



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

***UNIVERSITY “Kadri Zeka” of GJILAN
MATHEMATICS EDUCATION (BSc)***

REACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

May 2022, Gjilan



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule.....	6
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation	8
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	10
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration	10
2.2. Quality management.....	12
2.3. Academic staff	17
2.4. Educational process content.....	20
2.5. Students.....	26
2.6. Research.....	29
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	32
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	36



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 27.04.2022

Expert Team (ET) members:

- Prof. Dr. Peeter Normak
- Asnate Kažoka, PhD Candidate

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Leona Kovaci, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self Evaluation Report (SER).*
- *Syllabi of the subjects.*
- *CVs of the academic staff.*
- *Summary Report on Evaluation of Academic Staff and Subjects from Students of “Kadri Zeka” University, for the Summer Semester of 2020/2021.*
- *List of scientific publications and conferences/seminars the staff has participated in.*
- *Memoranda of understanding and cooperation agreements between University of Gjilan “Kadri Zeka” or the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology and other institutions.*
- *Annual Quality Assurance Calendar for 2021/2022 academic year.*
- *Guidelines for the Assessment of Academic Staff and the Subjects by Students and the Usage of such Results in the University “Kadri Zeka”.*
- *Key Performance Indicators at UKZ.*
- *Manual for Planning and Assessment of the Performance of the Academic Staff.*
- *Regulation on Basic Studies-Bachelor.*
- *Regulation on Disciplinary Measures and Procedures for the Academic Staff and Students.*
- *Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the Public University “Kadri Zeka” Gjilan.*
- *Regulation on the Code of Ethics in UKZ.*



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- *Regulation for the Scientific Research Activity at the Public University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan.*
- *Regulation on Selection Procedures Relating to Recommendation and Appointment and Advancement of Academic Staff at Public University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan..*
- *Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan.*
- *Statute of the University "Kadri Zeka" of Gjilan.*
- *UKZ Strategic Plan 2017-2022 (revised in 2020).*
- *Intellectual Property Guideline.*
- *Regulation on the establishment and functioning of the Council for Quality and Evaluation Supervision.*
- *Regulation on Student Engagement in Internships at Administration of the Public University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan.*
- *Regulation. Commission for the Supervision of Implementation of the Strategic Plan of the Public University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan.*
- *Regulation on the Internal Organization and Systematization of Jobs.*
- *Regulation for Writing the Bachelor's Thesis.*
- *Regulation on the Work of the Steering Committee of the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan.*
- *Regulation on the Procedures for the Engagement of the External Associates at the Public University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan.*
- *Regulation to Support the Mobility and other Activities of the Academic Staff of the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan.*
- *Regulation on Establishment and Functioning Principles of the Advisory Board of the University "Kadri Zeka" in Gjilan.*
- *Regulation on Personal Income and other Payments of the Academic Staff at the University "Kadri Zeka".*
- *Regulation on Students Elections in UKZ.*
- *Regulation on Selection of the Academic Staff in "Kadri Zeka" University in Gjilan.*
- *Regulation on Procedures for Quality Assurance.*
- *Report of the Expert Team of 2019 accreditation evaluation of the Mathematics Education (called Educational Mathematics in the Report) study program.*
- *Other documents (some of them in Albanian language)*
- *Manual for Planning and Assessment of the Performance of the Academic Staff.*



Requested documents:

1. Quality Assurance strategy (draft).
2. Quality (Assurance) Action Plan for 2021/22 academic year.
3. Budget of the Faculty for Applied Sciences (income and expenditure) for the years 2019 – 2021.
4. Financial plan of the study programme (in scenario where there are 50 students).
5. Information on MA level study programmes at Kadri Zeka University where the graduates of BA Mathematics Education could be admitted and information on entrance examinations that they would need to pass, if any.
6. Detailed description of implementation (the regulation) of the subject "Teaching Practice", in addition to the course description (if there is).
7. Quantitative quality assurance indicators defined for the BA Mathematics Education (if any), results for 2019-2021 and prognosis for 2022.
8. CV-s: Merxhan Avdyli, Kastriot Dermaku, Bashkim Dalipi, Shaip Surdulli.
9. The template of the Individual Development Plan.
10. Templates of the questionnaires for different stakeholder groups - graduates, students (both for assessing the administration as well as the academic staff and courses), employers, self-assessment of academic staff, deans' assessment of academic staff.
11. A couple of examples of an Individual Development Plan.

Received documents:

1. Quality Assurance Strategy at "Kadri Zeka" University 2022 – 2026 (draft).
2. Quality Assurance Action Plan at "Kadri Zeka" University 2017 – 2022, revised in 2020.
3. UKZ budget for 2021.
4. Information about master's level study programmes at the "Kadri Zeka" University where the graduates of BSc Mathematics Education could continue their studies.
5. Detailed information about the study course "Teaching Practice".
6. Statistical data about the pass rate and transfer from other universities.
7. CV's for Merxhan Avdyli, Kastriot Dermaku, Bashkim Dalipi, Shaip Surdulli.
8. Template of the Individual Development Plan.



