



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

*University “Haxhi Zeka”
in Peja*

General Law, LLB

Reaccreditation

Final-Report of the Expert Team

4 April 2022, Tübingen, Germany



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	2
1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
1.1. Context.....	Fehler! Textmarke nicht definiert.
1.2. Site visit schedule	Fehler! Textmarke nicht definiert.
1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation.....	Fehler! Textmarke nicht definiert.
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	5
2.1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	5
2.2. Quality management	7
2.3. Academic staff	9
2.4. Educational process content.....	11
2.5. Students.....	13
2.6. Research.....	14
2.7. Infrastructure and resources	15
3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	16
4. APPENDICES (<i>if available</i>)	Fehler! Textmarke nicht definiert.



1. INTRODUCTION

1.1.Context

Date of site visit: 22th March 2022

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Prof Dr. Johannes Falterbaum, Duale Hochschule Baden Wurttemberg*
- *Katerina Klimoska, Ss. Cyril and Methodius University in Skopje (student expert)*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Leona Kovaçi, KAA Officer*
- *Flamur Abazaj KAA*

Sources of information for the Report:

1. Self-evaluation Report (SER);
2. Annex (Agreements, Rules, CVs, Strategies, Manuals, List of Publications, Statues, Syllabuses)
3. Online meeting with the representatives of the University as of 22.03.2022
4. Website of the Institution
5. Supplementary documents requested by the ET
6. Comments of the University concerning the Draft-Report

Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations

- Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of KAA, 2021
- Criteria of Relevance, Efficiency, Effectiveness, Impact, Sustainability



1.2.Site visit schedule

- 09:00 – 09:45 Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
- 09.50 – 10.35 Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
- 10:40 – 11:40 Meeting with the heads of the study program:
- 11:40 – 12.25 Lunch break (provided at the evaluation site)
- 12:25 – 13:10 Meeting with teaching staff
- 13:15 – 14:00 Meeting with students
- 14:05 – 14:50 Meeting with graduates
- 14:55 – 15:40 Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
- 15:40 – 15:50 Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
- 15:50 – 16:00 Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

1.3.A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) is the successor of the Faculty of Applied Business Sciences (FSHAB) which was established in 1960 by the decision of the Executive Council of KSAK as the Higher School of Economics - Commerce in Peja. Initially the school had only the Commercial Business Section in the Enterprise and a small number of teachers. In the first year of studies, 1960/61, 120 students were enrolled. Since then, the school has been engaged in training professional staff of economists who responded to socio-economic conditions. The activity and development of the Higher School of Economics has always been oriented towards the construction of that kind of regular study curricula that would form economists with modern professional training that will respond to the needs of economic development and business in general. Several thousand economists graduated from the Higher School of Economics from Kosovo and other ethnic Albanian territories (Macedonia, Montenegro, Serbia, etc.).

The Faculty of Law in Peja has started working as a branch of the Faculty of Law of the University of Prishtina in the academic year 2010/2011 based on the decision of the management bodies of the University of Prishtina. The transformation of the branch of the Faculty of Law from the University of Prishtina into an academic unit of the Faculty of Law within the UHZ was finalized in 2011.



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The Faculty of Law includes the Study Programs General Law (LLB) and International and European Law (LLM).

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The organization of the teaching process at Haxhi Zeka University is based on the legislation in force and internal regulations drafted and approved by the University. The main document from which other internal documents originate is the Law on Higher Education in the Republic of Kosovo which sets the main frameworks for the organization of the teaching process. According to the Law, teaching in public universities and other HEIs is done in accordance with the Bologna system and other principles of the European Higher Education Area with the student at the center. The second most important document is the Statute of the UHZ and the third is the Regulation on Basic Studies and the Regulation on Postgraduate Studies (Master). These documents are all public and are applied consistently and transparently by senior management and the management of UHZ academic units.

In accordance with the provisions of the above documents, study programs at UHZ are organized at two levels, respectively at the Bsc. level with three (3) or (4) years, with 180 or 240 ECTS; Master studies last one (1) or two (2) years with 60 respectively 120 ECTS. The statute also enables the organization of joint programs as well as interdisciplinary programs which are approved by the Senate. Studies at UHZ can be conducted on a regular basis (full time) and part time.

Bachelor studies at UHZ aim at the scientific qualification of students through the integration of teaching and research. The teaching is realized through lectures, theoretical exercises, laboratory exercises, practical teaching, seminars, etc. Bachelor study programs end with the work of the bachelor thesis (excluding LLB studies in the General Law Program in which there is no bachelor thesis).

