



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosovaza Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

***UNIVERSITY OF PRISHTINA
ORGANIC CHEMISTRY, MSc***

REACCREDITATION

**REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM
(FINAL)**

June 18, 2021



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	8
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	9
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	9
2.2. Quality management	12
2.3. Academic staff	16
2.4. Educational process content.....	19
2.5. Students.....	23
2.6. Research.....	28
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	32
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	35
4. APPENDICES (<i>if available</i>)	37



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosovaza Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

• INTRODUCTION

.1. Context

Date of site visit: 17-05-2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. Antonio Sanchez Pozo
- Domagoj Vugić, PhD Candidate

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Flamur Abazaj, Quality Assurance and Accreditation Officer
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

- SER-FMNS-Organic Chemistry-M.Sc.- Reaccreditation 2020
- ORGANIC CHEMISTRY-MSC folder (containing the syllabi in Albanian and English)
- CHEMISTRY CV folder (containing CV from related and unrelated teachers)
- Video of the Chemistry Department
- Meetings 17-05-21 (see 1.2)
- Web site of the FMNS (not in English)
- Accreditation Report Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences University of Prishtina
- List of patents, technical reports and other products of knowledge transfer.
- List of international exchanges
- List of master thesis
- Quality assurance
- FMNS development Strategic plan 2020-2022
- Regulation on quality assurance
- Questionnaire for student, graduates, administrative staff and academic staff
- Student Evaluation for teaching and courses
- Regulation of MS studies
- Statute of UP



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosovaza Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Code of Ethics
- Regulation of BSc
- Studies Regulation of Disciplinary measures
- Students Appeals
- Student Academic Mobility Regulation on selection procedures
- UP Financial plan
- M.Sc. Thesis Example

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018

.2. Site visit schedule

09.00 – 09.40 Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated

meet.google.com/give-askm-inf

- Prof. Dr. Idriz Vehapi (Dean),
- Avni Berisha (Vice-Dean for Teaching affairs),
- Sefer Avdiija (Vice Dean for Science and Quality assurance Affair),
- Kajtaz Bllaca (Vice-Dean for financial affairs)

09.45 – 10:30 Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff meet.google.com/give-askm-inf

- Besnik Loxha (University Central Office),
- Ilir Mazreku (FMNS Office),
- Artan Alidema (IT FMNS)

12.10 – 13:10 Meeting with the heads of the study programme Organic Chemistry, MSc Responsible for SER.

meet.google.com/ked-ayyv-bce



- Prof.Dr. Majlinda Daci
- Prof.Assoc.Arieta Rifati
- Ass.Dr.Miribane Dermaku

13.15 – 13:55 Meeting with teaching staff of both Organic Chemistry MSc (OC) and Analytical and Environmental Chemistry MSc (AC).

meet.google.com/ked-ayyv-bce

- Prof.Assoc.Dr. Avni Berisha(AC)
- Prof.Dr.Tahir Arbneshi(OC, AC)
- Prof.Assoc.Arben Haziri (OC)
- Prof.Ass.Hamit Ismaili (OC)
- Ass.dr. Arsim Maloku (AC)
- Ass.dr.Hamide Ibrahimimi (OC)

14.00 – 14.45 Meeting with students of both Organic Chemistry MSc and Analytical and Environmental Chemistry MSc.

meet.google.com/ked-ayyv-bce

- Medina Kqiku
- Arjeta Selmani
- Fatjon Maxharraj
- Diellza Habibaj
- Ilirjana Qetaj

4.50 – 15.30 Meeting with graduates of both Organic Chemistry MSc and Analytical and Environmental Chemistry MSc. All of them external to UP.

meet.google.com/ked-ayyv-bce

- Iliriana Osmani
- Rina Krasniqi
- Fatjon Maxharraj

15.35 – 16.15 Meeting with employers of graduates of both Organic Chemistry MSc and Analytical and Environmental Chemistry MSc. All of them external to UP.

meet.google.com/ked-ayyv-bce



- Osman Hasku
- Agron Shala
- A non-identified English translator

16.15 – 16.25 Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
meet.google.com/ked-ayyv-bce

- Prof. Dr. Antonio Sanchez Pozo
- Domagoj Vugić, PhD Candidate
- Flamur Abazaj, Quality Assurance and Accreditation Officer

