



**UNIVERSITY “ISA BOLETINI” IN
MITROVICA (UMIB) FACULTY OF LAW**

Master: Human Rights and Rule of Law, LLM

Program Accreditation

Draft- REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

15.05.2023., Prishtina

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. Context.....	3
1.2. Site visit schedule	4
1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation	5
2. PROGRAM EVALUATION	6
2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration.....	6
2.2. Quality Management.....	7
2.3. Academic Staff.....	11
2.4. Educational Process Content.....	14
2.5. Students.....	16
2.6. Research.....	19
2.7. Infrastructure and Resources.....	21
3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET.....	22

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 4th May, 2023

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum, Tübingen (Germany)*
- *Asnate Kazoka, Student expert (Latvia)*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- *Shkelzen Gërxhaliu, KAA Officer*

Sources of information for the Report:

Information provided before or during the site visit:

- *Self-Evaluation Report (SER) submitted by UMIB*
- *Information obtained during the site visit with the management of the faculty, teaching and administrative staff, external stakeholders and employers of graduates*
- *Website of University of Mitrovica*
- *Visits of on-site facilities*

Additional information requested by the ET:

- *Statistics at the Faculty level with academic breaches and action taken*
- *List of professional development training for academic staff, planned for the start of the new study programme, if any*
- *CV's of the three part-time staff members that will be employed at the study programme*
- *List of book titles purchased in preparation of this study programme*
- *Student statistics on LLB Law since 2019 (number of applicants, number of admitted students, number of graduates, number of drop-out)*
- *Curriculum of the LLB Law*
- *Detailed statistics on incoming and outgoing student transfer in the Faculty of Law for the last 6 years (year; programme and institution from where the student was transferred and the programme and institution to which the student was transferred)*

- *Improvement plans for the Faculty of Law (2019, 2020, 2021, 2022)*
- *Any quality assurance reports produced on the level of the Faculty of Law*
- *Regulation on the size of student groups at UMIB (if any)*
- *Anticipated results of Key Performance Indicators for the LLM Human Rights and the Rule of Law (if defined)*
- *Financial plan for the sustainability of the study programme for the next 3 years*
- *List of full time professors in Bachelor Program*
- *Number of actual places of Bachelor Law Programs and Master Law Programs in whole Kosovo*
- *List of courses and hours the professors in Master Program are doing in addition in Bachelor Program*

Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations

- *Standards for institutional evaluation as outlined in the Accreditation Manual 2022 of the KAA*

1.2. Site visit schedule

Time	Meeting
09:00 – 09:50	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated
09:55– 11.40	Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative staff
11:45 – 12:45	Meeting with the heads of the study programme
12:45 – 13.45	Lunch break
13:45 – 14:15	Visiting Facilities
14:15 – 15:05	Meeting with teaching staff
15:10 – 15:50	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders
15:50 – 16:00	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts
16:00 – 16:10	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program

1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

The vision of the University of Mitrovica "Isa Boletini" (hereinafter UMIB) is to be a leading Higher Education Institution in the region, in education and scientific research and in preparing competitive professionals in areas unique to Kosovo and the region, in order to meet the requirements of the present and project the needs of the future, for the scientific-academic needs, the needs of the market economy, and institutional and diplomacy needs, focused on sustainable development and social welfare.

The mission of UMIB is to provide high-quality education for the preparation of cadres in unique fields for the labour market in Kosovo, region and beyond, committed to developing scientific research, professional projects, professional advising, and to better serve on sustainable development, well-being and social advancement.

The foundations of higher education studies in Mitrovica were laid in 1961 by opening the Technical High School. In 1970, within the Technical Faculty, the departments of Mining, Technology and Metallurgy were opened, initially in Mitrovica (the academic year 1970/71), and then continued in Prishtina until the establishment of the Faculty of Mining and Metallurgy in Mitrovica in 1974. In the first founding years, the studies were organized in the following departments: Mining, Technology and Metallurgy, whereas the department of Geology was opened in the academic year 1980/81. The establishment of the Faculty of Mining and Metallurgy was of great importance for Kosovo. It was the Mining and Metallurgical Plant "Trepça" that had a countless need for engineering staff coming out of the Faculty of Mining and Metallurgy. The cadres from the Faculty of Mining and Metallurgy and the High Technical School have occupied a well-deserved place in the Kosovo Power Plant, and the entire industry and economy of Kosovo.

