UNIVERSITY OF PRISHTINA

MANAGEMENT BSc
PROGRAMME RE-ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

21 February 2023, PRISHTINA, BUCHAREST, ZAGREB

1

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 21 February 2023

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Dr. Magdalena Platis*
- *Marko Komšo, Student expert*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Ilirjane Ademaj Ahmeti, KAA Officer*
- *Shkelzen Gërxhaliu, KAA Officer*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self-evaluation report (SER) of Management Programme, BSc, Faculty of Economy, University of Pishtina;*
- *Appendices to SER:* Annex 1 List of Evidence, Annex 2 Statute of UP, Annex 3 Regulation on PhD studies, Annex 5 Regulation on Disciplinary Procedure, Annex 6 Code of Ethics for Academic Staff*,* Annex 8 Sample completed by student assessment, Annex 9 Regulation for Student Academic Mobility in UP*,* Annex 12 Regulation on Selection Procedure of Staff, Annex 13 CV-s of academic staff, Annex 14 Scientific Journal Balkan Economic Review*,* Annex 16 Staff participation in conferences, Annex Annex 18 Course Syllabuses*,* Annex 19 International motilities;
- *Additional documents received after requested by the ET: General statistics about the Form: Faculty of Economics - Department of Management and Informatics – Bachelor, examples of evaluation for academic staff, Meeting reports, Syllabi, Reports designed to address the need for updating the curricula of study programs, Statistics_SEMS 2018.2023, List of staff, List of scientific papers, conferences and trainings 2017-2022;*
- *University webpage and Faculty webpage:* *https://uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=2,1, https://ekonomiku.uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=2,8.*

Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations

- *KAA-Accreditation-Manual, including the Standards and performance indicators for external quality assurance for Re/accreditation of bachelor and master study programs*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

1.2. Site visit schedule

Time	Meeting
09:00 – 09:50	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
09.55 – 10.35	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
10:45 – 11:45	Meeting with the heads of the study programme Management, BSc
11:45 – 12.45	Lunch break (provided at the evaluation site)
12:45 – 13:15	Visiting tour of the facilities and infrastructure
13:15 – 14:15	Meeting with the heads of the study programme Management, MSc
14:20 – 15:05	Meeting with teaching staff
15:10 – 15:55	Meeting with students
16:00 – 16:45	Meeting with graduates
16:50 – 17:35	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
17:35 – 17:45	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
17:45 – 17:55	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

The Faculty of Economics of the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina" was established in1961 and in 1961/62 academic year it started as a joint academic unit together with the Faculty of Law. After 10 years, the Faculty of Economics became itself an academic unit of the university, being dedicated to the preparation of capacities of young generation to take leadership roles in the community through teaching, research, and practice in the field of Economics (SER, page 4). The faculty mission is in line with the mission of the University of Prishtina as a public institution of higher education in Kosovo.

The Faculty of Economics provides studies in all the three academic cycles: a). Bachelor (three years studies), with 6 programmes, in the fields of: Banking and Finance, Management, Marketing, Economics, Accounting, Applied Economics and Management; b). Scientific Master (two years studies), with 4 programmes and c). Doctoral studies (three years studies), with other 4 programmes; both master level and doctoral studies cover the fields of: Banking and Finance, Management, Marketing, Economics (https://ekonomiku.uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=2,8).

4

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

The Management BSc programme was last accredited in 2020 for a period of 3 years, some recommendation being clearly formulated. The programme is intended to provide management education to students to understand how businesses are developed in Kosovo for achieving useful knowledge in the field; also, the programme acts to equip students with skills to take the responsibilities to deal with the challenges of time and context in business organizations (SER, page 12).

In many areas of SER, explanations refer to the faculty or institution organization, in few other, they refer to the programme delivery and implementation. All appendices and additional documents have been considered as evidence, when was the case to.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

The institutional evaluation consists of 7 subheadings through which the administration, organisation and management of the institution, as well as teaching and research are assessed.

2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration

According to the SER (page 12): "The Faculty of Economy has the mission to prepare cadres that contribute to the overall economic and social progress of Kosovo and beyond to advance global knowledge in the field of economy". SER only tries to reveal "The orientation of the study program according to the governing principles of the institution (mission)" which has to do with a declarative preoccupation of providing human resources for the current needs of the economy. In addition, the first recommendation at the previous evaluation (three years ago) was that "Research in management and other disciplines should be emphasized as well, not only Economics" (SER, page 88). This is about considering the mission statement of the study programme, not only to prove that some articles of the academic staff cover the management field. Moreover, the dialog with the heads of the study programme of Management, BSc revealed that the heads did not know about a specific programme mission considering the advancement of the global knowledge in the field of management and also the research orientation. Therefore, the study programme mission could be accepted as being in compliance with the overall mission statement of the faculty, but there is no doubt that the study program could not provide evidence, at the visit date, that it had a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept. The didactic concept is evidenced by the adequate relationship between professors and students, the diversity of the teaching methodologies, and by the administrative support offered for the teaching and learning process. The research concept is integrated neither in the mission, nor in the objectives of the programme. The SER does not reveal any programme objectives, clearly specified and the dialog with the heads could not reveal that they were aware of their role in designing the programme from a strategic point of view.