16:25 – 16:35 Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program
meet.google.com/gvv-askm-inf

- Prof. Dr. Idriz Vehapi (Dean),
- Avni Berisha (Vice-Dean for Teaching affairs),
- Sefer Avdija (Vice Dean for Science and Quality assurance Affair),
- Kajtaz Bllaca (Vice-Dean for financial affairs)

After the virtual visit, it was agreed the following agenda:

- By 19/5/21 Send a list of requested documents to FMNS
- By 24/5/21 Receive the documents from FMNS
- By 14/ 6/21 Send the draft report
- By 16/6/21 Receive the comments from FMNS
- By 21/6/21 Send the final report

Documents requested

- List of teaching staff with valid contracts.
- List of patents, technical reports and other products of knowledge transfer.
- List of international exchanges
- List of master thesis
- Results of satisfaction surveys.



- List of changes in response to previous accreditation
- Expert team evaluation report from before for this program
- Learning outcomes for a study program
- Development Strategy
- Quality Politics
- Regulation on Quality Assurance and evaluation
- Quality Assurance manual
- Manual on the Determination of Measuring Indicators
- Active website in English
- Questionnaire for academic staff, administration, and students
- Academic staff Questionnaire
- Total number of active students and dropouts
- Total number of Alumni
- Statistic - Drop off
- Evaluation results for questionnaire above
- Proposed recommendation for all questionnaires above
- Questionnaire - Graduates (Alumni).
- Library description – number of books for the program
- Practice manual
- Laboratory exercise manual
- UP Statute, regulation of Master studies
- Code of Ethics
- Student rights and obligations
- Student transfer regulation and mobility
- Research objectives, research plan
- Policies for research recognition (document for promotion of academic staff)
- Financial plan and sustainability analysis
- information regarding the number of seats in the library, places in classrooms and laboratories, etc.
- Example of Master thesis

Documents received

- Quality assurance
- FR UP FMNS 2016
- FMNS development plan
- Strategic plan 2020-2022
- Regulation on quality assurance



- Questionnaire for student, graduates, administrative staff and academic staff
- Student Evaluation for teaching and courses
- Regulation of MS studies
- Statute of UP
- Code of Ethics
- Regulation of B.Sc. Studies
- Regulation of Disciplinary measures
- Students Appeals
- Student Academic Mobility
- Regulation on selection procedures UP
- Financial plan
- M.Sc. Thesis Example

Suggestions/Comments to the draft report

None

.1. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

University of Prishtina "HASAN PRISHTINA" "is an autonomous public institution of higher education that develops academic education, scientific research, artistic creativity, professional counselling and other areas of academic activities" (article 6 of the UP Statute). It is the largest public higher education institution in Kosovo, since 1971/72, offering a diverse array of programs (bachelor, masters, and doctorate) in different Faculties. EECA (Emergent Europe and Central Asia) University ranking 301-350.

Faculty of Mathematical Natural Sciences was established in 1971, Previously the studies of Chemistry were part of the Faculty of Philosophy since 1960. There are five Departments: Chemistry, Biology, Physics, Geography and Mathematics.

The Department of Chemistry offers the following studies: Chemistry BSc., Engineering Chemistry BSc., Physical and Inorganic Chemistry MSc., Organic Chemistry MSc., Analytical and Environmental Chemistry MSc. and Chemistry PhD.

Master degree in Organic Chemistry is a 2-year full time course (120 ECTS) with 30 study places. The program accepts 15 new students per year. The total number of students enrolled at present is 31 (<https://fshmn.uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=1,68>)



- **PROGRAM EVALUATION**

- .1. Mission, objectives and administration**

Standard 2.1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: This study program is designed in a way to prepare students with necessary knowledge in the organic chemistry. Teaching and research are the two pillars. Teaching and research are poorly connected. There is a need for more professional training. Relationships with enterprises exist but not formally established.

Standard 2.1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: It is declared that learning outcomes are in line with the EHEA standards. The definition is made following a bottom-up process from the department, faculty and University with participation of teachers and student representatives as part of a Study Committee appointed by the FMNS/respective department. There is no formal participation of graduates and employers in the different commissions.

Standard 2.1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: The study program covers the main areas in Organic Chemistry. In terms of didactic a variety of activities are used that seems adequate. Regarding research there is a possibility to do in the final master work. However, more research activities are expected at the Master level that do not only include the thesis work. A list of 19 master theses was provided. All people interviewed showed a high degree of satisfaction.

