



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

PUBLIC UNIVERSITY “KADRI ZEKA” GJILAN

LAW FACULTY

PROGRAM: CRIMINAL LAW

LEVEL: MASTER (LLM)

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

May 2021, PRISTINA



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	5
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	6
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	6
2.2. Quality management	8
2.3. Academic staff	10
2.4. Educational process content.....	13
2.5. Students.....	19
2.6. Research.....	22
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	24
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	27
4. APPENDICES (<i>if available</i>)	29



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 14th of May, 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Prof. Dr. Goce Naumovski*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-Assessment Report (SAR) of the Public University “KADRI ZEKA” GJILAN, Law Faculty, Program , Criminal Law Accreditation SER File, January 2020*
- *Law on Higher education in the Republic Kosovo*
- *National Qualifications Framework*
- *KAA`s Formal Policies, guidelines and regulations*
- Course Syllabuses LLM Program
- Staff CVs (Full time, Part time, and Assistants)
- Annex
- Videos for assessing the premises of the Faculty of Law
- *Table with number of students enrolled at UKZ .*

Criteria used for program evaluation:



- *Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance; Re/accreditation of bachelor and master study programs, Accreditation Manual; July 2018*

1.2. Site visit schedule

Site Visit Program

14th May

09.00 – 09.40	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated (<i>no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion</i>)
09.45 – 10:30	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
10:35 – 11:35	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
11:35 – 12:15	Lunch break
12:20 – 13:00	Meeting with teaching staff
13:05 – 13:45	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
13.50 – 14:00	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
14:00 – 14:10	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

No	Study program	Experts	Responsible persons of the program	
1	Criminal Law LLM (Accreditation)	Prof. Dr. Goce Naumovski	Fejzullah Hasani	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The Public University “KADRI ZEKA” GJILAN (UKZ) was established on 6th of March, 2013 by the Decision brought by the Government of Kosovo, later on, approved by the Assembly of Kosovo on the 30th of May, 2013. The Public University "Kadri Zeka" in Gjilan is in service of knowledge, education, and welfare of Kosovo's society and humanity in general. University is the best opportunity for a society to educate and hold its members accountable to core values: freedom, principles of democracy, family, economic well-being, social peace, and other humanistic values, which stand at the core of a high-value society. The mission of the university is to prepare responsible and professionally capable young people to be part of modern and global society, part of a wider market than traditional labor markets, and, at the same time, a model for other members of our society. UKZ's mission is also oriented towards broader labor markets, loyal competition, and professional training of its students.

UKZ established the Faculty of Law in 2013 based on the Decision brought by the Government of the Republic of Kosovo, Provisional Statute of the Public University of Gjilan and UKZ's Development Strategy and Action Plan 2017-2020. The vision and mission of the Law Faculty are defined within the vision and mission of the UKZ. Moreover, the **mission of the Faculty of Law is** to promote and engage students for continuing research of development and education in the field of law, as one of the most vital instruments of the state for improving social life in the country, by paying particular attention to teaching students that law is the primary means of combating all social injustice.

The Law Faculty program at “Kadri Zeka” University aims to make the law graduates in the general law program capable of practicing the profession of a graduate lawyer and in providing legal services in the Republic of Kosovo and beyond. The criminal law program (LLM), which is subject of accreditation in this process, is combined with theoretical and practical courses, trying to cooperate with the labor market in order to provide the students with the needed knowledge and skills to become criminal law professionals after the graduation.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The curriculum is combined with theoretical and practical courses, each of which is related to the other, while the elective courses have a direct link to the practical subjects, as was notable from the site visit and the review of the SER.

UKZ's mission is also oriented towards broader labor markets, loyal competition, and professional training of its students. The mission of the Faculty as pointed out in the SER is to promote and engage students for continuing research of development and education in the field of law, as one of the most vital instruments of the state for improving social life in the country, by paying particular attention to teaching students that law is the primary means of combating all social injustice. The Faculty's and the University's missions are in the same line, targeting the need to work and develop youth as future employees. Moreover, it is notable from the mission that the Faculty is perceiving the students in the center of their existing.

