



UBT COLLEGE – Prishtina Branch
Bachelor of Management, Business and Economics (MBE)

Reaccreditation

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

April 5th, 2023

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	6
1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation	7
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	8
2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration.....	8
2.2. Quality Management.....	11
2.3. Academic Staff.....	13
2.4. Educational Process Content.....	16
2.5. Students.....	19
2.6. Research.....	22
2.7. Infrastructure and Resources.....	25
3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET	27
1. Mission, objectives and administration.....	27
2. Quality management	27
3. Academic staff	27
4. Educational process content.....	27
5. Students.....	27
6. Research.....	27
7. Infrastructure and resources	27

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: March 1st, 2023

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Dr. Katalin Kovacs, chair*
- *Christopher Back (student expert)*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Ms. Leona Kovaçi, KAA Officer*

Note to Board (NB): *The UBT College visit was a combined visit for the Bachelor and Master MBE programs. Please refer to the site visit schedule. There was a separate meeting ensuring the Expert Team meets the program management (heads) separately for both programs. The ET was able to validate their activities and separation of these meetings provided enough knowledge and adequate information to carry out the visit as such. When reviewing this report, the reader should keep in mind that several parts of the report will be the same as they relate to the programs. This will not be separately and specifically indicated in the text of the report.*

Sources of information for the Report:

- *Self Evaluation Report UBT COLLEGE – Prishtina Branch, Bachelor of Management, Business and Economics, January 2023.*
- *Academic Staff CVs*
- *Study Plan and Syllabi*
- *Annexes (1-19) including but not limited to: UBT Code of Ethics; Strategy 2020-2025; MBE Research Strategy; MBE Organogram; List of Partners; Staff List; Student Complaints; List of Staff Publications; Regulation on Student Registration; UBT Quality Assurance Regulation Final; Guidelines for Online Exams Organization; Academic Titles Regulations draft; Handbook for Student; Industry Board Members; MBE Call for papers*

Requested documents:

- *Thesis Guidelines and rubrics for assessment of learning outcomes*
- *Guide for Constructive Alignment of Learning Outcomes*
- *Minutes of the Faculty Quality Assurance Sub Committee*
- *Faculty performance evaluation sample*
- *Matrix linking program level learning outcomes to course level outcomes.*
- *Employer survey template*
- *Alumni survey template*
- *Student survey template*
- *Regulations (Statutes, page numbers) highlighting that Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.*
- *Regulation where grading is outlined (as indicated on page 63 in SER, under 4.9, not the Student Handbook but a Regulation)*
- *Policies and procedures regarding 4.10*
- *Regulation for the results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.*
- *Regulations for Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations. (both programs)*
- *Academic appeals regulation*
- *Faculty contract template indicating staff expectations on research and also requirements for standard 6.3*
- *Regulation which indicates that policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.*
- *Proof of ownership for main facilities*

Received documents:

- *Framework for Thesis*
- *Statement for Authenticity*
- *4.4. Matrica e Referimit sipas Harvardit*
- *4.5 Bachelor - Forma e Vleresimit te punimit te Diplomes Bachellor MBE*
- *4.6 Master - Vendimi i formimit te komisionit per mbrojtjen e diplomes*
- *Annex 2.1 - Bachelor - Raporti mbi postimet ne moodle SS212*
- *Annex 2.2 - Master - Raporti mbi postimet ne moodle SS212*
- *Example - Summer Semester Report 2021-2022*
- *Guide-for-constructive-alignment-of-learning-outcomes-and-assessment*

- *Handbook-for-student-Eng UBT Bachelor*
- *MBA QA Committee meeting note 1*
- *MBA QA Committee meeting note 2*

Received on March 20th:

- *Annex 1.1 Learning outcomes map – Bachelor*
- *Annex 2 - Employer survey template*
- *Annex 3 - Alumni survey template*
- *Annex 4 - Student survey template*
- *Annex 5.1 - Administrative Instruction for Accreditation*
- *Annex 5.2 – an example of Declarations of Honor by Academic Staff submitted to UBT and KAA*
- *Annex 5.3 - LAW ON LABOUR*
- *Annex 6.1 - Regulation for the first cycle of studies*
- *Annex 7.1 - Appeal Procedure*
- *Annex 7.2 - Regulation for students' appeal in the UBT College*
- *Annex 8.1 - Transcript of records*
- *Annex 9.1 - Decision on disabilities special needs*
- *Annex 9.2 - Special needs students instructions*
- *Annex 9.3 - Regulations for non discrimination*
- *Annex 10 - Regulation for students' appeal in the UBT College*
- *Annex 11 - Contract template*
- *Annex 12 - UBT Intellectual Property Policy*
- *Annex 13.1 - Proof of ownership for main facilities*
- *Annex 13.2 - Proof of ownership for main facilities*
- *The list of requested documents _UBT_15.03.2023*

Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations:

- *KAA Accreditation Manual-Updated 2021*
- *KAA The Manual for External Evaluation of Higher Education Institutions*

1.2. Site visit schedule

Time	Meeting	Participants
09:00 – 09:50	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated	Edmond Hajrizi Muhamet Gërvalla FT Arta Mulliqi FT Ermal Lubishtani FT
09.55 – 10.45	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff	Ylber Limani FT Ferizaj Artan Tahiri Gonxhe Beqiri FT Kestrim Avdimetaj FT Skender Ramadani Elinda Krasniqi
11:00 – 12:00	Meeting with the heads of the study programme Management, Business and Economics, BSc	Besnik Skenderi FT Fisnik Bytyqi FT Aferina Skeja FT Amir Imeri FT
12:00 – 13:00	Meeting with the heads of the study programme Management, Business and Economics, MSc	Arta Mulliqi FT Bekim Marmullaku FT
13:00 – 14:00	Lunch break (provided at the evaluation site)	
14:00 – 14:20	Visiting Facilities	
14:20 – 15:10	Meeting with teaching staff	Nora Sadiku Dushi Sema Kazazi FT Albulena Jahja FT Ermira Shehu FT Shpresim Vranovci FT Blerton Abazi FT Deniz Çelçima FT Bardha Qirezi FT Nazmi Zeqiri PT
15:10 – 15:55	Meeting with students and graduates	Fisnik Ferizi Rinor Musa Albatrit Konjufca Nora Jashari Ajsel Xheladini

		Emira Klinaku Elife Maliqi Fitore Jashari Shend Musliu Kreshnike Haliti Aulon Krasniqi Besmir Salihu Dafina Hasani-Ibrahimi Armira Fetoshi Jonxha Janova Minire Namani
16:00 – 16:45	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders	Vjosa Huruglica – Vranovci (Oda Ekonomike Austriake) Shpend Nura – (KEP Trust) Arianit Kastrati (EON TDI, OXA Group) Agon Skeja (BKT Banka) Nazmi Pllana (Audit Zone and SCAAK) – 2021 PT Feim Brava (Balkan Panel L.L.C.)- 2021 PT
16:45 – 17:00	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts	
17:15 – 17:30	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program	

1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

As indicated in the SER, UBT College was established in October 2004. The vision of the College has been clear: emphasizing the role of the labour market demand and offer competitive programs in the country and region. UBT College offers programs both on the graduate and undergraduate level with the intension of societal impact for Kosovo. UBT College claims they have a number of international accreditations; this is through their educational partnerships rather than their degree programs.

The Management, Business and Economics (MBE) reviewed here is their first program offered by UBT. The program itself has been offered for almost 20 years. This study program was originally designed by the MBE academic staff and a specific Program Development

7

Committee was established to ensure the program meets the demands of its stakeholders but also embed the knowledge of the academic staff who carries significant experience from renowned European universities. The College has also extended their relationships in the past 20 years with both academia (national, regional, and international) and with the industry and public institutions as well supporting the Triple Helix model of innovation.

UBT College has an excellent infrastructure in the Pristina locations, and it is equipped with the most updated technology to deliver the MBE Program. The Expert team witnessed this as the site visit was held in the new campus location, The market demand for the Bachelor MBE program seems to be significant (UBT College showcased a number of reports in the SER to support its reasoning for increased demand) and the fact that the hiring rate of the program is exceptional, these all result in an increased interest in UBT College's programs, including the Bachelor in MBE. The program currently is allowed to enrol 250 students; however, the College is asking for an increase to 600.

According to the SER, the MBE program in Pristina has 85 teaching and administrative staff.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration

As indicated in the SER, the mission of the Bachelor of MBE program is to “provide quality, focused and coherent studies, which focus on contemporary economic knowledge and management theory, in order to increase employment and enable career prospects.” The program objectives highlight the transfer of knowledge in all dimensions of Management, Business and Economics bringing together local and international expertise. The objectives also include the contribution to the social and economic development of Kosovo while highlighting the need to carry out further research in the field and enhancing the performance of the various sectors.

