UNIVERSITY "HAXHI ZEKA"

MASTER (MA) HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

RE-ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

April 2021, Zagreb-Riga

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 29th March, 2021

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Assit. prof. Marina Gregorić, PhD*
- *Ms. Asnate Kazoka, PhD student*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Mr. Naim Gashi*
- *Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Monitoring and Evaluation*
- *Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation*
- *Leona Kovaçi, Senior Officer for Monitoring and Evaluation*
- *Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Monitoring and Evaluation*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-evaluation report Master (MA) Human Resource Management, 2021*
- *KAA Accreditation Manual 11.07.2018*
- *Syllabi of the program*
- *CVs of academic staff*
- *Sample questionnaires for students, academic staff, dean, employers and graduates*
- *Strategic plan of University „Haxhi Zeka" in Peja 2020 – 2024*
- *Statute of the University „Haxhi Zeka"*
- *Research Strategy of University „Haxhi Zeka" in Peja 2019 – 2024*
- *Brochure about the research strategy*
- *Code of Ethics*
- *Academic Staff Handbook*
- *Academic development plan 2020*
- *Manual of Planning and Performance of Academic Staff*
- *Regulation for postgraduate (master) studies*

3

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

- *Performance indicators for the Human Resource Management study programme*
- *Annual plan of the scientific activities 2020*
- *Certificate of recognition of a research entity by EUROSTAT*
- *Regulation for the work of the career development center 2019*
- *Regulation on quality assurance and quality assessment system*
- *Quality Assurance Strategy of „Haxhi Zeka" University in Peja 2020-2024*
- *Regulation for publication*
- *European Training Foundation Key Indicators on Education, Skills and Employment 2020*
- *Law on Labour of the Republic of Kosovo*

Additional documents requested by the ET:

- *Comparison of HRM study program with other domestic and international institutions (in SER it is not presented in details)*
- *Erasmus mobility list of contracts signed*
- *Erasmus mobility statistics per year and students/teachers incoming and outcoming mobility in the previous years*
- *Evidence/examples of students and teachers questionnaires*
- *Evidence/reports of questionnaires analysis*
- *Examples of exams per study courses (marked from pass to excellent)*
- *Examples of testing learning outcomes per study courses*
- *Examples of final thesis/graduation thesis (satisfactory to excellent)*
- *Examples of plagiarism reports if any and the outcome of it*
- *Examples of complaints and how they are solved (procedures) - results*
- *Library sources - list of library collection and number of books, other sources available*
- *Examples of ethical committee activities, if there was any case and how it was solved*
- *Examples of dealing with underrepresented and vulnerable group of students*
- *Evidence of training or education for teaching staff in terms of teaching, didactics and learning outcomes - results and attendance*
- *List of published papers of each internal teacher*
- *List of contracts with business sector for practical training and cooperation with Institution*
- *Practice (practical training manual)*

4

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

- *Curricula for MA in Business Management with 3 concentrations (from 2020 onwards);*
- *Curricula - BA in Business Administration;*
- *Old curricula of the MA Human Resource Management;*
- *Entrance examination for the last admission – the content of exams and the results of the exams for all applicants*
- *Composition of the enrolled (admitted) students since 2017 – where they came from, which is their background (from which university and which study programme they graduated from)*
- *Composition of the Advisory Board of the FB24. Composition of the Quality Management and Evaluation Council*
- *The examples of practical research or work done by students in different study courses (examples assessed with different (good and average) grades).*
- *Mapping of the learning outcomes of the study courses with the learning outcomes of the study programme (if such mapping has been made)*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of KAA, July 2018*
- *Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact, Sustainability*

1.2. Site visit schedule

Expert Team

- Assist. prof. Marina Gregorić, PhD, University North, Croatia
- Ms. Asnate Kažoka, University of Latvia, Latvia

Coordinators of KAA

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA

5

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Site Visit Program

09.00 – 09.40	Meeting with the management of the institution *(no slide presentation is allowed, the meeting is intended as a free discussion, meeting with Dean, Vice dean)*
09.45 – 10:45	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
10:50 – 11:30	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
11:30 – 12:20	Lunch break
12:25 – 13:15	Meeting with the teaching staff
13:20 – 14:00	Meeting with students
14:05 – 14.45	Meeting with graduates
14:50 – 15:30	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
15:35 – 15:45	Internal meeting – Expert Team and KAA
15:45 – 15:55	Closing meeting with the management of the institution

Study programs	Experts	Responsible persons of study program
Human Resource Management (Re-accreditation)	Marina Gregorić Asnate Kažoka	Theranda Beqiri Vehbi Miftari Baki Koleci

6

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The Faculty of Business (hereafter FB) is organized as an academic unit of the University "Haxhi Zeka" in Peja (hereafter UHZ). The UHZ was established as a public higher education institution in Kosovo in 2012. At the time of the site visit, the FB offers two levels of study: bachelor (three-year studies) and scientific masthere will be one BA and 2 MA but UHZ has applied for accreditation of 3 new study programmester (two-year studies). In 2021 four study programmes are implemented at bachelor level and four study programmes at the master's level. The strategic orientation of UHZ is to consolidate the study programmes and currently only one study programme on the bachelor level and two study programmes on the master's level for the year 2021 have been announced. However, UHZ has applied for accreditation of 3 new study programmes

The master's study programme "Human Resource Management" is a unique study programme in Kosovo, as opposed to general education in business and economics that is provided by a number of higher education institutions in Kosovo. It was first accredited in 2013 and reaccredited for the period 2018 - 2021.

UHZ claims that the study programme takes into account the market needs and the interest of private and public enterprises for human resource managers.

The main recommendations of the previous assessment have been:

1. Define mission statement at the program level.
2. Conduct structured market research regarding market needs in order to further develop the program, adjust it to the specific needs of Kosovo, and thus increase employability of students.
3. Create internship opportunities for students, and include internship into the curriculum.
4. Increase transparency of admission procedures and establish unequivocal criteria and ranking procedures.
5. Support younger academic staff members to devote more time to research (which would lead not only to faster completion of their Ph.D. degrees but also to preparing academic publications).
6. Establish research infrastructure, increase funds for research support, and reward research achievements.
7. Support and stimulate regular pedagogical training, and make it available to all faculty members.