Standard 2.1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.

Partially compliant.



Comments/Observations: Publicity is very limited. All people interviewed showed a high degree of satisfaction.

Standard 2.1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: There are codes for ethics, Measures and Disciplinary Procedures for Academic Staff and Regulation on Disciplinary Measures and Procedures that we received.

Standard 2.1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Policies and regulations seems to be reviewed regularly, but not every 2 years as many of the regulations and codes are from 2005, 2015 and 2017.

Performance indicators

Not specifically detailed in the SER.

2.1.1. The institution has set Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) at the level of the study program. The data they provide is reviewed at least annually with overall performance reported to the decision-making structures.

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: Data not provided.

2.1.2. Systems are established for central recording and analysis of course completion, program progression, completion rates and program evaluations, with summaries and comparative data distributed automatically to senior administrators and relevant committees at least once each year.

Fully compliant.

They have an electronic system for student management (SEMS)

Comments/Observations: SEMS consists of several modules which are: application module for student registration; grading module; student payment module; student and staff card module; diploma modules; quality assurance and evaluation module; module of competencies and teaching contents; library module and other modules as needed.



2.1.3. Policies and procedures include action to be taken to deal with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There are two instruments to deal with such situations: The Course Evaluation and Teaching and the Student Assessment Questionnaire. The teachers have the obligation to review eventual criticisms and to improve the curriculum.

2.1.4. Statistical data on indicators, including grade distributions, progression and completion rates are retained in an accessible central database and regularly reviewed and reported in periodic program reports.

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: Data not provided

2.1.5. The concepts of gender justice and the promotion of equal opportunities for students in special situations such as, for example, students with health-related impairments, students with children, foreign students, students with an immigrant background and/or students from educationally disadvantaged families are put into practice at the level of the study program.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Regulated by UP Statute. There is a great consciousness about this aspect. No data is provided.

MISSION, OBJECTIVES AND ADMINISTRATION

Compliance level:

Fully compliant

X Substantially compliant

Partially compliant

Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Graduates and employer's participation should be increased. The external reference is crucial for the design of the study programs, based in the competences that need the society. In addition, the collaboration in the practical skills from the enterprise perspectives enrich the education program.*



- 2. The program should evaluate the possibility of different pathways for specialization. This could be done offering most, if not all, courses as elective.*
 - 3. Regulations and key performance indicators should be public, for example in the Website of the Faculty. This is basic for quality assurance.*
 - 4. Develop your vision as leader in the region with the attractive study concept*
 - 5. Integrate modern teaching practices, especially e-learning*
 - 6. Adapt the program constantly according to the needs and evolution of Chemistry as a study subject*
-

.1. Quality management

Standard 2.2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Academic staff participate in the Quality Assurance and Evaluation Committee of the FMNS. Most of this participation is at the level of the course. External stakeholders, to our knowledge, are not involved in Quality assurance policies. Students are not aware of all the processes that occur and particularly their outcome.

Standard 2.2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There are committees (Study Committee, Faculty Committee for QA and evaluation) integrated in the structure of the Faculty. In addition, there is a Faculty Coordinator for academic development and quality, which serves as connection between the faculty and the central bodies of the university.

Standard 2.2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: QA is regulated by law (Law No. 04/L-037 on Higher Education in Republic of Kosovo) and the university has established the procedures (article 210- 225 of the Statute, the Senate of University of Prishtina on 30. 12. 2016).



Standard 2.2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Quality is focussed in teaching and learning and in quality of scientific activity as can be seen in the questionnaires for academic staff and students. The academic staff questionnaire contains three categories of questions: for the faculty, for teaching and learning, and for research scientific activity. Regarding administrative staff the questionnaires are focused in work conditions (Administrative Instruction No, 1/438, dated 18. 05. 2018). Data about performance of student exists, but was not provided.

Standard 2.2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Changes only in 3 courses. Additionally, not all the suggestion from previous accreditations were implemented.

Standard 2.2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Survey are done to academic staff, administration and students only. At the end of each subject students evaluate teaching. No data was provided. Public information was not available in the Website. Website is not functional.

