



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

UBT COLLEGE
Master of Science in Paramedic Sciences

ACCREDITATION

FINAL REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

23rd May 2022, Szeged, Hungary and Riga, Latvia



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo

Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	5
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	7
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration	7
2.2. Quality management	11
2.3. Academic staff	15
2.4. Educational process content	18
2.5. Students	23
2.6. Research	27
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	30
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	34
4. APPENDICES 4035	

2



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: Zoom meeting, 31st March 2022

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Professor Mihaly Boros, University of Szeged, Hungary
- Ms Asnate Kazoka, PhD student, Riga, Latvia

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

- UBT Paramedical Science Program Self Evaluation Report (SER)
- KAA Accreditation Manual, July 2018
- Information obtained from meetings with the Management of the Faculty, Quality Assurance Representatives and Administrative Staff, Heads of the Study Program, Teaching staff and Stakeholders.
- Website of UBT College
- Results of international consultations in regard to programme content
- Mapping of the programme outcomes with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area
- Academic Council Regulations on Graduate Study (in English)
- Quality Manual (in English)
- Example of Improvement Plan (standard 2.2.) for the faculty
- Quality assurance reports (based on surveys and/or monitoring of different indicators) produced on the faculty level in 2020 - 2022
- Faculty Council Regulation on Admission
- Description about the results of applying Turnitin in the faculty in 2020 - 2020

3



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Student Handbook
- Regulation (criteria) for the selection of a clinical mentor and a copy of the Clinical Practice logbook.
- Data on the number of students per lectures, seminars, workshops, clinical practices for the first and second years of the programme.
- Data of supervisors/tutors with full-time and part time employments / subjects for the first and second years of the programme.
- Data of professors/teachers/tutors qualified for being diploma course / thesis supervisors by the end of the 4th semester / second year of the programme
- The exact timeline of the course “Thesis” with 10 ECTS, indicating the number of seminars and lectures that will be used (with durations), specifying the sessions which will prepare the students for obtaining appropriate ethical approval for their research, etc.
- Data (time) for one-to-one supervision sessions throughout the project including comments on drafts of the dissertation.
- Detailed description/guide on the selection of topics, data collection, etc. and the official regulation on the process of submission and defence of diploma thesis
- Pass mark for successful completion of the dissertation and rules for dissertation resubmission.
- Rules for ensuring the authenticity of submitted works
- Details of defence, how shall a candidate defend an MSc degree dissertation (public disputation before an assessment committee, as well as the rules for the appointment of the members of the committee).
- Clarification on the exact amount of courses in ECTS as discrepancies between the SER and course descriptions were identified

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- KAA Accreditation Manual, July 2018

Note:



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

It should be noted that the program is awaiting initial accreditation and has therefore not commenced. Therefore, some standards cannot yet be evaluated.

1.2. Site visit schedule

31st March 2022

09.00 – 09.45	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
09.50 – 10:35	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
10.40 – 11.40	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
11:40 – 12:25	Lunch break (to be provided within the faculty premises)
12.25 – 13:10	Meeting with teaching staff
13:15 – 14:00	Meeting with employers of graduates
14:00 – 14:10	Internal meeting between expert team and KAA
14:10 – 14:20	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The University for Business and Technology (UBT) is a private University in Kosovo. The College was licensed to operate as a private bearer of higher education by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology no. 808/02-1, date 18.10.2004. The UBT is built on the

5



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

experience of the Institute of Enterprise Engineering and Management (IEME), which was founded in 2001. The UBT website lists several locations and branches, and within the infrastructure houses one of the largest libraries in Kosovo and over 80 laboratories. UBT has a presence in several regions of Kosovo and abroad, namely - UBT Prishtina Campus, (main Campus), UBT Lipjan Campus, UBT Prizren Campus, UBT Ferizaj Campus, UBT Peja Campus – Dukagjini College, UBT Gjilan Campus – Arberi College. There is also apparently an UBT Austria Office and UBT Hungary Office.

UBT operates a broad range of Bachelor and Masters level programs. There are currently around 17,000 students, the claim being that 98% of these enter the job market, graduates of UBT being “leaders in entrepreneurship and new businesses, managers in the banking sector, public sector, information technology, engineering, architecture and construction”.

UBT is claimed to be the largest beneficiary of international student exchange projects from the European Commission, and the website states that UBT has 450 International Partnerships.

First study programme in health care at UBT was accredited in 2016 - BA Nursing. In 2017 the Integrated Studies in Stomatology and Integrated Studies in Pharmacy followed. In 2019 the Integrated Studies in Stomatology and Integrated Studies in Pharmacy were reaccredited but new study programmes - Anaesthesiology and Radiology - accredited.

The MSc Paramedical Science is proposed for implementation at the department of Nursing which is a part of the Faculty of Medical Science (Faculty of Nursing according to the SER). It is a new study programme that, according to UBT, has been designed based on international experience and will offer the possibility for graduates of BA Nursing to improve their qualification.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The mission of MA Paramedical Science Program is “*to contribute to higher education through contemporary curricula, based and harmonised with the best practice at European level, distinct educational philosophy, research and services to the community*”. UBT aims to offer

6



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

a program that is adequate for the study of future trends and developments in the profession of paramedics. This would be the first study programme in Paramedical Science in Kosovo and with it UBT aims to offer paramedics care at the UBT General Hospital, including the services of extended care paramedic, community paramedic and industrial paramedic.

There are clear aims defined for the study programme. The descriptive part of the SAR includes some statements that are formulated in the form of learning outcomes. They are compatible with the master's level studies and subsequently with the EQF level 7, for example, the graduates would be able to **make complex decisions** regarding the patient's ongoing care or their capacity to continue working, **demonstrate extended knowledge and clinical practice skills** necessary for the management and provision of holistic health care, enable the graduates to **apply research skills** to the resolution and improvement of health outcomes for consumers in the rural, industrial or community settings etc. However, this is the only place where these statements appear. The SER overall fails to include a full list of clearly defined learning outcomes in form of knowledge, skills and competencies that the graduates would possess. The learning outcomes listed in the additional information, for example, "preventing people from dying prematurely" are too general, not measurable and written in a passive form.

