UNIVERSITY OF PRISHTINA "HASAN PRISHTINA"

FACULTY OF MATEMATICAL NATURAL SCIENCE

Study program: Engineering Chemistry, Bsc

REACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

May, Zagreb/Paris

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: April 8, 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. sc.Sanja Kalambura, University of Applied Science Velika Gorica
- Mr. sc. Domagoj Vugić, Student Expert

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Naim Gasshi

Sources of information for the Report:

- Self-evaluation report University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina", Faculty of Mathematical Natural Sciences*),* study program: engineering chemistry- BSc
- Course Syllabuses
- Professors CV

Requested documents:

- Expert team evaluation report from 2016 for this program
- Learning outcomes for study program
- Development Strategy
- Quality Politics
- Regulation on Quality Assurance and evaluation
- Quality Assurance manual
- Manual on the Determination of Measuring Indicators
- Student electronic management system – link
- Active web site on English
- Tutorial procedure
- Peer to peer procedure

3

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

- Questionnaire for academic staff, administration and students
- Academic staff Questionnaire
- Instruction No 1/438
- Total number of active students and dropouts
- Total number of Alumni
- Statistic - Drop off
- Centre for Teaching excellence – regulation, description, projects, all informative things
- Evaluation results for questionaries above
- Proposed recommendation for all questionaries above
- Questionnaire - Graduates (Alumni).
- Library description – number of books for EM program
- Practice manual
- Laboratory exercised manual
- UP Statute, Regulation of Bachelor studies

- Code of Ethics
- Student rights and obligations
- Student transfer regulation and mobility
- Research objectives, research plan
- Policies for research recognition (document for promotion of academic staff)
- Financial plan and sustainability analysis
- Number of book titles
- We also need information regarding the number of seats in library, placesi n classrooms and laboratories etc.
- Example of Bachelor thesis

Additionally, Received documents:

- *Questionnaire for students*

- *Questionnaire for academic staff*
- *Questionnaire for graduates*
- *Questionnaire for administrative*
- *Evaluation reports for students – Albanian language*
- *Strategic Plan 2020-2022*
- *FMNS Development plan 2010-2015*
- *Documents for Centre for teaching excellence*
- *FR UP FMNS 2016*
- *Financial plan*
- *Accreditation manual*
- *Bachelor Thesis – Lejla Canziba*
- *Code of Ethics*
- *Instructions 1-438*
- *KPI-UP-Included Academic Staff*
- *Regulation for BSC Studies*
- *Regulation on Quality Assurance*
- *Regulation on selection procedures for academic staff_UP*
- *Statute of UP*
- *Student evaluation for teaching and courses*
- *Updated regulation for BSc studies.*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of KAA, July 2018*
- *Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact, Sustainability*

5

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

1.2. Site visit schedule

Date: 8th of April 2021

Expert Team

- Prof. Dr. sc. Sanja Kalambura
- Mr. Domagoj Vugić (Student Expert)

Coordinators of KAA

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA

- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Site Visit Program

09.00 – 09.40   Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated

- Prof. Dr. Idriz Vehapi (Dean)
- Prof.Asoc.Dr. Avni Berisha (Vice-Dean for Teaching)
- Prof.Ass. Dr. Kajtaz Bllaca (Vice-Dean for Finance)
- Prof.Asoc.Dr. Sefer Avdija (Vice-Dean for Science and QA)

09.45 – 10:30   Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff

- Dr. Ilir Mazreku (FSHMN)
- Besnik Loxha (UP)
- Artan Alidema (FSHMN)

10.35 – 11.35   Meeting with the heads of the study programme

6

- Prof.dr. Ramë Vataj
- Prof.ass.Dr. Makfire Sadiku
- Prof.dr.Fatmir Faiku
- Prof.ass. Ilir Shehu

11:35 – 12:10   Lunch break

12.10 – 12:50   Meeting with teaching staff

- Prof.asoc.Dr. Arben Haziri
- Ass.Dr. Flamur Sopaj
- Ass.Msc.Vjollca Berisha

12.55 – 13.40   Meeting with students

- Artiola Gorani-studente (Bsc.Kimi inxhinierike)
- Jonë Shahini-studente (Bsc.Kimi inxhinierike)