Standard 2.2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Continuous improvement of the curriculum is the responsibility of the teacher. As mentioned early, the results of the student assessment questionnaire have to be attended by teachers. One of the limitations in the development of the study program is the insufficient funds, as declared in the SER. Not follow actions plan were provided.



Standard 2.2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (e.g., every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: This standard is not developed in the SER. It seems the reports are done at least once every five years and kept confidential.

Standard 2.2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: This standard is not developed in the SER. There is a Central Quality Assurance Commission that monitor the activities.

Performance indicators

Not specifically detailed in the SER

2.2.1. Appropriate program evaluation mechanisms, including graduates' surveys, employment outcome data, employer feedback and subsequent performance of graduates are used to provide evidence about the appropriateness of intended learning outcomes and the extent to which they are achieved.

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: Graduates and employers do not participate in quality assurance.

2.2.2. Reports are provided to program administrators on the delivery of each course and these include details if any planned content could not be dealt with and any difficulties found in using planned strategies. Appropriate adjustments are made in plans for teaching after consideration of course reports.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is a Course evaluation and teaching at the end of every course. In addition, a specific analysis is made for students at the bottom 10% of the expected results

2.2.3. A comprehensive reassessment of the program is conducted at least once every five years. Policies and procedures for conducting this reassessment are published. Program



review involves experienced people from relevant industries and professions, and experienced faculty from other institutions.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Policies and procedures are well established for accreditation and reaccreditation (Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance. KAA Accreditation Manual – July 2018) and implemented with external agents from industry and other institutions.

2.2.4. Students participate in the design and implementation of quality assurance processes.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is a student in the Central Quality Assurance Committee. It seems that there is a lack of interest in quality.

QUALITY MANAGEMENT

Compliance level:

Fully compliant

Substantially compliant

X Partially compliant

Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. To periodically publish the quality reports, including graduates' surveys, employment outcome data, employer feedback and subsequent performance of graduates used to provide evidence about the appropriateness of intended learning outcomes and the extent to which they are achieved.*
- 2. To publish plans for improvement in progress.*
- 3. To allocate specific funds for quality plans development.*
- 4. To elaborate the SER with specific analysis of each standard and key performance indicator in agreement with the KAA.*
- 5. Information acquired during QA processes needs to be embedded into practice*
- 6. Evaluation results needs to be accessible by students and student should participate in their discussion*
- 7. More effort is needed in implementing quality management*



.1. Academic staff

Standard 2.3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations Employment is regulated by law. All teachers are full-time. Only qualifications and duration of the contract are presented in the corresponding table. According with that table 4/11 of the teachers have finished the contract. No data about workload is provided. The academic staff team is composed by 11 teachers: 3 are full professors; 3, associate professors; 2 Assistant Professors and 3 Assistants. There are some discrepancies in the staff number in different part of the SER as well as in the list of CV.

Standard 2.3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the administrative instruction on Accreditation.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Staff selection for employment is regulated by law.

Standard 2.3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Personnel in regular employment who may be engaged, elected or appointed to another public institution are not eligible.

Standard 2.3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: All academic staff are full-time employees.



Standard 2.3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Teachers responsible of the different courses are all PhD and full-time. Assistants have a MSc degree and are developing their PhD.

Standard 2.3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is a Centre for Teaching Excellence and an active program for internationalization.

Standard 2.3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: No data about the engagement in the academic community is provided. The students declared full availability for consultation.

Standard 2.3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Each semester regularly evaluates the academic staff by the students for each subject. The data are not made public, but are communicated to the management and the subject professor.

Standard 2.3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: As shown in syllabi, teachers use a broad range of strategies. There are limitations for the use of the Internet. As shown in the video, some laboratories have been renewed. However, the equipment has no formal maintenance.



Standard 2.3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.

Not applicable.

Comments/Observations: They do not have retired people involved in the program.

Performance indicators

Not specifically detailed in the SER

2.3.1. Teaching staff are encouraged to develop strategies for the improvement of their own teaching and maintain a portfolio of evidence of evaluations and strategies for improvement.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Teachers have to attend the results of the student evaluation at the end of the courses. No data was provided.

2.3.2. Training programs in teaching skills are provided for both new and continuing teaching staff including those with part time teaching responsibilities; these include effective use of new and emerging technology.

Full compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is a Centre for Teaching Excellence providing programs. No data was provided about the academic staff that follows those courses.