9. Templates for questionnaires for – students; student – teacher and subject; employers; graduate students; self-evaluation of the academic staff; assessment of the academic staff by the dean (manager assessment).
10. A couple of examples of an Individual Development Plan.

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *KAA Accreditation Manual*
- *The Manual for External Evaluation of Higher Education Institutions*
- *National Qualifications Framework*

1.2. Site visit schedule

Site Visit Programme

Time	Meeting	Participants
09:30 – 10:15	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated	1. Shprese Qamili – Dean 2. Ekrem Alimi – Prodean 3. Blerta Dushica – Secretary
10:20 – 11:00	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff	1. Fitore Malaj – Quality Assurance Office 2. Arbona Xhemajli – Quality Coordinator 3. Refik Ibrahimimi – Administrative Staff
11:05 – 12:05	Meeting with the heads of the study programme	1. Xhevdet Thaçi 2. Ekrem Alimi 3. Arbona Xhemajli
12:05 – 12.45	Lunch break (provided at the evaluation site)	



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

12:50 – 13:35	Meeting with teaching staff	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Musa Ajeti2. Bashkim Dalipi3. Avdullah Zejnullahu4. Nimete Berisha5. Kastriot Dermaku6. Aferdite Ibrahim7. Merxhan Avdyli8. Fevzi Berisha9. Liridon Hoti
13:40 – 14:20	Meeting with students	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Dea Lota2. Vlerë Mustafa3. Erëmirë Aliu4. Flamur Shala5. Leona Mustafa6. Merita Emini7. Erisa Neziri8. Tringa Tasholli9. Havë Dërmaku10. Valerina Basha11. Antigona Shabani
14:25 – 15:05	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Selvete Sylejmani – Director of the MDE-Gjilan2. Afrim Dervishi – Director of the MDE-Kamenice3. Fatbardha Emini – Director of the MDE-Viti4. Jetmir Jerliu – Official of the MDE-Gjilan5. Festim Shkodra – Professor of Mathematics6. Hysnije Ismajli – School principal
15:05 – 15:15	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts	
15:15 – 15:25	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Shprese Qamili – Dean2. Ekrem Alimi – Prodean3. Blerta Dushica – Secretary



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The University “Kadri Zeka” of Gjilan (UKZ) was established as a public university on 6 March 2013, which was approved by the Assembly of Kosovo on 30 May 2013. Provision of higher education in Gjilan goes back to 1958 when the Teacher Training Centre was established. In 2002, the Faculty of Education of University of Prishtina was established in Gjilan (based on the former Higher Pedagogical School). In 2010 the University of Prishtina established in Gjilan two other faculties: the Faculty of Economics and the Faculty of Law. In 2013, all these academic units have been merged to a new independent university.

The Assembly of Kosovo approved the Statue of UKZ on 10.12.2020.

The mission of the UKZ is as follows: “A Temple of Knowledge which cultivates learning and the development of knowledge, fosters critical thinking and the spirit of entrepreneurship for new research, which aid social and technological development, prepare responsible and professionally capable young people to be part of a virtual and global society, part of an open labour market and at the same time, a model for other members of society”.

UKZ has five faculties (Applied Sciences; Computer Sciences; Economics; Education; Law) and offers seven bachelor level study programs (Preschool Education; Primary Education; General Law; Banking, Finance and Applied Accounting; Management and Entrepreneurship; Marketing; Computer Sciences; Educational Mathematics) and five master level study programs (E-Governance; Teaching Albanian Language and Literature; Teaching and Curriculum; Criminal Law; Control Systems and Artificial Intelligence).

The Mathematics Education study program belongs to the competence of the Faculty of Applied Sciences, and is the only study program of this faculty.

UKZ has about 5000 students and 49 academic staff members, of which two are masters of arts, 4 are PhD candidates and the others have a PhD degree.

The UKZ campus is located in the centre of Gjilan and consists of two interconnected buildings.

UKZ has special quotas for the admission of students from small communities (Serbs, Turks, Roma) and from municipalities outside Kosovo (Serbia and North Macedonia). There are conditions for admitting students with special needs. The university admitted 23 students in



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

the Faculty of Applied Sciences in 2021. The total number of students in the Faculty is 78, from which 52 are female. As there are nine full-time academic staff in the Faculty, the student-teacher ratio is very good.

The Mathematics Education study program was accredited in 2019 for three years.

UKZ has institutional accreditation from year 2017 and is currently in the process of re-accreditation.



2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

What follows are the comments on each standard, numbered according to the numbering of the standards in the *KAA Accreditation Manual*. There is a table at the end of each section that lists the compliance assessment for each standard.

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

- 1.1. The mission statement of the UKZ does not specify any focus area of the university, stating that the university cultivates learning, fosters critical thinking and the spirit of entrepreneurship. However, the *Strategic Plan* of the university for 2017-2022 states that the university “aims to profile itself mainly in education, computer science, applied science, social science”. The mission of the Mathematics Education program is: “*to prepare responsible and professionally capable young people by encouraging critical thinking towards the development of mathematics knowledge for new educational research to be part of modern and global society, part of the wider labor market, and at the same time, a role model for other members of our society*”.

