University of Pristina

Financial Law, LLM, 60 ECTS (Re-accreditation)

RE/ACCREDITATION

REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

May 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Context

Date of site visit: 19th May 2023

Expert Team (ET) members:

- *Dr. Bertel De Groote*
- *Horia Serban Onita, Student Expert (online)*

Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

1

- Arianit Krasniqi, KAA Officer

Sources of information for the Report:

- *The Self-Evaluation Report*
- *Interviews with stakeholders (sitevisit)*
- *Quality Assurance Regulation*
- *CVs of the academic staff.*
- *Expert recommendations during the previous reaccreditation process*
- *Handbook of Student*
- *Organigram of Faculty*
- *Program of the Office of the Dean, 2020-2024*
- *The Statute of The University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"*
- *Syllabi of the subjects*

Additional documents/information

- *Percentage of students abandoning their studies;*
- *The quality assurance procedure;*
- *Examples of a complaint procedure made by students;*
- *List of companies with the signed cooperation agreement;*
- *List all major improvements in curriculum and syllabuses from the last re-accreditation process.*

Criteria used for program evaluation:

- *Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of Kosovo Accreditation Agency, 2021*

1.2. Site visit schedule

,Programme Accreditation Procedure at Faculty of Law, University of Prishtina "Hasan Prishtina"	
Programme:	**Financial Law, LLM, 60 ECTS (Reaccreditation)**

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

2

Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju

Site visit on:	**19 May 2023**
Expert Team:	Dr. Bertel De Groote
	Horia Serban Onita, Student Expert (Online)
Coordinators of the KAA:	Arianit Krasniqi, KAA Officer

Site Visit Programme

Time	Meeting	Participants
09:00 – 09:15	Meeting with the management of the faculty where the programme is integrated	**1.Prof.Asoc.Dr.Avni Puka-Dean** **2.Prof.Ass.Dr.Muhamet Vokrri-Vice Dean** **3. Prof.Ass.Dr.Florent Muçaj-Vice Dean** **4. Miftar Shala-Secretary of the Faculty**
09:20 – 10:20	Meeting with the heads of the study programme Financial Law, LLM	**Prof.Ass.Dr.Artor Nuhiu**
10.25 – 11.10	Meeting with teaching staff	**Prof.Dr.Mejdi Bektashi** **Prof.Dr.Bedri Peci** **Prof.Ass.Dr.Fitore Morina**
11:15 – 12:00	Meeting with students	**1. Saranda Kryeziu** **2. Greta Guci** **3. Sibora Kadriu** **4. Rinor Krasniqi**
12:00 – 13:00	Lunch break	
13:00 – 13:20	Visiting Facilities	**1. Prof.Asoc.Dr.Avni Puka-Dean** **2. Prof.Ass.Dr.Muhamet Vokrri-Vice Dean** **3. Prof.Ass.Dr.Florent Muçaj-Vice Dean**

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

3

13:20 – 14:05	Meeting with graduates	1. **Arrita Rezniqi** 2. **Valerina Rrustemi** 3. **Krenare Kodra** 4. **Egzona Kozhani**
14:10 – 14:55	Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders	1. **Hana Bahtijari Jakupi – Representative from The Ministry of Economy, Government of The Republic of Kosovo [Completed PhD studies in Financial Law at Law Faculty - University of Prishtina];** 2. **Arta Krasniqi – Representative from public sector (Legal-Financial Consultant at Termokos, "Prishtina HeatSave" Project) [Completed Master studies in Financial Law at Law Faculty - University of Prishtina];** 3. **Fitim Gashi – Representative from private sector (Legal & Compliance Manager at Bambus Group) [Completed PhD studies in Financial Law at Law Faculty - University of Prishtina].**
14:55 – 15:05	Internal meeting of KAA staff and experts	
15:05 – 15:15	Closing meeting with the management of the faculty and program	1. **Prof.Asoc.Dr.Avni Puka-Dean** 2. **Prof.Ass.Dr.Muhamet Vokrri-Vice Dean**

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

4

		3. **Prof.Ass.Dr.Florent Muçaj-Vice Dean**
		4. **Miftar Shala-Secretary of the Faculty**

1.3. A brief overview of the institution and program under evaluation

The Faculty of Law – initially the Faculty of Law-Economics, established in 1961, is the first law faculty in Kosovo and operates under the University of Pristina. It offers bachelor's, master's, and doctoral programs. The faculty faced challenges during the period from 1991 to 1999, including attacks by Serbian forces, which disrupted the education process in the Albanian language. Albanian staff members were expulsed from the University premises. After the war in 1999, the faculty resumed its activities but had to rebuild its premises and infrastructure. Nowadays, the faculty continues its work in these premises, while renovating the infrastructure. A special transformation program regarding the Faculty infrastructure started in 2021 and is gradually implemented. This goes in line with a more profound paradigm shift in relation to the development of the faculty and its educational provision, led by the new executive team of the faculty.

The Law Faculty produced professionals who have contributed significantly to legal sciences, judiciary, administration, politics, and state-building in Kosovo.

The Faculty of Law has been undergoing continuous reforms to align its education system with advanced European and international higher education standards. It currently has over 4,399 active students in bachelor's, master's, and doctoral programs. In addition to the bachelor's program (leading to the degree of Graduated lawyer), the faculty offers master's programs in various legal fields such as Criminal Law, Civil Law, Constitutional-Administrative Law, Financial Law, International Law, Contracts and Commercial Law, all leading to the LL.M.-degree. There is also (as from 2021) an English-taught master's program in Advanced European Studies, and the faculty is amidst the accreditation process of the English-taught master's program in Human Rights, International Criminal Law, and Transitional Justice, which is

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

5

supported by the Council of Europe and open to international studies. The faculty also provides doctoral studies in several legal fields.

The Faculty of Law aims to enhance its programs, including by fostering potential student mobility programs under Erasmus+ and participation in projects related to higher education.

The master programme under review was last accredited for the period 2017-2023.

The SER states that, for its drafting, preliminary discussions have been conducted regarding the needs of the programme. Students, external partners and internal working groups were involved in this process. They were involved as well in a preliminary exercise to revise and reorganize the program plan. To evaluate the program, experts from the Council of Europe were engaged. They analyzed the study programs.

2. PROGRAM EVALUATION

2.1. Mission, objectives and administration

The SER points out that the Faculty of Law aims to be a place of advanced scientific thought in the legal field. It aims moreover at teaching and learning deeply based on critical thinking, and with a balanced approach between knowledge and practical skills. The ambition is to prepare for the needs of the labor market, but also for the research field and scientific work.

The faculty and its study offer is based on values. The Faculty is, for instance, committed to provide education in accordance with the highest academic standards, academic ethics and aims at bringing students practical and contemporary skills in accordance with the trends of the time and the needs of society and the labor market. Ethic rules and the principle of legality are at the forefront in the Faculty of Law. The principle of equality is promoted by the Faculty. The Faculty contributes to citizenship-building, the respect for the rule of law and, in general, democracy.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

6

According to the SER, the vision and mission of the Faculty are interwoven and promoted in the programs of the Faculty.

The Faculty aims to prepare individuals who will contribute to the democratic and modern society. Also, it makes efforts to ensure 'improvement' in law, with the aim of preparing students to overcome the challenges they will have to deal with in legal/judicial life.

The Faculty aims to have a leading role in the development of education related to legal reform, scientific training, the training of cadres for judicial practice, for policy-making activities and for state administration. The SER claims that the faculty makes efforts to fully incorporate the most advanced European standards of higher education, which can also be proven through the various reassessments of the programme, including with the cooperation of the Council of Europe.

Regarding the congruence between the mission and vision of the Faculty and the mission of the program under review, the SER states that the study program wants to prepare students from the field of financial law for independent scientific research work. With knowledge, experience and skills they will be enabled to solve complex problems, creatively and research-based. They therefore need in-depth and multidimensional comparative research.

According to the SER, the purpose of the program is to provide an integrated perspective of legal-financial activities. It thereby stresses 'specific knowledge on the field of study', to understand the main ideas and methods used in the field of financial law, 'intellectual knowledge', such as creative thinking, information analysis or expressing ideas, and 'key skills'.

