



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

***UNIVERSITY OF APPLIED SCIENCES IN FERIZAJ  
(UASF)***

**Bachelor of Science in Management of Hospitality and Tourism**

**RE-ACCREDITATION**

**REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM**

*23<sup>RD</sup> OF FEBRUARY, 2021 – 26<sup>th</sup> OF MARCH, JUBLJANA*



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION .....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule .....	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	7
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION.....	8
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	8
2.2. Quality management .....	12
2.3. Academic staff .....	15
2.4. Educational process content.....	18
2.5. Students.....	23
2.6. Research.....	27
2.7. Infrastructure and resources .....	32
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET .....	35
5. APPENDICES ( <i>if available</i> ).....	37



## 1. INTRODUCTION

### 1.1. Context

#### Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Dr. Yelena Istileulova, Fulbright Scholar, DAAD expert of Hub Peer Support project*

#### Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Naim Gashi, KAA Director*
- *Ilirjane Ademaj Ahmeti, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring*

#### Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-evaluation report of the University of Applied Sciences, Bachelor of Science in Management of Hospitality and Tourism, Ferizaj, 2021*
- *Appendixes with Regulations/documents/information*
- *Web-site;*
- *The requested documents (with the answers received by the 8<sup>th</sup> of March, 2021):*
  - *Report of the previous accreditation or just the summary of recommendations;*
  - *Regulation on the evaluation of academic staff;*
  - *Regulation on Research policy/University's Regulation for Scientific Research";*
  - *Summary of recommendations of the previous accreditation for the BSc;*
  - *The samples of Questionnaire distributed for evaluation (Scanned/copied);*
  - *The scanned copy of Teacher's evaluation (names can be eliminated) if available*
  - *Results of the survey data collected – if available;*
  - *Ratio of students to teacher;*
  - *Any KPIs and targets (for 2021), and for the past - 2018 or 2019*
  - *Description of procedure for anti-plagiarism check at the programme level;*
  - *Admission requirements for students;*

#### Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *KAA Accreditation Manual (as of 11.07.2018);*
- *European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance;*
- *Triangulation method;*
- *Benchmarking of HEIs in Kosovo;*
- *References to articles on Kosovo's higher education*



## 1.2. Site visit schedule

### Programme Accreditation Procedure at University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj

Date of site visit: 23rd of February 2021

09.00 – 09.40	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated ( <i>no slide presentation is allowed; the meeting is intended as a free discussion and this applies for each session</i> )
09.45 – 10.55	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
11.00 – 11.40	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
11.45 – 12.35	Meeting with teaching staff
12.35 – 13.10	Lunch break
13.15 – 13.55	Meeting with students
14.00 – 14.40	Meeting with graduates
14.45 – 15.25	Meeting with employers of graduates
15.30 – 15.40	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
15.40 – 15.50	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

#### Site Visit Program

23<sup>rd</sup> of February

09.00 – 09.40 Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated (*no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion and this applies for each session*)

*Prof.Dr. Agron Bajraktari – Rector*

*Prof.Dr. Bujar Pira – Vice Rector*

*Prof.As.Dr. Fakije Zejnullahu – Vice Rector*

*Armend Hysa – General Secretary*



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

- 09.45 – 10.55 Meeting with the heads of the study programme  
*Prof.As.Dr. Mimoza Zhubi*  
*Prof.As.Dr. Arbresha Meha*  
*Prof.As.Dr. Bashkim Musliu*  
*Prof.As.Dr. Idriz Kovaci*  
*Prof.As.Dr. Petrit Hasanaj*
- 11.00 – 11.40 Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff  
*Prof.Dr. Bujar Pira – Vice Rector*  
*Armend Hysa – General Secretary*  
*Prof.As.Dr. Leonora Rudhani-Haliti – Academic and QA (ECTS) coordinator*  
*Fatime Musliu – QA office*  
*Besa Rexhepi – Student services*
- 11.45 – 12.35 Meeting with teaching staff  
*Prof.As.Dr. Sokol Krasniqi*  
*Prof.As.Dr. Bislim Lekiqi*  
*Prof.As.Dr. Ismajl Mehmeti*  
*Mr.Sc. Etleva Blakaj*  
*Mr.Sc. Florit Hoxha*  
*Mr.Sc. Flamur Salihu*
- 12.35 – 13.10 Lunch break
- 13.15 – 13.55 Meeting with students  
*Erbliina Hasani*  
*Eurolinda Shabani*  
*Xhenetë Mjaku*  
*Festina Vranoci*  
*Endrit Ademi*  
*Endrit Sadiku*  
*Leona Jahiri*



14.00 – 14.40 Meeting with graduates  
*Lorita Rama*  
*Rinidon Bislimi*  
*Resul Qorrolli*  
*Rinore Caka*  
*Almir Osmani*  
*Fitim Sejdiu*  
*Arbnore Avdiija*

14.45 – 15.25 Meeting with employers of graduates  
*Enver Haziri – EuroArt,*  
*Nexhmendin Sadiku – Daqa,*  
*Bujar Baliu – ANB Baliu,*  
*Avni Bajrami – Oxa Group,*  
*Arianit Kastrati – Nica Swiss,*  
*Nehat Ademi – N.T.P. Doqi.*  
*Fahri Bega – Veneta Tours*

15.30 – 15.40 Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts

15.40 – 15.50 Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

Nr.	Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study programs
1	Management of Hospitality and Tourism, BSc, Re-accreditation	Dr. Yelena Istileulova	Mimoza Zhubi Arbresha Meha Bashkim Musliu Idriz Kovaci Petrir Hasanaj



### 1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The Bachelor of Science (BSc) in Management of Hospitality and Tourism is offered at the Faculty of Tourism and Environment of the University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj (hereafter UASF). UASF was established by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MEST) and was ratified by the Parliament of the Republic of Kosovo on July 16, 2015. The tradition of academic and scientific work in Ferizaj dates back to 1976, and then – linked to the Higher Technical School (HTS) with the machinery and wood industry section set up in 1988 year. The current mission of the University is:

- “*We are committed to providing quality education to prepare qualified professionals, dedicated researchers and educated and responsible citizens, to develop a professional career and lead a productive life.*”

According to the website of UASF, it has the following 5 faculties:

- Faculty of Tourism and Environment;
- Faculty of Engineering and Informatics;
- Faculty of Architecture, Design and Wood Technology;
- Faculty of Management;
- Faculty of Applied Arts.