Thus, the study program is consistent with the profile and the mission of the university.

- 1.2. The SER does not address the compliance of learning outcomes of the study program with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. Moreover, the university considers schools as the main employers of graduates of the study program: all employers of graduates who met with the ET represented different educational institutions. The reasoning for establishing the program was explained by a feasibility study that highlighted the lack of mathematics teachers. The representatives of schools were also the only ones who have been consulted in regard to content of the study programme. This is a fundamental problem, since the graduates of bachelor studies in Kosovo cannot be employed as teachers and must complete 5-year studies to obtain formal teaching rights.



- 1.3. As the overall didactic concept, the student-centred teaching was mentioned. This means that teaching and learning is interactive, group work and learning by examples as well as software applications are used. No information related to the research concept was provided. Although this is a bachelor level study program, it is currently the only study program at the Faculty of Applied Sciences and defines the research concept for the whole faculty. The ET therefore recommends that a research concept for the Faculty of Applied Sciences is established with clearly defining the role of the BSc Mathematics Education program.
- 1.4. The academic processes are very well regulated. The main document stating the structure and administration is a thorough (85 pages) *Statute of the University*. There is a number of additional regulating documents like *Regulation on Basic Studies-Bachelor*, *Regulation for writing the bachelor's thesis*, *Regulation for the scientific research activity at the public university "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan*, *Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan*, *Regulation on the Code of Ethics in UKZ*, *Regulation on student engagement in internships at the university*, *Regulation on Internationalization* etc. All these documents are publicly available.
- 1.5. For ethical issues, the university has a separate regulation (*Regulation on the Code of Ethics in UKZ*). This document covers on its 13 pages all aspects of ethical conduct including prohibition of discrimination and harassment, plagiarism, conflict of interest, transparency and confidentiality etc. There are designated bodies for implementing the principles stated in this document: the Ethics Council and the Disciplinary Committee. The measures applied in cases of violation are stated in the *Regulation on disciplinary sanction and procedure for academic staff and students*.
- 1.6. The majority of the documents have been reviewed during two last years. According to the *Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan*, "At the end of each academic year, the Faculty shall organize a periodic review of the study programme and its teaching regulation". Concrete aspects are listed that should be reviewed.



Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	+	
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		+
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		+
<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	+	
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	+	
<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	+	

Compliance level: partially compliant.

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop a research concept for the faculty that would clearly define the role of BSc Mathematics Education.*
2. *Involve experts from outside the education sector in curriculum development.*

2.2. Quality management

- 2.1. At the end of each academic year, the teachers provide a written report on all aspects of the teaching process, identifying issues and proposing solutions including control



procedures for knowledge and results achieved. Then a review of the study program is performed, which determines “changes to be carried out in the study program and in its teaching regulation, in the implementation process, in the material and didactical basis, in academic staff, in the control procedures of students’ assessments, and in the feedback process from students” (*Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University “Kadri Zeka” Gjilan*).

2.2. Quality assurance processes at the Faculty level are coordinated by the Quality Coordinator of the Faculty. The work is based on a very thorough Quality Assurance Calendar of the UKZ that specifies weekly activities for the whole academic year (September - July). The quality assurance relies on three pillars: bodies, documents, instruments. The main documents regulating the evaluation processes and planning for improvement are *Regulation on quality assurance and evaluation at the public university “Kadri Zeka” Gjilan* and *Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University “Kadri Zeka” Gjilan*. The Quality Assurance Office coordinates the quality assessment of study programs. The regulations mentioned above determine quality instruments and prescribe concrete duties of all parties involved. The duties and responsibilities of the faculty’s Quality Coordinator are explicitly determined, (s)he:

- Instructs academic staff and students in the framework of the academic unit regarding the practical and academic aspects of ECTS implementation;
- In cooperation with the management of the academic unit, takes care of and monitors the involvement of all stakeholders (academic staff, students, businesses, members of the Advisory Board, etc.), for the drafting/review of study programs during the re / accreditation process;
- It is part of the planning and monitoring of the process of evaluation of courses and teachers, as well as internal quality evaluation;
- In cooperation with the management of the academic unit, he/she assists in the systematization of data and information related to scientific/artistic activity in the academic unit (evidence of scientific works, artistic performance, professional and scientific projects);



- Advises, plans, and monitors schemes, activities for quality improvement in the academic unit.

The Faculty has an internal quality assessment team, work of which is also organized by the Quality Coordinator.