Unfortunately, the SER, lacking further details, is not explicit regarding the link between the mission of the faculty and the study programme.

Despite having specific aspects related to internationalization, especially in terms of courses with an international focus, the SER limits itself to mentioning 'multidimensional comparative research and study'. The ET therefore strongly advises the program to reflect on the relevance of and opportunities for a more explicit attention to 'internationalization', especially

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

7

internationalization at home and mobility, given the global(izing) societal context. During the visit, the importance of multidisciplinarity in the LLM was mentioned. However, this aspect was not more clearly outlined in the ambitions of the program or the learning outcomes it leads to. Moreover, the program should continue to keep a closer eye on the societal problems alumni have to face and assess whether and if so, how well they're addressed in the program and its learning outcomes.

The expert team is pretty much assured that the programme's learning results are in line with the applicable frameworks.

The expert team praises the 'comparative' approach in drafting the programme and recommends the programme to benchmark the programme internationally on a structural and revolving basis.

According to the ET it could be useful to redraft the outcomes, as mentioned on p. 14 on the SER. They, for instance, can focus on field-related or general knowledge and competences and skills, rather than professions they can lead to. Some of the examples of the learning outcomes provided are not, in fact, learning outcomes and through the idioms used are more suitable for a bachelor level rather than a masters' one.

The programme seems to be developed in a spirit of stakeholdership and is closely monitored by the Department of Financial Law. Notwithstanding the contacts of the programme with labour market, alumni and students, the programme should invest in a more structural way to involve its stakeholders in the programme (development) policy and prevail its role as forerunner in a society with fast changing needs.

The SER as well as the interviews during the reaccreditation states that the study program has a well-defined didactic and research objective.

The SER mentions a list of components that are considered when realizing the didactic concept. Though the ET reads relevant keywords – as well regarding the research component of the program – it is not clear to the ET how all those elements are integrated in a well-defined and balanced didactic 'line'. According to the SER it is clearly integrated in all the syllabuses of the

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

8

program's subjects. The program mentions however that special importance is given to the research work of students and their participation in research. This is a clear choice the ET appreciates – and the ET encourages the consistent implementation of it - and wished the program gave more proof of in describing its 'didactic concept' in the SER.

In the SER, the programme mentions the role of, inter alia, the master's thesis for the research ambitions of the programme. The master's thesis therefore has a substantial weight in the program (20 ECTS). In this regard, and taken into account *inter alia* the doubts the ET has regarding the structural character of the framework regarding guidance, follow-up, etc. as well as the possible impact of the master's thesis on the study length, the program has to assess whether the master's thesis (as currently conceived) fits in the didactic concept the program has in mind as well as in the program's ambitions. If necessary, the program shall invest in re-designing the master's thesis or the framework for its guidance, evaluation, etc. The programme should assess whether initiatives could be useful in harmonizing (the communication on) the process and the evaluation criteria for the master thesis.

Both the SER and the annexed documents proved that the Faculty has formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural and academic issues. The so-called 'handbook' and the care that is taken by the programme about the selection of thesis subjects is worth mentioning. Worth mentioning as well is the role of the students in drafting/reviewing the handbook, as it can inspire the programme to deal with students as co-creators.

Moreover, attention is given to regulations regarding ethics and the programme is aware of plagiarism and the challenges of AI. Correct steps are taken in this regard. In communication with students, especially in view of the master's thesis, it is worthwhile reiterating the importance of research integrity (eg. in a dedicated session for all master thesis students). Moreover, the future will force the program to include the mentioned challenges in the assessment-policy. In this regard, the ET recommends that the antiplagiarm software is available both for staff and students.

All the internal regulations are revised periodically. In this process the students are involved (in meetings with students or through the QMS) and the SER also mentions the creation of an

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

9

advisory body, consisting of labor market actors, that will have to help in linking the program with the labor market for lawyers in Kosovo.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 1.1. The study program mission is in compliance with the overall mission statement of the institution.		X
Standard 1.2. Relevant academic and professional advice is considered when defining the intended learning outcomes which are consistent with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.	X	

Standard	Yes	No
Standard 1.3. The study program has a well-defined overarching didactic and research concept.		X
Standard 1.4. There are formal policies, guidelines and regulations dealing with recurring procedural or academic issues. These are made publicly available to all staff and students.	X	
Standard 1.5. All staff and students comply with the internal regulations relating to ethical conduct in research, teaching, and assessment in all academic and administrative activities.	X	
Standard 1.6. All policies, regulations, terms of reference and statements of responsibility relating to the management and delivery of the program are reviewed at least once every two years and amended as required in the light of changing circumstances.	X	

Compliance level: Partially compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *The ET strongly advises the program to reflect on the relevance of and opportunities for a more explicit attention to 'internationalization', given the global(izing) societal context and the way in which complex legal problems have to be dealt with, in its policy.*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

10

2. *In line with the Faculty's initiatives to connect with the labour market, the programme is highly recommended to consider ways to structurally embed all major stakeholders in the development and implementation of its educational and research policy and more specifically the study programme under review, with due consideration to institutional autonomy and academic freedom.*

3. *It is recommendable to assess how international benchmarking by academic peers can at best be structurally integrated in the process of reviewing the programme to guarantee that the programme keeps up with evolving international standards and practices.*

4. *The ET advises to revisit and redraft the learning outcomes and hereby focus on field-related or general knowledge and competences and transversal skills, rather than professions the program can lead to.*

5. *The program is recommended to invest in (the drafting of) a clear definition of its didactic concept and how it will be systematically implemented.*

6. *The program is recommended to assess whether the master's thesis (as currently conceived) fits in the didactic concept the program has in mind, including through lowering the number of ECTS credits, as well as in the program's ambitions. If necessary, the program shall invest in re-designing the master's thesis or its framework.*

2.2. Quality management

The Self Evaluation Report (SER) outlines the procedures used for quality management at the university, however there is little evidence of using PCDA methodology (plan-check-do-act) on a structural basis. Although the SER states that evaluation and improvement planning are integrated into regular planning processes, the ET still recommends treating the QA processes as an integral part of strategy and institutional planning.

UP employs a set of questionnaires towards stakeholders in order to analyze their satisfaction, and the faculty has implemented a process to review these questionnaires regularly. The university employs a survey instrument as part of its course evaluation process, which students complete and is accessible to instructors and administrators. However, there is little systematic indication that the evaluation outcomes and their follow-up are discussed with the students. Apart from the course evaluation, the university administers other surveys, the results of which are utilized for internal quality management purposes but are not publicly disclosed. As a result,

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

11

the transparency of these results is inadequate. Furthermore, the surveys are focusing on satisfaction rather than engagement, a.i. the capacity of students to shape their learning experience and the learning environment.

There is a need for improvement in alumni tracking at the university. It was noted during the visit that although the university maintains connections with alumni from smaller programs, there is a lack of institutional integration. Therefore, it is crucial to enhance efforts to engage graduates, such as establishing an alumni network, and conducting formal surveys of alumni or integrating them in the implementation of learning objectives. It is positive and it is evident from the SER and the list of evidence that when course evaluations reveal unsatisfactory results, appropriate measures are taken by the university. These measures and procedures are adequately documented.

There is enough evidence to conclude that Quality assurance processes that deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution, are regulated according to the Quality Assurance and Evaluation Regulation at the University of Prishtina. The Central Quality Assurance and Evaluation Commission oversees the assessment of university activities, with participation from all university stakeholder groups. It formulates a five-year and annual action plan that outlines the activities to be undertaken, including evaluations of academic units. Quality assessments are conducted to identify issues related to program quality. The Dean of the Academic Unit ensures that the academic development coordinator fulfills their responsibilities in conducting evaluations at the university and academic unit levels. After each evaluation activity, the Dean of the Academic Unit formulates an improvement plan and includes the necessary measures in the academic unit's annual budget. Based on available documentation and on-site discussions, the ET confirms that the collected data is used for ongoing development, with clear responsibilities assigned to the relevant parties.