The mission of the Faculty of Management, Business and Economics in Pristina focuses excellence in teaching, learning and research with a student centred approach. The Faculty wants to ensure that its graduates are able to take on leadership roles in the society whether is in business, industry or governmental relations. In this, the mission of the Faculty indeed takes on a wholistic approach to support society. The above and the discussions with the teams on site indicate that the Bachelor of MBE program and its objectives are in line with the main mission of UBT College.

UBT College and the Faculty has taken into consideration the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area Level 6 when designing the program. This is evident from the discussions on site but also as

indicated in the supporting documents of the SER. Qualifications for Bachelor level include the requirements for students to have advanced knowledge about the field and master the understanding of theories. The need to demonstrate the application of skills is part of the requirements. The Faculty has carried out extensive comparison with international universities such as (but not limited to): University of Graz, VIA University College Oakland University, Vienna University of Applied Sciences, Copenhagen Business School, University of Southampton on curriculum and content level. The Faculty would be advised to compare the Bachelor of MBE program with the intended learning outcomes of the programs listed at the above universities and colleges as well.

Finally, feedback was gathered from other stakeholders, including business, industry, and alumni when designing the program, which was confirmed during the visit.

The study program has well-defined overarching didactic and research concepts. The SER indicates a ratio around of 70 % to 30 % between theory and practice. This means that the expectation is that the program has a substantial amount of its curricula covered by simulations, case studies, etc. This was confirmed during the site visit. Academic staff members gave examples of flipped classroom activities, guest lectures, etc. Research is also included in the program requirements, overarching concepts during the course, and showcased during the diploma thesis. However, the SER mistakenly indicated (under 1.3, pp 13.) that the bachelor students would need to conduct original research. As discussed, and confirmed during the visit with department heads and academic staff members, students are not required to present original research as that would not be aligned with level 6 framework requirements.

One of the most useful documents that was shared with the expert team is the document supporting the alignment of course level outcomes to the teaching activities in the classroom. This called the Guide for Constructive Alignment of Learning Outcomes. This document clearly set forward what the expectation is for faculty to align with course level SLOs and assessment tools used in the classroom.

There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students. These documents include but not limited to the Student Handbook; the UBT Code of Ethics; the Faculty Strategy; the Regulation on student complaints, Student registration regulation; thesis guidelines, quality management regulation, regulation for academic advancement. Moodle is the platform where they post the document above and some of them are also available to the public on the College's website. The college could benefit from including research related assessment activities in the student handbook next to the regular participation rules in lectures, the seminar activities, mid-term exams and results in the final exam.

The ethical conduct compliance is ensured through several documents and activities. The UBT Code of Ethics as mentioned above is available for all faculty, staff, and students. All are required to comply with the provisions outlined in the UBT Code of Ethics. In addition, the Code of Conduct is also available for faculty and teachers, this is distributed to them at the time of signing the contract. The students are also presented with the Students Ethical Code document. The ET also confirmed with participants in the site visit that any documents regarding the ethical compliance is clearly visible and applied fairly to all.

UBT colleges undertakes regular reviews of the documents guiding the management and delivery of the program. The Quality Assurance Office plays a crucial role in this. The office gathers important information on the assessment of the activities and shares it with the Academic Council and the Dean who has the main responsibility for the management of the program. The ET confirmed during the visit and with additional documents and minutes received that council meetings take place regularly and suggestions for changes are proposed and implemented as needed. Systematic practices are in place for the regular review of the program.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	
<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The ET recommends that the Faculty includes research related assessment activities in the Student Handbook for the Bachelor in MBE, for clear and transparent communication.*
2. *The ET recommends that the Faculty considers comparative data corresponding to Level 6 of intended learning outcomes of the program with international universities. These could be the same institutions they have already compared on curriculum level.*

2.2. Quality Management

UBT has a reliable and comprehensive Quality Management. The main document that establishes the basis on which the Quality Management System operates is the Quality Assurance Regulation (last revised 2020). The Regulation clearly defines all mechanisms, procedures and responsibilities regarding to Quality Assurance at UBT. The Quality Assurance System is working on institutional and faculty level. The responsible groups at the institutional level are:

- *The Governing Body, President,*
- *Academic Council,*
- *Quality Assurance Committee,*
- *Quality Manager,*
- *Heads of Programs and Departments,*
- *Program Councils*

On faculty level, a Quality Assurance sub-committee which consists of five members is responsible:

- *one representative of the management of the faculty.*
- *two representatives of teaching staff with research positions.*
- *one students' representative, and*
- *one representative of administrative or technical staff.*

The participation of the academic staff in the Quality Assurance Process is crucial at UBT. All academic staff is obligated to fill out a self-evaluation survey every semester. Additionally, a face-to-face meeting with the dean is scheduled once a year. This way, the academic staff members are able to participate in the development of the programme thru the monitoring system of the Quality Assurance Office (via the survey) as well as is in direct discussion with faculty management. During the on-site visit, the academic staff as well as the faculty management described this procedure as beneficial and fruitful.

To achieve the quality objectives, UBT and specifically the MBE programs have implemented a variety of quality assurance instruments and control procedures to assure and improve the quality of teaching, learning, research, community service, and quality of management. The

normal planning process for the programme is based on the analysis of information, data and reports obtained through a structured process of evaluation, monitoring and feedback from internal and external stakeholders. In the planning process, particular attention is given to the learning outcomes for students.

The quality assurance framework for learning and teaching focuses on program planning and delivery, administration, and support services. The ongoing review of practice, the experience of all staff involved in implementing Quality Assurance policy, and the management and administration of academic provision are the basis of program Quality Assurance. Resources and services are available at the MBE Bachelor program and institutional level to positively impact continuous quality assurance.

During the on-site visit UBT was able to provide a variety of examples (mainly generated by the monitoring process) how the Quality Assurance procedure assure that required standards are met and a continuing improvement in performance is assured.

Essential part of this monitoring process are the survey data from students, graduates, and employers. The evaluations contain (among other things) the results of academic success and the employment of graduates. The relevant results of the questionnaires are published on the website of the institution.

While the workload evaluation for students is part of the Quality Assurance via the student representative in the Quality Assurance sub-committee on faculty level, there is no question regarding to this topic in the student survey. The Expert Team recommends adding the workload evaluation into the student survey to provide more reliable data to the monitoring system.

The Quality Assurance Regulation defines the frequency of the preparation of reports on the overall quality of the program. A variety of individual documents and shorter reports is conducted into an overview report periodically every three years (or prior to an accreditation procedure as the SER).

During the on-site visit the Expert Team discussed the topic of the revising of the Quality Assurance arrangements themselves. While this topic belongs mainly to the institutional and not to the program level, the Quality Assurance Office representatives were able to provide an example how the importance and coverage of learning outcomes for students was implemented more extensive in the Quality Assurance procedures.

Overall, the Expert Team is very satisfied with the Quality Assurance system of UBT.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 2.1.</i> All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
<i>Standard 2.2.</i> Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
<i>Standard 2.3.</i> Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 2.4.</i> Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to <u>learning outcomes for students</u> .	X	
<i>Standard 2.5.</i> Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	
<i>Standard 2.6.</i> Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.	X	
<i>Standard 2.7.</i> Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
<i>Standard 2.8.</i> The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
<i>Standard 2.9.</i> The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The ET recommends adding a question on the evaluation of the students' workload in the existing students' survey.*

2.3. Academic Staff

As indicated in the SER, UBT College drew up the UBT Statute, which outlines the requirements for grades and titles of Academic Staff, including those teaching and associated with the Bachelor MBE program. Hence all academic staff has the required and proper academic degrees, research output and practical experience, teaching experience, among

others. The appointment and promotion process document is also guided by the statute and based on the Regulation for Academic Advancement.

According to the Statute of UBT College, full-time staff may have only one full-time position. Academic staff must declare any other activities or engagement with other institutions, this was discussed with faculty members during the site visit. Engagement of the academic staff at UBT College is guided by state regulations, which is the Administrative Instruction for Accreditation document by the Kosovo Accreditation Agency. Working hours are regulated by the Law on Labor. UBT is obliged to follow these regulations. To ensure implementation, all academic staff sign a document from the Kosovo Accreditation Agency called the Declaration of Honour. Employment contract template was provided to the ET.

Currently, more than 90% of UBT college Academic Staff are full-time employees. The ET has met one academic staff member who was part-time. The program is adequately covered with doctoral level and full-time academic staff members who have professional experience as well in their respective fields. UBT College has increased the number of faculty members in the past years, an indication that the College would like to be ready for the increased student numbers expected in the upcoming years.