- 2.3. The quality assurance processes at UKZ are unified and regulated. The main document is the *Quality Assurance Action Plan*. The quality assurance and evaluation system, quality assurance mechanisms and instruments, quality assurance stakeholders and the duties and responsibilities of the parties involved in this process are defined in the *Regulation on quality assurance and evaluation at the public university "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan*. The basic priorities of the quality assurance and the way of its implementation are determined in the *Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan*. These documents regulate – among other aspects – also design and approval of new study programs, continuous review of study programs, external evaluation, evaluation of teaching process, etc. However, the fact that the curriculum does not comply with the national regulations (see the detailed explanation in sections 4.1 and 4.2) shows that the above-mentioned quality instruments do not work.
- 2.4. It is commendable that quality issues have a separate pop-up menu on the university website. According to the *Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan* the yearly reviews should consider the following aspects: allocation of credits to respective disciplines or group-disciplines; teaching programs for specific subjects; constituent elements of disciplines and allocation of credits among them (lectures, seminars, assignments, projects, labs, etc.); the study program regulation; the necessary didactic basis for the implementation of the study program, identifying deficiencies and undertaking necessary measures for the successive year; literature used, deficiencies observed and measures undertaken to improve the situation; study program implementation in the respective academic year; control procedures of knowledge/exams and analysis of control outcomes; feedback from students. The review report must determine changes to be carried out in the study program and in its teaching regulation, in the implementation process, in the material and didactical basis,



in academic staff, in the control procedures of students' assessments, and in the feedback process from students.

- 2.5. The decision-making bodies of quality assurance are hierarchical: Working Group for reviewing of the study program -> Faculty Council -> Studies Commission -> Council for Quality and Evaluation Supervision -> UKZ Senate. The processes and responsibilities of these bodies are determined by respective regulations and other documents. Questionnaires are heavily used to collect empirical data. The ET, however, did not learn of any particular performance indicators where the targets to be achieved would be defined on the programme level and monitored on a regular basis. As a part of additional information, the ET was presented the data on student passing rate and transfer from other institutions, however, these were plain statistics and the targets were missing. The ET therefore suggests that UKZ defines such performance indicators.
- 2.6. There are ten questionnaires developed: 1) Questionnaire for students regarding online learning at UKZ, 2) Questionnaire for academic staff related to UKZ online learning, 3) Questionnaire for students regarding the evaluation of UKZ Professors, 4) Questionnaire for students regarding the evaluation of UKZ assistants, 5) Questionnaire for academic staff regarding the evaluation of aspects of their work with students at UKZ, 6) Questionnaire for students regarding administrative services in UKZ, 7) Questionnaire for UKZ administrative staff regarding their aspects of work, especially their suggestions for eventual improvements, 8) Questionnaire for self-assessment of academic staff, 9) Questionnaire for alumni, 10) External evaluation questionnaire/employer.

The whole process, from filling in the individual questionnaires to the handling of the reports is fully determined. Some average results are publicly available on the UKZ web page. The ET also learned that the templates for student questionnaires include only questions with a defined scale but no open questions where students could provide their comments. Moreover, there was no question in the questionnaire for graduate students about updating the curriculum – what courses or topics are missing and should be added.



- 2.7. The procedure for further development of the study program is described in section 2.4 above. The Student Management System (SMU) has options for collecting data on student workload, student achievement etc. that allows to take immediate actions when necessary. It has to be noted that since there are no graduates yet, employment data are so far not involved in the analyses.
- 2.8. The *Standards on Internal Quality Assurance in the University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan* state that the review of study programs and the teaching regulation is conducted at the end of each academic year. However, the ET did not learn of any specific quality assurance reports for the BSc Mathematics Education or the Faculty of Applied Sciences in general.
- 2.9. As described in section 2.4, the study program regulation and implementation, as well as control procedures and analysis of control outcomes are reviewed every year.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 2.1.</i> All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	+	
<i>Standard 2.2.</i> Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	+	
<i>Standard 2.3.</i> Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.		+
<i>Standard 2.4.</i> Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	+	
<i>Standard 2.5.</i> Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.		+
<i>Standard 2.6.</i> Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		+
<i>Standard 2.7.</i> Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes	+	



evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.		
<i>Standard 2.8.</i> The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	+	
<i>Standard 2.9.</i> The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	+	

Compliance level: partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop and implement quality assurance instruments to ensure curricula meet the national standards.*
2. *Update the data on students' assessment of academic staff and subjects on the UKZ web page.*
3. *Develop a list of indicators and specific targets for every semester/year that would be monitored for the BSc Mathematics Education on a regular basis and include the related analysis in quality assurance reports.*
4. *Develop quality assurance reports on faculty/programme level or clearly separate the faculty/programme level in the reports prepared for the whole institution.*
5. *Review the templates for student and graduate questionnaires in cooperation with UKZ student organisations, so that the templates would ensure that meaningful feedback can be provided.*

2.3. Academic staff

- 3.1. Personal data of academic staff are presented in tabular form: name, academic title, qualification, start and end of the contract, field of study. The courses taught are listed in a separate table of the SER.