While the statements included above indicate that there has been an intention to align the programme with the master's level, the ET did not identify any mapping where the learning outcomes of the study programme would have been methodologically mapped against the requirements of the EQF level 7 (<https://europa.eu/europass/en/description-eight-efq-levels>). In the SER UBT also states that the programme is aligned with the European Union Directive for Paramedics and professional advice from the International Biomedical Scientific Council has been sought. The ET did not learn of any specific advice that would have been taken from similar programmes in other countries. The additional information includes opinions from three external experts, but these opinions are related to the SER and not to the outline and content of the study programme.

When explaining the reasoning for establishing this study programme, the UBT talks about the lack of qualified nurses either with a bachelor's degree in Nursing or with a qualification of Nurse Assistant and in need of re-qualification to achieve the bachelor level, as well as about the migration of nurses to other countries. While the ET understands the rationale of developing a programme on master's level and providing possibilities for further education, ET is not convinced how it would address the current lack of nursing specialists presented by UBT.

7



Republika e Kosovës
 Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
 Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
 Kosovo Accreditation Agency

During the site visit, the ET also learned about the impact of overqualification on the labour market in Kosovo and the risk that graduates of MA Paramedical Science would compete with the graduates of nursing programmes for the same positions.

The SER states that the study programme is implemented in the Faculty of Nursing with a Dean and Vice Dean for Teaching and a separate Faculty Council. In the section 2.2 of this report also a reference to Technical Medical Faculties is included. The information published on the UBT website, however, is contradicting. On the website UBT lists a number of faculties - Nursing, Dentistry, Pharmacy, Dental Technician, Anesthesiology Technician, Radiology Technician - with a separate website for each of them. In practice, these websites each include information about one study programme only. From the interviews the ET learned that each programme would be implemented in a separate department (sometimes called - faculty) and the titles announced on the UBT website are the titles of each department which usually includes one study programme, but not of the faculties. For clarity reasons, the ET urges UBT to streamline the terminology used in regard to programs, departments and faculties.

The base for administration of this study programme at UBT is the UBT Statute and the Regulation for Master Studies. The different regulatory documents are published on the UBT website and references to some of them are included in the Student Handbook, thus making them more accessible to students.

UBT has established a Code of Ethics that is applicable to all staff and students and is published on the UBT website. The ethical issues on the level of this programme would be dealt with by the Faculty Sub-Committee on Ethics.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	-	-

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. To define learning outcomes for the study programme that would be formulated in the form of knowledge, skills and competencies that the students would possess upon graduation.*
- 2. To perform a mapping of programme content with similar study programmes on master's level in Europe in order to identify possibilities for improvement.*
- 3. To review the terminology regarding the programmes, departments and faculties on the UBT website and documentation related to this study programme in order to provide clear and consistent information on institutional structure and affiliation of the study programme.*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

2.2. Quality management

Arrangements for quality assurance of education at UBT are defined at the central level. There is a UBT Quality Assurance Regulation and a Quality Manual that includes the Quality Assurance Regulation as a part of it. The UBT Quality Assurance Regulation states the main quality assurance mechanisms related to different stakeholder groups and areas, procedures, roles of those involved, reporting and data collection principles. However, the Regulation does not include information on each specific procedure that is carried out, its purpose and regularity and is not easy to navigate for operational use. The Quality Manual, on the other hand, is very brief and states the general information on the UBT, including the strategic goals, and some specific elements, such as the enrolment regulation, description of the institutional quality assurance structure and its staff and lists the instruments used for quality assurance. Neither of the documents explain the concept of excellence by UBT and how the quality assurance system would be designed to support institutional objectives.

The Quality Assurance Sub-Committee on the faculty level regulates the academic and administrative service evaluation, quality improvement, preparation, and supervision of the self-evaluation process and makes the necessary preparations for the external evaluation of UBT. The participation of all staff is ensured through the existence of collegial decision-making bodies. The Quality Assurance Regulation states that evaluation of staff is performed through student assessment and self-assessment, as well as the assessment by peers and supervisors. According to the Quality Assurance Regulation and Quality Manual, the information for improvements is collected from the staff, students, and graduates. No surveys for the employers have been mentioned among the tools.

There is an Action Plan for Quality Improvement for the Technical Medical Sciences Faculties developed in April 2022. According to the reference included in the plan, it was developed due to accreditation processes for the MA Paramedics. The recommendations included in the action plan have been formulated based on the results of student surveys and the Annual Report of the Faculty Council. These improvements would be implemented in the following programmes - BA Nursing, BA Radiology Technician, BA Anesthesiology Technician, MA Public Health and Management, MA Paramedics (currently undergoing accreditation). While the ET commends the arrangements established by the UBT, it would still point at the inconsistencies of terminology which makes it difficult to differentiate between the different structural units

10



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

(faculty, department etc.) and, consequently, understand the scope in which the different quality assurance procedures will be implemented. In this regard, it is not clear which Faculty Council and which Quality Assurance Sub-Committee would be in charge of developments in the MA Paramedical Science programme and on what level the indicators would be monitored. The ET would like to point out that the consistency of the terminology is itself an indicator of quality.

As for the improvements foreseen, while the report was produced in April 2022, the activities have already started in October 2021 and will continue until July 2022 at the latest. One of the activities that had been planned until March 2022 is constructive alignment of course learning outcomes with teaching activity and student assessment that included the review of course descriptions. However, the course descriptions available to the review panel do not demonstrate any specific emphasis on measuring and monitoring the achievement of learning outcomes.