5

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

The SER does not describe the way the programme integrated learning outcomes defined on academic and professional advice from external stakeholders. The heads of the Management BSc programme could not provide evidence on how they get professional advice and also, the dialog with the employers of graduates and external stakeholders at the visit day demonstrates that all the participants were more than willing to take part in the programme design, but that they did not contribute by now. Moreover, a weakness admitted in the SER is: "The non-functioning of the Advisory Board with the industry limits the business community's contribution to program design".

The students use the Electronic Student Management System; according to SER (page 13): "*Rules of Procedure of the Electronic Student Management System* (see Annex 2)" are in place, but this annex does not exist, as annex 2 represents the University Statute. However, ET accepts that this is a useful system and admits that there are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students. For example: the access to students in the system: https://studenti.uni-pr.edu/. Unfortunately, most of the links provided in the SER (page 15) could not be accessed (the message got was: "Server Error in '/' Application. The resource cannot be found". Moreover, the link to the curriculum (available at https://ekonomiku.uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=2,94) should reveal clearer which academic year it refers to. ET is reserved in considering these regulations as being publicly available but accepts that staff and students are aware of these through the electronic system.

The institution has a Code of ethics which is very old (adopted in 2013), provided as annex 6 (not annex 16 as mentioned in the SER, at page 16). The provided document is in Albanian. The link provided as a set of decisions of disciplinary committees are also old, since 2017 (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/0B_36rMoVdto4endMWUZuWEY4Unc?resourcekey=0-OWAH42S5TZWXoLu_KCUjyw). It was found in English by the ET (direct effort) at: https://fim.uni-pr.edu/desk/inc/media/ADD5A282-4F61-4544-AA42-3C01ACE295AA.pdf. The document covers several areas of unethical behavior and ethical principles, but this is only declarative. There is no clear evidence for any internal mechanisms that all staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities. All participants in the meeting confirmed that there is no plagiarism software in place. ET is aware that institutional documents (for example the Code of ethics) are not the Faculty of Economics responsibility.

The programme delivery should be clearly reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances. SER does not contain any evidence on this matter (page 16). ET accepts the additional documents received after request on the Management programme BSc delivery. Two reports and a descriptive document were provides, for example: http://alled.eu/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/Report-Draft-

6

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

215x215mm_print30092019.pdf and http://alled.eu/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/Kosovo-Skill-Barometer-1.pdf. There is a lot of room for improvement in this area. ET congratulates the organizer of the job fair in 2022.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Revise the mission of the programme considering the management field (not only Economics area) and integrating the research interest and the society engagement in the mission statement;*
2. *Formulate 3-5 objectives of the study programme in a SMART manner (specific, measurable, achievable, realistic and timing) considering teaching, research and society engagement, if the case;*
3. *Increase the role of the heads of the programme in the mission and objectives of the programme, and their responsibility in the entire process of designing and implementation of it, not declaratively, but effectively;*
4. *Create a mechanisms at the programme level to get academic and professional advice in the programme design, including when defining the intended learning outcomes;*
5. *Set a regular and periodical mechanism at the programme level for the programme delivery (at least every 2 years);*
6. *Contribute to the process of revising the Code of ethics by suggesting more clarifications on teaching, research and administrative processes; make sure all staff categories are considered in the revision version.*

2.2. Quality Management

The quality system is developed at an institutional level. According to SER (pages 20-21): "In 2007, the Senate of the University of Prishtina established the Office for Academic Development (OAD), which functions within the Office for Quality Assurance. This office is responsible for supporting the University to establish formal mechanisms related to quality assurance procedures and standards of their programs. In each academic unit, the OAD has one responsible person - the Academic Development Coordinator.... Also, in 2016, the Quality Assurance and Evaluation Regulation at the University of Prishtina (Annex 3) has been approved, which aims at defining the quality assurance and evaluation mechanisms and procedures of the University of Prishtina". Unfortunately, Annex 3 is the Regulation on PhD studies and not the regulation regarding quality assurance. There is no appendix provided in the documents, apart from the Annex 8 Sample completed by student assessment. ET has no doubt that at an institutional level, this regulation exists, but must note poor revision of the SER and its appendices. The regulation was found by the ET at: https://mjekesia.uni-pr.edu/desk/inc/media/51D772F3-CDD0-4302-AD03-8E5B8B2DECE4.pdf; it was approved

