Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo

Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

UNIVERSITY "Haxhi Zeka" OF PEJA

B.Sc. Business Management

RE-ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

01 July 2022, Hamburg, Germany - Riga, Latvia

1. INTRODUCTION

2

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

0

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

1

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Context

Date of site visit: 14. June 2022

Expert Team (ET) members:
- Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga
- Mr. Christopher Bohlens (student expert)

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Flamur Abazaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

Sources of information for the Report:
1. Self-evaluation Report (SER);
2. Annex (Agreements, Rules, CVs, Strategies, Manuals, List of Publications, Statues, Syllabuses)
3. Online meeting with the representatives of the University as of 14.06.2022
4. Website of the Institution

Request of additional documents:
- Statistical Data for the Study Programme
  A course of study statistics showing. The values should be broken down by semester.
    a. Number of applicants
    b. Number of admissions
    c. Number of first-year students with differentiation according to gender
    d. Students in semester
    e. Dropouts
    f. Students in standard period of study
    g. Students over the standard period of study
    h. Number of Graduates
    i. Average graduation grade for each cohort of graduates
  Please provide figures for the last three study years **for each category.**
- MoU with industries for the internships.
- Research objectives of the program.
- Provide the list of employed full time staff for each student group according to Standard 3.5.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

2

- Strategic Plan of the Faculty of Business
- List of research priority topics

Criteria used for program evaluation:
- Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of KAA, 2021
- Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact, Sustainability

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

1.2 Site visit schedule

Programme Re-accreditation Procedure at **University of Peja "Haxhi Zeka"**	
Programme:	**Business Management, BSc**
Online site visit on:	**14 June 2022**
Expert Team:	1. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga 2. Christopher Bohlens, Student Expert (TBD)
Coordinators of the KAA:	1. Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, SO for Evaluation and Monitoring 2. Flamur Abazaj, SO for Evaluation and Monitoring

Site Visit Programme

Time	Meeting	Participants
09:00 – 09:45	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated	**Prof. Asoc. Dr. Halit Shabani** *(Dean of Faculty of Business)* **Prof. Ass. Dr. Fisnik Morina –** *(Vice Dean for Teaching, Student Affairs and Scientific Research)* **Prof. Ass. Dr. Vlora Berisha –** *(Vice Dean for Finance, Budget and Infrastructure)* **MSc. Liridon Cukaj** *(Secretary of the Faculty of Business)*
09.50 – 10.35	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff	**Prof. Dr. Ibish Mazreku** *(Member of Quality and Evaluation Management Council)* **Dr. Sc. Donjeta Morina,** *(Cordinator of Quality)* **MSc. Zijad Sabotic, Ph.D. (cand)** *(Teaching Assistant and member of commision of quality insurance)* **Besa Gora** *(Student affairs oficer)*
10:40 – 11:40	Meeting with the heads of the study programme	**Prof. Ass. Dr. Vjosa Hajdari** **Prof. Ass. Dr. Alma Shehu** **Prof. Dr. Husnija Bibuljica** **Prof. Asoc. Dr. Halit Shabani**

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

		Prof. Ass. Dr. Suada Ajdarpasic
		Prof. Ass. Dr. Suada Dzogovic
		Prof. Ass. Dr. Anita Cucovic
		Dr. Sc. Driton Sylqa
11:40 – 12.25	Lunch break (provided at the evaluation site)	
12:25 – 13:10	Meeting with teaching staff	**Prof. Dr. Edmond Beqiri** **Prof. Dr. Florin Peci** **Prof. Ass. Dr. Bashkim Nurboja** **Prof. Ass. Dr. Ylber Januzaj** **Prof. Ass. Dr. Zirije Hasani** **Prof. Ass. Dr. Mersiha Kalac Kacamakovic**
13:15 – 14:00	Meeting with students	**Blin Zeli** *(Student in First Year)* **Edona Tofaj** *(Student in Second Year)* **Florian Berisha** *(Student in First Year)* **Edona Alija** *(Student in Second Year)* **Altina Gashi** *(Student in Second Year)* **Almedina Hodzic** *(Student in Second Year)*
14:05 – 14:50	Meeting with graduates	*This study program has not yet managed to have graduate students, for the fact that three years have not yet passed.*
14:55 – 15:40	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders	**Ms. Zana Lipoveci** *(Human Resourse Manager in Elkos Group)* **Mr. Fatmir Asllani** *(Deputy Mayor of the Municipality of Peja)* **Ms. Irefete Pasha** *(High Official in the Kosovo Financing Agency)* **Mr. Shefqet Dervishaj** *(Director of the Tax Administration of Kosovo)* **Mr. Kenan Bardhaj** *(Business Client Adviser in ProCredit Bank)* **Mr. Agron Lajqi** *(Manager of Rugova Company)*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