The expert's team was informed that the University has made a labor market's analysis when developing this program. Moreover, in the SER and during the site visit the management team has pointed out that their program is made based on European programs. However, the expert's team noted partial evidence that outline professional advice considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

In addition, SER also reads that the curriculum is generally comparable to similar European programs and it enables students to qualify for the labour market needs, striving to enhance indirectly the quality of studies in the law field in Kosovo and beyond (objective).

There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues, as it can be concluded by the submitted document: "Regulation on Selection of the Academic Staff in Kadri Zeka University". However, the expert team is on opinion that the Faculty of Law is lacking a certain number of specific academic staff for the specific study



program. During the site visit, the management team has shared this concern with the expert team also.

The Faculty of Law is following the regulation on the Code of Ethics with specified measures and guidelines on the ethical behaviour that is developed on a University`s level. However, the expert`s team is on opinion that the Faculty of Law should explore different methods for its additional and continual promotion among the academic staff and the students.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	x	
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	x	
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	x	
<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	x	
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	x	
<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	x	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. From the aspect of compliance with the overall mission of the institution, management bodies could intensify efforts for enhanced cooperation with the judiciary, prosecutors`office, and other institutions and organisations, similar to the good practices established with the chamber of advocates. In this context, additional steps for the recognition of the institution within the Kosovo legal community should be taken, such as exploring enhanced cooperation



forms with the numerous organizations, such as the chamber of notaries, the business law community and other entities.

2.2. Quality management

SER (p.26) describes the QM cycle for the Criminal Law Programme as follows:

Quality control and quality management in the Faculty of Law-Criminal Law Master Program will be carried out periodically and during the academic year this important process will go through several necessary stages. Consequently:

- First Stage:** in the first week of each following semester, the teacher will present and offer their work plan in relation to the subject which he/she will lecture. The subject syllabus (all syllabuses of all subjects will be presented electronically on the UKZ website) will be distributed to students (electronically or in hard copy), which will help them 'enable an adequate orientation in terms of quality teaching and learning.
- Second Stage:** after each lesson, the teacher will submit reports on the topics discussed to the students, which will contribute to the gradual realization of the study plan presented by the teacher at the beginning of the academic semester, respectively obligations taken by the teacher in relation to the academic unit as well as students.
- Third Stage:** At the end of each calendar month, the teacher will submit to the academic unit a monthly report on his / her academic activity, which will further strengthen his / her responsibility in relation to the academic unit and the students, always in the function of fulfilment of the study plan presented before them.
- Fourth Stage:** at the end of each semester, the teacher will present a report to the academic unit outlining the achievements or eventual deficiencies in the realization of the study plan for the given subject.
- Fifth Stage:** Students, through their free and anonymous expression, will respond to the questionnaires presented by the Law Coordinator of the Faculty of Law and master's degree programs, thus making a valuable contribution to the evaluation of both the academic staff and the subjects.



□ Sixth Stage: from the reports collected, the Quality Coordinator will process the data, compare it, match the data presented by the teacher with the semester curriculum, the teachers engagements and dedication during the teaching process, reports from student assessment, etc., and will be able to create a unique report for each teacher separately.

□ Seventh Stage: from the reports collected, the leader of the Criminal Law Program will write the Evaluation Report, which will become part of the personal file for each teacher or assistant).

