



Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

## TEMPULLI ACADEMY

# **INSTITUTIONAL**

# FINAL REPORT OF THE EXPERT TEAM





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### Contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS2
1. INTRODUCTION
1.1. Context4
1.2. Site visit schedule
Muhamed Krasniqi5
Fatime Krasniqi5
Mevlan Bixhaku5
Leonora Rudhani5
Fatime Krasniqi5
Leonora Rudhani5
Sara Fusha5
Makfire Preniqi5
Ema Smajli5
Ema Berisha Krasniqi5
Muhamed Krasniqi5
Gezim Hoxha5
Mevlan Bixhaku5
Eflorim Hajra5
Gjelosh Vataj5
Shpetim Lajqi6
Bujar Pira6
Ramadan Duraku6
Liridon Hoti6





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Xhevat I	Ramosaj	6
Valerie B	3ojku	6
Fatbardh	n Xhaferi	6
Nexhmi l	Rama	6
Bujar Isto	ogu	6
Hafije Gë	ërbeshi	6
1.3.	A brief overview of the institution under evaluation	6
2. INS	STITUTIONAL EVALUATION	7
2.1.	Public mission and institutional objectives	7
2.2.	Strategic planning, governance and administration	9
2.3.	Financial planning and management	10
2.4.	Academic integrity, responsibility and public accountability	11
2.5.	Quality management	12
2.6.	Learning and teaching	14
2.7.	Research	15
2.8.	Staff, employment processes and professional development	18
2.9.	Student administration and support services	19
2.10.	Learning resources and facilities	21
2.11.	Institutional cooperation	22





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

#### 1.1. Context

Due to pandemic restrictions, this evaluation was conducted online. The expert team (ET) was provided with relevant documentation well before the site visit date and was provided with some more documentation and materials after the site visit (upon the request), too. The support by colleagues from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA) was very effective and helped the ET to conduct all the necessary steps during the whole evaluation process.

Date of site visit: February 5, 2021

#### **Expert Team (ET) members:**

- Prof. Milan Pol, Masaryk University
- Prof. Magdalena Platis, University of Bucharest
- Mr. Christoph Back, Student Expert

#### Coordinators from Kosovo Accreditation Agency (KAA):

- Naim Gashi, Executive Director of KAA
- Shkelzen Gerxhaliu, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Arianit Krasniqi, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Accreditation
- Leona Kovaci, Senior Offices for Evaluation and Monitoring
- Ilirjane Ademaj, Senior Officer for Evaluation and Monitoring

#### **Sources of information for the Report:**

- Self-evaluation report of Tempulli Academy and other documents provided before the site visit
- Interviews
- Video on Tempulli Academy premises





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

 Additional documentation of Tempulli Academy provided upon the request of the expert team

#### Criteria used for institutional and program evaluations

• KAA Accreditation Manual

#### 1.2. Site visit schedule

**09.00 – 10.20** Meeting with the management of the institution

Muhamed Krasniqi Fatime Krasniqi Mevlan Bixhaku Leonora Rudhani

**10.25 – 11.10** Meeting with quality assurance representatives and administrative services

Fatime Krasniqi Leonora Rudhani Sara Fusha Makfire Preniqi Ema Smajli

**11.10 – 12.00** Lunch break

**12.00 – 12.50** Meeting with the heads of faculties/study programs

Ema Berisha Krasniqi Muhamed Krasniqi Gezim Hoxha Mevlan Bixhaku Eflorim Hajra Gjelosh Vataj





## Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

12.55 – 13.45	Meeting with teaching staff
---------------	-----------------------------

Shpetim Lajqi Bujar Pira Ramadan Duraku Liridon Hoti Xhevat Ramosaj Valerie Bojku

**13.50 – 14.30** Meeting with employers of graduates and external stakeholders

Fatbardh Xhaferi Nexhmi Rama Bujar Istogu Hafije Gërbeshi

**14.35 – 14.45** Internal meeting – Expert Team and KAA

**14.45 – 14.55** Closing meeting with the management of the institution

#### 1.3. A brief overview of the institution under evaluation

Tempulli Academy (TA) has been registered in October 2020 as a new higher education institution. There can be seen a continuation with the institution which started in 1992 provide training and education to young vehicle driving students, and later developed as the institution also providing some higher education programs (Tempulli College), though. Tempulli College stopped its operation after two consecutive unsuccessful accreditations last year. Therefore, the new institution, Tempulli Academy, has started.