7

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

in 2016 at an institutional level. It only refers to two types of evaluations (1. Assessments for institutional accreditation purposes. 2. Assessments for the purposes of program accreditation at the academic unit level.) and does not reveal internal quality assurance mechanisms and tools meant to continuously improve quality in all areas. ET has requested additional documents: " All quality assurance questionnaires / surveys and reports (the latest ones) and the link to all of these publicly available (students, graduates, employers)". What documents were received consisted only in evidence that one type of questionnaire is used, for the academic staff evaluation by their students. Reports on this evaluation were provided, but the document is poor in content. In addition, the only collected mechanisms considered in SER is that of the electronic system: "While this system is now being computerized and implemented through SEMS, it has facilitated the process of making quicker analyses and has made the data generated for staff performance to be more reliable" (SER, page 23). ET is reserved that the mechanism is efficient or functional, since it is no evidence on how many students evaluated how many professors and no open questions were considered. There is no evidence that survey data is being collected from graduates and employers. The results of evaluations (made by students) are not made publicly available. Moreover, during the meeting with the heads of the study programme Management, BSc, ET was suggested to ask the dean directly issues related to how consultation with stakeholders regarding the programme is managed. ET considers that heads of programme should be aware of all internal processes regarding the programme evolution, from the design to implementation and continuous improvement. The discussion with the graduates and employers proved that they could not recall being involved in surveys, at all. Therefore, there is not enough evidence to consider that quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.

Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes. ET asked the heads of the programme during the site visit what improvement can be mentioned as recent achievement and online teaching was mentioned, as well as their interest in improving the internal processes from some benchmark they are doing with similar study programmes in Slovenia and Ljubljana.

Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution. The dialog of the ET with the management of the faculty revealed that all developments are discussed at the department level. In addition, cooperation with the industry is accepted by the management of the faculty as a weakness to be solved when the institute will become effective (Institute for Scientific Research at the Faculty level, which was re-activated in 2018 and currently is in the initial stage of consolidation – SER, page 14).

Quality evaluations provide not adequate overview of quality issues for the overall program or of different components within it; the evaluations do not consider inputs, processes and

8

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

outputs, and have no particular attention given to learning outcomes for students. For example, student surveys that is mentioned refers to 2016 (SER, page 24); even if it was more recent than 2016, since later the current students are considered, the data collected are only about the study satisfaction and willingness to work in companies. Moreover, during the discussion, ET could observe little understanding of the learning outcomes at the programme level.

Results of the limited internal quality assurance system are considered for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates. Two studies regarding labour market were provided as additional documents. Moreover, the dialog of ET with the employers demonstrates that some of the participants consider the graduates of good theoretical level, but that 3-6 months are needed to get them become actively engaged in the professional activity.

The institution and the faculty ensure that reports on the overall quality of the Management programme BSc are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration indicating its strengths and weaknesses. Details on the current and past evaluation were provided in SER (page 5).

According to the article 12 of the Regulation on Quality Assurance and Evaluation at the University of Prishtina:" The evaluation for program accreditation is in line with the dynamics of program accreditation.1.1. Evaluation should be done at least once every five years, as planned." There is not enough evidence if and how quality assurance arrangements are regularly evaluated and improved, since the last regulation was approved in 2016.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Make sure that all staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity; create special files and directory to add evidence on this process;*
2. *Make sure that the quality evaluations provide an adequate overview of quality issues for the programme and its elements; pay proper attention to learning outcomes for students;*
3. *Monitor the continuing improvement in performance, by setting few clear indicators to do that; make sure that survey data is being collected not only from students,but also from graduates and employer and that the results of these evaluations are made publicly available;*
4. *Make sure that at the programme level, a team contributes to the final submission of the SER and eliminate all discrepancies (such as missing appendices or wrong*

9

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

numbers to appendices noted in SER); this team should have full responsibility regarding the content.