The UBT has defined a number of performance indicators for the MA Paramedical Science, according to the Faculty Performance Assessment Framework. Currently the defined performance indicators are related to input only, for example, the annual student intake, student-staff ratio, staff expenditure, income from student fees but, once the programme is launched, the process and output related indicators will be defined.

The MA in Paramedical Science is not implemented yet, therefore, in order to assess the general capacity for the execution of the survey mechanisms, the ET requested samples of other reports for the faculty and was provided with an evaluation of the teaching staff and the institutional evaluation for the whole UBT in the academic year 2020/2021. This report was based on three evaluations conducted through questionnaires (evaluation of the teaching staff by students and the institutional evaluation by the academic and administrative staff), staff evaluations by the deans of the faculties and in some faculties also from the self-assessment data of the academic staff. This report confirms the existence of the survey mechanisms declared in the SAR, however it does not include any specific data for the faculty or departmental level. There is no evidence of any conclusions and/or suggestions that would have been collected and submitted for further actions and also no information on what actions have been taken as a result of these surveys. It is also not clear what are the internal targets related to these quality assurance processes and their results and what are the expected targets (key performance indicators) of each study programme.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.		X
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	-	-
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	-	-
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	-	-
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

12



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. To ensure that there is a clear link between the institutional objectives and the indicators defined for quality assurance processes on the programme level.*
- 2. Once the study programme is launched, to define standards for process and output related indicators and monitor them on a regular basis.*
- 3. Introduce survey mechanisms for employers.*
- 4. To use clear and consistent terminology in regard to UBT structural units (faculties, departments) in all documentation related to internal quality assurance.*
- 5. To take measures for measuring and monitoring whether the learning outcomes defined for each study course have been achieved and possibly integrate them in the study course descriptions.*

2.3. Academic staff

According to UBT's Health's Clinical and Biomedical and Health Professions Education Strategy the final aim of the program is to engage a diverse workforce of faculty, staff and students in a new learning opportunity targeting organizational priorities and facilitating individual growth. The members of the staff, seniors, juniors alike, are supporting this concept, and backing the ultimate aim of the program.

In general, the staff consists of qualified people who have the necessary competencies to help students to achieve the program learning outcomes. Rules and procedures for hiring (electing/appointing) the staff are described in the UBT's management policy. These rules are transparent and objective and should ensure attracting qualified employees. The interviews showed that these rules are working, the staffs' qualifications are in line with the requirements. The UBT sets benchmarks for the staff and the work completed by them in order to effectively manage the activities. The qualification requirements of the clinical staff, including clinical mentors considering their job descriptions and functions are clearly described and are also in line with the requirements. Members of the QA department during the interview described how



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

they are going to actively utilize staff evaluation and satisfaction survey results in the process of staff management and further development.

As concerns standard 3.1. a table is presented with 15 tutors with MD or equivalent and PhD degrees and full-time tenure positions, and these tutors are also listed among the potential thesis supervisors, submitted by the UBT to the ET in an additional document (see below). Although it seems that some of the teaching staff are not specifically experts in paramedic science and training the UBT declared that all staff members are meeting the legal requirements as set by the Administrative Instruction and the full-time academic staff at the UBT covers all the needs of all classes, completely. Also, it is stated that the list of staff, their employment status and their qualifications have been approved by the National Quality Council.

The list of graduate mentors for the year 2021 was provided by the UBT in the additional set of documents, with 84 names for the Faculty of Technical Medical Sciences as a whole, including Nursing, Radiology, MSc Anesthesiology, Public Health and Management and MSc Paramedical. Of these tutors 17 are listed as supervisors for “paramedicine” alone, while 10 other tutors are listed suitable with dual responsibilities, sharing paramedicine with another discipline, such as internal medicine or family medicine. According to this approach, 27 senior tutors with PhD degree are available for thesis supervision with a theoretical maximum of $17+5=22$ teachers with full-time equivalent positions. During the interview, it became clear that a thesis supervisor can have a maximum of 3 active students. At present, this correlation can be used to determine the maximum number of students that can be admitted.

The staff development plan at the Faculty of Nursing is an integral part of the strategic planning process and the faculty mandates the Departments to provide developmental plans as part of financial planning process, to establish indicators for staff performance and to identify activities supporting the institutional strategy and development. Nevertheless, it seems that there is no such plan in force specifically for Paramedic MSc training, although the expectations and needs for career progression are different from those for other programs at the bachelor level. Besides, such plan should be provided for the non-academic staff as well. It should be added that according to available data the UBT has started to prepare the staff for the upcoming tasks providing pedagogical skills and training for student-centred learning, curriculum design, writing learning outcomes, lesson planning, design and delivery, group learning, problem based and integrating key skills into the curriculum. However, currently there is no evidence for the future performance of theoretical or practical clinical teachers. The

14



qualification requirements for clinical tutors is set by the sector benchmarks, therefore the level of compliance should be checked, regularly, and this can be supplemented by peer-review-based evaluations of the quality of clinical teaching.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Compliance</i>	
	<i>Yes</i>	<i>No</i>
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	



Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Thesis supervision should be carried out by a person appropriately skilled and competent with sufficient knowledge and seniority. To ensure programme sustainability, the number of enrolled students should be planned according to the numbers of academics with appropriate scientific degree.*
- 2. It will be necessary to analyse thoroughly the teaching capacity and staff availability in the upcoming years. A staff management policy and a transparent workload scheme is suggested ensuring the efficient involvement of staff members in the process of education at the MSc level.*
- 3. The UBT should introduce a clear methodology to determine the number of the academic and invited staff for the MSc program, where the minimum number of*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

academic hours and training load, scientific/research/creative/performing and other workload for the semesters is defined and updated.