The mission of the TA is oriented to teaching and research and contains the ambition to prepare people for successful career and active professional life in community. As a new institution,





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

the Tempulli Academy is in the process of planning and preparing its programs and other activities with the aim to get accreditation in order to start fully its operation.

#### 2. INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION

#### 2.1. Public mission and institutional objectives

Tempulli Academy (TA) has formulated its mission as follows: "Qualitatively prepare students and trainees with relevant knowledge and skills to learn and research in order to lead a successful career as an active professional in the community" (SER, p. 5). This may be said, the mission statement explicitly focuses on two main pillars of each higher education institution (HEI), teaching/learning and research. As concerns "the third role" (community reach), the mission expresses an ambition to enrich the community with people of successful career who are active professionals. This way, one can see the undirect link to the third role of the HEI's operation, too. This is confirmed with the list of contributions the Tempulli Academy intends to provide the society with, among them to serve as a local partner or businesses and industry, local and central institutions, and the community (SER, p. 5).

The vision of TA is formulated in line with the mission statement. In particular, the vision is as follows: "A unique institution of higher education in the country and the region, with a focus on the development of professional research skills through the interconnection of innovative teaching, practical learning and scientific work for the benefit of the community." (webpage of the TA)

To achieve its mission and vision, the TA declares "it intends to function based on the following values:

- Empowerment of Partnership Boards consisting of competent and forward-looking professionals and entrepreneurs in the relevant fields (see organizational chart of the institution);
- Reviewing the existing methodology of functioning and improving both in institutional and programme level;
- Investment in training of academic staff;
- Quality assurance;
- Improve IT infrastructure to facilitate administrative processes and student services;
- Improve the quality of teaching by establishing IT labs and intelligent classrooms;





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Purchase anti-plagiarism software for verifying scientific works;
- Further increase third party funding through donations, providing services to businesses and institutions also, through access to research funding." (webpage of the TA)

This is not, however, a clear and persuasive message. The above stated list does not indicate values; rather, it refers to specific areas of the TA's intended activity. The values are properly expressed in the Strategic Plan, though.

The institution under the evaluation declares that its mission statement has been drafted by the working group (the same group that was drafting Strategic Plan) in which representatives of various stakeholders took part (management, academic staff, administration staff, business representatives). Participants of the interviews confirmed this during the site visit.

Also, as it seemed, most people involved in interviews were aware of the new TA's mission. The mission is displayed at the TA's website, too.

As such, the mission statement has some potential to serve as a relatively solid basis and guide for strategic planning, decision-making and operations of the institution which appears to be at the new starting point of its development.

Medium- and long-term institutional objectives as formulated in the Strategic Plan 2021-2025 of the TA seem to be prevailingly consistent with and support the mission.

#### Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. Consider a possibility to formulate third role of your institution in a more explicit and direct way.
- 2. Make sure values/areas of operation are not misinterpreted in the strategic documents of the TA.





Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

#### 2.2. Strategic planning, governance and administration

The Tempulli Academy has the Strategic Plan developed for next five years (2021-2025). As in the case of the process of developing the mission statement, the Tempulli Academy reports about a consultation process as a basis for developing the Strategic Plan 2021-2025. The same group (in which representatives of different groups within the TA and beyond participated) was drafting this document in several phases. According to the SER, this group held several meetings/workshops in which analysis of current situation (SWOT analysis), formulation of the vision, the mission and strategic objectives, identification of activities, development of framework, communication plan and monitoring plan, and also action plan and budget plan were realized. During the interviews, the evidence of participation of some representatives of different groups was provided.

The strategic plan is composed of six "fields of intervention" to which strategic objectives are formulated and further concretized, for each of them performance indicators, and indicative targets are identified. And assigned budget allocation for each field of intervention was developed as a part of the strategic plan, too, as well as risk analysis and communication plan. Activity monitoring plan has also been drafted in a short version.