On the basis of these faculties and based on over 60 years of tradition of Higher Education in Mitrovica, the Government of the Republic of Kosovo on 06.03.2013 established the Public University of Mitrovica, while the Assembly of Kosovo ratified the decision on May 31, 2013. Based on the Temporary Statute, approved by the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, there are six faculties within the University of Mitrovica "Isa Boletini" (UMIB): Faculty of Geosciences (FGS), Faculty of Food Technology (FFT), Faculty of Mechanical and Computer Engineering (FMCE), Faculty of Law (FL), Faculty of Economics (FEC) and Faculty of Education (FED). Within these faculties, the total number of programs accredited at UMIB is 16 study programs at two levels: Bachelor and Master.

A total of 135 professors and assistants are engaged in the teaching process at UMIB. Out of them, 106 are full-time professors, and 29 contracted professors.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, Objectives and Administration

The Self-Evaluation-Report (SER) of UMIB contains two sentences concerning the mission and the vision of the planned Master Program Human Rights and Rule of Law. The rest of this part is a discretion of the Faculty of Law (FL).

It goes without saying that there is the goal to provide deep studies in Human Rights and the Rule of Law and to prepare students with attitudes, knowledge and skills. But there is not the attempt to describe why there is a need of this program in Republic of Kosovo and in this Faculty. The annexe 1.1.4 which should give information about the mission and vision of the program (see p. 19 SER) does not exist. The Annex 1.1.3 is without any substance.

There are fundamental doubts if there is a need for this Master's Program because FL starts in the Bachelor Program only with 60 students each year. And it is improbable that nearly the half of the Graduates will start a Master's Program. As well it is improbable that students come from greater surroundings noticing that the University of Pristina has a wide and good quality International Master Program. So it seems to be illusory to create a Mitrovica a "unique gravity centre of Human Rights and Rule of Law" (p. 18 SER).

Concerning the Qualification-Framework the SER demands:

1. To demonstrate in-depth knowledge of human rights and the rule of law areas
2. To analyse the case studies, the connections between the relevant justice factors that enable you to critically offer possible solutions to human rights
3. To compare the legal aspects of human rights and rule of law problems with different countries
4. To demonstrate the ability to integrate knowledge and deal with complex problems by reflecting on justice issues
5. To apply contemporary methods in the field of law, in order to be able to cope successfully in their work positions

This are very general proclamations without concrete relation to the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

The documents of a didactic a research plan concerning the Law Faculty is understandable and in general it seems to be possible to use it as well for the Master program. The same it to say about the policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues.

Concerning the ethical conduct in research, teaching, assessment in the academic and administrative activities there are no recommendations; but this part could be stronger international founded. Concerning a frequently review at least once every two years cannot be determined because the Program has not started yet.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 1.1.</i> The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.		X
<i>Standard 1.2.</i> Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.		X
<i>Standard 1.3.</i> The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.	X	
<i>Standard 1.4.</i> There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues . These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 1.5.</i> All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research , teaching, assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
<i>Standard 1.6.</i> All policies , regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	-	-

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *To work out the special need of the Program for the Republic Kosovo*
2. *To work out the special need of the Program for the Faculty of Law*
3. *To work out the special need of the Program for the Labour Market*

2.2. Quality Management

The internal quality assurance system at UMIB is organised according to the UMIB Statute, Regulation for Quality Assurance and Assessment, Guide for Quality Assurance, Guide for

ECTS, Document for the main performance indicators and Quality Measurements Instruments Package.

Before providing the compliance assessment for each standard, the ET would like to formally recognise UMIB's commitment and efforts to implement a consistent institutional quality assurance system and ambition to develop further. The descriptions and links provided in the SER and the overall well-structured SER demonstrates a solid level of understanding of the requirements of KAA and the ability to present compliance in a realistic manner. The ET found the SER very informative and easy to follow, providing sufficient information in relation to the standards. All the main regulatory documents were provided as part of the SER and with links to English versions in good quality, thus allowing the ET to focus on the substance of the review and request only additional materials that are not foreseen by the mandatory content of the SER. In the future though, the ET would recommend a more analytical (as opposed to descriptive) approach to the SER, clearly reflecting the strategic deliberations leading to different decisions and actions.