15:40 – 15:50	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts	
15:50 – 16:00	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program	**Prof. Asoc. Dr. Halit Shabani** *(Dean of Faculty of Business)* **Prof. Ass. Dr. Fisnik Morina** *(Vice Dean for Teaching, Student Affairs and Scientific Research)* **Prof. Ass. Dr. Vlora Berisha** *(Vice Dean for Finance, Budget and Infrastructure)* **Prof. Ass. Dr. Vjosa Hajdari** *(Head of Programm)*

1.3 A brief overview of the institution and programs under evaluation

University "Haxhi Zeka" is a promoter of business and trade, as well as art and culture, has built an educational profile based on the long tradition of the city of Peja as a city with highly developed culture and art. In 2012, the Faculty of Business in Peja became the basis for the development of the newly established University "Haxhi Zeka" in Peja, and became an academic and scientific unit of the University.

Currently, the University Haxhi Zeka is the second largest public university in Kosovo, with over 10.000 students, 5 faculties and 13 study programs. The study programs offered are study programs organized according to the Bologna system, three-year with 180 ECTS, respectively 4-year with 240 ECTS at the Bachelor level, while two-year with 120 ECTS, respectively 1-year with 60 ECTS.

The bachelor study program in Business Management (started 2018) represents the equivalent combination of basic theoretical knowledge and specific professional skills. The structure of the program includes studies which by nature are dynamic and interactive. The program is designed to offer general courses in economics, management, accounting, finances, budgeting and auditing, courses that enable training in research and subjects that are directly related to the Specializations within the program, chosen by the students.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

The Business Management Program, part of the Faculty of Business, is a three-year inspiring and challenging program that helps organizations that aim for perspective and want to be competitive in the market. The program ensures quality of teaching and learning and each of the courses contains targeted learning outcomes and attractive learning methods.

The ratio between the theoretical and the practical part in most curricula is 50:50 but in some curricula even 60:50. The practical part will be realized in institutions, businesses with which the University "Haxhi Zeka" / respectively the Faculty of Business have memorandum of understanding / cooperation agreements.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1 Mission, objectives and administration

The mission of the University "Haxhi Zeka" in Peja (UHZ) is to create an environment and transformative academic experience in order to realize the full potential of students, to apply advanced scientific standards and to help the economic development of the region of Peja and the country in general.

The 180 CP study program Bachelor in Business Management is a basic study program in Albanian and Bosnian language that offers scientific and professional education in this important field of study. It is a study program to provide a thorough knowledge in the field of Business Management. The program provides links between theories and practices that provide a solid foundation for the diversity of business management and leadership.

The majority of employers in the private sector in Kosovo are Small and Medium Enterprises and a significant part of start-ups. Taking this into account, as well as the current demands in the labor market related to business management, the program is designed to include the most appropriate Specialization for the current needs in the labor market. So, the Business Management study program has two Specializations in Business Administration and Banking and Finance.

The Business Management program aims to respond to the need for qualified employees, where students graduating from the Business Management program will be qualified to work within the market economy as well as the professional leadership of a business.