The Faculty of Law provides in the SER concrete actions that have been taken, such as re-conceptualizing clinical teaching and implementing the Office/Centre for Clinical Studies, which includes certification programmes, in order to provide students with additional skills for the job market. In addition, it emphasises good cooperation with the advisory body. However, the focus of standard 2.7 is much broader and more holistic, bringing together student evaluation, workload evaluation, which is crucial for the design of courses and programmes,

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

12

and alumni data for employability.

Based on the available documents and on-site discussions, the ET notes that the collected data are utilized for continuous development. The relevant parties have well-defined responsibilities, which are being effectively carried out. Previous evaluation results have also led to corresponding adjustments to the study programs.

Program administrators receive reports for each course delivery, which specify any planned content that could not be covered and challenges faced in implementing planned strategies. After reviewing the course reports, suitable modifications are made to the teaching plans. Students evaluate the teaching quality of courses at the end of each semester. The course results are analyzed by the faculty for academic staff, and information is provided regarding quality assurance measures. However, there is no evidence or reports on how the public or university members are informed about quality development in a public report which point to a lack of transparency in that regard.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 2.1. All staff participate in self-evaluations and cooperate with reporting and improvement processes in their sphere of activity.	X	
Standard 2.2. Evaluation processes and planning for improvement are integrated into normal planning processes.	X	
Standard 2.3. Quality assurance processes deal with all aspects of program planning and delivery, including services and resources provided by other parts of the institution.	X	
Standard 2.4. Quality evaluations provide an overview of quality issues for the overall program as well as of different components within it; the evaluations consider inputs, processes and outputs, with particular attention given to learning outcomes for students.		X
Standard 2.5. Quality assurance processes ensure both that required standards are met and that there is continuing improvement in performance.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

13

Standard 2.6. Survey data is being collected from students, graduates and employers; the results of these evaluations are made publicly available.		X
Standard 2.7. Results of the internal quality assurance system are taken into account for further development of the study program. This includes evaluation results, investigation of the student workload, academic success and employment of graduates.	X	
Standard 2.8. The institution ensures that reports on the overall quality of the program are prepared periodically (eg. every three years) for consideration within the institution indicating its strengths and weaknesses.	X	
Standard 2.9. The quality assurance arrangements for the program are themselves regularly evaluated and improved.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Development of rigorous quality management system based on a proven quality management framework (PDCA-cycle - Plan-Do-Check-Act - approach) which is communicated to all stakeholders and which serves as a basis for participatory action involving all stakeholders.*
2. *Treating the QA processes as an integral part of strategy and institutional planning.*
3. *Discuss evaluation outcomes and follow-up with all stakeholders.*
4. *The creation of a system for alumni tracking and its subsequent integration into institutionalized surveys.*
5. *Publication of evaluation results from the general surveys.*
6. *The expert team encourages further developing tools (active ad hoc focus groups, debates, benchmarking) within the QA system, together with a scoreboard of indicators to be monitored and by which tool. The standing and developments in the scoreboard should be public.*
7. *The expert team suggests a more realistic approach regarding strengths and weaknesses, since the SWOT within the self-evaluation report appears rather optimistic in comparison with the aspects raised in the discussions. A chart of consequences for different kind of results in the assessment and the actions which should be taken by the management should be considered.*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

14

2.3. Academic staff

The Financial Law Department is the main supplier of subjects in the reviewed programme. According to the SER there are 4 'regular' staff members. On a short term, in the context of the program 'Brain Gain', 2 extra staff members – one with an economic and one with a legal background – will be appointed. Though it was said during the site visit that the LLM has no ambition to attract more than 35 students (see in this regard the policy of the Ministry of Education as well), taken into account the number of subjects (and the diversity of concerned fields of expertise) that have to be taught in the LLM as well as the necessity of a thorough research base, the number of concerned staff remains critical. It is therefore recommended to continue to invests in academic staff to make sure the program can substantially guarantee the necessary quality in teaching and research, disposing over the 'critical mass' to develop research lines in the domains covered by the program and guarantee a modern teaching approach. During the site visit the ET got the impression that the energy it takes to run the master program – taking into account its multidisciplinarity as well – justifies considerable staff investments.

The procedure to select staff and to determine its duties is outlined in Regulations established by the University of Pristina.

The academic staff, linked to the programme, is regularly employed at the Faculty of Law of University Pristina. According to the SER there is no conflict with the existing limitation on the cumulation of academic staff positions. Academic staff can participate in projects outside the UP, which is subject to prior notification to the university/faculty. The academic staff of the program meets, according to the SER, the legal requirements as defined in the Administrative Instruction for Accreditation.

According to the SER the entire academic staff of the study program is employed on a full-time basis and fulfills the criterion of over 50% of the teaching hours of the study program.. Moreover, the Financial Law Department meets the requirement that for each group of students and that for each student group and per 60 ECTS, in extenso the LLM under review, there is at least one full-time staff member with a PhD degree. The accreditation team welcomes the

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

15

announcement, that new academic staff members will soon be hired. This will strengthen the programme's teaching and research capacities. Moreover, the ET recommends to further invest in staff linked to the program.

The expert team acknowledges the role of the Centre for Excellence in Teaching in creating opportunities to professionalize the teaching staff. It is highly advisable that all staff members, on a regular basis and especially at the moment that they're appointed and become responsible for a subject, attend staff trainings. Furthermore, opportunities for mobility and leaves for research are welcomed and the ET supports efforts to conclude agreements that create a framework for these activities that allow staff to grow as a teacher and as a researcher and that can bring inspiring insights. The same goes for initiatives that allow foreign professors to visit UP and thereby cooperate in teaching/research and also help broaden students' horizon. The ET can't but stimulate the Faculty to further invest in this regard.

Academic staff is engaged in research, teaching, and service to the (academic) community. Moreover, consultations with students – on line during the Covid 19 pandemic - are a structural part of the workload and duties of academic staff at UP, according to the SER.

An evaluation system for academic staff, based on different evaluation instruments and relevant data, is installed. Self-evaluation is one of the pillars for the evaluation, together with evaluations by the students and the evaluation by the dean. The results of the student questionnaire are sent to the respective professors. They are discussed in management bodies (also in the study committee, where student representatives are present) and in meetings with individual professors. It is the opinion of the ET that all steps taken to enhance awareness of the importance of a culture of quality in teaching have to be encouraged.

According to the SER quality improvement is structurally embedded in the strategy of the Faculty. The SER mentions some basic components regarding quality improvement and supervision, such as course syllabuses, evaluation mechanisms, updating and publication of literature, etc.

Although this list of components is relevant and useful it is a pity that the SER did not integrate them in a more carefully drafted strategy on improvement of teaching (materials).

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

16

With regard to teaching quality, the SER refers to the fact that in working groups the possibility of translating foreign university books in Albanian was taken as a conclusion. Unfortunately the SER did not further elaborate on this. Helpful though this may be, it is strongly recommended to assess whether it is possible/valuable to assure that students must consult materials in English as well. In this regard, one might wonder whether the best contribution to the quality of teaching materials translating them, rather than investing in the development of genuine materials. Moreover, it is advisable to integrate quality enhancing measures in a global strategy approach on education quality, on which the SER unfortunately did not give much clarification.