Throughout the SER it is visible that UMIB acknowledges quality assurance system as being designed at the institutional level and further implemented at faculty level and fully adheres to all institutional procedures. The SER repeatedly states that the quality assurance reports form a basis for strategic planning at the FL level.

The ET was provided a strategic plan for the FL for the period 2019 – 2021. The action plan included foresees a Strategic Objective No.4 “Development of quality assurance system” with three specific objectives – capacity building for quality assurance within the FL (activities – QAC/FL training for SEVC platform, training of academic staff for the SEVC platform for their needs), raising awareness on the quality assurance system (activities – organising discussions between academic staff and administrative staff for internal quality, organising workshops and information sessions with FL students on the role of internal quality assurance) and internal and external quality assessment (activities – designing and developing questionnaires for internal quality assessment for the program needs, the establishment of a working group for drafting the SER of FL, review of the SER for the re-accreditation process and implementation of recommendations of GE of KAA and review of the syllabus us of program courses). The Strategic Plan clearly demonstrates that quality assurance is a priority at FL. However, UMIB currently operates according to the strategic plan 2023 – 2025 and the ET did not learn of a corresponding FL strategic plan including or for this period. Therefore, while the ET acknowledges the overall approach of UMIB, it cannot unanimously conclude that the strategic activities of FL are also aligned for the period 2023 – 2025.

The self-evaluation of the academic staff is an integral part of the internal quality assurance system at UMIB. According to the SER, this takes place twice a year, i.e. after each semester and the results of this evaluation together with the student evaluation of staff and dean's evaluation of staff form the basis of the Quality Assurance Office report. The academic staff

8

members interviewed by the ET were well aware of the quality assurance mechanisms that they are subject to.

The Quality Measurement Instruments Package includes templates for the following surveys conducted at UMIB – student evaluation of teaching, courses and resources, student evaluation of study programs and research work, evaluation for academic staff, self-evaluation for deans, evaluation for dean’s work by the academic staff, deans’ evaluation form for the academic staff, survey for external stakeholders, survey for alumni, survey for the administrative staff, survey for the academic staff, evaluation of support services. The SER also mentions an evaluation of study programs by final year students but no related survey template has been included in the Quality Measurement Instruments Package.

During the interviews, the ET received several confirmations that these tools are implemented in practice. However, the ET would like to make a note that the quality assurance system at UMIB is to a large extent based on surveys and this creates a significant workload for everyone involved, and is likely to result in survey fatigue which will eventually reduce the efficiency and reliability of the data collected. While surveys are a valuable tool, it is important to align them with other strategic processes so that the quality assurance actions would derive from the strategic objectives and the results would feed into the daily work of UMIB in order to reach these objectives. It is also important that the resources spent are appropriate for the value gained, as otherwise, it could end up in numerous processes of gathering and storing data without actual analysis, with the UMIB community complaining about the workload and seeing little purpose and even less benefit. It is important that quality assurance processes are able to identify what information and how much should be collected and these decisions should be informed by the relevance of analysis outcomes. The ET would suggest that UIBM explores ways how to re-balance this.

Also, as this is the first program at the master’s level at the FL, special attention should be paid to monitoring and measuring the inputs and outputs of this specific study program. Perhaps, the FL can seek experience from other UMIB faculties that already implement master’s level studies.

In general, the quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as for different components within it. The overall results of the surveys are presented on the webpage of UMIB: <https://www.UMIB.net/en/quality-assurance-reports>. However, the ET found that not all previously mentioned assessment instruments are reflected in these reports. There are general reports on the results of surveys for bachelor’s students and master’s students. Also, there are separate summary reports on the results of student surveys for each study level at each faculty, including the Summary report on questionnaires conducted with students of the FL on the bachelor level. There are also reports on the results of the academic staff self-assessment and alumni surveys. The written summaries of the survey of external

stakeholders and administrative staff are, however, missing as well as the results of some other surveys.

When studying the content of published reports, the ET learned that the reports present the overall satisfaction level and most reports conclude that the satisfaction level is generally high. However, for each question, there is not a big but still, a considerable share of evaluation “average” and the justification for such evaluation has not been presented and analysed in the summary report. The ET came to the conclusion that this is due to the survey template that only asks to evaluate each statement on a scale from 1 to 5 but does not ask for comment in case the evaluation is lower than 5 but only asks for general comments at the end of the survey. The ET would suggest that UMIB includes more open questions or provides a possibility (asks) for a comment on each question to both understand the reasons for student disappointment and to see which elements the students have appreciated the most. The statistics on the student survey in 2022 (899 surveys filled in and only 329 comments provided) also confirm that students are not eager to provide comments in this general section.