7

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

8. Assuring access to on-line journal databases is paramount for increasing quality of teaching and research. It would be worth considering that library consortium at the national level be formed, as this would substantially alleviate cost burden for all participating universities.

9. Establish information infrastructure (intranet) that would facilitate program delivery and information flow (e.g., e-classrooms, e-bulletin boards, etc.).

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The mission of the study program reflects the overall mission statement of the institution and it is in line with the requirements. According to previous reaccreditation and the recommendations of the ET it is identified that the revision of the mission in the past and the continuous improvement is in compliance to the overall mission statement of the institution. The idea of the mission is to prepare students for a competitive labor market environment in the field of Human resources management. In order to achieve that there are different courses designed and they offer a certain level of creativity, innovation, support and research which is also in line with the "Haxhi Zeka" university mission. In the SER and during the visit to university, from the meetings with management, students, professors and external stakeholders it is clearly seen that they do have strong commitment and understanding of the mission of the University but also the mission of the study program. Some of the competences and outcomes listed in the SER can be identified with the various stakeholders perception of the study program and its mission. The competences listed in the SER such as: equip students with capacity building on employee engagement that promotes their efficiency by using their analytical, communication and conceptual skills, applying creative and critical thinking in designing solutions to improve the employee performance and build organizational capabilities and gaining competence to analyse and interpret data of relevant researches and analytics to advance evidence-based HR processes and practices, do show that the study program Human resources management do comply with the overall mission of the University.

Due to the constant change in the environment and the need to continuously improve the study program, there is always a need to enhance, rethink and adjust the mission (University and

8

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

study program too). In the previous institutional re-accreditation were listed recommendations and the institution was assessed as fully compliant in the Standard 1.1. which shows the commitment of the University in general towards the alignment of study programs' missions with the overall mission of the University.From the mission statement of the University which states that *"University "Haxhi Zeka" continues its positive academic and artistic tradition, creates environment and transformative academic experiences in order to achieve the full potential of students, implements advanced scientific standards and helps the economic development of Peja region and the country in general"* we can conclude that the Faculty of Business with its master program "Human Resources Management" comply with the overall mission of the University as can be read in the statement of management and other stakeholders and from the SER;The mission is "*designed to meet the essential requirements and standards for preparing managerial and professional staff to improve their professional career. The program aims to assist students to develop a range of conceptual and practical skills, which will prepare them to work in human resource management and related fields. The program emphasizes the ways in which conceptual and theoretical skills can be utilized in managing people at work…*".

According to the SER there is a statement that indicates the compliance of the learning outcomes of the study program with the National Qualification Framework and the Framework for the Qualifications of the European Higher Education Areas such as; "*The HRM program, as the only one in Kosovo, offers quality curricular programs of study in this field. The aim of the program is fully in line with the goals of the national qualifications framework, making the HRM program integrate the European labour market, respecting the diversity of national education systems of different countries (CCC, 2008, p.18 https: // https://akkks.rks-gov.net/en/nqf/national-qualifications-framework). Taking into account the suggestions of the EE in the evaluation report of 2017 (External Evaluation Report, (institutional and programs re-accreditation pp. 8), the program designed is very flexible for students to understand how organizations should operate in the local and international environment.*

During the analysis of the SER and site visit it is obvious that no group of stakeholders clearly understood the meaning of the alignment of outcomes of the study program on the basis of the definition of learning outcomes on the level required (in HRM MSc level). As a consequence there is no evidence of the consistency of learning outcomes of the HRM program with the European Higher Education learning outcomes definition and standards. There is no evidence of the learning outcomes of the study program and its compliance with the syllabuses. As per the EU standards there should be alignment in all syllabuses which contribute to the study

9

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

program learning outcomes. As a consequence there is no evidence of testing and assessment of learning outcomes on the course level. There is no distinction which learning outcomes students passed in each exam. Exams are still done with no appliance of EU practice of assessing each learning outcome. During the meeting with all participants there was no understanding of the exact meaning on how students pass each learning outcome and how the learning outcomes are tested and assessed during the study course. There is no understanding of the process of creation of exams and other forms of assessment of learning outcomes, and there is no specific explanation and matrix of assessment of each learning outcome in the syllabuses. Syllabuses are created on the general level and they need to be detailed and specific, according to EU practices.

For the study program HRM it is not clear where the specific didactic and research concept is defined. Although the SER report entails the statement that "the study program has a well-defined didactic and research concept", such evidence is not presented to ET. The SER indicates the relationship between the Faculty of Business and HRM study program but it is written only as a general and not clear evidence is attached when it comes to didactics. Same applies to the research concept, because there is a research plan and concept for the entire UHZ but no specific one for the HRM study program is designed or presented to ET during the site visit or afterwards.

According to the SER and as per discussion with the management, staff and students there is evidence of the existence of the formal policies, guidelines and regulations related to procedural and academic issues. The functioning is based on the regulations and instructions of University "Haxhi Zeka" which are in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework and the Qualifications Framework of the European Higher Education Area. As stated in the SER and communicated with the staff they are aware of such procedures especially those related to University in general. During the meeting with staff there were not many staff available which is teaching in the HRM program and therefore it was not possible to identify whether there are any special problems in that area. There is a "*Regulation on the use and monitoring of the work schedule of academic staff and students at the University "* (http://unhz.eu/regulations/).
Haxhi Zeka "in Peja - No. Prot. 462. Dt. 02.03.2018 and accordingly all staff and students have to follow the rules and comply with them. It is also evident that the The Faculty of Business organizes its academic and scientific activities in accordance with the Strategic Plan 2017-2022 of the University "Haxhi Zeka" but no special document for HRM programs are developed. Since it is the common rule and policy for all members of the Faculty of Business, ET finds it appropriate. According to SER and the meeting with management it is evident that the HRM study program is designed in accordance with the **Law on Higher Education 04 /**

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

L-037, in the Republic of Kosovo, according to the Bologna declaration, the statute (see **UHZ Statute No. 04-V-622**) (Statute of Haxhi Zeka direct link https://drive.google.com/file/d/11dKx1Lc4wbP46cdocvPJUyRBEouUhlN0/view).

of the University "Haxhi Zeka" and the strategic plan 2017-2022 (**see Strategic Plan 2017-2022**), of the Public University "Haxhi Zeka". Strategic plan2017-2024 link https://drive.google.com/file/d/19NwnMGZR3EA7Gj_jJw6YwJBuLCB2llrK/view).

