



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

***University of Prishtina “Hasan Prishtina”
BSc in Mechatronics***

REACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

March 2021, Tallinn/Prishtina



TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context	3
1.2. Site visit schedule.....	6
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	7
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION.....	8
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration	8
2.2. Quality management	10
2.3. Academic staff.....	12
2.4. Educational process content.....	15
2.5. Students	19
2.6. Research	21
2.7. Infrastructure and resources.....	24
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	26



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 23.03.2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak – Tallinn University, EE

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

1. *Faculty of Mechanical Engineering, Self-Evaluation Report (SER)*
2. *CVs of the academic staff*
3. *Syllabi of the subjects*
4. *Accreditation Manual*
5. *Training Manual*

Requested documents:

1. *Guide for Curriculum Design (a FME document)*
2. *BSc Study Programme in Mechatronics (the full document, contained also the objectives and learning outcomes)*
3. *MSc Study Programme in Mechatronics (the full document, contained also the objectives and learning outcomes)*
4. *Occupational Standard for Mechatronics, level 6*
5. *Occupational Standard for Mechatronics, level 7*
6. *Regulation on the Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina, 2016*
7. *Rulebook on Student Academic Mobility at the University of Prishtina, 2017*



8. *Guide for Examination and Reviewing the Syllabus, 2018*
9. *Student Assessment Guide for Students and Their Use at UP, 2018*
10. *Statute of FME*
11. *Strategic/Development Plan of FME*
12. *Minutes on two last meetings of FME Industry Advisory Board (FME Industrial Body on Curriculum Development and their improvement)*
13. *Regulation on the Advisory Board of FME*
14. *Regulation on scientific publications in UPHP*
15. *Regulations and procedures for developing / reviewing and approving new curricula*
16. *Regulation on student assessment and their progress during the studies*
17. *Regulations and procedures for the writing of Bachelor and MSc subjects*
18. *Quality Assurance Guidelines of the University of Prishtina*
19. *Regulation for Bachelor studies at the Faculty of Mechanical Engineering*
20. *Regulation on the Systematization of Jobs for the Administration of the Faculty of Mechanical Engineering*
21. *Regulation on the activity of the Institute of the Faculty of Mechanical Engineering*

Received documents:

1. *A Short Guide for Reviewing and Revising Syllabi. For Teaching Staff and for Staff Supporting and Supervising Curriculum Development*
2. *Professional Standard. Mechatronics, levels 5, 6 and 7 of the NQF*
3. *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina*
4. *Regulation on the Student Academic Mobility in the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"*
5. *Bachelor Level Students' Questionnaire*
6. *Questionnaire for Graduates*
7. *Developing a Module for Managing and Monitoring the Quality of Teaching within the SEMS*
8. *The Statute of the University of Prishtina*
9. *Strategic Plan, Faculty of Mechanical Engineering 2017-2022*
10. *Extract. Minutes of FME Advisory Board for 29.05.2020 and 15.01.2021*



11. *Regulation on Establishment of the Advisory Board*
12. *Regulation on Establishment and Functioning Principles of the Advisory Board of Academic Units at the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"*
13. *Administrative Instruction (MEST) No 01/2018. The Recognition Principles of Platforms and International Magazines with Reviews*
14. *Regulation on the Selection Procedures Related to the Appointment, Reappointment, and Promotion of the Academic Staff at the Faculty of Arts of the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"*
15. *Regulation about the Office for Research and Sponsored Programs*
16. *Regulation on Financing of Research – Scientific, Artistic and Sports Activities at the University of Prishtina*
17. *Methodology for Reviewing and Revising Study Programmes in Line with the Labour Market Demands*
18. *Regulation for Undergraduate Studies – Bachelor*
19. *Updated regulation for bachelor studies*
20. *Regulation for Master Scientific Studies*
21. *Updated regulation for master studies*
22. *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina*
23. *University of Prishtina Strategic Plan 2020-2022*
24. *Regulation on the Internal Organization and Systematization of Jobs within the Services of the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"*
25. *Regulation of Activities. Institute of Mechanical Engineering*
26. *Regulation on Establishment and Principles of functioning of Institutes at University of Prishtina Hasan Prishtina"*
27. *Regulation for updating for Advisory Board*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance (Re/accreditation of bachelor and masters study programs) set in the Accreditation Manual.*