The Self-evaluation Report (SER) is submitted for the re-accreditation of the following programme:

- Bachelor of Science (BSc) **in *Management of Hospitality and Tourism***

which offers an accredited bachelor’s degree program, *BSc in Management of Tourism and Hospitality*. There are 439 students studying in this faculty, with

- **358 students** in the Management of Tourism and Hospitality program (BSc);
- **81 students** in the Management and Innovation in Tourism program (MSc).

The website <http://www.ushaf.net/fta/?lang=en> provides the following information that Faculty of Tourism and Environment offers the following study programme entitled as:

- ***Management in Tourism and Hospitality***, in the first cycle (at the level of Bachelor)



## 2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

### 2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The **mission of the programme on Management of Tourism and Hospitality** of the University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj (UASF) is outlined in the SER and states as the following:

- *to provide courses with contemporary and flexible content as well as to provide internships in businesses, which will easily follow the demands of the local economy and the local labor market in the Hospitality and Tourism sector.*

Therefore, in terms of compliance of the mission of this programme on Management of Tourism and Hospitality with the overall institutional mission statement, we refer to the institutional mission which is :

- *"to prepare qualified professionals and educated and responsible citizens to develop a professional career and lead a productive life."*

The institutional mission is considered here from the view of three pillars: *teaching, research and community service*. The pillars related to teaching and learning are quite clearly explained in the SER - with a modern teaching technology (smart boards, technological devices representing virtual reality) and IT laboratories. Thus, the pillars of community services (*responsible citizens*), and teaching (*prepare qualified/educated professionals*) are addressed. However, there is no direct link towards “*research pillar*” in the institutional mission.

The mission of the programme is related to the theoretical content of teaching (*course with contemporary & flexible content*) and its practical aspects (*internship in business*).

Again, “*research pillar*” is not obviously available at the institutional and the programme’s levels (of the Management of Tourism and Hospitality), although *the research services are becoming more crucial at the Master programme level*.

*The community services are not clearly illuminated and explained in the SER.*

The ET addressed the issue of research during the online meeting, and got the answer that research is incorporated, first of all, through the *research capacity programmes*, and development of *24 case studies* at the institutional level. The students confirmed their





Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

involvement into case study. There is a question which is still to be clarified - how students are trained in terms of research capacity, if there are no related courses available at the BSc level.

The mission of the University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj (UASF) is also stated on its website: [www.ushaf.net/mission-and-vision/?lang=en](http://www.ushaf.net/mission-and-vision/?lang=en); *but there is a slight difference in the formulation of this mission:*

- *“We are committed to providing quality education to prepare qualified professionals, dedicated researchers and educated and responsible citizens, to develop a professional career and lead a productive life.”*

The phrase “*dedicated researchers*” has also disappeared from the SER, but it is still written in the website. In terms of overarching didactic and research concepts, it is problematic to describe it as a well-defined mission, because there are no specifically related didactic and research concepts, and the pillars of the research and community services are not clearly presented in its mission.

In terms of the relevant academic and professional advice, the related recommendations are taken into account, and some of these examples are evident from the previous evaluation (SER, page 34): they are considered by the management of this programme. (Comment: the date/time when the last evaluation/accreditation is missing in the SER.

The faculty has a qualified staff as well as modern work environments, which enable students to master the appropriate skills in the areas of tourism and hospitality. However, the didactic and research concepts used by academic staff are not explicitly defined in the SER. Therefore, it is not clear how study programme deals with the teaching and research methods, how the teaching staff improve their didactic and research skills. In the light of recent events (Covid-19), there were no obvious trainings for the academic teaching staff provided, especially in the light of didactic practices recommended online and in terms of professional recommendations of this study programme for its consistent approach and educational style to present information to students. It is also not mentioned which methods were used in the classrooms (dialectics, the Socratic method, constructivist didactics). The constructive alignment teaching linked to the learning outcomes is the approach recommended to consider because it has the focus on what and how students learn. It is also becoming more practical due to the shift/move to the digital online teaching.



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

*Thus*, the study programme mission is not quite fully compliant with the overall mission statement of the institution due to the research pillar (with a different version on the website of this University), as well as the differences between the *programme and institutional missions* (research and community services are vanishing in the programme mission).

The Code of Ethics and other 9 related Regulations have also been uploaded on the website of University under the University Regulation page. As far as the formal policies, guidelines and regulations, during the evaluation of this programme there were 4 documents publicly available to all staff and students:

- Strategic Plan 2018-2020, Provisional Statute 2020, Student Handbook, Fair Booklet 2019

The Code of Ethics and its 23 Article (also covered with more details in 2.6 Research) is mentioned due to the typical problem of plagiarism, which is the most common problem in Kosovo Higher education, including its public universities. Some authors like Shala, Leka and Morganella (2018)<sup>1</sup> mention this issue in case studies of public universities of Kosovo. The Article 23 of the Code of Ethics on Academic plagiarism is directly related to the increase of the research quality and the possible associated plagiarism of theses/submitted written works of students of “Bachelor” degree. So far, this issue of plagiarism in Albanian language is not solved: it is up to the teaching staff to check the students’ works in the ways they can.

At the same time, the University is part of the Erasmus+ Capacity building funded project “ReaserchCult” through which University has an access to anti-plagiarism software for staff and students for the next three years, but at this point, it is not mentioned which language this software uses – Albanian or English, when the University launch and access this software, and many other organisational issues. The comments to this Report refer to the fact that platform which became officially available to the university on 19 March 2021 (in the time when the final report was just prepared) may use two languages – the Albanian and English ones, which is a very positive news.