This may be said the Strategic Plan 2021-2025 expresses the TA's awareness of aspects of internal as well as external environment. It is relatively complex, in some respects very ambitious.

The TA seems to have a decision-making system and internal operating regulations in accordance with current legal provisions. The main governing body is the Steering Council (fine voting members, each for four years, two of them nominated by stakeholders, two by Academic Council and one student member nominated by Student Parliament). Of course, since the institution does not have students yet, the question of the existence or planned existence in in place – this relates to some other aspects of the TA's operation, too.

The organizational structure is clear, perhaps more direct links between intended academic programs and the research could help the integration of two key areas of operation of the TA.

The election criteria and processes of the decision-makers and other elected positions seem to be clearly planned, they are transparent and accessible.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The responsibilities of the decision-making bodies are defined, the roles are clearly differentiated, and it remains to be seen whether/how they will be followed. There is a plan to install one student place in Steering Council, Academic Council, Program Committee, Quality Commission, Ethics Committee and Disciplinary Commission. The rules for student elections have also been drafted since there is a plan to create Student Parliament at the TA.

The administration of the TA seems to be prepared for the work; they responsibilities are clearly described. Their qualification was indicated as a weak point in the SWOT analysis, the plans emphasize the need to train these people in some extent.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. Make sure the organisational structure clearly and effectively supports links between the teaching/learning (study programs) and the research.
- 2. Make sure there is enough qualified administration staff to effectively carry on all the necessary functions of the TA.

#### 2.3. Financial planning and management

The TA seems to have sufficient financial resources in a short as well as medium term to adequately reach its mission and objectives formulated in the Strategic Plan. There are diverse sources of income at the TA, among them student fees, driving course fees and instructor training payment, expertise, and various project-related finances are declared to play a major role. Planned expenses are lower than planned incomes for the next three years at the TA.

Since the TA has rather ambitious Strategic Plan for the next five years, it is expected this will be fully inserted in the specific budget items. Sometimes, this seems to be the case, in some other cases it is slightly questionable (for instance funding of the research, internationalisation plans). The budget does not envisage the item of student scholarships.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Oversight and management of the institution's budgeting and accounting functions are carried out by a specialised office responsible to a senior administrator (Academic Director having the final responsibility of the Academy, Director of the Institute for Road Safety and Transport Research is having final responsibility for the Institute). Financial officer is employed within the Academy.

It may be said there is an accurate monitoring of expenditure and commitments against budget with reports annually at the TA.

Accounting system at the TA is a dual one, in accordance with professional accounting standards and in principle it indicates attribution of total costs to particular activities.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Make sure the research as well as the internationalisation plans are supported with sufficient funding.
- 2. Consider a possibility to install the fund for student scholarships within the TA's budget planning.

#### 2.4. Academic integrity, responsibility and public accountability

The TA has a Code of Ethics through which it declares the defending values of academic freedom, institutional autonomy and ethical integrity. The Code also defines rights and obligations of the staff as well as of the students and consequences of rule-breaking behaviour. On 28/12/2020 the Steering Council approved the Code of Ethics and implemented policies to ensure a high standard of ethical conduct for all stakeholders. With these guidelines (Code of Ethics (Annex 4A.) and Regulation on Disciplinary Procedure (Annex 4C.)) Tempulli Academy is sufficiently prepared to deliver a high standard of academic integrity.

Tempulli Academy also established the Ethics Committee (Annex 4B.). The committee is responsible for the analysis and resolution of any potential breaches in the code of ethics. It consists of three members of academic staff, one member of administrative staff and one





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

student member (the chair of the student-representative is vacant at the moment, because no students are enrolled). The constitutive meeting was held on 08/01/2021.

The Academy is publishing a significant amount of information about its academic staff, activities, procedures, programs, and more.

An antiplagiarism software is available in Albanian language.

Because of the current situation with no students enrolled, Tempulli Academy did not have the chance to provide the experts any evidence of working processes and procedures regarding the academic integrity.