Consequently, at the end of each semester, but also at the end of the academic year, within the Faculty of Law in the Criminal Law Master's Program, a summary report on the evaluation of academic staff and subjects will be published on the UKZ website, and in detail it will reflect the accomplishments and deficiencies for the semester or academic year completed. Presenting it in such a form, however, contributes to the enhancement of the quality of academic life within the UKZ Law Faculty, further motivates the academic staff and in turn contributes to the identification of eventual deficiencies, always with the aim to eliminate them.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	x	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	x	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.		x
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	x	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	x	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	x	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	x	



Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	x	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	x	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. The Faculty of Law should enhance the cooperation with the stakeholders (labor market), graduates and Alumni and to regularly involve them in the process of improvement of the study program through formal ways, such as questionnaires, formal meetings with reports from those meetings and various other instruments pointed out in recommendation. The inputs gathered from them should be involved in the process of improvement of the study program.*
- 2. The Faculty of Law should promote the evaluation reports, recommendations and actions undertaken as results from the quality assurance system among the academic staff, employers and students in order to show the importance of their involvement in the quality assurance processes and to assure that their inputs and feedbacks were taken into consideration.*

2.3. Academic staff

Both from the SER and the site visit it is evident that the Law Faculty of has improved in terms of hiring new staff, out of which there are tenure position devoted to the proposed LLM program).

The expert team has analysed the composition of the academic staff, their qualifications, including the field of specializations and particularly their research work. The composition of the academic staff could be presented at the table bellow:



REGULAR ACADEMIC STAFF					
Name	Surname	Scientific degree	Academic degree	Field of study	Duration of Contracts
Sadik	Haxhiu	Dr. sc	Prof. asoc.	Constitutional – Administrative fields of Law Sciences	4 years
Fejzullah	Hasani	Dr. sc	Prof. ass.	Criminal field of Law Sciences	4 years
Albulena	Hajdari	Dr. sc.	Prof. ass.	Criminal field of Law Sciences	4 years
Liridon	Dalipi	Dr. sc.	Prof. ass.	Administrative field, business and social communications through technology	4 years
Fatmire	Krasniqi	Dr. sc.	Ass. dr.	Criminal field of Law Sciences	3 years

In the general context of the Law faculty academic staff meets the minimal requirement regarding the proposed LLM program, however the findings of the experts show presence of academic staff of disciplines including political science, security studies other fields staff teaching core legal disciplines. For the purpose of enhancing employment of adequate academic staff (namely full time), specialized in Criminal Law as an important pillar of legal science, the expert team encourages the initiatives of the management in strengthening the criminal law department in terms of human resources.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	x	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching position included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	x	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	x	



<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.		
<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	x	
<i>Standard 3.6.</i> Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	x	
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	x	
<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	x	
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	x	
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially Compliant

ET recommendations:

The subsequent steps of LLM programme management in coordination with the Faculty of Law management in terms of academic staff development would include the following measures:

- 1. Further employment of full professors and ESRs in criminal law areas in order to contribute for improvement of the faculty-student ratio as an input for higher quality of the Criminal Law LLM programme. In this process efforts for gender balance should be increased.*
- 2. Efforts should be made for full realization of the Staff development plan at the Law Faculty namely in improving the knowledge, skills and behaviours of staff which will enhance personal growth and to embed all staff development activity into the institutions' academic calendar.*
- 3. Number of international, European and regional visiting professors in criminal law and related legal sciences (especially in emerging criminal law fields) should be increased (particularly with experience and education acquired at EU and US universities), as a tool for providing diverse approach to the students and enhancement of cooperation of academic staff with colleagues from other countries. University of Gjilan should continue to use its*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

cooperation agreements as a basis for this step. This will be a concrete input for overcoming the weaknesses and threats. Examples would include enhancing visiting positions in areas where criminal law components are relevant such as: EU aspects of criminal law, information technology law, sports law, piracy and criminal law aspects of intellectual property.