2.3.3. The extent to which teaching staff are involved in professional development to improve quality of teaching is being monitored.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: No data was provided. According with employer's opinions, there is no formal collaboration.

2.3.4. The results of the academic staff evaluation are taken into account for promotion purposes and renewal of contracts.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Promotion is largely based in research results.

ACADEMIC STAFF



Compliance level:

Fully compliant

X Substantially compliant

Partially compliant

Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Elaborate a plan for stabilization of the teachers*
 2. *Include teaching activities and results as part of the academic staff promotion.*
 3. *Increase collaborations with professionals outside the university for teaching.*
 4. *Keep a record of the teaching evaluations and teacher portfolios.*
 5. *Teachers should receive more support to improve their pedagogical competencies*
 6. *More support is needed to increase the mobility*
 7. *Literature found in the Syllabuses needs to be updated and contain links to main websites*
 8. *Increase the number of training and educations for teaching staff to achieve better results in the teaching process*
-

.1. Educational process content

Standard 2.4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: All subjects are elaborated with qualifications objectives and covers, organic synthesis, mechanism of organic reactions, spectroscopy, chemistry of antioxidants, chemistry of natural products, and heterocyclic chemistry. There is a substantial body of methodology. The aspects refer to academic competencies and a little about employment.



Standard 2.4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Courses are designed in ECTS. However, most subjects seem to be extensions of the bachelor as many of the competences of the masters' degrees, level 7 of the EHEA and FQ are not described.

Standard 2.4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: The order seems appropriate, although there is no a matrix of competences-disciplines. This program is comparable with the one in Zagreb.

Standard 2.4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: None

Standard 2.4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.

Not applicable.

Comments/Observations: Language is Albanian. Students demand more teaching in English. Teachers complain about the English proficiency among students.



Standard 2.4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: At the beginning of each course learning outcomes are explained and discussed with the students as declared by students.

Standard 2.4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: No data about how flexible the teaching strategies are used was provided. There are elective courses.

Standard 2.4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: At the beginning of each course the teacher informs the students with the assessment method, which is also described in detail in the syllabus.

Standard 2.4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison, with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: The syllabi present a description of the student evaluation. It is similar among the different disciplines. No data about the consistency over time or in relation to other institutions was provided.

Standard 2.4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Described in the Regulations on Master Studies



Standard 2.4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.

Not applicable.

Comments/Observations: There is no internships or external training periods. Graduates and employers believe that internships were necessary.

Standard 2.4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.

Not applicable.

Comments/Observations: No data about cooperation agreements was provided.

Performance indicators

Not specifically detailed in the SER

2.4.1. The academic feasibility of the study program is ensured by taking into account the expected entry qualifications, a suitable design of the curriculum, a student workload that has been checked for plausibility as well as an adequate number of examinations.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: The program has been in use during years. The student and graduates found the working load appropriate.

2.4.2. Teachers use new IT resources (e-mail, personal web page, topics, bibliographies and other resources in electronic format and communication with students) and auxiliary materials, such as whiteboard, flipchart and video-projector.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is a web page for each teacher in the Website, but with very little information.



2.4.3. The effectiveness of planned teaching strategies in achieving different types of learning outcomes is regularly assessed and adjustments are made in response to evidence about their effectiveness.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: At the end of each course there is a course evaluation and a student evaluation. See also Quality management performance indicators.

EDUCATIONAL PROCESS CONTENT

Compliance level:

Fully compliant

X Substantially compliant

Partially compliant

Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Adjust the competences to the master level in the EHEA and level of the EQF*
- 2. Create and share with the students a matrix of competences-courses to better define the progression of the learning.*
- 3. Link the learning outcomes of the study program with the competencies*
- 4. Include external practical stages such as internships of tutorized training in the program.*
- 5. More practical courses and internships will benefit the quality of the program*

.1. Students

Standard 2.5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.

Fully compliant.



Comments/Observations: Regulated by law. Published on the FMNS website (SEMS) which is sometimes not working! Most of the students come from their Bachelor program and there is very little to non, coming from other programs.

Standard 2.5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: All admitted students have a bachelor diploma in Chemistry or Engineering Chemistry.

Standard 2.5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: The groups include 15 students that allows effective teaching. In principle we found that the groups and teacher professor relation is good due to small size of Program.

