



THE ESLG COLLEGE

MANAGEMENT OF REAL ESTATE AND INFRASTRUCTURE
(MA)

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

15.02.2023, PRISHTINA

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	3
1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation	4
2. PROGRAMME EVALUATION	5
2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration.....	5
2.2. Quality Management.....	8
2.3. Academic Staff.....	11
2.4. Educational Process Content.....	13
2.5. Students.....	17
2.6. Research.....	20
2.7. Infrastructure and Resources.....	23
3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	27
1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	27
2. Quality management	27
3. Academic staff	27
4. Educational process content.....	27
5. Students.....	27
6. Research.....	27
7. Infrastructure and resources	27

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 15th of February 2023

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Assoc. Prof. Dr. Remigijus Kinderis*
- *PhD student Marija Vasilevska*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Ilirjane Ademaj Ahmeti*
- *Shkelzen Gerxhaliu*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *SER and it's annexes*
- *Information and documents provided on the website of the College*
- *Additional information and documents requested and received by the experts from the College administration*

Criteria used for institutional and programme evaluations.

- *KAA Standards*

1.2. Site visit schedule

Time	Meeting
09:00 – 09:50	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
09.50 – 10.30	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
10:30 – 11:30	Meeting with the heads of the study programme: Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure, MA
11:30– 12.10	Lunch break (provided at the evaluation site)
12:10– 13:00	Meeting with teaching staff
13:00 – 13:40	Meeting with students
13:40 – 14:20	Meeting with graduates
14:20 – 15:00	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
15:00 – 15:15	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
15:15 – 15:25	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and programme

3

1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

The ESLG College was established in 2009, by decision 01/2009 of the Managing Board of the European University in Kosovo. The ESLG College was accredited for the first time by decision No. 479/10 of 20 July 2010, as the ESLG Institute, for the following study programmes: 1) Law LLB, and 2) Law and Real Estate and Infrastructure Management (BA), initially for a one-year period.

The Mission of the ESLG College is to provide premier education in Kosovo with unique programmes and unique teaching methodologies that contribute to economic growth, sustainable development, and advancement of teaching, learning, and research in the built environments for the benefit of community.

For the purpose of realization of its mission, the ESLG College as of August 2019 joined University for Business and Technology and became an integral part of UBT group. The ESLG College has only one centre, and no other campuses.

The ESLG College is accredited by Kosovo Accreditation Agency until 30.09.2022 and has received the positive institutional re-accreditation from 01.10.2022 until 30.09.2025. The ESLG College is also licensed by the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation of Republic of Kosovo from 01.10.2022 until 30.09.2025.

Study programme evaluation concluded by Decision No. 1573/20 of State Council of Quality on re-accreditation of the master study programme Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure (MA) for a three-year period 01.10.2020-30.09.2023.

82 students study in master study programme Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure.

2. PROGRAMME EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration

The master study programme Real Estate has a mission to develop leaders of the future in the construction and real estate industry in Kosovo by installing in them also the values of sustainable construction, energy efficiency and environmental protection, as it is presented in the SER. The programme has two strategic objectives which are presented in the SER. *“The main strategic objective of the programme is to advance holistic knowledge of real estate for sustainable urbanization in Kosovo through innovative research-based teaching. The other strategic objective of the programme under evaluation is to equip construction industry leaders and managers with the most up to date knowledge and skills of the industry in order to enable them to lead innovatively in their organizations, increase the performance, efficiency and sustainability of the sector of real estate in Kosovo and educate them on the relevance of construction and development of real estate in a sustainable manner by saving energy and being friendly with the environment.”*- SER page 10. On the other hand, the mission of the institution is to provide premier education in Kosovo with unique programmes and teaching methodologies that contribute to economic growth, sustainable development, and advancement of teaching, learning, and research in built environments for the benefit of the community. The ET considers the mission of the study programme to be compliant with the institutional one.

The involvement of the industry is one of the things of which the College`s representatives are proud most. They have shared many examples of involving the industry in their work and specifically pointed out their involvement in the learning outcomes. From the information in the SER and the ones presented during the site visit, ET can conclude that relevant professional advices have been taken into consideration when developing the learning outcomes. *However, examples of academic advice which has been taken into consideration are not available, so ET would like to recommend the involvement of national and international academic advice in the next revision of the study program.* In addition, the learning outcomes are clear and consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

The SER presents the programme has more theory than practice. In addition, the head of the programme during the site visit specified their success in including research within the master programme. The examples presented in the SER for research concept are existing, but according to ET are rather limited and oriented into working with the industry. On a college level there is a Research Strategy and within the budget projections there is a separate budget line for research projects. *However, specific examples of how research concept in embedded within the programme has not been found. In that regard, ET would like to advice the College to involve research concept to a higher extend especially since this is a master programme.*

The College has well established system for managing, including different regulatory bodies, guidelines and documents. The most important document is the College`s statute that regulates its functioning followed by a set of other documents, policies, procedures and guidelines all available online. The one thing the ET found questionable is the relationship between UBT and the College. The cooperation between these two entities at a certain point might come up as a challenge, so a clear distinction between the two is needed. Despite the fact that academic staff pointed out that they do not see this situation as a problem, still in a long term this might cause difficulties and a lack of clear distinction between students and external stakeholders.

