeting with employers, they made several proposals for improvement of the study program, especially concerning the development of practical skills of students. This indicates that employers' views were not sufficiently taken into account in the development of the study program. The employers expressed the opinion that the

10

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

university should hold regular discussions with them, in which, in addition to study programs, other opportunities for cooperation would be discussed, including in research and development. Moreover, the ET was not able to find results of evaluations (based on survey data) on the public web of the university.

2.7. The document *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina* states that the data obtained during the internal evaluation are to be used for the further development of study programs. In addition, other source data are used, including data on the employment of graduates.

2.8. Again, the document *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina* sets out the requirement for periodicity of curriculum quality analysis. Enforcing this requirement is a task of the Office for Academic Development at university level and Quality Assurance and Evaluation Committee at the Faculty level.

2.9. The fact that a big part of the latest versions of the documents came into force in the last two years shows that quality assurance arrangements for the study program are regularly evaluated and improved.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		X
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		X
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	

11

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	**X**	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	**X**	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop and implement measures for a comprehensive quality analysis of the study program.*

2. *Develop and implement a system for receiving systematic feedback on the study program from alumni and employers.*

2.3. Academic staff

3.1. University of Prishtina as a public university strictly follows all regulations concerning employment. The selection and promotion of teaching staff is conducted according to the articles no. 171, 175, 176 and 177 of the *Statute of UP* as well as according to the following regulations: *Regulation on Selection Procedures for Appointment, Reappointment and Promotion of Academic Staff* and *Regulation on Selection Procedures for Part-time Staff*. The publication of position openings by UP is usually done twice a year. Requests for new academic positions are submitted by the respective departments to the Faculty council that makes the decision on opening the position. Personal data of academic persons are presented in the SER in tabular form. The courses taught are listed in another table. The university has the same rules for recruiting full-time and part-time staff, which makes recruiting part-time staff too difficult and costly due to high administrative workload.

3.2. Legal requirements set for teaching staff are met: according to the SER, 10 teachers (out of 12) have a PhD degree and are elected by open competition.

3.3. The formal requirements concerning employment of academic staff by other institutions are met – all full-time teachers are indicated in their publications University of Prishtina as their only employer.

12

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

3.4. All teachers have full-time employment, and consequently, they cover the big majority of courses (some courses are conducted by teachers from other institutions).

3.5. There are 10 full-time teachers on the study program who hold a PhD degree. Although all teachers are listed among the teachers of the bachelor program as well, the total amount of staff with a PhD is sufficient for both study programs.

3.6. The university has established the Center for Teaching and Excellence that organises training of teaching staff. Experienced professors are used as trainers of younger colleagues. More recently training on enhancing teaching and assessment methods, creating syllabuses and writing learning outcomes were organized by international experts; some teachers took part on an international project DRIVE. There are six regular meetings during each year where experienced teaching staff present their experience in teaching and share relevant documents and materials. Newly employed teaching staff are obligated to take two courses on improvement of teaching methods. Every teacher has to attend at least two trainings/workshops between each promotion or before signing a new contract. However, the university does not have a teacher training strategy and corresponding plan, as well as a database of training completed by teachers.

3.7. *Regulation on the selection procedures related to the appointment, reappointment and promotion of the Academic Staff* states service activities as one (out of four) group of activities that is considered in assessing the academic staff. Teachers are actively involved in community service, are invited as experts for consultations with government agencies, etc.

3.8. Evaluation of the teaching staff is administered by the Rectorate and is done at the end of each semester through the questionnaires posted on the SEMS (Electronic student management system) platform. The results of the academic staff evaluation are taken into account for promotion of the academic staff and renewal of contracts. The performance of each professor is measured based on the University regulation for staff promotions. However, the number of students that fill in the questionnaires is very low; there are no questionnaires developed for peer and superiors' evaluations.

3.9. Neither the *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina* nor the *Strategic Plan of Actions 2021-2023 of FECE* contains strategies or measures for quality improvement specifically on improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.

3.10. There are no retired full-time teachers – the average age of full-time teaching staff is about 47 years.

13

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.		X
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

14

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop and implement regular measures for assessment and support of academic staff, including annual personal development interviews with the superior.*

2. *Include improvement of the teaching and assessment methods into the strategies for quality enhancement and the strategic plans, as well as the continuous improvement in the content and quality of learning materials.*

2.4. Educational process content

4.1. The study program has 7 mandatory courses (including thesis) and 36 electives. This is caused by the fact that the study program is targeted to the bachelor graduates of both specializations (1) Electronics and (2) Automation and Robotics. Therefore, the study program accommodates in fact two study programs. Since the total number of study places is 30, the offering of the study program becomes extremely expensive. This fact is in clear contrast to the situation where there is a shortage of lecturers and technical staff in the Faculty. Among other things, this causes a situation where several lecturers (M.Zabeli, Q.Kavashi, L.Kurtaj, D.Bunjaku) have 15 or more subjects per academic year (in bachelor 's and master' s studies together) which is much more than can be assigned to a teacher. Another major problem is related to the expected learning outcomes of the study program. Due to such a large difference in the competencies of graduates (essentially they are students of two different study programs), it is not possible to describe the competencies of all graduates with the same set of learning outcomes.