(It is also evident that UHZ provides equal opportunities to everyone during the recruitment process, training and other practices implemented and the characteristics such as gender, race, ethnic origin, national origin, colour, religion, age, uniform of the service or status they represent, with mental and physical disabilities or even political beliefs, has no major impact on the position of the person and the fair treatment is guaranteed as per the "Code of ethics for academic staff and students of University"

During the meeting with students, staff and other stakeholders there wasn't any complain or misunderstanding noted and it is clear that UHZ insists on applying the standards and regulations when it comes to anti-discrimination and ethic issues.

During the meeting with management it was identified that there is a link between the society, especially the business sector and beginning of foundation of Alumni association, with the aim to improve the HRM study program and adapt it to the changing market needs and environment. The Alumni members declared their activity in the given feedback via conducted surveys, and they confirm that the program has been improved since they graduated. There are several study courses added as elective courses according to the request of Alumni but also according to the feedback given by the business sector and professionals cooperating with UHZ and companies hiring and accepting students for practical training. The fact is that most of the attendees of the meeting with external and employers of graduates were discussing the level of The Business Faculty and not specifically the program of HRM. Only one representative was head of the HRM department and former student, and she shows strong enthusiasm when it comes to believe in the HRM study program competences, and recommends improvements in added value from introducing additional study courses to be implemented in the program. The HRM study program has responded to those recommendations. The major recommendation is related to the practical training course with 2 ECTS which is seen as a good start but most of the participants agree that the practice should be longer, maybe even organized during both academic years in the future. Currently, the HRM masters program at UHZ is the only such program in Kosovo, but in the future when the competition will be stronger, there will be an

11

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

urgent need to research the market more and adjust to it since the research activity was not needed until now (as management stated too).

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

Recommendations:

1. *Strong recommendations to revise and implement learning outcomes of the study program HRM in accordance to EU practice*

12

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

2. *Strong recommendation to adjust and map learning outcomes of the syllabuses with learning outcomes of the study program in terms of exact matching the contribution of each course to learning outcomes of the study programs*

3. *In order to follow up and implement recommendations 1 and 2, the advising or consultancy can be outsourced from the institutions in the neighboring countries which are more experienced in the required analytics and definition of learning outcomes of the study and syllabuses*

4. *Implement didactic and teaching concepts with clear guidelines for assessment and learning process. The implementation of learning outcomes should be seen in testing the learning outcomes in all forms of assessment. Students should be aware of each learning outcome assessment in each assessment form (exams, seminars, practice, WS, etc.). The assessment should be based on passing each and every specific learning outcome in order to pass the course. This should all be structured in syllabuses and implemented during the teaching and examination process.*

5. *Continue monitoring and researching the market and market needs in terms to comply with market requirements and adjust the mission with the overall mission of the University especially when the change of the current University mission changes*

6. *Continue to apply rules and regulations of the University and The Faculty of Business in delivering the HRM study program and continuously work on improvements and follow up in terms of advancements and quality standards*

7. *Continue with implementation, monitoring and control of rules and regulations regarding ethical issues, anti-discriminatory policies and treatment of underrepresented, vulnerable and disabled staff or students.*

8. *Continue cooperation with external stakeholders and research the market needs in order to improve study program, introduce new courses with alignment to new technologies and practices, and add value to the HRM program according to the market needs*

2.2. Quality Management

Quality assurance mechanisms and system are defined on the UHZ level and applied throughout the institution.

13

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

Similarly to many higher educations in Kosovo the quality assurance arrangements in UHZ are rather recent. The first Quality Assurance Strategy of the University of Haxhi Zeka was first defined in 2016.

Currently UHZ operates according to the Quality Assurance Strategy of "Haxhi Zeki" University in Peja 2020 - 2024, Regulation on Quality Assurance and Quality Assessment System at the University "Haxhi Zeka" in Peja approved in 2019 and Quality Assurance Guide approved in 2020.

From the aims of the quality assurance system, for example, *"Quality assurance processes within the university are regular activities that contribute to the development of a quality culture within the university"* it is visible that UHZ has focused on internal development needs, rather than external requirements. Periodic external quality assurance is only one of the elements within the scope of the quality assurance and assessment in UHZ.

The regulation and guidelines have been developed in 2020 according to the timeline set in the Quality Assurance Strategy. The Regulation on Quality Assurance and Assessment defines the aims, involved parties, their duties and the types of assessment and instruments used. The Quality Assurance Guide is intended to guide the UHZ community on processes, procedures, timelines and quality assurance policies.

The Quality Assurance Strategy is an integral part of the UHZ Strategic Plan which confirms that quality assurance developments are fully integrated into the normal planning processes. However, currently the strategic goals have been mostly related to establishment of different mechanisms and ensuring that they are functional. In the future it would be suggested to aim for more ambitious goals related to implementation and the actual outcome of the quality assurance processes, for example, increasing the response rate for surveys to a certain level, reaching certain results in the use of the anti-plagiarism system, decreasing the failure rate for exams etc.