2.4. Educational process content

As of today, there are no other Master of Science level programs for Paramedic Science in the Republic of Kosovo, and therefore the educational program should serve as an example for other higher education institutions. The entry requirements are clear: students who have completed BSc in Nursing or have appropriate undergraduate degree can apply and upon successful completion will receive Master's degree and the academic title Master of Science (MSc) in Paramedic Science.

The Faculty has adopted a Competency Based Approach in curriculum development where program learning outcomes (LOs) guide the teaching, learning and assessment method through the e-Portfolio environment. In this context the MSc in Paramedic Science curriculum of UBT contains 15 courses with analytical descriptions in syllabi which were submitted by UBT to the ET in Annex A and also as part of the additional set of documents (with modified ECTS calculations). The program is structured into 4 semesters, the total student workload throughout the studies - including theoretical instruction, practice, preparation, and exams - equals 120 ECTS. The studies include 1800 hrs with 555 hrs of theoretical instruction and 1,245 hrs of practical training (SER, p35) but it should be noted here that in other parts of the report the theory to total practice ratio is different, being 375 hrs and 1,425, respectively (SER, p36).

The UBT employs a variety of teaching methods across the curriculum and all departments offer possibilities for active learning. According to the description these include case-studies, project work, problem-based learning, and simulated learning. Opportunities for interactive learning are reinforced through project-based learning, case study analysis, visiting speakers, group work and e-learning. However, here it should be noted as another shortcoming that there is no specific indication for the types of teaching methods during clinical placements and in this respect details on any other clinical/field practices/works are also not given.

According to the SER, the study methods and requirements for course completion will be specified in the course syllabus available to the students before the course starts. Each course has a detailed syllabus, which is more detailed than a course program and describes topics to be covered during the course – objectives, subject content for each week, organization of work,

17



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

requirements for seminar and individual work, gives a list of required and recommended reading and sets of attendance and specific assessment rules. It should also be noted here that a detailed description would have been much needed for a newly launched programme.

The education is organized in close collaboration with UBT Hospital to strengthen the connection between theory and practice. According to the SER (in case of Standard 4.4.), the minimum guidelines for syllabus content are determined by the Faculty Council; the minimum requirements that subject leaders must abide by include a short description of the course aims and objectives, LOs, course teaching and learning methods, course ECTS workload and its distribution, course assessment methods, course resource requirements and literature.

Practice placements are considered important features of the teaching and learning process, according to the UBT placements are provided in specialist medical settings across a range of clinical contexts including hospice settings, primary health care services, community centres and acute care hospitals (SER, p41). Nevertheless, important data on these clinical subjects and respective LOs which are designed to contribute to the attainment of overall program outcomes, are missing. The modified Annex A contains 4 courses (Advanced Health Care Assessment and Diagnosis, Principles of Extended Paramedic Care, Principles of Industrial Health Practice, Advanced Primary Health Care for Paramedics, respectively), where the aim of the module is to “*develop the principles, constraints and responsibilities of these themes in context with the student’s own workplace requirements*”. Nevertheless, the exact sites, place, durations, subjects etc. of this highly important practical component of the curriculum remain unknown. Here it should be noted that according to SER (p36, Semester 4, with Σ 30 ECTS) clinical placements are perhaps included with 29 ECTS in course no.10. (i.e. Master Thesis is shown here with a total of 29 ECTS with practice and 1 ECTS theory).

The UBT has defined the extent and sequencing of curricular elements, including the balance between core, compulsory, and optional contents (SER p35-36). The elements are recognized in the syllabi as well (in Modified Annex A) and for each course the ECTS amount, LOs, teaching/learning/assessment methods, equipment, the ratio of theoretical/practical parts and literature data are given. Unfortunately, several important details are missing, exact data on course contents, tasks, practical works, site of teaching (simulated environments, laboratory or clinical practice) target objectives and expected results cannot be determined exactly. Besides, there are many redundant and repetitive parts; as an example, identical “assessment methods” are employed (copied) in a row in 9 courses (“an in-depth analysis of a complex patient will

18



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

assist students to advance their paramedic practice by: (a) developing their skills as reflective, critical thinkers; (b) increasing their specific knowledge and understanding of paramedic care; and (c) considering ways to implement "best practice" into the care of the paramedic patient"). Besides, the compulsory / recommended literature includes English language volumes only (Albanian textbooks, other resources are not shown) but there is no proof for the English proficiency level of the students. More importantly, in certain cases (such as the 4th Edition of Mosby's Paramedic Textbook newer editions are already available (5th edition is of 2019).

Furthermore, certain components of the curriculum map should be made thematically more compatible with the expected final LOs. In this line, the structure of courses, the amounts of lectures, practical exercises and the ratio of theory and practical activities should be reviewed and clearly defined with special attention to the particular LOs of the courses. As an example: on completion of "Advanced Primary Health Care for Paramedics" course the student will be able to formulate care pathways and demonstrate the skills and knowledge required to manage wounds, soft tissue injuries or simple fracture stabilization. This partly meets expectations, however, the way to prove this knowledge is not specified (simulation stations using OSCEs or bedside exams). Besides, an advanced primary health care course for paramedics should include many other forms of fractures and traumas such as crush, head or extremity injuries, haemorrhage, spinal trauma, immobilisation, etc. – with matching practical exams.

In all cases, the LOs could be planned in hierarchy following Bloom's taxonomy but particular attention should always be paid to end-practical training. In case of paramedic science, the acquisition of practical competencies and the assessment of practical skills is of critical importance. As an example: according to syllabus no. 8. (Advanced Primary Health Care for Paramedics course) "the module builds on the skills and knowledge of the previous year's learning to equip the student with the knowledge, skills and aptitude to work with an extended scope of practice and a variety of settings". As said, the assessment of technical competencies (together with clinical, communication and team working skills) should be considered very important but here the test methods do not include practical exams - or these practical assessments cannot be recognized in the given scheme ("the assessment of performance/competencies is based on individual case study with 2.500 words (60%) and individual and group presentation 40%)".