Many developed countries have adopted the entrepreneurial thinking approach, which has proved fruitful for the development of the country. Kosovo, as a country still shaping its economic identity, welcomes an entrepreneurial thinking approach about solving the country's economic problems.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

Thinking with such an approach would empower the economy by instilling in young people the idea that jobs do not necessarily have to be found, they can also be created by themselves. So, a contemporary study program that prepares young people with entrepreneurial mentality and enables them to run/manage a business is more than necessary for the economic development of the country.

The study program is designed in accordance with the objectives of the respective study program, its curriculum and its teaching activities. First-cycle studies provide basic knowledge on general scientific methods and principles and specific skills in a wide variety of professions and specialties. This program is based on this standard, applying Bachelor studies of Level 6. These diplomas are at the Level 6 of qualifications in the NQF (National Qualifications Framework) with Credit Values of 180 ECTS credits (6 semesters), it is also harmonized with the "Bologna Process" and the requirements of the law "On Higher Education in the Republic of Kosovo" also the European Higher Education Qualifications Framework.

The Business Management program at the Bachelor level is designed with a high level of compliance with similar programs of the University of Ljubljana and the University of Malta, about 80 % similarity of the courses that make up the programs.

There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. They are public to all staff and students. The staff and students comply with internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching and assessment in academic and administrative activities.

All the relevant policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of the programme are periodically reviewed. Depending on the general social changes and institutional needs for quality increase, institutional cooperation, exchange of staff and students, etc., the procedure is initiated through professional commissions, from receiving comments of all academic and administrative staff before approval by the competent authority of the change and amendment of regulation.

In general, it is noticeable in the study program that the research activities as well as the involvement of the students in the research activities are not yet at a good level. Therefore, the university should make corresponding efforts to increase the research activities.

Standard	Compliance

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: 83 % - Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The research activities could be increased by appropriate concepts and under it also the systematic consideration of students under it is understood.*

2. *The study program should strive for a revision of the didactic and teaching concept concentrating on three priorities: (1) creating a coherent concept of student-centered teaching and learning, (2) integration of modern teaching practices, (3) visible integration*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

of research at the program level and strengthening the linkages between teaching and research.

3. *The didactic concept should take into account all relevant stages and elements of the teaching and learning process. This would include assessment approaches and choosing a coherent overarching concept or fundamental principles which align the main stages and elements of teaching and learning.*

2.2 Quality management

The SER contains a description of how quality management at the university works and which instruments it contains. The quality assurance instruments and measures are described to evaluate, monitor and control the quality of study programs, teaching process, learning, research, community academic staff input, administrative services, teacher performance and the governing bodies of the faculty. Further information about the quality assurance assessment and planning processes are integrated into the University strategic documents and the strategy of the faculty.

The Faculty has created an experience for the evaluation and review of curricula in consultation with the advisory and industrial board, which consists of labor market actors as representatives and other private sector, conducting the analysis of the achievements of the Bachelor program. The evaluators can see here that the integration of professional practice works very well to capture the needs of the labor market.

One of the survey instruments used is the survey within the framework of course evaluation, which students fill out and are made available to the teachers and responsible persons. There is no discussion of the evaluation results with the students. In addition to the course evaluation, the university has implemented further surveys. Their results are used in the context of internal quality management, but are not published further. Accordingly, the transparency of these results is lacking. The university has established a process to review the questionnaires regularly.

It remains a challenge for the university to carry out numerous evaluations, especially in the case of pen and paper evaluations, when evaluation fatigue sets in. The university can, for example, counteract this if it communicates more transparently what the evaluations are for and what measures have been taken on the basis of these results. A general report of the university's evaluation results is available annually, but it is clear that the results could be better communicated within the university so that all status groups are aware of the changes based on the results of the evaluation. This should lead to the establishment of a quality culture at the university.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

From the available documents and the discussions on site, it is clear to the experts that the data collected will also be used for continuous development. The corresponding responsibilities have been defined and are carried out by the appropriate persons. Previous evaluation results have also led to corresponding adjustments to the study programmes, including study content and professional qualification.