There are 6 KPIs listed for program, they are provided with the definition, but SER does not mention how these KPIs are going to be used throughout programs for defining its success, and it remains unclear how they are used to benchmark the programme progress. According to the requested information, the true answer has been provided during the online site visit session

---

<sup>1</sup> Shala, S., Leka, D., & Morganella, T. (2018). Plagiarism in Kosovo: a case study of two public universities. *International Journal for Educational Integrity*, 14(1), 1-15.



that these KPIs are only general indicators, due to the fact that the specific KPIs will be developed at the time when the overall University Strategy is prepared. The Expert agrees and accept the opinion that it should take some time, after the University Strategy is introduced.

The management of the University notes that during pandemic situation all university staff were trained to use Microsoft Teams, as online tool. The purpose of this training in MS Teams was connected with the explanation how to deliver lectures, provide the required materials, how to conduct seminars for students and other purposes. The University organised one training in 20 March 2020 and developed and shared the manual for student and staff on how to use Teams. Another training for staff was organised in September 2020 on the use of online learning and teaching tools including MOODLE and other MICROSOFT online tools (FORMS, TEAMS etc).

Lastly, in SER there are some slightly different variations used in this programme:

- BSc in Management of Tourism and Hospitality and/or Bachelor of Science in Management of Hospitality and Tourism".
- According to the web-site: Faculty of Tourism and Environment offers study programme in “Management in Tourism and Hospitality”, in the first cycle (Bachelor).

### Mission, objectives and administration

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study programme mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution	X (0.5)	
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area	X	
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study programme has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students	X	
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities	X	



<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies, regulations, terms of references and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the programme are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances	X	
---	---	--

**Comments:** the number 0.5 means compliance level of this particular standard is met only partially (the same principle is applied for all other standards).

Therefore, there are 4.5 points out of 6 maximum possible points, or alternatively, it is **75%** of compliance level. This level corresponds to the substantially compliant level.

**Compliance level: Substantially compliant**

**ET recommendations:**

1. *The SER and website use slightly different titles of the programme in English language and it is recommended to decide what would be the right and the only name of this programme in English (comparable to its title in Albanian language);*
2. *Approach the mission statement at both levels (institutional and programme) from the view of three pillars: teaching, research and community services;*
3. *Provide more clear perspectives and some explanation towards research and community services' pillars at both the institutional and the programme's levels with the incorporated research concept; Provide harmonisation of the mission available on the website and in the SER;*
4. *Think of the didactic concepts to select, especially in the light of the online perspective of teaching;*
5. *Organise the training programme for the members of academic staff on the didactic methods including constructive alignment teaching linked to the learning outcomes.*

**2.2. Quality management**

The SER provides the required information about the participation of staff and students in the process of self-evaluation. The SER does make a reference that it is a regular part of the self-assessment process, but it does not refer to the dates when the programme started its self-evaluation and how long this programme has been involved into this process. It also mentions that the university has changed the form of data collection from students.

Now it is in a digitized form where each student makes the assessment for the teachers and the administration of the university. The additional evidence is provided by the expert's request -



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

different samples of questionnaires for different target groups - from the evaluation of the dean of the faculty up to the performance evaluation of the academic staff and administration. Seven types of Questionnaires have been presented by the expert's request, which, indeed, is in the compliance with the Regulation on Quality Assurance of the University and its Article 11, where the evaluation of the quality includes the following seven main fields:

1. Study programs;
2. Teaching process;
3. Academic and non-academic staff;
4. Students;
5. Infrastructure (Textbooks, literature, library and computing cabinets);
6. Organization and function of the system of quality assurance;
7. Employment of students.

According to the Provisional Statute of the University, and its Article 193, the Educational/Scientific Council is involved into the development of the questionnaires, based on a standardized questionnaire structure provided by the Senate. According to the SER, the University has drafted the Alumni and Business questionnaires, which have been approved by the Quality Committee (probably, the Quality Assurance Committee is meant), and, therefore, the expert checked the available questionnaires developed.

*First*, according to the survey data being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are to be made publicly available, but it is not evident from the website. The request has been made to provide the results of the evaluation. According to the submitted results of the evaluation of administration, administrative services and infrastructure presented in a Summary table, it looks that all components were evaluated positively. According to these results, the attention has to be paid to the provision of internet at the University.

*Second*, the related comment is to be made about the Questionnaire for Alumni – at this point, it is not clear what the results this survey is going to achieve: on one hand, the Questionnaire says that it is anonymous, on the other hand, there is a question which asks specifically for the name and surname. Therefore, it should be decided what is the goal of each particular questionnaire before its actual submission, otherwise it may confuse the respondents.

Although the surveys are supposed to be anonymous, it should be clearly explained how the risks of anonymity are avoided and guaranteed, to guarantee the confidentiality of each respondents to express their opinions. In addition, in some of the Questionnaires the goal



should be very clearly emphasised, in line with the results – how they are going to be used to improve the quality of the processes. The target group should be aware that these Questionnaires are used not only because they are required, but as one of the most reliable sources of the objective information also for the University.

It should be mentioned, that despite survey data is being collected, the results of these evaluations are not made publicly available, and also the scanned copies of at least one sample filled in are not provided. At the same time, there was a sample of one Questionnaire provided to this Report, which has been generated by the system for one of the staff members engaged in this programme.

Many QA procedures are the newly introduced ones. Thus, there is a foundation which is laid down, which is going to become the normative practice introduced for these procedures in QA day-to-day practices. At the same time, some improvement in the development of the various types of Questionnaire, their pre-testing and the evaluation arrangement is these QA procedures are recommended.

The SWOT analysis is provided not through the classical features of Opportunities and Threats (Strengths, Weaknesses – are ok), but from the point of similar features, where emphasis is made on other areas - Options and Challenges (OC) instead of OT (Opportunities and Threats).