2.4. Educational process content

According to the SER data, the curriculum includes compulsory and elective courses. From the point of view of structure, it is a typical criminal law programme. Its contents are shown at the tables bellow:



PLANPROGRAM FOR TWO SEMESTERS				
FIRST SEMESTER ²				
Compulsory (O) or elective (Z) courses; credits and classes	O/Z	ECTS	Classes	Course Professor
Advanced Criminal Law - General Part	O	6	3+2	Prof. ass. dr. Fejzullah Hasani
Advanced Criminal Proceedings Law- General Part	O	6	3+2	Prof. ass. dr. Fejzullah Hasani
Criminology	O	4	2+1	Prof. ass. dr. Albulena Hajdari
Methodology of Scientific Research	O	4	2+1	Prof. asoc. dr. Sadik Haxhiu
Seminar Paper	O	4	2+2	Prof. ass. dr. Albulena Hajdari
ELECTIVE COURSES				
International Criminal Law	Z	3	2+1	Dr. sc. Fatmire Krasniqi
Forensics	Z	3	2+1	Prof. asoc. dr. Naim Haliti
The Law on Minor Offences	Z	3	2+1	Dr. sc. Fatmire Krasniqi
		30		
		ECTS		
SECOND SEMESTER ³				
Compulsory (O) or elective (Z) courses; credits and classes	O/Z	ECTS	Classes	Course Professor



SECOND SEMESTER ³				
Compulsory (O) or elective (Z) courses; credits and classes	O/Z	ECTS	Classes	Course Professor

² The student has the right to choose one of the three elective courses.

³ The student has the right to choose one of the four elective courses.

Advanced Criminal Law - Special Part	O	4	2+1	Prof. ass. dr. Fejzullah Hasani
Criminal Procedural Law - Special Part	O	4	2+1	Prof. ass. dr. Fejzullah Hasani
Criminal Law Clinical Learning	O	4	2+1	Prof. ass. dr. Feti Limani
ELECTIVE COURSES				
Penology	Z	3	2+1	Prof. ass. dr. Albulena Hajdari
Criminalistics	Z	3	2+1	Prof. ass. dr. Albulena Hajdari
Cybercrime Security	Z	3	2+1	Prof. ass. dr. Liridon Dalipi
GRADUATE THESIS	O	15		
		30		
		ECTS		
TOTAL 60 ECTS				



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The objective of the concept of the proposed LLM program is to prepare the students to develop critical understanding of the criminal procedure and criminal evidence, investigation's tools and methodology and also to develop advanced knowledge on particular areas of criminal law like criminalistics, preventive measures of organized crime, allocation of evidences and proofs. It is considered important to advance the student's writing and oral argumentation of the students, relevant to the labor market demand.

Furthermore, both from the SER and the interviews with the stakeholders and the employers of graduates, it is evident that a strong pillar of the educational process contents is the efficient collaboration with the Courts, Attorneys at Law and the Public Prosecutors offices.. Experts and professors engaged at the Faculty, which is a prerequisite for the LLM program proposes. This should also facilitate the practical review of the challenges of the justice system and the law implementation. Law Faculty in Gjilan has built the practice of visits realized in the prosecutor's office, in the Municipal Court and every other practical sector of the law, supervised by a professor of professional practice the curriculum of master program.

The expert opinion is that the outlined concept of the Criminal Law programe is designed to be in line with the mission of the Law Faculty and the general mission of the University of Gjilan in order to respond to the labor market requirements.

The expert team has examined the curriculum as well as the syllabus of each course. The main advantage of the curriculum is its approach which mainly corresponds to the challenges of the Kosovar society, particularly with the expressed effort of the curriculum to address the needs for expertise of future graduates. This particularly refers to area such as Advanced Criminal. Law, Cybercrimeas well as the elective courses that also include complementary social sciences such as Penology and Criminalistics. The syllabi are coherent with the general approach, even though the components that examine transitional justice could be upgraded.