- 3.2. UKZ as a public university follows strictly all regulations concerning employment. Legal requirements set for teaching staff are met: according to the study program in SER, all 12 teachers have a PhD degree and are elected by open competition.
- 3.3. According to the CV-s submitted, the formal requirements concerning employment of academic staff by other institutions are met.
- 3.4. About 67% of all teachers (8 out of 12) have full-time employment, and they cover about 70% of the courses.
- 3.5. There are 12 full-time lecturers on the study program who hold a PhD degree. As this is the only study program of the Faculty, the number of staff with a PhD is sufficient for the study program.
- 3.6. According to the *Regulation to Support Mobility and other Activities of the Academic Staff of the University*, the university supports financially full-time academic staff for active participation in conferences and for scientific mobility. The decision is made by the Steering Council of UKZ. However, the academic staff of the Faculty claimed that this support is not sufficient. All trainings abroad that are described in the SER have taken place within the framework of Erasmus+ projects. There are no opportunities for long-term (at least one semester) visits, including sabbaticals, to the leading universities and research centers.
- 3.7. The responsibilities of academic staff in the engagement in the academic community are outlined in the *Manual for Planning and Assessment of the Performance of the Academic Staff*. The activities are divided into four categories: 1) on planning and assessment of teaching; 2) on research and development, 3) on administrative activities and 4) on professional services in the interest of the society. Concerning availability for consultations, every teacher should assign at least two hours a week for consultations of students.
- 3.8. At the beginning of the academic year, the teacher drafts the Individual Development Plan, which includes all his activities within an academic year. The university regulations foresee conducting academic staff yearly self-assessment. Students assess the staff at the end of each semester. The data are processed by the Quality Office which informs



the members of the academic staff individually on the results of the questionnaire and suggests measures to overcome the difficulties presented. The evaluations are made publicly available. However, as it was mentioned under section 2.6, the latest data on students' assessment of academic staff and subjects on the university's web page are from 2018/2019 academic year.

- 3.9. Although the UKZ *Strategic Plan 2017-2022* (page 6) declares that “The essence of the Strategy can be included in five points: ... 3. Improving the quality of teaching and learning ...”, no concrete strategies for improving teaching and quality of learning materials are proposed. The SER lists only the general principles: 1) open dialogue and participation, 2) transparency and reliability, 3) consistency, 4) flexibility, 5) integration of digital technologies and 6) proper evaluation of achievements. On the other hand, the SER considers the small number of literature on mathematics education in Albanian as one of the weaknesses.
- 3.10. There are no retired full-time teachers – the average age of full-time teaching staff is about 51 years.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	+	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	+	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	+	
<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	+	



<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	+	
<i>Standard 3.6.</i> Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.		+
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	+	
<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	+	
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		+
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	+	

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Find resources for long-term training of academic staff abroad.*
2. *Determine the quality indicators for evaluation the quality of learning materials and implement their usage in the holistic quality system on the university.*

2.4. Educational process content

- 4.1. The aim of the study program is *“to prepare math teachers for the full implementation of the curricula for level 2 and 3 as well as the labour market needs in the lower and upper secondary schools of the Republic of Kosovo and beyond”* (SER page 34). Therefore, the study program would have the ISCED code 0114 (Teacher training with



subject specialization). However, the content of the study program corresponds to the ISCED code 0541 (Mathematics): about 2/3 of the volume is mathematics courses, and the rest is almost equally divided between IT, pedagogy, physics, and general subjects (English language and academic writing). The share of education-related courses is less than 10%. Therefore, the content of the study program contradicts the stated aim. The study program does not give students the competencies required by school teachers: there is only one course in didactics of mathematics and no school practice (the course *Teaching practice* does not foresee any practical teaching at school). There is no pedagogy course in the study program for semesters 2-5! Moreover, according to the syllabus of *Diploma Thesis*, the thesis should be devoted to mathematics, not to mathematics education. Currently UKZ does not offer any possibilities for the graduates of this study program to continue studies on the master level in order to obtain the teaching rights. Thus, the proposed study program can be considered as part of a five-year study program for the training of teachers of mathematics. The ET has the following comments on the content of the study program:

- 4.1.1. Courses in mathematics belong to classical mathematics: mathematical logic, mathematical analysis, algebra, geometry, combinatorics, probability theory, discrete mathematics. There is no course in numerical analysis (iteration, interpolation, numerical integration and differentiation etc) nor in mathematical modelling (including regression models or linear programming). Not only that, the SER does not consider the compatibility of mathematics subjects with the content of school mathematics.
- 4.1.2. Although two of the stated learning outcomes are “Knowledge and understanding of the influence of mathematics on the development of other sciences” and “Use approaches to natural science thinking to quantify problems in nature, the environment and society”, the mechanism for achieving these remains unclear because:
 - According to the syllabi, subjects are theoretical, with only very few, if at all, examples of application of mathematics in other sciences;
 - the study program does not contain any internship or project.



Therefore, a graduate may not be able to apply mathematics in solving problems of other sciences.