2.3. Academic Staff

Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. The SER presents in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic staff, including: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, consulting, administrative activities, but these are not for the study program under evaluation – Management BSc, but for the staff in the Department of Management (SER, pages 29-31). ET observed that at page 11 in SER, a list of academic staff is presented with 15 people. Therefore, 15 academic staff in the tabular form are from the Department of Management teaching at bachelor programme. Considering the need to have clear data, new tables were provided to the E as requested additional documents, and this time 16 people were provided, 2 of them being part time. ET accepts some changes from the date of submitting the SER till the visit date, but expresses concern that during the dialog with the heads of the Management BSc programme, they could not provide data on the number of staff working in the programme. Therefore, 87.5 % of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for more than 50% of the classes of the study program. Asking the teaching staff during the site visit about the teaching load, they all confirmed it and described it according to the information in SER.

The teaching staff comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions. Annex 12 provided in Albanian (ET expresses the regret about this) as annex to SER refer to " The Regulation on Selection Procedure of Staff", was adopted in 2022. Instead, ET was able to study the CVs of the staff and many of them are economists who graduated from abroad (for example, the University of Zagreb). According to the SER: "Courses that are not in the field of management are taught by the professors of other departments" (page 11).

Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity. The description of the workload was provided in the tabular format, and also confirmed by the teaching staff during the site visit.

In SER (pages 36-38) the curriculum is provided having 180 ECTS, with a design of 30 ECTS in every semester of 15 weeks. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

According to the SER (page 33): "Within the University of Prishtina, academic staff are required to have at least two trainings for teaching, which can be carried out at the Center for Excellence in Teaching (QPM) of the University of Pristina "Hasan Prishtina" or somewhere with a center other training at home or abroad. QPM offers training for basic level teaching entitled: Teaching in higher education, as well as advanced training with the title: Planning and implementation of teaching in higher education. This shows that measures have been taken within the institution to train teaching staff in the theory and practice of student assessment, as well as other teaching issues". Therefore, opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, no special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties being needed so far. More experienced staff provide proper orientation to less experienced professors, fact confirmed during the dialog with the teaching staff. The heads of the Management BSc programme also explained to the ET that teaching staff benefited from the strategy for teaching to improve quality in teaching, for example to adapt the syllabi, to promote international mobility, to take part in TEMPUS/ERASMUS projects. Participants in the meeting declared that recent trainings were on writing Horizon projects, on what the students' needs were, on how to introduce case studies based on assessment (during the coffee breaks, professors got the feedback from students who mentioned that they liked the interaction), on open book exam. Therefore, ET considers that strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.

The dialog with the students during the site visit proved that students appreciate some courses taught by some professors, for example - Microeconomics and Business communication – where they talked about real life examples, Business Ethics - where group discussions were encouraged, Projects Management – where they works on proper projects; students would have liked more applied Management course, as it looks too theoretical and more engagement in the Mathematics course. Moreover, during the meeting with employers of the graduates and external stakeholders proved the need for more applied knowledge; participants agreed that the theoretical knowledge is solid, better that that of graduates from other universities, but more practical competences are needed.

The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, should include engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service. According to SER (page 33): "each professor holds four hours a week of consultations (2 times a week from 2 hours), while assistants from six hours a week (3 times a week from 2 hours)". However, the SER does not reveal clear hours dedicated to administrative hours and community service. Only two examples were offered by professors during the site visit (free consulting for a company and ministerial engagement). However, the service to community has a variety of actions that are taken for the benefit of a group in need, and universities are responsible for this third mission. Some professors are totally engaged in extracurricular activities, but there is no evidence that all of them do this.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly only through students; the annexes and the requested additional documents described only this process. There is no clear evidence that it is also done through self- evaluation, peer and superiors' evaluations, at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are not made publicly available.

Teachers retire at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers. According to SER (page 34): "In the Department of Management, teachers retire at the age of 65, as necessary, engagement is allowed until the age of 70 in the absence of staff, or there have been cases for a period when, due to other engagements or other reasons and circumstances, they lose the status of teachers with full-time and are considered part-time teachers".

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Develop/contribute to a visible mechanism for self- evaluation, peer and superiors' evaluations of the academic staff;*
2. *Create a plan of events at the programme level in order to make sure that all staff get engaged in the institution and community service;*
3. *Provide training to all staff on how to provide more applied knowledge to students, through case studies or applied projects, eventually designed with the industry representatives contribution.*