However, the expert panel is satisfied with the policies and regulations the Academy has implemented. As long as the Institution will follow this policies and regulations with well adapted processes, the academic integrity will be on a sufficient level.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### **ET recommendations:**

- 1. Tempulli Academy made improvements on the side of policies and regulations. Now it is time to ensure the effectiveness of these with clearly defined and appropriate processes. This should be the main focus.
- 2. With the enrolment of new students, the Institution has the chance to improve its policies and system by monitoring and reviewing.
- 3. Antiplagiarism software for the English language is urgently needed, if a program in English is planned.

#### 2.5. Quality management

Tempulli Academy "was registered on October, 13th 2020 as a Higher Education Institution in Kosovo. Tempulli Academy, although as a new institution, has a long tradition of Tempulli since 1992, and that as a center of training and education of young vehicles driving students" (SER, page 4). Therefore, all documents refer to the newly established institution and they have been approved and entered into force after the establishment day. In other words, all documents referring to internal processes present the institutional intention to organize and implement activities according to the mission of the new institution. The institution has already





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

set up a web page which is under construction to be filled in with documents, data and information: <a href="http://tempulli.org/en/">http://tempulli.org/en/</a>. Tempulli Academy has elaborated a formal Quality Assurance Regulation that defines roles and responsibilities, procedures and mechanisms in the area of quality assurance. The policy is not a public document yet and the date of approval does not appear on the document, as many of other documents have this piece of information missing. Without the date of approval, the document looks like it is still a draft.

According to the organizational chart (SER, page 12) the institution has established an office and a commission for Quality Assurance. The management has paid a high attention towards quality assurance as it is a separate domain of intervention in the Strategic Plan for 2021-2025: Teaching and Quality Assurance, with 9 specific indicators. In all the discussions that ET carried out during the online site visit, it was clear that the management was open to support the development; they declared that they plan to apply for accreditation for 2 new more programs, while the QA responsible was very open and recognized the main improvements (such as clearer objectives and measurable ones, professional panel, data gathering) and the facts that remained vulnerable (such as digitalization, new staff, mobility, English competences) since the last external evaluation. According to the QA policy, the processes are planned to be monitored and reviewed, especially in relationship to the evaluation of programs. In the additional documents, several questionnaires were provided which reflect the capacity of the QA system to cover a whole range of institutional activities, including library, infrastructure and services to students.

Evaluations take into account inputs, processes and output and provide a particular attention to the quality of outcomes. Evaluations deal with performance in relation to continuing routine activities, as well as to strategic objectives. The institution is aware of the "Unproven experience on quality assurance assessment as Academy", which is considered a weakness in SER (page 23). ET is therefore reserved in considering at the time of evaluation that all units within the institution participate and contribute to its continuous improvement. Staff is new and need training and this simply takes time and effort. In the Quality Committee, one student is member (SER, page 14).

Different surveys are used in order to get proper feedback across institution – Questionnaire for Evaluation of the Program Services and Infrastructure by Students; Questionnaire for Academic Staff; Questionnaire for Institutions/Businesses; Questionnaire for Alumni; Questionnaire for Administrative Staff, Peer (Collegial) Evaluation Questionnaire; Self-assessment report for academic staff (these were all provided as additional documents). Nevertheless, although common forms and survey instruments are set up to be used for assessing activities across the institution (academic activity, student services, administration, etc.) there is no evidence yet that the institution uses responses or if the results of the surveys





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

are publicly available. At this stage, all these documents represent a starting point for assessment mechanisms.

Statistical data are used, and QA has the potential to monitoring quality through specific indicators. These KPI are set up in the Strategic Plan for 2021-2025 with targets. In addition, at the evaluation time, there was no clear evidence that QA clear data were used to guide enhancement, as everything was at the early stage of establishment. In other words, quality assurance data are not yet used to guide enhancement, this process requiring time. The institution did not consider at this stage the periodical evaluation of the QA arrangements; this will be re-assessed in a year or later.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. Include in all formal documents the date of approval and make them publicly available to the academic community.
- 2. Set clear QA measurable indicators to monitor their evolution as an appendix to Quality Assurance Regulation.
- 3. Create a calendar for re-evaluation/improvement of each QA arrangement (all QA tools and mechanisms, including the QA Regulation).
- 4. Provide training to staff on QA procedures and management on a regular basis on different topics.