- 4.1.3. The role of physics in the study program remains unclear: physics is not mentioned in the expected learning outcomes of the study program neither is this discussed nowhere else in the SER.
- 4.2. The study program covers most of mathematics, which is typical for undergraduate programs in mathematics. As the volume of teacher training study programs must be 240 ECTS, the submitted study program does not comply with the national legislation.
- 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow. Concerning the connection between the subjects, the main question here concerns the fact that the course “Philosophy of Mathematics Education” is offered already on the first semester, while there is no explicit link of this course to the subsequent courses on semesters 2 to 5. There are listed 10 learning outcomes in mathematics, 6 in pedagogy and 8 in general competences. Obviously, having only one course in didactics of mathematics and not having school practice, the learning outcomes in pedagogy cannot be achieved at the required level. Note that the SER mentions that the “Pedagogical Mathematics” of University of Ljubljana was taken as example. However, this is not adequate: University of Ljubljana has a 5-years single cycle (integrated) master study program “Mathematics education”. Another study program that was proposed for comparison (Mathematics bachelor program of Krakow University of Science and Technology) does not contain a single course in pedagogy!
- 4.4. The syllabi contain all the necessary components and were submitted in electronic form. They are detailed enough to get an adequate understanding on the content and other aspects of the subjects. However, the teacher of the subject was not indicated in the syllabi (they were indicated in the SER).
- 4.5. The language in which the study program will be offered is Albanian.
- 4.6. The syllabus of a course is explained and discussed on the first class. The student-teacher relationship seems to be a partnership. The students also highlighted the helpfulness and good availability of the teachers at the meeting with the expert.



- 4.7. The teaching and assessment methods are described in detail in the syllabi. The students had no comments or objections on teaching and assessment methods. Students are directed to do enough independent work - they were quite positive about the support of their studies.
- 4.8. Learning outcomes and other aspects of modules are described in the syllabi and are discussed already on the first class.
- 4.9. The grading system that is used in all Balkan countries is used. The grades are 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 where 5 marks failing and 6-10 are positive. These marks are equivalent to F, E, D, C, B, A, respectively, used in several European countries. The passing level is 50% as widely used in Europe.
- 4.10. Students who are not satisfied with the evaluation of their work have the right to submit a written complaint to the Dean. The procedures are described in the *Statute of UKZ* (article 109). As the ET was explained, there has been no case of rejection of the grade so far.
- 4.11. Currently there is no internship/practical placement in the study program. However, based on the suggestions from students, the subject Teaching practice has been added to the curriculum submitted for accreditation (in the 6th semester). This subject would be implemented after the accreditation.
- 4.12. Cooperation agreements are signed with several public and private institutions. On the other hand, as the study program does not yet have an internship module, the practical implementation of these agreements cannot be evaluated.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment,		+



contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.		
<i>Standard 4.2.</i> The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		+
<i>Standard 4.3.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		+
<i>Standard 4.4.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	+	
<i>Standard 4.5.</i> If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	-	-
<i>Standard 4.6.</i> The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	+	
<i>Standard 4.7.</i> Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	+	



<i>Standard 4.8.</i> Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	+	
<i>Standard 4.9.</i> Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	+	
<i>Standard 4.10.</i> Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA inconsistently assessed.	+	
<i>Standard 4.11.</i> If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	-	-
<i>Standard 4.12.</i> In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units. <i>*To be inserted the overview of the program (with all areas to be filled out)</i>	-	-

Compliance level: partially compliant.

ET recommendations:

1. *Expand the study program to a five-year study program, ensuring compliance with national legislation.*
2. *Supplement the content of the subjects with aspects of applied mathematics and school mathematics.*



2.5. Students

- 5.1. The admission procedure of new students is conducted and the admission criteria defined according to the clauses set in *Regulation on Basic Studies-Bachelor* and in accordance to the legal regulations established by MEST and KAA. For example, the complaints are handled by the Complaints Review Commission. Following the decision of the Complaints Review Commission, the Commission for admission of new student announces the final results. There are special quotas reserved for admission of students from small communities. However, these quotas are not filled in the BSc Mathematics Education program, thus decreasing the number of regular students who can be admitted.
- 5.2. For admission, applicants must submit a diploma and a high school certificate (originals) and the birth certificate as well as pass a test in mathematics. High school graduates from outside Kosovo must validate their diploma in advance.
- 5.3. One group of students at UKZ consists of maximum 60 students for lectures and up to 30 for laboratory work. However, the groups for BSc Mathematics Education are in fact even smaller because of the small yearly intake (up to 25).
- 5.4. Students get feedback on their performance primarily either through Moodle or the Student Service System. The teacher is obliged to issue grades in no more than 7 days after the exam. As the student group is small (currently up to 25 students), the teaching staff is able to obtain and provide feedback during every lecture.
- 5.5. Data processing is unified in UKZ. The electronic Student Management System retains all records for each student, including assessments, colloquium scores, final exam scores etc. The students are provided with the appropriate certificates (Grade Certificate, Diploma and Diploma Supplement).
- 5.6. The procedure for holding the exam is defined by the study program and evaluation process and exam passing are assigned in the course syllabus. The exam from the same subject can be repeated up to 4 times (the 4th to a commission). At the student's request – in reasonable and justified cases – the dean may authorize the student to take the exam at a different time.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 5.7. Completion rates for student registries are maintained for all courses and the program. Average grades, percentage of students who drop out and graduation rates belong to the key performance indicators of UKZ.
- 5.8. Clauses concerning academic plagiarism (including self-plagiarism) form a whole article in the *Regulation on the Code of Ethics in UKZ*. SMU contains an anti-plagiarism option and UKZ is in the process of developing their own software. All diploma thesis in UKZ are verified for anti-plagiarism. During the site visit the UKZ representatives admitted that there have not been any issues of plagiarism, possibly due to the small community and the spirit of cooperation.
- 5.9. The rights (including appeal procedures) and obligations of students are stated in the *Regulation on Basic Studies-Bachelor* which is a publicly available document. The student rights and responsibilities are also communicated in a student-friendly manner through the Student Handbook. Issues of non-academic conduct are regulated in the UKZ Statute. Students have the right to file a written complaint to the Dean about the grade they received. The complaint must be filed within two (2) working days after the results are announced. However, the ET learned that the practice of contesting marks is not usual in this study program. This was explained by the excellent preparation of the students admitted.
- 5.10. The transfer of students between the higher education institutions, faculties of the university, and study programs is regulated in the *Statute* of the university and *Regulation on Basic Studies - Bachelor*. Transfer from other universities is possible only for those who have completed at least 50% (in ECTS) of studies in their home/sending university. Transfer of students from other programs is done through the Commission for the recognition of transfer exams based on the documentation (transfer request, certificate of exams given, etc.) required by the competition. The SER states that until now there have been 11 cases of student transfer from other institutions to the BSc Mathematics Education. During the site visit the ET learned of actual cases of student transfer to UKZ and was assured that the transfer process is organised smoothly and takes place in a consistent way.