1.2. Site visit schedule

- 09.00 – 09.40** Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
Prof. Dr. Ahmet Shala, Dean
Mrs. Fatmire Kuçi, FME Secretary
Prof. Dr. Ilir Doçi, Vice Dean for teaching affairs
Prof. Dr. Rexhep Selimaj, Vice Dean for financial and infrastructure affairs
- 09.45 – 10:25** Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
Prof. Ass. Dr. Xhevahir Bajrami, Vice Dean for quality assurance and cooperation with economy.
Msc. Rifat Krasniqi, Coordinator for quality assurance
Msc. Rinor Berisha, Teaching assistant, member of Faculty Council
Msc. Liridon Bytyqi, IT Officer
- 10:30 – 11:10** Lunch break
- 11:10 – 12.10** Meeting with the heads of the study programme – Mechatronics, BSc
Prof. Dr. Arbnor Pajaziti, Head of Mechatronics Department
Prof. Ass. Dr. Xhevahir Bajrami
Prof. Asoc. Dr. Shpetim Lajqi
- 12:15 – 13.15** Meeting with the heads of the study programme – Mechatronics, MSc
Prof. Dr. Ahmet Shala
Prof. Dr. Rame Likaj
- 13.20 – 14:00** Meeting with teaching staff
Prof. Dr. Shaban Buza
Prof. Asoc. Dr. Sabrije Osmanaj
Prof. Ass. Dr. Riad Ramadani.
- 14:05 – 14.45** Meeting with the students
Fisnik Tishukaj
Albin Krrabaj
Arjanit Fandaj
Elza Lupçi
Rrustem Qenaj



- 14:50 – 15.30** Meeting with the graduates
Fatjon Beqa
Fatjona Berisha
Eranda Pira
Lum Rexha
- 15.35 – 16.15** Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
Mr. Ylber Hoxha "EIZEK Mechatronics" Prizren
Mr. Dijon Vula "Solaborate" Prishtine
Mr. Florent Hoxha, "Termokos", public company, Prishtine
- 16.15 – 16.25** Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts – Joint session
- 16.25 – 16.35** Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program
Prof. Dr. Ahmet Shala, Dean
Mrs. Fatmire Kuçi, FME Secretary
Prof. Dr. Ilir Doçi, Vice Dean for teaching affairs
Prof. Dr. Rexhep Selimaj, Vice Dean for financial and infrastructure affairs

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The predecessor of the Faculty of Mechanical Engineering (hereinafter the Faculty or FME), the Technical Faculty, was established in 1965, on the foundation of the Technical Graduate School in Prishtina.

The faculty has five departments: 1) Manufacturing and Industrial Engineering with Management, 2) Thermoenergetic and Renewable Energy, 3) Design Engineering and Vehicles, 4) Traffic and Transport Road Traffic, 5) Mechatronics.

The Faculty offers six bachelor and four master study programs.

The Faculty has defined its mission as an academic unit of the University of Prishtina "HASAN PRISHTINA" that "trains students in the fields of mechanical engineering, industry, technology, transport, mechatronics etc., for the labor market; contributes to scientific development, research and education, cooperation with economics, public institutions, companies by carrying out scientific-research work, development and professional projects in the field of engineering and industry" (SER, page 5).



Strategic focus areas and initiatives for completing the mission and achieving the vision have been outlined in the *Strategic Plan* of the Faculty for 2017-2022.

There were 232 new bachelor and 96 new master students enrolled in the Faculty in 2020/2021 academic year.

The Mechatronics bachelor program was accredited in 2013 and reaccredited in 2016 for three years (2016-2019) that was extended for one more year. In 2020, 57 new students have been enrolled in the study program.

It is pertinent to note here that the self-assessment report submitted by the university has basically composed in 2019. Therefore, the actual situation at the time of the assessment was different – generally better – in some aspects than described in the SER.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

- 1.1. The mission of the “Mechatronics study program is to integrate the classical fields of mechanical engineering, electrical engineering, computer engineering and information technology to realize the basic principles of contemporary methodology used in all branches of economics, industry, mining, energy, agriculture, etc.” (SER, page 29). Therefore, the study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission of the Faculty.
- 1.2. It is argued (SER, page 30) that the study program is in line with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area and that relevant academic and professional advice were considered when defining the intended learning outcomes. A number of activities like labour market analysis, comparison with other international study programs, consultations with experts etc. are listed.
- 1.3. For explaining an overarching didactic and research concept, the staff members listed the following principles: basing on the needs of the industry, the ratio 40:60 between the volume of theoretical and practical studies (although the ratio was stated as 50:50



in the majority of syllabi), student-centred teaching, application of project-based methods in teaching, implementing results of the projects in teaching. The RWTH Aachen University and the University of Stuttgart were mentioned as examples that have been followed in developing the study program.