Considerable number of discussions took place during the visit with regards to the faculty development activities. UBT College has the IDEAA institute (the Institute for Development and Education and Academic Affairs) which fully supports the academic staff's professional developmental activities. These include but not limited to training on how to use electronic platforms for online exams through electronic platforms (which is also guided by the Guidelines for Online Exams Organization document). In addition, and as confirmed by the onsite discussions, the College supports development activities such as international training activities which may include conferences, seminars, publication of papers in scientific journals, etc. Academic staff members are preparing self-development plans annually, and this also aid the identification of professional development activities.

Considerations have been given to the appropriateness of the workload of the academic staff members. It was confirmed during the site visit that the teaching hours amount to 8-10 hours maximum per week and the rest is divided up with research, community engagement and administrative tasks such as consultation, supervision, mentoring, etc.

The Faculty places great emphasis on student evaluations. This was confirmed by discussions with the students and alumni as well Student evaluate the faculty members after each semester. These are done by anonymous surveys/questionnaires and the results are evaluated before the start of the academic year. Members of the academic council confirmed during the visit that these are being discussed with the academic staff members and as necessary additional appointments are set up with the Dean. Faculty members do meet the Dean annually to discuss

14

their performance evaluations and staff development plans. Program management also monitors on time publishing of lectures, results etc. to ensure the process is deployed as required. If it is identified that improvements need to take place, that is discussed with the faculty members and appropriate measures are identified together with the corresponding departments (including the IDEAA institute and the OQA).

The Faculty does not have retired academic staff.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.	X	
<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
<i>Standard 3.6.</i> Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	
<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.	X	
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

No recommendation

2.4. Educational Process Content

UBT's Bachelor of MBE program has been modeled on the Bologna Framework and hence embraced the National Qualification framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The objectives of the program highlight the basic foundational knowledge and competencies and highlight application of knowledge as well in the field.

As indicated in the SER, the objectives of the program are as follows:

- “- Basic competences and knowledge in the field of study and research.*
- Apply their knowledge and understanding in a way that shows a professional approach to work and possess competencies that are usually demonstrated through drafting and supporting arguments and solving problems within the field of Management, Business, and Economics.*
- To collect and interpret relevant data in the field of business and economy, as well as the communication of these data with interest groups.*
- To have a professional level in approaching problems for the specific field of study”.*

The above are in line with Level 6 qualification of the EHEA and of the National Qualifications Framework of Kosovo. The program also showcases numerous orientations. The introduction of these highlights the close relationship between UBT and the industry and follow advisement of the business in the region and internationally. The program is 180 ECTS, which each year representing 60 ECTS. Each ECTS has 25 overall hours of learning effort which then includes contact hours and individual learning.

While the first 2 years of the program concentrate on the general skills and competencies (such as business communication, key concepts of business finance, information technology study, micro and macroeconomics, managerial and financial accounting, research methods, human resources, project management, etc.), the third year highlights the orientation subject areas. The purpose of orientation is to provide a higher level of understanding trends in management, entrepreneurship, and innovation with special focus on entrepreneurial processes (including SME management and setting up their own businesses).

The primary language of teaching is Albanian. In case of international guest speakers, translations are provided for the students. Also, language subjects are available for the students such as English, Public Speaking and Business Communication. In addition, UBT has established the Institute of Foreign Languages to support these activities.

It is commendable that the overall skills and competencies and the achievement of these are embedded throughout the curricula which was evident from the discussions the ET had on site with faculty members, students and from the documents received such as the Learning Outcomes Map. Advanced skills play a critical role in the program especially in the final year of study where practical application is a significant aspect to the theoretical part of the program.

The Expert Team was provided with the detailed curricula and syllabi of the program. They are standardized and contain all the necessary information including course level learning outcomes, assessment methods and their descriptions, literature, and teaching methods, etc.

As mentioned, the academic staff are required to list learning outcomes and corresponding assessment methods in the syllabi and these are being discussed in during the beginning of the lectures so while the course is designed so that students can achieve these outcomes, students themselves can take responsibility in the achievement of those outcomes. Expectations are also uploaded to the Moodle platform for students.

A variety of teaching methods are being employed during the program, the ET was able to confirm this during the discussions with the students and the academic staff members as well. Several examples were provided (example in the finance related courses). Methods are designed to support competency-based learning, active learning with project work, problem based learning and simulated learning activities.