The profession domain of EU Standards for Paramedics provides care and transport of an ill or injured patient following an emergency call. In this scheme a paramedic can provide

19



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

intermediate life support which includes the skills listed for emergency medical technicians/services. The approximation of the current proposals' very broadly/generally defined LOs to those applicable in EU countries not only secures a more balanced approach in terms of theory and practice but could also give the future students the opportunity to transpose the same skills into another working context.

To continue with, courses no. 11-15 of the Year 2 are electives, but their content should make them compulsory. These subjects and their curriculum elements are of importance to achieve the goal, namely, to acquire reliable practical knowledge in the whole spectrum of paramedic science at the Master level. Besides, the compressed content of course no. 11. needs to be decompressed - in its current form the broad and general descriptions make the recognition of LOs, individual themes, syndromes, indications nearly impossible. As an explanation: "Acute Assessment and Management of Special Population" course (with 6 ECTS) now includes pregnancy, new-borns, geriatric and bariatric (obese) patients as well. The highly diverse medical characteristics of this "special population" are obvious. A potential emergency call from this environment can include pre-hospital obstetric emergencies (which should include clear references on adequate and sufficient knowledge on childbirth, basic and advanced life support for neonates, haemorrhage in pregnancy, etc.), paediatric pre-hospital emergencies with pain management, advanced airway management - foreign body airway obstruction, allergic reaction-anaphylaxis, glycaemic emergencies, seizures, convulsion, pyrexia, haemorrhagic shock, burns, heat-related emergencies among others - and the same topics can be listed (and taught, practised and checked) in case of geriatric and bariatric patients as well.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		X
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	-	-
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.		X
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ECTS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		X
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- 1. Access to a range of clinical settings for practice experience and rotational placement in a range of clearly defined practice areas (emergency, primary and community-based care settings, ambulance service) is needed, and should be defined in the curriculum*
- 2. A Clinical Practice Guideline for MSC level Paramedics which contains ample information on the learning outcomes and competency-based clinical assessment as well should be compiled and made available later for future students.*
- 3. The organisational structure of the new educational program itself should be presented with clear links to BSc Nursing. The connections between the Dean, Faculty Council, administration and the operation of all educational parts (departments, clinical units)*

22



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- should be demonstrated at the website. The possible interfaces, personal responsibilities and the overlaps between them should also be demonstrated.*
4. *Supervision rules, responsibilities of tutors and students involved in Course 10 (Master Thesis) should be defined in the syllabus together with the requirements on content and format and the precise rules for the defence of the work (or a link should be provided to the site of these data).*
 5. *The list of compulsory textbooks should be supplemented with further, optional readings. The volumes of compulsory bibliography, the teaching material listed in syllabi (printed or electronic versions) should be accessible at the Library and up to date. The program is new; therefore, it is important that the latest editions would be available at the library and in appropriate numbers.*
 6. *The structure and the content of the educational program, the ECTS values of the courses, the amounts of lectures, practical exercises, the ratio of theory and practical activities should be checked thoroughly, optimally by an internal review committee.*
 7. *LOs should be clearly defined with special attention to the specificities of the individual courses. It is recommended to use objectively structured clinical or practical examinations (OSCE, OSPE), and other modern assessment methods for evaluating LOs/competences in clinical subjects.*
 8. *The components of the curriculum map should be made thematically compatible with the expected final LOs.*
 9. *The syllabi should define the time available for student consultation as well.*

2.5. Students

The SER states that the admission procedure is organised based on the Faculty Council Regulation on Admission. The Faculty Council Regulation on Admission is currently not available on the UBT website. The UBT website includes the Regulation on Master Studies which in regard to the admission process and requirements fully refers to the Faculty Council Regulation on Admission.

All applicants who have completed a BA in Nursing or similar programs with the average grade of 8,00 have the right to enrol in the MA Paramedic Sciences. Additionally, a proof of at least level B2 knowledge of English is requested. In case the applicant does not have an average

23



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

grade of 8,00, it is possible to be enrolled by demonstrating a proof of at least three years of experience in the field of healthcare. A standard requirement for studies in healthcare is medical and legal fitness for the profession.

According to the SAR, the number of students per lecture is up to 50 students, for seminars is between 15-25 students, for lab practice is between 10-15 students and between 8-10 students for clinical subject courses. The SAR states that the study methods applied by introductory subjects put a lot of emphasis on lectures, individual work or teamwork and discussions. The MA Paramedical Science foresees enrolling 200 students each year, which is a large number. The issue of student groups has to be looked at together with the planned enrolment and the technical capacity of the premises. While the ET does not have any remarks on the size of student groups, the ET questions the number of applicants who would be eligible for studies, given the high average grade requested from the applicants. Also the actual capacity of UBT, that is analysed in the section 2.7 of this report, has to be taken into account.

At UBT the students are assessed continually during the coursework and also at the end of each course. All student data, including the grades, are administered through the Student Management Information System (SMIS).

UBT has developed a set of criteria to help identify students at risk of non-completion. This information is combined with an evaluation of the student learning styles and abilities with the aim to provide appropriate pedagogical support. During the first week of a semester each student takes a learning styles inventory. In addition to that, each student is allocated a mentor. Students may make up for the missed lectures in a way determined by the faculty if the reason for non-attendance is justified and in case that no more than 30% of the classes are missed. The student who misses more than 30% of practical courses shall repeat the year of studies.

According to the Action Plan for Quality Improvement (described in the section 2.2 of this report), by July 2022 the guiding standards for assessment will be developed and by May 2022 a procedure for improving the completion rate of students will be introduced. The drop out rate and completion rate is included among the indicators that will be monitored for each study programme at UBT (Faculty Performance Assessment Framework).