### Quality Management

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement process in their sphere of activity</i>	X	
<i>Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning process</i>	X	
<i>Standard 2.3. QA processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery including services and resources provided by other parts of the institutions</i>	X	
<i>Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different component within it, the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students</i>	X	
<i>Standard 2.5. QA processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance</i>		X





<i>Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available</i>		X
<i>Standard 2.7 Results of the internal QA system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student's workload, academic success and employment of graduates</i>	X (0.5)	
<i>Standard 2.8 The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses</i>	X	
<i>Standard 2.9 The QA arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.</i>		X

At this point the Quality Management includes 5.5 points out of 9 points which correspond to 61 % (Partially compliant)

### **Compliance level: Partially compliant**

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. It is recommended that the content of Questionnaires is again submitted for its scrutinised check by the Quality Assurance Committee and then it should be pre-tested, with its further improvement on the provided comments;*
- 2. It should be emphasised how the program is prepared for its self-evaluation indicating no only its strengths and weaknesses (SW), but also opportunities and threats (OT) and not necessarily the Options and Challenges (OC) indicated in the SER*

### **2.3. Academic staff**

According to SER there are 23 listed academic staff members and among them, - 18 teachers who have their Doctoral degrees which corresponds to 78% of all academic staff members. The members of academic staff have their contract with the written responsibilities.

Out of 23 members, there are 6 full-time staff with the doctorate degree programmes from the Faculty of Tourism and Environment, which means 26% of professors are specialising on this programme directions. According to the KAA regulation, at least 50% of the academic staff in the study programme should be the full-time employees.



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

Despite there is a table provided with the names of the teachers and their contract duration, there are four things that remains unclear in SER regarding the academic staff members:

- *First of all*, SER refers to 23 members of academic staff, and provides their names, but there are 24 CVs of people. The comments has been received that one CV was forgotten to be included in the SER;
- *Second*, it is not clear how many members of academic staff are employed on the full-time and part-time basis. The satisfactory comments to this report are provided that there are 24 members of academic staff and all of them are officially employed on the full-time basis;
- *Third*, from the SER it is not clear how many full-time and part-time's members of the academic staff are divided in terms of their responsibilities including their engagement in the academic community, consultations, possible consulting activities and community service;
- *Finally*, in terms of their research output, and how the publications of the part-time teachers are considered in terms of their output.

All members of the teaching staff are provided with the contracts with the defined duration (listed in the provided table) and the number of courses and workload for each academic member. For the programme accreditation process, there are six full-time staff with doctorates from the Faculty of Tourism and Environment, the specialisation field which meet the satisfactory level.

It is also partially explained that the opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff in terms of their research. There is some partial explanation about those teachers who are facing difficulties, although what kind of special assistance is provided remains quite vaguely explained.

According to the Statute, its Article 193, “*the assessment of the quality of teaching by the students takes place once a year through the anonymous questionnaires coordinated by a special committee studies*”. However, the Article 13 of the Regulation on QA provides the statement that the evaluation of Academic staff by students is done once a semester; and the evaluation of academic (as well as the administrative staff) of University is implemented once a year.





According to the same article of statute, the leader of each study commission discusses the results with the teachers who are assessed lower with the joint decisions on the measures which are to be taken to improve the quality.

#### Academic staff

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X (05)	
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	



## Compliance level: Substantially compliant

### ET recommendations:

1. *It should be defined how the full-staff and part-time of academic staff is divided and how the research output is considered*

### 2.4. Educational process content

The evidence of the Curriculum's review is provided by the Hotel and Tourism Management programme, with the Minutes of the meeting held on 20.11.2020. There are consultations with the Industrial Board, which helps to define the required competencies and skills which have to be taken into account by the programme. The Regulation of Undergraduate Studies states that the study time consists of "*three years and six semesters*" (in fact, it has been recognised as a technical error emerged during the translation from the Albanian into English language, **and it should be written as "three years or six semesters"**), and a student accumulates at least 180 credits in ECTS according to the Article 8 of this Regulation (for Bachelor Studies).

There are specific skills and general knowledge listed for the learning outcomes of Hospitality and Tourism. To check the related skills on Kosovo tourism in practice, the expert's question was addressed to the selected student of this programme about the recommendations on the cultural locations to be attended in Kosovo. The question was asked with the purpose to check students how they can demonstrate some knowledge on Kosovo domestic tourism's locations, food or beverage management in promoting this region (for the personal choice of student). The selected student was not able to answer this question directly during the online session or simply did not expect this question.

In terms of tourism, many foreign people don't know much about Kosovo, about its cultural, music and its heritage culture and other traditions, which cultural places to visit or to go to some specific nature spots, and what to try from the traditional village-like food's point of view, and it is important to "sell" this knowledge, because the future graduate will be working in this industry and have to deal with these issues providing their recommendations to foreign and domestic tourists on a regular basis.

Some observations have been made during the online site visit's session.

*First of all*, students do not speak English, which means that they cannot explain foreigner what to visit (despite English and German are the languages introduced to this programme).

*Second*, the selected student did not recommend any specific places to visit or did not "sell" some cultural and awesome places in Kosovo, which means that there are no practices or culture of "telling the stories" about the Kosovo beautiful places, and there is a lack of literature about its tourists' destination.



*Third*, it seems that some students may have shortage of both languages, and lack their own practical experience of travelling over Kosovo, that is why the access to the professional literature on Kosovo heritage, tourism is becoming more important. This access to the professional literature on Tourism in Kosovo should be provided in the Albanian and desirably, in English languages. Therefore, it should be noted that the additional focus should be made on the cultural heritage and traditions of Kosovo, its legends, stories, traditional music which is rich with rare and unique elements, folk music instruments (for instance, ciftelia, sharkia, etc.), food and beverage tourism, in the educational process content. In addition, the comparative analysis should be added in terms of their neighbouring countries along with the practice of writing and telling the stories in English language, German and other languages.

The report from the previous accreditation expert team included the reference that the local tourism opportunities are not enough valorised in the curricula presented to the previous team and also recommendation to include the new development of the modern tourism - from the point of the nature experience and cultural contacts. It seems that the previous recommendations have not been taken into the account yet.

These recommendations are to be even more emphasised at this point of time due to the recession in the tourism industry, changes in the current trends and priorities and the shift of tourists' flows towards the domestic tourism. The domestic tourism always requires more deep knowledge and skills, and it is the trend that is becoming more popular due to the external lockdown measures/the recession/global slowdown in the hospitality/tourism industry. The current available courses do not have any modifications to the courses from the point of domestic tourism like:

- Introduction to Kosovo Tourism, Sustainable Tourism Development, Management in Kosovo Tourism and Recreation, Food and Beverage, Kosovo Tourism Planning.