13.45 – 14.25   Meeting with graduates

- Medina Kqiku – e diplomuar
- Blerina Osmanaj – e diplomuar
- Ilirjana Çetaj kanë perfunduar-e diplomuar

14.30 – 15.10   Meeting with employers of graduates

- Sabrije Spahiu
- Azem Jaha

15.10 – 15.20   Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts

15:20 – 15:30   Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

7

No	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs			
1	Engineering Chemistry, BSc (Reacreditation)	Prof. Dr. Sanja Kalambura Mr. Domagoj Vugić	Ramë Vataj	Fatmir Faiku	Makfire Sadiku - Hasani	Ilir Shehu

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The University of Prishtina (UP) is the largest University in Kosovo, offering a diverse array of programs (bachelor, masters, and doctorate) in different Faculties, including programs in mathematics and natural sciences. The studies in the field of mathematics and natural sciences (chemistry, biology, physics and mathematics) in the UP, for the first time started in 1960, as part of the Faculty of Philosophy. Later, in 1971 section of exact sciences separated from this faculty, and then form this section the Faculty of Mathematical and Natural Sciences (FMNS) was established with the verdict of the Assembly of Kosovo (Official Paper of SAP of Kosovo, no, 37/71). Since that time, full-time and correspondence studies were organized in five departments: Chemistry, Biology, Physics, Geography and Mathematics.

FMNS actually has five departments with respective programs as follow: Department of Chemistry - study programs: Chemistry BSc., Engineering Chemistry BSc., Physical and Inorganic Chemistry MSc., Organic Chemistry BSc., Analytical and Environmental Chemistry BSc. and Chemistry PhD.

In 2021 the FMNS Faculty apply with the current Becleor Degree Program in Chemical Engineering studies lasting three (3) years and one hundred and eighty (180) ECTS credits.

The specific objectives of the UP are given in Self-evaluation report (SER) are following:

– To act as an institutional and leadership centre for advancing the knowledge, creative ideas and science in the Kosovo higher education system

8

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

– To have a leading the role in the development of education, science, culture, society and economy of Kosovo

– To actively participate in the process of promoting civic democracy

– To create and support the highest standards in teaching and learning, scientific research as well as in and artistic creativity

– To utilize its resources in the most efficient way

– To maximize the cooperation and participation in higher education activities at national, regional and international level

– To adapt to European standards

– To be fully integrated into the European Higher Education Area, the European Research Area and to undertake the appropriate reform steps needed to achieve this mission.

According to the UP Statute, the University create equal opportunities for all, without any discrimination based on gender, race, sexual orientation, marital status, language, religion, political belief, nationality end etc. FMNS, in accordance with the Statute of the UP, sets up the criteria for admission of new students for each academic year. The number of students is proposed by the academic units (faculties), respectively by departments based on their human and material resources, then these quotas approved by the Council of FMNS and by UP Senate. For students who come from families of vulnerable social categories, there is assistance program provided to support their studies, foreseen by the Administrative Instruction published by MEST. The semester fee is also acceptable for most of the social categories (students), while students from the most remote places from Prishtina can stay in dormitory at the University Campus. Teaching in FMNS is organized in a regular (full-time) form and involves a variety of activities planned to achieve the objectives of the courses and the program as a whole. These activities include lectures, laboratory work, theoretical and practical exercises, seminars, scientific research, mentoring of students, etc. Curriculum development at FMNS is regulated and implies the development of a series of processes and experiences that students have to develop to obtain a degree.

Since we did not have opportunity to visit University due COVID -19 restrictions we can confirm from materials and movie that are satisfactory, equipped teaching rooms and laboratories.

BRIEF ANALYSIS OF ADVANTAGES AND DISADVANTAGES

ADVANTAGES OF THE HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTION:

1. FMNS has ambition and opportunity to lead both education and science in the region
2. Very Good connection with the local and business community
3. Clear mission of the program
4. Satisfactory motivation of professors and management for study program
5. Program offers a broad base of knowledge in the field of chemistry
6. Infrastructure is satisfactory: teaching rooms, library, web site (Albanian language)
7. Only BSc. Program in Kosovo
8. Motivated students
9. Communication between teaching staff and students is on a good level, teaching staff is available to all students.