Most of the comments/suggestions provided are related to improving the teaching methods, exploring the possibilities for combining online and physical learning and improving the possibilities for practical work.

While most of the published reports contain some suggestions/ recommendations, it is not clear whether and how these recommendations were followed up and implemented within the FL and UMIB.

UMIB publishes annual reports on the monitoring results of key performance indicators (KPI). These reports provide extensive statistical information – some on the level of each faculty and some on the level of each study program – but there is a lack of specific targets for each KPI and the analysis on the achievement of these targets. The ET would recommend defining a target for each KPI on the level of each faculty or program and performing regular analysis on the achievement of these targets and the reasons for that.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 2.1.</i> All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
<i>Standard 2.2.</i> Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
<i>Standard 2.3.</i> Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
<i>Standard 2.4.</i> Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X

<i>Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.</i>		X
<i>Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.</i>		X
<i>Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.</i>	-	-
<i>Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.</i>	X	
<i>Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.</i>	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Define measurable targets for each of the Key Performance Indicators (KPI) already proposed for the program level and monitor their achievement as part of the FL and UMIB annual reports;*
2. *Ensure that the results of all surveys conducted at UMIB and FL are reflected upon in summary reports that are publicly available and monitor the suitability of surveys and their potential to constantly render relevant outcomes which can lead to correction or improvement measures in reasonable timeframes;*
3. *Include the template for the Evaluation of study programs by final year students as a part of the Quality Measurement Instruments Package;*
4. *Review the templates for student surveys to include a possibility of providing a comment next to each question and to even require it in case the mark is lower than “Excellent”;*
5. *Monitor the data collected to ensure that all the data are still relevant and reflect program performance therefore can be practically used for follow-up actions;*
6. *Ensure that all quality assurance reports include recommendations that are later followed up by the relevant structures and that the results of their implementation are documented and communicated to UMIB staff, students and stakeholders.*

2.3. Academic Staff

The employment process and conditions are based on the Law on Higher Education, the Labor Law, the University Statute, the Regulation on the procedures and criteria for the selection,

advancement and admission of academic staff at the University of Mitrovica "Isa Boletini" and the Instructions of the Ministry of Education, Science and Technology.

Legal acts as above ensure that all recruited academic personnel have the relevant qualifications to effectively manage educational, scientific and research activities. The employment process begins by making public the competition for the relevant position. After the application of the candidates, the selection process takes place in two stages, first the selection of the successful candidate within the faculty and then the second stage within the bodies at the University central level.

After the completion of the competition procedures and the selection of the academic staff, the decision is issued by the University Senate for the academic call for the subjects announced in the competition, as well as the employment contract is signed, in which the duties and responsibilities of the academic staff are specified.

In a table is this showed for the members of the Academic Staff of the Program under Evaluation.

There are no recommendations that the teaching staff comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the administrative instruction on Accreditation.

The SER gives no information in which quantity the academic staff of the planes Master Program of Human rights and Rule of Law is charges with teaching and administration work in the Bachelor of Law Program. The additional document sent by the FL gives a few information. But it rests uncertainty that the Master Program is sufficiently independent from the Master Program. It is important for the new Program to have independence from the beginning.

For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed more than one full-time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.

Concerning professional development of teaching staff in the SER is listed (p. 60) "staff training certificates" as Annex 4.7.1. But this Annex does not exist. As well the Annex 3.6.3 "Certificates and other evidence for the completed trainings" (s. p. 45 SER) does not exist. And there is no other prove of staff professional development. The "UMIB strategic plan" is not concrete enough for this question.

Concerning the responsibilities of all teaching staff for consultations with students and community service the author of the SER did not make any effort the write one word concerning the new Master Program (only Bachelor Program).

Concerning Strategies for quality enhancement the author of the SER did not make any effort the write one word concerning the new Master Program (only Bachelor Program).