Academic staff retire at age 65, but with the possibility of part-time employment even after retirement up to age 70.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 3.1. Candidates for employment are provided with full position descriptions and conditions of employment. To be presented in tabular form data about full time (FT) and part time (PT) academic/ artistic staff, such as: name, qualification, academic title, duration of official (valid) contract, workload for teaching, exams, consulting, administrative activities, research, etc. for the study program under evaluation.	X	
Standard 3.2. The teaching staff must comply with the legal requirements concerning the occupation of teaching positions included in the Administrative instruction on Accreditation.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

17

	X	
Standard 3.3. Academic staff do not cover, within an academic year, more than two teaching positions (one full-time, one part-time), regardless of the educational institution where they carry out their activity.		
Standard 3.4. At least 50% of the academic staff in the study program are full time employees, and account for at least 50% of the classes of the study program.	X	
Standard 3.5. For each student group (defined by the statute of the institution) and for every 60 ECTS credits in the study program, the institution has employed at least one full time staff with PhD title or equivalent title in the case of artistic/applied science institutions.	X	
Standard 3.6. Opportunities are provided for additional professional development of teaching staff, with special assistance given to any who are facing difficulties.	X	
Standard 3.7. The responsibilities of all teaching staff, especially full-time, include the engagement in the academic community, availability for consultations with students and community service.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

18

Standard 3.8. Academic staff evaluation is conducted regularly at least through self evaluation, students, peer and superiors' evaluations, and occurs on a formal basis at least once each year. The results of the evaluation are made publicly available.	X	
Standard 3.9. Strategies for quality enhancement include improving the teaching strategies and quality of learning materials.		X
Standard 3.10. Teachers retired at age limit or for other reasons lose the status of full-time teachers and are considered part-time teachers.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:
1. *Consider the possibility of investing in the drafting of study materials (in Albanian) and asses the need/desirability of the translation of study materials instead of offering course materials or even courses in English.*
2. *Develop a global and continuous strategy for the improvement of education quality, which addresses the need of continuous training of all teaching staff.*
3. *Develop and implement a strategy to add perspectives to the programme, making structural use of mobility programmes/initiatives (physical/virtual) and guest lecturers.*
4. *It is recommended, taken for instance into account the program's multidisciplinarity as well as the need for a robust development of research lines in the fields covered by the program, to continue to invest in the program and thereby assess the need and possibility to hire additional academic staff, especially with expertise in the field of financial and fiscal law.*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

19

2.4. Educational Process Content

The LLM targets students with a bachelor degree (accumulated: 240 ECTS credits). It aims, building on the needs of the labor market, to provide the necessary skills for the adequate formation of future lawyers specialized in the field of financial law. As a LLM it aims to give students the opportunity to deepen basic knowledge. In line with the mentioned objectives the curriculum was revised, made more comparable with similar international programs and the structure of the program was rearranged. The SER states that the program is enriched with cross-disciplinary subjects (from the field of finance and financial reporting). It has to enhance the student's practical skills and prepare him better for the labor market and to exercise the profession of lawyer specialized in financial law.

The courses' credit numbers are based on course workload. The study load for the students is, at least in theory, logically divided over the two semesters. During the site visit it became disturbingly clear though that few students are able to finish the program within one year. Mostly – be it for administrative reasons the program management calls upon or for other reasons – it takes at least one and a half year to finish the study program. The program management is strongly recommended to deal with this issue.

Although the SER states that the course content, didactic concept and teaching methods are designed to meet the expected learning outcomes, the ET wished to have more elaborate evidence on this flow from aimed outcomes over learning approach to assessment. The ET recommends the program to invest in efforts to make this flow more explicit and reflect on whether and if so, how it can be optimized.

When consulting the syllabi, the suggestion arises to invite the programme to a joint revision of the course outcomes, against the background of the learning outcomes, to assure coherence in content and style as well as undoubted fulfillment of level 7 of the European Qualification Framework in all subjects and taking into account the program's ambitions

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

20

According to the SER, the program is in line with the mentioned level 7. To reach the required level, students are given access to respectable electronic databases, teaching is IT-sustained and efforts are made to upgrade and upscale the IT equipment. Worth mentioning is a request to EULEX for domain-relevant materials. To facilitate the study process infrastructural renovations, such as the building of an open library, are on their way.

The subjects in the program form a coherent set. As mentioned, the ET is surprised by the fact that the SER seems to attribute 20 credits to respectively the first and second semester, while 'adding' 20 credits for the master's thesis. According to the ET a program of 60 credits is designed to take place within a normal study time of one year.

Apart from that, the ET recommends the program to assess the master's thesis and hereby take into account *inter alia* the following topics: the weight of the course, taking into account the objectives (regarding learning outcomes) of the LLM-program, the impact of the course on the study length, the framework of the subject with regard to guidance, evaluation etc., the administrative frame for the masters' thesis as it was said that administrative burdens related to the thesis cause prolongation of the study time in the LLM,…More specifically, the program is recommended to assess whether it is useful and possible to reduce the master's thesis in number of ECTS credits and create an adjacent course that encompasses the concept phase of the master's thesis or that introduces students in specific research skills that are useful for the masters's thesis, or that brings another (elective) subject in the program or that brings a practical subject in the program or that is focused on practical valorization of the master's thesis.

Regarding the study program, the ET also came to the conclusion that the so-called elective courses are, due to lack of choice, de facto obligatory – which was confirmed during the site visit. Therefore, the ET recommends the program to make a clear choice and make the study program exclusively out of obligatory courses or add 'real' electives. In this regard, the ET would also like to suggest assessing whether elective courses could usefully be offered in English, which could as well enable – regarding their content – a global and/or comparative approach.

The courses in the LLM under review allow to address specific and general competencies.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

21

The 8 objectives (learning outcomes) they aim seem to be in line with the taught subjects. Confusing for the ET though is that the outcomes mentioned on p. 36 differ from the ones that are listed on p. 14 in the SER. According to the SER the program is designed such that it offers graduates the opportunity to competently practice the profession of lawyer specialized in financial law. The program is assessed on its comparability with similar master's programs of the European Higher Education Area.

The programme, though designed in its origin to be taught in English, is in Albanian (according to the SER in the absence of participating foreign students). During the site visit, the ET noticed willingness to help students from non-majority communities that might possibly encounter linguistic problems.

Most of the academic staff has an adequate knowledge of English.

The SER gives sufficient proof of the fact that students are – for instance at the start of the lectures – informed about the learning outcomes and their relevance. Subject professors are accessible to students and can easily help them with required clarifications. Students can evaluate subjects and professors.

Assessment is not only done with exams, but continuous assessment is promoted as an assessment method. Syllabi are revised regularly (eg. in view of new topics that can be addressed). Consultation schedules are published for the students.

Teaching strategies are defined in the syllabi and are depending on the nature of the subject that is taught. Academic staff is, according to the SER, well prepared for the teaching and assessment strategies that are chosen.

Unfortunately, under 4.7 (p. 39), the SER does not clarify how teaching and assessment strategies are brought in line with the needs of different groups of students. Additional information in this regard has been provided after the site visit.

Regarding evaluation mechanisms the information in the 'syllabi' is crucial. Students who are not regular in lectures, can undergo the final exam. Tests are written by professors, or subject

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

22

holders, based on a standard that includes the topics defined in the syllabus. As was already said, during the site visit, there was some confusion regarding the different assessment methods/components and their relations (especially in view of determining the final grade). This made the ET extra aware of the necessity the communicate very clear and accessible to the students in this regard.

Feedback and consultation is, according to the SER, foreseen and measures are taken to assess objectively. The feedback is also part of an instructional growth process. The ET can't but stress the importance of feedback and feed-forward.

Different evaluation systems are combined with - if applicable - a final exam at the end of the semester. In view of the complexity this can lead to and for the sake of clarity and accessibility for the students, the ET recommends clear communication regarding the assessment components for all subjects. Consistent standards for grading are used. Students are informed about the criteria for grading and the knowledge they must prove. The assessment methods correspond to the teaching methods, according to the SER. Consistent standards for grading are used. Students are informed about the criteria for grading and the knowledge they must prove. The assessment methods correspond to the teaching methods, according to the SER.

A framework to deal with inconsistencies in assessment or inadequate assessment is in place.

Though the SER mentions 'clinical teaching' it is not part of the study program under review. In order to implement and conceive clinical teaching, the Faculty signed agreements with different partners.

Interesting though these agreements for cooperation may be, it is necessary to reflect on ways to structurally bind them in the LLM-programme to guarantee all students a 'practical' component. One may strongly recommend the Faculty to assess whether the legal clinics of the Faculty can be a lever in this regard.