- 1.4. The main documents of formal policies, guidelines and regulations are *Statute of the UP, Regulation for Undergraduate Studies – Bachelor, Regulation on Disciplinary Measures and Procedures for the Academic Staff of University of Prishtina, Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at University of Prishtina, and Regulation on the Student Mobility in the UP*. However, the existence of these documents on the university's website was chaotic. For example, *Regulation on Disciplinary Measures and Procedures for the Academic Staff of University of Prishtina* was on the website of the Faculty of Economics, but the *Regulation on the Student Mobility in the UP* was not accessible at all in the public web.
- 1.5. The university has adopted principles of ethical conduct for academic staff only, according to the *Code of Ethics for the Academic Staff of the University of Prishtina “Hasan Prishtina”*. However, there are no internal document on the ethical conduct of students and administrative staff.
- 1.6. Approximately half of the documents submitted to the ET date from 2019 or 2020. Some of the remaining documents (such as the *University Statute*) were those that do not need to be amended frequently. Some documents (for example the templates of questionnaires) did not contain the date of their approval. The competence to amend most of these documents belongs to the central bodies of the university, not the Faculty.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	



<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.		X
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.		X
<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Make formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues available through the university's public web pages.*
2. *Adopt the principles of ethical conduct for students and administrative and supporting staff.*

2.2. Quality management

- 2.1. The main quality instruments are feedback questionnaires for academic staff, for administrative staff and for students. Students evaluate at the end of each semester each subject/course electronically through the electronic evaluation system (SEMS). Since filling in the questionnaires is voluntary for the staff, the data are not necessarily representative and therefore conclusions drawn from them may not be correct.
- 2.2. *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina* is the main document that states the actors, their duties and the quality assurance processes. Each faculty has the Quality Assurance and Evaluation Committee and the Quality Coordinator. The latter, together with the Vice-Dean for teaching matters monitors the implementations of the quality measures in the Faculty.
- 2.3. Quality assurance issues belong to the responsibilities of the Vice-Rector for quality assurance (ex-officio). Quality assurance on the Faculty level belongs to the responsibility of the Quality Coordinator who coordinates the activities of program planning and delivery. The main tools used are: 1) Questionnaire for Academic Staff, 2)



Questionnaire for University Administrative and Support Staff, 3) Bachelor Level Students' Questionnaire. Students evaluate the quality of teaching at the end of each semester. Additionally, students' passing rate is used as an indicator to assess the quality of both the study programme and the teachers.

- 2.4. Quality assurance focuses on the quality of the subjects. The questionnaires referred to in section 2.3 do not address the quality of the study program as a whole. Nor were other instruments presented to ET that would address issues of the quality of the study program as a whole, such as learning outcomes and their coverage, the relationship between theoretical and practical learning, links between subjects, etc.
- 2.5. As the standards 2.4 and 2.6 are clearly not met (as well as some standards in other sections), the quality assurance process does not ensure compliance of the study program with all standards.
- 2.6. No regular feedback from graduates and employers on the study program is collected. There are developed questionnaires for graduates and labor organizations, but these cover the general issues of studies and the competences of graduates, respectively. At the meeting with employers, they expressed their readiness to cooperate more actively with the Faculty. Moreover, the ET was not able to find results of evaluations on the public web of the university.
- 2.7. The document *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina* states that the data obtained during the internal evaluation are to be used for the further development of study programs. In addition, other source data are used, including data on the employment of graduates.
- 2.8. Again, the document *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina* sets out the requirements for periodicity of study program quality analysis. Enforcing these requirements is a task of the Office for Academic Development at the university level and Quality Assurance and Evaluation Committee at the Faculty level.
- 2.9. The fact that big part of the latest versions of the documents came into force in the last two years shows that quality assurance arrangements for the study program are regularly evaluated and improved.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 2.1.</i> All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	