From the Quality Assurance Strategy it is evident that most of the quality assurance arrangements have been established in 2020. UHZ makes use of 6 survey mechanisms - student assessment of the academic staff, dean's assessment of the academic staff, self-assessment of the academic staff, student assessment of the administration, survey for employers and survey for graduates. Only two of these mechanisms - student assessment of the teaching staff and

14

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

self-assessment of the academic staff - have existed before 2020. In 2020 all surveys have been transferred to a digital format (UHZ Student Management System) indicating that the collection and analysis of data has become easier. None of the currently established assessment mechanisms for students addresses the issues that are related to study programme in general and the student life (resources, student support services, including career and psychological counselling, extra-curricular activities)

The currently available quality assurance reports are prepared on the UHZ level only. The reports contain a very general statistics of satisfaction, without any strengths and weaknesses identified and suggestions for further improvement. The expert team would suggest to include a more extensive analysis of the results which would result in specific recommendations to the UHZ management and could be included in the strategic planning and later followed up. The expert team would also suggest in the future preparation of such analysis/ reports on programme or on the faculty level to obtain an overview of the specific issues on the faculty level. Currently the expert team could not obtain any evidence on how these results would be used for further development of the study programme and could not identify any examples of such cases.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X

15

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		X
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.		X
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *In the next planning period define more ambitious strategic goals/targets for quality and quality assurance processes, related to the expected outcome of processes rather than establishment of mechanisms.*

2. *To analyse the quality assurance results and the on programme and faculty level and to produce relevant analysis/ reports which would include suggestions for improvement;*

3. *To measure KPIs for Human Resource Management study programme regularly and incorporate them in quality assurance reports on the programme level;*

4. *To integrate these suggestions in the regular planning processes and provide updates on their accomplishment;*

16

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

5. *Update the current student and staff survey mechanisms to assess general aspects related to study implementation (resources, support services, appeals and complaints system, student transfer, extra-curricular activities etc.)*

6. *Review the content of all questionnaires regularly through involving the relevant parties, for example, Students Parliament in revising the questionnaires for students;*

2.3. Academic staff

Candidates for employment at UHZ as well as to the HRM study program are provided with the full position descriptions and conditions of employment. There is a table presented in the SER including the following data about full time and part time academic staff supported with the following: name and surname, program affiliation, qualification level, academic title, contract duration, workload divided by teaching, counselling etc, consultation, administrative work and research as well as the employment status is presented allocating skills and time resources to different tasks (p. 21-24). All contracts of the academic staff of the Faculty of Business as well as those who teach in the master in HRM program, are in compliance with legal requirements regarding the position in which they are placed (assistant or professor) according to Article 8 of the Labor Law no. 03 / L-212. The UHZ follows the rules and regulations in recruiting staff and offering equal opportunities for all candidates. The evaluation process starts after public competition by assessment done by the Evaluation Committee. The Evaluation Committee is appointed by the Council and it reports to the Council and evaluation is done according to the terms set in the Statute of the UHZ. As being evident in the SER, *"after the approval of the council the proposal of the evaluation committee passes to the senate and after the senate the decision goes to the rector so all the academic staff is appointed by the rector according to the Senate decision based on the proposal of the council of the academic unit"*. According to Article 166 of the Statute of the University Haxhi Zeka, regular employment staff can't have another contract full employment in any of the Institutions of Higher Education. In the program of masters in HRM 80% of the academic staff who teach at the master level are full time staff. The following table shows the structure of full time and part time staff (SER, p. 25).

17

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

Regular Staff	Part time	Total
20	5	25
20/25 = 80%	5/25= 20%	100%

Majority of the staff has a relevant PhD degree and the HRM program fulfills the requirement of having for every 60 ECTS credits of the HRM study program employed at least one full time staff with PhD title. The same staff is allocated to teach in other study programs within the Faculty of Business at it is sufficient for the program existence, but it would be more appropriate for further improvement of the program to have opportunity to allocate more staff to the HRM program in order to revise the program more often and have more time for research activities in the field. The opportunities for further development of staff are available for all staff and they can participate in different research and project activities on the international and national level, but due to the crisis and limited budget for research funding as well as lack of budget for employment of new staff, it is not possible to to achieve the research goals fully. The Faculty of Business and HRM study program has a young staff and it is important to offer them various development opportunities. During the meeting with staff it is noted that certain Erasmus mobility has been implemented over the past period. The 28 teachers mobility and 3 students mobility. The awareness of management and teachers shows the understanding of being part of international mobility but last year was difficult because of Covid - 19 pandemic as well as the challenges of online learning. The working hours of staff is 40 hours per week where during the meeting with staff it is identified that they teach approximately 6 hours per week and the rest of the time they do other tasks such as preparation for lessons, seminars and exercises, and other forms of lecture, prepare university textbooks and appropriate literature for study, supervise the seminar papers, master thesis, and to ensure the unobstructed retention of exams during the exam period. Teachers also have to allocate weekly consultancy hours for students, minimum 2 hours per week when students can ask about any problem related to

18

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

teaching process, courses, exams, research projects or exam results as well as the thesis guidelines.

As per the SER and information provided during the meeting with students, staff and management, it is evident that the UHZ does the evaluation of the teaching quality by students, at least once a year but mostly every semester. Questionnaires are compiled by , based on the standard structural questionnaires provided by the Senate and which are stored and used in computer mode and are anonymous. Ten percent (10%) of the best annual results of the quality assessment of learning are published by each committee leader. The data from the questionnaires are provided in the documents and SER but the implementation of the results of the feedback gathered is missing. The management and staff should focus on the feedback given by students and create the action plan in order to improve the quality of teaching, teaching methods, syllabuses and courses accordingly. During the site visit the ET did not get the solid evidence of the implementation of such policies. The practical training course with 2 ECTS was added recently and it is more related to the recommendation from the previous re-accreditation and in line with the preparation for current re-accreditation while the course as such is not yet delivered. Since there was enough time from previous re-accreditation the HRM study program could have been improved significantly by now, according to the feedback gathered in questionnaires. On the other hand, management is aware that the HRM program is unique in Kosovo and the lack of competition together with strong demand for the program, is not encouraging to invest more effort in improvements when not necessary. However, the positive side is that they are aware of the need to be ready for competition in the future and with more funds and more staff they are willing to develop and improve the study program and the research activities together with implementation of the teaching strategies. Although the teachers and professors (teaching staff) are relatively highly assessed by students for their quality in teaching they should be aware of no competition, no other program comparison existing (which can lead to biased assessment too). During the meeting with staff it is noted that they attended different trainings and workshops, participated in different projects (8-9 of them international) but none of the teachers was aware of the EU standards and requirements for creation of syllabuses. Syllabuses do contain general information about the courses but not the specific learning outcomes in relations to learning outcomes of the study program, the assessment of learning outcomes through different technologies and methods, according to EU practices.