In any cases, the listed points and knowledge are required for both cases – international tourism and domestic tourism.

The learning outcomes are introduced in 54 subjects listed in the Curriculum. The programme uses a variety of assessment methods, including exams, seminar papers, projects, essays, group and individual presentations – these methods are listed for the normal, in-class lecture's format. There are no any comments found how the teaching methods, assessment have been changed and the adjustments that have been made for online classes during the online/digital format of teaching and learning.

In addition, Curriculum provided in the SER and on the **webpage** of Management of Tourism and Hospitality - <http://www.ushaf.net/psmth/?lang=en> shows the different subjects listed. For instance, the Curriculum demonstrated on the website for the 1<sup>st</sup> semester (shown below) does not quite corresponds to the Curriculum provided in the SER for the Bachelor degree of Management in Tourism and Hospitality:



## Curriculum and Syllabuses

### Management in Tourism and Hospitality – Bachelor

Year I				
Semester I				
No.	C/E	Modules	Hrs/week	ECTS
1	O	Mathematics for Business	4	6
2	O	Fundamentals of Economy	4	6
3	O	Business Law	4	6
4	O	Academic and computer skills	4	6
5	O	English Language I	4	6
Semester II				

The selected Syllabus of the course “Introduction in tourism” of the Academic Unit: Faculty of Tourism and Environment has been checked on its required elements like the course description, its status (Mandatory), hours per week (4) and allocated ECTS credits (5) and other. The course description is included in line with the listed objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students’ assessment system, the minimal bibliography. There are 8 Key Learning outcomes and additional 8 specific learning outcomes listed and demonstrated in the Annexes. However, their check-up in the website versions of courses have less than 7 outcomes (required by the KAA) listed. The main and additional literature does not correspond to the requirement to be issued within the last 10 years. The listed books are published long time ago, some literature might be still useful, but under the light of requirements it seems to be quite outdated:

*Vjollca Bakiu, Renata Dema, Gjylso Binaj: Turizmi, Tirane, 1997*

*The Business of Tourism - Prof. Chris Hollowey, R. Davidson, Ms. Claire Humphreys, Taravel and Tourism (Udhetimi dhe Turizmi) – Richard Sharpley Vjollca Bakiu; Menaxhimi i Turizmit, Tirane, 2006*

The related syllabi have to be checked on availability of information, practices, internship and projects in tourism like:

- archaeological heritage from Illyrian, Dardanian, Roman, Byzantine, Serbian and Ottoman times,
- traditional Albanian cuisine, architecture, religious heritage,
- traditions, legends, folk songs, music instruments,
- natural landscapes.



“Practice” as a subject is included in the curriculum, with 96 hours, but it is not clear whether it is considered as the subject or it is the internship practice. This course includes the range of practices – from Catering Gastronomy and practice in hotel up to “Internship at the Travel Agency”, and the practice in Municipality, Ministry, and a work in some hotels. Some useful practice with booking Systems-AJATA is mentioned. From the comments to this report, it was understood that this “Practice-Internship” was a newly introduced subject, and it did not take place due to the restrictions put in place by the government and closure of the hospitality and tourism businesses. Consideration of the use of modern technology was not currently used in programme (except marketing), the most appropriate technologies/software for this programme in hospitality and tourism have not been not mentioned (examples: the voice search used in hospitality with the range of other related technologies - from the chatbots and artificial intelligence (AI) up to the use of robots to carry out tasks performed by humans). But the comments have been received to the first draft of this report that the use of modern technology is foreseen in the new/revised programme as well as the application like AMADEUS, HIM for the next summer time.

During the discussions and meeting at the University in November, 2020 (Appendix A), there was a discussion of how to plan and execute projects in the field of Tourism and Hospitality, and the listed gap can be incorporated in the plan to execute the projects, first of all, for the “internal tourism”/domestic tourism (travel within Kosovo) and Kosovo neighbours’ tourists from the region of Central and Eastern Europe and Balkan regions.

It is difficult to make judgements’ about whether the Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively under the current level with the lack of information on this particular point.

The University has signed over 50 cooperation agreements with enterprises in various fields of industry, and this programme has provided the satisfactory list of 15 cooperation agreements, where at least 26 % belong to the restaurant business, and 20% - to the hotel activities

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study programme is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic	X (0.5)	





competencies, the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality		
<i>Standard 4.2. The study programme complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the EHEA. The individual components of the programme are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.</i>	X (0.5)	
<i>Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.</i>	X (0.5)	
<i>Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/syllabuses of each subject/module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study programme under evaluation</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.</i>	Not related	
<i>Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.7 Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.</i>	X (0.5)	
<i>Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.</i>	X (0.5)	
<i>Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.</i>	X (0.5)	



<i>Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.</i>	X	

There are 8 points out of 11 related points (because one point is not counted), and, therefore, this level of compliance corresponds to 73%

### **Compliance level: Substantially compliant**

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Harmonisation of the Curricula and Syllabi in the website and SER;*
- 2. Local tourism opportunities in Kosovo are to be valorised in the curricula from the point of expansion of the domestic tourism and covering the gaps listed;*
- 3. More updated literature should be introduced for the general courses, to balance the lack of literature. Consider the collection of books and expand the research on the Kosovo heritage and introduction of the practical projects and related courses on Kosovo tourism in the Albanian and English languages;*

### **2.5. Students**

According to the information provided to this report, every year the Faculty of Tourism and Environment enrol 150 students for the bachelor programme in Management of Hospitality and Tourism. There are only 10 free places allocated for new students out of 150 students. Currently, the Bachelor Programme in Management of Tourism and Hospitality has 358 enrolled students according to the SER. The website <http://www.ushaf.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Konkursi-per-Studimet-Bachelor.pdf> provides the information with the data on the enrolment of 2020/2021 year, which is 261 students (for all programmes).