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 3.1.</i> Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.2.</i> The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	
<i>Standard 3.3.</i> Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.		X
<i>Standard 3.4.</i> At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
<i>Standard 3.5.</i> For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
<i>Standard 3.6.</i> Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.		X
<i>Standard 3.7.</i> The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.		X
<i>Standard 3.8.</i> Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self-evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occur on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	-	-
<i>Standard 3.9.</i> Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
<i>Standard 3.10.</i> Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. Concerning all aspects the responsible of the Program have to refer all the structures, methods and plans to the Master Program Human Rights and Rule of Law. It is to differentiate of the Bachelor Program.

2.4. Educational Process Content

The Educational Process Content has numerous fundamental problem:

Without doubts realization of human rights and rule of law is a very important issue all over the world and particularly as well in Republic of Kosovo. Realization is possible and necessary in two aspects. Human rights and rule of law has to penetrate the concrete valid rules. For this aspect it is necessary to work very close with concrete valid norms. For the other aspect, there is a need to realize research and teaching about fundamental problems and the development of human rights in a fundamental word-wide dimension. For this aspect a very good reputation is indispensable and the demand for these experts in the labor market is small.

The offered Master's Program of University of Mitrovica complies with neither the first nor the second aspect. The syllabi don't concern the valid rules of Republic of Kosovo; they concern the general theme of need of human rights and the rule of law in general. But to content the international demand the syllabi would need a different level of international literature, overall in English language. E.g. the course "Fundamental rights and freedom in comparative constitutional law" mention only one title in English language (Oxford Handbook), the rest is in Albanian language. As well the students would have to prove their ability of the English language to be enrolled for this program.

Furthermore, the Program includes the courses "Contract Law" and "Scientific Research Methodology" which concern not strong enough the theme of the Master's Program. Particularly the subject "Scientific Research Methodology" concern according to the syllabus only very easy support of writing in general (writing business letters, writing as a process, writing practice...). This could if need be a subject for the Bachelor's degree.

In general, no references to access to internet sources are given in the syllabi in regard to the literature. This is in no way up-to-date, especially in a Program with an international focus and with great international importance, Internet research is indispensable.

The course "Transitional Justice" is of course very interesting and as well very demanding. There is not enough international literature given to realize it in an acceptable way. A appropriate deepening concerning the Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Lebanon, Yugoslavia or Nurnberg appears in the previous time in one semester not possible.

The ET had while the meeting with the teaching staff not the impression that the responsible professors for the course "Economic, Social and Human Rights" are informed about the international basic codifications for human rights. A discussion about the relevance of social human rights was not possible.

14

This program realizes not the market need for “judiciary, prosecution, advocacy, administration, notary, research institutions, enterprises in the counts and abroad” (p. 50 SER).

Standard Learning Outcomes 4.1 – 4.7 Student assessment 4.8-4.10 Practice stages 4.11-4.12	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 4.1.</i> The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students’ personality.		X
<i>Standard 4.2.</i> The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.		X
<i>Standard 4.3.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To be listed at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.		X
<i>Standard 4.4.</i> The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline’s objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students’ assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation.		X
<i>Standard 4.5.</i> If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.		X
<i>Standard 4.6.</i> The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students’ development.	X	
<i>Standard 4.7.</i> Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and	X	

assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.		
<i>Standard 4.8.</i> Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X	
<i>Standard 4.9.</i> Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.		X
<i>Standard 4.10.</i> Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or KAA inconsistently assessed.	X	
<i>Standard 4.11.</i> If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.		X
<i>Standard 4.12.</i> In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units. <i>*To be inserted the overview of the program (with all areas to be filled out)</i>		X

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The program must be clearly related to the international codex on human rights*
2. *International literature should be included much more.*
3. *Links and online access to literature must be proven.*
4. *The individual courses must be related more closely to each other and to the core topic Human Rights and Rule of Law.*

2.5. Students

The admission requirements for the MA Human Rights and Rule of Law are based on the general Regulation for Master Studies at UMIB. According to this regulation, master’s studies are open to all candidates that have previously obtained bachelor’s degree in Kosovo or abroad and completed bachelor studies with 240 ECTS. However, neither in the SER nor during the site visit FL presented specific admission requirements for the MA Human Rights and Rule of

16

Law that would include the required background, a statement on the existence of entrance examination and the weight of different criteria during the admission procedure. The ET believes that the admission requirements must be subject-specific and already at this stage of program development they need to be detailed, clearly indicating in what cases and what type of entrance examination is applied, what is the share of the average grade, entrance examination results and other elements as well as whether there is a special requirement regarding the language skills.