In the university's own SWOT analysis, a number of points have already been mentioned which state that the university should also pursue itself. Overall, the evaluators come to the impression that the university has undertaken a great deal in the area of quality management in recent months, but has not yet fully consolidated this in its processes.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.		X
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: 88 % - Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Discussion of the course evaluation results with the students. The results of the course evaluation could be discussed with the students. The lecturer can discuss the results with the students and present them during the course. This should promote the dialogue between the students and the lecturer.*

2. *Feedback from employers is already secured through the IAB. However, a survey of employers should be institutionalized alongside this exchange body.*

2.3 Academic Staff

All academic positions at the University "Haxhi Zeka" are described in the relevant documents of the UHZ which are publicly announced for the public as: Law on Higher Education, the Statute of the University, Regulation on selection procedures relating to the appointment, removal and advancement of regular academic staff at the "Haxhi Zeka" university in Peja and the Regulation of Evaluation Procedures for engaging external collaborators at "Haxhi Zeka" University in Peja.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

The regular academic staff consists of 17 professors and 10 assistants in the respective fields. In addition, 15 persons are involved as part time academic staff. According to Article 166 of the Statute of University "Haxhi Zeka", staff in regular employment cannot have another full-time employment contract in any Higher Education Institution. Also, full-time staff, who may be engaged, elected or appointed to another public institution, do not have the right to be elected to governing bodies, but have the right to vote.

Over 50 % of the academic staff who teach at the bachelor and master level are regular staff, however, no additional information was provided for academic staff involved in the current study program.

The SER doesn't provide the evidence for Standard 3.5., that for each student group and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions. However, after the request of the experts, such information was provided, which confirmed the fulfillment of the standard.

Having mainly a new and young staff, the Faculty of Business has motivated and created conditions for its staff to participate in various programs such as: Fulbright Faculty Development program, Training abroad, various workshops, seminars, staff mobility academic etc. This fact was also confirmed by the academic staff during the site visit.

Faculty are required to hold office hours for students, and each faculty must designate a consultation day of at least two (2) hours during the week. However, the involvement of academic staff in community service was unclear.

The evaluation of the quality of teaching by students is done once a year through anonymous questionnaires coordinated by the special commission of studies. The questionnaires are compiled in detail by the committee of the academic unit, based on the standard structure of the questionnaires provided by the Senate and which are stored and used in a computerized manner and are anonymous. Ten percent (10 %) of the best annual teaching quality assessment results are published by each committee leader. At the same time, the faculty has 2 other evaluations such as: the questionnaire for the evaluation of professors by the dean (once a year) and the questionnaire for self-evaluation for the academic staff (once a year).

After the assessments of students for those teachers who have reached the lowest 10 % of the results in the assessment, together with the commission and the teacher, a decision is made on measures and quality improvement. Also, these results are addressed to the senior management of the UHZ, where from the findings they make the plan for the implementation of quality improvement. It is also worth mentioning that the faculty through various projects has held various

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

trainings which have taught different methods which teachers implement in lectures and exercises that help them develop the most adequate class and use the most up-to-date literature. According to the SER, every academic year teachers update their curricula with up-to-date literature no older than 10 years old, however, experts have noticed that many curricula still contain old literature, especially in the local language.

Standard	Compliance Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.		X
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: 80 % - Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Continue evaluating and improving the standards of quality of teaching and learning by addressing the following staff KPIs (Key Performance Indicators):*
   - *Module monitoring processes and course team meetings (e.g. Course Committee);*
   - *Views of the External Examiners for the course/ programme/ individual module - their visit and reports;*
   - *Student performance data, career progression and feedback from alumni;*
   - *Participation in Department Learning and Teaching events and conferences;*
   - *Peer observation of teaching as required (with development of appropriate observation criteria);*
   - *Staff appraisal in terms of identifying staff development requirements;*
   - *Staff membership of the educational and professional bodies;*
   - *Staff involvement with learning and teaching research initiatives.*

 2. The Faculty should recognise that teaching observations/ peer-observations should be carried out throughout the academic year on a multiple basis to obtain a full picture on one's performance. Also, in addition to teaching observations, a variety of other methods should be effectively deployed to fulfill the performance management function in full (360° appraisal, line manager's observations, performance review meetings, etc). Teaching observation

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

should be collaborative and centered around a professional and supportive dialogue. This can particularly be achieved when design of the process is informed by such criteria as planning, presentation, teaching approach and aids to share good practices in teaching (as well indicate one's performance). Finally, it is important to assess student response to one's teaching (e.g. general atmosphere, level of student engagement, etc.).

