Biznesi College

Bachelor (BSc) in Computer Science

ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

June 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

1

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 8th May 2023

Expert Team members:

- *Prof. Dr. Sc. Josip Balen - Josip Juraj Strossmayer University of Osijek, Faculty of Electrical Engineering, Computer Science and Information Technology, Osijek, Croatia*
- *Ms. Laura Palac (student expert) - University of Zagreb, Faculty of Electrical Engineering and Computing*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Mr. Shkelzen Gerxhaliu*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *The Self-Evaluation Report (including four Annexes), Bachelor in Computer Sciences*
- *Syllabi of the subjects.*
- *CVs of the academic staff.*
- *Online interviews with various stakeholders*
- *Kolegji Biznesi website*

Additional documents

- *College Statute*
- *Strategic plan at College level*
- *Annual plan for teaching staff development and the annual report*
- *Qualifying exam and the list of programme specific entry requirements*
- *List of full time academic staff*
- *List of agreements with other universities and companies*
- *Templates of the agreements*
- *Regulation on Publication*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

2

- *Regulation-for-research*
- *Manual - Per studentet Eng - Kolegji Biznesi*
- *QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICY IN BIZNESI COLLEGE*
- *REGULATION FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE AND EVALUATION*
- *Rregulation_on_quality_assurance*
- *Anketa Alumni KB 2022*
- *Anketa e studentëve 22-23 KB*
- *Anketa studentët*
- *Vlerësimi i kolegëve*
- *2.7. Kontrata Prishtinë*
- *Number of seats in the reading rooms*
- *Library information*
- *Internal_Regulation_of_Biznesi_College*
- *REGULATION ON REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF THE ACADEMIC STAFF*
- *REGULATIONON THE HARMONIZATION OF ACADEMIC TITLES*
- *REGULATIONON THE ORGANIZATION AND WORK OF THE HIGHER TEACHING-SCIENTIFIC COUNCIL OF BIZNESI COLLEGE*
- *MANUAL FOR EVALUATION OF TEACHING PERFORMANCE, STUDY PROGRAM AND COLLEGE*
- *Regulation on Publication*
- *REGULATION ON THE WORK OF THE SCIENTIFIC PUBLICATIONS MONITORING TEAM*
- *Regulation-for-research*
- *REGULATIONON RESEARCH AND SCIENTIFIC WORK AT BIZNESI COLLEGE*
- *REGULATIONON THE SELECTION PROCEDURE IN SCIENTIFIC TEACHING TITLE, TEACHING TITLE, TEACHING-PROFESSIONAL AND ASSOCIATE TITLE*
- *MANUAL FOR ACADEMIC AND ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF*
- *PROGRAM FOR PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF TEACHING AND ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF OF "BIZNESI" COLLEGE - PRISHTINA*
- *Regulation_on_the_Code_of_Ethics(1)*
- *Regulation-for-recension*
- *Regulation-for-scientific-calls*
- *REGULATIONON BUSINESS COLLEGE POLICIES FOR REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF ACADEMIC STAFF*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

- *Marreveshje bashkepunim Kolegji Biznesi - ANA SHPK*
- *Marreveshje bashkepunim Kolegji Biznesi - Ndermarrja Tregtare IFNOPEJA*
- *Diploma Example CS*
- *Diploma Shembull Emergjenca*
- *Diploma Supplement SP Emergency management*
- *ACADEMIC STAFF IN STUDY PROGRAM COMPUTER SCIENCE*
- *Lista përcjellëse AAK 12.05.2023 (2)*
- *PROV1MIT PRANUES*
- *Stafi pjesmarres me ekspert 12.05.2023*
- *Videos/images of the infrastructure, lecture rooms, laboratories, library, etc.*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of Kosovo Accreditation Agency, 2021*

1.2. Site visit schedule

Time	Meeting	Participants
09:00 – 09:50	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated	- Dr Shyqeri Kabashi - Dekan - Dr Afrim Alili - Prodekan për arsim dhe sigurim të cilësisë - Dr Nexhmije Sejdiu - Prodekan për ndërkombëtarizim
09.55 – 10.25	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff	- Mr. Blerim Burjani Përgjegjës i Zyrës për Sigurimin e Cilësisë - Burim Morina Përgjegjës i Administratës Qendrore - Ylber Krasniqi Zyrtar administrativ - Zejnullah Fetahu Përgjegjës për Zyrën e IT
10:25 – 11:15	Meeting with the heads of the study programme: Computer Sciences, BSc	- Dr Ilir Gashi - Dr Hiflobina Obertinca – Dermaku - Hazir Hajdari