#### 2.6. Learning and teaching

Tempulli Academy implemented and revised policies to organize the teaching process. The Regulation of Studies and the Regulation of Bachelor and Master Studies are the main resource of the Institution regarding the topic of learning and teaching. Within these documents, policies and procedures (for all academic programs) are set. Also, the monitoring system is described within the regulations.

The Institution has defined quality indicators to measure the quality of its programs. These indicators are graduate satisfaction, employer satisfaction, employment rate of graduates, programme student satisfaction and graduation rate. The data will be gathered by the regular use of surveys (for the intended group of interest).





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The expected learning outcomes for each program are in line with the National Qualifications Framework and the European Qualifications Framework for Higher Education. Teaching staff are appropriately qualified and experienced for their particular teaching responsibilities.

The study programs are defined to be based on correlations between learning outcomes. The structure and necessary documents for each study program are determined in the Regulation of Bachelor and Master Studies. The topic of assessment methods is also included.

Because of the situation with no students enrolled, the experts were not able to see processes and procedures in practice. Once more, Tempulli Academy has implemented sufficient policies and regulations, but did not have the chance to show how they are adapted in real life.

The expert panel wants to underline that the adaption and consistent execution of this processes and procedures will be essential for the success of the Institution (and also for future accreditations).

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. Tempulli Academy made improvements on the side of policies and regulations. Now it is time to ensure the effectiveness of these with clearly defined and appropriate processes. This should be the main focus.
- 2. The expert panel strongly recommends to revising the Regulations regarding the student workload (especially in particular cases like internships).
- 3. The monitoring (and KPI) system has to be proofed when students are enrolled. The Institution should be aware, that the monitoring is the foundation for future improvements.
- 4. The aspects of effectiveness of assessment methods and student-centred learning could be explained (and implemented) more extensive in the regulations and processes of monitoring.

#### 2.7. Research





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

In December 2020, the institution has adopted the Regulation for Scientific Research consisting in the rules, procedures and other relevant documents for the organization of scientific research activity of academic, research staff and students in accordance with the Statute of the Academy. In January 2021, the Research Strategy of the Tempulli Academy for 2021-2025 was also approved. The institution has included in the Strategic Plan for 2021-2025 a set of specific indicators and target for research. Unfortunately, this cannot be considered a relevant research development plan consistent with the mission of the institution and the economic and cultural development needs of the region. The indicators and targets considered in the Strategic Plan are more related to staff performance than to research development area; they do not consider any research topic that might be relevant to the institution mission and local needs. In addition, there is no clear indication on the potential of the institution, as there is no benchmark connection. The discussion with the head of programs revealed an interest for comparing their state with universities/colleges from Croatia, Bosnia, Macedonia etc., which is a good start for proper and effective benchmarking.

The management interest for research development is clear, as the budget for research is planned to increase in 2023 with 20% compared to 2021 and with 80 % in 2025 compared to 2021 (as mentioned in the Research Strategy for 2021-2025). The objectives as they are currently set are considered achievable under the current allocation of resources. Teaching staff participating at the discussion at the online site visit confirmed this. In addition, according to SER, page 28, "the Academy has foreseen the support of the academic staff in scientific publications up to 1000 euros for each academic year for staff".

Research is validated through scientific and applied research publications. According to SER (page 29), "The Academy has 24 academic staff employed most of whom are with the title Dr.Sc. In the last three years, the number of publications of the academic staff within the Academy is 51 which represents less than one publication per academic staff. Considering that this number of staff is employed in 2020, their scientific contribution should really be taken into account only in 2020 and not in 2018, 2019. However, the Academy has taken into account the contribution of academic staff for 2018 and 2019 knowing that this can affect the reduction of the average work per worker, per year". The list of publication was provided to ET as appendix to SER. Nevertheless, although the number of publication decreased in 2020 compared to 2019, the institution is now re-setting everything as the time of evaluation would be the new starting time and a proper monitoring of the staff publications would be important in the following years.