3. Actively involve academic staff not only into regular CPD and research activities but also consulting activities in terms of delivery planning and quality enhancement at the Faculty level.

4. Nominate staff who can take lead on developing manuals/ teaching resources for Blended Learning Model in the light of current external challenges and transition to on-line learning model.

2.4   Educational process content

According to the SER, the university principle guide strictly follows the Bologna system and Dublin descriptors regarding the qualification objectives. The BSc in Business Management program is a specific program that emphasizes the preparation of students on managerial, financial, accounting and auditing concepts. However, the specializations are in "Business Administration" and "Banking and Finance", as a result, the program does not focus enough on business and banking. Moreover, the previous accreditation was for three specializations, including accounting and auditing, and this specialization has been abolished under this accreditation. During the site visit, the experts raised this issue several times and received the answer that this is in line with the needs of the industry, the accounting specialty should be provided at the master's level, and there is no need for a bachelor's degree. According to experts, you cannot offer an accounting specialization at the master's level unless you provide a good foundation at the bachelor's level. However, when analyzing the curriculum, it becomes clear that accounting-oriented subjects predominate in elective courses. Thus, as a result, this may provide the necessary foundation for an accounting specialization at the graduate level, however, it is still unclear why such a specialization would not be offered at the bachelor's level. In addition, during the meeting with the students, most of them were with the specialization "Accounting".

Analysis of Study Plan and Syllabuses shows that it contains too many "Fundamental" subjects, given the number of ECTS, these subjects should have independent titles. Too many accounting subjects are offered as electives while banking and business administration are not widely offered.

According to the SER, the BSc level program in Business Management is built in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework and the European Qualifications Framework and contains

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

a total of 180 ECTS credits. However, according to the National Qualification Framework, learning outcomes are to be specified in three categories – as knowledge, skills and competence. Such classification isn't used in Course Syllabuses and Study Program. Also, site visit meetings with academic staff and department members confirmed that such requirements do not exist. These categories are to be translated and listed in at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation (Standard 4.3 of KAA). The SER includes only 7 general learning outcomes, while there are no learning outcomes for each specialization. In addition, they are not classified as knowledge, skills and competencies. For instance, according to the SER 1. Outcome students will demonstrate theoretical and professional knowledge of management, finance, accounting and auditing, while the specialization in banking is missing.

Standard 4.4. Each syllabus should include clearly: (i) Course description, (ii) Course objectives, (iii) learning outcomes, (iv) teaching methodology, (v) assessment methods, (vi) literature and (vii) as well as the learning plan of topics covered in each week of lectures. The related Course Syllabuses check show that the Course description, Course objectives and Learning Outcomes are the free interpretation of the teachers. For example, some course descriptions present topics that cover the subject. The same is true for Course objects, as some define it as the purpose of the subject rather than the objectives. Although the teaching academic staff are great professionals in their own areas, it is becoming important to ensure the "learning outcomes" with classification knowledge, skills and competences, are written down for each subject in Syllabuses both for the deep understanding of students and professors. The information included in Syllabuses in SER is different from provided in Annexes. It is unclear why syllabuses were included in SER, just to increase the number of SER pages (64-182 pages)? Moreover, the literature is very old, many books are dated from 2004, and few books are from 2019/2020.

The language of the program is Albanian and Bosnian. The students in the language in which have applied for the study program, must respect all the rights and obligations required by the program itself and as such must fulfill them. Adequate academic staff is appointed in albanian and bosnian languages. As the experts found out during the site visit, the majority of Bosnian language teachers are recruited as part-time teachers.