Master studies are conducted according to programs accredited by KAA. The teaching is realized in the form of lectures, seminars, theoretical exercises, practical and field work, professional and scientific visits, discussions, professional consultations and through



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

independent works of students. The master studies end with the preparation and defense of the master thesis in accordance with the study program.

The University organizes studies during the academic year which lasts twelve (12) months while the academic year begins on October 1 and ends on September 30. The active period of studies, lectures, exercises, seminars, colloquia, is divided into two semesters where the winter semester begins on October 1 and ends on January 15 of the respective year, while the summer semester begins on February 16 and ends on May 31 of the respective year. . The study calendar is issued by the Senate no later than May 31 and contains the schedule of lectures, exercises, seminars, exam conditions and deadlines.

According to the Statute, the Office for Academic Affairs also functions within the UHZ. This office is a supporter of the teaching process which constantly provides information to the dean of the academic unit to enable the drafting of semester and annual reports. Before the beginning of each semester, meetings are held between the senior manager and the management of the academic units, where it is ensured that each academic unit has drafted work plans, that each syllabus of the study program is harmonized and complete, as well as all the prerequisites for the start of the academic year are planned. Quality assurance officers in academic units make sure to check the SEMS platform as well as the university website. In terms of continuous evaluation and monitoring of studies. The Studies Commission is an advisory body to the council of academic units which is established for each academic unit. The Studies Commission is responsible for:

- Drafting new study proposals
- Adaptation and modification of existing study programs - Continuous review of university textbooks
- Requirements for change of study programs by students
- Preparing the course for student complaints.

The monitoring of study programs, in addition to being done by the study commission, is also done by the Evaluation and Monitoring Council and the Quality Assurance Office in accordance with the provisions of the UHZ Regulation on the evaluation and Quality Assurance system. The university has also developed performance indicators for each Faculty within the



Republika e Kosovës
Republika Kosova - Republic of Kosovo



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju
Kosovo Accreditation Agency

university, which will help the university monitor and evaluate how well the performance as well as guide policy formulation and set their goals.

In 2019, UHZ has approved the new mission statement and vision. The new mission statement contains the following goals:

- Implement of advanced academic and scientific standards.
- Services for local partner for businesses and industry, local and central institutions, as well as the community.
- Collaborates with international institutions of higher education for staff and student mobility and joint academic, scientific and professional projects.
- Implement of the social dimension of Bologna and the approach based on Human Rights.

Regarding this goals and organisation Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) has adequate structure and institutions as it is usual in western European universities. The self-governance gives the impression to be adequate for the needs of students, teaching staff and for research.

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

2.2. Quality management

The legal framework on the basis of which quality management is developed is good and covers all aspects along the vertical (university-faculty) and horizontal line (professor-student-administration). Through the Council at the University level, in which the faculty has a representative, up to the coordinator at the faculty level. The acts allow the use of tools for filing complaints and appeals if any of the students, academics or administration staff felt that some of their rights have been threatened or violated. The evaluations are performed in accordance with the legally required i.e. each semester before enrolling in the semester the students fill in a questionnaire, as well as on an annual level there is an evaluation of all actors at the faculty (students, academics, administration). The adoption of new acts in 2020 year is to be welcomed, such as Code of ethics for academic staff and students of University "Haxhi

7



Zeka" in Peja, Regulation on quality assurance and quality assessment system at the University "Haxhi Zeka", Act for commission for complaints and objections, Quality assurance guide and Quality assurance strategy of "Haxhi Zeka" University in Peja 2020 – 2024.

The key assumption, here, is how and whether these legal acts are used and whether they are in function of achieving their purpose. From the evaluation process, the experts concluded that more attention should be paid to introducing students to the importance of this process, as well as what opportunities it offers to improve and protect their rights as academic citizens; greater involvement of students in the evaluation process is also needed (according to the documents about 50% participate), as well as encouragement to be honest in their evaluations (according to the documents almost all positions in the questionnaires get average grade over 4, which gives the impression that students fill in only formally and not critically and objectively. The assumption is that this is a case of the mentality in the area itself (R.Kosovo/Western Balkans) on which matter should be worked on and the faculty should contribute to building students' self-confidence and expressing their views). Another aspect that is very important is the existence of an administrative office that will take care of this issue, ie the personnel issue and readiness so that what exists as a legal act can be realized in reality and thus have the impact of improvement. Given that this is a state university, the faculty through the university needs to request and explain the need for additional staff, in order for better quality in the future. The faculty monitors the progress of the activities by the professors themselves, and the experts encourage the use of incentive measures when there are improvements in performance and outstanding achievements and vice versa (pull and push strategy regarding the performances). We recommend the same with the administrative staff.