There is an internal regulation on the size of student groups for different activities at UMIB and the size is differentiated for faculties. According to this regulation, for the FL the group size is up to 70 students for mandatory lectures and at least 10 students for lectures in elective subjects; up to 35 for mandatory exercises and 10 for exercises in elective subjects. UMIB is applying for the quota of 45 students which would constitute one group for lectures and two groups for exercises and would be appropriate in the view of ET. However, in the SER FL states that both the lectures and exercises will be held in two groups. As this directly affects the workload of the academic staff and subsequently the salaries, the ET urges FL to clarify this information.

In the SER UMIB states that it applies continuous evaluation where a significant part of the final evaluation is made up by the evaluation that the student receives through the semester and this was also confirmed by syllabi and during interviews. The syllabi that include the proposed assessment methods are available to the students through University Management System (SMU). There are specific support mechanisms available for students that do not manage to pass the exam.

The results of student assessments are placed in the University Management System (SMU), through which at the end of the studies the transcript of grades as well as the exam result statistics are automatically generated. All graduates are entitled to a diploma supplement. According to the Regulation for Master Studies Article 16, the regular exam dates include: January, June and September. The exact period for each term is determined by the general calendar of studies, which is accepted by the Senate and is available publicly. The Article 17 of the Regulations on master's studies defines the specific situations in which flexible treatment is foreseen, e.g. the student participates in an international study exchange program or is doing practical training abroad during the period assigned for the exam. However, the ET would like to suggest a broader formulation of such cases to allow more flexibility for the dean to decide, for example, in case of urgent health issues, family conditions, disabilities and other. It would be important that such special cases are not counted as a failure of the exam and do not prevent the student from receiving a scholarship or other benefits.

The student completion rate is an important indicator that has been included among the KPI defined by UMIB. In the SER FL confirms the regular monitoring of the student completion rate and that these results are used in the debate with the aim to increase the level of quality in teaching.

The concept of plagiarism is referred to in the Code of Ethics and the UMIB Statute. As several other universities in Kosovo, UMIB is part of the Erasmus+ project ResearchCult which

includes the Turnitin anti-plagiarism check system. According to the SER, this software is also available to students through the SMU platform. However, the Regulation for master’s studies suggests that only master’s thesis would be subject to a compulsory plagiarism check. It specifically states that the allowed percentage for similarities for the master’s thesis is 15% and there is no mention of other assignments that would be checked.

According to the SER, the students’ rights and obligations are defined in several regulatory documents, including the Regulation on master’s studies. While these documents are available on the UMIB website, UMIB uses a number of other tools to inform the students about their rights and obligations. These include the Student handbook, orientation day, newsletters. The possibility to complain is foreseen, too, although the ET could not assess its application in the program submitted for accreditation.

There is a separate Regulation on Transfer of Studies at UMIB. It foresees the possibilities of transfer of studies from abroad, change of department (internal transfer) and change of curriculum. The SER also reports the transfer cases that have taken place at FL every year. However, only the possibility to transfer from abroad or internal transfer within UMIB are foreseen. At the same time, the Regulation for Master’s Studies state that “for the change of the study program or for the transfer of the student from another Program (Faculty) of UMIB, or from any other accredited University in the country or abroad, the provisions of the relevant Regulation for the transfer of studies at UMIB apply”. In the view of the ET, UMIB would benefit from a clearly regulated possibility for the students of other universities in Kosovo to transfer to UMIB, through the Regulation on Transfer of Studies.

According to the UMIB internal regulations, each academic staff has to dedicate one hour per week for consultations with students for two hours of compulsory lectures. The consultation schedule is announced both on the FL website and also physically at the entrance of academic staff offices. There is also a Center for Psychological Support and Wellbeing that provides specific support in case needed.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 5.1.</i> There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students’ recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.		X
<i>Standard 5.2.</i> All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	X	
<i>Standard 5.3.</i> The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	X	
<i>Standard 5.4.</i> Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	-	-