The Code of Ethics for the academic community at the College outlines basic ethical principles such as freedom of thought and expression, integrity, respect for other people's rights, and academic honesty. The Code also specifies that academic staff and other members of the academic community must fulfil their obligations professionally, objectively, and with mutual respect. In cases of violations of the Code of Ethics, the Dean or Rector initiates proceedings before the Department or Faculty Disciplinary and Ethics Sub-Committee, and staff and students can appeal decisions to the ESLG College 's Ethics Committee.

Academic integrity for both staff and students is regulated by the Academic Integrity Policy and the Research Integrity Policy of the ESLG College, and the institution also has a Preventive and Educative Plagiarism Prevention Policy. These policies can be found on the ESLG College website.

Following recommendations from the Expert Evaluation Team from one of the previous evaluations, the ESLG College revised its Code of Conduct for Students and Code of Ethics for Academic Staff to include concise and clear provisions on sanctions in case of violations. A clear and concise list of violations and sanctions for teachers, researchers, colleagues, and employees of the College, as well as guidelines for the Ethics and Disciplinary Commission were also added. Additionally, the College defined a maximum percentage of plagiarism for students, stating that the level of work submitted without proper citation allowed is 10% of the assignment without bibliography, quotations, and small sources of up to 1%.

The College has established a system for reviewing the policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibilities related to the management and delivery of the programme followed by a system for addressing the needed changes based on what has been identified in the evaluation process.

The Quality Commission of the College is accountable for overseeing and enhancing the quality assurance procedures throughout the institution, which are monitored by the Quality Assurance Office. For new programmes, they must be evaluated annually for three years, with the review completed by February 15th for the spring semester. After re-accreditation by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency, study programmes will undergo comprehensive evaluations every two years, which can be in the form of self-evaluations or external evaluations conducted by a peer committee or programme auditor. The evaluations will assess various aspects of the study programme, such as its profile and structure, teaching and assessment methods, practical

implementation, student enrolment and completion rates, grade distribution, availability of resources and literature, and suggestions for improvements by the programme director. The review process should be completed before the publication of study programme descriptions for the upcoming academic year.

If major changes are recommended, the quality assurance plan should include transitional schemes for affected students. The Quality Commission is responsible for monitoring the academic performance of the programme and producing quality enhancement measures at the programme and institutional level. They carry out review and monitoring activities to ensure transparency in performance assessment and propose changes to the quality assurance policy, curriculum review, teaching, assessment, student support services, infrastructure and equipment, and public information.

Supported by the Quality Assurance Office, the Quality Commission produces an Annual Quality Report using Performance Assessment Indicators and Key Performance Indicators developed as outcome and process indicators within the Faculty Performance Assessment Framework.

The recommendations of the previous study programme evaluation have been taken into account.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study programme mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study programme has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the programme are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The research concept of the programme should be strengthened by involvement of students in academic staff's research projects and more research projects led and initiated by the particular programme.*
2. *Ensure the involvement of international academic advice.*
3. *It is recommended that the College and UBT should be publicly and clearly distinguished to prevent conflicts of interest and to ensure the delivering quality education to their respective institutions.*

2.2. Quality Management

The quality management processes are governed by the Quality Assurance Manual of the ESLG College. The College has a designated Quality Assurance Officer and Quality Commission. The Quality Commission is composed of seven members, which includes three teaching staff members, two student representatives, one industry representative, and Alumni representative. The Quality Commission is used for all the study programmes at the ESLG College level.

