

Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



**UBT COLLEGE** 

# ART AND DIGITAL MEDIA PROGRAM RE-ACCREDITATION

## **REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM**

22 June 2022., Zagreb



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



#### Table of Contents

1.	INT	RODUCTION	3
	1.1.	Context	3
	1.2.	Site visit schedule	4
	1.3.	A brief overview of the institution under evaluation	5
2.	PRC	OGRAM EVALUATION	6
	2.1.	Mission, Objectives and Administration	6
	2.2.	Quality Management	9
	2.3.	Academic Staff	12
	2.4.	Educational Process Content	15
	2.5.	Students	19
	2.6.	Research	22
	2.7.	Infrastructure and Resources	25
3.	FIN	AL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	28



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



## 1. INTRODUCTION

## 1.1. Context

Due to pandemic restrictions, the review visit was conducted online.

Date of site visit: 9 June 2022

## **Expert Team (ET) members:**

• Prof. Dr. Diana Milčić

## Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Flamur Abazaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

#### Sources of information for the Report:

- Self-evaluation report
- Staff CVs
- Syllabi
- Other documents, appendix to the SER, of the UBT College provided prior to the site visit
- *Video: Art* and Digital Media Infrastructure2022.mp4
- Interviews during the site visit (online)
- *information available on the website*

## Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations

Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to:

• Kosovo Accreditation Agency: Accreditation manual, 2021





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### **1.2. Site visit schedule**

Programme Re-accreditation Procedure at UBT College				
Programme:	Art and Digital Media			
Online site visit on:	9 June 2022			
Expert Team:	Dr. Diana Milcic			
Coordinators of the KAA:	<ol> <li>Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, SO for Evaluation and Monitoring</li> <li>Flamur Abazaj, SO for Evaluation and Monitoring</li> </ol>			

Time	Meeting	Participants
09:00 - 9:45	Meeting with the management of the	1.Egzon Bajraktari; 2.Artan Tahiri ;3.Aferdita
	faculty where the programme is integrated	Statovci; 4.Gazmend Ejupi
09.50 -10.35	Meeting with quality assurance	1.Bekim Marmellaku; 2.Artrit Bytyci;
	representatives and administrative staff	4.Mirjeta Arifi; 5.Bardha Meta
10:40 -11:40	Meeting with the heads of the study	1. Fitore Isufi; 2. Alban Muja; 3. Gazmend
	programme:	Ejupi; 4.Arben Arifi
11:40 -12.25	Lunch break	
12:25 -13:10	Meeting with teaching staff	1.Burim Berisha; 2.Dardan Luta; 3.Sezgin
		Boynik; 4.Penesta Dika; 5.Anisa Rada; 6.Besa
		Sopjnai; 7. Luara Ymeri; 8.Zymer Veliu;
		10.Bekim Sele
13:15 -14:00	Meeting with students	1.Vullnet Jakupi; 2.Rea Kurtaj; 3.Vita
		Kasapolli; 4.Migena Halilaj; 5.Ndricim Hakiu;
		6.Rinor Mustafa; 7.Ard Shishko
14:55 -	Meeting with employers of graduates and	1.Gezim Avdiu – Pixell; 2.Visar Statovci –
15:40	external stakeholders	Waste; 4.Nir Alon – Design Factory
15:40 -15:50	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts	
15:50 -16:00	Closing meeting with the management of	
	the faculty and program	



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



## **1.3.** A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

UBT was established in Prishtina, Kosovo in 2001 as IEME – Institute for Enterprise Management and Engineering. In October 2004 it was renamed to UBT – University for Business and Technology. UBT College organizes studies in 16 Faculties including the Faculty of Art and Digital Media, which is an integral part of the UBT College HEIPP, and it is not a legally independent entity. UBT offers a range of programs at undergraduate and graduate level.

The governance of UBT is regulated by the Statute of the institution. UBT is governed by: UBT Board, Academic Council, President and Steering Committee. Every statutory body has standing and ad-hoc structures, sub-committees and working groups. The Governing Board is collectively responsible for the management and control of affairs of the College and for ensuring that an effective system of internal control and representation is implemented in the institution.

Dean of Faculty is responsible for academic management of studies. Faculty is responsible for academic strategy, student examination, teaching and learning, research and development, links with industry, operational and procedural aspects including quality policy implementation.