<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	x	
<i>Standard 4.2.</i> The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	x	
<i>Standard 4.3.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.	x	
<i>Standard 4.4.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	x	
<i>Standard 4.5.</i> If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program	na	
<i>Standard 4.6.</i> The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	x	
<i>Standard 4.7.</i> Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students	x	
<i>Standard 4.8.</i> Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	x	



<i>Standard 4.9.</i> Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	x	
<i>Standard 4.10.</i> Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	x	
<i>Standard 4.11.</i> If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	x	
<i>Standard 4.12.</i> In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	x	

Compliance level: Substantially Compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1.The expert team encourages future enhancement of training in statistical methods and their application in criminal law disciplines (preferably multivariate statistical methods), as well as empirical jurisprudence . This would be a contribution for higher quality of the master theses, given the opportunities of application of quantitative methods in criminal law science.*
- 2.Given the potentials of the academic staff and the labour market needs, there is a solid basis for enhancing legal clinic forms and regional moot court activities, possibly through the support of the applicative/donor projects.*
- 3.Improving of the regulations is advised in terms of providing a more balanced distribution of LL.M candidates among supervisors (mentors) and topics, with emphasis on allocating mentorship by ESRs.*
- 4.The LL.M programme management and the University/Law Faculty top level management could consider including additional innovative elements in the syllabi, such as in the case of crime in sports, transitional justice, criminal law protection of copyright and industrial property rights, counterfeiting, economic/financial crime, particularly through internships of students and regional Southeast European initiatives.*



5. *The programme management could explore the possibilities for joint/double degree programmes with institutions from the region or from the EU.*

2.5. Students

The Faculty of Law is continuously working to position the student in the centre of the studies in order for the process to result in the acquired knowledge needed for the labour market. The expert team acknowledged the fact that the Faculty is understanding the importance of placing students in the centre of the studies. Based on the SER and the provided annexes of the report it is that the Faculty of Law is understanding the importance of students' participation in the governing of the Faculty, but also in the teaching and learning process. All this in favour of fulfilling the mission of the Faculty and its orientation into the development of young people that will contribute to the improvement of the social life in the country, specifically through combating all social injustice.

In general, employers of graduates that the expert's team met during the site visit were satisfied with their studies. In addition, they pointed out the good level of communication and collaboration that they have with their professors, realized through consultations, practical guidelines during their studies, and support received by the professors after graduation. It can be concluded that all actions were undertaken by the Faculty of Law, in order to support the students, are fit for the purpose and are providing the wanted results.

The has required additional information on the number of students in the las three years. The HEI has provided the document, shown bellow.

Faculty of Law Students' Number

(Additionally submitted)

Faculty of Law	Basic studies	Academic year 2020/2021	Students enrolled in the first year	<i>Females</i>	<i>Male</i>
			178	106	74

19



Local Government and Democratic Society	Master studies	Academic year 2020/2021	Students enrolled in the first year	<i>Females</i>	<i>Male</i>
			34	15	19
Faculty of Law	Master studies	Acedemic year 2019/2020	Graduate students	<i>Females</i>	<i>Male</i>
			65	31	34

The admission process is clear and consistent. Every student has an equal opportunity to enrol in the Faculty of Law following the regulations post by the State and the University. Most of the needed information for the process of admission, the program, subjects, deadlines, and consultations are available on the Faculty of Law`s web site.

Study groups are organized to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process. Moreover, the academic staff is using different interactive methods for teaching such as Mock trials, analysis, discussion, group work, and other methods, as the expert`s team has the chance to learn during the site visit. The Faculty of Law is especially proud of their legal clinic opened for students, as a place where they can realize their practice work. The students acknowledged the work of the clinic and they are happy to be part of it in order to get more practical and unique knowledge.

The Regulation of the Code of Ethics in UKZ in its Article number 14 regulates that copying is prohibited in any possible way. The same regulation in its Article 17 has regulated that plagiarism is foreseen as the “greatest injury to scientific and professional ethics i.e. the Code of Ethics.” However, any specific procedures were not shared with the experts` team.

The Faculty of Law is dedicated to the development of partnerships with local national and international institutions. The agreements for cooperation were signed with the following institutions: Kosovo Judicial and Prosecutorial Council, prosecution offices in Gjilan, Viti, Kamenica and Novo Brdo, municipalities of Kamenica, Viti, Gjilan, Novo Berdo.