The student-teacher relationship is very important to university, this is closely linked to transparency. In the syllabus of the course, the academic staff is obliged to list the learning outcomes and topics that will be taught in order to achieve the learning outcomes. Furthermore, the assessment process is designed to ensure that learning outcomes are achieved. Academic staff is required to explain in detail the syllabus to students in the first lecture and make the curriculum available to students.

A variety of teaching methods employed offer possibilities for active learning. These include case studies, project work, problem-based learning and simulated learning. The practical part is mainly

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

implemented through case studies from the literature and practical knowledge for private and public enterprises and commercial organizations, creating interactive professor-student relationships as well as student-student relationships.

Standard 4.8 in the SER only provides information on student workload and not student assessment mechanisms. The experts received the answer during the site visit that this information is explained in the curricula for students, however, the student assessment mechanism is wider than just the part of how the professor evaluates the student.

University "Haxhi Zeka" in general and the Faculty of Business in particular have agreements and collaborations with private and public institutions and companies which are ready to provide internships for their students. Following a site visit and an additional request from the experts, MoUs were submitted to assess the degree of cooperation.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment,contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		X

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	X	
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.		X

Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ECTS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	X	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: 75 % - Substantially complaint.

ET recommendations:

1. *Include and reflect the issues of SER educational process content according to NQF, and standards   of   KAA.*

2. *Remove the mistakes from the Syllabus as well as include all necessary elements (from general requirements up to didactics), with the use of technologies, etc.*

3. *Learning outcomes should be defined in three categories: knowledge, skills and competences, and their quantity should be regulated, since each learning outcome must subsequently   be   achieved.*

4. *The experts recommend implementing a more systematic approach to assure the achievement of learning outcomes on a yearly basis. This could be done by the Study*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

Programme Management or an independent group within the faculty or the HEI.

5. *It is recommended to review the study courses titles and their content. For example, too many "Fundamentals" subjects, given the number of ECTS; some subjects should also be reviewed, such as Fundamentals of Accounting and other elective subjects with a focus on accounting, to instead include more subjects with a focus on banking and business administration.*

2.5   Students

The area of university admission and admission procedures are documented and are applied in the study programm. The documents regarding the admission and vacancy are published on the University's website.

At the state level it is regulated by the law on higher education, the university statute and the internal regulations of the university. The recruitment procedure is transparent and public, starting with the public announcement of the competition for admission of students for the respective academic year. Those interested applied through the online system, after reviewing the documents.

In the study programs of the first cycle, up to 250 in Albanian Language plus 50 in Bosnian language are accepted to enroll. The Faculty has divided into groups the participation of students in the teaching process by dividing them into groups for lectures which are up to 100 people and dividing them into groups for exercises which are up to 50 people.

The university has a University Management System (SMU) which provides appropriate performance tracking. Relevant documents containing the rights, obligations and other information regarding the study program are published on the website. There is also a student handbook and the Bachelor degree criteria. Replacement of the program and transfer from other Universities is defined.

The Faculty of Business through the Quality Office keeps all records and statistics on student enrollment, completion of their studies, passing reports and student transfers (mobilityQuality assurance focuses on academic issues, teaching and learning, and relates approximately to those services that directly support students such as the library, student service, and career center.

The entire process of reflecting the results of students is regulated by bylaws and applied through the electronic system. The student examination and papers are subject to the anti-plagiarism system which is applied at the level of the academic unit and the university.

Students within each faculty are also organized in the Student Council as well as the Student Parliament to guarantee their rights. Students are an active part of the University's governing bodies, such as the Senate, the Faculty Council, and are part of any committees created at the faculty level.

Participation in workshops, establishment of contacts through collaborative memorandums with public institutions as well as with private sector operators are some of the ways that are used to inform students and enable their access to the labor market, in accordance with the requirements of his needs.

According to the available documents and after the discussions at the university, the evaluators can also state that the lecturers are accessible to the students and can be approached for problems.