The mission and the objectives of the Undergraduate program in Art and Digital Media at UBT are to prepare students/graduates with critical and analytical skills, problem-solving skills, self-initiative, and theoretical and practice knowledge in professional art practice and in multidisciplinary areas; to provide comprehensive knowledge that will lead them to become professional artists and art specialist working in a broader scope of contemporary art institutions, film, television, advertising and in broader creative industries.

As stated in the SER, the activity at UBT is based on strategic goals and the development and review of Strategy takes into account the educational philosophy, national educational policies and social-economic environment within which graduates will work.

The institution has identified several strategic objectives: achieving academic excellence; developing research, innovation and social responsibility; creating a positive working and learning environment; maintaining and increasing internationalization and regional partnerships; partnering with the community.



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



## 2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

The institutional evaluation consists of 7 subheadings through which the administration, organisation and management of the institution, as well as teaching and research are assessed.

In this report the term research includes artistic research, exhibitions and applied research.

## 2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration

As it is mentioned in the Self-evaluation Report (SER), the mission of the study program is prepare students/graduates with critical and analytical skills, problem-solving skills, selfinitiative, and theoretical and practice knowledge in professional art practice and in multidisciplinary areas; to provide comprehensive knowledge that will lead them to become professional artists and art specialist working in a broader scope of contemporary art institutions, film, television, advertising and in broader creative industries. The mission of the study program is in compliance with the overall mission statement of UBT, which is publicly available on the web page.

Regarding the consistency of the program with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area, no evidence-based information was provided in the SER nor during the site visit. No explicit formulations which would connect the proposed learning outcomes of the program to specific level descriptors relevant to the program were provided.

It is not clear what is the meaning of statement in the SER "The BA program in Art and Digital Media program is designed to prepare students academically and practically so that upon successful completion they should be able to:" (page 9).

During the meeting with the employers of graduates it has been confirmed that they have been participating in regular meetings with the management and that they have been consulted regarding the specific issue connected to the study.

The SER contains very general statements on research/exhibitions activities. This cannot replace the description of the particular action that would foster the involvement of students and academic staff in research activities at the program as well as on the course level.

Based on the SER, the additional documents from the website and the site visit (meetings with the management of Faculty and professors), considerable information was provided on formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. It



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



can be assumed that program topics related to administration and quality assurance of the program, the interaction between teachers and students, rights and duties of all stakeholder are well developed and well-known.

It is gained the impression according to the SER and information gained during the interviews that a good level of compliance with internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching and assessments in most of the relevant areas has been achieved so far.

Based on the SER, all policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required due to the changing circumstances. However, on the Faculty web page https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/study/bachelor-programs/art-and-digital-media/staff/ only basic contact information regarding the academic staff is available. It should be updated by adding teaching and scientific/artist information.

Standard		Compliance	
		No	
<b>Standard 1.1.</b> The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X		
<b>Standard 1.2.</b> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X	
<b>Standard 1.3.</b> The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept		X	
<b>Standard 1.4.</b> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students	X		
<b>Standard 1.5.</b> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X		





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

**Standard 1.6.** All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.

X

Compliance level: Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant /Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. The study program should strive for a revision of the research concept and integration of research at the program level and strengthening the linkages between teaching and research.
- 2. Also, the study program should be revised and a clear and unitary approach should be taken using the same framework for all disciplines, especially take care of learning outcomes.
- 3. As SER report is a basic document for further internal review and evaluation process, it is recommended that the document be edited to better meet the objectives of the process (some sentences are not completed and clear, specify page numbers, match the name of the program: Digital Art and Media or Art and Digital Media etc.)



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



## 2.2. Quality Management

The SER contains a description of how quality management at the UBT College and Faculty works and which instruments it contains.

The Faculty has a designated Quality Assurance Officer and Quality Assurance Sub-Committee that work in conjunction with UBT Quality Assurance Committee and Quality Manager.

Based on the SER, the Faculty has its own internal Quality Assurance Manual which is based on UBT Quality Manual. The main and only one available document (on website) is UBT Quality Manual, from October 2020. The Faculty Quality Assurance Manual was not publicly available on the website.

The Faculty of Arts and Digital Media is not mentioned in the UBT Quality Manual (Curricula offered pp. 4, Quality circle pp.5).

From the available document, UBT Quality Manual, it is clear that students, teachers, administrators, and external stakeholders are involved in the work of the quality assurance office.

The main quality management tool is a survey/questionnaire.

The UBT carried out the regular internal and external evaluations with students, academic staff, administrative staff, employers and graduates. As mentioned in UBT Quality Manual the evaluations are foreseen to be conducted on a regular basis: per semester or per academic year; once per semester for students and once per year for all other important stakeholders (academic and administrative staff, graduates, employers).