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

The number of students with quotes are reserved for all programmes in all phase of competition, including 18 students for this programme:

- A) 12% are for students from non-majority community in Kosovo
- B) 1% are for students from Montenegro
- C) 2% are for students from Serbia
- D) 2% are for students from Albania and North Macedonia

In terms of the students' admission, in accordance with the requested information, there is a public competition announced in daily newspapers in Kosovo, and the maximum number of students is determined by the accreditation of the programme. The University approves the request regarding the number of students in the senate of University, and this request is to be approved by MEST. After approval of the number of students from MEST, the University opens a public competition for student admission.

Student admission criteria are set out on the Statute of the University and made public in the competition announced in the official newspaper and on the website of the University.

The website of the University provides the Provisional Statute of the University of Applied Science in Ferizaj, and the admission procedures have been checked. They are regulated by the following articles: 11,12,48, 94 (with criteria for the admission of students), 97, 126 (for full-time and part-time students) and 207.

The admission criteria at institutional level are regulated by the Article 94 Admission to the studies that any candidate who passes the state exam has the right to compete for university studies according to the legislation. The conditions for admission to undergraduate - bachelor at the University are listed in its 2.1-2.4 points on:

*-the successful completion of a secondary school in Kosovo with a certified diploma; completion of primary and secondary school with at least 12 years of education, certified by the relevant degree; etc.*

The Senate shall issue regulations, which define in detail the conditions and criteria for enrollment in undergraduate-degree. The Senate approves THE REGULATION FOR UNDERGRADUATE STUDIES (Bachelor Studies), Nr. Prot.: 47/20; as of 09.01.2020 and its Article 3 refers to Matura exam with:





Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

- Secondary school diploma; Secondary school transcript; Verification for the assessment in the Matura Exam subjects; Birth certificate; Identification card (copy); Application payment (defined by the Ministry).

The Article 9 of its Regulation refers to the student's qualifications of the Hotel and Tourism Management (Bachelor of Science) upon the formal completion of this programme with :

- *Study and gain basic knowledge on qualitative management in Hotel and Tourism*
- *Employment opportunities in hotel businesses, especially management of businesses*
- *Employment in travel and tourism agencies*
- *Preparation of projects related to the field of hotel and tourism*

The related adequate certificates are provided such as grade certificate, diploma and diploma supplement. There are some KPIs that are introduced, but it is understood from the online meeting, that they are not actively used so far: Graduate satisfaction, Employer Satisfaction; Graduate employability; Student Satisfaction; Pass rate; Graduation rate.

The related documents – the Regulation on Student Internship and Regulation on Student Transfer are uploaded on the website as well.

During the check of some documents, there are some deficiencies discovered.

*First*, it also should be noted, that the key document – the Provisional Statute does not include some articles: for instance, the Articles 91,92, 93, 95 and 96 are missing from this Statute.

*Second*, the SER does not make specific reference on the study groups or other dimensions to ensure the effective and interactive teaching and learning process, for instance: 1) structure of the tasks and activities, 2) student or teacher centeredness, 3) type of knowledge, and 4) students' age/educational level.

*Third*, some procedures are still have to be launched like the procedures to ensure that work submitted by students is original, with the use of the anti-plagiarism programme.

Despite the software is purchased under the framework of project, and it seems it is still not clear which language is provided for this software, because it has not been applied yet. The SER makes reference that so far the university does not have any specific mechanism to guarantee that student work is original, because it is up to teachers to cover this aspect. The related issues for students' performance are also commented in the chapter 2.2. Quality



Management, and the various survey for students are introduced. There are no references on the flexible treatment of students.

### Students

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X (0.5)	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.		X
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X (0.5)	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X (0.5)	
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X (0.5)	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

There are 8 points out of 11 points which corresponds to 72%.

### Compliance level: Substantially compliant



### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. The Provisional Statute and the related University documents on admission and other issues should be checked to ensure that the content is harmonised and all articles are in place;*
- 2. The check for anti-plagiarism mechanisms is to be launched at both programme and institutional levels to ensure whether it works in both languages;*
- 3. Effective mechanisms of interactive teaching and learning process are to be ensured through the additional courses for Teachers/Academic staff members in didactic methods*

### **2.6. Research**

There is a Regulation for Scientific Research activities, which was introduced only in 2020 with its 18 articles to regulate research activities of this University. According to Article 9 on “Responsibilities of academic staff” there is a performance requirement to publish their scientific activities in international journals: it should be one paper per year (on average). These publications should be made in the journals/as well as the platforms approved by the University Senate.

According to the additionally provided documentation, research remains the key activity, and it is going to be included in the 2021-2025 Strategic plan (which is not provided because it is under its development), and the date is not provided when it is going to be approved.

There is no any Research Development Plan provided at the levels of University or programme. Partially it might be explained that the University’s Regulation of Scientific Research refers to the scientific research activities carried out under the umbrella of the Institute of Applied Sciences, but there is no any information about the status of this institute. There is no explanation about this Institute of Applied Sciences found on its website or in SER – which kind of institution it is, and whether it is private or public institution, how many people it employs from the University and what are the relationship between the University and Institute. The information provided to this Report, explains that the University is only going launch the Institute of Applied Sciences, however the date is not mentioned.

The additionally requested information provides only the following details:

- Workshops where the in-house practical work of students will be undertaken;
- Research laboratories where staff and students participate in University and industry research projects;



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

- Innovation Centre (InLAB), with modern equipment for product development and design like: 3D Printer and 3D scanner, with VR Headsets as well as CNC machine, Printer/plotter, all the other modern equipment that will arrive before the next new academic year begins;
- Commercial project, where staff and students will engage in real commercial activities to not only allow staff to keep up with the industry but also to bring students closer to the industrial by applying science and gained theory to practice.

No comments are provided on how professors will do their research – under the University’s umbrella or under this Institute of Applied Sciences.

It is understood that the workshops will be organised under the umbrella of this institute, and the practical work of students in the institution is implemented, but it is again unclear how BSc students have to carry out their research due to the absence of the research courses, and whether it means that they have their own “Mentors” at this institute who train them on the practical or theoretical issue of research.

According to the SER, the BSc programme academic staff in Management of Tourism and Hospitality have published 89 papers in journals.