<i>Standard 2.2.</i> Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
<i>Standard 2.3.</i> Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 2.4.</i> Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X
<i>Standard 2.5.</i> Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		X
<i>Standard 2.6.</i> Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		X
<i>Standard 2.7.</i> Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
<i>Standard 2.8.</i> The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
<i>Standard 2.9.</i> The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop and implement measures for a comprehensive quality analysis of the study program.*
2. *Develop and implement a system for receiving systematic feedback on the study program from alumni and employers.*

2.3. Academic staff

- 3.1. University of Prishtina as a public university follows strictly all regulations concerning employment. The selection and promotion of teaching staff is conducted according to the articles no. 171, 175, 176 and 177 of the *Statute of UP* as well as according to the following regulations: *Regulation on Selection Procedures for Appointment*,



Reappointment and Promotion of Academic Staff and Regulation on Selection Procedures for Part-time Staff. The publication of position openings by UP is usually done twice a year. Requests for new academic positions are submitted by the respective departments to the Faculty council that makes the decision on opening the position. Personal data of academic persons are presented in the SER in tabular form, the courses taught are listed in another table.

- 3.2. Legal requirements set for teaching staff are met: according to the SER, 17 teachers (out of 18) have a PhD degree and are elected by open competition.
- 3.3. The formal requirements concerning employment of academic staff by other institutions are met – all full-time teachers are indicated in their publications University of Prishtina as their employer.
- 3.4. More than 75% of all teachers have full-time employment, and they cover more than 80% of the subjects.
- 3.5. There are 17 full-time teachers on the study program who hold a PhD degree. Although 11 of them are listed among the teachers of the master program as well, the total amount of staff with a PhD is sufficient for both study programs.
- 3.6. The university has established a Center for Teaching and Excellence that organises training of teaching staff. Experienced professors are used as trainers of younger colleagues. More recently training on enhancing teaching and assessment methods, creating syllabi and writing learning outcomes were organized by international experts. There are six regular meetings during each year where experienced teaching staff present their experience in teaching and share relevant documents and materials. Newly employed teaching staff are obligated to take two courses on improvement of teaching methods. Every teacher has to attend at least two trainings/workshops between each promotion or before signing a new contract. However, the university does not have a teacher training strategy and corresponding plan, as well as a database of training completed by teachers.
- 3.7. Concerning engagement in the academic community, involvement in international projects (although the staff expressed a wish to become even more involved) and participation on international conferences were mentioned. Concerning students, they rated teachers positively in terms of their availability for consultations.
- 3.8. The evaluation of the academic staff is administered by the Rectorate and is done at the end of each semester through the questionnaires posted on the SEMS. The results of the evaluation are taken into account for promotion of the academic staff and renewal of contracts. The performance of each professor is measured based on the University regulation for staff promotions. However, the number of students that fill in



the questionnaires is very low; there are no questionnaires developed for peer and superiors' evaluations. As it was explained during the discussions with the quality assurance representatives, the teaching staff visit sometimes each other lectures. The ET was not able to find the evaluations on the university web.

- 3.9. Measures for improving the quality of teaching form one subsection in the *Strategic Plan for 2017-2022* of FME.
- 3.10. There are no retired full-time teachers – the average age of full-time teaching staff is about 51 years. On the other hand, about 40% of full-time staff are at or near the age of 60.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	X	
<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
<i>Standard 3.6.</i> Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	



<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.		X
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop and implement regular measures for assessment and support of academic staff, including annual personal development interviews with the superior.*
2. *Develop and implement measures to replenish the teaching staff with young teachers.*

2.4. Educational process content

4.1. The study program focuses on three relatively broad areas – mechanical engineering, electrical engineering and informatics. Some courses in mathematics and electrotechnics teach teachers from the Faculty of Electrical and Computer Engineering. The first three semesters are identical for all bachelor study programs of the Faculty, which certainly restricts the possibilities to include courses specifically targeted to mechatronics study programs. The study program as a whole is adequate. The following aspects were discussed during the meetings with the heads of the study program, and with other people involved:

- 4.1.1. The principles of dividing subjects between mandatory and elective. For example, *Theory of production and introduction to organization of enterprise* (which would in fact be more relevant to the master program) is mandatory and taught already in the first study year, while *Basics of Automation* is elective and taught in the second study year.
- 4.1.2. The study program lacks a course that provides a holistic view of mechatronics – concepts, approaches, scope, problems, standards, applications, history, trends, etc. of mechatronics. Having an introductory to mechatronics subject already in the first semester would frame the entire 3-



year studies and would give students a better opportunity to form their interests in the speciality.