2.4. Educational Process Content

The curriculum described in SER (pages 36-38) reveals a large possibility for elective courses (3/semester) which means that students have the possibility to create their own learning path. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological, and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to civil society and of developing the students' personality. Therefore, according to SER (page 54): "Management students are driven to prepare business plans so they become familiar in a practical way with market research, business management, sales plans, financial reporting and the whole complex of activities that a manager must be prepared to undertake. answers skillfully. Students present project proposals, business plans, and solutions to case studies, thus proving the degree of knowledge acquisition and preparation for the labor market". The subjects included in the curriculum are mandatory and elective, in a logical flow, from introductory disciplines in the business field, to more specific management topics. There are 7 learning outcomes considered for the Management programme, BSc level: Gaining basic

knowledge in the disciplines that form the basis of management practice; Developing an understanding of the foundations of management through the study of fields that analyze different aspects of management; Acquisition of critical analysis skills related to management issues; Developing awareness of managers' responsibilities in the context of the business environment - Developing quantitative skills and being able to apply them in the context of problem-solving; Development of decision-making skills and teamwork in pursuit of organizational goals; Acquaintance with human resources practices and benefiting from the skills to develop best practices to advance the human side of the organization; Acquiring work with software tools for management support (Microsoft Office, SPSS, Microsoft Project, Outlook). (SER, page 55).

The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. These were provided as additional requested documents. Some of them need more revision than others, for example – The Marketing syllabus mentions that this is elective, while the curriculum shows that the subject is obligatory. The syllabi format does not include the academic year it applies to, which would indicate that the content was revised for the academic year in place.

The student-teacher relationship is an adequate partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development. The discussion with the teaching staff revealed that students are sometimes involved in activities together with professors, such as collecting data for surveys. Students mentioned that they would like to have more successful people invited as speakers, to have the exams planned much more time in advance, to have many more workshops available, to have reading clubs, real work in companies, practice to be mandatory.

In fact, all the questions regarding the status of the internships, compared with the Career Development course which is an elective course in semester VI showed a lot of inconsistency. For example, in SER (page 58) it is stated that: "6 ECTS = 200 hours of workload (commitment). 200 hours of engagement / 7.5 hours in one day = 26.67 working days (on average) (minimum one month of work (the duration of practical work (internship) may be longer, but this is the minimum time given) + Bachelor's degree thesis)". On the contrary, 1 ECTS has been calculated as 25 hours, which would mean that 6 ECTS means 150 hours, not 200 hours. In addition, this is not mandatory, but students ask for it. The intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified in the Career Development course and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students, including presentations from companies' representatives, visits in companies, job fair the dialog with all stakeholders confirmed and

13

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

detailed these contributions). The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organizations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.

Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. The strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students. There are different methods used and they are all considered in the syllabi. However, some professors are more interactive than others, but efforts can be made by every academic staff. For example, the least interaction is in the Mathematics course. Moreover, some courses, are not clear enough in the syllabi when referring to the teaching methods; for instance, at the Reward Management and Organizational Performance course, it is mentioned that: "Module will be based on interactive lectures and group work of students. Each lecture will present key concepts and techniques of reward management and organizational performance. Likewise, students will be given assignments that they will solve at home for each chapter to encourage them to learn and develop seminar papers. Assignments will be presented and discussed in the classroom by all students in the spirit of productive interaction, where students will learn from each other with the inputs of the professor where necessary", which is very descriptive and unclear. On the contrary, at Microeconomics, the teaching methods are clearly explained: "Lectures; tutorials using case studies; homework; guest lectures".

The heads of the programme make no effort to improve the student assessment mechanisms to be conducted fairly and objectively. Staff and management recognize that there is no software to fight against plagiarism and moreover, there is no evidence on their intentions to have it soon regulated. Students explained that they know what to expect from each course and professor. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and described in the syllabi. Also, students confirmed that against plagiarism they had no pressure from the teachers' side. Therefore, ET is reserved in considering that there are clear policies and procedures with actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.

SER (page 58) states that: "In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts, or other documents with institutions/organizations/practical training units. First, the Faculty of Economics will sign various Memoranda of Understanding with various institutions, companies and international organizations, which can offer practical work positions for at least one month for the students of the Faculty of Economics. Secondly, students can apply for the various practical work opportunities, which will be announced through the faculty, daily newspapers or through the UP-Career Center. On the other hand, students can propose to the faculty a place of practice,

14

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

which they choose themselves". Therefore, since students can suggest by themselves a place to perform the internship, there is no need for the faculty to provide places to all of them, but at least to a percentage of what can be decided at the faculty level.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Make sure the subjects are taught based on a more applied content; for example, Statistics course could become Economic Statistics (variables become from no-name variables to economic variables and economic phenomena and processes become explained as being statistically related);*
2. *Create a guide at the programme/department level on how to write and review the syllabi (academic year is missing, some include for 3 weeks just presentations, for example – Distribution Management, others 2 weeks for tests);*
3. *Introduce Internship as a mandatory activity for all students;*
4. *Create at least on time/year a collegial cross checking to have the syllabus revised by a colleague and provide training on the teaching methodologies;*
5. *Make more effort in having a plagiarism detector in place for the work of academic staff and students.*

2.5. Students

At the University of Prishtina "HASAN PRISHTINA" Faculty of Economics, Bachelor in Management there is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students. The admission procedure is described in self-evaluation report. Procedure and criteria are clearly stated. The ET considers that the admission criteria are fairly applied to all candidates. This was also confirmed by the students when the ET discussed this issue during the site visit.