The targets set in the Strategic Plan for 2021-2025 are general for the institutional development:

- "At least one collaboration per year with local and international partners on joint scientific projects
- On average, a scientific paper published by each academic staff per year





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- Participation in one international conferences per year by the academic staff
- Establishment of a research fund in the Academy to support the research work of staff and students
- Organizing at least one conference per year in cooperation with international institutions and universities
- At least five joint researches and publications among Academy teachers".

Therefore, expectations for teaching staff involvement in research are not clearly set up in an evaluation form referring to individual performance review system and in promotion criteria. The Manual for academic staff that was provided as appendix includes declarative criteria with no performance measurable criteria; at the same time, the questionnaires that were provided as additional documents to the ET did not include any staff evaluation made by superiors, where these research criteria could have been considered.

Teaching staff is willing to make classes attractive. They include in their teaching information research outcomes that are relevant to courses they teach. Their publications should include the name of the institution. Unfortunately, some of the publications that were provided from the very beginning does not have this included: <a href="https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S1369847818305321">https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S1369847818305321</a> (other countries and universities); in addition, other links include some errors: <a href="https://www.uklo.edu.mk/filemanager/Bilten/2018/Bilten%20442.pdf/">https://www.uklo.edu.mk/filemanager/Bilten/2018/Bilten%20442.pdf/</a> (message is: not

The institution does not have any policies yet for ownership of intellectual property and clear procedures set out for commercialization of ideas developed by staff and students. Asking to provide this, as additional documents, the institution suggested that this issue was covered by the Article 19 in the Code of Ethics. In fact, this article refers to academic plagiarism which is a different aspect of ethical issues. There are no clear policies at the date of the visit or procedures and relevant structural units to ensure the safeguarding of ethical principles in research, apart from the Code of Ethics. ET admits that institution has done a lot of organizational issues since the establishment date and appreciates all the preparatory efforts.

#### Compliance level: Partially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

found).

- 1. Create a Research Plan including 1-3 research themes and identify core actions to be taken according to these; make it public.
- 2. Create specific and clear research indicators targets.

17





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 3. Create a benchmark study on research activity to compare the status of the institution to other and relevant ones.
- 4. Define clear and measurable research tasks and criteria for staff performance and promotion as appendix to the Manual for Academic Staff.
- 5. Allocate a verification person/team to check the affiliation of staff in the publication process.
- 6. Include a responsibility for the Scientific Commission (or other unit) in relationship to the safeguarding of ethical principles in research; this unit should propose clear policy on this matter including intellectual property.

#### 2.8. Staff, employment processes and professional development

The institution has provided to the ET as additional document The Manual for academic staff which includes a set of policies for staff such as recruitment, right, engagement, workload, employment, discrimination, transparency etc. The recruitment process is based on an internal competition announced by the Academic Council and therefore, it assures that equitable treatment is available for of all applicants. According to SER (page 31), "the Regulation on recruitment and promotion of academic staff, foresees the criteria for advancement and promotion of staff for the Assistant, Lecturer, Assistant Professor and Professor title. These two documents are publicly available to each member of the academic staff within the Academy. The administrative staff is recruited on the basis of Tempulli Academy Statute, while their roles and responsibilities are set out in the Regulation on the Systematization of Jobs".

At the date of visit, according to SER (page 33), the Academy had 13 full-time staff and 11 part-time staff. The teaching load is reasonable and the ratio student to staff adequate, assumed for the future functioning period at 5:1. Staff employed in the institution can manage educational, research, administrative processes. During the discussion with the teaching staff, it was clear that some participants were familiar with educational process and some of the teachers were also experienced and qualified in the field of the studies. They were also happy to provide orientation to new entrants in the institution. Considering the documents provided, the institution is also given appropriate and fair opportunities for personal and career development.