The College has established an internal quality assurance system in accordance with the national standards requirements, which is a part of its strategic management for the period from 2021 to 2026, *but this strategic document should be based on objective and comprehensive SWOT and content analysis and allocations as well.*

Supervision of the ESLG College activities is ensured by everyday activities, for example, approval, validation, evaluation of work quality, distribution of duties and responsibilities, etc. At the same time, targeted control measures have been implemented that are used in various periods throughout the year. *However, the effectiveness of the control/supervision itself should also be measured and discussed at college management level.*

During a meeting with ET, management of the faculty, quality assurance representatives and administrative staff with the heads of the study programme gave an explanation and examples of how they ensure continuous improvement, development, and efficient performance of the study field and the relevant study programmes (conducts student surveys, organizes informal and formal meetings with social partners, students, has joint meetings with course teachers, and so on). During a meeting with an ET, teaching staff, employers and students confirmed that the process of improving the internal quality of studies takes place on a regular basis and throughout the year (surveys, meetings, feedback). During the meetings, the ET identifies that social partners are directly involved in the process of improving the study programme as well, however, not all of them are actively involved. All these fragmented reports of feedback are further approved by the Quality Commission and their findings are further integrated into parts of the Annual Internal Self-Evaluation Report (learning outcomes, staff, effectiveness of quality management system, contribution to private sector and society). Further, based on the findings of the Self-Evaluation Report, the QA Office drafts a Quality Improvement Strategy,

8

which is adopted by the Quality Commission. Finally, the QA Office drafts the action plan for the implementation of the Quality Improvement Strategy, which is adopted by the Quality Commission. *It is important to note that it is very important not only to collect feedback, analyze it, and make decisions, but also to communicate those decisions publicly (not only in passive way – webpage) to interested parties/stockholders. During a meeting with ET graduates could not name how they were informed about the changes in the study programme after the last observations. Full maintenance of the Deming cycle is the basis for continuous improvement and assurance of the internal quality system.*

Head of the programme, academic staff have a clear enough understanding of the mechanism of operation of the internal quality system (explained how the study programme is improved, how feedback is received and passed on to teachers and students). During the meetings with ET close communication and cooperation between teachers, teachers and students was highlighted as an advantage. The fields of the developed partnerships were named (practice places, visiting lecturers, projects, study visits to companies, etc.).

The ESLG College has developed a system for centralized collection and analysis of key data related to the study process. The system has a clear division of responsibilities for data analysis at various levels (institutional level, study programme level and study course level), drawing conclusions and providing feedback on the changes planned and implemented in the study process as a result of the analysis.

The College collects data on general statistical indicators: number of students, drop-out rates, average attendance, student retention, as well as admission results. Student performance is analysed twice per academic year after the end of the autumn and spring semesters, employee survey - once per year (information form expert group meeting).

The quality assurance processes at the ESLG College and programme level are designed to be implemented during the whole life cycle of the programme to ensure quality, superiority, and consistency in the delivery of the study programme. The quality assurance processes involve all stockholders of the College. Results of the internal quality assurance system are considered for further development of the study programme. *However, ET want to draw attention to the fact that the College should formally assess the potential risks, identify and manage them.*

The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the programme are prepared periodically (e.g., every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses. Activities of the higher education institution are transparent, public and subjected to external evaluation and assessment. Evidence is provided through the rulebook and the manual available on the corresponding websites (e.g., The Annual Internal Self-Evaluation Report based on Quality Assurance Manual of the ESLG College is available online).

The recommendations of the previous study programme evaluation have been taken into account.

Performance indicators are well described in the SER.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 2.1.</i> All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
<i>Standard 2.2.</i> Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.		X
<i>Standard 2.3.</i> Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of programme planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 2.4.</i> Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall programme as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.	X	
<i>Standard 2.5.</i> Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
<i>Standard 2.6.</i> Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	X	
<i>Standard 2.7.</i> Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study programme. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
<i>Standard 2.8.</i> The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the programme are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
<i>Standard 2.9.</i> The quality assurance arrangements for the programme are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

- To develop institutional strategy plan not only with measurable key performance indicators in all activities, but also based on with SWOT, PEST, strategic programmes and its activities and allocations as well. The College should prepare its portfolio of programmes and activities' plan for their development based on resources and investments.*
- The internal quality assurance system should be implemented through a system of quality monitoring mechanism based not only on surveys reports, meetings, feedbacks, discussions, but also on risk management and /or internal audit.*

10

2.3. Academic Staff

The academic staff in programme Master of Real Estate Management and Infrastructure are hired according to the provisions of the Administrative Instruction on Accreditation and rules pertaining to full-time/part time staff. The academic staff engaged in the programme include staff that have previously been certified by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency. 11 academic staff members are involved in the master programme.

In response to the Expert Evaluation Team's 2022 recommendation assessing the institution, the ESLG College established the Workload matrix of academic staff members. Based on the workload matrix of academic staff members, the study programme is positioned in the market as a balanced teaching and research study programme. Four professors are research intensive since they are Assistant Professors, and the support is rendered to them for promotion to higher academic title of Associate Professor. *This can be seen as a good experience of the College, as the academic staff and students did not make any complaints about the working conditions and quality during the meeting with the experts.*

Considering the information provided in SER the full-time academic staff within one academic year cover only two teaching positions (one full-time and one part-time). In terms of numbers, 64 % of academic staff in the master study programme Real Estate Management are full-time. However, when experts analyse the CVs of the academic staff and during the meeting with them, it can be noticed that the vast majority of teachers work in other higher education institutions. The ET, having analyzing the SER and its appendices, is not clear by what specific criteria a full-time academic staff (especially the professor) is identified in the College. In the projected budget for the next three years the College plan to hire 3 new junior academic staff with PhDs per each year, but it is also not clear whether it will be members of full-time academic staff?