<i>Standard 5.5.</i> The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
<i>Standard 5.6.</i> Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.		X
<i>Standard 5.7.</i> Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
<i>Standard 5.8.</i> Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		X
<i>Standard 5.9.</i> Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
<i>Standard 5.10.</i> The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
<i>Standard 5.11.</i> Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Define clear subject-specific admission requirements for the MA Human Rights and the Rule of Law;*
2. *Clarify the size of student groups for MA Human Rights and the Rule of Law and its relation with the Regulation on personal incomes in UMIB;*
3. *Consistently apply plagiarism checks on all written assignments and offer students sufficient information to develop preventive practices;*
4. *Review the Regulation on Transfer of Studies so that it clearly foresees a procedure for transfer from other universities and study programs in Kosovo;*
5. *Revise the regulations in regard to flexible student treatment in exams in cases where the student is not able to participate in the exam due to objective reasons other from those currently prescribed by the regulation and ensure that such special cases would not be counted as a failure of the exam and would not prevent the student from receiving a scholarship or other benefits.*

2.6. Research

The full-time professors provide evidence of scientific research. However, most of the publications were not in the subject area of the proposed program.

The scientific research objectives are – as the most messages in in the whole SER- not referred to new Master Program but to the Bachelor of Law program which is already accredited.

No verifiable evidence of scientific publications was presented for Prof. Beka. The information only contains titles but no sources.

A strategy has to be developed how students can be involved in research in the new course.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 6.1.</i> The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.		X
<i>Standard 6.2.</i> Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.		X
<i>Standard 6.3.</i> Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
<i>Standard 6.4.</i> The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.		X
<i>Standard 6.5.</i> The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.		
<i>Standard 6.6.</i> Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	
<i>Standard 6.7.</i> Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.	X	
<i>Standard 6.8.</i> Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff.		
<i>Standard 6.9/6.8.</i> Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
<i>Standard 6.10.</i> Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
<i>Standard 6.11.</i> Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.		X

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *The FL has to involve more professors which have publications in the thematic of the Master Program.*
2. *The FL has to develop a research strategy concerning the Master Program.*
3. *A strategy has to be developed how students can be involved in research in the new course.*

2.7. Infrastructure and Resources

The UMIB has a very new building. The equipment is very good compared to other facilities in the Republic of Kosovo. In particular, there are enough lecture rooms, group rooms and study-work rooms. The library premises and the options for students with special needs are also satisfactory.

The literature specified for the program is not sufficient (see above “2.4. Educational Process Content”). But even this low standard provided in the syllabi cannot actually be met by the library.

The ET selected eight titles from the specified basic literature from different courses and asked to be able to look at these books in the library. Five of these titles were not available at all. A title could be submitted. Another title, although given in English, was available online in Albanian. Another title could be found with some effort via an internet search.

This is absolutely not satisfactory! Irrespective of the other conditions, the prerequisites for an orderly study program are not met.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
<i>Standard 7.1.</i> The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	
<i>Standard 7.2.</i> There is a financial plan at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years.		X
<i>Standard 7.3.</i> The higher education institution must demonstrate with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, for the next at least three years: a) owned or rented spaces adequate for the educational process;		X

<p>b) owned or rented laboratories, with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities;</p> <p>c) adequate software for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, with utilisation licence;</p> <p>d) library equipped with reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock according to the disciplines included in the curricula.</p>		
<p><i>Standard 7.4.</i> The number of seats in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be related to the study groups' size (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.</p>	X	
<p><i>Standard 7.5.</i> The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs:</p> <p>a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program;</p> <p>c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, out of which at least 50% should represent book titles or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years;</p> <p>d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for;</p> <p>e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.</p>		X
<p><i>Standard 7.6.</i> The infrastructure and facilities dedicated to the implementation of the program is adapted to students with special needs.</p>	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:

- The library has to contain all literature need for the Master Program Human Rights and Rule of Law.*

3. FINAL RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

As shown above the compliance levels per general areas are:


Standard	Compliance level
-----------------	-------------------------

1. Mission, objectives and administration	Substantially compliant
2. Quality management	Partially compliant
3. Academic staff	Partially compliant
4. Educational process content	Partially compliant
5. Students	Substantially compliant
6. Research	Partially compliant
7. Infrastructure and resources	Partially compliant
Overall compliance	Partially compliant


According to the expert team's evaluation, the program "Master in Human Rights and Rule of Law" is **partially compliant** with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, the expert team recommends **not to accredit** the program.

Expert Team

Chair

	Prof. Dr. Johannes Falterbaum	15-05-2023
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)

Member

	Asnate Kazoka	15-05-2023
(Signature)	(Print Name)	(Date)