In the university's own SWOT analysis, a number of points have already been mentioned which state that the university should also pursue itself. During the interviews the students were able to confirm the good impression of the evaluators. Many of the students would go afterwards into a further Master Programme at the university.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: 100 % - Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The Support for student initiatives must continue.*

2. *A strategy should be developed and implemented on how to deal with so many students dropping out.*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

23

3. *Students with problems especially in quantitative subjects like mathematics and statistics should be further supported by appropriate tutorials.*
4. *Faculty should strategically consider even further the topic of English in courses. The actual implementation of the use of English is not strong. In order to ensure the connection to international programs and an exchange, the use of English modules would be important.*

2.6 Research

The Faculty of Business has implemented numerous activities to achieve the objectives set out in the Strategic Plan 2020/2024 of the University and the Strategic Development Plan of Faculty of Business 2020/2024. However, the faculty does not have its own research home page. It would be necessary to create a separate research section on the Faculty homepage: Priority research directions for each Department; Journals, Conferences etc. As a positive practice, experts assess the placement of publications and participation in conferences for teaching staff on the homepage of the faculty.

The study program does not define the objectives of scientific / applied research (6.1 st.), only in the University Research Strategy for 2019/2024 general goals are mentioned, and in the Strategic Development Plan of the Faculty of Business for 2020/2024 mentions the establishment of a project office, a professional research institute, etc. During the site visit, representatives of the faculty provided information on financial support for research activities, which is positive, but only part 6.1. Standard. At the request of the experts, the objectives of the program were also presented, but the experts had the impression that the documents were created on demand, but should be an integral part of the research activities of the faculty and the study program.

In 2020, the Faculty of Business received two scientific projects from the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation (METI).

The Office for Scientific Research within the University ensures that all academic staff are informed of all tasks and obligations that must be performed by them in order to achieve the plan and objectives in the field of research. Such activities are implemented in order to increase their performance as well as the institution. Moreover, from 2021 the academic staff has been given the opportunity of continuous promotion through the publication of any scientific activity on the official website of the institution. This initiative has raised great interest from all staff, influencing their greater engagement in various activities, such as: participation in conferences (physically and online), participation in workshops, seminars, lectures and various symposia, etc.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

24

Neither the SER nor the web page contains the research priorities of the study program and the faculty, however, at the request of the experts, such priorities were provided. However, the research priorities are too broad, while only a few priorities should be targeted, usually no more than five.

According to the SER, The Faculty of Business has drafted a research plan based on statutory provisions and research policies in the framework of the Strategy for Scientific Research, as well as the Regulation on Scientific Research Activity of the University "Haxhi Zeka" (Standard 6.3.), however, no evidence was provided.

When selecting academic staff, one of the criteria is their involvement in research in their respective fields. This means that the research history of academic staff is closely linked to their teaching process. The experts confirm that the research topics are closely related to the subjects delivered.

Considering the support that UHZ offers, the academic staff of the Faculty of Business, constantly works on various researches that result in local and international papers and scientific conferences. The activities of the academic staff of this unit reflect on their continuous development, enabling the achievement of competitive results at the international level.

Every scientific activity by the academic staff of the Faculty of Business is published under the name of the institution. Applying this, not only affects their individual and professional development, but also contributes to the development and advancement of the institution, influencing the ranking of the institution. In addition, another very important element is the connection of the institution with the databases of scientific works where the academic staff publishes scientific works, in order to verify that the name of the institution is used accurately. For more, the scientific activities of the academic staff are also published in Google Scholar.

Unfortunately, the SER doesn't provide information about the subscription to science databases to promote the research. It is recommended to look for the EU projects to obtain financing for the purchase of databases as Scopus and WoS, as well as data access as Orbis, Market Line etc.