Students are represented in Faculty's bodies, thought members of their student's parliament. There are Regulation for student elections in "Haxhi Zeka" University from 2015 year and Regulation for student parliament work in the "Haxhi Zeka" University " from 2018 year. Last student elections were carried out in 2021 year, as students informed the experts. At the moment there are two student organizations, each of them participating with own members in student's bodies. Experts encourage students to use their role, provided by the legal acts of the University, with ethical and moral respect with aim for better protection of student's rights but also obligations.

The expert team reviewed closely the faculty comments, which are welcomed. As mentioned before in this report, the basic framework of Quality management at the faculty is solid but the main issue is more proactive use of those tools as well as the approach from all the actors (students, academic, administrative staff) so tangible results could be seen in the future.



Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Make the process inclusive so all students academic and administrative staff participate in open and objective manner, in the processes of quality assurance and contribute to its continuous improvement, so tangible results are met as an end goal.*
2. *Encourage the students to be more proactive and use the tools which are on their disposal in the legal acts concerning quality management*
3. *Make sure the process is guided in transparent and ethical manner, so the results could provide positive impact*
4. *Provide at least one administrative staff who will address the needs of the quality assurance process in compliance with the current coordinator for quality assurance*

2.3. Academic staff

The general conditions of employment are defined by the Labor Law in the Republic, while the special conditions are defined by the Law on Higher Education, the Statute of the University and the Regulation on selection procedures related to the appointment, reappointment and promotion of full academic staff at UH Peja (Annex 9). The UHZ Senate has also approved the Regulation on evaluation procedures for the engagement of external collaborators in the UHZ (Aneks 10). This is in order for the procedure of engagement of external collaborators to be transparent and on the basis of merit as defined by the positive legislation.

Concerning the academic staff of the Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) has since the last reaccreditation process without doubt made big progress. Eleven full-time professors and ten part-time professors are in the academic year 2021/2022 employed. But the assignment to the courses is absolutely not satisfactory.

Based on a random sample, the teaching load of Professor Petrit Nimani and Dean Professor Avdullah Robaj was checked by the Expert Team.



According to the syllabus, Prof. Petrit Nimani teaches a total of nine courses ("Introduction to Law", "Rhetoric and Legal Expression", "Media Law", "Administrative law", "Information Technology Law", "Administrative Procedural Law", "Nomotechnics - the technique of drafting legal acts", "Administrative Law - special part", "Electoral Law"). This means a total of 23 hours of lectures and 13 hours of exercises. However, his contract only provides nine hours a week.

According to the syllabus, Prof Avdullah Robaj is responsible for six courses ("Constitutional Law", "Constitutional Judiciary", "Labor Law", "Administrative Control", "Positive Constitutional Law", "Social Law"). That means in addition to his work as Dean of the Faculty of Law he has a workload of 16 hours for lectures and 10 hours for exercises. He is scheduled for six hours a week.

Even if we take into account that the workload is spread over the summer semester and winter semester and that some elective courses may not take place every time, this planning is no way justifiable. It is also impossible for one person to represent this breadth of different subjects.

This finding suggests that the lecture planning has surly other serious shortcomings.

Regarding the commends given by die Faculty to the Draft Report March 31, 2022 the Expert Team clarify that the employment contract and the appointment decision of these professors are not complained. And their qualifications were not examined more closely. As well it is not excluded that the internal rules of Law Faculty of Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) (perhaps in need of change) are supporting partially this practice. Curial for the valuation is, that this quantity of responsibility for lessons and exercises for individual full-times professors described in the Self-Evaluation-Report is not in accordance with a satisfactory formation for a Law Program with academic level. This applies in particular in view of the breadth of the content of lessens and exercises, partially not included by the employment contracts and the appointment decisions.

Compliance level: not compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The Faculty of Law has to assign the professors in an adequate way the relevant courses in consideration of the academic expertise and foreseen workload.*



2.4. Educational process content

In the Self-Evaluation-Report the Content of the Educational process is described in good works. But checking it, the Experts had the impression that these words are not realized in practice.

The weaknesses are corresponding with the situation of academic staff (see above 2.3.). Further serious weaknesses were found in regard to the literature references in the syllabus.

Concerning all courses, there are references for literature. But mostly the foreseen literature is older than ten years. This is even respecting special circumstances in the Republic of Kosovo not adequate. In addition, reference to electronic access is only made in very few cases.