Finally, the students have different opportunities for international exchanges through the Erasmus+ program and other cooperation agreements. According to the additionally provided



documents by the Faculty of Law, specifically, the table with number of students and staff that use/have used the internationalization opportunities it can be noticed that the Faculty is providing the students with opportunities for international exchanges in different countries such as, Germany, Croatia, Finland, Portugal, Turkey, Austria, Swiss and in the WB. However, it can be concluded that not many students are using those opportunities.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 5.1.</i> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organizing students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	x	
<i>Standard 5.2.</i> All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	x	
<i>Standard 5.3.</i> The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	x	
<i>Standard 5.4.</i> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	x	
<i>Standard 5.5.</i> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	x	
<i>Standard 5.6.</i> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	x	
<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	x	
<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	x	
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	x	
<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	x	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	x	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant



ET recommendations:

1. *The Faculty of Law should focus on the cooperation with the graduates/Alumni of the LLB program and information on the opportunity of the LLM Criminal Law programmes (similar to the affirmation of the existing LLM and MA programs) :*
 - a) *Strengthening of the Alumni network that will serve as a network for the promotion of the Faculty, but also as a correction tool for further advancement.*
2. *Enhancing international cooperation with other Faculties in Europe and abroad to be more strategic. In addition, the academic staff should continually motivate and support the students to use the exchange opportunities available through the Erasmus + program or as a result of the Faculty's cooperation agreements.*

2.6. Research

The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific papers are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country. The evidence is provided through the CVs of the academic staff, with list of articles and journals. There are different articles which are not clearly published in the field of teaching, but they can be considered in the field of the program, being interdisciplinarity based.

Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications and several consultancy activity. Several members of the academic staff are experts in the field and provide expertise in the country.

Academic staff should be encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field. The course description which is included the syllabi, should include clear picture regarding research findings integrated into teaching. This



can be easily done by including in the course objectives and in the content (chapters) topics related to latest trends in the field, and research related subjects.

Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students. Students should be engaged in research projects and other activities.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	x	
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	x	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	x	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	x	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	x	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	x	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	x	
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	x	



<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	x	
<i>Standard 6.9.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	x	
<i>Standard 6.10.</i> Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	x	

Compliance level: Substantially Compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Strengthening research projects initiatives in legal areas where criminal law studies would contribute for application of scientific results in the society of Kosovo, such as, juvenile delinquency, sports crime, counterfeiting and intellectual property piracy, cybercrime etc.*
2. *Intensification of access to on-line data bases for staff and students /additional subscriptions to online libraries/.*
3. *Boost interdisciplinary research with other university departments in terms of application of quantitative statistical methods (particularly multivariate) as an indispensable tool for criminal law related sociological and psychological disciplines.*
4. *Explore the possibilities for additional stimulus for staff to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.*
5. *Additional regional projects are an indispensable tool for the development of the program and UKZ in general.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

The Faculty of Law, as part of the University, has its own premises in the University`s campus where all faculties are concentrated. The management team is aware of the challenges related to the infrastructure. There is an active official agreement signed by the University and the Ministry for Education, Science and Technology for building new premises for the Faculty and for the University. The next steps are the negotiations between the Reactor and the respective Ministry. After that, the management team of the Faculty of Law is expecting that the construction will start.

The respective Faculty receives funds from the University`s budget. The University`s budget is directly provided by the state budget, through the Ministry for Education, Science, and