The Faculty conducts a number of surveys and has defined procedures for dealing with survey results. All results collected through surveys and questionnaires are stored in the institutional

database. There is no defined procedure which determines how survey stakeholders are informed of the steps taken based on their comments. The results related to the teaching process quality are delivered to the academic staff privately. The results of the conducted surveys should be publicly available as a complete presentation without specifying names.

From the available documents, it is concluded results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success, and employment of graduates.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard		liance
Standard	Yes	No
<b>Standard 2.1.</b> All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity	X	
<b>Standard 2.2.</b> Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
<b>Standard 2.3.</b> Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	x	
<b>Standard 2.4.</b> Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
<b>Standard 2.5.</b> Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
<b>Standard 2.6.</b> Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		x
<b>Standard 2.7.</b> Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
<b>Standard 2.8.</b> The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	x	
<b>Standard 2.9.</b> The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	x	





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

## Compliance level: Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant /Partially compliant/Noncompliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Make clear what changes have been brought about by evaluation results. Ensure students receive feedback on measures implemented based on their comments
- 2. Establish internal mechanisms for monitoring the quality of scientific/research or artistic work that will be effectively implemented in practice.
- 3. Improve surveys and questionnaires for all groups of stakeholders by addressing the learning outcomes.



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



## 2.3. Academic Staff

The procedures for the selection, appointment, evaluation and development of academic staff are in line with the criteria stipulated in the Law on Labor and Law on Higher Education.

The rights and responsibilities, recruitment processes, supervision, performance evaluation, promotion, support processes are included in the "Regulation on Labor Relations and Responsibilities for Working Duties" 2019 and the "Statute of the UBT College HEI"-2018, under the Article 72. Also, the fair and transparent criteria for staff selection, appraisal and development are outlined in the Quality Manual.

According to the statement in the SER, for the study program a total of 23 members of academic staff are engaged. Also, from tabular presentation of data of the academic staff their role in the study program is not clear, is it fult time or part time academic/artistic staff. Later, in the SER it is noticed that all teachers are full time and verified with the e-Accreditation System operated by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency. The Faculty staff formally consists of teachers and lectures with PhD degrees, MSc and MA degrees.

It is evident from the Panel discussion as well as formal staff profiles (CV submitted prior to the review), that academic staff is able to deliver high level student learning experience through inclusive, relevant programmes and curricula while being professional and collaborative.

Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly by students, but from available data, the documentation and the panel discussion, it is not clear whether they are implemented. Also, it is not clear whether self-evaluation, peer and superiors' evaluations occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The aim of teaching observations, peer and superiors' evaluations, is to enable academic staff to gain feedback from their colleagues, who are trained and experienced teachers, as part of a process of reflection on teaching performance.

The impression was gained that all employees are not aware of all their duties. The responsibilities and duties of staff, which all staff agree, are regular teaching, material design, and student consultations.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard		liance
Standard	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
<i>Standard</i> 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.		X
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant /Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Continue evaluating and improving the standards of quality of teaching and learning.
- 2. Implement self-evaluation, peer and superiors' evaluations for the teachers.
- 3. Motivate academic staff to achieve the goals defined in the strategy related to research and teaching.
- 4. Organize additional education for the academic staff regarding writing the effective learning outcomes.



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



#### 2.4. Educational Process Content

The study program complies with the level 6 of the National Qualifications Framework and with the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

The Faculty assures that the competences and skills of graduates are in accordance with labour market demand through consultation with industry representatives that was confirmed during the meeting with employers of graduates. Employers of graduates are satisfied with the knowledge and skills of the graduates acquired through the study program.

The subjects within the study program are well harmonized with the needs of the labour market and comparable to similar programs offered in the region and beyond.

The curriculum covers a broad range of qualifications required to work in local or regional companies, professional firms in the field.

According to the SER, on the page 10 and 11, is table "Knowledge and Understanding" and "Generic and Graduate Skills". It is not clear on what the listed learning outcomes refers. Later, in the SER on the page 37 at the study program level are defined seven learning outcomes.

The courses have the full course description within the curriculum has analytical syllabuses which comprise all necessary data, but the syllabi provided reveal uneven quality levels of course descriptions. This could be improved by making template with clear and explicit explanation of what the course description has to contain.