During the meeting with the responsible representants of Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) 22th March 2022, the Expert Team made request as a random sample of seven titles that were specified as basic literature in the syllabus. Three of them could be found in the university, four not. This means that based on this sample, more than half of the necessary literature was not accessible on that day.

This result is in no way satisfactory.

For the substantially progress of the Faculty of Law it is indispensable to improve the contact with institutions of the society (see standard 7, research programs) and over all expand the exchange with abroad für professors and students.

Of course, the Expert Team respect that starting from visa problems it is absolutely not easy for all universities in the Republic of Kosovo. But regarding the academic standard of Western European countries, it is indispensable to make progress in this matter.



Regarding the commends given by die Faculty to the Draft Report March 31, 2022 the Expert Team thanks for the information about the reference of additional literature in the long version of the syllabuses. Additional literature is there given as destined.

While the site visit the institution was asked as a random sample for the following literature, all founded in the syllabuses as basic literature:

1. Isset Morina, the right of obligations to the Entrance to the Legal System of Kosovo, the Academy of Righteousis,in 2019
2. Academic Luan Omari "Principles and Institutions of Public Law", Tirana 2006.
3. Robert Schütze (2016). European Constitutional Law. Second Edition. Cambridge
4. Sabiha Shala (2016).
5. B. Chip, N. Haliti, and A. Synamati – Legal Medicine 2017
6. Stephen Weatherill, Eu Consumer Law And Policy. Edward Elgar, 2013
7. Laws: The law on the relations of obligations

This day the faculty could present only title number 2, 3 and 4. With the commends given by die Faculty to the Draft Report March 31, 2022 were given electronic references for title number 1, written in a different way. The title seems to be just a article in a book. It was not possible to confirm the validity of this link. Notably this link cannot be found in the short or long version of syllabus. For title number 5 and 6 could not be received any reference of this basic literature. Only the information given by the Faculty that access to laws are generally given by links is satisfactory.

So, the impression is maintained that references for literature is for students not satisfactory. Over all references for electronic access should be greatly expanded.

Compliance level: not compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The Faculty of Law has to incorporate electronic access of literature.*
2. *The Faculty of Law should update the references of literature.*
3. *The Faculty of Law has to make big progress in cooperation with universities abroad.*
4. *The Faculty of Law has to make big progress in exchange from professors and students.*



2.5. Students

The Faculty has a solid legal framework regarding the regulation of study programs, such are Regulations for bachelor and master programs, Performance indicators for the study program, The guidebook for young students, Regulation on academic mobility of students at the University "Haxhi Zeka" in Peja, which are brought after 2019 year. The enrolment process is transparent one and on good indicators and required criteria with three committees included before the enrolment is finalized. Although the faculty faces insufficient administrative staff, efforts are still being made to fulfill all requirements and meet the minimum required standard. There is an <http://sems.unhz.eu/> online platform that is designed for students to easily find the necessary information, but also to apply for studies, diploma, transfer, mobility, payments, alumni, rules etc. But it's obvious that this platform must be developed more efficiently in the future asap, since many content are missing when you visit it at the moment. The lectures during Covid – 19 pandemic were guided online, as professors and students informed the experts, but also presentations of lectures are provided after the class, on online platform, which is very welcomed. Mobility of students are also week issue even there is legal act for this, but more proactive approach must be made since there is no evidence any student made student mobility to other country especially European countries. Here must be emphasize that R. Kosovo still have problems with visa traveling to EU, but nevertheless the faculty should make effort to help students on this. Here, it's important the engagement of the faculty in improving the English language knowledge of student since only that way they could use the opportunity if provided by faculty for mobility outside Kosovo. Also, important part of the studies should be the internship which students could carried out during their studies, experts think that this must be implemented in near future. Lectures and tutorials are performed by the professors since lack of teaching assistants but occasionally there is evidence of student's engagement during the class which is welcomed if it's not regular practice of fulfilling the professor's duty. Faculty should have this close look. Providing e-library (at the moment EBSCO) is one of positive example and experts encourage the faculty in providing more in the near future. Only remark on this is that direct access to EBSCO have just professors and students could access via help of professors. This must be changed and better solution should be found via IP address access on Faculty, in case if there is internet for all students, academic and administrative staff at faculty, if not this must be provided asap, so and students could easily access to e-library via faculty's IP. At the same it's unnegotiable for the basic literature to be provided to students no



later than at the beginning of the semester. As students informed the experts, there is a program Friend for a friend in which students help one another, but also there are tutors if needed and group of young researchers in which students participate as well as in the annual conference that faculty is organizing. These are all positive activities but because of lack of academic staff, experts have impression that they are not regularly and properly performed. The final conclusion on this field is that the faculty is making efforts for carrying out the student's needed in accordance with the standards but of lack of staff and budget often in that they perform with no satisfactory results as in the case if the obstacles, mentioned previous, didn't occurred.