24



Technology. The respective Ministry establishes the tuition fees for the University. The process for planning the budget is the following: the University is drafting its wanted budget in consultation with the Ministry for Education, Science and Technology, and the Ministry of Finance, and it is adopted under the Kosovo Law on Budget. From the provided University's financial plan, with included budget for 2021 and 2022, it can be concluded that the University has stable finances, mostly coming directly from the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology. In addition, from the finance plan, it can be concluded that the University is planning to provide a sufficient amount of funds for equipment of information technology and for infrastructure construction and renovation of the University. As equal part of the University, the Faculty of Law, is provided with funds, equipment and places on the University's campus. The Faculty of Law is equipped with solid equipment for lectures and exercises, as can be concluded from all the provided information in the SER and the uploaded video on YouTube from the Faculty. In terms of library and reading rooms, the Faculty of Law is using the capacities of the University, as it can be concluded by the video from the Faculty uploaded on YouTube. Moreover, the need for building one strong digital library, as recommended in the previous accreditation process is still in place.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	x	
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	x	
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities. c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilization license; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	x	



<i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the specialty disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment	X	
<i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	X	
<i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.	Partly	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The Faculty of Law should enhance submission to online databases and build one strong digital library to the students.*
2. *The management team should consider the lack of the academic staff as a serious problem and explore different ways of solving the problem.*
3. *Explore different opportunities in order to be sure that the infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is fully adapted to students with special needs, such as assigning students volunteers that can help their colleagues that have special needs during the study processes on the premises of the Faculty. Ensure that the newly planned building will be adequate for the students with special needs.*
4. *Implement an action plan in which all the challenges related with the infrastructure and resources will be included. The plan should be realized jointly with the academic staff and the students and it should contain methods for solving the challenges that should be procure and methods that should not be procure but be addressed on systematic way.*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The expert team has a positive impression from the site visit to the Law Faculty during the process of accreditation of the Criminal Law (LLM). Due to the pandemic caused by the Covid-19, the site visit was organized through the digital tools. However, we must commend the Faculty for organizing the site visit and all meetings very smoothly. The expert team would like to thank all participants, that were part of the meetings during the site visit, for their honest approach and for providing the needed information for the study program.

In general, the expert team would like to commend the management of the Faculty, the academic staff, and the students for their willingness and hard work-oriented into improving the quality of the study program and for conducting serious and sustainable steps for development of quality culture on the Faculty level.

It is highly appreciated that the management team is aware of the challenges and issues with which they are facing. What is more important is that they are exploring different ways to solve and overcome the current challenges.

There are certain components that should be strengthened, so that the Faculty can achieve a greater level of quality and to achieve its vision and mission and the LLM program to be in the same line with the European ones.

First, the academic staff should be upgraded with additional full-time professors with PhD and expertise in criminal law, as well as visiting professors in emerging and legal disciplines.

Second, regarding the educational process content supplementary innovative elements in the syllabuses would increase the programme adequacy to the specifics of the Kosovar labour market and the European and international tendencies in legal science. In this context, the University/Law Faculty top level management could consider enhancing certain components of the syllabi, such as in the case of crime in sports, criminal law protection of copyright and industrial property rights, counterfeiting, economic/financial crime, particularly through internships of students and regional Southeast European initiatives.

27



Third, given the potentials of the academic staff and the labour market needs, there is a solid basis for improving regional activities, possibly through the support of the applicative/donor projects. *In this context the possibilities for joint/double degree programs could be explored.*

Fourth, concerning research, enhancing international cooperation, incentives for staff, interdisciplinary approach and enhanced application of multivariate quantitative methods in criminal law studies are recommended.

The overall evaluation of the 7 standards of the study program that is subject of accreditation is as follows:

Standard	Compliance level
1.Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
2.Quality management	Substantially compliant
3.Academic staff	Substantially compliant
4.Educational process content	Substantially compliant
5.Students	Substantially compliant
6.Research	Substantially compliant
7.Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
Overall compliance	Substantially compliant



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program *Criminal Law LLM* offered by the Faculty of Law under the Public University “Kadri Zeka” Gjilan is *substantially compliant* with the standards included in the *KAA Accreditation manual* and, therefore, recommends to *accredit* the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 25 (*twenty-five*) students to be enrolled in the program.

1. APPENDICES (*if available*): N/A

Expert Team

Chair

Prof. Dr. Goce Naumovski

01.06.2021

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)