5.11. Consultations can be organized in individual or group form. Academic staff is required to be available to students on a regular basis (each member for at least 2 hours a week according to the Senate's decision), for both academic and advisory purposes. Additional hours of consultations with academic staff may be organized.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 5.1.</i> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	+	
<i>Standard 5.2.</i> All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	+	
<i>Standard 5.3.</i> The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	+	
<i>Standard 5.4.</i> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	+	
<i>Standard 5.5.</i> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	+	
<i>Standard 5.6.</i> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	+	
<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	+	
<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	+	
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	+	



<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	+	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	+	

Compliance level: fully compliant.

ET recommendations:

1. *Continue the development of the plagiarism detection system and ensure that all student works, not only the diploma thesis, are checked for plagiarism.*

2.6. Research

- 6.1. The study program does not have clearly stated scientific/applied research objective. Neither is research mentioned in *Regulation on Basic Studies - Bachelor*. However, research is mentioned in one learning outcome of the study program: "Ability to improve the quality of work by developing mathematical study and research skills". Thus, the research objectives relate only to the field of mathematics; no research objectives have been set for the teaching of mathematics.
- 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are specified in the work contract, in the *Regulation for the Scientific Research Activity at the Public University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan* and the *Statute of the University* and in the *Regulation on Selection Procedures on Appointment and Promotion of Academic Staff*. The performance in relation to these expectations is considered in the self-assessment reports.
- 6.3. Research activities are determined in the *Regulation for the Scientific Research Activity at the Public University "Kadri Zeka" Gjilan* as well as in the *Key Performance Indicators at UKZ*. These are fully consistent with international standards and established norms.



Research is one of the main scopes also in the document *Development Strategy for Internationalization and IRO Action Plan 2020-2025*.

- 6.4. The scope of research of the academic staff harmonizes with the topic they teach.
- 6.5. The SER contained a thorough (26 pages) list of publications and attended conferences. However, the majority of the publications and conferences were from 2018 and earlier. The research of academic staff is internationally visible (for example, in *Google Scholar, GS*). However, according to GS, there are no citations to the articles of about 30% of the academic staff. This means that the scientific impact of some members of academic staff is essentially non-existent. The GS h-index for the remaining staff was between 1 and 5. Moreover, research and development activities are very poorly described on the website of the University. The participation on international research cooperation is small, all international projects listed in the SER were development projects in the framework of ERASMUS program. During meetings with ET, teachers complained about the difficulties of cooperation with leading foreign universities, caused primarily by visa regulations and financial reasons.
- 6.6. Research is basically validated by scientific publications. No information was provided about technological transfer. Technological transfer is not facilitated by the salary system either, as salaries are unified and do not depend on cooperation with companies.
- 6.7. According to the list of publications submitted, only about 25% of academic staff has published at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication per year for the past three years.
- 6.8. The regular academic staff within the Faculty publishes papers on behalf of the University.
- 6.9. No evidences were provided that academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to the courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field. On the other hand, lecturers very often offer topics for diploma thesis according to their research interest.



6.10. The university has adopted Intellectual Property Guideline that regulates the aspects regarding the ownership of intellectual property (IP) developed by staff, students and certain others, together with the procedures in place for commercialization of University owned IP. It covers all University related activities, including research and innovation and student education.