During the meeting of ET, students noted that they do not see any qualitative difference between full time academic staff and part time. They are satisfied with the quality of their work and communication. The College meets the requirement of full-time teachers in the study programme: 7 academic staff members are full time, and 4 academic staff are part time.

The College has prepared The Staff Development Plan of the ESLG College 2021-2026, which integrates the need for qualification improvement, indicators of scientific activity, etc. During the meeting with ET, the academic staff could not explain how exactly motivation system works in the College. However, they provided some examples of motivation: the College helped publish a book or organized some seminars and conferences with UTB. The College administration provided additional information about the funding allocated for the motivation of teachers and it amounts to about 500 EUR per teacher.

The workload for service to academic community and community cannot exceed 10 % of total workload according to the ESLG College Staff Workload Policy. This is also regulated in Articles 16-20 of ESLG Staff Workload Policy (SER, 64 p.).

Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available. (http://www.eukos.org/repository/docs/The_end_of_the_Year_Appraisal.pdf).

During the experts meeting with academic staff ET was convinced that the outcomes of the quality assessment procedure are discussed with academic staff members. All academic staff members are required to produce an individual development plan and reports, which outlines the ways to improve the teaching and learning methods, achievement of learning outcomes, improvement of research skills, and use of technology in the courses. The procedures below are carried out by the ESLG College Quality Commission.

The College has a retirement age limit of 65 after which professors lose their full-time status but are used in advisory roles. *Also, it is worth noting that the College improved the gender balance of academic staff.*

The qualification and research record of the academic staff is on a satisfactory level. It is a visible high engagement of the academic staff. The collaboration of the academic staff is at a good level. *For the purpose of SAR, there is a gap in providing quantitative analysis and measures in changes of the academic staff in the evaluation period and the College administration should pay attention to this as well.*

The recommendations of the previous study programme evaluation have been taken into account.

Performance indicators are well described in the SER.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study programme under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	X	

<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study programme are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study programme.	X	
<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study programme, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
<i>Standard 3.6.</i> Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant.

ET recommendations:

- 1. The system of human resources planning, and motivation has been created in the College, but it should be more empowered and implemented in real life.*

2.4. Educational Process Content

The mission of the programme is to develop leaders of the future in the construction and real estate industry in Kosovo by instilling in them also the values of sustainable construction, energy efficiency, and environmental protection.

The main strategic objective of the programme is to advance holistic knowledge of real estate for sustainable urbanization in Kosovo through innovative research-based teaching.

The study programme is interdisciplinary and various disciplines of real estate management are intertwined in the study programme and taught from the managerial perspective. The purpose of this study programme is to satisfy the needs of construction and infrastructure sector with skilled managers taught from the sustainable real estate management.

The study programme complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The learning outcomes, study methods and assessment methods are described in the syllabuses for each course. *However, ET want to point out that course descriptions are intended not only for teachers, but also for students, so they must be clearer and show a direct correlation between each programme task, learning outcomes, teaching/learning methods, assessment methods and criteria. The ECTS credit concept is correctly adapted in the study programme, but the course description does not show how much time the student devotes to achieving one or another learning outcome through contact and independent study.*

The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programmes and curricula delivered in the EHEA. The study programme consists of 10 learning outcomes, which are correctly methodologically constructed and focused on a critical and analytical and evaluative approach.

Syllabuses of curriculum are state of the well documented and published on the website.

Article 3 paragraph 1, item 3 of the Regulation on Admission and Transfer of Students at Master level foresees that if the language of instruction is English for the whole programme, students must pass the Graduate Record Examination (GRE) test with the result of at least 450 points in the paper based institutional GRE test. The GRE test can be also Computer based GRE test. For academic staff the requirement for teaching in English language is that they must do the PhD degree in one of foreign universities with the language of instruction in English. During the meeting with the experts, academic staff and students spoke English well and it is obvious that the stipulated requirements of the standard are being met.

The internationalization dimension is very important in the master's study programme, especially in management direction. *Internationalization aspects should be more clearly visible in course descriptions, students' scientific and project activities, and master's theses as well.*

The faculty of the programme received great feedback from students and graduates in the meetings and from surveys as well.

The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. During the meeting with the ET, the students and alumni emphasized the good and close relationship with the teachers and the flexible procedure for organizing the studies. The College administrative staff and academic staff responds to the social needs of study programme students as well.