DISADVANTAGES OF THE HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTION

1. Internationalization aspects are not yet sufficiently developed
2. Practical experience in laboratories is established but vulnerable due the Pandemic conditions (students do not have practice)
3. The transfer of knowledge and technology needs to be improved
4. Possible problems for student's enrolment since unemployment in Kosovo is high
5. Internal communication is limited meaning that students are not fully aware of all the changes and improvements made by FMNS, particularly in response to student surveys
6. Access to learning resources (library and e-books) is limited
7. The web site does not have enough information's about the institution and does not update the information quickly enough
8. Implementation of proposals obtained from student's surveys is not on the level that it needs to be.

EXAMPLES OF GOOD PRACTICE

1. Collection and analysis of quality data at all levels at University

2. Integration into the local community
3. The proposed study program is created for the needs of society
4. Motivated staff ready to learn and teach.

Very important note is that this evaluation from the expert team were very difficult since SER does not provide proof for the listed statements. FMNS English web site version is not functional. The additional documents received do not provide the necessary evidence. Accordingly, our expert evaluation report will be done according to the analyses of the submitted documents.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

UP has mission and objectives defined in Statute but for the study program mission missing so this expert team cannot confirm that is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.

This expert team cannot confirm that necessary policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues are publicly available to all staff and students. It will be helpful that are also on English language.

The University has a Code of Ethics for academic staff. There is a well done prescribe approach to academic integrity and ethics, and the documentation addresses important topics. Management has defined integrity and ethics as a matter of policy. However, plagiarism detection software is not currently used.

The learning outcomes of the study programs are not known to this expert team. In SER is written that the content of the study programs is designed based on faculty and university of regulations, and University statues as well. Curriculum development at FMNS is regulated and for each new proposed study program. In the SER it is explained in detail new study programme procedure: "First sets up the program objectives and learning outcomes, then through the planned activities provides the appropriate subject content that enables the students to achieve objective and respective learning outcomes".

11

It is necessary to review the learning outcomes of study program (if exist) and for all courses. The research concept is very good.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.		X
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.		X
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.		X

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The program mission needs better definition of the intended learning outcomes at the descriptive levels of the European Framework of Qualification. It needs to be seen in all your publications.*

2. *The study program should strive for a fundamental revision of the SWOT analysis*

12

since strengths and weakness are not in balance and also threats are sometimes actually weakness.

3. *All learning outcomes need to be revised and improve with generic skills.*
4. *It is desirable that the total number of learning outcomes at the level of the study program be between 15 and 20.*
5. *Increase the number of hours of student internship.*
6. *Focus yourself to be a leader in the region with attractive and best applying a coherent concept of student- cantered teaching and learning.*
7. *Integration of modern teaching practices and research at the program level, especially integration of e-learning and online teaching and learning at all levels of the teaching concept and the entire curriculum in a differentiated way.*
8. *The didactic concept should take into account all relevant stages and elements of the teaching and learning process.*
9. *Include a learning outcome at the level of the study program which will clearly show that the study program contributes to the development of engineering spirit.*
10. *Include a learning outcome at the level of the study program which will clearly show that the study program contributes to the development of communications skills.*

2.2. Quality management

The foundations of the QAS have been designed. The Committee for Quality Assurance and evaluation at the faculty level is composed from a member from the Faculty Management, the Faculty Coordinator for Quality Assurance, students and academic staff. Quality assurance and finances of UP are regulated by Law No. 04/L-037 on Higher Education in Republic of Kosovo" and by the Statute of UP. Based on article 210- 225 of the Statute, the Senate of UP approved the Regulation on Quality assurance and evaluation, which regulates the mechanisms and procedures of quality assurance and evaluation in UP.

The appropriate, and the major of functions (activities) appear to be implemented. The next stage for the UP and FMNS is to transition the QAS from a 'design' into 'business-as-usual'. This will involve embedding the QAS into practice for all staff and integrating the various processes, including data flows (e.g., surveys, student feedback, pass

13

rates, plagiarism etc) and key performance indicators, into routine review and planning meetings.