Standard	Compliance

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

23

	Yes	No
Standard 4.1. The study program is modelled on qualification objectives. These include subject-related and interdisciplinary aspects as well as the acquisition of disciplinary, methodological and generic skills and competencies. The aspects refer especially to academic or artistic competencies, to the capability of taking up adequate employment, contributing to the civil society and of developing the students' personality.	X	
Standard 4.2. The study program complies with the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. The individual components of the program are combined in a way to best achieve the specified qualification objectives and provide for adequate forms of teaching and learning.	X	
Standard 4.3. The disciplines within the curriculum are provided in a logical flow and meet the definition and precise determination of the general and specific competencies, as well as the compatibility with the study programs and curricula delivered in the EHEA. To list at least 7 learning outcomes for the study program under evaluation.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

24

		X
Standard 4.4. The disciplines within the curriculum have analytical syllabuses which comprise at least the following: the discipline's objectives, the basic thematic content, learning outcomes, the distribution of classes, seminars and applicative activities, students' assessment system, the minimal bibliography, etc. The full course description/ syllabuses of each subject/ module should be attached only in electronic form to the self-assessment report for the study program under evaluation		
Standard 4.5. If the language of instruction is other than Albanian, actions are taken to ensure that language skills of both students and academic staff are adequate for instruction in that language when students begin their studies. This may be done through language training prior to the commencement of the program.	n.a.	
Standard 4.6. The student-teacher relationship is a partnership in which each assumes the responsibility of reaching the learning outcomes. Learning outcomes are explained and discussed with students from the perspective of their relevance to the students' development.	X	

Kosovo Accreditation Agency

	X
Standard 4.7. Teaching strategies are fit for the different types of learning outcomes programs are intended to develop. Strategies of teaching and assessment set out in program and course specifications are followed with flexibility to meet the needs of different groups of students.	
Standard 4.8. Student assessment mechanisms are conducted fairly and objectively, are appropriate for the different forms of learning sought and are clearly communicated to students at the beginning of courses.	X
Standard 4.9. Appropriate, valid and reliable mechanisms are used for verifying standards of student achievement. The standard of work required for different grades is consistent over time, comparable in courses offered within a program, and in comparison with other study programs at highly regarded institutions.	X
Standard 4.10. Policies and procedures include actions to be taken in to dealing with situations where standards of student achievement are inadequate or inconsistently assessed.	X

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

26

Standard 4.11. If the study program includes practice stages, the intended student learning outcomes are clearly specified and effective processes are followed to ensure that those learning outcomes and the strategies to develop that learning are understood by students. The practice stages are allocated ETCS credits and the work of the students at the practical training organisations is monitored through activity reports; students during practice stages have assigned tutors among the academic staff in the study program.	n.a.	
Standard 4.12. In order to facilitate the practice stages, the higher education institution signs cooperation agreements, contracts or other documents with institutions/organisations/practical training units.	X	

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

ET recommendations:

1.   Globally revise the course outcomes, against the background of the learning outcomes, to assure coherence in content and style as well as fulfillment of level 7 of the European Qualification Framework. Take this as an occasion to harmonize and actualise the syllabi. The ET recommends revisiting the learning outcomes, adjusting them to level 7 QF-EHEA and Dublin descriptors verbs and level of complexity, adding more skills, autonomy and responsibility rather than knowledge.

2.   Assess the possibility and relevance to offer a more substantial number of (obligatory/elective) courses in English as well as to consider the value of more comparative/international subjects in the programme and keep monitoring proactively – in a structural way - whether programme answers the needs of society and the labor market in the broad subject field of the master.

3.   Assess the integration of real – de facto - 'electives' in the program, eventually bringing them together in a thematic track (major). The room for electives in the program

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

27

can be linked to the assessment of the number of ECTS credits that is attributed to the master's thesis.

4. Find ways to structurally integrate a 'practical' component in the study programme (including internships) and assess in this regard whether and how the Faculty's legal clinics can contribute to this objective.

5. Assess the effective study duration and if anomalies are found, determine their causes and reflect on the implementation of measures – especially regarding the master's thesis – to bring the time till graduation in line with 60 ECTS credits.

6. Visualize and make explicit the flow that links learning outcomes of the program, with competences aimed by the different subjects, assessments and learning strategies. If links are missing, reflect on appropriate actions to be taken.

7. The program shall assess the concept of the master's thesis and its implementation, taking into account inter alia the following topics: the weight of the course, the (administrative and pedagogical) framework of the master's thesis, etc…More specifically, the program is recommended to assess whether it is useful and possible, taking into account the program's objectives, to reduce the master's thesis in number of ECTS credits and create another course.

8. The ET recommends clear communication regarding the assessment components for all subjects.

9. The ET recommends proposing a facultative introductory course in English legal terminology for students.

10. The ET recommends creating an overarching framework to deal with teaching and learning strategy, taking into consideration both the estimation of human resources needs and the proliferation of emerging teaching innovations at European level

2.5. Students

The formal regulations regarding the admission procedures are set in the law, as well as in the applicable provisions at university level. In order to be eligible for admission, candidates need to have completed basic studies (bachelor) with 240 ECTS credits (four years of study).

The admission procedures and policies at the university are well-documented and implemented in the study programs. The dean of the academic unit, in consultation with the department heads,

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

28

prepares a proposal for admission quotas for regular and part-time students in Bachelor's, Master's, and Doctorate programs, considering the previous admission processes, graduation reports, and the demand for studying at the Faculty of Law. Once approved by the University of Prishtina Senate, the Rectorate announces the conditions and competition for admission of prospective students. The Faculty of Law then conducts the admission exams based on the announced competition. The university has established clear admission requirements for candidates and made them publicly available.

The study group for the LLM is adequately sized in order to promote effective and interactive learning.

The Faculty has specific practices for giving feedback and support for students, including additional consultations or additional hours when students request. Furthermore, teachers have regular consultation hours announced for mentoring. In terms of offering flexible approaches for students in special need, it is mentioned that students have the right to enter the exam early and after the deadline. For a more broad range of cases, despite without knowing the exact degree of flexibility, the regulations mention that the Senate allows additional, non-regular exam deadlines for up to two exams within the deadline. Despite there are types of assistance mentioned in the SER, it was difficult for the ET to find on the website a comprehensive list for these assistance methods or a regulation that would comprise them all in an accessible manner for students. The ET recommends improving the information provision towards students on the assistance methods, as well as creating a policy that includes short-term and mid-term assistance both on preventive (if there are signs of non-achievement) and corrective side.

The university has implemented an Electronic Management System for Students (SEMS) and made relevant documentation available for public viewing. This system records students' individual achievements and attendance in their courses. From the documentation available, it is apparent that the university utilizes a highly advanced and modern IT-based system, which was confirmed on site visit.

Discussion with student strongly implies that students are well informed on their rights and obligations. If the student is unable to pass the exam after the third attempt, an evaluation is conducted by a commission. If the student still fails to pass the exam after the fourth attempt, they will fail the entire academic year automatically. The course syllabus provides students with

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

29

information about the exam's number, date, and evaluation criteria. The academic year consists of three regular exam periods, and the university offers flexible treatment to students in exceptional circumstances. For instance, students who have lodged a complaint or are part of a specific study program may be assessed by an examination committee in addition to regular exams.

Regarding the flexibility of the learning path, the ET is surprised by the fact that students are required to pass all exams in the first semester in order to start working (at least 'formally') on the master thesis, all this happening in a 60 ECTS (one year) LLM. This can create additional burdens for students, especially since there are opportunities to pass the exam in the second semester. *De jure*, a student couldn't start writing the thesis (which has 20 ECTS allocated) only after the exam period of the second semester, which is practically impossible.

According to the available documents and after the discussions at the university, the evaluators can also state that the lecturers are accessible to the students and can be approached for problems. All rights and obligations of students are publicly available. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.

For students in need of support, there are several bodies within both the faculty and the university with defalcated responsibilities. The ET considers that it would be appropriate to invest in a single point of contact or an ombudsman for students who encounter difficulties.