19

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

In terms of the teachers retirement age and their retirement for other reasons the UHZ comply with the standard of replacing the retired full-time teachers with a contract of part-time teachers. The rule also applies to the HRM study program.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	*No*
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at the age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *In order to improve the quality of syllabuses and teaching skills it is necessary to create a policy and training plan oriented to the HRM courses.*

2. *Revision of syllabuses should be done based on the changes in the field of the HRM but also on the students' feedback provided by the students surveys*

3. *Self evaluation of teachers should be implemented regularly with the aim of creating yearly plan of skills and competencies to be improved or enhanced according to the trends, technologies and resource in the academic field*

4. *Revise learning outcomes of the HRM program and develop the matrix of learning outcomes of each course of the program in compliance with program learning outcomes*

5. *Enhance and strengthen the cooperation with other institutions and universities in the region and internationally (especially EU), in order to increase competencies of teaching staff and improve methodology of teaching and learning process*

21

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

21

2.4. Educational process content

Master Program in Human Resource Management is a 2-year study programme with 120 ECTS credits. It includes 12 mandatory study courses and three elective courses (to be chosen out of two sets of three courses in the 1nd and 2nd semester and a set of four courses in the 3rd semester). The number of mandatory study courses and elective courses has increased by one each if compared to the previous assessment of the study programme in 2013.

As described in the SER the Master's Program in HRM is created to meet the requirements and standards for training managerial staff and young professionals in Kosovo. The aim is to develop and improve employability and satisfy the market need for professionals in human resources. The study program consists of courses which aim to give students competences in different areas of HRM and management together with teaching staff claim that in theri courses there is a significant level of practice included. By practice they mean there is a research process in different courses and there is cooperation with the business sector while students will analyse companies and certain areas in the field of human resources. They write reports, research analysis and discuss case studies. The HRM program as such contributes to the civil society and to development of the student's personality.

The strategic goal of UHZ has been the establishment of a study programme where students would obtain managerial competencies in the human resource area therefore it was decided to establish a master's level study programme. However, the level 7 (master's) according to the European Qualification Framework requires highly specialised knowledge and skills to develop new knowledge and procedures while the expected learning outcomes of the study programme, for example, *develop students' conceptual understanding of modern human resource management practices and procedures*, are generic and seem to be more appropriate for the bachelor level. The expert team has learned about the intention of UHZ to develop a bachelor study programme in Human Resource Management. The expert team would highly recommend to start the development of this bachelor study programme by mapping the skills and competencies required at the bachelor level and master's level. In the expert team's opinion development of a bachelor study programme should result in significant changes to the master's programme in regard to the achievable learning outcomes.

22

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

While the expert team concludes that the subjects within the curricula have been arranged in a logical order, the experts did not find any evidence how the exact subjects would contribute to the general learning outcomes of the whole study programme. The UHZ refers to comparison with four study programmes in other universities in Europe but the aim of this exercise and the lessons learned are not clear. The comparison provided is based on the similarity of titles of study courses but not the amount in ECTS, content and learning outcomes of the specific courses. The expert team would recommend performing a thorough comparison of the UHZ study programme with selected study programmes in other European universities, to base this comparison on the actual content and mechanism of implementation and use the outcomes and use the results for improving the course content of the UHZ study programme.

Also, UHZ currently uses the term "electives" in a situation where a student has to select a subject from a predefined list of three subjects only. According to the European best practice, this is a very narrow implementation of "restricted electives". The expert team would like to suggest broadening the list of "restricted electives" and also allocating a number of ECTS for "full electives" meaning that students can choose any subject offered by UHZ and it does not necessarily need to contribute to reaching the specific learning outcomes of this study programme.

The disciplines of the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise the minimum required according to the standard such as: objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and other activities, assessment system, and bibliography. During the meeting with management, teachers and students it was noted that the understanding of learning outcomes is not in line with requirements and guidelines on the EU level, especially for the masters programs which need to be on the level 7 and the assessment of each learning outcome is not described in syllabuses. Formally, current syllabuses consist of basic elements but need to be revised and the level of quality and the content of syllabuses should be improved to reach the learning outcomes according to Bloom's taxonomy and the appropriate level (7). As a consequence, the teaching and learning relationship between students and teachers can not be adequate and sufficient for the masters level of the study. Teachers explain current learning outcomes to students, but this is not sufficient, and none of them during the meeting were able to explain the concept of learning outcomes at the program level in relation to the syllabuses and specifically learning outcomes for each syllabus according to the guidelines of EU qualification framework, descriptors of learning outcomes and Bloom's taxonomy of knowledge. The verbs used in the learning outcomes and the

23

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

23

definition of them should be improved and relate to level 7. During the meetings and from the SER, ET did not notice any issues related to the language of the program and the students ability to follow the program in the language they applied for.

The formal student assessment mechanisms are described in the course descriptions. During the interviews the expert team received evidence that these mechanisms are communicated to students at the beginning of each course. The assessment mechanisms are diverse and relevant to each study course. However, as explained earlier, while the actions that have to be performed in order to complete each course are clear, they are not connected to the learning outcomes of the course. It is also not clear to what extent the students can have a say on the teaching and assessment mechanisms.

While the majority of students are employed on a full-time or part-time basis, the student engagement in the study programme is claimed to be up to 40 hours a week according to the calculation by UHZ. The expert team would like to raise the issue of the high failure rates for the study courses - in 2018 there was almost 50% passing rate for the first time for a number of study courses. It is claimed to be caused by the fact that students are working and can not follow the courses. Although the reason is understandable, the high failure rate signals that the teaching, learning and assessment mechanisms have not been developed according to the student target group and are not aimed at achieving the learning outcomes defined. The expert team commends the establishment of a tutorial system in 2016/2017 where students with different performance levels are paired. The improvement in passing rates since then is evident. However, the achievement of learning outcomes should rather be the result of mutual teacher-student cooperation than a student-student tutoring system.

The previous expert team has identified the lack of an internship as one of the deficiencies and as a result UHZ has established a compulsory study course "Internship and Career Development" amounting to 2 ECTS. However, the expert team would like to highlight that this remark was related to the fact that the programme aimed to provide professional training and that academic and professional work was presented as programme's distinguishing feature, but there was neither specific internship nor evidence that the projects included in the curricula would be linked to specific companies and/or real-life business.