At the Management BSc study programme, there is a manual that provides a brief description to understand the use of the system for recording the presence of students and teachers in classes through ID cards with chips. Since 2011, the University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina" has implemented and operated the Electronic System for the Management of Student Affairs (SEMS). All students enrolled in the study program at the Faculty of Economics possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study which is a requirement. According to the SER and confirmed by professors and the faculty management, admission requires at least a high school diploma. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.

At the moment the professor places the grades in SEMS, the student receives a confirmation in the student's email that he has been graded by X professor in X course. The student has 72 hours from the moment the grade is assigned to reject it. Once the student chooses and submits an elective course, he cannot change it. The guide to SEMS is available in the user profile.

According to the SER (page 63): "Study groups are sized to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process. The number of students for lectures in previous years has been very large. In recent years, it has been 150 students per lecture for first year students, while for the second and third year it is 50 students per lecture. This smaller number of students in classes has increased the quality of teaching, and it is anticipated that the number of students in relation to the professor for compulsory and elective courses will be reduced to 25 students, both for lectures and exercises". All students are satisfied with the size of the groups during classes. The professor/student ratio is satisfactory. The smaller number of students in classes has increased the quality of teaching, and it is anticipated that the number of students in relation to the professor for compulsory and elective courses will be reduced to 25 students, both for lectures and exercises.

It should be mentioned that the same exam can be taken three times. If the exam is not passed after the third time, the assessment is done by a committee. The student does not have the right to be absent more than three times to take the exam. If after the fourth time, the student fails to pass the exam, he automatically loses the year. There were no objections to the impossibility of contacting the professor after class. The ET considers that the number of students is satisfactory for interactive teaching.

The feedback that is given to the students on their performance and results of assessments and papers is given promptly and accompanied by advice related to assessment if there is a need for it. At the Faculty of Economics, the Quality Office is centralized at the University level and is monitoring the annual progress rates to provide assistance to any students with any problem that might occur. If there is need for a flexible treatment of students in any special situations it will be provided but in respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.

When students come to the lecture for the first time, they are introduced to all the tasks and obligations that they must follow. Each professor introduces them in detail to their syllabus and they go through it together. The professor presents them with the basic book of the course and reads a list of additional literature Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.

The management of the Management BSc study programme do not apply effective procedures to ensure that work submitted by students is original and not plagiarism. Although there is an anti-plagiarism program at the University level, it is not used on the faculty level because it is only for the English language and does not exist for the Albanian language.

16

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

Professors check for plagiarism on online free anti plagiarism programms if possible and sanction plagiarism if they detect it (professors said so). However, students did not confirm any pressure on them regarding the fight against plagiarism. The plagiarism check is performed by professors also based on their long-time experience. If there is a plagiarism case of the seminar paper or theses from the student, then that work is cancelled. Lack of software for professional detection in the Albanian language is something professors mentioned during their meeting with the ET.

Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available and promoted on the website of the University at the link: https://uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=2,50. There is a procedure for student appeals, and it is regulated. Students' rights and obligations are published on the University official website https://uni-pr.edu/. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents and there is several students who have confirmed that they have used that right to go abroad and study. The ET received the „Regulation for Student Academic Mobility in UP" and confirm that it is well regulated.

The students participating in the meeting during the site visit confirmed that professors are available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice. The professors are at least two times per week for two hours available for consultations and online as well when needed. There is also a form of support provided to students on an individual basis by teachers who are willing to spend time in individual consultations with students.

There is a Student Union at the University level of which they are members from the faculty. The Student Union conducts regular elections that are open to all students. In every faculty body there is at least one student member. Regarding the administration service, it offers support advice to students from Monday to Friday from 10:00 to 15:00, with the exception of Thursdays when there are no pairs (break: 12:00-13:00).