The FMNS will also need to define mechanisms to 'close the loop' and take appropriate action. For this reason, efforts should be further intensified to involve more in operational activities. It is necessary to ensure PDCA cycle Plan, Do, Check, Act. The part Act seems to be missing in this cycle. From the available documents and the discussions on site, it is clear to the experts that the data collected will also be used for continuous development, but it has to be show somehow. It is necessary to provide some transparency and communicate/report the issues and actions of the QAS to different stakeholder groups, including where appropriate students.

The QAS is relatively immature, which is to be expected given its implementation post previous reaccreditation. The QAS needs also to be complemented by a cultural change where staff do not view the QAS as a threat but a tool to realise continuous improvement and to achieve and maintain the highest standards in education and science.

The QAS procedures developed for professional practice is maturing toward an example of good practice with clear learning outcomes and review thereof, an exit survey for companies and subsequent review and action by Head of Professional Practice.

As already recognised in the self-report, the university has recognised that there is room for improvement in the area of internationalization. The experts can confirm this by stating that the university develop online evaluation systems but did not receive any documents which will give more detail according improvements.

Alumni are very important part of Quality Assessment. They can conduct corresponding institutionalised surveys and implement results to improve all quality aspects.

The University performs evaluation activities on an ongoing basis and for quality assurance processes University using instruments like: Questionnaire for students, Questionnaire for Academic Staff, Questionnaire for graduates, Questionnaire for Administration. All set instruments are given in questionnaire form. Question structure is satisfactory but results missing. This expert team received student results on Albanian language, and it is not in position to grade these reports.

Expert team want to point to the fact that is challenging for the university to carry out numerous evaluations, especially in the case of electronic evaluations, when evaluation fatigue sets. Maybe to think about transparent communication and publication of evaluated results.

Unfortunately, there are no reports on how the public or university members are informed about quality development in a public report beside web site.

14

This expert team did not find in documents and web site Quality Politics and also General Strategy for the Faculty.

From the available documents and the discussions on site, it is clear to the experts that the data collected will also be used for continuous development.

Information on the activities of the University is available on the website in Albanian. In addition, communication with stakeholders is maintained in a variety of ways.
The University is obviously taking its social role seriously.

The FMNS has a strategy plan for 2 years that includes establishing new study programmes, research centres and intensifying cooperation with industry to become a regional centre of excellence. The strategy is entirely appropriate and plans to operationalise this are documented. As part of the plan, the following recommendations must be implemented to ensure that the education is not/has not been compromised.

In last report from 2016. recommendations of the expert team were: „The literature should be updated to modern books. The course objectives and learning outcomes of some courses are too general and should be given more precisely. The ratio between obligatory and elective courses is too high. More elective courses are needed, especially in the third year."

Some of those recommendations are improved like more elective courses in program but literature and learning outcomes recommendations must be adopted.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.		X
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.		X
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	

15

Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		X
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		X
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.		X
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.		X
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *QAS needs to be embedded into practice and mechanisms designed to enable feedback and action within appropriate timescales.*
2. *In the term of Efficient QAS need to be implement and understandable, visible Quality Politics.*
3. *As set of key performance indicators need to establish (agreed), monitored and reviewed at key times throughout the academic year.*
4. *Open discussion of the course evaluation results with the students.*
5. *Open discussion of the course evaluation results with the teachers.*
6. *The Faculty should make efforts to develop and implement a quality management*

system which ensures proactive involvement of all stakeholders following a PDCA-cycle approach.

7. *The culture must change to one of continuous improvement with appropriate feedback and timely/efficient loops e.g., annual cycles*

8. *Write a Development Strategy for Faculty and make it public.*

9. *Be very clear in publication what changes have been brought about by evaluation results.*

10. *The Faculty should make efforts to set functional and operational quality system with all stake holders.*

11. *In different operational quality bodies, it is necessary to involve external stakeholders and Alumni.*

12. *Establishment of alumni tracking and the corresponding integration into institutionalised surveys.*

13. *Introduce additional subjects with a focus on current and future knowledge and skills, both for current students and for external experts who need more advanced knowledge.*

14. *Accept all recommendations from 2016 report.*

2.3. Academic staff

The institution employed qualified staff that are responsible for the programme of engineering chemistry and other academic student services wherever they are offered in order to improve the effectiveness of the institution.

All members of the academic staff can't occupy, within one academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, part-time).