Concerning the content of the study program, there are few aspects that deserve focused attention and redesign:

4.1.1. The study program has a conventional structure, consisting of a collection of individual sometimes relatively weakly related subjects. Although students have to conduct small projects in some subjects, the study program does not contain an integrated project course where students would conduct a full development cycle – from requirements definition and analysis to testing a working prototype – of a product development which assumes using knowledge and skills of different subject areas.

15

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

4.1.2. There is no internship (professional practice) in the study program, within which students could apply the knowledge and skills acquired at the university in developing innovative solutions in the context of a company.

4.1.3. Learning outcomes and the content of the study program is not well aligned. For example, one of the learning outcomes is *Analysing, implementing, and optimizing information systems*, while the study program does not include any subjects dedicated to the analysis and optimization of information systems.

4.2. An analysis showing the compliance of the study program with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area was not provided. On the other hand, the learning outcomes of the study program contain also some transferable skills, so the study program can be considered conditionally compliant to these frameworks.

4.3. The study program has 11 learning outcomes. However, the study program does not allow **all** students to achieve **all** of these competences. *Entertainment industry, systems for speech and visual recognition* is an example of such a learning outcome.

4.4. The syllabi contain all the necessary components and were submitted in electronic form. They are in general detailed enough to get an adequate understanding of the content and other aspects of the subjects.

4.5. The language in which the study program will be offered is Albanian.

4.6. This is a new study program where no students have been admitted yet. As there were no meeting with the students, and the SER did not discuss the student-teacher relationship, it is not possible to assess this aspect adequately.

4.7. The teaching methodology and assessment methods are described in the syllabi. The university has a Center of Excellence of Teaching that runs courses for teachers on different aspects related to teaching, including teaching strategies. The university has also taken part in some international joint projects on this topic.

4.8. Learning outcomes and other aspects of subjects are described in the syllabi and are planned to be discussed already on the first class (it was said that this has become a common procedure).

4.9. The grading system that is used in all Balkan countries is used. The grades are 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 where 5 marks failing and 6-10 are positive. The passing level is 50% as widely used in Europe.

16

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

4.10. Students who are not satisfied with the evaluation of their work have the right to submit a written complaint to the Dean. The procedures are described in the *Statute of the University*.

4.11. The study program does not include an internship.

4.12. The staff has identified problems of finding institutions for internship as one of the main difficulties, and reason for not including Internship in the study program. There seems to be a certain discrepancy between the university efforts and position of the companies - meeting with company representatives showed that they consider the role of practical training and the role of internship to be extremely important.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.		X
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X	
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This	n.a.	

17

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.		
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	**n.a.**	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	**X**	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	**X**	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	**X**	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA inconsistently assessed.	**X**	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	**n.a.**	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units. *To be inserted the overview of the program (with all areas to be filled out)*		**X**

Compliance level: partly compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Revise the learning outcomes of the study program, aligning them with the learning outcomes of the mandatory courses.*

18

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

2. *Revise the whole study program by increasing the number of mandatory courses and reducing (at least by 50%) the number of electives.*

3. *Complement the study program in such a way that the learning outcome foreseen in the study program are achievable. At the same time, add Internship and Project as mandatory subjects.*

2.5. Students

5.1. General criteria for the admission to Master studies are determined by the Senate in accordance with the provisions of the Statute of UP. Admission procedures are described in *Regulation for Master Scientific Studies* and in *FECE Master Degree Regulation*. These criteria fairly apply to all students.

5.2. Concrete admission criteria are published on the website of UP. The University Senate determines the number of candidates to be accepted, considering the proposed number by the Faculty Council for each study program.

5.3. According to the planned classes for the study program, one group of students consists of maximum 30 students for lectures and exercises, and up to 15 for laboratory work.

5.4. The ET was not provided with any document specifying procedures and timelines for student feedback. This issue was also not discussed in the SER. Questions about feedback from teachers are not included in the student questionnaire, so the university does not have adequate knowledge of student satisfaction with the feedback they get from the teachers.

5.5. The university has established an Electronic Student Management System (SEMS). SEMS is an electronic platform to which students have individual access. This platform records individual student achievements and contains all materials and information needed to pass the courses. All course syllabi are also published on SEMS. The Faculty has a database where they keep records of all student grades and students can get a printout of their grades if they need it.