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Make efforts to apply effective procedures to ensure that work submitted by students is original.*

2.6. Research

The academic community has high expectations in relationship to the Institute for Economic Research at the Faculty of Economics which was established din 2013 and reconsidered in April 2022 when the Council of the Institute was decided to consist of five (5) members with a four (4) year mandate (SER, page 72). This institute is not really functional, although formal establishment exists; it is considered for future research development, for example in

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

the mission and vision of the Faculty of Economics (SER, page 5): "The Faculty of Economics as an academic unit of the University of Prishtina has a vision for:…. Implementation of research projects through the Economic Research Institute". The link to the institute webpage has no information: https://ekonomiku.uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=2,108.

Management BSc study program does not have a clear well defined scientific/applied research objectives and no research development plan of the programme exists; some improvement has been done in the research area, for example an increasing support for academics to publish sufficient, financial incentives for staff (the positive change was confirmed by the dean of the faculty during the site visit). However, there is a lot of room for improvement, starting with the determination of the research concept and a research plan with clear research objectives and topics.

SER includes some inconsistency related to the conferences organized, being mentioned that the first one was organized in 2013, the second in 2018, and the third conference in 2020 (SER, pages 72-73); however, the website presents conferences in 2017, 2018, 2020, 2022 (https://ekonomiku.uni-pr.edu/page.aspx?id=2,107), therefore, 2017 must have been the year of the second conference organized. These conferences had different topics.

According to SER (page 75): "Expectations for the involvement of teaching staff in research and academic activities are clearly specified and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in the criteria for staff evaluation and promotion are defined by the Regulation on selection procedures related to the appointment, reappointment, and advancement of academic staff at the University of Pristina "Hasan Prishtina". SER (pages 75-77) describes that "Based on the statute of UP and other legal acts in force, as works published in scientific journals during the evaluation of the candidates presented in the competition, works published in the candidate's field, in journals which are indexed in the relevant academic bases". Therefore, expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria, aspect confirmed during the discussion with the teaching staff.

Moreover, the list of research publications was provided as additional documents to the ET. Many of the publications belong to Professor Besnik Krasniqi. Other academics are neither in the list, with recent publications covering the latest 3 years, nor have in their CV recent publications; for example: professor Veliu Liridon has his most recent publication in 2018. Other academics have recent publications, but mentioned in their own CVs, not in the list of scientific papers received as requested additional document (for example professor Enver Kutllovci has in his CV the recent publications, but those are not integrated in the list). The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity. In addition, ET is reserved in considering that each academic staff member

18

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication per year for the past three years.

ET could not identify clear policies established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of management. Although these policies are set at institutional level, a set of rules could be formulated at the department level or at the faculty level.

Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications. The academic and research staff publish their work in specialty magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad. The provided list of scientific publications requested by the Et contains several errors. For example, the paper "Cooperation Of Companies With Educational Institutions For Contemporary Education In Kosovo" has a link which is not the right one: https://ejce.cherkasgu.press/en/archive.html?number=2022-06-29-17:29:52&journal=40.

Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field. They provide case studies and examples from the practice and research activity and students appreciate such efforts. In some cases, students are involved in research, contributing to the data collecting process (participating students in the meeting during the site visit confirmed this). However, the dialog with the heads of the programmes revealed that in terms of research, what has to be done is: more research, better comparisons with other countries, more practical research with companies, more students to be engaged in research.

Policies are not yet clearly established for ownership of intellectual property and no clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students. The need for these policies is recognized in SER (page 79): "At a Conference organized by the US Embassy in April 2018, these are some of the key challenges that were identified in relation to intellectual property and determining the commercialization of ideas developed by staff"; unfortunately, no progress since 2018 in this matter.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Organize a debate / workshop / focus group to brainstorm on the research concept of the Management BSc study programme;*

19

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

2. *Create a research plan at the programme level considering joint interest of the academic involved in this programme, with research directions and main topics;*
3. *Allocate a responsibility to a staff member to search for project opportunities and to communicate to all the teaching staff these calls for projects;*
4. *Apply the right to develop practical research in specific fields, based on cooperation agreements with private or public donors, with the approval of the Steering Council (article 65, Statute);*
5. *Create a mechanism to collect data of the scientific publications, at least 2 times/year and update regularly the list of the research productivity of the academic staff; make sure the collected data are recent and right;*
6. *Established a set of rules at the programme/faculty/department level for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the programme and communicate it at an institutional level to contribute to formal policy in the field;*
7. *Create an annual event at the faculty level to disseminate the results of the research (to present the published articles in the field);*

2.7. Infrastructure and Resources

It should be emphasized that the ET was able to personally visit the Faculty of Economics which is located in Prishtina and view the entire infrastructure in person. During the tour of the Faculty building, the ET noticed that the building is currently being renovated and that some parts of the building are currently inaccessible to students which. In addition, ET studied the University of Prishtina and the Faculty of Economics websites and talked with students and professors, as well as the management of the programme. The Faculty of Economics has an area of about 3,500 m2, not including the various corridors and alcoves. About 1/3 of it represents classrooms. All academic staff is using cabinets/offices, which are permanent spaces for independent scientific work and are equipped with computers, internet, printer/scanner.