At the same time, according to the provided table about the publications and conferences’ attendance for the last 3 year, there are only 4 academic staff members - in 2019 (p. 29 of SER), and only 1 professor in 2020 and 2018 who attended the conferences to present their papers.

There is an additionally provided list of publications (submitted additionally to the SER) by each member of the academic staff reveals the number of more than 100 articles published for the last 3 years. The list includes the authors (members of the academic staff), their Article’s title in the related journals and the year of publication. The discrepancy is then explained between the number of research publications by programme staff - between the SER (89 papers) and the Annex G document that came with SER (104 titles of publications). The SER provided the information on the papers published in journals (89), while the Appendix G has the 89 papers + 10 publications in conference proceedings and another 5 presentations in Congresses. However, some explanation is missing about the attendance of conferences and how many professors presented papers (till March, 2020).



There is also a difference between the information provided in the SER's data and the information submitted separately, and the source of these differences is not clear.

First of all, there are some significant differences in numbers of the members of academic staff:

- 21 members of academic staff listed in SER who teach in the Tourism and Hospitality Management program (page 29 of SER);
- 23 members of academic staff listed (page 19 of SER) listed or 24 members of academic staff (see p. 2.3);
- 18 members of academic staff (Appendix G) with the list of their publications

Additional information explains that there are currently 24 members of staff who are currently teaching in the programme. With the programme revisions only 21 of the 24 members of staff will be engaged in teaching under the new programme. Of the 21 members of staff engaged in the programme, only 18 have published something in the last three years.

There are some more questions which can be asked and explored on the following issues: how the academic staff members publish their articles without their preliminary peer-review, and how the members of academic staff are handling the issues on their own anti-plagiarism as well as the plagiarism of students (thesis/writing works, etc), and how students are involved in research without having the related courses, how many members of academic staff and students who have been involved in the case studies (for instance, 24 case studies), but it is up to the management of this programme to consider these issues which can be useful and related to the internal organisational management process.

The SWOT analysis refers to the “equipping workshops and starting the establishment of laboratories” as part of the Institute of Applied Sciences, but it is not clear which particular laboratories for tourism activities are included in this list and what is the equipment or technologies which are to be introduced.

It seems that there are only two factors of motivation – the requirement to publish (responsibilities) and the competition for the title of the “Researcher of the Year” with the listed criteria to meet this competition. The Regulation mentions, that only applications with prior approval can be reimbursed by the University. The motivation on research is not specifically outlined from the point of “research pillar” (which is also not clearly presented at the institutional and the programme's levels in the mission statement).



The problematic part is the fact mentioned about the involvement of BSc students in the research: in the SER it is written that “*it is expected that the rest of the students will be active in research activities at the University and will create opportunities for activation of all staff...*” At the same time, there are no research subjects for the bachelor degree students (it is introduced later on, at the Master level); second, students cannot be involved into the research without the professors’ teachings; and third, professors do not clearly deliver their teaching based on their “specialised” research practices. Therefore, preparation of research, including the thesis writing might be the potential weak points.

The Article 23 of the Code of Ethics on Academic plagiarism is directly related to the increase of the research quality and the possible associated plagiarism of theses/submitted written works of students of “Bachelor” degree. The problem of plagiarism as the most common problem in Kosovo Higher education, including its public universities according to Shala, Leka and Morganella (2018)<sup>1</sup>, including the case of public universities.

It has been mentioned already that this problem has not been solved (it is up to the teaching staff to check the students’ written works in the Albanian language). University has just received an access to anti-plagiarism software for staff and students (in March, after the first submission of this report) for the next three years, but at this point, it is still not being checked whether this software indeed uses both Albanian (which is a priority) and English language (second priority, because there are free programmes which can be found to check the related articles on plagiarism).

The SER also notes that University has not yet developed the policies related to the intellectual property, and they are postponed till the next year.

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	X (0.5)	

<sup>1</sup> Shala, S., Leka, D., & Morganella, T. (2018). Plagiarism in Kosovo: a case study of two public universities. *International Journal for Educational Integrity*, 14(1), 1-15.





Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X (0.5)	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.		x
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X (0.5)	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.		X
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	X (0.5)	

There are 6 points accumulated out of 10, and therefore, the current level is 60%

**Compliance level: Partially compliant**

**ET recommendations:**

1. *Include the part related to the clarification of the listed issues related to the academic staff and their research activities of the Institute of Applied Sciences and the University's professor's research output;*
2. *Prepare the Plan of development of the Academic staff, with their research areas and the planning dates for the conferences. Include the plan to issue an article based on the paper published for the conference;*
3. *Prepare the Plan for students – in terms of their potential research and what should be done to approach the topic from the methodological point of view, and the literature review.*



## 2.7. Infrastructure and resources

In terms of infrastructure, the university of Ferizaj is a public institution with more than 7000m<sup>2</sup> including its laboratories and workshops. A study programme possesses the adequate spaces for the educational process, with the neat and clean rooms and well-designed premises.

It has also the required places for

- 2 amphitheatres (for 150 seats and 350 seats),
- 15 classrooms for 75 students,
- 2 IT cabinets,
- 2 industrial spaces for workshops,
- 4 spaces for *laboratories*

In addition, there are 15 teaching rooms, 53 academic staff offices, library, one room for students' parliament. The University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj has signed the agreement with the University of Prishtina (UP) to use its library and scientific resources. In addition, the University of Prishtina (UP), provides the opportunity to access publications on the SciencDirect platform to the University of Applied Sciences' students and staff. The University has also provided access to the various electronic resources thanks to the agreement signed with the National Library. Recently the access has also been provided to the EBSCO (E-Library System) to the members of Academic staff by the Research Cult project.

According to the SWOT, there are a lack of tables in the library to enable independent work for students. The current SER does not specify how many rooms are dedicated to this particular programme, and how many offices the academic staff of this program requires, and whether there is any calculation of how many sq. meters are required for BSc programme.

SER refers to the available technology to facilitate their individual and collective work in support of the teaching process and their scientific work, but it does not mention which particular technologies are needed by this programme.