The ESLG College adopted a document called Guideline for Competence-Based Teaching Philosophy on 15.12.2022, which elaborates about the teaching philosophy that all professors at the ESLG College should embrace. The teaching philosophy is competence-based teaching rather than content-based teaching based on achievement of learning outcomes.

Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses. Student assessment is regulated by Regulation on Evaluation and Progress of Students. The regulation is transparent, and all students and professors are informed about it.

The College maintains close relations with the industry, which was confirmed by alumni and employers during the meeting with experts. *The employers' representatives were satisfied with the competences of the graduates and how they are included in the improvement of the study programme.* The main areas of cooperation were mentioned and highlighted as follows: practical placement; part-time employment; joint contract research; academic advising. The themes of the master's theses illustrate close cooperation with industry in conducting research as well.

The recommendations of the previous study programme evaluation have been taken into account.

Performance indicators are well described in the SER.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study programme is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
<i>Standard 4.2.</i> The study programme complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the programme are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		X
<i>Standard 4.3.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programmes and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study programme under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 4.4.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the	X	

distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study programme under evaluation.		
<i>Standard 4.5.</i> If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the programme.	X	
<i>Standard 4.6.</i> The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
<i>Standard 4.7.</i> Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programmes are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in programme and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	
<i>Standard 4.8.</i> Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
<i>Standard 4.9.</i> Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a programme, and in comparison, with other study programmes at highly regarded institutions.	X	
<i>Standard 4.10.</i> Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA inconsistently assessed.	X	
<i>Standard 4.11.</i> If the study programme includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified, and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study programme.		Not part of the curriculum

<p><i>Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.</i> <i>*To be inserted the overview of the programme (with all areas to be filled out)</i></p>	<p>X</p>	
--	-----------------	--

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *To update course descriptions in such a way that they fully comply with ECTS implementation and evaluation criteria. Direct correlation between each programme task, learning outcomes, teaching/learning methods, assessment methods and criteria should be shown and assure.*
2. *Internationalization aspects should be more clearly visible and implemented in all levels and activities of conducted study programme.*

2.5. Students

The ET met a group of students and alumni who are highly satisfied from the study programme. They choose this programme since it is a new programme in Kosovo and think that after finalization of this programme, they will have bright future. In addition, high level of satisfaction from the relation with their professors have been notices. On the other hand, the industry shared that the students after graduation from this programme are well equipped with knowledge.

The College has a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level prescribed in its Regulation on enrolment and transfer of master studies available on the College`s website. The same document applies for the transfer of students` between higher education institutions, faculties and study programmes. The College prescribed a list of formal requirements and relevant experience that are requested from each interested candidate. All students who will apply for the MA should have bachelor-level studies or equivalent. Furthermore, a certain level of average grade is required for enrolment in the MA. The explanation of the relevant experience has been further specified by the College based on the recommendations by the evaluation team from the previous accreditation period. According to the current ET, they are clear and understandable. Admission Affairs Committee is responsible for the admission process. In addition to this, the Regulations are prescribing what will prevail in case of limited number of students` enrolment.

At the Department of Real Estate in ESLG College, offering equal opportunities for high-quality education and student support is a top priority. The programme places a strong emphasis on catering to the needs of contemporary learners and is centered around the Competency Based Approach in curriculum development. Research competency is one of the key

competencies promoted and developed by the programme. The teaching, learning, and assessment methods are guided by the Programme Learning Outcomes, which are assessed through a Learning Outcomes Matrix Achievement Self-Assessment and a Quality Assurance Committee assessment. Based on these assessments, individual development plans are created with quality improvement methods.

Various teaching methods are used to facilitate active learning, including case studies, project work, problem-based learning, research-based learning, and simulated learning. Site visits to different buildings and cadastre, as well as interactive learning through project-based learning, case study analysis, and group work, are important components of the programme. The teacher-student ratio is favourable, allowing for effective implementation of these methods.

The course syllabus outlines the study methods and requirements for course completion, including topics to be covered, objectives, subject content, organization of work, seminar and individual work requirements, and reading lists. Coursework places a significant emphasis on research and project-based teamwork, with some courses requiring site visits and specialized equipment. Real estate appraisal courses, for example, use real case scenarios for analysis, while infrastructure courses include site visits to infrastructure companies. Interdisciplinary activities are also used to analyse various real estate problems from different angles.