Adherence to ethical principles is ensured through the Code of Ethics. SER states that the Faculty Sub-Committee on Ethics has been tasked to promote ethical behaviour in teaching, learning, research, and clinical placement. This committee would also deal with violence of the code. As mentioned previously, it is not clear where in the UBT organisational structure the

24



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Faculty Sub-Committee is located, and which particular faculty is meant. Information about the ethical principles is also included in the Student Handbook.

The Regulation on Master Studies foresees several cases when exceptions or special arrangements can be applied, for example, when evaluating and grading the work of a student with disabilities, the possibility for leaving studies for the period of maternity or paternity leave or serious illness. The regulation defines several possibilities for taking exams - winter, summer and autumn exam session - and states that the student has the right to withdraw from the exam no later than 24 hours before the exam but it does not define any special cases when a student could be allowed to withdraw later and take the exam at a different time without sanctions, for example, because of urgent health issues, participation in a mobility programme abroad etc.

The Regulation on Master Studies states that after the completion of studies, each student is issued a diploma which certifies the completion of the studies and the achievement of the professional or academic title. The diploma is issued in Albanian and English. In addition to the diploma, students receive a diploma supplement which certifies the study courses passed and other academic achievements, if applicable.

The information about the student rights and responsibilities is included in the Regulation for Master Studies. There is also a Student Handbook which generally includes valuable information but there is no reference to student rights and responsibilities. It would be suggested to communicate the student rights and responsibilities to the students in a friendly way through the Student Handbook and also include in the handbook links to any relevant legal documents, for example, the Regulation on Master Studies.

The transfer possibility is foreseen in the Regulation on Master Studies, and it is presented clearly. Transfer is possible for applicants who are/ have been enrolled into Nursing or similar Programs at master's level and finished at least the first semester.

There is a tutoring system with the Program Student Support Officer who is responsible for handling student administrative support. However, the SAR and the supplementary documentation does not include any information about the duty of the academic staff to offer consultations to students and about certain requirements for consultation.

Standard	Compliance
----------	------------



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	-	-
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	-	-
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.		X

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *To publish the Faculty Council Admission Regulation on the UBT website.*
2. *To reconsider the admission requirements and/or student quota in relation with the actual demand of the labour market and number of potential applicants who would fulfil the criteria.*
3. *To complement the Student Handbook with information about student rights and responsibilities and with links to relevant UBT internal documents.*
4. *To ensure that internal regulations include a mandatory requirement for the academic staff to ensure consultation hours for students.*

2.6. Research

According to SER the aim of the Faculty is to improve research through personal participation, development of projects, improvement of laboratories, joint research projects in cooperation with international partners, and the Faculty promotes continuous scientific and academic development of the staff and their active participation at international research forums. Besides, UBT intends to support both clinical and basic research to establish the scientific basis for the program. The main topics are safety and risks in emergency medical services, standards of quality indicator for pre-hospital safety, pre-hospital emergency services for low resource countries, coordination during pre-hospital care, hospital care, and rehabilitation and involvement of paramedics in out-of-hospital research. The SER describes this process rather clearly and the research components of the educational programme are also clearly outlined.

27



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The UBT will offer students several research-oriented educational possibilities like courses on the scientific method, which can be considered as a base for their future engagement into scientific activities. The strategic goal is to provide knowledge and understanding of the role of research in healthcare and in this line, much attention is paid for the building of research skills from the earliest stages of the program, which culminates in independent research in the second (final) year. Briefly, the UBT works on the strengthening of its research function, but it should be noted, however, that the program is new, without relevant performance indicators and the future role of basic or clinical research in the context of these research priorities is still unclear. Besides, it should be noted that setting of these research priorities does not constitute a constraint on other types of research activities of the academic staff. At the educational level, one of the major aims (as described by the SER) is to develop the scientific-research skills of students and their interest in engaging them in research projects. Considering the level (Master degree), the type and specifics of paramedic science, proper and relevant conditions should be guaranteed to support research activities on this particular field. In this line, the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision should also be ensured.

The UBT has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defence of dissertations. The UBT declared that the requirement to undertake research is a career expectation and over time will be balanced as appropriate with the other obligations of the staff members. In this respect the Dean allocates teaching and other responsibilities in the light of the research record of the academic staff and a Year-End Review will report on the staff productivity in the main areas (research, teaching and administration, respectively). Furthermore, the Faculty's research training program will target several important areas: research skills and techniques; research environment; research management; personal effectiveness; communication skills; networking and team working skills; career management skills and the effectiveness of these activities will be monitored with transparent performance indicators.

At present, there are no reliable data and information on university-supported research activities of the academic staff. As part of the quality culture the UBT set the rules of evaluation of scientific-research activities and according to SER the academic staff members have provided records on their scientific output, research data, peer-reviewed publications in periodicals relevant to their specialty field. In Annex B the publications of 10 authors are listed, and the number of communications, scientific papers relevant to paramedic sciences or related

28



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

critical care medicine issues is certainly less than the requirements, or the set limits, and the topics of emergency medicine or paramedical sciences are not present or shown directly amongst the subjects. Here it should be noted again that the current situation as described by the submitted documents is almost acceptable, the research-related plans are feasible, and the background provides an appropriate starting point for the implementation.

The mechanisms for detecting plagiarism are in place, the Faculty operates the plagiarism detection software (Turnitin) and the actions that happen as a consequence of any breaches in the code regarding plagiarism are quite clear. According to SER and interview results, intellectual property-related issues and procedures for commercialization are also regulated.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	X	
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
<i>Standard 6.3.</i> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	



<i>Standard 6.5.</i> The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
<i>Standard 6.6.</i> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
<i>Standard 6.7.</i> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.		X
<i>Standard 6.9.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
<i>Standard 6.10.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 6.11.</i> Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Internationalization - incorporation of international researchers and invited lecturers into the teaching process is suggested.*
2. *For the involvement of all members of the specific academic program - scientific and clinical staff as well - in research-related decision-making processes in paramedic*

30



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

science, the establishment of Academic Advisory Board or similar body is recommended in order to enhance the work on the priority research topics at the Faculty. This board, under the leadership of the Vice-Dean for Research may wish to develop a grant system and an internal funding mechanism to encourage academics, clinicians, students and other personnel to be involved in these activities. The planned allocation of research-directed resources should be based on quality criteria.