Standard 2.5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Feedback is usually done 10 days after the examination. There are midterm evaluations.

Standard 2.5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: A record of the results is maintained in the electronic system so called SEMS and physical copies.

Standard 2.5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: No information was provided. Exams can be done using the SEMS.



Standard 2.5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: A record of the results is maintained in the electronic system so called SEMS.

Standard 2.5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Plagiarism is controlled by the teachers according with the Code of Ethics of the University of Prishtina and in some other informal manners. However, we did not find the plagiarism software that is in use.

Standard 2.5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is The Student Council of the Faculty of Mathematical-Natural Sciences representing the 5 student organizations. Through the Council as a representative body, the students of the Faculty of Mathematical-Natural Sciences, have their representatives in the decision-making bodies of the Faculty, such as the Faculty Council and the study commission of the Faculty.

Standard 2.5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations. Regulated (no. 2/111, date: 14.07.2017) and published in UHP site. Long procedures for recognition of ECTS. Mobility is documented in general for the last 3 years (programs not indicated). However, we did not observe high participation of students in the mobility programmes and even less number to none of incoming foreign students.

Standard 2.5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.

Fully compliant.



Comments/Observations: Each teacher reserves 10 hours per course to consultations and the time schedule is published in their door offices.

Performance indicators

Not specifically detailed in the SER

2.5.1. If necessary, an adequate selection process as well as recognition rules for foreign qualifications pursuant to the Lisbon Recognition Convention as well as qualifications obtained outside higher education institutions are defined.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Mobility is regulated by the University. The Faculty participates in Erasmus+ Programs.

2.5.2. Systems are established for monitoring and coordinating student workload across courses. Systems are in place for monitoring the progress of individual students with assistance and/or counselling is given to those facing difficulties. Year to year progression rates and program completion rates are monitored and analysed to identify and provide assistance to any categories of students who may be having difficulties.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Teachers declare to have regular meetings every two weeks.

2.5.3. Grading of students' tests, assignments and projects is assisted by the use of matrices or other means to ensure that the planned range of domains of student learning outcomes are addressed. Arrangements are made within the institution for training of teaching staff in the theory and practice of student assessment.

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: No evidence was provided

2.5.4. Support services (e.g., regarding the study program, student counselling in case of emotional, financial or family-related problems, career guidance, international matters, legal advice etc.) as well as subject-related and interdisciplinary guidance are provided.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: No evidence was provided



2.5.5. *Textbooks and reference materials are up to date and incorporate the latest developments in the field of study. Textbooks and other required materials are available in sufficient quantities before classes commence.*

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Reference materials should include links to data base. Library is relatively small for the number of students.

2.5.6. *The academic or professional fields for which students are being prepared are monitored on a continuing basis with necessary adjustments made in the program and in text and reference materials to ensure continuing relevance and quality.*

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Teachers declare a continuous update in their fields. Graduates ask for more professionalism.

STUDENTS

Compliance level:

Fully compliant

X Substantially compliant

Partially compliant

Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Mechanisms for assistance and support services are needed.*
2. *Use some recognized systems (e.g., Turnitin) to check for academic integrity and avoid plagiarism*
3. *Coordination between teachers, especially in relation to evaluation should be improved. the use of matrices may help.*
4. *Reference materials should include data bases.*
5. *Improve the design of the webpage to promote the recruitment of students*
6. *Improve the number of incoming foreign students through mobility programs*
7. *Enable smoother procedure for the transfer between Universities and ECTS recognition especially when students take part in mobility exchange*
8. *Implement additional support for student for their professional counselling*



9. *Continue good practice of industrial collaboration providing internships for the students*
 10. *Continue further developing the ALUMNI organization.*
-

.1. Research

Standard 2.6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is no a clear research plan connected to the program. Number of master theses high. Funding only covers small projects forcing staff to find international collaborations. There are no technicians to support research and equipment maintenance. There are not enough financial resources to conduct research.

Standard 2.6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Regulation on the Procedures of Employment and Advancement of Academic Staff in UP. Publications are the main criteria in academic promotion. Research also has a discount in teaching of approximately 20%. No information about scholarship is provided.

Standard 2.6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: The Ministry of Education, Sciences and Technology has defined research in different coefficients: e.g., coefficient one: publications in Web of Science, Scopus, EBSCO, DOAJ, and Word cat. Journals. Publications listed in Bell's list are excluded.