According to the Standard 6.8. academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field. However, the verification of the syllabuses did not confirm this, especially since the literature presented in the syllabuses is rather old, especially in Albanian language. However, during the visit, the experts made sure that the academic staff actively incorporates their research into the educational process.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

25

Experts noticed that most academic staff do not have an ORCID ID or it is empty, we strongly recommend that academic staff create an ORCID ID and update the information to advance their research.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research center or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.		X
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in specialty magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centers, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

26

Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.9. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.		X
Standard 6.10. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
Standard 6.11. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities	X	

Compliance level: 72 % - Substantially complaint

ET recommendations:
1. *It is recommended to develop targeted research priorities showing focused program specialization in several areas with a limited number.*
2. *Create a separate faculty home page with Research section, identifying Priority research directions for each Department; Journals, Conferences etc.*
3. *It is highly recommended to introduce clear criteria for recognized publications.*
4. *It is strongly recommended to improve the quality of collected information by using one template for CV, publication list, presentations at the conferences.*
5. *Networking with international universities in the organization of conferences.*
6. *Stimulate students to apply for the independent research grant and funds from the external funding, donors and projects.*
7. *Apply for projects to get funding for databases such as Scopus, WoS, Orbis, Market Line etc.*
8. *The program should develop and implement measures for better involvement of students in research activities.*
9. *The academic staff should create Orcid ID and update the information regularly.*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

27

2.7 Infrastructure and resources

To implement the study program, the Faculty of Business has 15 (halls) with a capacity of 905 seats in total, 1 library with 84 seats, two computer cabinets with 60 seats and 10 cabinets for teachers with a capacity of 30 seats. The regular academic staff consists of 17 professors and 10 assistants in the respective fields. Also exists SEMS (student management system) which has a positive effect on increasing the quality of management and communication with the student.

In the opinion of the evaluators, the resources for teaching and research are adequate with the exception of access to the literature. The rooms are designed to be barrier-free.

The university has already recognized these problems itself and the experts are hopeful that the university will solve the problems itself. The students could not report any major grievances. On the basis of the documents submitted, the experts assume that there is financial security.

The equipment of the libraries is bad for all universities in Kosovo. It should be noted that legal literature as far as it relates to Kosovan law must be created in Kosovo itself. Because there was no site visit during this re-accreditation procedure, it was unfortunately not possible to check the current holdings of the library.

Due to the documents provided as additional documents, the students have electronic access to the Library, various ebooks and databases of other universities. Therefore, the possibilities for literature research are satisfactory, taking into account the Kosovar conditions. Nevertheless, to maintain Western European conditions, constant further improvement is required.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

28

Standard 7.2. There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilization license; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
Standard 7.4. The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

29

Standard 7.6. The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs	X	

Compliance level: 100 % - Fully compliant

ET recommendations:
None

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

30

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The Panel would like to commend the programme development team for their proactive engagement with the Panel during the validation event. There was a very strong sense of teamwork and ownership exhibited by the programme development team. It is evident that a good level of care and attention has been given to the (re)design of the programmes for the upcoming cohorts of students. Having considered the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme development team, the Re-accreditation Panel recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance Level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	**Substantially compliant**
2. Quality management	**Substantially compliant**
3. Academic Staff	**Substantially compliant**
4. Educational Process content	**Substantially compliant**
5. Students	**Fully compliant**
6. Research	**Substantially compliant**
7. Infrastructure and resources	**Fully compliant**
Overall Compliance	**Substantially compliant**

The overall compliance is assessed by the experts at the level of **Substantially compliant.**

However, the recommendations need to be considered in relation to programmes re-accreditation. This is noted at the end of each chapter.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

31

In conclusion, the Expert Team (The Panel) considers that the B.Sc. Business management study programme offered by Haxhi Zeka is **substantially compliant** with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation Manual and, therefore, recommends to accredit the above study programme for a duration of **five (5) years** with a maximum **150 students in Albanian** and **50 students in Bosnian language** to be enrolled on the programme.

4. APPENDICES (if applicable)

None.

5. EXPERT TEAM

Member

Prof. Dr. Ramona Rupeika-Apoga   **01.07.2022**

--------------..

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)

Member

Mr. Christopher Bohlens   **01.07.2022**

--------------..

(Signature)   (Print Name)   (Date)

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

32