- 4.1.3. Although it has been stated that the share of practice is bigger than theory, this is not reflected explicitly in the study program: 1) In several syllabi, only knowledge not skills are described as learning outcomes; 2) *Project of Mechatronics I* is elective, and those who have completed the study program may not have experienced the full cycle of any development, from problem definition and analysis to testing of the implemented solution; 3) *Professional Internship* has only 2 ECTS.
- 4.1.4. There is no subject on research methods or academic writing in the study program nor lectures on these aspects in the *Diploma Thesis* subject. This means that the students may not have enough skills for composing the thesis.
- 4.2. An analysis showing the compliance of the study program with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area was not provided. Moreover, the formulation of learning outcomes as these were presented in the SER (pages 46/47) are in fact not describing the expected competences adequately enough – “will be able to deal with” type of sentences will not say much about actual knowledge and skills of the students. Additionally, transferable competences are completely neglected.
- 4.3. The SER does not contain the full set of learning outcomes of the study program. The request of the ET to provide additionally the full *BSc Study Programme in Mechatronics* was not satisfied. Thus, the submitted materials allowed to evaluate the study program only in terms of professional competencies.
- 4.4. The syllabi contain all the necessary components and were submitted in electronic form. They are in general detailed enough to get an adequate understanding on the content and other aspects of the subjects.
- 4.5. The language in which the study program will be offered is Albanian.
- 4.6. During the meeting with the students, they characterised the student-teacher relationship very positively. No complaints or even recommendations were made in this regard.
- 4.7. The teaching strategies used were already mentioned in subsection 1.3. The students have opportunity to use laboratory equipment outside the scheduled classes if necessary.



- 4.8. Learning outcomes and other aspects of subjects are described in the syllabi and are discussed already on the first class. Students of Mechatronics have access to the labs 24/7. Faculty of Mechanical Engineering has provided to the students a special space/rooms for project development, to which students have also access 24/7.
- 4.9. The grading system that is used in all Balkan countries is used. The grades are 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 where 5 marks failing and 6-10 are positive. The passing level is 50% as widely used in Europe.
- 4.10. Students who are not satisfied with the evaluation of their work have the right to submit a written complaint to the Dean. The procedures are described in the *Statute of the University*.
- 4.11. The learning outcomes and other aspects in the syllabus for professional practice (internship) are described in very general terms and in fact does not specify the learning outcomes. The responsibilities of the university tutor are not described at all in the syllabus. Moreover, there is a contradiction between the study program and the regulation on the diploma thesis and professional practice: as the *Professional Internship* and *Diploma Thesis* is awarded with 5 ECTS in the study program, it should be 10 ECTS according to the *Guide for FME Students on Bachelor Thesis and Professional Practice*.
- 4.12. The faculty has established close partnerships with a number of local companies that have recruited a large number of university graduates and interns. The meeting with the representatives of the companies revealed that they were well acquainted with the study program, and therefore they were able to discuss the substantive problems on the topic of the study program and internship.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
<i>Standard 4.2.</i> The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		X



<i>Standard 4.3.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
<i>Standard 4.4.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 4.5.</i> If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	n.a.	
<i>Standard 4.6.</i> The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
<i>Standard 4.7.</i> Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	
<i>Standard 4.8.</i> Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
<i>Standard 4.9.</i> Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
<i>Standard 4.10.</i> Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA inconsistently assessed.	X	
<i>Standard 4.11.</i> If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS		X



credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		
<i>Standard 4.12.</i> In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units. <i>*To be inserted the overview of the program (with all areas to be filled out)</i>	X	

Compliance level: substantially compliant.

ET recommendations:

1. *Revise the learning outcomes of the study program, placing more emphasis on transferable competences - teamwork, creativity, entrepreneurship, etc.*
2. *Revise the study program, taking into account the remarks in subsection 4.1.*
3. *Update the internship syllabus so that it clearly states the learning outcomes and outlines the roles and responsibilities of all parties - company, university, intern.*

2.5. Students

- 5.1. The admission procedure of new students is conducted according to the clauses set in the *Statute* of the university. The basic criterion for enrolling students in the Bachelor program is completion of Matura Test; additionally, the admission exam is in Mathematics. Students have a right to appeal within 3 days.
- 5.2. The candidates must submit Diploma and High School certificates (originals) and the birth certificate.
- 5.3. One group of students consists of maximum 90 students for lectures and up to 20 for laboratory work (there are 20 seats in each laboratory).
- 5.4. The ET was not provided with any document specifying procedures and timelines for student feedback. This issue was also not discussed in the SER. Questions about feedback from teachers are not included in the student questionnaire, so the university does not have adequate knowledge of student satisfaction with the feedback they get from the teachers.