- 3. Schemes should be implemented for competitive activities and the recognition of research excellence with the use of quantitative parameters and qualitative descriptors, scientometry indicators (e.g., first or last authorship in periodicals, co-authorship with students in scientific papers, etc.). In this respect, a modified scientific/research strategy specifically addressing the HR development needs of the MSc program is also needed.*
- 4. Expert assistance and training for the academic staff with grant applications and project proposals may also be provided. A good pillar of research support is co-funding policy – the HEI provides funds for all kinds of research projects if the application is co-funded by business partners or other institutions, and this will greatly increase the scale and scope of projects that can be supported.*
- 5. There is a clear need to focus more on external funding opportunities for the future implementation of research projects - the development of greater cooperation with foundations and the business sector can enhance these specific research activities.*
- 6. It would be beneficial to strengthen the curriculum-based research work of students further (e.g. with elective courses for those who are participating in student scientific circles, specific, organized journal clubs, etc.).*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

A video link was provided by the UBT on March 31, 2022 (see at <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1vHSUErSF2rasyDA7MkZBHqyE0bjygSuU/view>) presenting several important aspects of the infrastructural background, including the library and a modern skills laboratory. These facilities provide the necessary space and technical equipment for the planned studies, among others well-equipped lecture halls with projectors and computers,

31



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

ample working spaces were demonstrated. According to SER the premises of the UBT Hospital are situated in the UBT Innovation Campus Lipjan, a medium-size modern facility built in 2017, constructed and tailored for higher education purposes by the institution. The institution does not pay rent thus leaving more potential resources for future capital investments. The Faculty uses 4 auditoria and 9 seminar rooms with designated office space for staff and students of the MSc program. All rooms are equipped with modern teaching equipment and are easily adaptable to various modes of teaching. A videoconferencing auditorium has also been established with the matching technical aids. It seems that students do have a stimulating learning environment with the appropriate equipment, space and possibilities for cooperation and group-working.

Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place. Monitoring of LOs and professional development of students will be done through the e-Portfolio environment.

The library is equipped with the necessary information communication technologies and provides access to international academic databases, journals, and e-books. The condition and functionality of the IT equipment is satisfactory, according to the interviews these resources are accessible for the students.

The UBT has a well-equipped clinical skills laboratory with basic technical simulation possibilities to promote practical skills development. There are stations that are already used but the space is not enough for practice and parallel trainings for many students. Furthermore, there is no permanent staff, who will support the studying process and fulfil students' needs. The same evaluation is valid for the partner clinical institutions, involved in the teaching process, the key practical teaching bases in affiliated hospitals. Nevertheless, these sites were not presented to the ET, clinics will be evaluated regularly for their appropriateness and quality regarding the practical training program.

The operation of the program will have to rely significantly on student tuition fees. UBT's existing financial condition, financial processes and the regulation considered in its management model ensure the realization of the activities defined in the UBT's strategic plan. During the interviews the representative members of employers were highly supportive, which also suggests that investors and capital investments will be participating in program development. The UBT has elaborated a forecasting budget for several years and it increases



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

year-by-year alongside the rising student numbers. Also, the budget is oriented on the organization's main activity providing effective implementation.

The UBT has declared that owns and rents adequate spaces for the educational process, laboratories with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the syllabi include such activities. Also, UBT declared to have adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence.

The UBT's administration mentioned that there is back up plan in case of financial difficulties, to cover costs if there will be shortage in students' admission. Funding for scientific studies and library functioning-development is included in UBT's forecasting budget and increases year-by-year alongside the rising student amount.

<i>Standard</i>	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

<p>Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence;d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
<p>Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.</p>	X	



Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	X	
Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

- The basis of the Skills Centre is expected to be used as starting point to increase the quality and weight of practical training, and therefore long-term development strategies are recommended with more complex simulations and specific, paramedic scenarios (with high fidelity computerized patient simulators) which may be incorporated into the curriculum later on (a range of different surgical, trauma maternity, emergency and other clinical scenarios with low and high-fidelity simulation can be presented in a controlled environment). In the short term, it is recommended to*



increase the space available for simulation practice and trainings for the appropriate number of students.

- 2. The teaching material listed in syllabi, the recommended volumes (printed or electronic versions) should be accessible and up to date. The program is new; therefore, it is important that the latest editions would be available and in appropriate numbers.*
- 3. In clinical education the key teaching bases (clinical hospitals) should be evaluated regularly for their appropriateness and quality regarding the practical training program. Mechanism to monitor, evaluate, and review defined technical and performance indicators is also suggested.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
2. Quality management	Substantially compliant
3. Academic staff	Fully compliant
4. Educational process content	Partially compliant
5. Students	Substantially compliant



6. Research	Substantially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Fully compliant
Overall compliance	Substantially compliant

The following recommendations need to be considered in relation to program accreditation:

- To define learning outcomes for the study programme that would be formulated in the form of knowledge, skills and competencies that the students would possess upon graduation.*
- To perform a mapping of programme content with similar study programmes on master's level in Europe in order to identify possibilities for improvement.*
- To review the terminology regarding the programmes, departments and faculties on the UBT website and documentation related to this study programme in order to provide clear and consistent information on institutional structure and affiliation of the study programme.*
- To ensure that there is a clear link between the institutional objectives and the indicators defined for quality assurance processes on the programme level.*
- Once the study programme is launched, to define standards for process and output related indicators and monitor them on a regular basis.*
- Introduce survey mechanisms for employers.*
- To use clear and consistent terminology in regard to UBT structural units (faculties, departments) in all documentation related to internal quality assurance.*
- To take measures for measuring and monitoring whether the learning outcomes defined for each study course have been achieved and possibly integrate them in the study course descriptions.*
- Thesis supervision should be carried out by a person appropriately skilled and competent with sufficient knowledge and seniority. To ensure programme*