Assessment methods and procedures are transparent and published for students in different platforms including Moodle. Policies and procedures supporting this are the Regulation for First Cycle of Studies and the Regulation for Student's Appeal (in case evaluation was inconsistent or inadequate).

In support of the practical application of the program especially in the 3rd year, UBT College has signed Memorandum of Understanding with several stakeholders and the College provides support to its students especially when it comes to internships. The career office manages the database for graduate students and also the graduate survey (the ET was provided with the alumni survey template and the employer survey template and results). Moreover, this was discussed in great extent during the meeting with the external stakeholders. During the meeting, the company representatives highlighted the fantastic nature of internships and relations with UBT College. They also highlighted that numerous courses and changes to the content of the program was discussed with them and even initiated by them to ensure students

have the right skills and ready to enter the workforce. UBT College and the program indeed has fantastic relations and support from the business community.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
<i>Standard 4.2.</i> The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X	
<i>Standard 4.3.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 4.4.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 4.5.</i> If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	N/A	
<i>Standard 4.6.</i> The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	
<i>Standard 4.7.</i> Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	X	

<i>Standard 4.8.</i> Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
<i>Standard 4.9.</i> Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X	
<i>Standard 4.10.</i> Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA inconsistently assessed.	X	
<i>Standard 4.11.</i> If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	N/A	
<i>Standard 4.12.</i> In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units. <i>*To be inserted the overview of the program (with all areas to be filled out)</i>	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

No recommendation

2.5. Students

The admission procedure is on institutional level defined by the Regulation for student registration. The regulation contains definitions and instruction for the topics of general provision, planning, competition, competition procedure and registration. UBT has a designated Regulation for non-discrimination. The Expert Team did not find any evidence, that the admission procedure is not fairly applied for all students.

The required documents for admission are:

- *application form (Online of Physically)*
- *high school diploma/certificate of completion*
- *birth certificate*

Applicants who finished high school in another country must provide evidence, that the high school diploma complies with level 3A according to International Standards for the Classification of Education (ISCED).

During the on-site visit the Expert Team had the chance to verify the capabilities of UBT to provide an effective and interactive teaching and learning process regarding to human resources and facilities. With study groups of maximum 100 students per lecture, 50 students per exercise and 30 students per seminar, the programme is fulfilling this criterion. During the meeting with the students, the Expert Team got a variety of examples how student-centred learning and teaching is approached in the programme.

The Regulation for the first study cycle defines within how much days a teacher has to publish the grading after an examination. The number of days is depending on the number of students in the course:

1 – 50 Students; 7 Calendar Days

51 – 100 Students; 10 Calendar Days

101 – 150 Students; 15 Calendar Days

151 – 200 Students; 20 Calendar Days

200+ Students; 30 Calendar Days

During the on-site visit the Expert Team got information from the students and the academic staff that this regulation is satisfactory for both groups.

UBT uses the online Student Management Information System “SMIS” to publish the grades of students. Each student can see his grades and passed subjects at any time. With the help of the “SMIS” platform each student is able to print his academic record.

Regarding to the treatment of students in special situations, the academic staff was able to explain, with the help of adequate examples, to the Expert Team how an individual and suitable solution for each of such cases can be found. During the meeting with the students, this was confirmed.

Additionally, UBT provided the Expert Team with “Standard Operating Procedures when working with students with special needs”. This document can be considered as a guide for academic staff. With this information the Expert Team can state that the flexible and suitable treatment for student in special situations is ensured in the program.

The program maintains a list of student records: examination register, application, list of students taking the examination in the given examination period, examination report, student files containing information on students’ re-examination activities and final grades earned during these activities. The documents related to student exam application and examination results are kept indefinitely while colloquium documents are stored for three years. The rate of completion of each course in each academic year as well as for the program as a whole is part of the monitoring system of the Quality Assurance Office. The completion rates are one of the defined KPI’s. Students’ assessment and progression are subject to the quality assurance processes implemented by the Program Sub-Committee on Quality Assurance.

20

To ensure that the work submitted by students is original, UBT uses the plagiarism detection software “TurnItIn”. Additionally, the UBT KnowledgeCenter is carrying out another plagiarism check with a database containing previously submitted papers by students.