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

		• Kastriot Dermaku
12:00– 12:45	Meeting with teaching staff	• Dr Liridon Hoti • Dr Vehbi Ramaj • Dr Ramadan Beqiri • Dr Vehbi Imeri • Dr Ariana Xhemajli • Mr Refik Ramadani PhdC
12:50 – 13:30	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders	• Mahir Hasani • Burim Gashi • Fidan Dushi • Leutrim Gashi • Koman Gashi
13:35 – 13:45	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts	
13:45 – 13:55	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program	• Dr Shyqeri Kabashi - Dekan • Dr Afrim Alili - Prodekan për arsim dhe sigurim të cilësisë • Dr Nexhmije Sejdiu - Prodekan për ndërkombëtarizim

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

BIZNESI College was established in 2004 as a Private Institution of Higher Education in Kosovo (PIHE) and it is licensed by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology according to Decision No. 412/ 02-1 and 2/3593. Following complete technical preparations, recruitment of academic and administrative personnel, in accordance with the legal provisions in Kosovo, the College started working in the academic year 2005/06. From the year 2010/2011, the institution started with the master's cycle and so far 11 generations have been registered in this study cycle at Biznesi College. Currently studies at BIZNESI College are carried out at the bachelor and master level. According to the decision for accreditation by KAA, as well as the decision of MEST for licensing, BIZNESI College currently conducts its academic activity in four study programs of bachelor level and two programs of master level and one program - level III according to the National Qualifications Framework. BIZNESI

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

College, based on the National Framework of Qualifications, conducts its academic activities in the following study programs:

- Fire Protection Technician - Short cycle of Bologna, Fifth level
- Banking and Business Finance, Emergency Management, Law - LLB, and Management and Economics - Bachelor, Sixth level
- Emergency Management, Management and Finance - Master, Seventh level

The main objective of the Bachelor's degree program in Computer Science is to prepare students with specific required competencies in accordance with the requirements who wish to work in private or public organisations. The study program is a research-based curriculum of advanced studies that provides professional-scientific education in this important field of study. It is an advanced study model designed to provide a thorough knowledge of computer science in general. The study program provides connections between theory and practices that provide the foundation and diversity of business leadership. Taking into account that the majority of employers in the Republic of Kosovo are from small and medium enterprises and also a significant part of START UP businesses as well as the current market demands and numerous expectations in the field of business management, the organization of computer science study courses, are with a key focus on their management, support and development.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The mission of Biznesi College continues its positive academic tradition by emphasising the creation of transformative academic environments and experiences to realize the full potential of its students, the implementation of advanced teaching standards, scientific research and the contribution to the economic development of the country in general. The Bachelor (BSc) in Computer Science study program mission stated in the SER (Self Evaluation Report) is the following: "To provide students with quality learning and access to research in the field of computer science that enables them to contribute positively to the economic well-being of the country and the region, with higher standards of ethics and effectiveness in the exercise of the computer science profession and to be prepared to address the complex 21st century challenges facing the world." The Expert Team agrees that the

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

mission of the study program is in full compliance with the vision and mission statement of Biznesi College since it supports the same pillars: education (teaching and learning), science (scientific research) and services to the community (positive contribution to the economic well-being of society).

The Curriculum Development and Review Committee developed the study program and the learning outcomes based on the advices and the feedback from the accreditation bodies, potential employers and professional organizations operating in the study program field. Furthermore, the following documents were used: National Qualifications Framework (NQF), Qualifications Framework of the European Higher Education Area (EHEA), European Qualifications Framework (EQF) for lifelong learning and internal Regulation on Curriculum Development and Review. This was confirmed at the meeting with heads of the study program and at the meeting with employers of graduates.

External experts believe that the didactic concept in this study program is well defined and it includes various useful teaching methods such as theoretical lectures, practical exercises, seminars, homeworks, projects, internships, etc. The research concepts are present throughout the whole study program, mainly through the seminar papers where students must adhere to the instructions given by the teacher for the realization of the research and technical work. Since this is a Bachelor study program the is it nor expected to have a high involvement of students in the research activities.