There are some weaknesses on Masters level that were confirmed by both students and alumni, for example lack of connection between students and alumni. Also, weakness that was raised during discussion is lack of software for plagiarism detection of texts using Albanian sources, especially in new circumstances like language models (ChatGPT). It is important for the university to implement a system to verify academic works and final papers for any instances of plagiarism. This includes checking corresponding examination papers and theses and taking necessary actions to address any detected plagiarism. Moreover, it is important to stress in all courses, especially methodological ones and those in which students must draft papers, the importance of research integrity and ethical research behavior.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

30

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 5.1. There is a clear and formally adopted admission procedure at institutional level that the study program respects when organising students' recruitment. Admission requirements are consistently and fairly applied for all students.	x	
Standard 5.2. All students enrolled in the study program possess a high school graduation diploma or other equivalent document of study, according to MEST requirements.	x	
Standard 5.3. The study groups are dimensioned so as to ensure an effective and interactive teaching and learning process.	x	
Standard 5.4. Feedback to students on their performance and results of assessments is given promptly and accompanied by mechanisms for assistance if needed.	X	
Standard 5.5. The results obtained by the students throughout the study cycles are certified by the academic record.	X	
Standard 5.6. Flexible treatment of students in special situations is ensured with respect to deadlines and formal requirements in the program and to all examinations.	X	
Standard 5.7. Records of student completion rates are kept for all courses and for the program as a whole and included among quality indicators.	X	
Standard 5.8. Effective procedures are being used to ensure that work submitted by students is original.		x
Standard 5.9. Students' rights and obligations are made publicly available, promoted to all those concerned and enforced equitably; these will include the right to academic appeals.	X	
Standard 5.10. The students' transfer between higher education institutions, faculties and study programs is clearly regulated in formal internal documents.	X	
Standard 5.11. Academic staff is available at sufficient scheduled times for consultation and advice to students. Adequate tutorial assistance is provided to ensure understanding and ability to apply learning.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

31

1. Ensure a flexible approach by allowing students to formally start working on the master thesis even though not all exams are passed in the first semester.
2. Invest in a single point of contact or an ombudsman for students who encounter difficulties.
3. The ET recommends improving the information provision towards students on the assistance methods, as well as creating a policy that includes short-term and mid-term assistance both on preventive (if there are signs of non-achievement) and corrective side.

2.6. Research

According to the SER, UP and the Faculty of Law have created clear objectives regarding scientific development and resources, including relevant resources to develop scientific research within and beyond the programme. According to the SER, UP and the Faculty of Law make efforts to increase the capacities of the institutes in this regard. The SER refers to the Institute for Legal Studies and Research and its concrete projects. It mentions the involvement of students in research projects and agreements with external donors.

The program claims to aim to train students in the field of financial law for independent scientific research work. They will learn to solve complex problems in the field of financial law, which will be achieved through in-depth and multidimensional comparative research and study.

A magazine, published by the Faculty (E Drejta) is referred to as a research window for academic staff and students. The magazine is structurally embedded in the doctoral programme. The digitization of the magazine is funded from the regular annual research budget of the Faculty. It must link the magazine to indexes in important international databases.

The Office of the Dean defined research objectives and strategies.

The ET recognizes in this regard, inter alia, the establishment of a structure that coordinates the efforts of academic personnel to discuss, develop and strengthen scientific activity at the individual and collective level or the establishment of initiatives to discuss scientific work.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

32

Moreover, the ET notices the use of opportunities for benefiting form scientific funds inside/outside the country and bringing together researchers in competition groups, or the promotion of meritorious academic staff, the development of an annual program of scientific conferences and thematic tables or ad hoc roundtables.

Moreover, the initiative was taken to re-establish the Center for Human Rights, International Criminal Law and Transnational Justice and transform it into a research mechanism for the faculty. Cooperation agreements create a framework for scientific and academic cooperation (exchange, joint research projects, co-mentoring of PhD-students, organisation of conferences). The SER as well mentions a Cooperation Agreement with the University of Milan-Bicocca, with the aim of promoting and strengthening academic and scientific cooperation through exchange. .

Scientific research is, according to the SER, an important duty of the academic staff and is outweighed with teaching responsibilities.

Staff who have published in a Scopus/WoS-indexed journal, present the paper in the Faculty/Department and can apply for funding of the paper. Moreover, UP created policies for the support of personnel, also regarding research and scientific projects (internal announcement by UP for academic staff to support research and scientific projects).

The 'rank' of academic staff is linked to clear publication conditions. There is a clear and rather severe policy on what is recognized as a scientific publication. It is inspired by international standards (Scopus, WoS) and in line with AKA-requirements. Scientific outcomes are also presented on conferences and symposia.

Academic staff members are active, publishing researchers – whereby they publish in respectable journals: Scopus, WoS, with impact factor in: DOAJ, EBSCO, world cat, HeinOnline - and have often obtained scientific degrees abroad. The track record can be consulted/accessed via the staff member's CV on the website of the faculty. Publications and scientific expertise are distributed in and available for the needs of society.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

33

A Memorandum of Cooperation with the Assembly assures the availability of the research and scientific expertise of the academic staff for the needs of the Assembly.

It is the Faculty's ambition to increase scientific cooperation and research through cooperation memoranda, strengthening these components and creating joint research policies.

Academic staff is 'active' and, taking into account the CV's (in the version handed to the ET after the delivery of the draft report), almost all produced at least an average of one 'publication' over the last three year's period. The ET notices that the information in the SER was not necessary self-explanatory – referring to a five year period (pp. 67 et seq. under Standard 6.7) – and was not undoubtedly related to the CV's. In this regard the use of identical CV-formats, adapted to the standards of the AKA, for the uploaded documents, brings transparency and trust.

Academic staff also considers the rules regarding the 'affiliation' that must be mentioned when publishing. Moreover, there are strict rules regarding the publications of books/materials by academic staff of the Law Faculty on its behalf. From the point of view of academic freedom this is not without relevance.

Literature for the relevant subjects is published under the logo of the institution.

Academic staff members have a teaching assignment in the field of their specialization (eg. PhD) and research. They are expected to include their research in the subject syllabus. This helps realizing the necessary link between research and teaching.

According to the SER, students are engaged in research activities and the Faculty of Law invests in creating opportunities for students to be involved in research projects, to write essays, to engage in mobility or in virtual internships.

The SER as well mentions the international legal clinic for the protection of refugees, as well as the possibility for more than 100 students to be included in practical court work (program 'Justice Activity', with the support of USAID) and monitoring of sessions. Apart from that reference is made to small grants offered via HERAS+ and the ANETREC-project that published a student publication. Interesting as the efforts of the faculty may be, for the expert

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

34

team it is hard to assess by means of the SER in how far students of the reviewed master programme are involved and how structurally the mentioned initiatives are intertwined in the programme under review. It is a clear duty of the programme to invest in creating structural links between the projects, cooperation agreements, etc. the faculty and its staff is involved in and the programme and its students.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 6.1. The study program has defined scientific/applied research objectives (on its own or as part of a research centre or interdisciplinary program), which are also reflected in the research development plan of the institution; sufficient financial, logistic and human resources are allocated for achieving the proposed research objectives.	X	
Standard 6.2. Expectations for teaching staff involvement in research and scholarly activities are clearly specified, and performance in relation to these expectations is considered in staff evaluation and promotion criteria.	X	

Standard 6.3. Clear policies are established for defining what is recognized as research, consistent with international standards and established norms in the field of study of the program.	X	
Standard 6.4. The academic staff has a proven track record of research results on the same topics as their teaching activity.	X	
Standard 6.5. The academic and research staff publish their work in speciality magazines or publishing houses, scientific/applied/artistic products are presented at conferences, sessions, symposiums, seminars etc. and contracts, expertise, consultancy, conventions, etc. are provided to partners inside the country and/or abroad.	X	
Standard 6.6. Research is validated through: scientific and applied research publications, artistic products, technological transfer through consultancy centres, scientific parks and other structures for validation.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

35

Standard 6.7. Each academic staff member and researcher has produced at least an average of one scientific/applied research publication or artistic outcome/product per year for the past three years.		X
Standard 6.8. Academic and research staff publish under the name of the institution in Kosovo they are affiliated to as full-time staff. Academic staff are encouraged to include in their teaching information about their research and scholarly activities that are relevant to courses they teach, together with other significant research developments in the field.	X	
Standard 6.9. Policies are established for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students.	X	
Standard 6.10. Students are engaged in research projects and other activities.	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1. *Develop a policy and strategies that help academic staff to balance the different components of their academic duties in view of their personal academic ambitions, their career phase as well as the faculty's research ambitions; give them follow-up and guidance in their personal, academic development plan.*