The majority of courses do not have well-defined learning outcomes or that the learning outcomes are not adequate. Some learning outcomes in the minority of courses is characterized by using active verbs for defining learning outcomes at the course level. Some sourses do not have defined learning outcomes at all (e.g. Sculputre, 3D Modelling and Animation...) some are written in Albanian. If the course has versions such as courses Art Theory I, Art Theory II, Art Theory III, the learning outcomes cannot be the same for all of them. Therefore, is necessary to review all the learning outcomes on all courses and reformulated by using active verbs to become more adequate for the study program.

Furthermore, learning outcomes of the courses should be in line with the study program learning outcomes and also uniform across all courses in the study program. A well-written learning outcome will focus on how the student will be able to apply their new knowledge in a real-world context.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Some courses have listed reference, relatively old and not cited with whole data (publisher, year of publishing etc.). Consequently, it can be concluded that the cited literature is not available in the library nor to teachers nor to the students. Therefore, it is necessary to review all the literature, remove the old and inadequate and add new literature in the course descriptions

The curriculum should be aligned with the student workload and the corresponding ECTS. According to some course descriptions, it can be assumed that the student's workload is not adequately assessed.

The teaching method, which is in use, is an interactive method, where the student conducts different various projects for different subjects, as well as field research works required for this level of study. The teaching strategy is presented in a rather normative way without giving information on how it is implemented in the study program practically. Further information on how an important concept such as student-centred learning is implemented was not provided.

The students are given ECTS credits for "Visiting artists and lectures 1-6" but the learning outcomes are not defined as well as other student's obligations. The program should seek to resolve this issue as soon as possible and arrange it according to European standards.

The Faculty has appropriate and valid mechanisms for verifying standards of student achievement which are also clearly communicated to students at the beginning of every course.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard		Compliance	
		No	
<b>Standard 4.1.</b> The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X		
<b>Standard 4.2.</b> The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X		
<b>Standard 4.3.</b> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X	
<b>Standard 4.4.</b> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program underevaluation.		X	
<b>Standard 4.5.</b> If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	n/a		
<b>Standard 4.6.</b> The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X		





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<b>Standard 4.7.</b> Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	
<b>Standard 4.8.</b> Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
<b>Standard 4.9.</b> Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
<b>Standard 4.10.</b> Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
<b>Standard 4.11</b> . If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	n/a	
<b>Standard 4.12.</b> In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	n/a	

**Compliance level:** Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Noncompliant

## **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Review all courses regarding a consistent, state of the art use of learning taxonomies and active verbs for defining learning outcomes.
- 2. It would be necessary to provide the full course description within the curriculum has analytical syllabus which comprise all necessary data for all courses



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



## 2.5. Students

The students met during the site visit are satisfied and happy to study at UBT.

According to the SER, the Students Admission is regulated by the Faculty Council Regulation on Admission. On the web page https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/study/students/study-atubt/registration-and-admission/ one could find information about admission for all programs offered by UBT.

The admission procedure at institutional level it is clear and formal adopted, and publicly available for all UBT programs.

But, according to the SER statement "Based on the results of the entrance examination, the Commission creates a ranking list determining which candidates have become entitled to enrol on the basis of the results achieved in the entrance examination and who have psychophysical abilities for the title of Art and Digital Media." It is not clear what is "psychophysical abilities". Furthermore, during site visit it was said that prospective students must submit a portfolio. On the web page https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/study/bachelor-programs/art-and-digital-media/admission/it is statement "Portfolios (works in different media, writing, design, cultural and social initiatives / activities)"

Therefore, the admission procedure for the study program Art and Digital Media it is publicly available but not clear. It is necessary to more precisely define what a portfolio should include and how it will be scored.

Almost all rights and obligations of students are publicly available through different document as the Statue, Student Organization Status, Code of Ethics, Handbook for Students, Regulation for Student Assessment, Academic Calendar. All above mentioned documents are available on the main website of UBT College.

On the website site https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/study/current-students/ the title "Study Rules and Policies" one cannot find any description or document in English. On the website https://www.ubt-uni.net/sq/ubt/per-ubt/politikat-rregulloret/ one can find the document in Albanian: Rregullorja për regjistrimin e studenteve (Regulation of student enrolment) Rregullorja për ciklin e parë të studimeve (Regulation of the first phase of studies) and Rregullorja për ciklin e dytë të studimeve (Regulation of the second phase of studies).





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly explained in the SER. On the website https://www.ubt-uni.net/en/ubt-en/about-ubt/regulations-and-policies/ one can find title "Regulation of transfer from one academic institution to another" but it is not publicly available.