Performance of staff is considered in the institutional documents, especially in The Manual for academic staff, but in too general terms. Criteria with percentages of calculation are not included yet. At the same time, there is no clear staff performance evaluation for other staff categories, such as researchers and administrative staff.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

Institution has an interest on academic staff evaluation; there are clear questionnaires and documents referring to self-evaluation, evaluation by students, peer evaluation. At the date of visit it was not provided a superior evaluation form. In addition, it is too soon due to the recent establishment date of the institution to consider some of the results to these evaluation categories. As many efforts have been made in relationship to these evaluation categories, the ET considers that the preparation stage as useful for a future case of improvement based on the feedback from respondents.

In the additional documents, the institution confirms that the current intentions on staff development are only those in the Strategic Plan for 2021-2025. There is no program development plan yet, but the institution plans to organize some workshops (no target set for these workshops in the Strategic Plan for 2021-2025 – page 11) and other activities. Therefore, there is no evidence on resource allocation for the future staff development plan.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. Set clear criteria and calculation for performance evaluation for all staff categories.
- 2. Create a superior evaluation of staff in addition to already existing ones.
- 3. Make public the tools used for staff evaluation and the results (when they will be generated from the first evaluation process).
- 4. Activate the Centre for Research and Professional Development.
- 5. Set up, approve and make public a Staff Development Plan, including English skills and innovative teaching.

#### 2.9. Student administration and support services

The admission requirements and procedure at Tempulli Academy are defined in the Statute, according to which, the admission announcement for each study program includes the following information: the total number of vacancies for students, the conditions for registration and the criteria for the selection of candidates, the deadlines for registration and the documents that should be submitted with the application form. All information regarding the admission procedure is published on the official website of the institution.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The college provides merit-based scholarships for students. The scholarship criteria, application and selection procedure of students is defined in the regulation on the scholarship allocation, which is publicly available on the college website. Since 2020 student data is being stored through the software for student's management SEMS. Through these monitored data the attendance of students in their studies and their results is monitored.

The college provides an orientation program for new students to explain the policies, procedures and services that operate at the institution. Additionally, the college developed the student handbook that includes all information necessary for student's life.

The college has developed the Code of Ethics and disciplinary procedures for staff and for students. The regulations are publicly available. Antiplagiarism software is available in Albanian language.

The college has the student support services, that mainly works on technical and administrative issues such as monitoring the student attendance, developing the schedule for classes and exams. The college also has the career support service, that gives consultation to students on development of the CV, or potential employment opportunities. The college does not have an academic or psychological counselling service.

Opportunities for extracurricular activities are provided.

Because of the situation with no students enrolled, the experts were not able to see processes and procedures in practice. The Institution was not able to explain the experts how the quality assurance process for the supportive services will work. Furthermore, the explanations on how the monitoring will enable improvements are not detailed.

**Compliance level:** Substantially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. The monitoring system should be revised.
- 2. Establish effective processes in place to collect and analyse reliable data referring to the profile of the student population, student progression, success and drop-out rates (including the reasons for them), students' satisfaction with the learning resources and





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

student support available, career paths of graduates; make sure that the results of the analysis is used to support students' academic achievements and improve institutional performance.

- 3. Ensure that the policies related to the academic integrity are practiced and implemented by staff and students.
- 4. Antiplagiarism software for the English language is urgently needed, if a program in English is planned.

#### 2.10. Learning resources and facilities

According to SER (page 39): "The Academy is located in a relatively new building, which has a very convenient, clean and attractive environment for students and staff, both in terms of learning conditions and social spaces. The Academy is located about 300 meters from the city center, where it provides very easy access for students and staff of the Academy. The building has over 1260 m2 including the spaces for Institute for Road Safety and the Driving School. The laboratories of the Institute can be used for student's practical work and for commercial activities of the Academy" and "Users have several ways of accessing different literature in the Library: a) Physical Library; b) Electronic library (electronic catalogue) and online academic and scientific journals. Through the National University Library the Academy will have access to numerous electronic databases as well as access to other open access journals. In relation to the number of students the library area has doubled with physical space and now meets the needs and requirements of the students. Tempulli Academy students have access to library that is available for students and academic electronic https://www.ciltuk.org.uk/Knowledge.aspx)".