Literature proposed in Syllabuses need to be improve and changed. This is the week part of this program proposal.

Centre for Teaching Excellence office ensure trainings for academic staff related to contemporary teaching methods. It is visible from web page of the centre.

Each semester regularly evaluates the academic staff by the students for each subject. The data are not made public but are communicated to the management and to the professor of subject.

In European quality academic and teaching strategies one of the important tasks is to develop good own teaching materials. This has to be focus for the future in this CE program.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	

		X
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.		

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Improving the pedagogical competencies of teachers should become part of regular institutional activities*
2. *The University should encourage teachers to significantly increase outbound mobility*
3. *Literature revision in Syllabuses is obligatory*
4. *It is important to ensure objective and transparent grade weight given by each evaluator for academic staff*
5. *Results of evaluation should be public, at least average grade for study program*
6. *Workload of teachers should be monitored as well as the total number of courses per teacher to boost the teaching quality and to give time for scientific activity and professional and personal development*
7. *Make teachers aware of alternative teaching strategies, including the periodic evaluation of the alignment of teaching methods and learning outcomes (ongoing process)*
8. *Teachers should to a greater extent include the latest research, trends and knowledge on the labour market in the teaching process*
9. *Literature should be more on international level and in electronic version*
10. *Provide access to a range of electronic tools for teaching, professional and research activities*
11. *Increase the number of training and educations for teaching staff to achieve better results in the teaching process*
12. *Formalize Peer review process.*

2.4. Educational process content

The CE program offers to students' knowledge related to all fields of the chemistry. In SER is written that program prepares students for communication skills and builds their future career

in scientific research in chemical industry. This statement cannot be confirmed since none of the courses are not connected with communication skills development.

This program promotes chemical engineering and applied chemistry and students that finish this program will have the skills to cope with problems within their domain.

Subject selection is done according available experts and needs in surrounding so from that point of view it is acceptable. But still there are some parts which need to be improve, especially in methodical approach and applying the modern learning methods.

The correlation between planned learning outcomes and specific courses it was not documented in Self Evaluation report.

Learning outcomes for study program has to be in direct correlation with competencies. Basically, they are the same but just written on another way. This part is very important for employers since they would like to know on the end of the day what graduates can do (competences) and you have to teach them that (learning outcomes). It has to be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.

The curriculum contains some weaknesses regarding the structure.

The syllabi provided reveal different quality levels of course descriptions. The majority of syllabi is characterized by using active verbs for defining learning outcomes at the course level. Some course descriptions are developed in a very traditional way emphasizing mainly the provision of knowledge. For example, subject *Technological Processes* according to the curriculum, consists of two hours lectures per week and two hours exercises per week. In this course description, the learning outcomes mostly refer to "evaluation" of theoretical foundations but not to the performance. Similar shortcomings can be identified in other courses, too. Perhaps the reason for this uneven description of learning outcomes is mainly a matter of wording and can be improved by making these parts more explicit in the course descriptions.

All learning outcomes has active verbs but it ned to be develop second level using the verbs for generic skills.

Most important part in creating the efficient and quality defined program is to make a matrix table with all learning outcomes for courses and learning outcomes for study program. After that you will be able to say that all of your courses contribute to study program in equal way. In this moment this expert team cannot conclude what is the contribution of all courses in program.

20

Overall, not much information was provided about the why and how of the curriculum's structure, however, the definition of the learning outcomes at the program level corresponds to level 6 of the European Qualifications Framework in general.

The complete lack of e-learning and online teaching as key elements of a modern teaching strategy is missing. It is necessary to develop online teaching and e-learning and integrated in practical teaching.

This study program is offered only on Albanian language.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X	
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.		X

Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.		X
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	X	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Revise and standardize all learning outcomes*
2. *It is recommended to have 4-7 outcomes per course and a maximum of 10 for the study program*
3. *Make a constructive alignment and incorporate the acquisition of generic skills into the outcomes*

22

4. *Multiple electives that will generate general competencies such as management*
5. *Link the learning outcomes of the study program with the competencies*
6. *In order to better support international exchange, it is necessary to introduce lectures and courses in English in all studies. These lectures and courses should be defined as compulsory for all students, including homework.*
7. *Ensure the practical classes and exercise.*

2.5. Students

The expert team concluded according to self-evaluation report and site visit that:

The Faculty has defined a clear and formal admission procedure at institutional level applied for all students. This procedure is regulated by Statute and Faculty Regulation for bachelor studies. Additionally, all the students possess a high school diploma, and we note general student interest in the program.