UBT College is dedicated to supporting ethical behaviour, therefore the submitted written works or final student's papers have adequate check for plagiarism through software "Turnitin".

Standard		oliance
		No
<b>Standard 5.1.</b> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organizing students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.		X
<b>Standard 5.2.</b> All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
<b>Standard 5.3.</b> The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
<b>Standard 5.4.</b> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
<b>Standard 5.5.</b> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
<b>Standard 5.6.</b> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
<b>Standard 5.7.</b> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<b>Standard 5.8.</b> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
<b>Standard 5.9.</b> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
<b>Standard 5.10.</b> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
<b>Standard 5.11</b> . Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant /Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

1. It would be necessary to define more precisely what the portfolio should include and how it will be scored.



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



## 2.6. Research

The College has the documents "Revised UBT Strategy 2027" and "Academic Strategic Plan 2020-2025" (without the date of acceptance and the body that accepted it), "UBT Research Strategy" (without the date of acceptance and the body that accepted it). All of above mentioned documents are available on the website. But none of the mentioned documents makes it clear what are the objectives of the research in study program Art and Digital Media.

UBT College publishes the Journal "International Journal of Business and Technology" (https://knowledgecenter.ubt-uni.net/ijbte/). This is an interdisciplinary peer reviewed journal that enables the publication of research in various fields. As a positive, it should be noted that the journal has the international editorial board and a blind review of papers, but on the other hand, in the journal there are no published papers in the field of art and digital media.

Research and artistic activity and publication productivity varies among academic staff. The part of them has a proven track record with a high quality and quantity of publications, the other part has not. It is concluded that all academic staff does not satisfy the minimum request of producing the minimum of one scientific/artistic publication per year. (6.7)

Since it is a study program of Art and Digital Media, every member of academic staff should involve themselves in the research/art by having at least exhibition, or work on a joint project with colleagues or students, or publish a scientific and applied research paper.

In addition, academic staff should publish papers and artistic work under name of the Faculty.

Policies establishing intellectual property rights and clear procedures for commercialization of ideas are not provided in the contract with academic staff or another document, which stipulates that intellectual property rights in any work related to or created by the employee during the employment relationship (during working hours and in the workplace), is counted as the work of the employer and is given the full guarantee of the holder. (6.10)

According to the SER students are encouraged to participate in research activities through their engagement in individual and group research assignments and projects during their studies. This is mainly an applied research. UBT plans involving students in the implementation of research projects, together with staff, which is not the case now. (6.11)





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard	Com	oliance
	Yes	No
<b>Standard 6.1.</b> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
<b>Standard 6.2.</b> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
<b>Standard 6.3.</b> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
<b>Standard 6.4.</b> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.		X
<b>Standard 6.5.</b> The academic and research staff publish their work in specialty magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.		X
<b>Standard 6.6</b> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centers, scientific parks and other structures for validation.		X
<b>Standard 6.7.</b> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
<b>Standard 6.8.</b> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<b>Standard 6.9.</b> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	
<b>Standard 6.10.</b> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students	X
Standard 6.11. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	X

Compliance level: Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant /Partially compliant/Noncompliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. The study program needs to add the applied research objectives based on the priority areas of research.
- 2. Provide clear policies for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.
- 3. Define the research strategy with all the necessary elements (action plan, responsible persons, execution deadlines, measuring method of the action execution)
- 4. Establish the policies for reward the best researcher
- 5. Establish the policies for ownership of intellectual property and set out the clear procedures for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.
- 6. Stimulate students and researchers to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.
- 7. Stimulate researchers/professors to published in the "International Journal of Business and Technology"



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



#### 2.7. Infrastructure and Resources

The UBT College is located in a newly building, has modern infrastructure and offers good study conditions for students and the organization of the academic teaching process. UBT College premises are property of College.

UBT has developed a platform the Knowledge Centre which, besides serving to students, also serves to the community and other stakeholders for the publication, preservation and management of scientific papers and other projects that are developed within the academic community, staff and students in general.

The UBT College space consists of amphitheatre, classrooms, studios, laboratories, library, reading hall. The UBT College has several classrooms, and one of them, the biggest amphitheatre is 665 m2. The facilities of UBT College have lecture halls and laboratories equipped with adequate equipment such as video conference sound system, computers, scanner, etc.

The above mentioned space is sufficient for conducting of lectures and exercises for study program. The number of seats in the lecture rooms and seminar rooms are sufficient for the number of student in lecture/exercise groups. It can be concluded that the institution provides adequate, clean, attractive and well-maintained facilities.