The emphasis on professional training and declaration of 50:50 or 40:60 theory-practice ratio in this study programme is still somewhat unclear. The expert team is of the opinion that establishing a separate study course amounting only to 2 ECTS is not the best approach in

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

24

ensuring the necessary practical competencies. Instead, the expert team would suggest incorporating the internship in a number of study courses and developing a set of separate learning outcomes and a mechanism for assessing them.

UHZ has signed a number of cooperation agreements with industry. However, during the interviews the expert team did not evidence any enterprises that would currently provide internships in human resource management. As the majority of master's level students are working, the expert team would assume that they would undergo the internship in their workplace. In this situation it is especially important to define programme or course-specific learning outcomes for the internship to ensure that the students obtain the necessary skills and competences.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality. Marina	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning. Asnate		X
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation. Asnate		X

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

25

Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation. Marina	X	
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	-	-
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development. Marina		X
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students. Marina		X
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses. Asnate	X	
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions. Asnate	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed. Asnate		X

26

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

26

Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program. Marina&Asnate		X
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units. Asnate	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Review the learning outcomes of the study programme to make them more appropriate for the European Qualification Framework level 7;*

2. *Review the learning outcomes of each syllabus and to make them adequate and related to the learning outcomes of the study programme as well as in accordance with the European Qualification Framework level 7*

3. *Review all syllabuses and include assessment of each learning outcome according to the European Qualification Framework level 7 and enable students to pass learning outcomes, not only exams in a general form as before*

4. *When developing the bachelor study programme, review the learning outcomes for both levels and revise the master's study programme accordingly;*

5. *To introduce the concept of full electives and reserve a time-slot in the study programme;*

6. *To review the concept of the internship/practice in the study programme and develop/adjust the necessary documentation.*

27

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

27

2.5. Students

The admission principles defined for UHZ are defined by the Regulation for Postgraduate Studies. They state that the prerequisite for enrolment in master's studies is the completion of basic (bachelor) studies, in relevant degree and amounting to at least 180 ECTS credits. In case there is no competition, all students who have achieved an average grade of 7.5 in their bachelor studies can be admitted directly. In case there is competition or the number of places is bigger than the number of applicants with the grade of 7.5 and higher, the candidates are subjected to entrance examination. The expert team considers this mechanism and requirements sufficient and relevant.

The maximum size for lectures is defined as 50 students while the maximum size for exercises is defined as 25 students. During the interviews the expert team did not receive any critical remarks related to this therefore the setting for the study process is considered as appropriate.

The SER and the regulation does not contain clear information on where and how the marks issued to students are announced. Also, from the interviews with the UHZ staff and students it was not clear whether the results of exams and the marks are discussed with students to explain the reasons for a certain result, other than just announcing the final mark. The main mechanism for assistance is the assignment of a student mentor in case of a failure and providing a number of opportunities for retake of the exam. The SER states that after completion of each exam period based on statistical reports, the UHZ Quality Office compiles the student passing ratio for 5 exams deadlines. These results for the last three years were also presented to the expert team as a part of the SER.

The Regulation for Postgraduate Studies and also the UHZ Statute does not include any fixed deadlines (number of days) for issuing (announcing) marks for the exam. It would be suggested to introduce internal deadlines for issuing marks for different types of assessment in regulations for different study levels.

The Regulation for Postgraduate Studies states that upon completion of the last regular semester of master studies, a student will have a period of twelve (12) months to finish his exams (graduation period). Also, the regulation states that at the request of the candidate, the faculty council can appoint a new term of up to six months at most for submitting the diploma

28

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

28

work. This is certainly a sign of flexible treatment and individual approach. However, together with the fact that there is a number of opportunities for passing exams and a tendency that a number of students do not pass the exam for the first time, this raises doubts about the efficiency of the study process. UHZ should encourage and support students to finish their studies in the nominal time, if there is no absolute emergency situation, and take the relevant measures to prevent non-completion and multiple extension of study period. Also, the defense of the thesis should be the final examination that the student takes, before issuing a diploma. Having said that, the expert team would raise attention to the statement in the UHZ statute that foresees that a student may be allowed by the dean of the academic unit to enter the exam earlier or later, if he/she participates in an international exchange program or is doing practical training/internship abroad. However, the expert team would like to suggest a broader formulation of such cases to allow more flexibility for the dean to decide, for example, in case of urgent health issues, family conditions and other. It would be important that such special cases are not counted as a failure of the exam and do not prevent the student from receiving a scholarship or other benefits.

The SER states that records on enrolment and completion rate are collected and on the bases of this the UZH Quality Office compiles reports on student passing and other quality measurement indicators. However, the list of Key Performance Indicators includes an indicator related to the grades that students have received but no indicators related to examination passing rate or drop-out rate. The expert team would suggest including such indicators, defining the target and using the results for improving the teaching and learning strategies for the study programme. As a result of the study programme the students will be issued a master's diploma and this is confirmed by the Regulation for Postgraduate Studies. The SER does not mention the existence of a diploma supplement which would be issued to all students as a result of the study programme. The expert team would like to highlight the importance of a diploma supplement that includes the full student track record (the subjects passed and the grades).

The process for contesting student marks is defined in the UHZ statute. The Statute states that there can not be a complaint against the evaluation of the commission which is established based on the student's appeal. The expert team would encourage establishment of an institutional body who could review the complaints received after the appeal. The expert team would also suggest transferring the information related to appeals possibilities to the Regulation for Postgraduate Studies. Currently the Regulation for Postgraduate Studies is

29

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

29

almost an excerpt from the Statute. The expert team would suggest reviewing the content of both documents to ensure that Statute provides an overview of the UHZ structure, general roles and processes within it while the Regulation for Postgraduate (Graduate) studies is the main operational document when it comes to organising the study process.

The SER states that UHZ provides a plagiarism detection programme. The UHZ Code of Ethics contains a detailed chapter on plagiarism, also stating that any text, dissertation, research, report, artwork must be subject to plagiarism detection software available. The students submitting their assignments are supposed to sign an agreement of proof that the document was prepared by him or her and that the document is his / her original work and without any plagiarism. Also the Code of Ethics states that every supervisor / mentor must receive a certificate issued by the IT responsible person or Contract Manager, proving that the work done by the student is not plagiarized. However, the interviews of UHZ representatives and the additional information submitted confirms that UHZ is only at the initial stage of implementing the anti plagiarism software. The current practice cannot yet be judged as consistent and efficient application of anti plagiarism mechanisms and the expert team would recommend to UHZ to continue the efforts.