There is an additional video about the facilities of the University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj placed on youtube channel, with the detailed video of facilities with provided comments: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xQHD4QIPF0Q>, and the building of the University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj and its infrastructure looks very comfortable and appropriate for the learning study process with all available resources.





Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

There is some difference in the provided information between the video and SER that was noticed: 450 seats for amphitheatre have been mentioned instead of 350 seats according to the SER (the additional satisfactory comments have been made that the video was made more than a year ago, and 100 seats were removed). There are also 3 laboratories and many other facilities (but for other faculties), 3D printers/scanners, etc.

The SER refers to the additional facilities - like an elevator to provide an access to all floors of the building for people with disabilities. According to SER, there is a regular evaluation of the selected three staff members' team how the space is adjusted for the current needs. One of the Questionnaires of the University's programme for Students include the related questions on the University and programme's infrastructure and services to make sure that students feel comfortable. The University has also appointed the Vice Rector for Budget, Finance and Infrastructure, who is responsible for developing infrastructure policies and overseeing its implementation. The SER notes that some investments are planned to be made for the library to create opportunities for independent work of students, equipping the library spaces with computers and other equipment.

Report does not make a special reference for the access and a sufficient number of subscriptions to foreign publications and periodicals, which is needed by this particular programme, but the programme management provided the additional information. Through the agreement with University of Prishtina, UASF staff have access to ScineDirect online resources. The University has provided the access to CambridgeUniversityPress electronic resources (<https://www.cambridge.org/core/>) and MSP - Mathematical Sciences Publishers (<https://www.msp.org>). Based on the agreement with the National Library, the University has provided access to the following electronic resources:

- ASTM COMPASS Abstract
- Edward Elgar Products
- IOPS Science
- IMF Library
- DUKE University Press

In addition, the Research CULT project will provide the support for the project partners, including UASF with the access to EBSCO resources.



Students of this BSc programme study English and German languages, and therefore, it would be logical to know about availability of the suitable literature, books and periodicals for the members of staff and students.

The books on the traditions, cultural heritage and travelling over Kosovo are strongly recommended for students of this programme in at least 2 languages (Albanian and English). SER does not include the reference for any software used and how it/they is/are adequate, whether it has its utilisation licence, but the information about the additional information, including the information for the anti-plagiarism software tool was provided after the 1<sup>st</sup> draft was received. There are also the specific technologies in hospitality and tourism which are used nowadays, which might be useful to check:

- Voice search is growing technology trend within hospitality;
- The range of other related technologies– from chatbots and artificial intelligence (AI) up to the use of robots to carry out tasks performed by humans.

#### Infrastructure and resources

<i>Standard</i>	<b>Compliance</b>	
	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum 3 years.		X
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups,	X	



subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.		
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	X (0.5)	
Standard 7.6 The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs	X	

There are allocated 4.5 points out of 6 points which corresponds to the compliance level of 75%

**Compliance level: Substantially compliant**

**ET recommendations:**

1. *Ensure that students at Bachelor and Master levels' programmes are provided with the access to the books and periodicals in English and German languages;*
2. *Purchase the books on the traditions, fairy-tales/legends, songs, folk national music instruments and their history, food, cultural heritage, nature and travelling over Kosovo for students of this programme;*
3. *Check for the specific technologies in hospitality and tourism and consider the most suitable for its adoption or use in the conditions of Kosovo and attraction of tourists*

**3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET**

The ET would like to thank the management team for their proactive engagement during the online session for the programme accreditation procedures. There was a very strong sense of teamwork, friendly exchange of various opinions and a very good organisation of this site visit. It is evident that a good level of attention has been given to this study programme in terms of provision of regulations, SER and preparation of the additional documentation. Having



considered the SER, website and additionally submitted comments and documentation, the following compliance was given to each standard:

Standard	Compliance Level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
2. Quality management	Partially compliant
3. Academic Staff	Substantially compliant
4. Educational Process Content	Substantially compliant
5. Students	Substantially compliant
6. Research	Partially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
<b>Overall Compliance</b>	<b>Substantially compliant</b>

The overall compliance corresponds to the level of **Substantially Compliant**.

At the same time, the following recommendations are to be considered in relation to this study programme's re-accreditation:

#### **ET recommendations:**

1. Check for the names of the faculties, programmes and other titles used officially in the SER and website in English language. These titles are to be the same, being comparable to their titles in Albanian language. The Regulations, Curricula and Syllabi should be carefully checked for its content (without missing articles in Regulations, the relevant update in Curricula, the literature's sources in Syllabi). SWOT analysis is to be used with its standard abbreviation in English;
2. Adjust the mission statements at both levels (institutional and programme) as soon as the Strategic plan 2021-2025 is developed, from the view of three pillars: teaching, research and community services;
3. Consider the training programme for the members of academic staff on the interactive teaching and learning processes with the practice for digital didactic;
4. Approach and pre-test the related Questionnaires for students and alumni from the position of the constructive alignment framework as the recommended principle to identify the learning outcomes of students;
5. Check available anti-plagiarism mechanisms (including the newly arrived software for anti-plagiarism) which are to be tested (in the Albanian and English languages),



Republika e Kosovës  
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim  
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju  
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

---

launched and also taught to the members of academic staff at both the programme and institutional levels;

6. Valorise the curriculum/relevant syllabi from the point of expansion of the domestic tourism and cover the gaps listed (including literature, traditions, cultural heritage, legends, national musical instruments in English and Albanian languages);
7. Analyse the Strategy and/or development plan of the Institute of Applied Sciences in terms of the research output of the University's academic staff/students and how it should be considered from the research pillar's view;
8. Check for the specific technologies in hospitality and tourism and consider the most suitable technologies for their adoption in the conditions of Kosovo and attraction of local and foreign tourists

In conclusion, the Expert/Expert Team considers that the **Bachelor of Science in Management of Hospitality and Tourism** study programme offered by University of Applied Sciences in Ferizaj (UASF) is *Substantially compliant* with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends *to accredit* this study program for a duration of **3 years** with a number of **150 students** to be enrolled in the program.

## 9. APPENDICES (if available)

*Not available*

### Expert Team

#### Chair/Expert

**Yelena Istileulova**

**26.03.2021**

---

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)