During the meeting with the academic staff the Expert Team got an explanation how the teachers raise the awareness for academic integrity and importance of the topic in the lectures. When submitting the thesis each student has to sign an originality declaration. The procedures regarding this topic are defined by the “Students Ethical Code”.

The students’ right and obligations are publicly available via the website of the institution. The Regulation For Students Complaints, the Regulation For Students Appeal In The UBT College and the supportive document Appeal Procedures Based On Regulation For Appeal define the processes and criteria for this regard. During the on-site visit the students explained to the Expert Team that they are very satisfied with the transparency of UBT College. An example for an issue regarding to the students’ right and obligations could not be provided.

The Regulation On Transfer is regulating all criteria and procedures for a transfer of a student from another higher education institution, faculty or study program. The Regulation is published on the website of UBT College.

Each member of the academic staff is obligated to be available for consultation and advice for students for at least one hour per week for each course taught. During the on-site visit the students have expressed their satisfaction regarding to the availability and supportiveness of the academic but also the administrative staff. A variety of examples could be provided on how a teacher helped a student with a specific problem.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students’ recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	X	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	

<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.	X	
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

No recommendation

2.6. Research

UBT College has a well-defined Research Strategy. This was shared with the Expert Team before the site visit took place and was discussed with the leadership team during the visit. The Faculty of MBE has defined its own research mission and vision and indicated from the Research Strategy Document:

“Mission of faculty MBE: The mission of the Faculty of Management, Business and Economics in Pristina is to apply excellence in teaching, learning and research within an inclusive student-centered environment to foster graduates of distinction that are ready to take or enhance their leadership role in business, the professions, industry, public service, and society.

MBE Research Vision: To be leading research, application, and teaching center in the field of Management, Business and Economics that are recognized nationally and internationally with value creating works.”

Research goals of the faculty include contribution to the United Nations Sustainable and Development Goals; attracting more post doctorate research faculty; increase the competencies of current academic staff.

Research priorities for 2022-2025 include the subject areas of International Economics and Finance, Entrepreneurship and Innovation, Business Informatics and Digital Marketing and Sustainable Development and Goals. Research Clusters are highlighted in a variety of subject areas with implementation timelines, budgetary considerations and responsibilities clearly

assigned. Hence the Expert Team was able to confirm that the MBE Faculty and study programs have clearly defined objectives.

As was mentioned in the Faculty Standard, the expectations for teaching staff are clearly defined in the Staff Contracts presented to all academic staff. These expectations are monitored which was verified by documents presented and from the on-site discussions. The Dean has responsibility of annual discussions with faculty not only on their performance when it comes to teaching but also on their research activities. The Dean also reviews several documents (Self-Assessment, Development Plans) and receives the List of Publications for review (Annex 7 List of Publications). It is also ensured that academic staff members use their research activities to closely support their teaching activities so research and teaching is linked closely. It is clear that the course content is continuously updated according to the latest knowledge in the field and the outcome of their research activity supports specifically this. The UBT Regulation for Academic Advancement is then being used for promotional activities.

The individual workload of the Academic Staff members is appropriate to support the research mission and vision of the MBE Faculty. Academic Staff members teach a maximum of 10 hours per week and the rest of the hours are divided up for research, community engagement and administrative activities. The academic staff members are required to carry out research and this is set at 2 publications annually. Not all academic staff members will meet this criterion, but the Faculty is expected to see an increased number of publications overall and still meeting the requirement of at least one publication by the KAA. With regards to transparency, academic staff members are expected to publish under UBT College's name, and they are requested to post the list of publications on Research Gate, Google Scholar, etc.

Clear guidance is set with regards to the type of publications accepted by the Academic Council of MBE. These must be indexed journals, indication for SCOPUS and/or Web of Science, books or book chapters, conference proceedings published. Practical research is conducted with various governmental and non-governmental organizations.

The ET was provided with a list of publications and the academic staff members align their research activities in their areas of expertise and teaching. Academic Staff members publish in various journals and this is being tracked throughout the institution. There are also annual conferences organized by the MBE Faculty, whereby last year's conference attracted academics both from Kosovo but also outside the region.