5.6. Assessment of students is done through exams, colloquiums, seminars, laboratory exercises and presentations of the practical projects. If assessment consists of two parts – a written part and an oral part – then the grade is calculated based on the results of both parts. The student has the right to apply for the revision of the grade, by submission of a written complaint to the Dean. In this case, the student takes the exam before the commission. All exams are held on the announced exam dates in

19

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

January, June and September. The Senate of the University of Prishtina (on the proposal of the Study Committee and the Faculty Councils) may decide to announce additional terms for exams if it considers that this contributes to the progress of the study process. The Faculty adapts to students who are participating in an international exchange program or doing internship abroad, allowing them to take exams earlier.

5.7. The Faculty collects and analyses the pass rates and grades of students of the courses. The results of these analyses are forwarded to the dean who takes further measures if necessary. Analysis of the degree of graduation is foreseen as one of the tasks in the *Strategic Plan of Actions* 2021-2023 of the Faculty.

5.8. The university has not implemented any plagiarism detection software, and checking originality of students' written texts is not regulated. However, according to the teachers, they do not consider plagiarism to be a serious problem.

5.9. The rights (including appeal procedures) and obligations of students and issues of non-academic conduct are stated in the *Statute of the University* which is a publicly available document.

5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is regulated in the *Statute of the University*.

5.11. The academic staff has sufficient scheduled times in their working hours for consultation and advice to students – consultations hours are written in the course syllabi.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	n.a.	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.		X

20

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	**X**	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	**X**	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	**X**	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		**X**
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	**X**	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	**X**	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	**X**	

Compliance level: substantially compliant.

ET recommendations:

1. *Introduce a plagiarism detection system in the university (or in the Faculty).*

2. *Stipulate in the university regulations the obligations of lecturers regarding giving feedback to students.*

2.6. Research

6.1. The study program has not defined an explicit scientific/applied research objective. However, expected learning outcomes foresee the development of students' research potential. Some master students are involved in research activities of teachers, and are listed as co-authors of their publications.

6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities and performance in relation to these expectations are specified in the work contract, in the *Statute of the University* and in the *Regulation on the Selection Procedures Related*

21

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

21

to the Appointment, Reappointment and Promotion of the Academic Staff at the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina".

6.3. Research activities are determined indirectly: the document *Regulation on Financing Research – Scientific, Artistic and sports Activities at the University of Prishtina* lists the activities that are financially supported. Research indicators are listed in the *Strategic Plan of Actions 2021-2023* of FECE.

6.4. The scope of research of the academic staff is described by the following keywords: electronics, digital electronics, power electronics, electrical engineering, systems and control, digital logic design, wireless communication etc. Therefore, the research harmonizes quite well with the topics the teachers teach.

6.5. The research of academic staff is internationally visible (for example, in *Google Scholar, GS*). All teachers have a positive GS h-index, and the publications of some teachers have relatively high citation score.

6.6. Research is basically validated by scientific publications. Technological transfer is not regulated and not supported by the university. This is not facilitated by the salary system either, as salaries are unified and do not depend on cooperation with companies. However, realization of professional expertise for the needs of the community is foreseen as one of the tasks in the *Strategic Plan of Actions of FECE for* 2021-2023.

6.7. According to the list of publications in the CV-s submitted, all teachers who are teaching on the study program, have published at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication per year for the past three years.

6.8. The academic staff within the Faculty publishes papers under the name of the University of Prishtina.

6.9. As the research of the teachers harmonizes quite well with the topics they teach, the potential is high to use research results in teaching. It also gives teachers the opportunity to propose topics for graduate thesis according to their research interests.

6.10. The university has not yet established intellectual property ownership policies or regulations, although "The development of policy for the protection of the intellectual property of the University and of its commercial utilization" is stated in the *Statute of the University* as one of the responsibilities of the Senate.

6.11. As mentioned above, some master students are involved in research activities of teachers, and are listed as co-authors of their publications.

22

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

	Compliance	
Standard	**Yes**	**No**
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	X	
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.		X
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.9/6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.10. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.		X
Standard 6.11. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	X	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

23

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

23

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop and implement a regulation on technology transfer.*

2. *The university is recommended to establish an intellectual property ownership policy.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

7.1. The facilities are shared with FME and FCA. The Department of Electronics and Department of Automation that jointly run the study program, have in total 2070m^2 at their disposal: an amphitheatre, five lecture halls, eight laboratories (partly shared with other departments of the Faculty), library, and rooms for teachers and administration. Videos were provided about the facilities. It seems that the Faculty has enough premises and equipment for satisfying the needs of the study program. However, during the meeting with ET, teachers complained about the inconvenience of managing the infrastructure due to sharing it with other faculties, as well as about difficulties in purchasing new equipment, mainly due to financial and lengthy procedural reasons. The lack of human resources and extremely high teaching load of some teachers is discussed in subsection 4.1 above.