The College has formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues and they are made publicly available to all staff and students on the College web page. All regulations which are drawn up within the institution are at the central level and apply to all existing study programs and the study program included in the evaluation process, as well. Furthermore, all policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility regarding the management and distribution of the program are reviewed at the beginning of each academic year and are amended as necessary in the circumstances of the change. After the meetings with management, heads of this study program and teachers, experts gained the impression that staff and students on other study programs comply with all the internal regulations.

In the SER under the threats it is mentioned that there is a high competition in the higher education system and an unfair competition in the economic market. The computer science

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

field is very popular recently and attracts many students. However, the College management and the heads of the study program need to be aware that Kosovo has a limited pool of students and many study programs from the computer science field are already available so students will choose the best one and the one that will provide the high quality education, as well as the professional career opportunities.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, and assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:
1. Constantly improve the study program in all manners and proforma comparison and benchmarks with the similar study programmes in the surrounding in order to remove the current threats of high competition in the higher education system and an unfair competition in the economic market.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

2.2. Quality management

The quality assurance process is managed by the Quality Assurance Office and is supervised by the Vice-Dean for Teaching. The process of self-evaluation of the study program is carried out based on the Statute of the College and the Quality Assurance Regulation. The Quality Assurance Office plans and monitors the full quality assurance process related to the academic staff, students and study programs. The current quality assurance processes ensure that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.

Based on the provided documentation and collected information during the online visit it can be concluded that heads of the department, quality assurance officers and the rest of the academic staff have participated in the quality improvement activities. One of the main mechanisms for the study program quality evaluation are surveys provided to students, academic staff and external stakeholders and the obtained results are taken into account for further study program development. Regular periodic review also measures the impact of the study program on the success and progress of graduates and the impact on industry and the community. The regular periodic review process takes place in three phases: self-evaluation of the study program, development of the program strategy, and drafting of a revised strategic document. The process includes the program self-evaluation, the development of the program's strategic plan and consists of the program self-evaluation, the program strategy and the proposed review document. The head of the program, academic staff members, student representatives, alumni club representatives and industry representatives participate in the self-evaluation of the program's learning outcomes, academic success, graduate employability and industry impact. During the meeting with quality assurance representatives, it was confirmed that all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution are considered in the quality assurance process. During the meeting with industry representatives it was confirmed that they have participated in the evaluation and the implementation of this study program.

Biznesi College conducts a regular periodic review of the study program once every three years. During the meeting with quality assurance representatives it was confirmed that the quality assurance office continuously monitors the quality assurance process and makes necessary improvements in terms of quality assurance mechanisms.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

ET recommendations:

1. *Students should be informed regarding the survey results and measures taken in a case of poor review of a specific course or academic staff.*

2.3. Academic staff

Academic staff at the Biznesi College that will participate in the new Bachelor (BSc) in Computer Science study program in total counts 21 teachers, of which 18 hold PhD degree and 3 hold MSc degree. Furthermore, 13 members of academic staff work as full time employees while 8 work as part time employees, and therefore, the condition (standard 3.4) that at least 50% of the academic staff in the study programme are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study programme is satisfied. Furthermore, there are no retired teachers. The Standard 3.5 which requires that for each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title, are satisfied and the heads of the study program are: Prof. ass. Dr. Hazir Hajdari, Prof.ass.Dr. Hiflobina Dermaku and Prof.ass.Dr. Ilir Gashi.

The employment procedure of academic staff complies with the legal requirements since it is conducted in accordance with the Law on Labour of the Republic of Kosovo, the Statute of Biznesi College, the Administrative Instruction on Accreditation of HEIs in Kosovo, and other College internal regulations. Candidates for employment are provided with an employment contract and full position descriptions. Furthermore, some of the academic staff have another teaching position at other educational institutions and some are involved in the industry mainly part-time as professionals which is allowed and could be even useful for the improvement of the courses content. During the meeting with an academic staff all information above was confirmed by the full time academic staff.