Standard 2.6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: The CV including research results were well documented.

Standard 2.6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Publications are well documented; there are also 2 patents owned by Univ of Paris; however, no information is provided regarding, contracts, consultancy, etc.

Standard 2.6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: Research is validated by publications.

Standard 2.6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: The majority of the staff have a good number of publications.

Standard 2.6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Most of them. Exceptions are related with special collaborations outside Kosovo.

Standard 2.6.9. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.

Non-compliant



Comments/Observations: No information is included in syllabi or on webpage.

Standard 2.6.10. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: No information is provided

Standard 2.6.11. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Students participate only during the diploma work. 19 Master theses were documented. Very few research projects occur outside thesis. Students expressed the need for more research engagement.

Performance indicators

Not specifically detailed in the SER

2.6.1. Assistance and support are given to teaching staff to develop collaborative research arrangements with colleagues in other institutions and in the international community.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Support comes mainly by international programs, such as Erasmus. In most cases collaborations came from personal contacts.

2.6.2. The study program periodically organises scientific sessions, symposiums, conferences, round tables, with the involvement of teaching staff, researchers, students and graduates, while proceedings are published in ISBN, ISSN scientific reports or in magazines dedicated to that particular activity.

Non-compliant

Comments/Observations: No data was provided.

2.6.3. Support is being provided for junior teaching staff in the development of their research programs through mechanisms such as mentoring by senior colleagues, inclusion in project teams, assistance in developing research proposals, and seed funding.

Substantially compliant

Comments/Observations: Junior staff is involved in research. No details about the support were provided.



2.6.4. *Strategies are introduced for identifying and capitalizing on the expertise of teaching staff and students in providing research and development services to the community.*

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: No data was provided.

2.6.5. *The institution is monitoring and supporting staff's contribution to attracting financial resources through research/applied/artistic projects and products. Staff capacity to generate such financial returns is considered in the individual performance review system.*

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: No data was provided.

2.6.6. *Cooperation with local industry and with other research agencies is encouraged. When appropriate, these forms of cooperation involve joint research projects, shared use of equipment, and cooperative strategies for development.*

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There are some connections. No data was provided.

RESEARCH

Compliance level:

Fully compliant

X Substantially compliant

Partially compliant

Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Policy regarding publications should emphasize the impact of the research and select journals included in the Journal Citation Reports.*
2. *Visibility of the research associated to the program should be increased by organizing periodically scientific sessions.*
3. *Information about the research of the teachers should be included in the syllabi*
4. *Knowledge and technology transfer is necessary. Strategies to produce patents, services and in general any kind of cooperation with society should be increased.*
5. *Central research facilities shared among different research groups are recommended.*



6. *A research plan is needed integrated in the UP. This plan should deal with financing, equipment, technicians to support research and equipment maintenance, international collaboration support, etc.*
 7. *Use standardized plagiarism tools to prevent plagiarism for both academic staff and students*
 8. *Engage all students in the research activities, not only during the Master thesis*
 9. *Communicated your research more in form of organizing scientific conferences at the Faculty*
-

.2. Infrastructure and resources

Standard 2.7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.

Substantially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is a need for new equipment and maintenance by technical personnel. Laboratories are shared with students of other studies offered by the Department of Chemistry.

Standard 2.7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: There is financial plan at the Faculty level, not at the study program. There is a concern regarding budget reduction from the Ministry.

Standard 2.7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:

- a) *owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process,*

Fully compliant.

Comments/Observations: All the activities are carried out in the premises of the Faculty.



- b) *owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;*

Substantially compliant

Comments/Observations: Equipment seems insufficient and requires renovation.

- c) *adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence;*

Non-compliant

Comments/Observations: There are complains about the availability of the Internet.

- d) *library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.*

Partially compliant.

Comments/Observations: Space and library funds are very limited.

Standard 2.7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.

Partially compliant

Comments/Observations: No information about IT was provided.

Standard 2.7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:

- A) *a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;*

Seats 84

- B) *a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;*

Room 1: 45, Room 2: 17

- C) *their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;*

194 book titles



D) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;

194 book titles

E) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;

194 book titles

Standard 2.7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.

Non-compliant.

Comments/Observations: Not data provided.