However, we would suggest improvement of Faculty webpage regarding the recruitment and general information about the program itself. We would also like to see more foreign students enrolled and improved student mobility as Faculty has opportunity to become a leader in teaching of the natural sciences in this region.

Number of enrolled students in the first year is 60 and study groups in the programs are designed to be small (10-15 students) and seem to support effective and interactive exchange among study groups. Because of the small size of the Faculty and study groups, we found in principle a good level of communication and support from Academic staff concerning students. Additionally, students are guided through the Syllabus during first day of each course start.

All students will receive feedback on their performance. However, we note that feedback is regarded mostly to student achievements after the exam. Faculty should envisage other forms of feedback in form of student guidance and career advices. Student examination results are

23

recorded in an electronic system which is an example of good up to date practice. Additionally, administrative staff is involved in supporting the students by keeping their records of progression.

Student rights and obligations are publicly available. However due to malfunction of the Faculty webpage we had difficulties confirming this aspect. Nevertheless, we recommend an upgrade of accessibility that student can reach online. Additionally, students have their own student organisations representing student interest at both Faculty and University level.

We did not find effective procedure to ensure that the work submitted by students is original. Publishing the thesis online and guidance by thesis supervisors is not good enough to prevent plagiarism among all students. To prevent this, procedure needs to be clear and effective and should consists of use of the plagiarism software.

Student transfer between the faculties and study programs is regulated in the internal document by Regulation for the mobility of UP academic staff and students and University of Prishtina has signed various mobility agreement that are managed by the Office for International allowing students to take part in the exchange. However, we did not observe high participation of students in the mobility programmes and even less number to none of incoming foreign students.

We found good practice of collaboration and agreements with the industry and fully support its further development to ease the employment of the student. Feedback we received ensured us that there is increasing need for production of highly skilled science graduates and that Faculty is doing well on that aspect.

Standard	Compliance

	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		X
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	

Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.		X

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Improve the design of your webpage to promote the recruitment of students*
2. *Improve the number of incoming foreign students through mobility programs*
3. *Enable smoother procedure for the transfer between Universities and ECTS recognition especially when students take part in mobility exchange*
4. *Implement additional support for student for their professional counselling*
5. *Continue good practice of industrial collaboration providing internships for the students*
6. *Increase the number of the foreign students and ensure gender balance through the recruitment*
7. *Provide mechanisms to ensure that work submitted by students is original (use of plagiarism software)*
8. *Continue further developing the ALUMNI organization.*

2.6. Research

During the analysing the data from SER and Panel discussion this expert team conclude that there is a lack of research dedicated funds and lack of modern equipment necessary to conduct research. We also note a limited access of both students and academic staff to international databases of scientific journals.

Regarding the academic staff involved in the program, they are well involved in research activities that are taking part at the Faculty and in cooperation with Research Institutes abroad. Expectations for conducting research are clearly defined and is one of the main criteria in

26

assessing their performance takin in account the promotion of the academic staff. Research is primarily taking in account international scientific journals and most of the staff generated a publication in the last 3 years. All the publications are close to the field of research and their results are communicated regularly in the scientific meetings both in the country and abroad. In general, we found that academic staff has a history of scientific research and that in context of country, Faculty and particularly Chemistry department is one of the biggest contributors of research activity.

In this Bachelor program students are rarely participating in the research activities outside the practical courses offered within the program because there is not any specific scientific research objective set. We highly encourage higher participation of students in Research even it is a bachelor level, especially while conducting their Bachelor Thesis.