Opportunities for additional professional development of academic staff are provided since during the academic year several trainings, workshops or lectures covering different topics are organized. For academic staff (both full time and part time) it is mandatory to attend those training sessions (an example list of events orgnaized in the last 4 years is provided in the SER). Furthermore, for the new academic staff, specific trainings are

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

organized in order to improve their knowledge and skills. Academic staff is always available for consultations with students in all forms of communication: in person, via e-mail, online, and mandatory consultations are scheduled with two hours a week according to the schedule announced at the beginning of the semester (Regulation No. 146-1/20 dated 30.06.2020 for basic bachelor studies - article 18). However, the engagement in the academic community and community service should be improved. During the meeting with the academic staff a few examples of academic community was given but mainly connected to an "external" business of academic staff and non example of an engagement in the academic community was provided. Furthermore, academic staff profiles are not available on the english version of the official college web page and the recommendation is to create it in order to improve the visibility of the institution, as well as the academic staff research and teaching fields. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly one per year through questionnaires for teachers, self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' (management and the dean) evaluations. The whole procedure is defined in detail in the Manual for evaluating the teaching performance, study program and college (No. 47-1/21, January 2021). The results of the evaluation are sent to each academic staff separately.

Strategies for quality enhancement included in the Biznesi College Strategic plan 2021-2024 contain improvement of the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials, and even more emphasis should be given while developing a new strategic plan (from 2025). They are also regulated in the Regulation on quality assurance of BIZNESI College. Teachers are retired according to the law (Law No. 04/L-131 on Pension Schemes Financed by the State) at the moment when they have reached the age of sixty-five (65). After this age, the teacher can work as a part-time teacher until the age of 70 but no examples of such cases were provided.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	X	
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.		X
Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occurs on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *An engagement of the academic staff in the academic community and community service should be improved.*
2. *Create academic staff profiles on the official web page in order to improve the visibility of the institution, as well as the academic staff research and teaching fields.*
3. *Improve the number of professional development of academic staff at international institutions.*

2.4. Educational process content

The purpose of the Computer Sciences Study Programme is to prepare the graduate to independently analyse, plan and carry out solutions for developing, refining and the integration of computer systems in private and public companies in national, regional or international settings. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives such as subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies and it complies with the level 6 of the National Qualifications Framework. During the meeting with external stakeholders and industry representatives it was stated that in general they are satisfied with the curriculum of the current study program and were involved in its creation.

The table provided in the SER on page 62 is confusing since learning outcomes on the study program level are not written properly since the majority of them do not contain a verb so they are not comprehensible and descriptive. However, the description under the "The graduates in Computer Sciences" is written quite well. Furthermore, on pages 63/64 other

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

learning outcomes are written so it is not clear which learning outcomes are the major outcomes of the study program.

By analysing the curriculum, the Expert team noted that not all disciplines within a curriculum are provided in a logical flow. Course Academic Writing planned in the first semester should be moved later in the curriculum, as this knowledge will be useful for writing the seminars which are usually given in higher study years, as well as for the final thesis. Furthermore, course Programming 1 is taught in the second semester and the purpose of the course is to provide basic knowledge in programming and software design to students with no programming knowledge assumed. The course Programming 2 is planned in the last 6th semester and it provides an advanced programming knowledge for solving various real-world problems based on the content from other courses given in the semesters in between (such as Object oriented program), so the naming Programming 2 is very confusing and it should be changed. Furthermore, the Expert team noticed that two very similar courses Introduction to Computer Graphics and Visualization and Image Processing are taught in the same (3rd) semester. This is not a good practice and the Expert team suggests that course Introduction to Computer Graphics should stay in the 3rd semester but to move course Visualization and Image Processing in a later semester in order for students to first acquire basic knowledge in computer graphics and then advance that knowledge in a later course which studies a specific area of computer graphics. Furthermore, courses Mathematics 1, Mathematics 2 and Statistics are not closely related to the field of computer science. The Expert team recommends adding more discrete mathematics, principles of mathematical logic, set theory and graph and network theory. Course Statistics should be replaced with course Computational statistics, which connects statistics and computer science, i.e. studies statistical methods that are enabled by using computational methods. Courses Business Intelligence and Introduction to Business are too similar, so it is necessary to remove one of them and add one new elective course in the third semester. This course should be Business Law which should be moved from the second to the third semester. Some state-of-the art technologies are missing in the curriculum such as IoT, mobile app development, big data, etc. Therefore, the Expert team recommends adding Big Data content in the course Databases and adding courses that would cover fields of IoT and mobile app development. Although the study program already contains various technologies, the state-of-the-art technologies need to be a part of all new study programs from the computer science field. This was discussed with industry representatives and they also suggested these recommendations. The Expert team

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

also noticed that dr. Betim Spahiu does not have competencies to give an Artificial Intelligence course since from his CV it can be seen that he is not qualified in this field. Therefore, the College needs to find another academic staff to give this course.