Student rights and obligations are set forth in the UHZ statute and Regulation for Postgraduate Studies. Although the expert team was presented with the Academic Staff Handbook, it did not find any evidence of a Student Handbook or a similar document. The expert team is of the opinion that statute is not a user-friendly format for communicating student rights and obligations and suggest to develop a Student Handbook where this information would be explained in a way that is clear and understandable to the students.

The possibilities for student transfer are mentioned by the Regulation for Postgraduate Studies, however, the statement is broad and does not explain the prerequisites for transfer and the transfer process itself, to make it clear and transparent for anyone interested. The expert team did not learn of any actual examples of transfer in this study programme therefore it is not able to judge on the quality of the process.

The SER states that all professors and assistants in coordination with the UHZ quality coordinator set the official schedule for giving advice and consultations to students. In addition to this schedule, the teaching staff members are also available through email. In this regard the

30

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

30

expert team would like to mention the tutoring system where tutoring is provided by excellent students who also receive a salary for their service.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.		X
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		X

31

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

31

Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.		X
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Introduce fixed internal deadlines for issuing marks for different types of assessment;*

2. *Take measures to further encourage and support students to finish their studies in the nominal time, if there is no absolute emergency situation, and take the relevant measures to prevent non-completion and multiple extension of study period;*

3. *Revise the regulations in regard to flexible student treatment in exams in cases where the student is not able to participate in the exam due to objective reasons other from those currently prescribed by the regulation and ensure that such special cases would not be counted as a failure of the exam and would not prevent the student from receiving a scholarship or other benefits;*

4. *Streamline the Regulation for Postgraduate Studies and the UHZ Statute to ensure that the most important information for the study process is included in the regulation and to avoid overlapping with the Statute;*

5. *Include an indicator related to study course completion rates and the dropout rate among key performance indicators for the study programme, define the target and use the results for improving the teaching and learning strategies for the study programme;*

32

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

32

6. *Issue a mandatory diploma supplement to all graduates of the study programme;*
7. *Ensure that the information about student rights and responsibilities is available in a format that is clear and accessible to the students, for example, the Student Handbook;*
8. *Take further actions in raising the student awareness about plagiarism issues and ensuring the authenticity of all student works;*
9. *To establish an institutional body who could review the complaints received after the student appeal;*
10. *Develop a clear formal process (documentation) for student transfer on the master's level.*

2.6. Research

According to the SER and meetings with the management and academic staff, there is a significant research activity continuously conducted at UHZ by their staff and students. It is done in line with the Academic Development Plan of the Faculty of Business. The document identifies the key development activities for staff and students and follows the strategy of the UHZ. There is also important information and regulation included when it comes to the needs of academic staff in the field of publications and research until 2024. The document entails the definition of the platforms for scientific research and publications together with policies how staff participate in scientific conferences and mobility. The management of UHZ is aware of the importance of the research activity and involvement in the project, supports its staff to participate in, but due to relatively new staff on board at HRM program there is a constant need for improvement and empowerment of staff. The limitations and obstacles in collecting data from the field and the companies are noted during the meeting with management and staff. The overall crisis in the country and the effect o Covid-19 pandemic is also noted as a problem which slows the research progress and availability of data but this is something that can be overcomed with more online research, participation in the projects on the national and international level by expanding these activities in all possible ways in the given circumstances. Activity of UHZ is seen also in the participation of teachers in the Erasmus+ exchange and projects and that is something to be continued even during the pandemic in terms of broadening the online technologies, online teaching methods, lectures and training but also after the pandemic in a hybrid or contact/traditional ways of Erasmus+ cooperation. Currently, the

33

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

33

research strategy exists on the University level but it should be specifically designed and created for the purpose of advancing and improving as well as further developing the quality of HRM study program which must be equipped with teaching quality and content related to current trends in the HEM business. Therefore, it is very important to build the research strategy for the HRM program and ensure its competitiveness before new entrants enter to the market, to be a step ahead of the competition.

During the analysis of the documents, SER and meetings with the staff the ET finds the policies for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and the staff publishes in the recognised publications, such as Scopus, Web of Science, Ebsco, and other relevant data base. However, it is necessary to conduct more research and continue to publish, encourage and motivate younger staff and become leaders in the research in Kosovo in the field of HRM. The current situation of being the only master study in the country offering HRM program, should be utilised in the research area too. The proven track record of research activity is elaborated in the SER for full time and part time staff. The ET recommends to continue with research and increase the activity in the field of HRM as a specific goal in order to improve the quality of the program, within the Faculty of Business. According to the research activity report for the academic staff there is evidence that they do publish at least one scientific/applied research paper yearly in the past 3 years. The published papers of the staff are affiliated with the UHZ as per the requirements of quality standard 6.8. as well as UHZ Statute - Articles 160 and 161.

Furtheron, the UHZ encourages academic staff to include the research results in their syllabuses and teaching materials and update syllabuses with recent literature and findings in the field. In the HRM courses/syllabuses major revision of syllabuses should be implemented according to the learning outcomes and the sources of literature should be adjusted accordingly once outcomes are in line with HRM masters level 7. The major problem and weakness found in the SER and during the meeting with management and staff when it comes to research in the field of HRM is lack of infrastructure resources and literature as well as the access to international updated databases. This should be overcomed with the specific plan of research activities for the program HRM and with the increased cooperation with international institutions, libraries, online databases and using the possibilities given by international projects and Erasmus+ cooperation. The plagiarism software still does not exist at the level of the HRM study program or The Faculty of Business and this is something to be seriously considered and implemented. The current originality checking of the documents such as seminar and especially the masters

34

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

34

thesis, is not sufficient, by only a signed statement of originality. Academic staff and management explained to the ET that each course of HRM consists of practice and research done by students but this is one of the elements that should be checked and monitored also by anti plagiarism tools in order to accept such results and reports, especially in the process of writing and defending the master thesis. It is important to introduce the anti plagiarism software and procedures within the whole Faculty of Business and specifically for the HRM program. Being the only masters in Kosovo at the moment, the HRM program must be leader in quality and ensure its position of a leader in the future by cooperation with domestic and international business and academic institutions and the results of the researches and master thesis should be of a high quality which includes the originality and applicability to the sector, too.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	**No**
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	X	
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	