- sustainability, the number of enrolled students should be planned according to the numbers of academics with appropriate scientific degree.*
10. *It will be necessary to analyse thoroughly the teaching capacity and staff availability in the upcoming years. A staff management policy and a transparent workload scheme is suggested ensuring the efficient involvement of staff members in the process of education at the MSc level.*
 11. *The HEI should introduce a clear methodology to determine the number of the academic and invited staff for the MSc program, where the minimum number of academic hours and training load, scientific/research/creative/performing and other workload for the semesters is defined and updated.*
 12. *Access to a range of clinical settings for practice experience and rotational placement in a range of clearly defined practice areas (emergency, primary and community-based care settings, ambulance service) is needed, and should be defined in the curriculum.*
 13. *A Clinical Practice Guideline for MSC level Paramedics which contains ample information on the learning outcomes and competency-based clinical assessment as well should be compiled and made available later for future students.*
 14. *The organisational structure of the new educational program itself should be presented with clear links to BSc Nursing. The connections between the Dean, Faculty Council, administration, and the operation of all educational parts (departments, clinical units) should be demonstrated at the website. The possible interfaces, personal responsibilities, and the overlaps between them should also be demonstrated.*
 15. *Supervision rules, responsibilities of tutors and students involved in Course 10 (Master Thesis) should be defined in the syllabus together with the requirements on content and format and the precise rules for the defence of the work (or a link should be provided to the site of these data).*
 16. *The list of compulsory textbooks should be supplemented with further, optional readings. The volumes of compulsory bibliography, the teaching material listed in syllabi (printed or electronic versions) should be accessible at the Library and up to date. The program is new; therefore, it is important that the latest editions would be available at the library and in appropriate numbers.*
 17. *The structure and the content of the educational program, the ECTS values of the courses, the amounts of lectures, practical exercises, the ratio of theory and*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- practical activities should be checked thoroughly, optimally by an internal review committee.*
18. *LOs should be clearly defined with special attention to the specificities of the individual courses. It is recommended to use objectively structured clinical or practical examinations (OSCE, OSPE), and other modern assessment methods for evaluating LOs/competences in clinical subjects.*
 19. *The components of the curriculum map should be made thematically compatible with the expected final LOs.*
 20. *The syllabi should define the time available for student consultation as well.*
 21. *To publish the Faculty Council Admission Regulation on the UBT website.*
 22. *To reconsider the admission requirements and/or student quota in relation with the actual demand of the labour market and number of potential applicants who would fulfil the criteria.*
 23. *To complement the Student Handbook with information about student rights and responsibilities and with links to relevant UBT internal documents.*
 24. *To ensure that internal regulations include a mandatory requirement for the academic staff to ensure consultation hours for students.*
 25. *Internationalization - incorporation of international researchers and invited lecturers into the teaching process is suggested.*
 26. *For the involvement of all members of the specific academic program - scientific and clinical staff as well - in research-related decision-making processes in paramedic science, the establishment of Academic Advisory Board or similar body is recommended in order to enhance the work on the priority research topics at the Faculty. This board, under the leadership of the Vice-Dean for Research may wish to develop a grant system and an internal funding mechanism to encourage academics, clinicians, students and other personnel to be involved in these activities. The planned allocation of research-directed resources should be based on quality criteria.*
 27. *Schemes should be implemented for competitive activities and the recognition of research excellence with the use of quantitative parameters and qualitative descriptors, scientometry indicators (e.g. first or last authorship in periodicals, co-authorship with students in scientific papers, etc.). In this respect, a modified scientific/research strategy specifically addressing the HR development needs of the MSc program is also needed.*

39



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

28. *Expert assistance and training for the academic staff with grant applications and project proposals may also be provided. A good pillar of research support is co-funding policy – the HEI provides funds for all kinds of research projects if the application is co-funded by business partners or other institutions, and this will greatly increase the scale and scope of projects that can be supported.*
29. *There is a clear need to focus more on external funding opportunities for the future implementation of research projects - the development of greater cooperation with foundations and the business sector can enhance these specific research activities.*
30. *It would be beneficial to strengthen the curriculum-based research work of students further (e.g. with elective courses for those who are participating in student scientific circles, specific, organized journal clubs, etc.)*
31. *The basis of the Skills Centre is expected to be used as starting point to increase the quality and weight of practical training, and therefore long-term development strategies are recommended with more complex simulations and specific, paramedic scenarios (with high fidelity computerized patient simulators) which may be incorporated into the curriculum later on (a range of different surgical, trauma maternity, emergency and other clinical scenarios with low and high-fidelity simulation can be presented in a controlled environment). In the short term, it is recommended to increase the space available for simulation practice and trainings for the appropriate number of students.*
32. *The teaching material listed in syllabi, the recommended volumes (printed or electronic versions) should be accessible and up to date. The program is new; therefore, it is important that the latest editions would be available and in appropriate numbers.*
33. *In clinical education the key teaching bases (clinical hospitals) should be evaluated regularly for their appropriateness and quality regarding the practical training program. Mechanism to monitor, evaluate, and review defined technical and performance indicators is also suggested.*

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the MSc study program “Paramedical Science” offered by UBT is **substantially compliant** with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, recommends **to accredit** the study program for a duration of **3** years with a number of **60** students to be enrolled in the program.

40



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

4. APPENDICES (*if available*)

None

Expert Team

Chair

(Signature)

Prof. Mihály Boros

23.05.2021.

Member

Asnate Kazoka

(Signature)

Asnate Kazoka

23.05.2021.