- 5.5. Students' scores are stored in the SEMS and are physically protected and archived, and are available for the students, professors, administration and university management needs.
- 5.6. Students in accordance with the *Statute* of the University, have in special cases the possibility of extended duration of studies and exams. The length of studies can be no more than double the duration of the studies, but with a justified request and approved by the Faculty Council; this deadline may be postponed for another year. The student has the right to apply for the revision of the grade, by submission of a written complaint to the Dean.
- 5.7. Completion rates of students are kept in SEMS. The *Statute of the University* lists the number of graduates among the indicators to be measured.
- 5.8. The university has not implemented any plagiarism detection software, and checking originality of students' written texts is not regulated.
- 5.9. The rights (including appeal procedures) and obligations of students and issues of non-academic conduct are stated in the *Statute of the University* which is a publicly available document.
- 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is regulated in the *Statute of the University* and in the *Regulation for Undergraduate Studies - Bachelor*. All students' rights and obligations are made publicly available.
- 5.11. Academic staff are required to be available to students on a regular basis, for both academic and advisory purposes. Additional hours of consultations with academic staff may be organized.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 5.1.</i> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
<i>Standard 5.2.</i> All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	



<i>Standard 5.4.</i> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.		X
<i>Standard 5.5.</i> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
<i>Standard 5.6.</i> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		X
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Introduce a plagiarism detection system in the university (or in the Faculty).*
2. *Stipulate in the university regulations the obligations of lecturers regarding giving prompt feedback to students accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.*

2.6. Research

- 6.1. The SER does not specify any scientific/applied research objective of the study program.
- 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities and performance in relation to these expectations are specified in the work contract, in the *Statute of the University* and in the *Regulation on the Selection Procedures Related*



to the Appointment, Reappointment and Promotion of the Academic Staff at the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina".

- 6.3. Research activities are determined indirectly: the document *Regulation on Financing Research – Scientific, Artistic and sports Activities at the University of Prishtina* lists the activities that are financially supported. Research indicators are listed in the *Strategic Plan* of FME for 2017-2022.
- 6.4. The scope of research of the academic staff is described by the following keywords: mechatronics, robotics, mechanical design, automotive engineering, renewable energy, CNC programming, operations research, industrial management, computer science, artificial intelligence, etc. Therefore, the research harmonizes quite well with the topics they teach.
- 6.5. The research of academic staff is internationally visible (for example, in *Google Scholar, GS*). All teachers have a positive GS h-index, and the publications of a majority of teachers have relatively high citation scores. The participation on international conferences has been relatively active.
- 6.6. Research is basically validated by scientific publications. Technological transfer is not regulated and not supported by the university. This is not facilitated by the salary system either, as salaries are unified and do not depend on cooperation with companies. However, cooperation with local economy is stated in the *Strategic Plan of FME for 2017-2022*.
- 6.7. According to the list of publications submitted, the teachers have published at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication per year for the past three years.
- 6.8. The academic staff within the Faculty publishes papers on behalf of the University.
- 6.9. As the research of the teachers harmonizes quite well with the topics they teach, the potential is high to use research results in teaching. It also gives teachers the opportunity to propose topics for graduate thesis according to their research interests.
- 6.10. The university has not yet established intellectual property policies.
- 6.11. The prerequisites for student research are insufficient - the study program does not deal with research methods and methodology (research methods and methodology are not mentioned in any subject description).