2. *Further invest in funding opportunities for research mobility and structurally enable 'leaves' for research and/or academic development.*

3. *Invest in dissemination activities on research (topics) within the Faculty (such as brown bag session, a research event,…) as well as in stimulating researchers to cooperate. Initiatives to valorize research of staff and excellent student research can be explored. In this regard the ET recommends the programme to reflect on the possibilities the joint*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

36

presence of economic and legal research expertise could bring for investing in multidisciplinary research

4. *Assess the possibilities to structurally link the master's thesis to the research lines of the academic staff members guiding them.*

5. *As during the site visit the presence of methodological aspects in every subject was confirmed, the programme can explore the idea of defining a 'methodological' line to optimize the integration of research competences/skills in the programme.*

2.7. Infrastructure and resources

Though the infrastructure of the faculty was only partially used during the 'Covid-period', the Programme under review claims that physical space to organize the courses 'physically' is not an issue. Moreover, during the 'Covid-period', the faculty proved its ability to organize courses 'online', making use of modern technology. In this regard, the suggestion arises to exploit the experience gained with IT-sustained teaching during the 'Covid-period' and explore the opportunities and challenges of hybrid teaching approaches and blended learning.

The faculty addresses the issue of comfortable space for teaching and learning, due to the fact that the Faculty of Law shares a building with the Faculty of Economy, with the construction, on short term for a new building for the Faculty of Economy. While sharing the building, the organization of teaching came with considerable efforts

Also, the Faculty claims that the demand for classrooms for smaller groups of students can be met. The Faculty is convinced that teaching and research activities can be done in overall qualitative circumstances regarding infrastructure.

Thanks to the project 'Transformation of Spaces of the Faculty of Law Project' (from the academic year 2020/2021), renovation projects are set up, aiming to create spaces for lounging and reading and adapting the infrastructure to students with special needs. The project plans and its design originate from an interesting cooperation with the architecture students of UP.

It is a recommendation to continue to gradually invest in the renovation of the infrastructure of the faculty and to continue to cooperate in this regard with the Architecture Faculty. The project

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

37

should at best consider the University's ambition to be sustainable and aim for adaptive infrastructure, that is fit for innovative and IT-sustained learning (eg. hybrid classes).

Also, the infrastructure should consider the needs of staff members and stimulate their cooperation (eg. about research). If possible, the Faculty shall integrate in its infrastructure projects the need to be able to organize conferences, host lifelong learning activities etc. as they can lead to funding opportunities, create a scientific forum or strengthen the relations with society/industry.

According to the SER, a financial plan guarantees the sustainability of the study programme for the next three years. The budget of the Faculty includes the budget allowed by the Governing Council of the University, donations from donors and project income. The budget plan clearly defines the expenses that must be covered. The Faculty has, according to the SER, a three-year plan that shows budget stability and proves that the Faculty has enough resources. As the SER refers to project funding as well (for instance ENEMLOS clinic, a budget that makes it possible to purchase IT infrastructure, books, etc.), it is clear that the Faculty is encouraged to further develop 'alternative' funding channels, with respect for its values.

Apart form the 'structural' funding, there are – as was pointed out during the interviews - essential project-related resources (eg. for strengthening the legal clinics).

The faculty has, apart from the available 'immovables'(facilities owned in Pristina), its website as an asset (with a link to 'MyCourt'), as well as an electronic student management system/quality management system. In SEMS, the Quality Management System is integrated.

For students with special needs, a mobile platform was built in 2022.

The SER also mentions a donation from the European Mission for the study of EULEX law, which contains data which are necessary for the teaching process.

The SER states that the library's infrastructure – consisting of designated reading areas as well - and collection meet the standards. The reading room meets the necessary conditions,

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

38

according to the SER, including the capacity required for the active number of students in the program under review.

The SER refers to other offices that can be used for group work of students and to a hall, built for group work, in the new spaces. For group work the professors' hall as well as the courtroom of the Faculty can be used. For doctoral students a room serves as a research office.

As libraries tend to be used as spaces to study, to work on group assignments as well, the faculty is recommended to cleverly think of the design of a library for the future, considering as well the shift to online/distant consultation of sources.

In this regard, although the value of up-to-date books (in Albanian as in foreign languages) leads no doubt, is it important to continue to invest in a broad access to national/international electronic sources. For the management, it is a major duty to continuously assure access to relevant sources, especially for the study of a 'literature-driven' field as law. As the library's quality is a crucial basis for the programme's quality, it is necessary to include the improvement of the availability of 'sources' in funding requests and cooperation plans.

For the time being, according to the SER, the sources (online/physically) present at the Faculty of Law guantee sufficient availability of sources for the needs of the study program under review.

Standard	Compliance	
	Yes	No
Standard 7.1. The adequate long-term implementation of the study program is ensured in quantitative terms as regards premises, human resources and equipment. At the same time, it is guaranteed that qualitative aspects are also taken into account.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

39

Standard 7.2. There is a **financial plan** at the level of the study program that would demonstrate the **sustainability of the study program for the next minimum three years**.	X	
Standard 7.3. The higher education institution must **demonstrate** with adequate documents (property deeds, lease contracts, inventories, invoices etc.) that, for the study program submitted for evaluation it possesses the following, **for the next at least three years:** a) **owned or rented spaces** adequate for the educational process; b) **owned or rented laboratories,** with the adequate equipment for all the compulsory disciplines within the curriculum, wherever the analytical syllabus includes such activities; c) **adequate softwar**e for the disciplines of study included in the curriculum, **with utilisation licence;** d) **library** equipped with **reading rooms, group work rooms and its own book stock** according to the disciplines included in the curricula.	X	

Standard 7.4. **The number of seats** in the lecture rooms, seminar rooms and laboratories must be r**elated to the study groups' size** (series, groups, subgroups); the applicative activities for the speciality disciplines included in the curricula are carried out in laboratories equipped with IT equipment.	X	

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

40

Standard 7.5. The education institution's libraries must ensure, for each of the study programs: a) a number of seats in the reading rooms corresponding to **at least 10% of the total number of students** in the study program; b) a number of seats in the group work rooms corresponding to at least 10% of the total number of students in the study program; c) their own book stock from Albanian and foreign speciality literature, enough to cover the disciplines within the curricula, **out of which at least 50% should represent book titles** or speciality courses of recognised publishers, from the last 10 years; d) a book stock within its own library with a sufficient number of books so as to cover the needs of all students in the cycle and year of study the respective discipline is provided for; e) a sufficient number of subscriptions to Albanian and foreign publications and periodicals, according to the stated mission.	X	
Standard 7.6. **The infrastructure and facilities** dedicated to the implementation of the program is **adapted to students with special needs.**	X	

Compliance level: Fully compliant

ET recommendations:

1.   *As Covid-19 illustrated the importance of IT in the teaching process, consider, when renovating premises, the needs of future-oriented and flexible teaching approaches (eg. recording classes, hybrid teaching,…). Moreover, reflect on the opportunities the skills developed during the Covid-period, could have for improving teaching approaches.*

2.   *Continue to gradually invest in the infrastructure of the faculty and focus hereby on sustainability and innovative learning and working.*

3.   *Invest in infrastructure that accommodates researchers and stimulates their cooperation.*

4.   *Take a modern approach on the library and its functions; keep expanding it, hereby structurally guaranteeing a sound mix of books and electronic sources.*

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

41

5.   *Provide a formal strategy for inclusion of students with disabilities which is not limited to physical accessibility.*

3. OVERALL EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE ET

Based on the research of the documentation submitted and a(n) (online) visit to the Law Faculty, and more precisely the programme under review, the Expert Team for the re-accreditation process prepared this report based on the defined Standards & performance indicators for external evaluation according to the Accreditation Manual of KAA (updated 2021) and gave an overview of the current situation. The Expert Team assessed the program and expressed its findings and recommendations.

The ET allows itself a general remark on the SER report, as it sometimes lacked the expected 'reflective' approach. Moreover, the ET was disappointed by some loose ends, since they complicated the understanding of the text and could jeopardize a clear view on the program or provoked ambiguities. Apart from the fact that the SER could have been more elaborate and focused to the standards, the use of a standardized CV for all academic staff would make the 'scientific' production more transparent and its check therefore more reliable.