The partnership between students and teachers involves both parties taking responsibility for achieving the learning objectives. *The students and alumni highlighted the positive and supportive relationship they have with their professors as well as the adaptable approach to organizing their studies. The administrative and academic staff at the College are also responsive to the social needs of the study programme's students.*

In addition, fair and objective student assessments are implemented using suitable methods for different types of learning, and these assessment criteria are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of each course. Electronic Grading System is established where the requirements of the course are calculated, and grades are stored based on the Study Rules. Furthermore, mentorship programme is applicable for the students that have such need and tutors are assigned to them followed by seminary workshops.

The student's competition rates are kept in the College's system and are included in the outcome indicators as a cross-cutting check in few of the indicators.

The College Code of Ethics for Students regulates the expected standards of behaviour during education, examinations, and written assignments, and is enforced by the Disciplinary and Ethics Committee. Students receive information about the Code during tutorials and as a notice included in Writing Assignments. The Academic Integrity Policy, which is available online, regulates violations of academic integrity by means of plagiarism, including quotations without proper citation, reformulating without proper citation, insufficient acknowledgment of sources, and using the structure and organization of thoughts based on other authors without properly citing their work. The Plagiarism Prevention Policy, also available online, establishes procedures to ensure that students' work is original. Academic staff must provide tutorial

18

courses on how to reference assignments and warn students of what constitutes plagiarism. A declaration of originality must accompany every assignment, and academic staff must use the Penalization Scale of College Policy after detecting plagiarism. Plagiarism is punishable by a range of sanctions, depending on the severity of the offense, and repeated offenses are referred to the Ethics and Disciplinary Commission. The institution uses the plagiarism detection software Turnitin and checks diploma theses through the Technical Office operated by an administrator at the institution. The rules on written assignments are regulated by the Instructions on Written Work. The College has defined a maximum percentage of plagiarism in the Code of Conduct for Students and established sanctions for plagiarism in course research assignments and diploma theses, as requested in the previous accreditation process.

The students` rights and obligations are publicly available on the College`s website in English and Albanian language. During the site visit students and alumni confirmed that they are informed about their rights and responsibilities.

Finally, from the additionally received documents from the College, it can be concluded that a small number of students are using internalization opportunities. The College should take measures to promote internalization among students and motivate them for mobilisation activities.

The recommendations of the previous study programme evaluation have been taken into account.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 5.1.</i> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study programme respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
<i>Standard 5.2.</i> All students enrolled in the study programme possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
<i>Standard 5.3.</i> The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
<i>Standard 5.4.</i> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
<i>Standard 5.5.</i> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
<i>Standard 5.6.</i> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the programme and to all examinations.	X	

<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the programme as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programmes is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant.

ET recommendations: -

2.6. Research

The research strategy and development plan of the ESLG College is fully in line with the nature and mission of the institution, since main research areas defined by the Research Strategy of the ESLG College address the advancement of research in the built environment, sustainable development and environmental protection, and green and circular economy.

The Research Strategy of the ESLG College 2021-2026 foresees sufficient financial, logistic and human resources that are necessary for the achievement of proposed research objectives under the Research Strategy.

Indicators are also established in conformity with the Research Strategy 2021-2026 and Five Year Action Plan 2021-2026 for Implementation of the ESLG College Research Strategy 2021-2026.

Each Academic staff also develops individual research plans that is in line with the Research Clusters, research objectives, and research performance indicators foreseen by the Research Strategic Plan of the ESLG College and Management of Real Estate and Infrastructure (MA) study programme. The academic staff produce Five-Year Research Plan, in which each staff sets out the priorities for the next five years, including the additional trainings that they may need in the field of research. The five-year plan of academic staff is aligned with the Research

Strategy of the ESLG College. Additionally, the Annual Research Plan of each academic staff is aligned with the Five Year Research Plan.

The scientific and scholarly activities are considered as part of Scientific and Research Activity under the Regulation on Standards for Election into Higher Academic Titles of the ESLG College.

The individual research results correspond with their respective topics, and their quality level and quantity meet the general requirements of the programme. The ESLG College has defined the prioritised journals and conferences for research output; an overview is provided; the quality level complies with international standards as well. After evaluating the data provided by SER and the teachers' CVs, it can be stated that each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific research publication product per year for the past three years.

It was difficult for the ET to accurately determine the dependence of the amount of scientific production on the College by reviewing the CVs of the programme teachers and the general information provided in the SER. *Considering the fact that part of the academic staff of the programme also work in another higher education institution and the part of the scientific activities output created by them proportionally belongs to other higher education institutions as well, so the College should introduce a more accurate calculation of the scientific output.*

During the meeting with the ET, academic staff and students noted that they conduct market research together, which is usually ordered by business representatives. This was also confirmed by the employers' representatives. *However, there are fragmentary cases of publishing the results of research conducted by teachers and students in scientific journals and publicizing them at scientific events.* The programme should develop and implement measures for better involvement of students in scientific activities.

Property rights for research are well regulated.