Since Biznesi College is a business oriented college, and this study program is not closely connected to other existing study programs, the Expert team is suggesting to consider an idea to reorganise the study program or to start a master study program by lowering the number of mandatory specific technical courses and adding more business courses connected to the computer science field in order to prepare students to get the technical background and understanding and to apply it and use them in a business and entrepreneurs context. This type of study program would be unique in Kosovo and already exists in various universities across the globe such as The University of British Columbia, The University of Waterloo, Washington University, University of Colorado Boulder, etc. It can also be offered as a joint degree program with other technical University/College.

Most of the courses within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses that contain discipline's objectives, basic thematic content, learning outcomes, distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, literature, etc. However, the Expert team noticed that syllabuses for some courses should be improved since for many courses it is needed to add more state-of-the-art literature up to 2-3 years old (such as Web Application Development, Distributed Systems, etc.). Furthermore, it seems that the templates for syllabuses are not quite the same since eg. some have "Learning objectives" and "Learning outcomes", while others have "Study purpose and subject content" and "Student benefits". Since this is an accreditation process and there is no historical information and data on given courses, as well as there is no feedback from the students it is not possible to evaluate Standards 4.5, 4.6 and 4.8.

Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes since they offer different teaching methods which support active learning processes, such as lectures, internship/projects, seminars, laboratory exercises, etc. Furthermore, the goal of the study program is to produce students who actively acquire knowledge, skills, and disciplinary habits. Several strategies are applied such as discussion, case studies, visual presentations, role playing, group work, etc. For the evaluation of the learning outcomes, academic staff takes into account different approaches, such as: exams, quizzes, written tasks, presentations and individual or small group projects, taking into account the workload of the students for

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

the relevant subject. It is important to note that students evaluate the academic staff and the courses quality at the end of each semester. The results of these surveys are analysed and further measures are taken if needed which means that the effectiveness of planned teaching strategies in achieving different types of learning outcomes is regularly assessed and adjustments are made.

As described in the SER an appropriate and reliable mechanism will be used to verify standards of student achievement. During the calculation of student achievement, the students' entire engagement will be calculated, including: lectures, exercises, research activities, presentations, practical work, seminars, individual work and other various forms of work and examination. In cases where the standards of the students' achievements are insufficient or when they are not evaluated as foreseen in the course syllabus, based on the Internal Regulation of Biznesi College (No. 380-1/19 dated 30 September 2019, article 44 paragraph 6) appropriate measures will be taken.

The internship within this study program will be conducted in the industry. Internship is an obligatory course conducted in the fifth semester. In order to facilitate internships, the Faculty and the College have signed several cooperation agreements with different institutions. While on internship, students have to submit a written report in order to complete the course.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To list at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation		X
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is <u>other than Albanian</u>, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	n.a.	
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	n.a.	
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	n.a.	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X	
Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	X	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *The disciplines within the curriculum are not provided in a logical flow.*
2. *Define the learning outcomes on the study program level.*
3. *Course Academic Writing should be moved later in a later semester*
4. *Change the name of the course Programming 2*
5. *Move course Visualization and Image Processing in a later semester*
6. *Add content such as discrete mathematics, principles of mathematical logic, set theory and graph and network theory in courses Mathematics 1 and Mathematics 2*
7. *Replace course Statistics with a course Computational statistics*
8. *Courses Business Intelligence and Introduction to Business are too similar, so it is necessary to remove one of them*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

9. *Business Law should be moved from the second to the third semester*
10. *Add Big Data content in the course Databases*
11. *Add courses that would cover fields of IoT and mobile app development.*
12. *Find another academic staff with the competencies to give an Artificial Intelligence course*
13. *Improve syllabuses for specific courses (state-of-the-art literature and course template).*

2.5. Students

The admission procedure will be clearly defined and publicly announced. To enrol in this study program, students must possess a high school diploma and pass the entrance exam (in Physics, Mathematics and English or German) organised by the College. These criteria fairly apply to all students.