Overall, the study programme under review has a sufficient quality and answers the needs it intends to address sufficiently. It seems to have to ambition to further improve and will welcome extra straff members. The ET counts on the fact that this will structurally reinforce the program. The ET furthermore advises the programme to continuously be aware of the fast pace with which its context evolves. Stakeholders – academic stakeholders as well as industry partners and graduates – are important information channels in this regard.

The ET formulates some recommendations as they can guide the programme in its ambition to further enhance the programme under review. The recommendations are repeated underneath:

- The program is strongly advised the program to reflect on the relevance of and opportunities for a more explicit attention to 'internationalization', given the global(izing) societal contex and the way in which complex legal problems have to be dealt with, in its policy.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

42

- In line with the Faculty's initiatives to connect with the labour market, the programme – disposing of valuable and active contacts with the labour market and alumni - is highly recommended to consider ways to structurally embed all major stakeholders in the development and implementation of its educational and research policy and more specifically the study programme under review.

- It is recommendable to assess how international benchmarking by academic peers can at best be structurally integrated in the process of reviewing the programme to guarantee that the programme keeps up with evolving international standards and practices.

- The ET advises to revisit and redraft the outcomes and hereby focus on field-related or general knowledge and competences and skills, rather than professions the program can lead to.

- The program is recommended to invest in (the drafting of) a clear definition of its didactic concept and how it will be systematically implemented.

- The program is recommended to assess whether the master's thesis (as currently conceived) fits in the didactic concept the program has in mind as well as in the program's ambitions. If necessary, the program shall invest in re-designing the master's thesis or its framework.

- Development of rigorous quality management system based on a proven quality management framework (PDCA-cycle - Plan-Do-Check-Act - approach) which is communicated to all stakeholders and which serves as a basis for participatory action involving all stakeholders.

- Treating the QA processes as an integral part of strategy and institutional planning.

- Discuss evaluation outcomes and follow-up with all stakeholders.

- The creation of a system for alumni tracking and its subsequent integration into institutionalized surveys.

- Publication of evaluation results from the general surveys.

- The expert team encourages further developing tools (active ad hoc focus groups, debates, benchmarking) within the QA system, together with a scoreboard of indicators to be monitored and by which tool. The standing and developments in the scoreboard should be public.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

43

- The expert team suggests a more realistic approach regarding strengths and weaknesses, since the SWOT within the self-evaluation report appears rather optimistic in comparison with the aspects raised in the discussions. A chart of consequences for different kind of results in the assessment and the actions which should be taken by the management should be considered.

- Consider the possibility of investing in the drafting of study materials (in Albanian) and asses the need/desirability of the translation of study materials instead of offering course materials or even courses in English.

- Develop a global and continuous strategy for the improvement of education quality, which addresses the need of continuous training of all teaching staff.

- Develop and implement a strategy to add perspectives to the programme, making structural use of mobility programmes/initiatives (physical/virtual) and guest lecturers.

- It is recommended, taken for instance into account the program's multidisciplinarity as well as the need for a robust development of research lines in the fields covered by the program, to continue to invest in the program and thereby assess the need and possibility to hire additional academic staff.

- Globally revise the course outcomes, against the background of the learning outcomes, to assure coherence in content and style as well as fulfillment of level 7 of the European Qualification Framework. Take this as an occasion to harmonize and actualise the syllabi. The ET recommends revisiting the learning outcomes, adjusting them to level 7 QF-EHEA and Dublin descriptors verbs and level of complexity, adding more skills, autonomy and responsibility rather than knowledge.

- Assess the possibility and relevance to offer a more substantial number of (obligatory/elective) courses in English as well as to consider the value of more comparative/international subjects in the programme and keep monitoring proactively – in a structural way - whether programme answers the needs of society and the labor market in the broad subject field of the master.

- Assess the integration of real – de facto - 'electives' in the program, eventually bringing them together in a thematic track (major). The room for electives in the program can be linked to the assessment of the number of ECTS credits that is attributed to the master's thesis.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

44

- Find ways to structurally integrate a 'practical' component in the study programme and assess in this regard whether and how the Faculty's legal clinics can contribute to this objective.
- Assess the effective study duration and if anomalies are found, determine their causes and reflect on the implementation of measures – especially regarding the master's thesis – to bring the time till graduation in line with 60 ECTS credits.
- Visualize and make explicit the flow that links learning outcomes of the program, with competences aimed by the different subjects, assessments and learning strategies. If links are missing, reflect on appropriate actions to be taken.
- The program shall assess the concept of the master's thesis and its implementation, taking into account inter alia the following topics: the weight of the course, the (administrative and pedagogical) framework of the master's thesis, etc…More specifically, the program is recommended to assess whether it is useful and possible, taking into account the program's objectives, to reduce the master's thesis in number of ECTS credits and create another course.
- The ET recommends clear communication regarding the assessment components for all subjects.
- The ET recommends proposing a facultative introductory course in English legal terminology for students.
- The ET recommends creating an overarching framework to deal with teaching and learning strategy, taking into consideration both the estimation of human resources needs and the proliferation of emerging teaching innovations at European level
- Ensure a flexible approach by allowing students to formally start working on the master thesis even though not all exams are passed in the first semester.
- Invest in a single point of contact or an ombudsman for students who encounter difficulties.
- The ET recommends improving the information provision towards students on the assistance methods, as well as creating a policy that includes short-term and mid-term assistance both on preventive (if there are signs of non-achievement) and corrective side.

  - Develop a policy and strategies that help academic staff to balance the different components of their academic duties in view of their personal academic ambitions,

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

45

their career phase as well as the faculty's research ambitions; give them follow-up and guidance in their personal, academic development plan.

- Further invest in funding opportunities for research mobility and structurally enable 'leaves for research and/or academic development.

- Invest in dissemination activities on research (topics) within the Faculty (such as brown bag session, a research event,…) as well as in stimulating researchers to cooperate. Initiatives to valorize research of staff and excellent student research can be explored. In this regard the ET recommends the programme to reflect on the possibilities the joint presence of economic and legal research expertise could bring for investing in multidisciplinary research

- Assess the possibilities to structurally link the master's thesis to the research lines of the academic staff members guiding them.

- As during the site visit the presence of methodological aspects in every subject was confirmed, the programme can explore the idea of defining a 'methodological' line to optimize the integration of research competences/skills in the programme.

● As Covid-19 illustrated the importance of IT in the teaching process, consider, when renovating premises, the needs of future-oriented and flexible teaching approaches (eg. recording classes, hybrid teaching,…). Moreover, reflect on the opportunities the skills developed during the Covid-period, could have for improving teaching approaches.

● Continue to gradually invest in the infrastructure of the Faculty and focus hereby on sustainability and innovative learning and working.

● Invest in infrastructure that accommodates researchers and stimulates their cooperation.

● Take a modern approach on the library and its functions; guarantee structurally a sound mix of books and electronic sources.

● Provide a formal strategy for inclusion of students with disabilities which is not limited to physical accessibility.

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

46

Considering the documentation provided and discussions with the program development team, the ET gave the following compliance levels:

Standard	Compliance Level
Mission, objectives and administration	Partially compliant
Quality management	Substantially compliant
Academic Staff	Fully compliant
Educational Process Content	Substantially compliant
Students	Fully compliant
Research	Fully compliant
Infrastructure and resources	Fully compliant
Overall Compliance	Fully compliant

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that the study program LLM Financial Law offered by the Faculty of Law is substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation Manual, and therefore, recommends accrediting the study program for 3 years with a total number of 35 students to be enrolled in the program.

Expert Team

Chair

Bertel De Groote

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

47

Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim
Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju

| (Signature) | (Print Name) | (Date) |

Student Member

Horia Onita

| (Signature) | (Print Name) | (Date) |

AKA | Qendra e Studentëve, kati 2-të, 10000 Prishtinë, Kosovë
Tel. +381 38 213722 | Fax +381 38 213087 | www.akreditimi-ks.org

48