The recommendations of the previous study programme evaluation have been taken into account.

Performance indicators are well described in the SER.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study programme has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary programme), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	X	

<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
<i>Standard 6.3.</i> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the programme.	X	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
<i>Standard 6.5.</i> The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
<i>Standard 6.6.</i> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
<i>Standard 6.7.</i> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.		X
<i>Standard 6.9/6.8.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
<i>Standard 6.10.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 6.11.</i> Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.		X

Compliance level: Substantially compliant.

ET recommendations:

1. *To stimulate students and teachers in cooperation way conduct research, to publish results of research and to publicizing them.*
2. *Networking with international universities in the organisation of student's scientific conferences.*

2.7. Infrastructure and Resources

The evaluation was conducted online, therefore, checking the infrastructure and resources of the ET team was made based on the video shared by the respective College, and available data in the SER and the College's website. The ESLG College has only one centre, and no other campuses. Clear distinctions between facilities that are owned by the College and ones under the jurisdiction of UBT cannot be made. In addition, most of the infrastructure and resources are based on the Agreement signed with UBT which pens up the question of sustainability. The ET cannot conclude that there is a lack of infrastructure and resources, but still most of them are dependent on the agreement that the College has with UBT.

According to ET this is not sustainable and long-term solution, especially if the College projected its future enlargement, as the Head of the programme highlighted during the site visit.

The Department of Real Estate is implementing the study programme in the premises of the ESLG College seat in Annex of Innovation Campus in Lipjan, Kosovo. In addition, for the means of this programme two UBT's campuses are used one in Prishtina and one in Lipjan. The College operates in a building with a total surface of 1000 m², with 6 classrooms, 1 computer lab, a Student Affairs Office on the first floor, and an Administration Office on the second floor. The classrooms have different capacities ranging from 15 to 90 students. The department has access to a large lab with 132 computers, a videoconferencing auditorium, printing and photocopy equipment, and a video-conferencing equipment for streaming video lectures live, which are recorded and can be accessed through the electronic library. The department also provides four types of software to students and has a thermal imaging camera used for the Sustainable Facility Management course at the master's level. The department's computer laboratory is equipped with 33 computer PCs and 6 notebooks, and students can work on the mapping system in the GIS lab of UBT College. It also has an electronic library system equipped with books, readings, and video lectures for some courses held in the past. Students will have access to the library and electronic scientific and educational databases of UBT (further explanation in the text below).

The head of the programme declared their finances are stable and they have good financial plan for the next three years which is based on different sources of finances. The SER presents detailed and clear picture of their finances including breakdown of incomes and revenues. The College's financial plan is a balance between different sources of incomes. Its finances are relying heavily on the students' tuition fees while the investors' capital investments are essential in the infrastructure development.

The SER provides a breakdown of the incomes for the period 2023-2025 based on which ET concluded that: 1) a Small percentage of the budget increase is expected for the next three years for the students' fees; 2) Decreased number of incomes from the international project revenues, research and consulting services for the industry, research grants and contract research.

Furthermore, increasing is expected in donations from the private sector, which was not confirmed by the industry during ET's meeting with them.

The table with expenditures presents clear picture of the costs and their projections for the next three years. In particular decreasing of the expenditures for 1) staff sponsorships for advancement to higher academic titles; 2) lead scholar and young scholar; 3) research expenditure for staff involved directly in research projects; 4) staff development trainings and workshops; and 5) expenditures for implementation of disability inclusion strategy are projected. These cuts contradicting with the College's promises and objectives for staff's support for research and their self-development.

The programme operates on zero profit basis.

The Department of Real Estate's Library Section, located at the Annex of Innovation Campus Building in Lipjan, provides 33 student seats and operates during regular hours. Students have access to both English and Albanian textbooks, as well as around 1,000 physical and electronic copies of professional books related to real estate management, real estate appraisal, sustainability, and sustainable architecture, among others. In addition to these resources, the Department also has access to many book titles from the UBT library, thanks to an Agreement on Mutual Use of Infrastructure Resources signed between the ESLG College and College UBT. This agreement lasts for five years, with the possibility of extension, and provides access to over 10,000 book titles. Additionally, students can access thousands of books, journal articles, and other publications through the electronic library of Nova Univerza. The library provides computers and laptops for academic use, with unrestricted access to the internet. Four types of software are provided to students, including ECOTECT, SPSS, Athena Impact Estimator, and VBA Excel. The Department also has a thermal imaging camera for use in Sustainable Facility Management courses at the master's level. Finally, there is a computer laboratory with 33 computer PCs and 6 notebooks, while the UBT College has a GIS lab with ArcGIS hardware and software. Finally, the ESLG College operates an Electronic Library system, which distributes books for each course, as well as other readings, to support learning and teaching activities. Students can have access to thousands of e-books, journal articles, and other publications through the electronic library such as EBSCO, Bione, Cambridge journals, and JSTOR and SAGE. Students shared that most of the facilities are good, but also there are some of them that needs to be renovated.