In accordance with the provisions of the Statute, UBT College provides financial resources from the different sources for example from tuition fees, and other payments made by students; grants and payments from research and scientific work, donations, revenues from the development and implementation of projects, etc.

The investors capital investment provided infrastructure development.

The operation of programmes, research and staff development have to rely on student tuition fees. Also, the College operates several fee-based professional certifications with international vocational training bodies which have proven to be a small but steady stream of incomes.

The College has its own library. As reported in the SER the library has sufficient number of books and learning materials in Albanian and English. Students and other researchers, academic staff also have access to the electronic resources through online library, where students and academic staff have access to online libraries such as: EBSCO host, J-Store, Sage journals etc.



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

According to the video "Art and Digital Media Infrastructure2022.mp4", the facility has not electric stairs or elevators and the relevant infrastructure for students with special needs.

	Com	Compliance	
Standard		No	
<b>Standard 7.1.</b> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X		
<b>Standard 7.2.</b> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X		
<ul> <li>Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with a equate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:</li> <li>a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;</li> <li>b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;</li> <li>c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence;</li> <li>d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.</li> </ul>	X		
<b>Standard 7.4.</b> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X		





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<ul> <li>Standard 7.5. Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:</li> <li>a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</li> <li>b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</li> <li>c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognized publishers, from the last 10 years;</li> <li>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;</li> <li>e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.</li> </ul>	X	
<b>Standard</b> 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.		X

Compliance level: Fully compliant/ Substantially compliant / Partially compliant/Non-compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

1. Adapt the facilities of the UBT College to students with special needs.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

## 3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

First of all, the Panel is grateful to the Faculty's management and teaching team, its students , graduates and employers for their open and highly constructive contributions to the event, and wishes them well for the future.

The Panel is very pleased with the level of optimism and positive atmosphere among all interviewed groups. The communication between the students and the management seems to be very open and on an admirable level.

Having considered the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme development team, the Reaccreditation Panel recommends the following:

- 1. The self-evaluation report provides a lot of significant information, but to enable proper evaluation, more documents mentioned in the self-report should be attached. Besides the lack of the documents, all attached documents need to be translated into English. Without these documents, it is hard to properly evaluate and give recommendations for improvement.
- 2. Regarding evaluation of staff performance, it is suggested that the following criteria are integrated into individual staff records:

•Systematic collection of data career progression and feedback from alumni and include their opinion in learning process;

• Peer observation of teaching as required (with development of appropriate observation criteria);

- Regular staff appraisal in terms of identifying staff development requirements;
- Staff membership in the educational and professional bodies;
- Staff involvement in learning and teaching research initiatives;

• Participation in learning and teaching events and conferences, the Faculty should develop effective policies for teachers' improvement.

3. The Panel detected various discrepancies between the formulation of learning outcomes that led it to conclude that the Faculty does not have clear and uniform learning outcomes methodology. It is strongly advised to formulate a precise methodology of defining learning outcomes and apply it. Furthermore, organize additional education for the academic staff regarding writing the effective learning outcomes.



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



- 4. Increase the visibility of academic staff by improving their profile information on the official faculty web page.
- 5. Develop a model to improve the research activity of academic staff with a minimal productivity and for increasing the involvement of students in the research and project work.
- 6. The Faculty has developed quality policy and procedures that include regular collection and analyses of relevant data with the purpose of ensuring and improving the quality of all institutional activities, especially student participation. Nevertheless, there is room for improvement, especially in quality improvement eg. standardization of syllabuses.

Considering the documentation provided and discussions with the program development team, experts gave the following compliance level:

Standard	Compliance Level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially Compliant
2. Quality management	Substantially Compliant
3. Academic Staff	Substantially Compliant
4. Educational Process Content	Substantially Compliant
5. Students	Substantially Compliant
6. Research	Substantially Compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Substantially Compliant
Overall Compliance	Substantially Compliant

**Compliance level:** Fully compliant/Substantially compliant/Partially compliant/Noncompliant.



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency



In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Art and Digital Media BA program offered by UBT College is **Substantially compliant** with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends to **accredit** the study program for a duration of **three** years with a number of **50** students to be enrolled in the program.

## **Expert Team**

Diana Milčić

(Print Name)

(Print Name)

#### Member

J. Mileic

(Signature)

Member

(Signature)

Member

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)

22 June 2022

(Date)

(Date)

Member