UBT College encourages student involvement in research. This is obviously more prevalent on the graduate programs but even the Bachelor in MBE has research and project related outcomes and objectives embedded so linking research and teaching is highly supported. For the Bachelor MBE specifically, research is geared towards knowledge construction and different types of innovation projects. In the 2022 conference organized by the MBE faculty, there were 13 faculty-student papers and/or presentations. The ET was presented with a list of faculty-student publications as well.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	X	
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	
<i>Standard 6.3.</i> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
<i>Standard 6.5.</i> The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
<i>Standard 6.6.</i> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
<i>Standard 6.7.</i> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full time staff.	X	
<i>Standard 6.9/6.8.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
<i>Standard 6.10.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 6.11.</i> Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

No recommendation

2.7. Infrastructure and Resources

The program operates at the main Campus of UBT College in Lipjan and at the UBT City Center in Pristina. UBT College provides an impressive infrastructure with very good conditions for students and the academic staff. The facilities are modern, spacious, and welcoming. The long-term implementation of the study program is ensured by sufficient rooms for lectures and exercises and enough human resources. Furthermore, UBT is providing a digital platform for the students which provides actual information and enables easy communication with the academic and administrative staff. The IT-Office provides support for issues regarding the platform.

During the visit at UBT main Campus in Lipjan, the ET was able to get a good overview on the infrastructure and resources. The campus provides sufficient well-equipped classrooms, exercise rooms, student independent reading rooms, computer laboratories equipped with sufficient software in the fields of Management, Business and Economics, lecture halls and spaces for extracurricular activities for students. The ET wants to state that the infrastructure is far above the average regarding to other Higher Education Institutions in Kosovo, regarding to quantitative but also qualitative terms.

UBT College provided a financial plan at the level of the study program which contains projections for income and expenditures for the upcoming five years. While this plan, the alignment of the program within the overall UBT structure and the history of the program sufficiently demonstrates the financial sustainability of the program, the Expert Team recommends to prepare more detailed financial plans and projections. A worst-case calculation should be part of the financial planning.

UBT College owns all premises, classrooms, laboratories, software, equipment, and libraries at the main campus in Lipjan and rents the infrastructure at the City Center in Pristina. UBT College was able to show the certificate of ownership to the Expert Team for the Campus in Lipjan and the rental agreement for the facilities in Pristina.

The number of seats in the lecture and seminar rooms are sufficient for the study groups of the program. Adequate IT equipment for the program is provided as well. The library on the main campus of UBT in Lipjan is one of the biggest in the country. The number of seats and books in the library are sufficient for the study program. Furthermore, several resources for e-books can be used by the students and academic staff.

Flat entrances, elevators and special toilets ensure that the infrastructure and facilities on the main campus of UBT College can be used by students with special needs without any inconveniences.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.	X	
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process; b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence; d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	
<i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	
<i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	X	
<i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The ET recommends preparation of a more detailed financial plan including a worst-case scenario/risk mitigation plan. This would be the sustainability efforts for the future intakes.*

3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

The International Expert Team would like to commend the UBT College, the Faculty of Management, Business and Economics, its leadership, the academic staff members, and the administrative staff members for their efforts to commit to continued improvements of the Bachelor of MBE program. Proactive engagement with the Expert Team during the validation event was very much welcomed. The College has a systematic process in place to ensure continued quality delivery and alignment with the mission of both the College and the Faculty of MBE and its programs. It is clear that the college would like to continue serving its student population to the best of its ability and that gives assurance for the upcoming cohort of students. The relationship between UBT College and the industry is very strong showcasing commitment from both sides and ensuring that the program continues to serve the needs of the country and the region.

Having considered the documentation provided, the discussions with all the stakeholders and teams, the Re-accreditation Panel recommends the following:

Standard	Compliance level
1. Mission, objectives and administration	Fully compliant
2. Quality management	Fully compliant
3. Academic staff	Fully compliant
4. Educational process content	Fully compliant
5. Students	Fully compliant
6. Research	Fully compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Fully compliant
Overall compliance	Fully compliant

Compliance level: Fully compliant

Student quota recommended/Three or Five Years:

The ET recommends (re) accreditation for a period of 5 years.

The ET team was informed after the submission of the draft reports for UBT College that the KAA is in the process of drawing up guidelines and regulations related to the number of students enrolled in the programs. The KAA indicated the maximum allowance for student quota to be set at 250 for this specific program. In order to support the State Council of Quality in their decision-making process on the number of students, the requested 250 is indicated. The ET to ensure its independence and to uphold the Code of Ethics, will not be engaged in further stipulation.

Expert Team

Member



Dr. Katalin Kovacs

April 5, 2023

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)

Member



Christoph Back

April 5, 2023

(Signature)

(Print Name)

(Date)