35

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

35

Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.9. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.10. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
Standard 6.11. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Develop the research strategy for the HRM program and ensure its competitiveness before new entrants enter to the market, to be a step ahead of the competition.*
2. *Increase the quantity and quality of research in the domain of HRM topics relevant to the field.*
3. *Provide clear policies for defining what is recognized as high-quality research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of HRM program.*
4. *Ensure the funds/budget and financing the research in the field of HRM on the local and international level.*

36

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

36

5. *Improve the availability of international resources by broadening the international cooperation with universities, libraries and online database access to recent publications for academic staff and students*
6. *Encourage more utilisation of Erasmus+ exchange in terms of common research activity with other institutions*
7. *Integrate research, teaching and learning in the didactic concept of the HRM program and revise syllabuses with recent research according to the level 7 and appropriate learning objectives*
8. *Acquire and implement unique anti plagiarism technology to be used in the courses and for the master thesis writing purpose*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

UHZ is a public university which is fully dependent on public funds that are allocated on an annual basis by the Ministry of Education.

Finances are dealt with on an institutional level. According to the SER each year from 2018 to 2020 a sum 15 000 EUR of direct financial support has been allocated to the study programme.

The main weaknesses referred to throughout the SER and during the interviews by UHZ representatives have been related to the infrastructure and resources - lack of physical infrastructure, outdated and insufficient library resources, insufficient technological support and lack of advanced technological equipment, limited funding for research and projects. However, the UHZ management believes that the available resources are sufficient for implementing the existing and planned study programmes, especially in the light of programme consolidation that has already taken place in UHZ.

As the study programme and UHZ is solely dependent on the state budget, it can be considered as generally sustainable. However, it would be recommended to look for additional sources of income through research projects and service to society, in order to maintain a stable level of financing in case the funding from the state decreases.

The expert report prepared in 2017 states that a construction of a new building for the FB is planned for 2018 and this is also included in the UHZ Strategic Plan 2017 - 2022. However, at the point of the expert visit the construction was still not completed.

All infrastructure currently used for the study process is the property of UHZ. The study programme Human Resource Management makes use of the infrastructure available and does not require any specific infrastructure. According to the SER there are 13 classrooms, a computer lab and a library with 84 seats. Computers are equipped with the Nvivo, STATA and SPSS software which is used in the study process.

Recently UHZ has developed a Student Management System which is used for different purposes - publishing the information related to students and staff, collecting feedback, collecting and analysing information about student progression rates and results etc.

There are 1360 titles in 3754 copies included in the UHZ library collection . Library has received book donations from several donors (e.g., other universities), and was able to purchase some titles by using funds from the EU projects.

There is an institutional policy of providing at least 5 copies of each book/information source listed in the mandatory section of the study courses. The UHZ expressed their commitment to ensure as many copies as possible but the possibilities are limited by financial constraints.

Upon the request of the expert team UHZ submitted information on the UHZ library collection. Based on this information, the expert team cannot conclude that all materials listed as mandatory literature for the study courses are available in the UHZ library in sufficient quantity (at least 5 copies) or even available at all. Specific examples of „Hyrje në menaxhimin e burimeve njerëzore'' by Banfield P. and Kay R. and "The Time Trap: The classic book on time management" by Mackenzie A. and Nickerson P. can be mentioned. The expert team would like to note that even the availability of 5 paper copies would be generally insufficient compared to the number of students involved. Out of these 1360 titles less than 40 titles have been published in 2015 or later and most of them are related to financial management and accounting. Also, there was no information on any periodicals related to this study programme that would be available in the UHZ library.

38

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

38

In regard to ensuring access to on-line journal databases, the UHZ in SER states that it has reached some agreements as with EUROSTAT and EBSCO and the UHZ management is trying to cooperate on this issue with other universities. However, the agreements attached do not include any evidence of current access to databases. The UHZ has also presented a list of online resources available but the access for all resources presented has expired in 2020.

During the interviews the experts did not find evidence of any current students with disabilities. In the SER, UHZ states that all three facilities of UHZ support the learning process of students with disabilities. UHZ has also been active in promoting social inclusion. However, the video material provided to the experts does not demonstrate any specific arrangements for people with disabilities. The entrance to the faculty building and the main passages are based on stairs, the lecture rooms are quite narrow and arranged in a static way. The expert team assumes that in case there are students with disabilities, an appropriate solution is found. However, with the construction of the new building the expert team recommends paying special attention to accessibility issues.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account. Threats?	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	

Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.		X

40

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

40

Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Explore additional financing possibilities in addition to allocation from the Ministry, for example, project funding, research funding, to maintain stable level of financing for the study programme;*

2. *Complete the construction of the infrastructure for the Faculty of Business and ensure its accessibility for students with physical disabilities;*

3. *Review and update the physical literature resources related to human resource management and expand it in terms of the copies available, possibly through cooperation with other institutions;*

4. *Enhance the use of electronic resources in all key areas of the curriculum, including the access to on-line journal databases.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Standard	Compliance Level
Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
Quality management	Partially compliant
Academic Staff	Substantially compliant
Educational Process Content	Partially compliant
Students	Substantially compliant

41

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

41

Research	Substantially compliant
Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
Overall Compliance	**Substantially compliant**

The overall compliance is assessed by the experts at the level of **substantially compliant.**

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the Master of Arts study program "Human Resource Management" offered by the University "Haxhi Zeka" in Peja is **substantially compliant** with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation Manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the above study programme. The expert team recommends enrolling **80 students** in the first year of studies. The expert team recommends the reacreditation of the study program "Human Resource Management" in 3 years.

Expert Team Members

Doc. dr.sc. Marina Gregorić

……

Signature   Marina Gregorić   16.04.2021

Asnate Kazoka (student expert)

…………………………………………..………………………………………………………..

Signature   Asnate Kazoka   16.04.2021

42

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

42

4. APPENDICES *(if available)*

None

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

43