6.11. The prerequisites for student research are insufficient - the study program does not deal with research methods and methodology (research methods and methodology are not mentioned in any subject description). An Erasmus+ project STEAMedu was the only project students were able to name where some students were involved.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		+
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	+	
<i>Standard 6.3.</i> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	+	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	+	
<i>Standard 6.5.</i> The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.		+
<i>Standard 6.6.</i> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.		+



<i>Standard 6.7.</i> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		+
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	+	
<i>Standard 6.9/6.8.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	+	
<i>Standard 6.10.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	+	
<i>Standard 6.11.</i> Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.		+

Compliance level: partially compliant.

ET recommendations:

- 1. Decide on the research priorities of the Faculty of Applied Science and form the research groups accordingly.*
- 2. Specify scientific/applied research objectives of the study program which harmonizes with the research priorities of the Faculty.*
- 3. Develop and implement a motivation system that supports technological transfer and cooperation of academic staff with other institutions.*
- 4. Update the study program either by adding a course in research methods and methodology, or adding topics of research methods and methodology to different existing courses.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources



- 7.1. For satisfying current needs, the university has enough premises and, according to the SER, equipment as well. The University has 25 lecture halls, 5 computer labs and a Laboratory of Natural Sciences, in total of 1485 students at the same time. There are 21 offices for administrative purposes and 19 offices for teaching staff. During the visit it was explained that the Faculty of Applied Sciences has designated premises within the UKZ campus, as explained under standard 7.3. On the other hand, the university needs more premises and human resources for expanding its academic activities. The coverage with mathematics teachers will become critical in the coming years: only 55% of the mathematics subject is covered by three full-time teachers, while two of them approaching retirement age.
- 7.2. The study programs of the university do not have separate financial plans, the financial needs of the study program are covered by the central administration of the university. The Faculty is asking to double the number of students. When asked to provide information on financial plan for study programme with 50 students, the UKZ indicated that the increase of student number does not have an impact in financial terms because no increase in academic staff, maintenance services or space of classrooms is required. However, the ET considers this assumption not realistic, more resources are needed in the long-term perspective. Moreover, the students expressed their wish to have more sport facilities and better equipped laboratories.
- 7.3. The University is the owner of the facilities it uses. The Faculty of Applied Sciences has at its disposal 2 lecture halls, an IT Laboratory, a Natural Science Laboratory, a student consultation hall, regular staff office, administrative staff office, dean's office. As a public institution of higher education, University's financial sustainability is guaranteed by the Mid-Term Expenditure Framework for the next three years.
- 7.4. Considering the current number of students, the number and size of teaching classrooms is adequate. Should the university decide on a more practical approach to teaching and learning (which is highly recommended), the composition of laboratories and other physical space (smaller rooms for group work and space for socializing) should also be revised to allow, among other things, their more intensive use by students for independent tasks and research.



- 7.5. There are 180 places for reading in the Library, about 52 thousand copies of books and about 15 thousand book titles. The university has agreement with the Association of Electronic Libraries of Kosovo to access online digital libraries. The university itself admits that library services are insufficient, especially the availability of electronic databases.
- 7.6. The facility possesses electrical stairs, elevators, emergency exits as well as the entire infrastructure which is needed for students with special needs.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.		+
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.		+
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	+	
<i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	+	



<p><i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:</p> <p>a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;</p> <p>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;</p> <p>e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.</p>		+
<p><i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.</p>	+	

Compliance level: partially compliant.

ET recommendations:

1. *Take active measures to ensure the sustainability of mathematics teachers at the Faculty.*
2. *Revise the library stock, setting the needs of study programs as the priority.*
3. *Prepare a detailed financial plan for the acquisitions required for the implementation of the study program.*



3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The following recommendations need to be considered in relation to the program accreditation:

1. Given the shortage of mathematics teachers in Kosovo's schools, which will worsen in the coming years due to the large number of teachers retiring, a training program for educating teachers of mathematics is definitely needed. There are two options:
 - a. redesign the proposed study program to a bachelor of mathematics study program and develop an additional two-year Mathematics Teacher master's program or
 - b. expand the proposed study program to a five-year teacher training program. As the University of Prishtina trains mathematics teachers according to the 3 + 2 scheme, the preparation of a one-cycle (i.e. 5-year) master's program may be preferable in UKZ.
2. UKZ should take extra efforts for assuring necessary number of applicants and sustainability of the study program. The number of applications for the study program has decreased over the last three years to just 29 in 2021. The small number of students does not guarantee the long-term availability of the required number of mathematics teachers.

Overall compliance:

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
2. Quality management	Partially compliant
3. Academic staff	Substantially compliant
4. Educational process content	Partially compliant
5. Students	Fully compliant
6. Research	Partially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Partially compliant
Overall compliance	Partially compliant



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the *Bachelor of Mathematics Education* study program offered by University of Gjilan is **partially compliant** with the standards included in the *Accreditation Manual* and, therefore does not recommend to accredit the study program.

Expert Team

Chair

Peeter Normak

25.05.2022

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)

Member

Asnate Kažoka

25.05.2022

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)