More support from the government and the University is needed to fully implement research objectives. There is a need for improvement of the Research Facilities as well.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	

Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.		X
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities		X

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Continue further increase of number and quality of scientific publications*

28

2. *Explore the use of research funding from international organisation to improve research capacities, especially equipment*
3. *Forster more international collaboration in scientific research*
4. *Use standardized plagiarism tools to prevent plagiarism for both academic staff and students*
5. *Provide access to scientific journals to both academic staff and students*
6. *Engage all students in the research activities*
7. *Communicated your research more in form of organizing scientific conferences at the Faculty*
8. *Clear introduction of research activities on web site.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

The Faculty has adequate facilities to conduct its teaching and research activities. The Department of Chemistry has a surface area of 2041m2 consisting of teaching rooms and laboratories. All the spaces are owned by the Faculty and are not rented by any different Institution. Regarding the libraries, Department of Chemistry use the facilities of the Department of Chemistry libraries and the University Library. However, we note that libraries are not fully functional and often with lack of and outdated scientific literature that requires further investment.

Sustainability of the study program is ensured by developed financial plan for the upcoming years. We noted lack of technical staff to maintain the existing equipment and further investment in laboratory spaces is needed.

To ensure high quality of teaching and research further investment in infrastructure particularly laboratories and equipment is highly recommended. We also note that Faculty development is jeopardized by budget cuts from the MF. We hope that with the increased budget and investment in new spaces and facilities program and the research production of Kosovo will

29

benefit. Within the new facilities it is recommended that they are fully adapted to students with special needs as existing ones are not.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.		X
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	

Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		X
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs		X

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Continue collaborating with research Institutes to overcome lack of research infrastructure*
2. *Continue improving digitalisation and distance learning facilities*
3. *Ensure that students with special needs will have adequate infrastructure when new Facilities are built*

31

4. *Improve the library fund so that literature needed for the program is accessible and sufficient to all students enrolled*
5. *Ensure that new facilities will benefit both students and research*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The Expert team would like to commend the programme development team for their proactive engagement with the Panel during the validation event. There was a very strong sense of teamwork and ownership exhibited by the programme development team. Having considered the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme development team, the Re-accreditation Panel recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance Level
Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
Quality management	Partially compliant
Academic Staff	Substantially compliant
Educational Process Content	Substantially compliant
Students	Substantially compliant
Research	Substantially compliant
Infrastructure and resources	Partially compliant
Overall Compliance	Substantially compliant

The overall compliance is assessed by the experts at the level of **Substantially compliant.**

However, the following recommendations need to be considered in relation to programmes re-accreditation in future period:

- The study program has a great potential for students, professors and Kosovo so it has

32

to be modern and based on good practices.

- You should strive for a fundamental revision of the SWOT analysis since strengths and weakness are not in balance and also threats are sometimes actually weakness. From that point we can clearly see what we can change in the future. The program mission needs better definition of the intended learning outcomes at the descriptive levels of the European Framework of Qualification.

- Adopt and accept all recommendations from previous report.

- Focus yourself on the possibility that you become a leader in the region with attractive and best applying a coherent concept of student- cantered teaching and learning.

- Integrate of modern teaching practices and research at the program level, especially integration of e-learning and online teaching and learning at all levels of the teaching concept and the entire curriculum in a differentiated way.

- Write a Quality Policy and make it public and also Development Strategy for Faculty

- Put a live open discussion of the course evaluation results with the students and teachers.

- The Faculty should make efforts to develop and implement a quality management system which ensures proactive involvement of all stakeholders following a PDCA-cycle approach.

- Revise and standardize all learning outcomes, make a constructive alignment and incorporate the acquisition of generic skills into the outcomes.

- In order to better support international exchange, it is necessary to introduce lectures and courses in English in all studies. These lectures and courses should be defined as compulsory for all students, including homework.

- Provide mechanisms to ensure that work submitted by students is original.

- Continue further developing the ALUMNI organization.

- Use plagiarism tools to prevent plagiarism for both academic staff and students.

- The University should aim to create an environment which welcomes all students, enabling them to participate fully in university life. This applies to students with physical disabilities.

And on the end:

- SER document is poor quality document. It has to be improved.

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program *Engineering Chemistry* offered by *University of Prishtina" Hasan Prishtina" is **Substantially compliant** with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends *to **reaccredit*** the study program for a duration of *3 years* with a number of *60* **students** to be enrolled in the program.

4. APPENDICES *(if available)*

None

Expert Team

Chair

| (Signature) | (Prof. PhD. Sanja Kalambura) | (11.05.2021.) |

Member – Student expert

| (Signature) | (Mr. Domagoj Vugić) | (11.05.2021.) |