Performance indicators

Not specifically detailed in the SER

2.7.1. Formal plans are developed for the provision and improvement of infrastructure and resources, and the implementation and effectiveness of those plans is monitored on a regular basis.

Non-compliant

Comments/Observations: There is no a formal plan.

2.7.2. A senior staff member is assigned the responsibility for oversight and development of infrastructure and resources.

Full compliant

Comments/Observations: There is a vice-dean in charge.

2.7.3. The effectiveness and relevance of infrastructure and resources is regularly monitored through processes that include surveys of student usage and satisfaction. Infrastructure and resources are modified in response to evaluation and feedback.

Non-compliant

Comments/Observations: No data about student usage and satisfaction. The results of satisfaction surveys are not public, are generated at the office for Academic Affairs at the Rectorate (University of Prishtina)



INFRASTRUCTURE AND RESOURCES

Compliance level:

Fully compliant

Substantially compliant

X Partially compliant

Non-compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. A formal pluriannual plan for infrastructure and resources is recommended.*
- 2. Adequate software with utilisation licence*
- 3. Adapt infrastructure and facilities to students with special need*
- 4. Continue collaborating with research Institutes to overcome lack of research infrastructure*
- 5. Continue improving digitalisation and distance learning facilities*
- 6. Improve the library fund so that literature needed for the program is accessible and sufficient to all students enrolled*

OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Evaluation has been carried out in agreement with the protocol provided by the KAA. All meetings took place as scheduled, with the expected participation and without incidences. In the academic staff meeting the participation of Professor A. Berisha was accepted in spite of his participation in the management meeting. Meetings were conducted for the master degree in Organic Chemistry and the master degree in Analytical and Environmental Chemistry together with representatives of both master's degrees, with the only exception of the meeting with the heads of the study program. No significant differences were observed between these two groups in any of the meetings.

Information provided in the SER was very poor, although they gave a SWOT analysis for each section. Documents requested were provided. No one of the performance indicators and some of the standards are not described. Description of the standards are in many cases very



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosovaza Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

general as to see if the standard is achieved. As a result, most of the evaluation is based in declarations without documented evidence.

Mission, objectives and administration was consistent with a public university program, although transfer of knowledge and technology to society, as well as services, need to be improved. In this sense, a lack of start-ups, spin-offs etc is observed. Budget and infrastructure seem very limited, especially equipment. Academic staff is of good quality with a remarkable research production. Research is conducted mainly for promotion more than to impact in science and society in term of patents, services, etc. In addition, the necessary connection between research, professional aspects and teaching in the different subjects is poor. The educational processes are well organized, although with little flexibility for students to choose their way. A higher degree of specialization is needed. In this sense we recommend to offer elective more than compulsory courses. The master seems to be an extension of the bachelor, without substantial differences. In this sense we recommend to review the scope and the educational processes to fit better with the level of competences agreed in the European Higher Education Area (EHEA). Students are well represented and seem to be satisfied, although participation in quality issues is low. Quality management is well organized with fluid connections between university and faculty; however, it deserves special attention as SER does not provide evidence and a few data and indicators are public, according with the goal of transparency of EHEA.

The steering committee of the program declared they plan to increase scientific quality and networking. For these regards, we recommend to focus in increasing the visibility of the research by mean of publication in top quality journals more than to increase the number of publications and by participation and/or organization of scientific events. Patents and other forms of knowledge and technological transfer should be encouraged. We also recommend to implement the recommendations indicated in The Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences University of Prishtina Accreditation Report (May 30, 2016), not just the one indicated to the Organic Chemistry Program, but all, as they address important points affecting the Organic Chemistry Program.

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Organic Chemistry offered by University of Prishtina is **Substantially compliant** with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends **to accredit** the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 15 students per year to be enrolled in the program.

36



Evidence for the standards and key performance indicators should be provided to the KAA during the first year and key performance indicators published in the Web site of the program.

- **APPENDICES** (*if available*)

Expert Team

Chair

Firmado digitalmente por Antonio
Sánchez Pozo
Nombre de reconocimiento (DN):
cn=Antonio Sánchez Pozo, o, ou,
email=sanchezpster@gmail.com, c=ES
Fecha: 2021.06.18 10:49:20 +02'00'

(Signature)

Antonio Sánchez Pozo

18-06-21

Member

(Signature)

Domagoj Vugić

18-06-21