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
<i>Standard 6.3.</i> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
<i>Standard 6.5.</i> The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
<i>Standard 6.6.</i> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
<i>Standard 6.7.</i> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
<i>Standard 6.9/6.8.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
<i>Standard 6.10.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.		X
<i>Standard 6.11.</i> Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.		X



Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Determine scientific/applied research objective of the study program.*
2. *Develop and implement a regulation on technology transfer.*
3. *The university is recommended to establish an intellectual property ownership policy.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

- 7.1. In total, the Faculty has 3667m² at its disposal: two amphitheatres, 12 classrooms, 9 laboratories, 28 cabinets, library, 8 offices, and some other space for general purpose. The laboratories are renovated and equipped with sufficient technology. There are currently enough human resources for running the laboratories.
- 7.2. Financial plan has been composed for hiring new academic staff for three years is composed. The total amount of additional expenses for three years is calculated to be 400 000€, where expenses for salaries, as well as for new laboratory equipment and other activities are taken into account.
- 7.3. As a public institution of higher education, University's financial sustainability is guaranteed by the Mid-Term Expenditure Framework for the next three years. The University is the owner of the space it uses.
- 7.4. Considering the number of students (1281 students in 2018; the more recent data were not available to the ET), the number and size of teaching classrooms in the Faculty is adequate. The laboratories are sufficiently equipped with modern technology (about 4M€ has been invested to the laboratories during last four years).
- 7.5. There are 180 places for readers in the Library of the technical faculties which is more than 10% of the total number of students in the Faculty. About 50% of the subjects are covered by the literature that is located in the library of the Faculty. On the other hand, the university does not have an electronic catalogue and does not have access to important digital repositories. The university itself admits that library services are insufficient, both in terms of the availability of educational literature and access to electronic databases. The quality of Wi-Fi is also unsatisfactory.
- 7.6. The facility possesses elevators, emergency exits as well as the entire infrastructure which is needed for students with special needs.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
<i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	
<i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;		X



e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		
<i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.	X	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Implement an electronic catalogue in the library.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The following recommendations need to be considered in relation to the program accreditation:

1. The general impression is that the main factors hindering development are a number of university level problems. These are:
 - a. **The use of academic resources at the university is inefficient**, particularly in the field of ICT. It is known that the development of a society is largely determined by the digital solutions used in all its sectors, the so-called *digital transformation*. It is the same with university education in all subject areas, which requires digital transformation to ensure quality. To achieve excellence in this, academic competence in ICT should be pooled rather than split between different faculties. Thus, instead of each faculty recruiting some ICT lecturers, they should be grouped in one unit (faculty), which also provides ICT training in all other faculties. Such a unit would have the potential to create strong research teams that would be much more competitive in obtaining international ICT projects. This is essential if a university is to change from a teaching-based (that is, based on study programs) university to a research-based (that is, based on research groups) university.



- b. In today's information society, economic development, culture, politics and the well-being of members of society are largely based on information. The most important mediation medium for public information about the university is the university website. Public universities should lead by example. However, **the public website of the University of Prishtina is literally a disaster**. The fact that a new website is being created is not an excuse for poor / non-existent quality of the existing web site. The university also lacks a centralized document management system that includes all the regulations and other documents of the university. The responsibility for the quality of the university website cannot lie with any faculty, but with the top management of the university.
- c. Several **important areas are not regulated** at the university level. For example, 1) The university has not established intellectual property regulations as well as 2) technology transfer (including establishing spin-offs and start-ups) is not regulated. Ensuring academic activities with the necessary resources should be a special focus of university management; every opportunity should be taken to this end. Some aspects did not meet the standards in this assessment, in particular due to the lack of university-level regulations.
- d. Decision-making in the university seems **overly centralised**. This makes many processes cumbersome and discourages faculty initiative, but also reduces their responsibility. A leap in quality in academic activities inevitably requires increasing the autonomy of faculties and increasing the resources allocated to them. It is also inevitable to modernize the remuneration system, which would value the quality and activities accompanying the academic activities expected from universities (successful implementation of projects, cooperation with companies, etc.). If necessary, the University of Pristina, as the leading university in Kosovo, should take legislative initiative.
2. Regardless of whether the university concentrates ICT competence in one faculty or not, the Faculty management is recommended to start negotiations with the management of the Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences and of the Faculty of Electrical and Computer Engineering on **mutually beneficial cooperation and sharing of resources** in the field of ICT.



Overall compliance:

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
2. Quality management	Substantially compliant
3. Academic staff	Fully compliant
4. Educational process content	Substantially compliant
5. Students	Substantially compliant
6. Research	Substantially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
Overall compliance	Substantially compliant

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Bachelor of Mechatronics offered by University of Prishtina is *Substantially compliant* with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends to *accredit* the study program for a duration of 5 years with a number of 90 students to be enrolled in the program.

Expert Team

Chair

Peeter Normak

15.04.2021

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)