The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories are limited in the building that is owned by the College. In addition, based on their agreement with UBT they have additional lecture and seminar rooms that can be used for this programme. Despite the fact that there are many rooms and laboratories that the programme can use from UBT still this is not secured approach for the students.

The SER highlights that the infrastructure and facilities are adapted to the needs of students with special needs, and that there are elevators. However, specific proves that other actions undertaken for adjusting the facilities for students with special needs were not detected by the

24

ET. The video shared by the College does not show access pathway that the students with special needs can use. In addition to this, during the site visit, when asked about this the students did not confirm that the facilities are accessible equally for everyone. On the other hand, SER presents that the College allocates expenses which are aimed at implementing its action plan of the Strategy for Inclusion of Students with Special Needs. Improvement of physical infrastructure and books are among those costs.

The recommendations of the previous study programme evaluation have been taken into account.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study programme is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study programme that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study programme for the next minimum three years.		X
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study programme submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
<i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.		X
<i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programmes: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study programme;	X	

<p>b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study programme;</p> <p>c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;</p> <p>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;</p> <p>e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.</p>		
<p><i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the programme is adapted to students with special needs.</p>		X

ET recommendations:

1. *To ensure diversified financing sources such as international projects, paid projects with the industry and better planning which will address the strategic objectives such as new academic staff.*
2. *Project funds for adapting the facilities for the students with special needs.*

3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Expert team would like to commend the programme management team for their proactive engagement with the experts during the remote validation event. There was a very strong sense of teamwork. It is evident that good level of care and attention has been given to the updating study programme and creating strong relationships with the social partners. Having considered the documentation provided and discussed it with the programme management team, the reaccreditation expert team recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
2. Quality management	Substantially compliant
3. Academic staff	Fully compliant
4. Educational process content	Fully compliant
5. Students	Fully Compliant
6. Research	Substantially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Partially compliant
Overall compliance	Substantially compliant

The overall compliance is assessed by experts at the level of Substantially compliant and the programme is rejected.

The following recommendations need to be considered:

- The SER document should be prepared much more succinctly (smaller in scope) and have a deeper critical - progress assessment approach.*
- With regards to the programme Mission, Objectives and Administration, it is suggested the following:*
 - the research concept of the programme should be strengthened by involvement of students in academic staff's research projects and more research projects led and initiated by the particular programme.
 - ensure the involvement of international academic advice.

- it is recommended that the College and UBT should be publicly and clearly distinguished to prevent conflicts of interest and to ensure the delivering quality education to their respective institutions.
3. *For achieving greater level of quality management, it is recommended:*
 - to develop institutional strategy plan not only with measurable key performance indicators in all activities, but also based on with SWOT, PEST, strategic programmes and its activities and allocations as well. The College should prepare its portfolio of programmes and activities' plan for their development based on resources and investments.
 - the internal quality assurance system should be implemented through a system of quality monitoring mechanism based not only on surveys reports, meetings, feedbacks, discussions, but also on risk management and /or internal audit.
 4. *To ensure the quantitative and qualitative requirements of the academic staff, the following is recommended:*
 - the system of human resources planning, and motivation has been created in the College, but it should be more empowered and implemented in real life.
 5. *For ensuring high-quality and student-oriented studies, it is recommended:*
 - *to update course descriptions in such a way that they fully comply with ECTS implementation and evaluation criteria. Direct correlation between each programme task, learning outcomes, teaching/learning methods, assessment methods and criteria should be shown and assure.*
 - *internationalization aspects should be more clearly visible and implemented in all levels and activities of conducted study programme.*
 6. *The College should continue to strive to maintain a close relationship with students and maintain a high level of satisfaction with their studies.*
 7. *There is a need in further development of cooperation between teachers and students on scientific activities:*
 - to stimulate students and teachers in cooperation way conduct research, to publish results of research and to publicizing them.
 - networking with international universities in the organisation of student's scientific conferences.
 8. *The College should aim to create an environment which welcomes all students, enabling them to participate fully in college life. This applies to students with disabilities:*
 - to ensure diversified financing sources such as international projects, paid projects with the industry and better planning which will address the strategic objectives such as new academic staff.
 - project funds for adapting the facilities for the students with special needs.

Expert Team

Member *Kindz -* **Assoc. Prof. Dr. Remigijus Kinderis**

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

Member
MVASALOVSKA **PhD student Marija Vasilevska**

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

Member

(Signature) (Print Name) (Date)

Member