Compliance level: substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *SEMS platform must be developed and all content should be there with no delay.*
2. *English classes should be offered to students so their English knowledge is better*
3. *Sufficient academic staff must be employed in order the process is performed without stress*
4. *Internship during study years should be part of the curricula*

2.6. Research

In the Self-Evaluation-Report the Law Faculty of Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) makes general remarks about research. Since its establishment, an important component of the Law Faculty's mission at the Haxhi Zeka University has been the development and dissemination of knowledge through research and scientific publications that critically analyze the development of legal disciplines. In fact, the mission of the Law Faculty relates to the mission of the University Research Strategy and University Development Strategy 2020-2024, which sets the following scientific research objective: Research activity and quality artistic creativity contributing to the development of society. In reviewing the strategic plan and setting strategic objectives, special emphasis this time is placed on the implementation of applied research and the involvement of students in scientific research. The strategic plan envisages identifying and collaborating with businesses and companies that are interested in applied research. In scientific and applied research project conducted by the academic staff of UHZ, students are involved according to their professional competence, so that students become more familiar



with scientific research. To achieve the strategic objective set out in this Strategic Plan 2020 - 2024 on scientific research, expected results are set.

As well in the Self-Evaluation-Report is an impressive publication list of full-time academic staff. This is without doubt respectable.

But the Expert Team is missing concrete research projects with inclusion of students and institutions of the Kosovar society. The Experts have the impression that the SER describes in words abstract goals. It would be very helpful for all participant to develop certain juridical questions and solutions arising from real life and the environment. The Faculty of Law of Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) could develop an important role for the society. Regarding this goal it seems to be helpful to create an expert team and to work out a plan with an concrete agenda.

Compliance level: partially compliant

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

The infrastructure is one of problematic areas of the Faculty. The faculty is using premises together with the Faculty of art, which is not adequate since during the years the number of students went up. At the moment there are 2 amphitheatres, 1 court room, 3 or 4 classroom, on disposal, with caring out classes with approximately 60 students per group for lecture and 40 for tutorial. No argument that these are sufficient premises for carrying out the programs of the faculty.

University has a Strategic Plan of University “Haxhi Zeka” in Peja 2020 – 2024 in which more closely the investment in infrastructures are planed per year. Also, worth mentioning that the Faculty for arts, with whom Law Faculty is using together the same premises, will have new building approximately as planed in October 2022 year. But if that will be the case, it’s not sure, depending on objective circumstances may appeared during next period.

When looked the Strategic plan closely, the income for budget of infrastructure is mostly planned to be from the Ministry, as it is understandable it’s a public university. The experts expects this to be met. Also, experts encourage the faculty, at the moment, to find plus solutions for providing income for better infrastructure (EU founds, stockholders, etc.). At the moment, for the program to be carried out optimally, also solution for renting plus premises (they could



be in municipality ownership, it's a state university to be helped) and making them usable for teaching, should be performed. We emphasize that this is a state faculty which provide higher education in law studies to young people in area of Peja, and due to the living standard is one of a need. Stakeholders and students expressed with no doubt necessity for having this kind of study program at their municipality, with further investment in quality performance.

Also, attention should be put on providing dormitory for students, if the faculty plans in the future to attract students from municipalities not close to theirs. Important task is making faculty friendly towards students with special needs, as a human to human aspect but also and infrastructure friendly.

Compliance level: partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Find plus solutions for additional premises for lectures until the building of Faculty for art is finished*
2. *Find solutions for better technical equipment of the premises for caring out the lectures and tutorials*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The External Experts thank the responsible representants of Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) for their engagement and good cooperation during the validation event. It is evident that the Bologna process requires a high standard and engagement in different aspects for a successful reaccreditation process. The Panel recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance Level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	substantially compliant
2. Quality management	substantially compliant
3. Academic Staff	not compliant



4. Educational Process content	not compliant
5. Students	substantially compliant
6. Research	partially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	partially compliant
Overall Compliance	partially compliant

The overall compliance is assessed by the experts at the level of **partially compliant**.

In conclusion, the Expert Team (The Panel) considers that the Bachelor of General Law study program offered by Haxhi Zeka University in Peja (UHZ) **partially compliant** with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation Manual and, therefore, recommends **not to accredit** the above study program.

Expert Team

Chair

Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum

4th April 2022

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)

Member

Katerina Klimoska

4th April 2022

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)