7.2. Financial plan of the study program has been provided where expenses for salaries, as well as faculty level operational expenses, and expenses for computers, new devices, renovations, furniture and other categories are calculated. The study programs of the university do not have complete financial plans, the financial needs of the study program are covered by the central administration of the university.

7.3. As a public institution of higher education, University's financial sustainability is guaranteed by the Mid-Term Expenditure Framework for the next three years. The University is the owner of the space it uses. The university has a central library, as well as the departments have their own library of 80 m^2.

7.4. Considering the number of students (about 2400 students in the whole Faculty), the number and size of teaching classrooms and laboratories is adequate.

7.5. The role of the library is going to change in the future – from sharing physical books to providing digital services. Therefore, the problem of lack of library space will most probably decrease in the future. On the other hand, the problem of lack of access to all necessary digital databases (especially textbooks and scientific journals) will become more and more acute. The SER did not unfortunately provide enough information on the aspects mentioned in Standard 7.5. The link to the university's English website was also empty. The SER (page 134) states "Insufficient funds for the

24

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

24

ongoing enrichment of the library" as one of the weaknesses for infrastructure and resources.

7.6. The infrastructure is not fully adapted to students with special needs. However, the *Strategic Plan of Actions of FECE* foresees concrete activities for improvement.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.		**X**
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	**X**	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	**X**	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	**X**	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;		**X**

c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.		**X**

Compliance level: partly compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Ensure adherence to* the Strategic Plan of Actions of FECE *concerning infrastructure for students with special needs.*

2. *Plan and implement measures to ensure compliance with the requirements of Standard 7.5.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The following recommendations need to be considered in relation to the program accreditation:

1. The Faculty has a thorough Strategic Plan of Actions for 2021-2023 (51 pages). However, it appears to be lacking in grounded financial considerations, and focusing on the most important aspects. On the one hand, the Faculty has a huge lack of funding: for hiring staff, for research, for infrastructure, for covering internship costs etc. On the other hand, the structure and content of study programs do not always take into account the lack of resources. Therefore, it is recommended to **balance academic activities with available resources**.

2. The current assessment is based only on the analysis of the master program and does not take into account the bachelor program. However, they should be considered together.

26

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

26

In this case we see that there is a clear difference compared to the general international practice, where the bachelor's program is broader and the master's program narrower, with possible specializations. This ensures, among other things, the cost-effectiveness of teaching. Given the lack of resources of the Faculty, it would be expedient to redesign both study programs together so that the bachelor's program would provide basic knowledge in all three fields - electronics, automation, robotics (i.e. there would be no specializations in the bachelor's program) and the master's program has two or three specializations. This would significantly reduce the number of electives in bachelor studies. In this case, the number of study places in master's studies should be significantly higher, so that there are at least 20 students in each specialization. Cost-effectiveness should also be pursued in the case of a master's degree program.

3. There are also a number of problems, solving of which belongs to the competence of university administration. These are:

   a. The recruitment of part-time teachers undergo the same processes as recruitment of full-time teachers. Since the employment contract for part-time teachers is concluded for one year only, the process is repeated every year. This causes inconvenience to teachers and imposes high administrative load – and expenses - to the university. It is recommended to considerably **simplify the recruitment of part-time teachers**.

   b. In today's information society, economic development, culture, politics and the well-being of members of society are largely based on information. The most important mediation medium for public information about the university is the university website. Public universities should lead by example. However, **the public website of the University of Prishtina is literally a disaster**. The fact that a new website was recently created is not an excuse for poor / non-existent quality of the web site. The responsibility for the quality of the university website cannot lie with any Faculty, but with the top management of the university.

   c. Several **important areas are not regulated** at the university. For example, 1) The university has not established intellectual property policies and 2) technology transfer (including establishing spin-offs and start-ups) is not regulated. Ensuring academic activities with the necessary resources should be a special focus of university top management; every opportunity should be taken to this end. For example, there are

27

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

27

some well-equipped laboratories, but not enough technicians to fully exploit the potential of these laboratories.

Overall compliance:

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
2. Quality management	Substantially compliant
3. Academic staff	Substantially compliant
4. Educational process content	Partly compliant
5. Students	Substantially compliant
6. Research	Substantially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Partly compliant
Overall compliance	**Substantially compliant**

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Master of Electronics, Automation and Robotics offered by University of Prishtina is *Substantially compliant* with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends *to accredit* the study program for a duration of *3 years* with a number of 30 students to be enrolled in the program.

Expert Team

Chair

	Peeter Normak	**26.05.2021**
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)

Member

	Laura Palac	**26.05.2021**
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)

28

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

28

29

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

29