The Faculty of Economics also has a library; its space is very limited given the large number of students. However, some difficulties could be observed by the ET when asked the personnel to find a specific book and famous in Marketing (Kotler's textbook); later on, it was found but ET is reserved in considering it brought from the library deposit, as this did not contain any inventory number. In addition, when ET asked about the latest acquisition for the library was made, it was very difficult to find an adequate and clear answer.

The room that houses the administrative staff with direct contact with students is functional, although due to the large number of students, investments are still needed to make it more functional and larger. The classrooms are equipped with a projector, computer, Internet and all the necessary conditions for learning management.

20

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

All classrooms have a personal computer and overhead projector with basic programs that is sufficient for teaching. Special classrooms have computers with specific programs that are necessary for teaching, for example Statistics. There are only two rooms with personal computers for students which the expert team thinks is not enough which is also emphasized in the self-evaluation report. There is free Wi-Fi for all students, staff and visitors to the faculty.

In the main building of the Faculty of Economics, where most classes are held, the Faculty of Law also has its premises. In a conversation with the management of the faculty, they told ET that they plan to move to a new location in two years as soon as it will be fully equipped. The management of the faculty mentioned that the computers on the corridors that have been placed are for student needs and represent a donation from Procredit Bank as a result of the cooperation between these two institutions regarding the practice of students.

According to the Statute of the University of Pristina the Faculty of Economics, like other academic units, has at its disposal a percentage of the financial means coming from student fees to improve the educational quality as well as to cover the unforeseen expenses of educational staff. This percentage is decided by the Governing Council of the University of Pristina. Most of the budget is financed by the Budget of Kosovo for the University and all the Faculties because it is a public University. The faculty has its own library and reading room right next to it, but it has little space for the large number of students admitted each year and that is one of the points where the faculty needs improvement.

Dissatisfaction with the small library and room for studying and reading is shared by both professors and students, and a larger library is planned in the new building of the faculty. Although the library is small, in the conversation with the students, we received confirmation that all the books they needed were available to them. If there is only one copy of the book in the library, then they could not borrow it. While visiting the library, the ET noticed books in other languages such as German and Croatian, which is commendable because it is one of the ways to interest students. The student and professors said that the students of the Faculty of Economics have access to the National Library of Kosovo (NLK) which is not fair away. In the SER it is noted that the computers and projectors in the halls are outdated and need to be replaced as well as insufficient student space for independent work and group work.

According to SER (page 86): "Currently, the infrastructure of the Faculty of Economics is not adapted to meet the needs of students with limited needs". Also, some investment in making the learning resources accessible to all students would have to be considered.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Make efforts to increase students' access to more literature in the field of Management (both physical and electronical resources);*
2. *Make sure that the future infrastructure and facilities will be also adapted to students with special needs;*
3. *Create a plan to adapt the learning resources to all deficiencies students with special needs might face.*

3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The ET appreciates the efforts of the people involved in the process of organization the site visit contributing to providing answers and offering insights to all the issues that were raised. The academic staff is well trained and has a lot of potential to contribute to the establishment of a quality culture at the department level according to formal decisions. Students are well appreciated by the companies' representatives from the knowledge point of view. However, some inconsistency is still present.

ET strongly recommends that decision making regarding the study programme should:

- *Set up a clear research orientation of the Management BSc study programme, with reasonable objectives;*
- *Integrate the entire academic community in the effort to improve the quality management, by making them responsible of specific tasks, including the preparation of SER;*
- *Integrate the heads of the programme into normal planning and implementation of activities (they should be the first to know everything about the programme development);*
- *Make formal efforts to ensure that work submitted by students is original;*
- *Make more efforts to increase the access to recent literature, either physical or digital one;*
- *Create a system to check all the documents and links when they are addressed to different stakeholders to avoid errors and missing data (for example when writing the SER);*
- *Take into consideration all the standard specific recommendations mentioned above.*

Most of the recommendations can be considered within a short period of time. Therefore, ET strongly considers that the Management BSc study programme has the capacity to fix most of the issues raised and recommended or at least to start the process.

22

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

Student quota recommended: 150 students / 1 Year

Expert Team

Member

	Magdalena Platis	**22 March 2023**
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)

Member

	Marko Komšo, Student expert	**22 March 2023**
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)