Therefore, considering the information provided in SER and through the video, ET considers that the institution provides adequate financial resources for acquisitions, cataloguing, equipment, and for services and system development. The institution has made a lot of effort to provide Albanian materials to students, including translation from English. There are currently 1862 physical books, and several electronic books; 80 computers are available for students. This means that proper access to different materials is relevant for users. In addition, the library is open and accessible to students. A list of books and journals available for students was provided as additional document, as well as a list of laboratory equipment.

In the questionnaire students have to fill in they are asked (among other things) to "Present your thoughts on the services presented below – add other services if they do not appear on the list".





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

The institution plan to build a special elevator for students with physical disabilities and currently they have a mobile platform, which is excellent. Nevertheless, students with special needs might mean also visual or hearing impairments.

There is no clear evidence that technical support is available for staff and students using information and communications technology. Training programs are not yet provided to ensure effective use of computing equipment and appropriate software for assessments, teaching and administration.

Compliance level: Substantially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

- 1. Create a plan (calendar) for training programs to ensure effective use of computing equipment and appropriate software for assessments, teaching and administration.
- 2. Extend the data base in English.
- 3. Extend the investment on learning resources for students with special needs.

#### 2.11. Institutional cooperation

The TA's Strategic Plan 2021-2025 outlines six "fields of intervention", and one of them is titled Public Co-operation and Relations. Under this umbrella, the agenda of internationalization and public relations is in focus, with the emphasize on very recent establishing the Office for International Relations (support structure), developing international partnerships via projects, networks, mobilities, and more in the future. The ambitions are high in this respect and it remains to be seen what will come true.

Some steps to move things ahead in the field of internationalization have been already made at the TA. Meanwhile, two regulations were drafted (on international agreements, and on mobilities), and some efforts to identify suitable international partners are confirmed.

The main responsibility for the international agenda is given to the Academic Director and the Head of International Relations.

So far, there is a little evidence about the TA's more visible participation in international projects in the TA's current documentation. Also, it cannot be said the TA has been more





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

intensively and effectively involved in organizing events of international visibility and outreach so far.

Mobilities that are mentioned in the SER are few, and do not represent a stronger evidence about the effective effort of the institution to encourage the international visibility of its staff and students by supporting their participation in different international mobilities, events etc.

Promotion criteria do not seem to include engagement in international co-operation. At the moment, the staff is not effectively assisted to develop collaborative arrangements with international community. But the plans are in place.

More successful seems to be the TA in its effort to create productive links with industry in Kosovo. Some agreements about co-operation were signed by the TA with local companies and organizations, and the plans to broaden and intensify this area of operation are in place. The Council of Partners seems to be a well-recognized mechanism to work with the external partners here. A good experience in this respect confirmed the representatives of employers during the interviews and it appears this practice could also be beneficial for possible student internships as well as for applied research development possibilities. In this context, the TA's staff seems to be encouraged to participate in forums in which significant community issues are discussed and plans for community development are considered.

Representatives of the local business community seem to be invited to join appropriate advisory and other committees/structural unit of the TA and this way to consider institutional activities and have a chance to offer their perspective for the purpose of TA's activity development.

The TA declares it works with alumni of formerly conducted programs (Alumni Association of Tempulli Academy). All the activities of alumni as stated in the SER relate to the future, but there was some evidence of links between graduates and the TA during the interviews.

Compliance level: Partially compliant

#### ET recommendations:

1. Make sure the staff is prepared for international co-operation and encouraged to get involved.





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

- 2. Make sure the TA is more intensively involved in relevant international projects.
- 3. Make sure mobilities of the staff as well as the students become an integral part of their work or study, and the staff and the students are effectively encouraged to participate.

#### OVERALL EVALUATION AND JUDGEMENT OF THE EXPERT TEAM

#### **CONCLUSION**

In conclusion, the Expert Team considers that Tempulli Academy is substantially compliant with the standards included in the KAA Accreditation manual and, therefore, **recommends to accredit it.** 

# Chair Milan Pol (Signature) (Print Name) (Date) Member Magdalena Platis (Signature) (Print Name) (Date) Member Christoph Back





# Agjencia e Kosovës për Akreditim Agencija Kosova za Akreditaciju Kosovo Accreditation Agency

(Print Name)	(Date)
,	,
	(Print Name)