According to the SER study groups are planned to be organised as follows: maximum number of students in lectures is 60 and maximum number of students in practical laboratory exercises is 20. This organisation of study groups will ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process. Biznesi College uses an automated online system (SEMS) which allows students to access their data, various announcements, course registrations, courses by semester offered by study programs. Moreover, they can see the results of exams, list of grades, dates of exams, calculate the average, schedule of lectures, participation in lectures, dates of exams, teachers of subjects, etc. All the results obtained by students throughout the study cycles are recorded in SEMS. Furthermore, feedback to students on their performance is done through this system. According to the SER, in cases where students are not satisfied with the assessment they can use the rights provided by the "Regulation On Bachelor Studies in BIZNESI College". For students who have difficulties to achieve the required results, additional lessons or consultation hours are organized by the academic staff. Therefore, students have all the opportunities to use the help of the staff even outside regular hours to overcome eventual difficulties in learning, including tutoring. If the student is not satisfied with the assessment, he/she can reject the grade within the 48-hour period. College bought licensed software used for plagiarism detection, according to the academic staff. Also, students have to fill in the statement on the originality of their work and their works are

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

subject to a rigorous plagiarism check (Biznesi College Code of Ethics No. 380-1/19 dt. 30 September 2019 articles 28 and 30).

Biznesi College monitors and analyses student pass rates in each course. In the final evaluation report, the following evaluation categories are calculated: Course evaluation for the exam period, Assessment for the examination term of the study program, Assessment for the semester or academic year and the final assessment for the study program. The information derived from the final evaluation data in the study program serves as performance indicators to the Office for Quality Assurance in order to continuously improve the quality of the study program. Also, students have to participate in mandatory questionnaires every semester where they evaluate the courses. Through these questionnaires students can suggest improvements related to the study program. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is regulated in formal internal documents (Regulation on Bachelor studies in Biznesi College, articles 41, 42, 43 and 44). All students' rights and obligations are made publicly available and are defined According to the Statute of Biznesi College (No. 380-1/19 dt. 30 September 2019 articles 68 and 69) and Bachelor Studies Regulation (No. 146-1/20 dt. 30 June 2020, article 38).

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program posses a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

21

Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:
1. Apply all good practices from other study program to the new Bachelor (BSc) in Computer Science study program.

2.6. Research

Scientific research is an important part of the Biznesi College Strategic plan 2021-2024 and several strategic objectives are connected to it. Policies that support high quality scientific research and publications are established and they are also consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of the study program. Furthermore,

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

the expectations for academic staff involvement in research activities are clearly specified, and the minimum standards are set.

All full-time professors are obliged to publish at least one scientific paper within an academic year and they confirmed during the meeting that they always publish under the name of the Biznesi College. However, although the academic staff publish the results of their research work in journals and at scientific conferences, the high quality and highly cited publications form the computer science field is missing. One of the reasons could be that academic staff is lacking two important aspects that are closely connected to the quality and quantity of the scientific work and the first is implementation and participation in scientific projects and the second is an international collaboration. It is mentioned in the SER and confirmed by the academic staff that the scientific research results will be included in the educational subjects and that courses will be continuously enriched by scientific-research works and reflect the results of teaching to students and the business community. However, since this study program is at bachelor level it is not expected to have a high level or research work provided by students. Research work of academic staff is validated through scientific and applied research publications but technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation is not supported.

Regulation on Intellectual Property in "Biznesi" College was drafted in accordance with the Decision of the High Teaching and Scientific Council and it contains policies for ownership of intellectual property but procedures for commercialization of ideas developed by academic staff or students are not defined. Since this is an accreditation process there is no proof that students have been engaged in research projects and other activities but it mentioned in the SER students will be encouraged to draft scientific papers through publishing and research activities, as well as to be a common part of teamwork in the research-scientific field.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

23

institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.		X
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.		X
Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.	X	
Standard 6.8.(1) Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.		X
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

24

ET recommendations:

1. *Improve the quality and visibility of scientific publication from the computer science field.*
2. *Stimulate the application of scientific projects (national and international) and consequently increase the number of the projects.*
3. *Create formal procedures for supporting technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.*
4. *Regulate the procedures for commercialization of ideas developed by academic staff or students.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Biznesi College has headquarters in Prishtina but also has units in Prizren, Gjakova and Vushtrri where studies are conducted in programs accredited at the Bachelor and Master level. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program in general is ensured in quantitative terms since the total space of the facilities includes a spatial area of 4,500 m2, of which, 2,500 m2 indoor environment and 2000 m2 outdoor environment (some proof of owned or rented spaces are submitted in the additional documents). However, since currently the total number of students enrolled is over 10,500 students the number of seats in the teaching, computer (laboratories) and reading rooms will be very limited since the College is requesting a high number of students (120) to be enrolled in the new Bachelor (BSc) in Computer Science study program. Since the maximum number of seats in teaching rooms is 50, the lectures would have to be organised in three groups. Furthermore, organisation of the new study program will be very challenging specially in the part of laboratory exercises since there are only three computer rooms. Moreover, the new study program is not closely connected to any other existing study programme which is going to require a huge effort from the academic staff. Also, such a big number of students could lead to decreasing the quality and knowledge of students enrolling in the study program, as well as decrease the quality of the overall teaching process. Based on all facts the maximum number of students enrolled in the first year of the new Bachelor (BSc) in Computer Science study program should be 80 students. From the provided video and data it can be seen that the quality of the infrastructure is adequate for the organisation of the teaching process and partially suitable for people with

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

25

special needs. However, it is not clear if students will have all the necessary software on the computers and can they use computers for studying.

The existing financial plan for the next three years at the level of the study program is very tight and only sustainable if the number of students is 120. However, since we limited the number of students to 80 it is necessary to calculate a new financial plan and ensure its sustainability.

The Central Library of College Biznesi has 75 m2, while the reading room with 80 m2 respectively has 55 seats for all study programs in College. Also there is a Tutorial and group activities room with 20 seats. The stocks of books from the literature of Albanian and foreign specialties is sufficient to cover the disciplines within the curricula, of which at least 50% must represent book titles or specialty courses of well-known publicists, from the last 10 years. Additionally College Biznesi has a memorandum of understanding with the Central library of Kosova for cooperation which allows the student to use their cooperation links worldwide with their logging credentials from the College facilities.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
Standard 7.2. There is a **financial plan** at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the **sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years**.		X
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must **demonstrate** with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, **for the next at least three years:** a) **owned or rented spaces** adequate for the educational process;	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

26

b) **owned or rented laboratories,** with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) **adequate softwar**e for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, **with utilisation licence;** d) **library** equipped with **reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock** according to the disciplines included in the curricula.		
Standard 7.4. **The number of seats** in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be r**elated to the study groups' size** (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	
Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to **at least 10% of the total number of students** in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, **out of which at least 50% should represent book titles** or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	X	
Standard 7.6. **The infrastructure and facilities** dedicated to the implementation of the program is **adapted to students with special needs.**	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

27

ET recommendations:
1. Reduce the number of students that will be enrolled in this program to a maximum 80 per year.
2. Create a new financial plan at the study program level that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the minimum next three years based on 80 students enrolled in the first year of the study.

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Based on the study of extensive documentation and an online visit to the Biznesi College that was very professionally organized, the Expert Team for the accreditation process prepared this report based on defined Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of KAA (2021) and gave recommendations for further quality improvement. Since this is an accreditation of a new study program, several standards could not be evaluated while some standards were evaluated based on the experience from other study programs since part of the academic staff will be the same at both programs and also part of the courses have a similar content.

Considering the documentation provided and discussions with the program development team, experts gave the following compliance level:

Standard	Compliance Level
Mission, objectives and administration	Fully compliant
Quality management	Fully compliant
Academic Staff	Substantially compliant
Educational Process Content	Substantially compliant
Students	Fully compliant
Research	Substantially compliant

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

28

Infrastructure and resources	Substantially compliant
Overall Compliance	Substantially compliant

The Expert Team wants to point out that in general the self evaluation report is well written which has greatly facilitated the re-accreditation process. However, for some standards important information and more details are missing and those were obtained through the request for the additional documentation. We believe that you proposed a fair study program that has a bright future. However additional improvements are necessary in order to improve the quality of the study program and we encourage you to accept all the recommendations and improve it further. In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program Bachelor on in Computer Science offered by the Biznesi College is Substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation Manual, and therefore, recommends to accredit the study program for a duration of 3 years with a number of 80 students to be enrolled in the program.

4. APPENDICES *(if available)*

None

Expert Team

Chair

	Prof. Dr. Sc. Josip Balen	8th June 2023
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)

Student Member

	Ms. Laura Palac	8th June2023
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

29